## Chapter 6

**IMPACT ASSESSMENT AND POLICY CONTENT, CONTEXT AND ACTORS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1. The Dangs: Status on Human Development</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2. Poverty, Livelihood and Income</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.1. House Accommodation and Other Facilities</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.2. Poverty</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.3. Livelihood Patterns</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3. Literacy</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4. Health</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5. Perceptions of the Respondents’ on the Impact of Tribal Sub Plan</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.1. Awareness of the TSP</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2. Access to Direct Benefits</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.3. Access to State Actors</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.4. Impact of Tribal Sub Plan Schemes</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6. Policy Content, Context and Actors</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1. Policy Design and Contents of TSP Approach</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2. Policy Context</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.3. Worldviews and Social Discontinuities</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7. Summary, Main Findings and Conclusions</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7.1. Introduction</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7.2. Summary</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7.3. Main Findings and Conclusions</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 6

IMPACT ASSESSMENT AND POLICY CONTENT, CONTEXT AND ACTORS

“Poverty is the worst form of violence.” Mahatma Gandhi

The central and state governments and planners have formulated and implemented various policies aiming at raising social and economic conditions of Scheduled Tribes (STs) who remained traditionally backward for historical reasons. Roy Burman (1997) and many others consider the TSP strategy to be a failure. However, others disagree with this view (ibid) and point out improvement in various fields like health, education, infrastructure development etc. In this context, an attempt is made in the present study to assess the change and impact of tribal sub-plan schemes on tribal community of the Dangs district.

The total tribal population covered in the present study is 240. The various tribal communities covered in the study are Bhils, Varli, Kotwadia and Kokana.

In this chapter an attempt is made to highlight certain key issues which have emerged out of the study which are being compared with other relevant studies and discussed. Considering the fact of multiplicity of schemes and agencies, it is humanly not possible to assess the implementation and the impact of each and every scheme. In the last chapter; Human development concept even with its weaknesses was used to assess the impact of the TSP Schemes on the tribal life from the point of view of three indicators: a) poverty and livelihood, b) literacy and, c) health. For this, we also looked at HDM status of the Dangs taking Gujarat Human Development Report 2004 and subsequent data as basis. For impact assessment the following variables were considered:

**Independent Variables**

All demographic, social, and economic attributes of sample respondents were treated as independent variables,

(a) Demographic variables: (i) size of households and (ii) Literacy level, (iii) tribe sub groups
(b) Socio Economic Variables: (i) type of house (ii) pattern of land ownership and income (iii) occupational structure (iv) income from wages (v) migration (vi) right to forest land (vii) tree ownership scheme (viii) income from other sources (ix) consumption pattern (x) expenditure pattern and (xi) savings and indebtedness.

**Dependent Variables**

The impact of Tribal Sub-Plans Schemes on socio-economic condition was taken as the dependent variable.

Special Attention was given to employment, migration and the impact of NREGA scheme.

**6.1. The Dangs: Status on Human Development**

Mahatma Gandhi Labour Institute, Ahmedabad had brought out first Gujarat Human Development report, 2004. Written by two experts, Hirway and Mahadevia, it has computed various indices like HDI (achievements in health, education and income), HDM-1 (opportunities/capabilities of individuals), GDM-1 (opportunities/capabilities of females), GEI (Gender inequalities) and HDM-2 (macro level capabilities / opportunities available to all individuals) for 15 large States of India and 25 Districts of Gujarat for two time periods 1991 and 2001.

