Chapter 3

Methodology

The chapter begins with specific research objectives and research questions of each objective have been formulated subsequently. This study aims to look into the overall vending process. It also tries to see if conditions of decent work exist, and if they do, to what extent. In the methodology, decent work indicators have been considered to design the analytical framework. Since this study does not consider all the places in Mumbai, the limitations of the data set are also discussed in this chapter. Details on the way in which data is analysed have been discussed too, and they key points have been summed up in the concluding section.

3.1. Objectives of the Study

The objectives of the study are as follows:

1. To explore the nature of street vendors’ income and employment.

2. To look at issues concerning their working conditions and rights at work.

3. To understand the problems related to their accessibility to social security measures.

4. To understand the role of collective bargaining in formulating and realising their demands for basic rights at their workplace.

5. To make a critical analysis of the concept of decent work and discuss the extent of its applicability to the street vendors in light of the four objectives mentioned above.

The four major pillars of decent work have been set as indicators to examine the present status of vending activities. The first pillar deals with their right to adequate income and employment opportunities. Here their levels of income and expenditures have been considered. Access to credit is an important characteristic of their business activity which has also been addressed in the first objective. The sources, nature, purposes and types of the credit have been taken into consideration. Factors that determine their access to credit have been identified. How do street vendors manage their credit for economic
activity in the absence of formal credit sources is the issue which has been explored under this objective.

In the second objective, working hours in a day has been integrated to understand the working conditions. In addition, working environment at the workplace has been considered and the issues relating to the access and utilisation of public space have been stressed upon. Issues related to harassment and bribe payment have also been highlighted here.

The third objective of our study considers the social security aspect. A number of factors have been taken into account to address the issues pertaining to the social security. These include organisations that are supposed to provide social security benefits, the nature of benefits that they avail, accessibility to social security measures. In the absence of any social security benefits, it is crucial to examine how the vendors manage their medical costs, children’s education expenditures or any other exigencies arising from low financial status.

Social dialogue is one of the major components of decent work. The role of collective bargaining in the formulation and realisation of basic rights of the vendors’ at their workplaces has been considered in the fourth objective. The role of trade unions, membership based organisations or any other associations towards vendors’ social security, credit accessibility and for any other benefits has been considered.

With the help of empirical data, a critical analysis of the concept has been done. The meaning it carries for street vendors and the way in which this concept can be restructured to include the interests of the self-employed workers of the urban informal sector has also been considered. Street vendors have been taken as the unit of analysis.

3.2. Research questions

In this section, specific research questions based on the above objectives have been addressed as below:

1. To explore the nature of street vendors’ income and employment.
   i. What are the factors that determine street vendors’ income and employment?
   ii. What are the sources, nature, purposes and types of the credit?
iii. What are the factors which determine street vendors’ accessibility to credit?
iv. What are the barriers faced by street vendors in their credit accessibility?
v. In the absence of proper credit sources, how do street vendors manage credit for their economic activity?

2. To look at issues concerning their working conditions and rights at work.
   i. What are the working conditions of street vendors in terms of working hours in a day?
   ii. What are the conditions imposed on street vendors for occupying public space?
   iii. Why and what kinds of harassment do the street vendors face at workplace from local police, municipal authority, and others?

3. To understand the problems related to their accessibility to social security measures.
   i. Is there any sort of formal provisioning of basic facilities like housing, healthcare, education or PDS for the vendors and their families?
   ii. Why do street vendors need social security? In reality, what kind of social security measures exist for the vendors, if at all?
   iii. Are street vendors excluded from social security measures?
   iv. In absence of any social security benefits, how do street vendors manage healthcare, maternity benefits, children’s education facilities and social safety?

4. To understand the role of collective bargaining in formulating and realising their demands for basic rights at their workplace.
   i. What kind unions exist, what are the issues they raise and what are the vendors’ participation rates?
   ii. Why have membership based organisations come to play a significant role in realising rights of street vendors at the workplace?
   iii. What role do organisations/ trade unions/ member based organisations play in providing social security, financial support and other forms of support to street vendors?
   iv. What roles do organisations play in the areas of safety at the workplace for street vendors as they utilise public space?
5. To make a critical analysis of the concept of decent work and discuss the extent of its applicability to the street vendors in light of the four objectives mentioned above.
   i. What does decent work mean to street vendors? Why is the concept relevant for the informal sector workers?
   ii. How to conceptualise the decent work approach with regard to the self-employed street vendors and assess its applicability?
   iii. How far has this concept been realised in practice?

3.3. Methodology
3.3.1. Unit of Analysis
   The unit of analysis of the study is street vendors in Mumbai. Static vendors, who have particular space for the activity though unregistered, are the participants of the present research.

3.3.2. Universe of the Study
   Mumbai was selected because of its diversity in terms of ethnicity and economic activities. Statistically too Mumbai holds highest population of street vendors in India. Hence, stationary street vendors in Mumbai are the universe of the study.

