CHAPTER – 6

CONCLUSION

The three historical forces namely Muslim Separatism, Congress Nationalism and British Imperialism are the three most vital causes and reasons behind one of the most tragic events of the 20\textsuperscript{th} century, Partition of the Indian subcontinent. The holocaust resulted into mass migration from both the sides of the border of which ‘how many could not reach’ remains an all time mystery. People on the either sides, India and Pakistan were not simply killed, but were butchered. Physically Partition meant migration, mass killings, abductions, rapes and destructions; emotionally it was a traumatic experience for not only the victims but also for all who could think and feel and spiritually it meant killing humanity, fraternity and respect for one’s fellow human being.

Jinnah, the promoter of Two Nation theories is called a victim of personality conflict by many historians and theorists. It is believed that his ‘two nation theory’ was supported by the fear factor regarding Hindu Majority ruling over Muslim minority. Thus, religion was used by the modernist elite leaders to promote Separatism or Communalism, one of the three key factors behind Partition.

Nationalism or Indian National movement, on the other hand was mobilized to drive out colonial rule from the country and to bring in self Government. But here too the communal spirit deteriorated the National strength. The misunderstandings and misinterpretations between Hindu and Muslim leaders and the faulty execution of Indian National Movement can be considered the second key factor responsible for Partition. Muslim elite leaders firmly demanded a Muslim Nation and the Hindu leaders did not deny it.
‘The divide and rule policy’ by the shrewd British Imperialists succeeded in India and thus failed the country. For British, it was easy to create a fissure in the fraternity between culturally different but socially united communities like Hindu, Sikh and Muslims. They started the policy of cultural division from Bengal. Their suggestion for separate Muslim electorate was enough to air separatism. The early declaration of ‘withdraw of power’ created confusion amongst leaders and the people. Thus the British injected chaos of communalism and lack of preparation to the long awaited Independence of India. Imperialism, thus, is the third important key factor responsible for the partition of the sub-continent.

Like the reasons behind Partition the effects of Partition are equally important issues to ponder on. It has nourished the poisonous tree of ‘communalism’ in the psyche of people of India and Pakistan. It has divided the sub-continent not just geographically or politically, but has also shattered the dreams of ‘Surajya’ seen by the martyrs among the freedom fighters. Those who gave up their lives to provide freedom to future generations of India would have never imagined a divided sub continent. 15th August, 1947 India did become a ‘Swaraj’, but after six decades too, it still has not reached the height of ‘Surajya’ owing to communalism as one of the major reasons.

It is said that when the arms are chopped off pain is felt by both: the body and equally by the arms. The pain of Partition got reflected on both the sides of the border in different art forms like novels, poetry, drama, essays, painting, dances and the youngest of all art forms, films. This most disturbing event’s agony, torture, pangs and pain has found maximum space of expression in fiction, namely the social and political novels. The expression of tragedy has not lessened even after six decades.
Most of the novels dealing with the beast of Partition are in conflict with the humanity and communal attitude finally defeated by secularism. Many of the novels end with love and goodness winning over bad elements of the time. They begin with communal harmony; proceed towards misunderstandings, misinterpretations, doubt, suspects, disharmony and moral degradation of man. But finally all the stories end with a peaceful and relaxed conclusion of eternal love, fraternity and brotherhood.

The present study concentrates on four novels, namely Khushwant Singh’s *Train to Pakistan* (the first major Indian English novel on Partition), Bapsi Sidhwa’s *Ice-Candy Man* (Pakistan based Parsee female writer’s major work), Bhisham Sahni’s *Tamas* (a Hindi and later translated into English novel narrating reasons and effects of Partition at micro level) and Amrita Pritam’s *Pinjar* (A Punjabi, Hindi novel depicting problems faced by women in pre Partition and Partition period.