According to the report, Gujarat has fallen behind in human development in the 1990s despite its impressive economic growth. The position of Gujarat among large States and the Dangs among districts of the State stands as follows:

| Table 6.1 |
| Human Development Measures – Gujarat and the Dangs |
|---------|---------------------------|-------------------|------------------|-------------------|-------------------|
| 1       | HDI                       | 5                 | 6                | 24                | 23                |
| 2       | HDM-1                     | 5                 | 6                | 24                | 24                |
| 3       | GDM-1                     | 4                 | 6                | 24                | 24                |
| 4       | GEI                       | 8                 | 11               | 1                 | 2                 |
| 5       | HDM – 2                   | 6                 | 8                | 12                | 6                 |

Source: Adapted from Gujarat Human Development Report, 2004

1 For details on the HRMs see Appendix B
The study report states that Gujarat State, which stood second in industrialisation, third in urbanisation and fifth in per capita income, was placed sixth in HDM-1, sixth in GDM-1 and sixth in HDM-2 and eleventh in GEI. This shows that “industrialisation and urbanisation” has not ensured similar position of the State in Human Development indicators. Secondly, it was quite low in GEI. This requires a closer look at the type of investments, economic growth and linkages affecting gender equality and other human development indicators.

The rankings of the Dangs had not changed in 2001 and it continued to be at the bottom in all specified indicators except GEI (a phenomenon seen in other tribal districts also) and HDM-2. In HDM-2, the Dangs had improved its position from 12 to 6. Otherwise when it came to basic services within HDM-2; it was at the bottom with 22nd rank in both the periods. It indicates lack of mainstreaming, social exclusion and low human development.

It is with this background that we analyse the results of the survey which was carried out in 2011.

6.2. Poverty, Livelihood and Income

6.2.1. House Accommodation and Other Facilities

House Accommodation

Overall 99.6 percent of the households live in own house, most of them having two rooms (43.3 percent) and most of them are found residing in kuchha houses (68.4 percent). The households residing in pucca houses are found to be the highest among the Kotwadia tribes (41.2 percent) and Bhils are the most disadvantaged with only 8.7 percent residing in pucca houses. It is noticed that overall, most of the households (63.8 percent) constructed houses on their own without external assistance from the government. It seems that Kotwadia tribes of the Dangs district have benefited the most with Government housing schemes of either Sardar Patel Awas Yojana or Indira Awas Yojana as more than half of them (52.9 percent) constructed houses with government assistance, followed by Bhils (47.8 percent), Kokana (32.5 percent) and Varli (29.6 percent). It should be mentioned that the tribal families get wood and bamboo (known as ‘Katmal’ Scheme) for construction of their houses from the forest department on one time basis.
Drinking Water and Toilet Facilities

Drinking water is an important basic need of life. It is noteworthy that only 7.9 percent of the households in the study area have drinking water facilities within their dwellings. None of the households of Bhils has drinking water facilities in the house. The distance between the household and the availability spot of drinking water facility for 35.7 percent of the households is 100 meters, 13.1 percent have 101-250 meters, 20.4 percent households have water facilities within 251-500 meters and 20.4 percent have access to drinking water at a distance of more than 500 meters. Tribe category-wise analysis shows that Kotwadias are in advantageous position as all of them have drinking water facility within a distance of 100 meters. The largest distances (501-1000 meters) are covered by the Bhils (32.6 percent) to fetch drinking water compared to other tribal communities.

Majority of the households (86.3 percent) do not have toilet facility. The availability of toilet facilities is higher among the Kotwadia and Kokana tribes (23.5 percent and 18.7 percent respectively as compared to the Bhil (6.5 percent) and Varli tribes (5.6 percent).

Availability of Modern Household Facilities

The possession of household appliances and modern facilities including vehicles reflects not only prosperity but also the status of a person. Overall, majority of the households have sitting chairs (85 percent). The other household appliances and modern facilities available are cots (35 percent), tables (27.1 percent), television (23.8 percent), radio (7.1 percent), freeze (2.9 percent), LPG (1.3 percent) and washing machine (0.4 percent).

However, 12.5 percent of the households do not have such household items and the percentage is the highest among the Bhils (26.1 percent). None of the Kotwadia households is found without any household appliances and modern facilities. In all, 20.4 percent of the households own a vehicle. Among those who owned vehicles, most possess motorcycle (67.3 percent), 32.7 percent possess cycle and 4.1 percent possess Jeep. Ownership of vehicles is found to be the highest among the Kotwadias (41.2 percent) and the lowest among the Bhils (4.3 percent).