3.3.3. Data Sources
   The study has been planned on the basis of both primary and secondary data sources. Background for the analysis has been drawn from different secondary sources such as Mumbai Human Development Report (MHDR) and the NCEUS report. These have helped to show the statistics of the urban population, street vendors and their proportion to the population. As static street vendors are unit of analysis of the study and Mumbai is the universe of the study, primary data has been collected with the help of both methods, quantitative and qualitative. Rationale for choosing these two methods and the theoretical debates of the methods has been explained in detail in the next section.

3.4. Methods and its Philosophical Foundation
   The research methodology used in the present study has been explained in detail in this section. A research design and methods used for the study should be responsive to the stated research problems and research questions. As stated above, the research questions for the study are descriptive and exploratory in nature. Looking at the nature of the
research objectives and the research questions, a combination of quantitative and qualitative methods, referred as mixed method has been used. The philosophical stand for quantitative and qualitative methods will now be discussed. A similar discussion on methods used in the current research will be taken up thereafter.

3.4.1. Quantitative Approach

We have begun our discussion with epistemological and ontological stands for both the methods, quantitative and qualitative. Positivist paradigm underlies quantitative methods. The ontological stand of the quantitative paradigm is that there is only one truth. Epistemological stance of the research is that the researcher and researched both are independent entities and the researcher is capable of studying a phenomenon without influencing it or being influenced by it (Guba and Lincoln 1994). The aim of quantitative research is to measure and analyse causal relationships between variables (ibid). Methods and techniques of both are different. Techniques include randomisation, blinding, highly structured protocols and written administered questionnaires with a limited range of predetermined responses (Carey 1993).

3.4.2. Qualitative Approach

In contrast, the qualitative paradigm is based on constructivism (Guba and Lincoln 1994). Ontological stand for qualitative method outline that there are multiple realities or multiple truths based on one’s construction of reality. Reality is socially constructed (Berger and Luckmann 1966) and so it is changing constantly. On an epistemological level, there is no access to reality independent of our minds, no external referent by which to compare claims of truth (Smith, 1983). The researcher and the object of study are interactively linked so that findings are mutually created within the context of the situation which shapes the inquiry (Guba and Lincoln 1994 and Denzin and Lincoln 1994).

3.4.3. Mixed Method Approach

The third dimension of the methodological debate of the research has been deliberated here is mixed method paradigm. The debate over the relative virtue of quantitative and qualitative methodology has gained considerable impulsion. Over the past decade, there has been an increasing level of interest, debate, and sophistication surrounding the use of mixed methods in research. The underlying assumptions of the quantitative and qualitative paradigms result in differences which extend beyond the
philosophical and methodological debates. Different assumptions about the quantitative and qualitative paradigms originated in the positivism-idealism debate of the late 19th century (Smith 1983). The intrinsic differences are rarely acknowledged by those using mixed-method designs. The reasons may be that the positivist paradigm has become the predominant frame of reference in the physical and social sciences (ibid). In addition, research methods are presented as not belonging to or reflecting paradigms. Caracelli and Greene (1993) refer to mixed-method designs as those where neither method is inherently linked to a particular inquiry paradigm or philosophy. Guba and Lincoln (1989) claim that questions of method are secondary to questions of paradigms. We argue that methods are shaped by and represent paradigms that reflect a particular belief about reality. We also maintain that the assumptions of the qualitative paradigm are based on a worldview not represented by the quantitative paradigm.

There are various reasons for why qualitative and quantitative methods can be combined. Firstly, the two approaches can be combined because they share the goal of understanding the world in which we live (Haase and Myers 1988). King et al. (1994) claim that both qualitative and quantitative research methods share a unified logic and that the same rules of inference apply to both. Secondly, the two paradigms are thought to be compatible because they are also united by a shared commitment to understanding and improving the human condition, a common goal of disseminating knowledge for practical use, and a shared commitment for rigour, conscientiousness, and critique in the research process (Reichardt and Rallis 1994). In fact, Casebeer and Verhoeof (1997) argue that qualitative and quantitative methods must be viewed as part of a continuum of research with specific selected techniques based on the research objective. Thirdly, as noted by Clarke and Yaros (1988), combining research methods is useful in some areas of research, such as nursing, because the complexity of phenomena requires data from a large number of perspectives. Similarly, some researchers have argued that the complexities of most public health problems (Baum 1995) or social interventions, such as health education and health promotion programs (Steckler et al. 1992), require the use of a broad spectrum of qualitative and quantitative methods. Fourthly, others claim that researchers should not be preoccupied with the quantitative-qualitative debate because it will not be resolved in the near future, and that epistemological purity does not get research done (Miles and Huberman 1984). Having discussed some of the basic
philosophical assumptions of the two paradigms, one is better able to address the arguments given for combining quantitative and qualitative methods in a single study.

