Chapter-VIII

Conclusions and Recommendations

This chapter describes the conclusions drawn from the study. The conclusions define the crux of the study in terms of the objectives for which the research has been conducted. Further, recommendations regarding policy initiatives which need to be undertaken are made.

8.1 Conclusions

Emotional intelligence of teachers remains same for all age groups of teachers in the study i.e. between 28 to 52 years, teachers qualified with master level degree and doctorate degree also have same level of emotional intelligence, male and female teachers have no difference in their emotional intelligence levels and with experience of teachers in the study ranging from as low as 1 year to a maximum of 28 years, no change in emotional intelligence is observed.

Overall emotional intelligence and organization commitment of the teachers are positively associated with each other and the relationship is significant. Further, six out of ten dimensions of emotional intelligence i.e. self-awareness, self-regulation, resilience, social awareness, empathy and self-management are significantly correlated with one or more components of organization commitment. However, the strength of association between these dimensions is found to be different. It implies that teachers proficient in these six emotional intelligence skills exhibited better commitment levels (affective, continuance or normative). Thus, overall emotional intelligence and specifically the six competencies need to be nurtured in order to ensure greater affective/continuance/normative commitment. It can also be concluded that university teachers lack competence in some dimensions i.e. teachers are not capable in all emotional intelligence skills.

By and large emotional intelligence of teachers and their job involvement are related with each other and the relationship is significant. The dimensions of emotional intelligence do not show a significant association with job involvement of teaching professionals pointing towards a possibility that teachers lack competence in individual emotional
intelligence skills and there is a room for improvement in the emotional intelligence competencies.

The relationship between organization commitment and performance of transformational teacher leaders is non-significant and rather than overall organization commitment, it is its individual components which exhibit an association with transformational leadership characteristics of teachers. Different dimensions of organization commitment are associated with various transformational leadership characteristics; the strength of association however, varies. Affective commitment is positively and significantly associated with inspirational motivation and intellectual stimulation dimensions of transformational leadership. Continuance commitment exhibits strong association with transformational leadership behaviour of teachers through dimensions of idealized influence, intellectual stimulation and individualized consideration. Normative Commitment (NC) has been found to have a significantly positive association with inspirational motivation and intellectual stimulation dimensions of transformational leadership behaviour of teachers. It has been concluded that a commitment based on costs associated with leaving an institution (continuance commitment) does not guide a teacher’s ability to motivate and inspire (inspirational motivation) their students and although it has been found that affectively and normatively committed teachers do not serve as a role model for their students and do not empathize with them, but they inspire & motivate (inspirational motivation) and stimulate (intellectual stimulation) their students through their transformational behaviour. Furthermore, overall organization commitment may not influence transformational leadership behaviour of teachers but dimensions of organization commitment significantly predict their ability in various transformational leadership characteristics indicating that the universities need to step towards enhancing commitment of their academic staff in order to increase the instances of their transformational leadership behaviour.

Largely, there is a positive and significant relationship between job involvement and performance of transformational teacher leaders. Thus, research provides a novel perspective to the existing research on the association between job involvement and transformational leadership of teacher leaders i.e. teaching professionals with higher involvement in their jobs have greater chances of exhibiting transformational leadership behaviour.
Emotional intelligence has a positive and significant relationship with performance of teachers as transformational leaders. Further, 6 out of 10 competencies of emotional intelligence predict different dimensions of transformational leadership - Self Awareness, Self-Regulation, Empathy, Relationship Management, Motivation and Self-Management are positively and significantly correlated with idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation and individualized consideration. But the strength of association varies between different dimensional relationships.

In addition, the relationship between emotional intelligence of teachers and their transformational leadership behaviour is moderated by their job involvement. In other words, high emotional intelligence of teaching professionals increases their chances of exhibiting transformational leadership behavior through job involvement.

Thus, overall emotional intelligence of teaching professionals has a positive and significant association with their organization commitment, job involvement and their performance as transformational leaders. In other words, emotionally intelligent teachers are more committed, involved and exhibit greater instances of transformational leadership behaviour. Further, job involvement has emerged a significant mediator in the relationship between emotional intelligence and transformational leadership thereby indicating that emotional intelligence has an indirect relationship with performance of teachers as transformational leaders. Thus, in order to improve effectiveness of teaching through encouragement of transformational leadership behaviour by the teachers, higher educational institutions must consider the role of emotional intelligence and at the same time focus on enhancing the job involvement of their academic staff.