Khushwant Singh’s novel *Train to Pakistan* tells how the psyche of the Mano Majra, a sleepy little village changes suddenly as they come to know about an event called Partition through the outsiders and owing to that how communal harmony and consequently their lives are affected and change overnight. The feeling of doubt and insecurity was triggered by arrival of two trains loaded with dead bodies of Sikhs and Hindus from Pakistan and halt at Mano Majra. After the sterile efforts of Hukumchand to stop the violence and Iqbal’s retreat to the dreams of bravery, it is finally, leaving all the strong, powerful and educated characters aside, the character of Jugga, a local dacoit, raises high in performing the fatal brave act of saving the train boarded by his Muslim beloved along with other Muslims. He does this at the cost of his own life. Thus love and affection wins over religious and communal hatred.
Bapsi Sidhwa’s *Ice-Candy Man* tells of the trauma and its effect on the lives of different communities living in Lahore in 1947. The novel can be called a depiction of minority complex full of distrust and fear and ways they used to avoid discord and death. It also tells of Parsis who worked on the strategy to settle with who-so-ever came as the government. The defiling of the Ayah shows how woman was used to show the power of any community murdering all the values like trust, faith, friendship, brotherhood and affection.

Bhisham Sahni, in *Tamas* tells of how people with the mask of religion and social service indulge into heinous act of spreading communal fury and cause agitation. Sahni begins with a tragedy caused by the carcass of a pig thrown on the footsteps of a mosque and ends with scores of human bodies lying along the pathways. This one evil act becomes the fuel to the suppressed communal agitation. Though the agitation calms down, the burns left on the individuals and the society cannot be healed. The novel also narrates in details the uninterested and cunningly retreating Imperialism.

Amrita Pritam’s *Pinjar* starts with the abduction of Pooro, a Hindu female in the Pre-Partition period by Rashid, a Muslim youth and her rejection by her parents. Suffering the scar of orthodoxy and fear, she returns to her abductor and accepts him as her life partner. Pooro faces the trauma of dislocation and change of identity. And later during the Partition period, Pooro’s brother’s wife is put into a similar situation; she too is abducted by a Muslim. But this time the orthodoxy is diluted giving way to flexibility in the name of re-habilitation. Pooro with Rashid rescues her. Fearing dislocation once again, Pooro refuses to go back to India and chooses Pakistan as her home and Rashid as her family.
Of all the writers of Partition novels, most of them have either suffered or witnessed the trauma and have narrated the tragedy in true and vivid colours with the grave strokes of pain and pangs. Most of them have narrated the time of action immediately before or after the Partition, leaving Pinjar which starts from pre-partition period in 1936. As the writers of all the four novels included in the present study have faced the agitation of Partition in one or the other manner, their creative endeavors have reflected their respective experiences in different and distinguished ways.

A marked feature of these novels is the depiction of migration – dislocation of millions of people across the Indo-Pak border. In all the four novels the narration of migration or pre-migration and post-migration refugee camps is narrated in a heart rendering manner. Along with migration, the writers have not missed to capture the beastly acts like loot and arson, killings, abductions and rapes that occurred in the cruelest way during this time. The ghost train carrying only dead bodies of those migrating to India in *Train to Pakistan*, a similar train arrives at Lahore Railway station from Gurudaspur carrying corpses and sacks full of chopped breasts of women in *Ice-Candy Man*, stories told by the refugees at the refugee camp in *Tamas* and abduction of Hindu girls in the refugee ‘Kafila’ by Muslims in *Pinjar* are a few of the many instances.

Three of these novels also tell of the loss of identity faced by both man and woman during the Partition agitation. In *Ice-Candy man* Shanta, Lenny’s Hindu Ayah is made a prostitute and is renamed ‘Mumtaz’ by the Ice-candy man, Iqbal Singh, Harnam Singh’s son in *Tamas* is forced to become a Muslim. He is circumcised, given a Muslim cut beard, and is also forced to eat meat. Pooro, in *Pinjar* is rechristened as Hamida. These characters unwillingly accept the changed identity and
continue to live a subdued life. They do not oppose because either they are alone amidst the crowd of the enemy, or are not in a condition to react. However, what matters is their ‘desire to live’, to survive and to push off with their lives. No one wants to die. Only Pooro could re-adjust to this new situation and come to terms with life. Sahni leaves Harnam Singh and Iqbal behind to advance his story towards a different dimension. Shanta is rescued and rehabilitated unlike Pooro, who too had a chance to return to her family but declined. Shanta moves ahead to regain her former identity and could migrate across the border to her people.

