CHAPTER-VI

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

6.1. Introduction

Karnataka State has attracted the attention of the nation as a model state from the point of view of socio-economic development. The rights of the transgender people are widely discussed by all right thinking persons in all walks of life. The transgender persons are also entitled to right to vote, right to own property, right to marriage, right to obtain legal documents (ration card, driver’s license, passport etc), right to education, right to employment, right to health, right against exploitation and right to integrated development. The male to female transsexuals constitute a microscopic minority in the state. They should be actively included in the mainstream of life as ‘third gender’ according to the recent judgment of the Supreme Court of India. The present study evaluated the socio-economic, health, human rights and other aspects of male to female transsexuals in the state of Karnataka. This chapter contains the summary and conclusion of the study, findings of the study, implications on the state and other stakeholders, implications on future research and epilogue.

The male to female transsexuals are indeed an important segment of the national population. In fact, transsexuals are threatened by several personal, health, social, educational, economic, political, psychological, cultural and environmental factors and forces. Societal and governmental intervention has become a highly challenging task of our times. The founding fathers of Indian Constitution had accorded a place of pride for the development of human resources. After independence, various welfare programs have been devised and implemented for the uplift of the socially and economically excluded, deprived and marginalized sections of Indian society. These measures have not disseminated significant benefits for the transsexuals due to lack of political will, social activism, community participation, media intervention and research support. Practically, all developing countries have accepted human resources development as an integral part of development planning. Evaluations dealing exclusively with the role of government and non-government organizations with special reference to rehabilitation and development of male to female transsexuals in Karnataka State are scanty as seen through the paucity of
literature. The need and importance of integrated rehabilitation and development of male to female transsexuals in Karnataka State is chiefly focused in the present study.


The socio-economic issues, sexual issues, healthcare issues, human rights issues of male to female transsexuals in Karnataka State are less understood mainly due to lack of comprehensive scientific studies. The primary data were gathered from 300 subjects. The present study approached the problem through a systematic survey method. Several tools and techniques like non-participant observation, informal discussion and secondary literature review were also used for the purpose of data collection. Prominent statistical analysis techniques such as percentage analysis, graphical representation and Chi-square test were also employed in the present study. This investigation primarily deals with the scientific evaluation of the factors associated with the life, status, problems and prospects of male to female transsexuals with special reference to Karnataka State.
The findings reveal that the male to female transsexuals are subjected to series of social constraints and hazards which have made their lives miserable in Karnataka. The respondents are also economically marginalized sections of Indian society since they are deprived of basic needs, infrastructure, education, properties, self-employment opportunities, public employment opportunities and other economic resources. The respondents are also deprived of basic health care facilities in general and advanced medicare facilities in particular. They suffer from innumerable health hazards which have cost their lives and prosperity very dearly. The respondents also suffer from several types of violations of human rights since they are excluded from the mainstream of national life. The findings of the study also revealed that male to female transsexuals of Karnataka state are subjected to several threats which have impeded their progress. The study emphasizes that male to female transsexuals need all round support for meaningful sustenance in the modern society.

The Constitution of India guarantees equal rights, opportunities and benefits to all sections of the society regardless of gender and other factors. Experience reveals that leading a life as a transgender is far from easy because such people can be neither categorized as male nor female and this deviation is unacceptable to the mankind in India and abroad. The male to female transsexuals are struggling for their existence due to several disadvantages. There are various stakeholders of empowerment of people in modern society. The transgender people suffer from great harm by attitudes of intolerance and hatred toward diverse gender expression. They have also been at the aggrieved end of financial extortion by the police in exchange for not revealing their identities to the society. The case analysis reveals that several reforms are needed in the existing laws for the realization of equal rights for the transgender community in Karnataka state. The government and other stakeholders should develop a sense of conscience and empathy towards the sexual minorities and prepare grounds for making transgender community free from violence, discrimination, exploitation and other oppressive features at all levels of the modern society.
6.2. SUMMARY

6.2.1 Demographic Details of the Respondents

There were a majority of the respondents representing the categories of primary and metric educational groups (70.00%), age group of 15-35 years (64.00%), beggars and sex workers (73.66%) and monthly income group of Rs.1000-6000 (63.00%). It is evident from the data that a greater part of the male to female transsexuals were young, fairly educated and below the poverty line in the study areas.