Hence, the results on availability of modern household facilities indicate that the Dangis have access to modern facilities though on a very small
scale. Special note should be taken of television (23.8 percent) and vehicle (20.4 percent), 67.4 percent of the later having motorcycles. Secondly it shows that Bhils are low positioned among all tribals in this regard. Also Bhils are the most disadvantaged with only 8.7 percent residing in pucca houses compared. It is surprising that Kotwadias were not found with household appliances even when they have got maximum benefit schemes of housing, drinking water and toilets. The households residing in pucca houses are found highest among the Kotwadia tribes (41.2 percent) This should also put a question mark on the efficacy of the special programmers, especially with regard to income generating assets as they are declared as primitive tribes requiring special attention. It is not surprising that they have shown maximum dissatisfaction with regard to the implementation of the TSP. To conclude, most of the households live in two room kuchha houses with no toilet, no tap water with bare minimum household items. Bhils are the most disadvantageous group amongst all.

6.2.2. Poverty

One of the most important objectives of the TSP is to make such an impact on economic front that at least 50 percent of tribal families come above BPL (GOI, 2001). No reliable estimates on poverty are available for the Dangs. In 1991 as per the survey conducted by the State 86.30 percent of the families was BPL. The Dangs topped the list in the state with 86.89 percent BPL families (Upadhyay 2005:15). This is quite high compared to 52 percent for the rural Gujarat. The survey of 2003 by the Government of Gujarat puts this figure to 50.8 percent. The figures are not comparable due to different methodology and the government surveys are exaggerated (Hirway and Mahadevia 2004: 53). Still they indicate extreme poverty in the Dangs. The recent studies at the national level have actually shown a higher percent of people living below the poverty line.

What this means is that the government’s target to bring at least 50 percent of the tribal families above poverty line is yet to be accomplished. The BPL households are the highest among the Kotwadia tribes (76.5 percent) and the lowest among the Varli tribes (38.9 percent). This may be verified with average annual income of the households, which is the lowest among Kotwadias (`15,766/-) and the highest among the Varlis (`18,259).

As per our study, an overwhelming majority of the households (95.9 percent) in the present study is from the annual income slab of less than
6,000-36,000. This is contrary to 50.8 percent of BPL households recorded in the study. It is of relevance to point out that most of these families by virtue of their income and expenditure pattern could be reckoned as being in the category of ‘Below Poverty Line’. Also what we have observed is that the households have purposefully understated their income for obvious reasons. Also, for the identification of Below Poverty Line families, income is not an essential criterion. There are 13 socio-economic parameters, namely, operational holding of land, housing, clothing, food security, sanitation, ownership of consumer durables, literacy, labour force, means of livelihood, status of children, type of indebtedness, migration and nature of assistance are all taken into account for assessing the poverty level of rural household. Moreover, the socio-economic surveys, especially among the marginalised groups in remote areas, the correctness of income and expenditure cannot be guaranteed in all cases because of inherent deficiencies in the responses of the respondents (Institute of Social Sciences, 2003). Our observation shows that Kokanas tend to understate their income, while Bhils and others have been slightly less enthusiastic in this exercise. However, overall, what it indicates for certain is the prevalence of extreme poverty among the people of the Dangs.

6.2.3. Livelihood Patterns

The present study reveals that the tribals are engaged in multiple primary and secondary occupations throughout the year to earn their livelihood as agriculture just cannot provide adequate livelihood. The Dangs has a serious livelihood issue; it is still a subsistence economy dependent on natural resources, especially the land. Due to very small landholdings and low productivity of the land, most households in the Dangs district depend upon diversified patterns of occupations for their survival; no single activity provides sufficient resources to entirely ensure livelihood (District Plan Report, 2009-2010). The livelihood systems in the area are primarily dependent on combinations of cultivation (67.9 percent) and agriculture and forest employment (61.3 percent and 11.3 percent). It is not surprising that 35 percent of the households migrate outside the district every year in search of work. And this despite the introduction and implementation of the MGNREGA!