All the novels highlight the retreating steps, rejection of action, or disinterest on the part of higher literate class, bureaucrats, imperialists and communists at the time of need during the holocaust. Hukumchand, Iqbal, Richard, Shethi couple, Pooro and Ramchand’s parents look defeated and backs out when an action was needed on their part. Instead of these, illiterate, semi-literate, children and those belonging to economically lower class, which too are in greater trouble, shine out as heroes in their own little spaces owing to their second or third seat in the hierarchy.

For instance, Jugga, a local Hindu dacoit saves the whole train going to Pakistan at the cost of his own life; Lenny with her God Mother strive to help the Ayah; Harnam Singh and Banto are helped and given shelter by Rajjo, a Muslim lady and Laajo is helped to escape her abductors by Rashid, the Muslim abductor of Pooro. These acts can be defined as motif of love and fraternity prevailing amongst the less educated and economically lower class in India as well as in Pakistan. In all the four novels, the higher class neglects the emergency and the mediocre act for the cause of love and brotherhood.
All the novels, with exception of Sahani’s, have element of ‘love’ at their core, as the main reason that leads to the climax of the text. In *Train to Pakistan*, for instance, Jugga’s love for Nooran initiates and compels him to risk his life to rescue his beloved and consequently the entire train, bound for Pakistan is saved; in *Ice Candy Man* the protagonist, Ice Candy Man’s love and affection for Shanta prompts him to act as an antagonist, a villain and to abduct and rape Shanta as he wanted to possess her; in *Pinjar* Pooro’s abduction by Rashid has love as one of the reasons. As the novel advances, his love for Pooro gradually transforms her hatred into admirations. She starts acknowledging the inherent good qualities in him and consequently opts to remain with him rather than going to India to join her Hindu family. Noticeably, in each case, without any exception, love and affection blossoms between the rival communities – Hindus, Muslims and Sikhs who were thirsty of one another’s blood at the time of Partition.

All these novels, following a notable lapse of time after their publication, were brought on silver screen as movies by the experienced or upcoming but ambitious film makers and their teams. They could help the novel reach the non-reader groups too through the medium of silver screen as today Cinema has reached a great height of popularity as a medium of information and entertainment with its sole capacity: moving, talking visuals.

Indian Cinema, one of the largest film industries, has countable movies on the theme of Partition, the greatest tragedy that India has faced. This is surprisingly a bitter fact. This can be because Partition is considered a very sensitive issue for screen for the mixed recipient in a country like India where communal riots remain in news at one or the other places. There are, of course, a large number of films on terrorism, one of the major consequences of Partition. But this is because, that will not compel
any particular community to identify themselves with a terrorist or a group of terrorists and the film-maker can always dilute the effect by introducing characters from the terrorist’s community as a previously troubled person as well. Another reason is that a terrorist can be shown as an isolated figure or group too. On the other hand Partition cannot be taken as an insignificant or individual incident as it affected a large part of both the nations and also ahuge multitude on both the sides of the border. Because of this, the horror re-liven on the screen may kindle the sentiments of people who had undergone that trauma themselves or had lost their people and possessions due to it.

When any film maker makes a film for the Indian audience, he does take care of certain aspects, especially, when it is a commercial film. He gives his film attractive sets and costumes, adds different shades of colours, and uses melodrama, songs and dance to furnish his film so as to make it acceptable by the audience of any and all the backgrounds.

It is observed that even though the directors and the unit of the films based on Partition lack in the first hand experience of traumas and pages of Partition, they have been faithful to the experiences depicted in the novel.

It should also be noted that adaptation follows its own rules and regulations, especially when it is that of a novel into a film. Both the narratives – the novel and the film have certain similarities and differences. The similarity is the story. The novel gives a thought to the film-maker, an idea, a concept. The film-maker gives this story-line a specific shape fit in a fix time period.