6.2.2 Social Aspects of Male to Female Transsexuals

The respondents 88.67% of them experienced ‘gender dysphoria and yearned for gender crossing’. 55.33% experienced the ‘fear of seen as the wrong sex by others’, 61.33% respondents have stated that their ‘family members considered them as a freak to be shunned’, 68.33% of them discriminated with respect to food and shelter and 81.33% health and nutrition, 67.00% them discriminated against them with respect to educational facilities from their families, 73.67% respondents discriminated against them with respect to social freedom and mobility, 78.33% discriminated against them with respect to economic equity and development from their families. 64.67% were stated that they subjected them to social isolation.

Majority (89.00%) of them were denied the opportunities to livelihood, 88.00% were denied employment opportunities by the community, 90.00% of them endure the problem of social invisibility, 89.00% respondents experienced intersexuality related stigma and trauma, 84.00% them considered as source of eternal disgust and perennial fear, 77.00% of respondents have experienced the sense of denigration after the gender reassignment surgery. 84.00% have stated that they did not enter into any loving relationship after post-operative care.

6.2.3 Economic Aspects of MTF Transsexuals

All the respondents (100.00%) regardless of education, age, profession and income background have stated that they suffered from the ‘no openings for procuring livelihood through cooperative ventures’, refusal of entrepreneurship development opportunities, rejection of procuring livelihood through self help group initiatives,
pension benefit, 99.33% have stated that they suffered from the denial of employment opportunities by the state.

A majority of the respondents (91.00%) regardless of education, age, profession and income background have stated that they suffered from the denial of basic needs by the state, 92.67% ration card, 98.67% passport, 99.33% driving License, 89.33% PAN card and 99.00% they suffered from the denial of house site by the state.

A majority of the respondents (91.33%) have stated that they suffered from the denial of procuring livelihood through begging by the state. 90.67% of them denial of procuring livelihood through sex work by the state. 89.67% regardless of education, age, profession and income background have stated that they suffered from the denial of procuring livelihood through government welfare schemes. 89.33% have stated that they suffered from the denial of allotment of land for cultivation, 88.33% have stated that they suffered from the denial of loan and subsidy for self employment by the state.

6.2.4 Health Aspects of MTF Transsexuals

All respondents (100.00%) regardless of education, age, profession and income background have stated that they suffered from the legal hindrance during the sex reassignment surgery, absence of appropriate analysis in the medical centres and laboratories, denial of timely medicare facilities, non availability of competent health professionals and medical counselors, the non availability of specialized medicare facilities.

A majority of the respondents apart from the education, age, profession and income background 98.67% regardless of education, age, profession and income background have stated that they suffered from the non availability of emotional support, 98.33% have confirmed that they suffered from the absence of consultation from authentic clinical behavioral scientists for gender reassignment surgery, 95.67% of them experience from the inconsistency of counseling and treatment from an endocrinologist, 92.67% respondents were suffered from the tendency of
homophobia. 85.67% respondents, they bear the sexually transmitted diseases including HIV/AIDS, 86.33% respondents suffered from the absence of timely financial assistance from the family members, friends and well wishers the gender reassignment surgery, 85.33% of they suffered from the absence of right to health on par with men and women in modern society, 85.00% were endure from the ill treatment by the health care personnel, 79.00% have be ill with the deprivation of basic health facilities, 82.00% of them experience from the substance use including drug and liquor, 75.33% were stated that they suffered from physical health disorders. 79.67% respondents have a medical condition of mental health disorders, 61.00% them endure sexual health disorders and 39.67% they suffered from the suicidal tendency.