When they are not migrants, most of the respondents (63 percent) are engaged in earning their livelihood either within the village or within a distance of one km. As majority of the tribals (94.3 percent) are employed within a distance of 5 kms. from the village, they cover the distance on
foot or on cycle (93.3 percent). Rest of them (6.7 percent) are found to reach their work place through bus or private vehicle or personal vehicle. Kotwadia tribes are mainly confined within their villages for livelihood (88.2 percent). This is largely due to the supply of bamboo and the availability other facilities at their door step by provided by the government as part of special development programmes meant for them as a primitive tribe. Again only Bhils (2.2 percent) among all the tribal groups are found to cover a distance of more than 10 kms. for livelihood.

Herein we will analyse various livelihood options exercised by the tribals of the district.

**Agriculture, Land and Other Facilities**

Land ownership is a crucial factor in socio-economic status and secure livelihood especially in an agrarian economy. Most of the households in the study area (70.4 percent) possess agricultural land, even when the land holding size is very small. It is a known fact that the PTG (Kotwadias) are generally landless but in the present study 5.9 percent of the Kotwadias have agricultural land. The percentage of ownership of agricultural lands by Bhils (58.7) is substantially less than that of the Kokanas (81.3 percent) and the Varlis (75.9 percent).

Various types of crops, mainly paddy (98.2 percent) and ‘Nagli’ (a type of Raga, a coarse grain) (92.9 percent) are taken by the households. Majority of the tribals in the study area (92.3 percent) use organic fertilizer and other fertilizer (53.3 percent) for better yield. Overall, 27.8 percent mentioned to be using pesticides, which is really worrisome as it has been established that it can adversely affect the health and environment. Further 21.3 percent households use pesticide spray-pumps. It has been observed that the tilt is to go for paddy crop at the cost of Nagli. The use of fertilizer and pesticides is more in other crop, especially paddy. The use of hybrid seeds in rice is also in vogue due to extension services. While Nagli is still cultivated for home consumption in the traditional manner in which just before the rain, leaves are collected and burnt and the ashes is scattered over the field. The local traditional crops like Nagli are highly nutritious coarse grain that can grow in rain-fed areas on slope land. However the extension services are negligible for this crop.

Majority of the households have ploughs (95.9 percent), Kodali () (88.2 percent), bullock (87.6 percent) and pavada (spade) (87.6 percent) for agricultural purpose. Overall, 34.9 percent households have agricultural
equipments such as pesticide spray pumps (21.3 percent), oil engines (13.0 percent) and Honda Machines (0.6 percent). This indicates some reach of government schemes.

**Income from the Sale of Crops**

Almost all the households (98.2 percent) use the crops for their own consumption and only 14.2 percent sell the crops. Selling of crops is found to be the highest among the *Bhils* (33.3 percent). Those who sell crops, majority of the households (87.5 percent) sell it locally and 16.7 sell the crops in *haats* (weekly bazaar or market). The annual income from the agricultural products for majority of the households (87.5 percent) is `6,000 or less. Majority of the households (83.3 percent) faced difficulties to sell their agricultural products. Lack of transport facilities (64.3 percent) to carry the crops to the market is the biggest problem they face.

**Animal Husbandry and Dairying**

Tribal agriculture is based primarily on animal power. While cattle wealth is given considerable importance in the socio-economic conditions of the tribals, the status of the families being determined in many communities by the number of cattle heads owned. Besides the use in agricultural operations, animals are also a source of subsidiary income (Thakur, D et al., 1997).

The present study shows that except *Kotwadias* (5.9 percent), almost two-third of the households keep animals with overall 58.3 percent of the all households. Most of them (75.7 percent) have bullocks. Overall, 40 percent of the households keep some poultry, largely for their own consumption. Among 140 households who keep animals, 41.4 percent have milch cattle. 39.7 percent households use milk for own consumption which is a welcome change. Now they have been covered in the dairy scheme. It is not surprising that 46.5 percent sell the milk through dairy cooperatives. Majority of the households (82.9 percent) informed that veterinary doctors are available though at a far-off place. However, 71.4 percent faced various difficulties in this supplementary occupation. Arranging and providing drinking water and fodder to the animals are the prime problems faced by the households (60 percent and 44.3 percent respectively).

