CHAPTER VII
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

7.1 Introduction
7.2 Issues and Trends
7.3 Objectives
7.4 Hypotheses
7.5 Design of the Study
7.6 Design of the Experiment
7.7 Sample
7.8 Tools
7.9 Results
7.10 Educational Implications of the Study
7.11 Suggestions for further Study
CHAPTER - VII

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

7.1 Introduction:

The present study entitled, 'A Comparative Study of the Effects of the Natural Approach and the Bilingrael Method of teaching of English as a foreign language on Comenunciation Skills', is taken up with a view to compare the effects of the natural approach in acquisition and learning of second language in a natural setting with that of bilingual method. Methodology is an effective instrument in the hands of a teacher to arouse the interest of the students in a particular subject.

During the pre-independence days, English was the language of the ruling class. Indians were obliged to learn the language of their masters. Similar examples can be picked up from history. When Muslims ruled over our country, we tried to learn Persian and Arabic. In the same way, we tried to learn English when the British ruled over us.

In the pre-independence, educational set-up, English was the medium of instruction in high schools and in universities. English was taught by experienced teachers.

Soon after independence, Maulana Abul Kalam Azad took over the education portfolio in the interim Government. At a press conference he hinted at the New policy of the Government. He said: "............... it was never my intention to suggest that there should be any falling in the standard of English. One hundred and fifty years of intimate contact has made English an integral part of our educational system and this cannot be changed without injury to the cause of education in India .......... English has to day become one of the major languages of the world, and Indians can neglect its study at the risk of lost of themselves".
After knowing the history of English, now let us discuss the meaning of approach, method and technique.

An approach can be defined as a set of correlative assumptions dealing with the nature of language. An approach is axiomatic. It describes the nature of the subject matter to be taught.

Method is an overall plan for the orderly presentation of language material. An approach is axiomatic, a method is procedural. Within one approach, there can be many methods.

A technique is implementational—that which actually takes place in a classroom. Techniques must be consistent with a Method, and therefore in harmony with an approach as well.


The question arises if there are several methods, why we have chosen only two methods, i.e., the natural approach and the Bilingual method.

By comparing the Natural Approach and Bilingual Method with above mentioned methods, it has been found that these two methods are better than others. These enhance the communication skills of teaching of English as well as enable the students to acquire English as a foreign language in more effective way than others.
In Natural Approach, the entire goal of classroom practice is to provide comprehensible input. Natural Approach teachers utilize relia,pictures and students' previous knowledge to make their speech Comprehensible. Natural Approach attempts to capture students interest by using what Terrell terms "Affective Acquisition Activities.

As compared to other methods, in natural approach, some tools for conversational management are provided in the form of very short dialogues, designed to help students converse with native speakers on predictable and frequent topics.

In comparison to other methods, the natural approach is designed to be consistent with what is known of Monitor functioning. The absence of error correction in the classroom is a recognition that there are constraints on when the conscious grammar is used: students are expected to utilize the Monitor only at home, when they have time, when they are focused on form, and when they know, or are learning a rule.

On the other hand, in the Bilingual Method, the teacher's work is facilitated and the mother tongue enters only as a time-saving device. Meanings and concepts are conveyed in the mother-tongue of the pupils and practice is given in those of the target language as compared to other methods. Thus the method can promote accuracy in the target language. Even an average teacher can work out this method successfully with a little of preparation.

There are the above mentioned characteristics of natural approach and bilingual method due to which these were chosen than other methods for the present investigation.
The methodology is used to inculcate communication skills. Now, let us discuss communication skills. First of all, we should know the meaning of a skill.

Skill is the 'ability to do something expertly and well'. So says the OALD (Oxford Advanced learner's Dictionary of Current English). And the COD (the Concise Oxford Dictionary) says it is 'expertness, practised ability, facility in doing something, dexterity'.

Now let us be familiar with the definitional view of communication.

The roots of the word communication (cummunis or common) accurately portray its purpose. In communication the speaker is attempting to "be one" with the listener. In the process of "being one" we develop a communion, a transaction, a dialogue. At its foundation, communication involves a writing and exchange of thoughts. As a result, the speaker is obligated to create a clear picture of reality to stimulate listeners and "make common" his or her thoughts.