Furthermore, the moderate impact of emotional intelligence of teaching professionals on their organization commitment, job involvement and transformational leadership behavior highlights the fact that merely possessing emotional intelligence would not lead to higher commitment of teachers; emotional intelligence skills must be employed in our everyday life and most importantly in our work life, only then would its effects surface. In case of teaching professionals in universities, although on an average they have been found to have high average emotional intelligence levels but they may not be exploiting their emotional intelligence potential and utilizing it in their institutional life. This is obvious
because although emotional intelligence is regarded as the foundation of effective performance and desirable work behavior, it finds no role in selection, training and development of university teachers. Thirdly, the existing selection of university teachers gives no importance to emotional intelligence of the candidates and the training and development programs as per UGC guidelines do not focus on developing emotional intelligence of the teachers.

When considered in public and private universities, emotional intelligence of teachers in private universities is highly positively related with their organization commitment and the association is highly significant. But the relationship between emotional intelligence and organization commitment of the teachers in public universities is non-significant. The difference here may be because public universities may not have effective and targeted HR policies such as socialisation of teachers, there may not be clarity in policies and rules, work experiences of teachers in the public institutions may not be positive and teachers may not be rewarded or their contribution may not be recognized publicly. While in private universities, a strong relationship between emotional intelligence and organization commitment of teaching professionals may additionally be attributed to effective HR policies and their strategy to retain high performing academic staff. However, this is an unanticipated finding and needs further examination to throw light on the reasons for no impact of emotional intelligence on organization commitment in public university teachers.

Emotional intelligence of the teachers working in public universities has a significant positive relationship with their job involvement but in the case of private universities, the relationship between emotional intelligence and job involvement of the teachers is non-significant.

For teachers in public universities, emotional intelligence is found to be positively associated with their transformational leadership behaviour and this association is highly significant while no such relationship has been found between emotional intelligence and transformational leadership of teachers in private universities.

Organization commitment has a positive and significant association with transformational leadership behaviour of teachers in public universities but the relationship
between organization commitment and transformational leadership for teacher leaders in private universities, is not significant.

Job involvement of teaching professionals has a positive and significant relationship with their performance as transformational leaders in both public and private universities. Thus a new dimension is added to the research interlinking the transformational leadership and job involvement with job involvement as a positively significant determinant of transformational leadership behaviour of teachers. Additionally, it can be concluded that job involvement acts as a significant predictor of transformational leadership behaviour of teaching professionals irrespective of the nature of institution.

The conflicting results regarding effect of emotional intelligence on job involvement and on performance of teachers as transformational leaders in public and private universities may be because in case of teachers, there are additional factors which may influence their job involvement - whether they have the authority to decide the pedagogy or how the students would be evaluated and the extent to which management interferes with their teaching practice and so on. While public universities may be guaranteeing greater autonomy and control over the job to their academic staff allowing transformational leadership behaviour of their academic staff to flourish. On the other hand private universities do not promote a culture which encourages the expression of transformational leadership behaviour by its teachers i.e. there may be greater interference of management and teachers may not have considerable control over the teaching pedagogy and evaluation of students. However, the relationship between emotional intelligence of teachers and their organization commitment is opposite i.e. significant in private and not in public universities because other factors guiding organization commitment are different from the ones determining job involvement and transformational leadership.

Thus, private universities need to conduct further investigation in order to identify the underlying reasons for deficient transformational leadership behaviour in their academic staff.

When considered in individual faculties, emotional intelligence has been found to have a positive and significant influence on organization commitment of management faculty members while emotional intelligence and organization commitment of engineering
faculty members are not significantly associated. This may be because as anticipated, management teachers may have undergone experience (conceptually) in emotional intelligence and organizational behaviour during the course of their study and analyse management practices in a more positive manner and are better aware of benefits of being committed to their organizations as compared to their engineering counterparts. Further, these results indicate that even conceptual experience may help enhance teachers’ emotional intelligence ability and it can be imagined that what miracles can emotional intelligence training and development program would do.

Emotional intelligence of teachers in engineering department is positively associated with their job involvement and the effect of emotional intelligence on job involving for engineering teachers is significant but no significant association has been found between emotional intelligence and job involvement in case of teachers in management departments.

On the basis of faculty, no significant relationship between emotional intelligence of teachers and their transformational leadership behaviour has been found in both management and engineering departments. The results are however, unanticipated and unrelated with other findings regarding role of emotional intelligence in transformational leadership behaviour of teachers. Hence, further investigation is required to yield conclusive evidence.

Considering organization commitment and transformational leadership of teachers according to the disciplines i.e. engineering and management, no association between the two constructs has been found. Thus, it can be concluded that the type of faculty has no influence on the relationship between organization commitment and behavior of teachers as transformational leaders.

The effect of job involvement on performance of transformational leadership behavior of teachers in management faculty is positive and significant. But, no such relationship has been found between job involvement and transformational leadership in engineering faculty.