The following table shows the income from animal husbandry. It can be seen that it is almost insignificant. Interestingly 100 percent *Kotwadia*
earn more than ` 1000 while no Bhil figure in this highest income category. The 7.1 percent of the households in this income slab are largely dairy scheme beneficiaries.

**Animal Husbandry Income**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income from Animal Husbandry</th>
<th>Bhil</th>
<th>Varli</th>
<th>Kotwadia</th>
<th>Kokana</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>` 50 and less</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>`101-250</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>` 251-500</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>` 501-1000</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>` 1001+</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No income from Animal Husbandry</td>
<td>87.0</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>81.3</td>
<td>80.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of HHs engaged in Animal Husbandry</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To conclude, the reach of the veterinary services, excluding areas covered in dairy scheme, is poor at the village level and extension services and infrastructure is lacking. Healthcare facilities, including artificial insemination centers are not adequate and far-flung. Lack of fodder and drinking water for animals, especially during summer is a serious problem as hand-pumps and in some areas check-dams are highly insecure. The grazing land in the area is extremely limited. Also, the forests provide green fodder only during monsoon. Storage of milk produce needs cooling facilities which are highly inadequate in the area even when there is a huge success of dairy scheme in some areas.

Involving the tribals in animal husbandry by giving animals or birds is not sufficient. They should be provided with extension services and training in the field of animal rearing, feeding, animal care, marketing of milk, procuring fodder for animals among others. Follow-up monitoring is essential to check and facilitate them in understanding difficulties. Efforts need to be made by the government to provide water (especially during summer), increased storage and transportation facilities especially when dairying has commenced, and giving additional income to some of the households. The concept of animal hostel can do wonder in this district in light of migration and lack of water during summer.

**Livelihood from the Forest**

The National Forest Policy of 1988 stipulated that all agencies responsible for forest management should ensure that the tribal people are closely associated with the regeneration, plantations, development and
harvesting of forests so as to provide them gainful employment. Despite these special safeguards, tribals continue to struggle for mere survival as they face formidable problems such as possession of land/house with no rights, restrictions in the collection of minor forest produce, exploitation by middlemen, lack of any development in forest villages etc. (GOI, 2001).

The major livelihood option in the Dangs was traditionally forest based. This option has shrunk since the times that the forest was demarcated in reserve and protected areas and restrictions came into place. But the collection of NTFP produce and labour work still contributes, though in small measure, to the livelihood of the people in the Dangs (District Plan Report, 2009-10).

Collecting of Non Timber Forest Produce

The activity of collecting forest produce (NTFP) is a contributor to the livelihood of tribals of the Dangs. Forest produce is gathered for home-use which include fodder, firewood (as fuel requirement most of the households), berries and tubers, certain leaves, roots, fish in the areas close to the rivers, medicinal plants, herbs and fruits. Some forest produces are also gathered for commercial purpose and include teak seeds and other seeds, honey, gum, bamboo, mahuda flowers etc. Timru leaves, teak seeds, mahuda flowers and seeds are collected during summer season. Seeds and mahuda flowers and are sold at the local haats. Timru leaves, teak seeds and bamboo are mainly sold through the forest department.

Labour from forest

The major labour intensive activities in forest (provided by the forest department) include cutting of trees, cutting and collection of grass, cutting of bamboo, plantation, forest preservation and protection works like fencing, gully plugging, water conservation etc.