6.2.5. Human Rights Aspects of MTF Transsexuals

All the respondents (100.00%) regardless of education, age, profession and income background have stated that they suffered from the non-inclusion of their name under ‘other’ category, suffered from the denial of economic equity and justice, suffered from the denial of social security, suffered from the denial of equal rights and opportunities, suffered from the denial of political leadership development opportunities.

A majority of the respondents (94.00%) regardless of education, age, profession and income background have stated that they suffered from the denial of right to education, 85.00% suffered from the ill-treatment of doctors in times of need. 81.33% suffered from molestation and physical harassment problems, 79.33% suffered from the atrocities committed by the fellow citizens, 61.33% they suffered from the police atrocities, Very less percentage (15.00%) of the respondents regardless of education, age, profession and income background have stated that they suffered from the negative portrayal of third gender in the media.

6.2.6 Case Analysis Findings

A majority of the male to female transsexuals belonged to the age group of 20-40 years and constituted the younger age group; belonged to the socially and economically backward sections of the society; below the poverty line families; experienced domestic violence and harassment on account of transsexuality; could not
study beyond matriculation on account of poverty; left their homes mainly because of exclusion by the society; male to female transsexuals came in contact with fellow transsexuals and found shelter in the cities and townships. They had obtained the benefit of sex reassignment surgery by mobilizing funds on their own initiatives; obtained modern treatment for the breast improvement; transsexuals had lived away from home and relied upon sex work for their sustenance.

A greater part of the male to female transsexuals helped their family members financially and gained their acceptance subsequently; experienced atrocities from the police, anti-social elements and others; they were denied of civic identities, amenities and facilities; wanted to live a normal life by obtaining financial assistance and moral support from the government and society; transsexuals wanted to live with social dignity and economic independence.

6.2.7 Testing of Hypotheses

H1: The male to female transsexuals in Karnataka State suffered from several social disadvantages.

The data reveal that the male to female transsexuals in Karnataka state suffered from several social disadvantages. Hence, the above hypothesis stands proved according to the data analysis.

H2: The male to female transsexuals in Karnataka State suffered from several economic constraints.

The data reveal that the male to female transsexuals in Karnataka state have suffered from several economic constraints. Hence, the above hypothesis stands proved according to the data analysis.

H3: The male to female transsexuals in Karnataka State suffered from several health hazards.

The data reveal that the male to female transsexuals in Karnataka state suffered from several health hazards. Hence, the above hypothesis stands proved according to the data analysis.
H4: The male to female transsexuals in Karnataka State suffered from series of human rights violations.

The data reveal that the male to female transsexuals in Karnataka state have suffered from series of violations of human rights. Hence, the above hypothesis stands proved according to the data analysis.

6.2.8 Limitations of the Study

The usual limitations of the survey method, namely time, human inadequacies, resource inadequacies, recollection and communication were experienced by the researcher. It was practically not possible to contact all the male to female transsexuals and various stakeholders responsible for the rehabilitation and progress of male to female transsexuals mainly due to lack of time. An exhaustive and intensive study was not possible because of large numbers and usual constraints. The purposive sampling technique was followed in selecting the subjects. Though much care had been taken to collect the primary data, the memory bias on the part of the respondents cannot be ruled out completely. The specific limitations of the study must be considered. The data may not be generalizable to other population spread across various regions of the country. Second, the sample included the male to female transsexuals, who are not competent enough to provide authoritative and critical comments on the subject concerned. Third, the attitudes, behaviors, problems and prospects of male to female transsexuals may not embrace the whole gamut of the life of male to female transsexuals in Karnataka State. Despite these potential limitations the researcher was able to survey relatively large and diverse sample of male to female transsexuals in the study area.