The novels and films are similar at the point that they imitate human actions and give their creator and appreciator joy and satisfaction. They also follow similar
patterns of narration and take their readers and viewers to the world of imagination. Both use techniques like flashbacks, dialogues, monologues, dreams and stream of consciousness and thus annihilate or manipulate time. Both arrange their subject in predetermined logical frame, the plot of the story.

The basic difference between the two narratives is their use of different mediums to accomplish their idea, thought or concept concretely. Writer uses words and auteur uses visuals. Unlike novels, a film supplies physical details with its visualizing ability. The writer has to satisfy the urge of a small interested minority, whereas, the film, a mass medium, has to meet the expectations and imaginations of the mass and yet maintain the story and quality.

The film maker can use his camera lens and let it function like an eye for the audience. Film presents all the tenses as the present tense. Unlike novel, its physical time can be speeded up, stretched or even frozen. Film can show external scenes and inner thoughts moving ahead parallel simultaneously through the juxtaposition of the sound track. The movement of camera and its lens helps to create impression of movement. Film uses sound effect, music and silence to create excitement, tension, suspense or even dream. A film can alter the appearance of anything, person or place using aids like lights, sets and make up.

When the four novels *Train to Pakistan, 1947 Earth, Tamas the Darkness and Pinjar… beyond boundaries* were transferred to screen respectively, the motif behind their filmisation was either a strong wish to work on Partition theme or to bring this tragic chapter of history to the mass that would not read these works. Partition, being a sensitive issue, all the four directors, namely Pamela Rooks, Deepa Mehta, Govind
Nihlani and Chandraprakash Dwivedi have taken the assistance of their respective novelists in framing the screen play for the film.

The film-makers have introduced minor and major changes while adapting the novels into films. These shifts have multiple reasons like to give linearity; compress the time frame; dilute the effect of horror; highlight certain aspect or point of view among the others depending on the novel and the intention of the author and the director. The film *Train to Pakistan*, unlike the novel, begins with Hukumchand as the narrator of the past and the present of Mano Majra. This controls the time used by the movie. The audience comes to know of Jugga and Mano Majra in just a few minutes in the beginning itself. Whereas in the book, Jugga’s character is built up gradually and the readers take some time to perceive Mano Majra with all its characteristics. The village, as discussed in the preceding chapter plays an important role in the novel and the author has delineated it with care and concern in the novel. Keeping the limitation of the film version, the director has two options. Either to move around the village with a camera zooming in and zooming out, to create an image of the village compatible with its counterpart in print, or make some one describe it with its specificities. Later being more convient is adopted by the director. Same is the case with the character of Jugga.

*1947 Earth*, unlike *Ice Candy Man* stops with the abduction of Ayah. Deepa Mehta does not give any solution to the problem and makes the audience leave cinema hall shocked. This makes the film compact. Rehabilitation of Ayah on screen may have spoiled the compactness of the film. Mehta tells of what could have happened with Ayah in the short concluding narration by grown up Lenny. Such a choice makes the film open-ended and saves it from the unnecessary lengthening of the story, which might have affected the flow adversely.
The mini tele series *Tamas* differs from its source text. Govind Nihlani makes the two less important characters of the novel, Nathu and his wife, the linking chain that leads the viewers ahead from beginning to end of the television series. This helps the series move ahead in a logical sequence and prevents it from becoming episodic fragments like its source text. Unlike the novel, Nathu’s wife gives birth to their child after Nathu’s death at the refugee camp amidst the shouts of ‘Allah-o-Akbar’ and ‘Har-Har Mahadev’. This alteration brings out the parallel truths of life like hatred and love, filth and purity, frustration and hope. The end lifts the television series to a greater height. It confirms one’s faith in humanity and lends a sort of positivity to the film

*Pinjar…beyond boundaries* has characters who are grown ups and mature, whereas in its counterpart in print they are not yet adults. This justifies the decisions they take and gives the director a space to dovetail the narrative more convincingly. Unlike the novel, mature Ramchand rejects the proposal to marry abducted Pooro’s sister and remain a bachelor; Trilok, Pooro’s brother, strives to find out Pooro, he cannot adjust in his married life. Pooro herself is also not a timid girl in her early teens. She is capable of gulping the insults and get adjusted to the changing situations. Owing to such changes the actions of the major characters seem realistic. Consequently, the character of Pooro in the film proves stronger than Amrita Pritam’s Pooro.