Malki

Another livelihood source related to forest is the scheme of Malki (Ownership). The landholders have been granted the rights over standing trees on agricultural land. Before 1997, 50 percent of the revenue from the logged trees was given to the landholder. Now it has become 100 percent.
In the present study area, only 22.9 percent reported to visit forests for collection of forest products, out of which, 23.6 percent visit forest as a labourer of forest department, 20 percent visit forest as their right to collect forest products and 56.4 percent are visiting for both purposes. A substantial difference can be observed between the gathering for home use (80 percent) and the commercial use of forest products which are sold to forest department (5.5 percent). Overall, 65.5 percent sell the forest product to the local market and 29.1 percent sell it to forest department. Most of the households (65.5 percent) earn less than Rupees 50 to 100 per day from the forest products. About 50.9 percent of the households faced difficulties of getting permit for gathering forest products (16.4 percent), partnership problem (23.6 percent) and bribed (7.3 percent) during collection of forest products.

A little less than half of the tribal households (48.3 percent) have ownership of trees. None of the PTGs (Kotwadis) owns trees. Overall, 45.7 percent households mentioned getting permission for cutting trees. The reasons for those who did not get the permission for cutting trees are mostly due the small size of the trees which are not grown fully (61.9 percent). The households mainly use the income of trees for house construction (61 percent) and repayment of debt (51.2 percent).

To conclude, the income from forest from these activities is negligible and shows a complete disconnect between tribal life and forest activity. The concept of joint forest management exists more on paper heavily controlled by forest officials and aimed at preserving forest in traditional regulatory manner. There is no path-breaking initiative by forest department in aspect of growing of fodder, fruit trees and trees which can provide additional diet, water harvesting structures and soil erosion. The distrust is now complete between forest and people especially after the passage of new law.

**Implementation of Forest Rights Act**

Only 2.5 percent households have got land under the new law which aims at conferring rights to cultivate the forest land which is traditionally cultivated by them. This matches with the district figures. The implementation is tardy and insensitive farce. Bhanubhai Tadvi, President of the Gujarat unit of Adivasis Sabha (state unit of tribals committees) told reporters that the procedure being followed to allot land is difficult and tribals may be deprived of their entitlement due to non-cooperative attitude of the forest department officials (DNA: 3/11/09).
Migration

Migration is an important livelihood activity. (Mosse et al. 1997). Low agricultural productivity, erosion of natural resource base, lack of employment opportunities and increased restrictions on rights over forest produce have forced the tribal labourers to migrate to other areas in search of wage employment (GOI, 2001). Sole dependency on rain fed subsistence agriculture, lack of irrigation facilities, very low per household land holding, low agricultural productivity and lack of other employment opportunities plague the district even today. Of the total cultivable land only 13 percent is irrigated. The landholdings are small and hardly sufficient to support a household. The average landholding per household is 1.58 hectare and an average land holding per cultivator is 1.07 hectare. As the population is increasing, the average landholding has gone down considerably over the years. It is not surprising that a sizable percentage of population migrates during winter and summer months to be engaged in agricultural labour and construction work. Other livelihood options including forest are negligible and not fully utilised though dairying is showing some hope especially with women participation. District Plan Report of the Dangs, 2009-2010 revealed that most livelihood options within the Dangs region are under stress due to scarcity of fertile land, lack of water and unproductive forest policy. A majority of the population therefore migrates after monsoon, especially the marginal workers. The study also mentioned that people mostly migrate for at least 6 to 7 months and generally after monsoon. Our study reveals that various factors for migration include lack of employment opportunities, cultivation as the only source of income, lack of sufficient land, no irrigation facilities and therefore no opportunities for cultivation during winter and summer and the shortage of water leading to almost no economic activity during the lean season from September to June. Other factors include: to have another source of income besides agriculture and also to pay off debts. Sugarcane cutting was found to be the primary occupation during migration. Other labour-work included agricultural labour; work in horticulture and to some extent industrial and construction work. People mostly migrate for at least 6 to 7 months and generally after monsoon. In sugarcane cutting people migrate mostly between September and November and come back in March or April just before Holi.

The present study shows 35.4 percent tribals have migrated to other places for earning their livelihood. Migrants are highest among Bhils (60.9 percent) and lowest among the PTG, Kotwadia (17.6 percent). The main reasons for migration include (a) earning more (52.9 percent) and
(b) lack of employment opportunities in the locality (44.7 percent). 'Mukkaddams' or 'labour intermediaries' have appeared vital motivators for 54.1 percent migrants. The migrants generally migrate alone (35.3 percent) for earning livelihood. Overall, 29.4 percent accompany their family during migration.