6.2.9. Implications of the Study

The analysis revealed the actual state of affairs pertaining to male to female transsexuals in Karnataka state. The analysis also put the search light on the socio-economic status, health status, human rights status of male to female transsexuals in the state. The implications of the study are presented as follows.
6.2.10 Implications on Government of India

The present investigation reveals that it is imperative to formulate a national policy on transgender people who are the most backward and marginalized sections of modern society. The constitutional safeguards and promotional measures should be extended to the transgender people who are deprived of their fundamental rights and opportunities. The transgender community should get the basic rights which include right to personal liberty, dignity, freedom of expression, right to education, right against exploitation and right to empowerment. They should enjoy the fundamental rights and developmental opportunities and par with other sections of society. The state is also responsible for providing basic education, vocational education, employment opportunities, healthcare facilities, inheritance of property, adoption of child, access to public space, access to legal rights and allied facilities for the inclusive growth and development of transsexuals. They should be treated equally, respectfully and without any discrimination. The state should also provide subsidy to all those transgenders in the field of education, healthcare, business, cooperative management and other fields of development. The state should also take affirmative action to achieve the goal of equality by providing adequate opportunities for transgenders in all walks of life. The state should also implement welfare and protective measures in order to achieve gender justice and equity. Comprehensive civil rights legislation should be enacted to provide equal rights and opportunities to the transsexuals on the principle of non-discrimination. A comprehensive sexual assault law should be enacted applying to all persons irrespective of their sexual orientation and marital status. Police reforms are also required to facilitate transparency, accountability and responsibility in the dealings with transsexuals. The police officials should be sensitize about human rights of the transsexuals. A comprehensive sex-education programme should be included in the curricula at various levels to foster a liberal and progressive outlook among the people. The discrimination in medical treatment of transsexuals should be avoided. The transsexuals should be recognized as a marginalized section of society in order to provide all government instrumentalities and opportunities. The transsexuals should be given necessary opportunities in all walks of life. The government should also create a special database of transgenders that would help deal with their problems and
demands. A national commission should also be constituted for the transsexuals to prepare grounds for their protection and empowerment.

6.2.11 Implications on State Government

The state governments and union territories should also be encouraged to constitute regional welfare boards for the transgenders in order to implement various welfare schemes. Loan, subsidy, entrepreneurship development, personality development, leadership development and other opportunities should also be created for the transsexuals. In particular, the state government of Karnataka should provide adequate funds and facilities for the inclusive and integrated development of transgenders in urban and rural areas. The development departments should also be motivated to design and implement various welfare programmes for the inclusive growth and development of transsexuals in the state. The efforts made by the Government of Tamil Nadu deserve special attention. Similar initiatives are required in the Karnataka state to facilitate the development of transsexual persons.

6.2.12 Implications on Educational Institutions

The schools, colleges and universities are required to change the mindset of the people about transgenders through formal and informal teaching, training, research, publication and extension activities. The children, adolescents and youth require proper upbringing academically. The young transsexuals are often rejected, neglected and abused by the family members and fellow citizens. Suitable educational campaigns would enable the members of the family and society to provide equal treatment and opportunities to the members of the transgender community. The educational institutions have a great social responsibility of changing the mindset of the people and motivating them to become the champion of human rights and gender justice.

6.2.13 Implications on Healthcare Institutions

There is a need for reforming the health care institutions in India. The Medical Council of India should issue guidelines to the medical professionals and avoid discrimination in medical treatment of transsexuals. Any kind of refusal to treat a person on the basis of gender identity should be considered as a serious professional misconduct. The medical curricula in various medical colleges should be reformed to
prevent seeing transgenderism as a disease and a deviance. Adequate health communication programmes are also necessary to provide proper orientation to the general public’s and medical professionals with respect to protection of the rights of the transgenders. Suitable action plans should be drawn for the rehabilitation of transgenders through health awareness programmes and providing health education opportunities. The transsexuals are normally prone to health hazards. Hence, they need proper medical facilities including insurance in the health sector.