Thus, it can be concluded that when categorized on the basis of faculty, lot of variations exist regarding various relationships between the constructs indicating that role of
emotional intelligence in guiding behavior is highly complex and there are additional factors influencing behavior of teaching professionals. Therefore, further examination needs to be done in consideration with management and engineering faculties in universities in order to identify underlying factors influencing the relationships between emotional intelligence, organization commitment, job involvement and transformational leadership behavior of teaching professionals.

8.2 Recommendations

These results have implications for institutions of higher education in the sense that emotionally intelligent teachers are more involved, more committed and have a tendency to exhibit transformational leadership characteristics and these characteristics are reflected in the exercise of their duties as teacher leaders. Given the importance of transformational leadership for effective and quality teaching which in turn is critical for improvement of quality of higher education in general and effectiveness of institution in particular, universities should focus on ensuring conducive environment for enhancing emotional intelligence of the teaching professionals. Further since influence of emotional intelligence on transformational leadership behavior of teachers is mediated by job involvement of the teachers, steps must be taken towards identifying the factors (other than emotional intelligence) influencing job involvement of teachers and developing transformational leadership characteristics of their academic staff at all positions.

Given the significance emotional intelligence has in predicting organization commitment, job involvement and transformational leadership behavior of teachers and considering the impact such a behavior by 4038 emotionally intelligent teaching professionals (an estimate based on numbers disclosed by university representatives) may have on a population of over one lakh (i.e. 1,35,000 as per numbers disclosed by university representatives) students, emotional intelligence emerges as the center of powerful competencies which form the foundation for effective performance and other factors of desirable work behavior (organization commitment and job involvement). However, the association of emotional intelligence with the three constructs in the study i.e. transformational leadership, organization commitment and job involvement is moderate implying a possibility that teachers may be emotionally intelligent but they are not utilizing
their emotional intelligence potential in their teaching practice to full extent. This signifies a lacuna in the higher education system in India which does not recognize the importance of emotional intelligence of the teachers in transformation of the students. So far no mention of emotional intelligence skills is found in the process of selection and training of teachers. In the recent times, UGC has revamped its guidelines for selection of university teachers wherein qualification of NET has been made the eligibility criteria for applications to faculty positions in all disciplines (except the ones for which NET is not conducted) and it has been noticed that the selection criteria and NET exam focus on academic and research performance of the candidates. Therefore, emotional intelligence and TL skills are not given their due importance in the selection and training of teachers. Thus based on the findings from the study, following recommendations are made in terms of policy implications regarding recruitment, selection and training of teachers in the universities in the region (Punjab, Haryana and Chandigarh)-

i. Certain weightage should be given to competence of a candidate in emotional intelligence and transformational leadership in the assessment of domain knowledge and teaching skills criterion for selection of teachers to various positions.

ii. The National Eligibility Test conducted by UGC should also include assessment of emotional intelligence as part of Paper I which measures teaching aptitude.

iii. An induction program should be initiated in the universities for training the newly selected candidates before taking on their duties as teachers. The program targeted at ‘Training teachers how to teach’ should include a module on assessment and development of emotional intelligence and transformational leadership skills in addition to enhancement of academic and research knowledge, policies, rules and regulations of the institution.

iv. The existing training and development programs conducted by Academic Staff Colleges in the universities should consider inclusion of emotional intelligence and transformational leadership based module aimed at assessment, development and utilization of such emotional intelligence and transformational leadership skills in effective teaching.

v. Training in emotional intelligence should not be guided by passive lectures or explanation of what emotional intelligence is and its plausible role in effective
teaching. Rather a more focussed approach at evaluation of emotional intelligence and development of emotional intelligence skills should be adopted. A training program on emotional intelligence should be based on interactive training wherein participants are encouraged to ask questions and share personal experiences in the presence of a trainer who acts as a facilitator, drawing from the skills and insights of the members of the group while avoiding getting bogged down or side-tracked by extraneous issues; small group discussions; small group discovery exercises which include simulations, and are designed to help teachers to discover principles, untested assumptions, attitudes and behavioural insights and the participants are immersed in challenging and ambiguous situations that instigate strong emotional responses, followed by debriefing by the trainer who draws deep insights out of the participants and relates these insights to everyday work situations; role plays etc.

vi. A possibility of partnership with existing organizations offering Human Resource Consultancy services should be considered by the universities. HR consultancy firms like Hay Group and Mind Tools offer professional training programs in assessment and development of emotional intelligence skills. Collaboration with such professional organizations would ensure provision of specialized emotional intelligence training for the existing as well as newly hired faculty members. Later on, institutions with the help from resource persons in Academic Staff Colleges and the HR consultants may devise in-house training programs for development of emotional intelligence and transformational leadership skills.