When ease of communication is the goal of language instruction, understanding the nature of language becomes one of the specific aims of the teaching-learning process. Students must understand how meanings are conveyed by language; thus they learn that language is a symbolic expression of ideas. They need to understand communication as a social setting. Through activities based on real experiences, students learn that communication must be purposeful. They must have something to say, some one to say it to, and a reason for saying it.

Similarly, we need a common word for what we communicate. The common world that scholars have found for all these put together is message. Now where does the message come from? That is often very difficult to find out. Important people sometimes hire "ghost" writers to write their speeches. We need a common word for where the message comes from. Let the word be "sender" for the time being.
Now who takes the message that sender sends? When we write a book, broadcast a radio talk, or appear in a television show, we can only vaguely guess who are readers, listeners or viewers are going to be. We can call them all receivers. When the sender passes the message on to the receiver, the message has to pass through something. It may be anything, such as air, paper or empty space, which is far from empty in reality. When we look on it as a free or empty passage, we call it a channel. When we regard it as "something" filling the space between the sender and the receiver, we call it a medium.

Before the sender can pass a message on to the receiver, he should know how to pass it on. How does he shape his message to suit his medium. The message may be made up of thoughts, feelings, will and so on. If the sender knows how to pass thought wave on, and the receiver can read thoughts, there is no problem. If not, they have to make use of some devices to change thoughts into things or events which they can see, hear or feel. Usually, they put their thoughts into words which they can say and hear, or write and read. That's the communication skill. These communication skills are: listening, speaking, reading and writing.

After discussing the skill, the definitional view of communication and communication skill, now let us discuss the rationale of the study, briefly.

We have chosen two methods. One is natural approach and the other is the bilingual method. The natural approach is for beginners and is designed to help them become intermediates. Natural approach is primarily designed to develop basic communication skills - both oral and written. The goals of a natural approach are based on an assessment of student needs. According to the needs and interests of students, content selection should aim to create a low affective filler by being interesting and fostering a friendly, relaxed atmosphere. It provides a wide exposure to vocabulary that may be useful to basic personal communication.
In the natural approach, teacher is the pivotal figure. He has been assigned three central roles. First, the teacher is the primary source of comprehensible input in the target language. Class time is devoted primarily to providing input for acquisition and the teacher is the primary generator of that input. In this role, the teacher is required to generate a constant flow of language input while providing a multiplicity of nonlinguistic clues to assist students in interpreting the input.

The other method is the bilingual method. The bilingual view accounts for the fact that learning the second language constitutes a serious learning task that cannot be ignored— and that because the student is already lingual in one language he or she can use it to learn and develop the second. (Cummins, 1981; Dodson 1967, 1983; Dodson, 1985; Ho, 1985; Lambert, 1982).

We have followed two methods to inculcate communication skills among students. In this scientific age, communication of messages, ideas, thoughts are very necessary in every sphere of life, it may be an educational sphere or a business field. These communication skills are: listening, speaking, reading and writing.

This is the rationale due to which this study was chosen for the purpose of investigation. After discussing the rationale of the study, now let us discuss the issues and trends of the study.

7.2 Issues and Trends:

The issues and trends are described as below:

- Does or does not natural approach and the bilingual method facilitate comprehension and speaking skills of teaching of English as a foreign language at the lower middle school level.
Does or does not natural approach and the bilingual method facilitate reading and writing skills of teaching of English as a foreign language at the middle school level.

Do boys and girls of the grade VI of the natural approach group perform significantly better on listening and speaking skills than those of the bilingual method group at lower middle school level.

Do we find significant difference between the achievements of the boys and the girls of grade VIII of the natural approach group on reading and writing skills than those of the bilingual method group at middle school level.

These are the issues and trends raised with which we have dwelt upon it is our present investigation.

After discussing issues and trends, now let us discuss the objectives of the study.

7.3 Objectives:

The following objectives of the study were stated:

1) To compare the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method on comprehension skill of teaching of English as a foreign language at the lower middle school level.

2) To know the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating speaking skill of teaching of English at the lower middle school level.
3) To investigate the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating reading skill of teaching of English at the middle school level.

4) To find out the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating writing skill of teaching of English at the middle school level.

5) To find out the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating comprehension skill among boys of grade VI.

6) To find out the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating comprehension skill among girls of grade VI.