None of these arguments adequately address the underlying assumptions behind the paradigmatic differences between qualitative and quantitative research. However, Reichardt and Rallis (1994) acknowledge the possibility of contention between the two paradigms concerning the nature of reality by conceding that the two paradigms are incompatible if the qualitative paradigm assumes that there are no external referents for understanding reality. We have argued that the qualitative paradigm does assume that there are no external referents for understanding reality. An interesting argument has been made by Howe (1988) who suggests that researchers should forge ahead with what works. It appears to be the prevalent attitude in mixed-methods research. Howe’s argument seems to suggest that only pragmatists, or those not wedded to either paradigm, would attempt to combine research methods across paradigms. But this does not address the issue of differing ontological assumptions of the two paradigms. Bryman (1988) stated that quantitative and qualitative research can be perceived as different ways of examining the same research problem. Hence, the mixed method (Creswell 2009)—combination of quantitative and qualitative methods—has been used to describe and explore the current situation of the street vendors. Bryman (1988) states that combination of two methods can be used. Qualitative method either can facilitate the quantitative method in research or quantitative method can facilitate qualitative method in the research (ibid).

The presence of qualitative data has assisted the analysis of quantitative data. The sample has been drawn with the help of quantitative method while some of the individual extreme cases have been identified based on the in-depth interviews and the observation in the qualitative paradigm to explore the current situation.

3.5. Triangulation

Triangulation is defined as the mixing of data or methods so that diverse viewpoints can throw light on the topic. More than one research instrument can be used in the measurement of the main variables in a study. This is referred as ‘triangulation of measurement’ (Bryman 1988: 131). Denzin (1970: 130) showed that ‘triangulation can be approached by combining different sources of data, observations and methodologies’.
These various techniques used in qualitative and quantitative methods should be viewed as complementary rather than as rival camps (Jick 1979). It also said that the desirability of mixing methods and data will give the strengths and weaknesses found in single method designs (ibid). Olsen (2004: 2) stated that “the mixing of data types known as data triangulation which helps in validating the claims that might arise from an initial pilot study”. Triangulation can have other meanings and uses as well. There is the ‘within-method’ kind (Denzin 1978: 301) which uses multiple techniques within a given method to collect and interpret data. Therefore, the idea of triangulation needs to employ more than one method of investigation and more than one type of data to validate data and hence the research problem (Bryman 1988). Jick (1979) gives the example of a hypothetical study of job satisfaction among employees which showed a significant chi-square result demonstrating deep discontent. The result was underexplored from the quantitative method. In order to support the results, qualitative method was used to understand the intensity, dynamics, meaning, and aftermath of the strike (ibid). Thus, important qualitative data had been integrated with quantitative findings. Hence, triangulation can also capture a more complete, holistic and contextual portrayal of the study (ibid: 604).

As mixed method has been adopted in the present study, different methods and techniques have been used to do field survey. Triangulation has been applied to validate the data and methods used in the research and to test the reliability of the research holistically.

3.6. Decent work indicators and its incorporation in the study

As discussed earlier, decent work has four major pillars, namely employment and income, rights at work, social protection and social dialogue. The indicators related to employment and income opportunities are the ratification and observance of relevant conventions, labour force participation rate, employment-to-working age population ratio, the unemployment rate, youth unemployment rate, share of wage employment in non-agricultural labour force, excessive working hours, time-related underemployment rate and job insecurity (ILO 1999, Ahmed 2003 and Bescond et al. 2003).

The present study considers that level of income corresponding to the decent work indicators of ‘employment and income opportunities’. Access to credit for their activities
has also been considered in this indicator. In this connection, the sources, nature, purposes and types of the credit have been taken into consideration.

Working conditions and their rights at work, working hour, safety at the workplace have also been considered here. Here, working environment has been considered and the issues relating to the public space stressed upon. The issues related to harassments and bribe payment have been highlighted to address the working conditions.

Indicators of social protection include proportion of workers covered against main contingencies and receiving benefits in times of sickness, unemployment, old age, maternity, disability etc; adequacy of benefits received under these heads; public social security expenditure as proportion of GDP; public expenditure on needs-based cash income support as proportion of GDP; and levels of deprivation in specific areas such as nutrition, health, education and poverty among vulnerable groups (ILO 1999, Bescond et al. 2003 and Ghai 2003). Social security considers maternity benefits, medical facility, children’s education, accident. Access to social security and indebtedness for the social security corresponds to the decent work indicators of ‘social protection’. The sources and nature of social security benefits have been taken into account to address issues pertaining to social security.

According to ILO and others (ILO 1999, Bescond et al. 2003 and Ghai 2003), indicators on social dialogue include freedom of association and collective bargaining; the proportion of workers covered by collective bargaining agreements; participation in workplace decision-making; and participation by workers, employers and civil society organisations in national policy-making bodies.

In the present study, collective bargaining in formulating and realising vendors’ demands for basic rights at workplace has broadly been considered. The role of the trade unions, membership based organisations or any other associations towards vendors’ social security, credit accessibility and for any other benefits too has been considered.

3.7. Data Collection Tools

3.7.1. Questionnaire

Semi-structured questionnaire has been used to directly associate with the survey research based on the objectives of this study and research questions (Bryman 2009).
Closed ended and open ended questions have been asked. Since the study is explorative in nature, open ended questions helped to explore the current situations (Bryman 2009).