**Facilities Available at Migration Work Place**

Tribal labourers are found subjected to exploitation by contractors and middlemen through practices such as inadequate wage payment, non-provision of basic amenities and other violations of labour laws. Force is also exercised to retain them if they make attempts to leave the employment. The tribals labourers on migration to States other than the States of their origin are not recognised as tribals and do not get facilities accordingly. Despite the enactment of Inter-State Migrant Workmen (Regulation of Employment and Condition of Service) Act, 1979, exploitation of migrant labourers continues to persist. There are no labour organisations to take up the cause of such labourers (GOI, 2001). It is disappointing to note that in the present study 23.5 percent of the Dangi migrants are not getting any facility of accommodation to stay, drinking water and toilets. Hardly half of the migrants (61.2 percent) received medical treatment in the place of migration. However it is notable that tribal pregnant and lactating women managed to get basic medical facilities including vaccination for their children (77.6 percent). What is distressing is the fact that there are no education facilities at the migration sites.

To conclude, this unhealthy, exploitative and unjust migration phenomenon in the present form should be discouraged at any cost. It may be good for the sugar economy controlled by sugar lobby and for the tribals in form of income but in the long term the impact on education and health can keep them behind other populations. And this takes us to analyse the answer to this unhealthy migration, i.e. MGNREGA.

**MGNREGA**

Most of the respondents (78.8 percent) in the present study desire to get labour work within their village. Only 47.5 percent respondents are aware about this most ambitious scheme and only 9.2 percent have been able to apply. This shows something amiss in the implementation of the scheme. None of the PTG, Kotwadia is found to apply under labour law; this is obvious as they are covered in low paying bamboo craft schemes. The study also reveals that though majority of the respondents (96.7) paid no
bribe in getting the work, 6.7 percent Bhils and 4.0 percent Kokana mentioned to pay for labour work to either Talati or Sarpanch or other middlemen. Majority (88.4 percent) of the households covered under the scheme got work within the village or within a distance of 5 kms from the village. More than half of the tribals (50.3 percent) received payment after 15 days while 26.5 percent got immediately.

**MGNREGA Households**

As per NREGA Act, wages are to be paid according to piece rate or daily rate. Disbursement of wages has to be done on weekly basis and not beyond a fortnight in any case (Ministry of Rural Development, 2008). But the study result shows that more than half of the NREGA beneficiaries (57.5 percent) receive payment on monthly basis, which need to be evaluated by the government officials. Payment under NREGA is not pending for majority (94.3 percent) of the beneficiaries. There are 4.3 percent Varli households and 0.9 percent Kunbi households who mentioned that they bribed for getting NREGA payment. Further, evaluation research is essential to find out the truth as already an inquiry has started in this regard.

We can conclude that the implementation of the scheme is far from satisfactory. It has hardly made a dent on the migration which needs to be discouraged in its present form.

**Debt and Savings**

District Plan Report, The Dangs, 2009-2010 depicted high level of indebtedness among tribal households and the dependence is overwhelmingly upon informal money lenders. However, present study reflected that only 11.7 percent of the households are under debt. None of the Kotwadias are under debt. More than half of the indebted households (57.1 percent) raised loans from the banks. The foremost reason for raising debt was for business/agriculture purpose (32.1 percent), followed by medical purpose and for buying animals (17.9 percent each).

Poverty leads to poor savings among the tribals. In the present study, only 22.5 percent managed to save some portion of their earnings mainly in the banks (61.1 percent) and post offices (29.6 percent). Majority of the Bhils (81.8 percent) and most of the Kokana tribes (58.1 percent) prefer to save in the banks, Kotwadia save only in the post offices and Varli saves both in the banks (47.6 percent) as well as in post office (38.1 percent). Only 4.8 percent households informed to save in local self help
groups of “Sahakari Mandali”. Overall, only five percent of the households have any insurance policy. Most of the households (70.4 percent) are saving for their children’s education, 42.6 percent households are saving for old age security, and 38.9 percent are saving for social occasions like marriage and 20.4 percent for more income for their future utility.