Chandraprakash Dwivedi, by making a slight change in the novel, makes Pooro’s task towards the end very difficult. Her decision of not returning to India sounds more difficult as in the film, Ramchand is a bachelor, and Pooro has lost her child. Moreover, the mad woman’s child is taken away by the Hindus. In such a situation, the paths towards India were easy to travel. However, like her counterpart
in the novel, Pooro chooses Rashid and stays back in Pakistan. This decision seems more difficult but convincing than the same decision taken by Pooro of the novel. Her mature love for Rashid is recognized more in film compared to the text.

Films, a mass medium has to cater the likes and dislikes of varieties of viewers. Along with it, films have to give truth in comparatively simpler and digestible manner. Easy, simple and less violent films are always admired. The four film-makers have tried to avoid too much of violence on screen. In *Tamas the Darkness* the scenes of violence are smartly violent without showing violence directly on the screen. Nihlani has shown violence not exactly happening. Viewers see it reflected in the eyes and facial expressions of the victims and and the dead bodies after the murder or massacre. Grain market is shown burning bright in the night. But no one is shown setting fire to it. However, if a fictional writer chooses to opt for the same technique, s/he might have to use many adjectives, and occupy much space in describing the facial expressions of characters involved or their reflections about the event. However, when it comes to the screen, in the case of an adept actor all these pains can be saved. Nihlani, being an experienced director, kills two birds by depending on the acting skills of his star-cast. He has been able to get desired result by focusing on the facial expressions of the actors and avoided direct depiction of violence on the scene, as doing so might have ignited controversy as visual medium can prove more powerful and far reaching than the print medium which addresses less number of people directly.

Similarly, in *1947 Earth*, the train carrying dead bodies arrive at Lahore railway station. The audience realizes the horror through Amir Khan’s body language and facial expressions. Depiction or description of the massacre is hardly required. What occupies number of pages in the novel is shown in a few moments in the film
and with almost the same intensity. Horror in the eyes of the hero automatically gets transferred in the numerous pairs of eyes glued to the screen. Moreover, emotions are easy to transfer through visual shots than printed words, as reading requires more training and efforts.

In *Train to Pakistan* the scenes of loot and chaos are very short. Mali and Sikh outsiders are shown stealing away things from the Muslim houses in a few shots only. The director uses the technique of long and short shots to highlight and dilute various scenes depicted in the novel. In addition, most of the early events in the novels are presented indirectly in the film. First person narration by Hukumchand brings down the intensity of looting as that act comes to the reader as second-hand experience.

However, interface between film and fiction depends on the mutual understanding of the creative writer and the film maker and their respective points of views. It largely depends on the orientation of the director and what s/he chooses to highlight, twist, turn and alter; keeping his/her audience in mind.

Different from the three earlier discussed instances, *Pinjar….beyond boundaries* shows riots and blood-shed in their true colours.

The reason is hard to seek, unless the director chooses to share. However, one can speculate that either owing to lack of the first hand exposure to Partition or its tragedy, he prefers to keep the experience of the author in tact; or temperamentally, he is keen to be closer to reality of the event and the fictional world created by the author. He has followed the text faithfully. As narrated in the text, blood is shown flooding the gutters, men running around with open swords and spears piercing the enemy, buses ablazed, people pouring kerosene on the houses to set fire and burning resident screaming for help. Consequently, instead of depending on the actors, he
uses the visual imagery. On one hand, he rolls his camera on the action, giving the film a sort of pace and depends on the strength of acting of his major characters when it comes to articulating some touching moments in their lives. The opening scene of the film makes the intention of the director obvious. Emotions of Pooro are captured symbolically by showing her counterparts reminiscing on her past frequently. The director has combined the long and short shots and use of colour frames very effectively to create a desired atmosphere quite from the beginning. However, stark reality is well balanced with jovial songs and colourful costumes of the actors celebrating festivity.