3.7.2. Interview Methods

Personal interviews and group interviews were conducted (Bryman 2009). In the current study, personal interviews of 400 individual street vendors were conducted and one group interview was conducted with 10-15 vendors in each of the areas. It helped to understand common issues. In-depth interviews were conducted with individual street vendors to understand and explore the current situation, as also with the key respondents from different organisations. These key respondents were mainly active members of membership based organisations (MBOs), who were acquainted with the role of MBOs for collective action of street vendors in Mumbai. They were also in the position to make decision for street vendors and represent to the higher authorities. In the study, interviews of 50 consumers were conducted in order to understand citizen’s perspective on street vending and importance of street vendors in their lives.

3.8. Process of Data Collection

3.8.1. Pilot Survey and Selection of the Study Areas

A pilot survey was conducted in order to check the effectiveness of the questionnaire. This survey was conducted in the months of May-June 2008 to develop the research proposal. It was also useful in checking and understanding of the questions posed by the respondents and also helped to understand basic situation of the vendors. Ten areas were selected for the pilot study. These were Andheri, Chembur, Dadar, Dharavi, Jogeswari, Kandivali, Parel, Powai and Ville Parle. Ten vendors involved in selling different products from one another were selected for the present study. Of the ten areas, four places were considered for the present study. Of the ten types of the products, seven types of the products were considered for the present study. The reason for this selection is that their share is largest in total vending.

The four places finally chosen for the study were Chembur, Dadar, Kandivali and Vile Parle. Chembur was selected because many migrant vendors from different parts of India are found here. It was also found that the conditions of women vendors were more miserable than that of the men in Chembur during pilot study.
Dadar was considered because it had the highest number of the vendors in Mumbai and the level of harassment they face at workplace is also high.

Very few MBOs are active in Kandivali compared to other parts of Mumbai. In addition, many shopping malls are found in Kandivali. Together these two reasons made it important to include this area for an examination. It is also important of understanding the impact of the expansion of formal retail outlets on this group of the workers and role of MBOs in securing their rights.

Vile Parle was selected because instances of harassment and eviction faced by food and fruit vendors of this location are famous in Mumbai. The brief detail of the four places is discussed later on in this section.

Information collected through interviews during the pilot study also helped in further development of the final questionnaire. Fifty vendors were interviewed during the pilot survey from ten places, mentioned in order to develop the final questionnaire and select the places for the final survey.

3.8.2. Sampling Method

In order to draw a sample, five steps were used in the sampling method. The size of the sample was 400 and the sample was drawn from nine streets of four selected study areas. The detailed information of the selected areas and the streets has been discussed in greater detail later.

3.8.2.1. First Step

When a population is scattered over a region and complete lists of the total population are not available, “clustering” is of assistance in sampling (Murthy 1967). For the purposes of the present study, three zones were identified, namely, Harbour, Central and Western Mumbai.

3.8.2.2. Second Step

In the second step, four areas from the three zones were purposively selected in terms of volume of street vendors, characteristic of the area. Chembur was selected in the Harbour zone, Dadar in the Central zone and Kandivali and Vile Parle were chosen in the Western zone in Mumbai. These four places were selected purposively. Moreover, a large number of vendors involved in selling any one of the seven types of products were considered in the present study in these four places.
Focus has been laid on particular locations in the four areas under consideration. These locations are characterised by the presence of visibly large concentration of street vendors all round the year. Thus these places are ‘natural market’ in public spaces where vendors sell their wares and consumers visit frequent these spots to buy their products. The concept of natural market has been kept in mind while selecting these particular areas. However natural market and the issues of public space have been discussed in greater detail in chapter five.

(a) Brief introduction to Chembur

Chembur\(^7\) is a suburban neighbourhood in eastern Mumbai. It is serviced by the Harbour line of the Mumbai Suburban Railway and is an important transit point for the Mumbai-Pune Highway. Chembur has a multi-ethnic population, dominated by Maharashtrians, Sindhis and South Indians. Chembur consist of two BMC wards— M (west) and M (east). It is 22 km from downtown Mumbai and 20 km from Chhatrapati Shivaji International Airport. Chembur is the largest industrial area in the island city of Mumbai. It ranges from Thane Creek in the East to Tansa Pipe Line No. 2 in West, from Somaiyya Nalla in the North to Mahul Creek in the South. Chembur is split by the local railway line running from Kurla towards Vashi into Chembur (East) and Chembur (West).

This study considers both the eastern and western parts of Chembur. Data has been collected from N. G. Acharya Marg Station Road which is located in the eastern Chembur.

(b) Brief introduction to Dadar

Dadar\(^8\) is located in central Mumbai and it has also the only railway station on both the Western (Dadar) and the Central lines (Dadar T.T.) of the Mumbai Suburban Railway network which makes it a busy station. This makes it a transit hub for thousands of passengers using the Mumbai suburban railway, and is one of the most crowded railway stations on the network. Dadar is divided into East and West by the railway line. Dadar East is popularly called Dadar Central or Dadar T.T. because the erstwhile Dadar Tram Terminus is located here. Dadar West market is a very popular shopping

---

\(^7\)A brief introduction of Chembur, one of the study areas, has been portrayed based on http://www.chembur.net, accessed on 10 November, 2011.