vii. Emotional intelligence training should specifically focus on skills which have been found to be significantly associated with performance of teaching professionals as transformational leaders i.e. self-awareness, self-regulation, empathy, relationship management, motivation and self-management.

viii. Universities must focus on identifying the factors underlying job involvement of teaching professionals. The step towards improvement in quality of education or teaching needs to emphasize enhancing job involvement of academic staff through greater involvement of teachers in decision making and giving them greater autonomy.
ix. Further investigation into the relationships between emotional intelligence, organization commitment, job involvement and transformational leadership behavior of teaching professionals specifically with regard to management and engineering institutes is recommended in order to identify additional factors influencing these constructs.

x. Research must be conducted to identify the factors other than age, gender, qualification and experience which may have significant bearing on emotional intelligence of teaching professionals in universities.

8.3 Implications of the study

Taking into account the importance of transformational teacher leaders (Box 1.6) and significance of emotional intelligence in determining organization commitment, job involvement and transformational leadership behavior of teachers, the impact 4038 (an estimate based on numbers disclosed by university representatives) emotionally intelligent, highly committed and involved teachers exhibiting transformational leadership behavior would have on the population of over one lakh (i.e. approximately 1,35000 an estimate based on numbers disclosed by university representatives) students is tremendous. Moreover, as the number of students increase with every academic year, teachers as transformational leaders will have an escalating effect on the development of their students i.e. in addition to present 1, 35,000 (an estimate based on numbers disclosed by university representatives), more students would join engineering and management courses (B.Tech/M.Tech/MBA) in the region. Moreover, effects of transformational leadership behavior of teachers on students are not limited to provision of an environment conducive for effective learning. Rather, transformational leadership behaviors of teachers create a ripple effect i.e. transformational teacher leaders instigate their students to become transformational leaders. The enthusiasm, optimism and passion radiating from transformational teacher leaders are infectious. Therefore, emotionally intelligent teachers whose transformational leadership behavior forms an integral part of teaching practice transform their students who in turn serve as transformational leaders for hundreds and thousands of individuals they come across in their lives. Therefore, a chain of positive transformation begins with emotionally intelligent teachers emanating transformational
leadership behavior and the transformational leadership attributes are carried forward as legacy by generations of students. The indirect effects of emotionally intelligent transformational teacher leaders would be in strengthening the higher educational institutions, human resource development in the nation and development of students into self-dependent and passionate transformational leaders in various professions with strong ethical and moral values. Such effects would trickle down to propel socio-economic development in India.

Further, the research acknowledges that mere knowledge and possession of emotional intelligence does not ensure positive effects, rather emotional intelligence skills will be rendered futile, if not employed in the conduct of job duties. This highlights the need for development of emotional intelligence skills in academic staff. Also as per UGC guidelines emotional intelligence has not been regarded as a criterion for selection of university teachers during the UGC-NET exam as well as in selection interviews and emotional intelligence is not given its due consideration in training and development programs in universities. Thus, the research has implications for selection, training and development of teaching professionals.

8.4 Scope for future research

The present study highlights the importance of emotional intelligence of teaching professionals in management and engineering institutes in the universities in Punjab, Haryana and Chandigarh region. The research contributes to the existing pool of knowledge on emotional intelligence wherein emotionally intelligent teachers have high organization commitment, job involvement and greater chances of exhibiting transformational leadership behavior and hence are better performers. The future research regarding emotional intelligence of teachers and their performance as transformational leaders may be conducted in other departments of the universities in the region and additionally in other regions in India. Furthermore, the measure of effective performance of teachers as transformational leaders, employed in the study is student ratings of their teachers. However, there are numerous methods for measuring effectiveness of teachers e.g. peer ratings, department head ratings, self-evaluation, alumni ratings etc. Thus, future research may be conducted employing one or more of the other methods for measuring effective performance of teachers as transformational leaders.
8.5 Limitations of the study

The most unpredictable aspect in behavioral research is the human behavior itself. Response of an individual to a situation cannot be determined with 100% accuracy. Further, human behavior cannot be predicted by a single variable. Rather, it is determined by interaction of numerous factors acting simultaneously. Therefore, human behavior is highly subjective and establishing cause and effect relationship between two variables is limited under certain conditions and assumptions. Moreover, at no point of time can it be concluded that X is absolutely predicted by Y. Keeping in view these considerations regarding behavioral research, the inferences from this study must be drawn in consideration with following:

- The scope of the study is limited to population of teachers in management and engineering departments of universities.
- The study is based on a single measure of evaluation of effective performance of teachers i.e. student ratings. Although student ratings are the most recommended and widely used measure to evaluate effective performance of teachers but a holistic view must consider other strategies like peer ratings, employer ratings, alumni ratings, self-evaluation also.