7) To investigate the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method on speaking skill among boys of grade VI.

8) To investigate the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method on speaking skill among girls of grade VI.

9) To determine the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method on reading skill among boys of grade VIII.

10) To find out the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method on reading skill among girls of grade VIII.

11) To investigate the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method on writing skill among boys of grade VIII.

12) To determine the effects of the natural approach and the bilingual method on writing skill among girls of grade VIII.
The study was advanced from the viewpoint of the following hypotheses:

7.4 Hypotheses:

1. There is no significant difference between the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating comprehension skill of teaching of English as a foreign language at the lower middle school level.

2. There is no significant difference between the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating speaking skill of teaching of English as a foreign language at the lower middle school level.

3. There is no significant difference between the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating reading skill of teaching of English as a foreign language at the middle school level.

4. There is no significant difference between the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating writing skill of teaching of English as a foreign language at the middle school level.

5. There is no significant difference between the achievement of the boys of the natural approach group of grade VI and the boys of the bilingual method group on comprehension communication skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

6. There is no significant difference between the achievement of the girls of the natural approach group of grade VI and the girls of the bilingual method group on comprehension communication skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.
7. There is no significant difference between the achievement of the boys of the natural approach group of grade VI and the boys of the bilingual method group on speaking skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

8. There is no significant difference between the achievement of the girls of the natural approach group of grade VI and the girls of the bilingual method group on speaking skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

9. There is no significant difference between the achievement of the boys of the natural approach group of grade VIII and the boys of the bilingual method group on reading skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

10. There is no significant difference between the achievement of the girls of the natural approach group of grade VIII and the girls of the bilingual method group on reading skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

11. There is no significant difference between the achievement of the boys of the natural approach group of grade VIII and the boys of the bilingual method group on writing skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

12. There is no significant difference between the achievement of the girls of the natural approach group of grade VIII and the girls of the bilingual method group on writing skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

After discussing hypotheses, now let us discuss the design of the study.

7.5 Design of the Study:

For this an experimental method involves the formulation and testing of hypotheses and problem solving approach.
7.6 Design of the Experiment:

The study was designed as a single-factor experiment. Ferguson (1971) discusses three types of single-factor experiments in which the single factor is a treatment variable with K levels or categories, in this case with 2 categories: the natural approach and the bilingual method. Sample is an integral part of the design of the experiment. Now, let us discuss the sample.

7.7 Sample:

Since the school population is scattered over a wide geographical area and the study is an experimental one, one school in Haryana (where English as a foreign language is skill being taught through the old method like grammar-translation method) was selected for the purpose of the study. This school, Govt. Girls High School of Karnal City Caters to the needs of the children with average socio-economic status, i.e., children belonging to middle class families. Hence, it was considered to be representative of the general population of this part of India.

The sample of the present study was drawn from classes VI and VIII grade. Further 68 pupils of grade VI and 68 pupils of grade VIII of this institution were randomly divided into 2 treatment groups at each of the two grade levels. A mixed sample of boys and girls was taken up. While conducting the study, elaborate experimental controls and control of variables were exercised.

The next step is the discussion on tools. It is necessary to know after the selection of sample, how the data was collected. The collection of data is possible only through tools.
7.8 Tools:

Cattell's culture Fair Intelligence Test Scale 2 (Form A for age group 8-13 years) was administered to all the 136 pupils in order to initially check whether the groups were properly formed.

The experimenter constructed four tests for the collection of data, i.e., test of listening, speaking, reading and writing skills.

Test of listening skill was consisted of 5 activities. Each activity comprised of 10 sub-activities. This test was of 50 marks.

The second test of speaking skill was divided into two parts.

- Early Production
- Extended Production.

Each test included of 5 activities and each activity consisted of 10 sub-activities. Each test was of 25 marks. The scores of these tests were added (25+25=50) to get the final score.

The third test constructed was of reading skill. This test comprised of 4 comprehensive passages. There were various questions asked in these passages to know the reading comprehension of the students. This test was also of 50 marks.