\(^8\)Dadar, one of the study areas, has been illustrated based on http://www.praja.org; Accessed on 6 December, 2011
destination for residents of central Mumbai. Dadar flower market and vegetable market too are famous. Dadar is home to the famous Shivaji Park grounds. A predominantly upper middle class residential zone, the Shivaji Park residential area is highly sought after residential area in South Mumbai because of its proximity to Dadar Chowpatty, Shivaji Park and other amenities.

For the purpose of this study, we have considered Dadar (West). Data has been drawn from Dr. D’Silva Road and Ranade Road of Dadar (West).

(c) Brief Introduction to Kandivali

Kandivali\(^9\) is suburb of Northern Mumbai. Kandivali railway station is on the Western Railway line of Mumbai suburban railway. Prominent localities in Kandivali (West) include Kandivali Village, Dahanukar Wadi, Mohite Wadi, Tulaskar Wadi, Amrut Nagar, Kamla Nagar, Mathuradas Road, Shanker Lane, Parekh Nagar, Mahavir Nagar, Poisar, Ganesh Nagar, Irani wadi, Ekta Nagar and Charkop. In Kandivali (East), some of the popular areas include Ashok Nagar, Thakur Complex, Thakur Village, Lokhandwala township, Samata Nagar and so on. The oldest locality in Kandivali is the Kandivali village (\textit{gaon}), an old east Indian village of Mumbai. It originally consisted of the east Indian Catholic families.

Kandivali is also known for its various pilgrim sites. The "Church of Our Lady of Assumption", located off M.G. Road, was built in 1630 and is one of the oldest churches of Mumbai. The famous Kala Hanuman temple is located on M.G. Road and frequented by hundreds of devotees every day. The 56 years old Shreeji Temple on Mathurdas Road attracts a large number of devotees.

Several shopping malls too dot the suburb. Among them, the mega shopping malls are Raghuleela near the Poinsur bus depot, Growel's 101 on Akurli Road near Kandivali station which also houses supermarket Big Bazaar. Auto giant Mahindra and Mahindra in Kandivali plant occupies a 63 acre built-up area. Popular industrial complexes such as Akurli Industrial Estate, Kandivali (Charkop) Industrial estate, Gundecha Industrial Estate, Balaji Industrial Estate and Bonanza Industrial Estate are

\(^9\) A brief introduction of Kandivali, one of the study areas, has been portrayed on the basis of http://www.praja.org; accessed on 6 December, 2011.
home to small and medium sized industries. Lastly, Kandivali is also home to The Times of India printing press, one of the world's largest manufacturers of empty capsules.

We have considered sample from both Kandivali (East) and Kandivali (West). Data has been drawn from Akruli Road, Kandivali (East) and M. G. Road, Kandivali (West).

(d) Brief introduction to Vile Parle

Vile Parle\textsuperscript{10} also known as Parla, is a suburb of Northern Mumbai. Separated by a railway line, the Vile Parle area was also the place where the first Parle biscuit factory was housed. The east-west boundaries of Vile Parle are from Juhu (West) to Santacruz (East). The suburb is well known for its food joints, starting from Lucky Sandwich corner to the Sai Samarth dosa centre locate in Vile Parle (West). Maruti pav bhaji on Bajaj Road and Chan Chavdar serving Vada Pav, Misal, Sabudana Vada, Sabudana Khichadi, Potato Poha and are famous in Vile Parle (East). It is particularly famous amongst college students.

Vile Parle (East) and Vile Parle (West) were considered in the study. Data has been collected from Hanuman Mandir Road and M. G. Road of Vile Parle (East) and DJ Road and Bajaj Road of Vile Parle (West).

3.8.2.3. Third Step

Since the total number of street vendors of each of place was unknown, ‘quota’ was fixed in order to draw a sample. Based on the volume of trade, quota was fixed in each area. The number of the street vendors in Dadar was significantly large compared to the other three areas under consideration. One hundred and twenty five respondents in Dadar, 100 sample respondents in Chembur, 100 in Vile parle and 75 sample respondents in Kandivali were fixed.

3.8.2.4. Fourth step

Sampling error can be reduced either by increasing the sample size or by making a homogeneity group (Babbie 2001). Since the street vending profession is heterogeneous in nature, stratification method helps to make homogeneous group in that particular group of population (Babbie 2001). Therefore, in the fourth step, street vendors have been

\textsuperscript{10}A brief note on Vile Parle has been given based on http://www.praja.org; accessed on 6 December, 2011.
divided into seven ‘stratum’ such as vendors selling cooked food, vegetables, fruits, garments, electronics, household utensils and leather items. These were chosen because they were most visible types in the retail market and have the largest share in the total vending process.