Apart to this, one can observe that in addition to all the directors all the techniques available to them, the directors have used colours of costumes and songs to create appropriate atmosphere and achieve desired results. The limitations of visual medium to handle some of the specificities of the print medium are overcome by proper use of techniques and songs.

Songs, in fact, help them to create right mood and also help to advance the story in certain cases. The songs, music and silence have made the Partition theme more serene. For instance, the shouts ‘Aaayo Rabbaa’ with the titles of Tamas, the song ‘Waris Shah nu….’ in Pinjar….beyond boundaries, drumbeats with the arrival of the ghost train in 1947 Earth and the poisonous silence with fly’s buzzing in the ghost train in Train to Pakistan take the tragedy shown on screen to a great height, making the climax scene more appaling and appealing. The lights and shadow used by Nihlani, change of colours of the same place on Ice-Candywalla’s terrace by Mehta, monochrome effect of blue in the black light by Rooks and the change of shades from bright to grave by Dwivedi lend desired effects and help the audience feel Partition scene deeply and intensely.
The subsequent directors have also avoided siding with any of the communities or addressing the political problems of the time. Deepa Mehta has avoided Sidhwa’s comments on Gandhi, Nehru and Jinnah. Similarly Nihlani too has avoided many of the comments on the failure of the contemporary leaders. He has also not used the name ‘Murad Ali’ given by Bhisham Sahni to the Thekedar. Nihlani has very smartly balanced the good and bad of all the communities by adding and editing episodes. Rooks has tried to keep a balance between Granthi and Imam Baksh. Thus though the authors of the subsequent novels have first-hand experience of Partition, and have translated their experience very effectively and deeply while creating their fictional world, their counterparts on the screen do not give the same impression. Ruthlessness and blood-thirstiness of the novels have been diluted to some extent in almost all the instances. Human emotions win and violence is pacified in the films.

Moreover, success of a novel depends on the competence of its author, whereas the same depends on many factors in the case of the film. Besides the skills of the director, aspects like camera, acting skills of the entire star-cast, editing, time of screening and marketing as well as advertising affect the success factor.

Consequently, inspite of all efforts taken by the directors, it can be said that films Train to Pakistan and Pinjar...beyond boundaries fail to reach the height and depth of their print origin owing to too much of faithfulness to the text. The length of the film Pinjar and too many songs that occupy one third of its time dilutes the effect of Partition. The train of Train to Pakistan does not become a protagonist as it does in the text.
On the other hand, Nihlani’s *Tamas* changes the episodic fragmented text of Sahni into a compact whole Tele series. Equally well knit is Mehta’s *1947 Earth* which unlike its counterpart in print does not stretch the melodrama too long as its source text does.

To sum up, a novel has to go through the process of creative violence to be a film. It has to enter another body. This study of Partition novels adapted by the film-makers to give a compact film has been focused not on whether the print version or the screenplay is better, but to find a parallel that borrows the stories of the text and infuses them with techniques that are exclusively their own. All the four film-makers have performed a task similar to the authors. They too have borrowed the ideas or thoughts from others, but have treated it with their own strategies of constructing a plot and have used a different medium, manner and matter as well. The four Partition novels have touched the hearts of the readers and their film adaptations have reached the audience who are away from the reading habit. Many of their reviews on internet tell of their wish to read the novel after watching the film.

Films and tele series are steadily and consistently supplanting the print medium. In this new age, bent more towards technology, it would not be surprising if a novel gets recognized due to its film or tele series adaptation. The question of shifts, fidelity or changes would not be given importance once for all. The cinematic adaptation of any literary text is acquiring importance as a guideline to teach acoustic texts. Every visual text provides a new impetus to the study of the literary text. The important point is not what is retained or deleted but how the director’s language reaches the audience. The novel, imitation of the human action is made interesting and easy to understand for a bigger mass by its imitation- the films.
Both, the print text and the visual text enjoy a complimentary status in respect to each other. But it is equally true that every text of the present time is as if looking ahead for its sequela in its cinematic version.