The fourth test was of writing skill. This test was constructed to inculcate the writing skill by natural approach and bilingual method. This test was also of 50 marks. "The five hypotheses given in Krashen's instructional model, 1985 were also considered while the items were constructed. These hypotheses were:
1. The Acquisition/Learning Hypothesis
2. The Monitor Hypothesis
3. The Natural Order Hypothesis
4. The Input Hypothesis
5. The Affective filter Hypothesis

After describing the tools, now let us discuss the results were drawn by the present investigation:

7.9 Results:

The first hypothesis that there is no significant difference between the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating comprehension skill of teaching of English as a foreign language at the lower middle school level is refuted. There is a significant difference between these two methods on listening comprehension.

The second hypothesis that there is no significant difference between the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating speaking skill of teaching of English as a foreign language at the lower middle school level is however refuted as there is highly significant difference in the performance of the two groups.

The third hypothesis that there is no significant difference between the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating reading skill of teaching of English as a foreign language at the middle school level is again refuted as the bilingual method group outperformed the natural approach group.

The fourth hypothesis that there is no significant difference between the natural approach and the bilingual method in facilitating writing skill of teaching of English as a foreign language at the middle school level is rejected as the difference is highly significant.
The fifth hypothesis that there is no significant difference between the achievement of the boys of the natural approach group of grade VI and those of the bilingual method group on comprehension communication skill of teaching of English as a foreign language is again rejected.

The sixth hypothesis has been validated by the present investigation as both girls of natural approach group and those of bilingual method group of grade VI on comprehension skill were found to perform equally as there is no significant difference between the two groups.

The results of the seventh hypothesis does not support it because the difference is highly significant, whereas, hypothesis, that there is no significant difference between the achievement of the boys of the natural approach group of grade VI and those of the bilingual method group on speaking skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

The present investigation supports the eighth hypothesis that there is no significant difference between the achievement of the girls of the natural approach group of grade VI and those of the bilingual method group on speaking skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

The results of the present investigation have been rejecting the ninth hypothesis that there is no significant difference between the achievement of the boys of the natural approach group of grade VIII and those of bilingual method group on reading skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

The results of the tenth hypothesis does not support it because the difference is highly significant whereas the hypothesis was formulated that there is no significant difference between the achievement of the girls of the natural approach group of
grade VIII and those of the bilingual method group on reading skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

The eleventh hypothesis that there is no significant difference between the achievement of the boys of the natural approach group of grade VIII and those of bilingual method group on writing skill of teaching of English as a foreign language is refuted.

The twelfth hypothesis again has been refuted that there is no significant difference between the achievement of the girls of the natural approach group of grade VIII and those of the bilingual method group on writing skill of teaching of English as a foreign language.

Yet, one may be justified in inferring from the results of this study that with the bilingual method which facilitate the communication skills of teaching of English as a foreign language better than that of the natural approach.

7.10 Educational Implications of the study:

The following are the educational implications of this study:

1. It is hoped that this study may result in greater awareness on the part of the teachers while delivering the instructions to the students in teaching of English as a foreign language.

2. The results of the study indicated that the students can learn English if the class-room atmosphere is congenial one.

3. The class-room activities should be derived from the real context of the students. The teachers should introduce lively activities in the class-room.

4. The students should be encouraged to converse with their fellow students.
5. The teachers should also take into consideration the steps given in bilingual method while teaching English to the students. These steps are: Imitation, interpretation, substitution and extension, independent speaking of sentences, reverse interpretation, consolidation of question-patterns, questions and answers, normal foreign language conversation. By following these steps, the teacher can facilitate the communication skills of teaching of English as a foreign language.

6. The activities like interviews, use of advertisements, small dialogues, problem solving activities, imagination, games, drills etc. should be introduced in the class-room. The teacher can teach the students by narrating interesting stories which widen the imagination of the students and increase their communication skills. The teacher can also encourage the students to write free composition which improves the accuracy of writing skill.

7.11 Suggestions for Further Study:

The following are the suggestions given for further study:

1. This study was undertaken only in one school, i.e., Govt. Girls High School in Karnal. Further study can be undertaken in more than one school.

2. This study is restricted to the two grade levels, i.e., grades VI and VIII. Further study can be undertaken by taking the students at Senior Secondary School level or at college level.

3. This study is restricted only to two methods: Natural approaches and bilingual Method. Further study can be undertaken by comparing three or four methods.

4. Comparison can be drawn by undertaking other methods like comparison between Natural Approach and Total Physical Response Approach, between Natural Approach and Audio Lingual Method......