3.8.2.5. Fifth Step

In the fifth step, random sampling was done from the quota from each area. Thus, the present study covers 400 sample respondents at random (see Table 3.1). Each study area covers vendors selling aforesaid seven categories of goods. Out of 100 vendors in Chembur, 66 are male vendors and 34 are female vendors. In Dadar, out of 125 vendors, 66 are male vendors and 59 are female vendors. In Kandivali, of the 75 sample respondents, 30 are male vendors and 45 are female vendors. Finally, out of 100 vendors in Vile Parle, 74 are males and 26 are females. The detailed information is given in Table 3.2.

Table 3.1
Place-wise Sample Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the Places</th>
<th>Total no. of the Sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chembur</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dadar</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vile Parle</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kandivali</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total (n)</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.2
Place and Gender-wise Sample Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the study places</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chembur</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dadar</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kandivali</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vile Parle</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As we have mentioned earlier, vendors selling any one of the seven different products have been considered in the study. Therefore, Table 3.3 shows the types of products have been selected in each study area and the proportion of the male and female vendors selling these items.
Selected Streets in each Location

Chembur (East): N. G. Acharya Marg Station Road
Dadar (West): Dr. D’Silva Road and Ranade Road.
Kandivali (East): Akruli Road and Kandivali (West): M. G. Road
Vile Parle (East): Hanuman Mandir Road and M. G. Road and Vile Parle (West): DJ Road and Bajaj Road.
Table 3.3  
Place, Gender and Product-wise Sample Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Places</th>
<th>Cooked Food</th>
<th>Vegetables</th>
<th>Fruits</th>
<th>Electronics</th>
<th>Household utensils</th>
<th>Garments</th>
<th>Leather items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Chembur</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dadar</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kandivali</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vile Parle</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Chembur</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dadar</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kandivali</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vile Parle</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A survey for the study was conducted from December 2008 to June 2010. Personal interviews with the help of a semi-structured questionnaire were conducted with these 400 individual street vendors. One group interview was organised in study area. In addition, in-depth interviews were carried out with 21 street vendors in order to develop cases.

Before the final stage of the data collection, several meetings were conducted with some of the street vendors’ union leaders and they were informed about the study and its purpose. The union leaders were encouraging and had informed street vendors about the survey. On an average, each vendor was interviewed for 45 minutes. Although most of them were more or less cooperative, some were reluctant to participate in the discussion freely. Some of the vendors, though marginally, were found to manipulate information during data collection and these have been considered as a part of non-responses. Therefore, a non-response rate of ten per cent was considered in this survey. However, interview schedules were checked on a daily basis. In the case of gaps in data through the interview schedule, the site was revisited to collect the missing information.

In-depth interviews were organised with five key respondents. These five key respondents were involved in membership based organisations. They provided information on the role of these organisations in terms of collective action by street vendors in Mumbai. Such organisations are also in a position to make decisions for street vendors and represent them to higher authorities. Fifty consumers were selected at random from four selected areas.
3.8.3. *Triangulation of the Data Collection Process*

Triangulation has been used in this study in efforts to integrate fieldwork and survey methods. Many social scientists (Vidich and Shapiro 1955, Reiss 1968, McCall and Simmons 1969, Spindler 1970, Diesing 1971, Sieber 1973 and Jick 1979) have noted the viability and necessity of such linkages.

Hence, in the present study, there are many places where data, techniques and methods have been mixed. Some of the open ended questions from the schedule have been coded after data collection based on the varied responses. Interview schedules and responses from the 400 individuals were verified and cross checked through in-depth interviews, personal interviews and field observation.

3.9. Data Analysis

Primary data shows the current situation of the street vendors on the basis of the objectives of the study and specified research questions. Mixed methods have been used to analyse the primary data. Statistical models have been used to present quantitative data and individual cases have been developed to explore the current situation in an in-depth manner under the qualitative paradigm. Descriptive statistics and log-linear regression models were used to analyse responses of 400 individuals using quantitative data. Fourteen individual cases were developed in order to explore the current situation.

Sample has been drawn with the help of quantitative method. While analysing the data, ANOVA (between one ratio scale variable such as income and one categorical variable — types products, religion and caste), t-test (between one ratio scale variable, income and one categorical variable gender, having only two groups—male and female) and Chi-Square test (between two categorical variables such as union membership, types of the products, religion and caste) have been used to find the associations between the indicators. ‘Multiple log-linear equation’\(^\text{11}\) has been shown in order to analyse the degree of associations between the selected variables such as level of daily income, daily bribe payments, daily sale and daily working hours. Individual distinctive cases have been identified and detailed based on in-depth interviews and observation to explore the current situation.