6.2.14 Implications on Media Institutions

The corporate social responsibility of media demands that mass media organizations should sensitize the various stakeholders of the empowerment of transsexual people. The media should launch series of campaigns in order to educate and sensitize the policy makers, bureaucrats, scientists, technocrats and other stakeholders of gender justice and empowerment and popularize the beneficial effects of various government schemes and non-governmental initiatives. The print media should provide adequate space for discussion of the status, problems and prospects of transsexual people. The electronic media should also provide special audiences programmes which benefit the various stakeholders of development of transsexual people to take appropriate actions. The new communication technologies and social media should also be utilized by the public and private media to popularize the beneficial effects of various policies and measures for the empowerment of transsexual people. The information and publicity divisions of various governments should also launch series of campaigns on the rights of transsexual people in modern society. The media institutions should take all possible steps for bringing the transsexual community into the mainstream of national life.

6.2.15 Implications on Non-Government Organizations

The non-government organizations are also equally responsible for the protection and development of transsexual people in modern society. These organizations are also rightly considered as the ‘third force’ of civil society. The NGOs should also provide series of educational, healthcare, human rights and development oriented services to the transgender people. Various communications media, social organizers, social activists and volunteers should be properly utilized by the NGOs for various educational and developmental endeavors in a developing
country like India. These organizations should also play a major role in transforming the lives of transgender people through better participatory communication and development programmes.

6.2.16 Implications on Research and Development Organisations

There are good numbers of research and development organizations in Karnataka and other parts of the country. They should conduct innovative research and extension programmes which would sensitize the various stakeholders of social justice, gender justice, public welfare and development of marginalized sections of Indian society. Series of research and development activities are required in Indian society to ensure equality in all spheres. Target group specific, area specific and problem specific research endeavors would go a long way in ensuring human rights protection and empowerment of transgender people. This community is pushed to the periphery as a social outcaste and usually end up begging, dancing, flesh trading and other activities for survival. The research and development institutions are called upon to play a pro-active role, explore new redressal mechanisms, identify development measures and facilitate the sustainable development of transgender community.

6.3 CONCLUSION

The transsexual people are subjected to multi faceted inconveniences, injustices, deprivations and discriminatory tendencies in modern society. The present study is effort to explore the An Anthropological study of Male to Female transsexuals in Mysore and Bangalore Cities, Karnataka, India’. The study is conducted to understand socio-economic status, health status and human rights violations of male to female transsexuals in Karnataka state. The present study reveals that male to female transsexuals face pervasive discrimination in virtually all walks of life. The transsexual people live below the poverty line in all respects. They are subjected to several social disadvantages, health hazards, human rights violations and economic constraints. They have been educationally most backward and economically marginalized sections of our society. They are also victims of ill health and other health related disadvantages. They are also deprived of their civic amenities and basic health care facilities. The respondents have also reported experiencing homelessness in their lives. The Government should take steps for bringing the transsexual
community into the mainstream by providing adequate healthcare, education, employment and security.

6.4 SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

The present study evaluated the status and problems of male to female transsexuals of Karnataka state. There are many areas which demand continuous research and developmental endeavors from various individuals and institutions in a developing country like India. The rights of transsexual people, basic needs of the transsexual people, protection of privacy rights of transsexual people, human trafficking of transsexual people, health and family welfare of transsexual people, educational empowerment of transsexual people, social inclusion of transsexual people, economic development of transsexual people, political empowerment of transsexual people, entrepreneurship development of transsexual people, leadership development of transsexual people, media intervention for the development of transsexual people, intervention of NGOs for the development of transsexual people, support of civil society for the development of transsexual people, police reforms for the protection of transsexual people, reforming the medical establishment for the transsexual people, legal recognition of post-operative transsexual people, judicial activism for the development of transsexual people, social activism for the development of transsexual people, social security for the transsexual people and other important aspects demand future research endeavors. There is a need for establishment of linkage between transgender people and various stakeholders of development in order to facilitate the empowerment of transsexual people in the new millennium. The future generation of researchers should concentrate on scientific evaluation of status, problems and prospects of transsexual people on a missionary zeal and social commitment.