\(^\text{11}\)Log linear analysis offer a method for analysing relationships among several nominal variables having more than two attributes each (Babbie 2001: 486). It provides a means of identifying which have the most important impact on the dependent variables and also ignoring the rest (ibid: 483).
The main focus of the present study is to examine the situation of the street vendors within the decent work framework. The decent work approach has been accepted worldwide as a strong normative field which needs to hold workers from formal or informal sector alike. However, there is a lack of a strong conceptual understanding of this concept in the context of the informal sector, in particular, the street vendors. Decent work indicators have been recognised as important factors in the street vending activity. Therefore, it would be interesting to assess the present status of the vendors keeping the pillars of decent work in the background. This has been done while keeping the conditions of decent work under important themes and then identifying the components that affect each of them. The components identified under each theme are thus tested in the light of the decent work approach. Calculations have been made across the column because the focus of the present research is the gender aspect. The following sections show possible outcomes of the present study and corresponding percentages for these outcomes, which are represented by the values within parentheses. Composition of male and female vendors has been presented separately in each of the cases. Quantitative data has been analysed with the help of Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 15. Qualitative data has been analysed with field notes and observation. Field notes have been maintained on a daily basis.

Analysis of each research question has been outlined below:

1. **What are the factors that determine street vendors’ income and employment?**

   All factors impacting street vendors’ income and employment are discussed here. This includes the socio-demographic factors impacting their income and employment status. In addition, the economic factors such as investments, sales and profits have also considered.

2. **What are the sources, nature, purposes and types of the credit?**

   Institutional as well as non-institutional sources of the financial services have been identified from interviews of individual street vendors as well as key informants from different trade unions or organisations or associations. In this study, sources of their financial accessibility are considered rather than credit for their business. The descriptive statistics have been presented here. The whole situation is explained through responses of street vendors and key informants. Individual cases have also been presented here.
Hence, sources, nature, purposes and types of the credit have been explored through this research question.

1. **iii. What are the factors which determine street vendors’ accessibility to credit?**

   In the present context, the factors which determine street vendors’ credit accessibility are discussed.

1. **iv. What are the barriers faced by street vendors in their credit accessibility?**

   Being a part of the informal sector, street vendors have no access to any formal financial institutions. Thus, they manage their daily transactions through informal sources. Barriers and the difficulties of accessing credit have been explored and addressed through this research question. Since this research question is exploratory in nature, primary data has been used and cases have been developed.

1. **v. In the absence of proper credit sources, how do street vendors manage credit for their economic activity?**

   This research question is a further exploration of financial accessibility. It helps to analyse the kinds of network, such as, friends, relatives, kinship, community or other types of the existing networks. This research question is also exploratory in nature, therefore, primary data has been used and individual cases have been developed.

2. **i. What are the working conditions of street vendors in terms of working hours and working days in a week?**

   Working conditions are addressed in terms of working hours and kinds of harassment at the workplace. Working hours are calculated and presented in descriptive statistics. Working hours play a key role. Working hours differ from activity to activity and are different for male and female vendors. Therefore, different individual cases have been presented here.

2. **ii. What are the conditions imposed on street vendors for occupying public space?**

   Information from individual respondent and key respondents from unions and other membership based organisations is considered in order to understand the situation relating to the public space and imposing conditions. Individual cases have been developed and presented here.
2. iii. Why and what kinds of harassment do the street vendors face at workplace from local police, municipal authority, and others?

Since street vendors have no legal public space for their business activity, they face constant harassment from different stakeholders, such as the local police, the municipal corporation and local agent set by the civic authorities. The kinds of harassment faced by street vendors have been discussed here through individual cases.

3. i. Is there any sort of formal provisioning of basic facilities like housing, healthcare, education or PDS for the vendors and their families?

This research question addresses the issues related to provisioning of basic amenities and merit goods, such as education to the vendors. The provision of these amenities has the capacity to raise vendors’ standard of living and working. Access to basic services such as basic health care accessibility, children’s education, housing types, PDS system is explored from primary data drawn from interviews with street vendors. Descriptive analysis and cases have been presented.

3. ii. Why do street vendors need social security? In reality, what kind of social security measures exist for the vendors, if at all?

The first part of the question is exploratory in nature. It is explained through different individual cases. The issues raised in this research question concerns the availability of social security measures for the vendors. Some studies in the past have shown that the measures exist only on paper. The kinds of available measures intended for women, men and children separately have also been examined.

3. iii. Why are street vendors excluded from social security measures?

This research question is related to the actual access to social security benefits. This study tries to explore how many street vendors are entitled to social security. Descriptive analysis has been made alone here. It also considers the vendor’s view on social security, especially the meaning it holds for them. It is explored from the data and different cases are developed.

3. iv. In absence of any social security benefits, how do street vendors manage healthcare, maternity benefits, children’s education facilities and social safety?

Street vendors don’t have state sponsored social security. However, when they require, they manage by taking help either from the unions where they are members or their own. Hence, this study has tried to explore how street vendors manage in the
absence of state sponsored social security. Since this research question is explorative in nature, primary data and available literature from secondary sources have been used. Individual cases have been developed from street vendors as well as members of organisations or union in order to explore the current situation.

4. i. What kind unions exist, what are the issues they raise and what are the vendors’ participation rates?

The nature of existing trade union activities is analysed in this section to see whether these unions have political affiliation or not, how many such unions are active, their areas of operation and whether they are able to attract the attention of vendors.

4. ii. Why have membership based organisations come to play a significant role in realising rights of street vendors at the workplace?

This research question is exploratory in nature. Therefore, different cases have been analysed and highlighted from different perspectives of various key recourse persons.

4. iii. What role do organisations/ trade unions/ member based organisations play in providing social security, financial support and other forms of support to street vendors?

Organisations play the role of intermediaries between authorities and street vendors. Primarily, they try to lobby for legalisation of street vendors and for provisioning of rights to public space to street vendors. Some of the unions or organisations are providing social security and credit. Thus, the nature of struggle is vividly illustrated in some of the cases.

4. iv. What roles do organisations play in the areas of safety at the workplace for street vendors as they utilise public space?

The role of organisations and unions in issues pertaining to the workplace and the utilisations of public space has been analysed with the help of different cases.

5.i. What does decent work mean to street vendors? Why is the concept relevant for the informal sector workers?

In this question, the vendor’s perception of decent work has been taken into consideration. Available literature on the concept has been critically analysed and support with evidences from the empirical data.
5. **ii. How to conceptualise the decent work approach with regard to the self-employed street vendors and assess its applicability?**

   Here, the concept of decent work has been critically analysed with help of empirical evidences. In this section, indicators identified from the research questions mentioned above have been used to assess its applicability.

5. **iii. How far has this concept been realised in practice?**

   This question is a continuation of the previous research question. The applicability of the concept of decent work has been further explored with evidences from quantitative and qualitative data.

### 3.9.1. Triangulation of the Data Analysis

Triangulation has been applied in the data analysis as mixed-method has been used to collect data. This study and some of the research questions are exploratory in nature. Combining quantitative and qualitative methods would provide a holistic picture of the street vending in Mumbai. Quantitative approach has been used to analyse the data statistically while the qualitative approach facilitates the quantitative approach. The result has been validated and cross checked. Statistical data has been validated and cross checked by the case narrative analysis of the street vendors and key respondents of the organisations or the unions. Cases have been developed from in-depth interviews with street vendors and members of the membership based organisations and/or unions. Nevertheless, the case narratives also have been cross checked with the quantitative evidences and data.

### 3.10. Strengths and limitations of the data set

#### 3.10.1. Strengths

The data set used for this study contains a great deal of information on complete street vending in three places in Mumbai. Moreover, this study deals with the context of decent work. This study is related to financial accessibility and working conditions of the vendors, particularly in the context of Mumbai. The uniqueness of this research is that this study is based on both qualitative and quantitative methods. The data includes wide information on the urban informal financial markets. The daily life cycle of the vendors is documented and penned down based on in-depth interviews. An attempt has been made in the study to present a vivid picture of the overall vending process. This study considers
the factors which have contributed to an increase in the number of street vendors in Mumbai. Thus, the data includes information on both the demand and supply sides of street vendors. An approximate estimation of the total number of street vendors in Mumbai with the help of various records from the trade unions has also been provided.

**3.10.2. Limitations of the Data Set**

Some of the limitations of the data set must be accepted. There may be some selection bias. No detailed information on lenders was collected, as no specific lending technologies are adopted in such informal transactions. Access to these financial sources is frequent and universal.

**3.10.3. Ethical Considerations**

The study took into account the ethical issues involved in such an exploration. The participants were informed of the purpose of the study. Participation in the study was voluntary and participants were free to leave at any point of time. Information shared by the participants was kept entirely confidential. Respondents requested that their identities may not be disclosed. Their names have therefore been removed from the data analysis and proxy names have been used while presenting the case narratives in the subsequent chapters. This study also considers union members from two active unions in order to understand the role of the membership-based organisations towards the vendors’ daily life. Therefore, union members have also been considered in this study. They too requested not to reveal their names that their identities may not be disclosed. Hence neither their names nor their physical descriptions are revealed anywhere in the study. Names of the organisations/unions have also not been disclosed.

**3.11. Conclusion**

To sum up, in this chapter, the analytical framework for data analysis of the study based on research objectives and research questions has been discussed. The whole research design is formed in this chapter. The data analysis plan is discussed in detail in this chapter. The analysis would be discussed in greater detail in the following in chapters.

The present study is based on the mixed methods. The debate on quantitative and qualitative methods is presented in this chapter. In addition, a discussion on the philosophical debate surrounding the mixed method is done. Since the total number of
the vendors is unknown, the appropriate sampling frame was discussed in detail thereafter. Strength and weakness of the data are also discussed in the present chapter.

Since the present study is predominantly based on data primary sources, data analysis and discussion have been synthesised in the following chapters. Chapter 4 would deal with the income and employment aspect of the street vendors and would attempt to relate with the first pillar of decent work. This chapter also would focus on the socio-demographic characteristics of respondents, their work-related characteristics and their household information. Chapter 5 would highlight the discussion on ‘rights at work’. Issues pertaining to the public space utilisation would be discussed in this chapter. A discussion on social security and its issue would be dealt in Chapter 6 while the role of union or membership based organisations in the realisation of vendors’ rights would be discussed in Chapter 7. The last chapter titled ‘discussion and conclusion’ deals with summing up of findings, identification and discussion on key emerging issues and ends with a concluding section focused on tying up the entire debate.