To conclude indebtedness is not a serious problem but few people are able to save. Those who save, modern institutes like banks and post offices are preferred destinations. Refreshingly, Self-Help Groups also figures in the list though almost negligible.

6.3. Literacy

Dramatic results of the Government’s efforts in raising the literacy level coupled with increasing awareness among the tribals especially among women are observed in the present study. Encouragingly high literates among the household members of age 7+ years (75.1 percent) are found in the study area which is substantially high as compared to the literacy percentage of tribal population of Gujarat (47.7 percent) and tribal population of India (47.1 percent) as per 2001 census. The literacy rate of total population of the Dangs as per 2001 census was 59.7 percent which has increased to 76.8 percent in 2011 (Census 2011). The total literates are highest among Kotwadias (83.7 percent) and lowest among Bhils (69.8 percent). The female literacy (64.2 percent) is relatively lower than the male literacy (84.2 percent). The difference of male-female literacy percentage (6.2 percent) is substantially low among the Kotwadias than other tribal groups. The male-female literacy difference is highest among the Varlis (22.8 percent). The difference of male-female literacy percentage (86.7 percent and 80.5 percent) is substantially low among the Kotwadias than other tribal groups. More young children (41.9 percent) of 15-19 years are opting for higher education (secondary and above).

A detail analysis on literacy based on secondary data is offered here:

Table 6.2
Education Indicators - Gujarat and the Dangs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Literacy Total</td>
<td>61.29</td>
<td>69.96</td>
<td>79.31</td>
<td>47.56</td>
<td>60.23</td>
<td>76.80</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>73.39</td>
<td>79.66</td>
<td>87.23</td>
<td>59.55</td>
<td>70.70</td>
<td>84.98</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>48.92</td>
<td>57.80</td>
<td>70.73</td>
<td>35.31</td>
<td>48.50</td>
<td>68.75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gross Enrolment Rate</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As can be seen from the above table, in case of the Dangs, the literacy rate had gone up from 47.56 percent in 1991 to 60.23 percent in 2001 (Census, 2001). Compared to the state literacy rate of 69.67 percent, the Dangs was left behind by almost ten points both in male and female literacy. The Dangs had the highest GEI in primary school enrolment compared to the state. In case of the Dangs, percent of girls to boys in the primary school was 93.54 percent as against 82.90 of the State in 2001 (Hirway and Mahadevia, 2004: 194). However the situation has completely changed for better as per the provisional figures of the Census 2011. The Literacy rate of the Dangs has gone up to 76.80 percent in 2011 from 60.23 percent. This is quite comparable to Gujarat rate of 79.31 percent. Even literacy rate has improved by net 20.25 percent for women as against 14.28 percent for male! Further, as can be seen from Table 2.11, the Dangs which was at the bottom in the literacy in 2001 has improved its position to 12th in the state. Even in female literacy, it has moved up to 14 in the state while it ranks 15th in male literacy. In drop out also the situation has dramatically improved. It is not surprising that the female literacy has taken a jump to 68.75 percent from 48.50 percent.

Our survey shows positive findings with regard to accessibility of various schemes of education. The educational facilities mainly availed by the children are scholarships (76.1 percent), text books (66.5 percent), uniforms (65 percent) and food supplements. Almost none of them faced any difficulty in availing these benefits.

This result can also be attributed to higher level of awareness and realisation of importance of education among tribals. There is a sea change in the world view of tribals in this regard. Our survey reveals that majority of the respondents (84.2 percent) desire to educate their children further. Majority of the respondents (90.4 percent) opined that girl children should be educated. The survey shows that out of total 197 respondents, 27.4 percent desire to educate their children up to 12th standard, 22.8 percent desire to educate to the level their children can get a job or start own business, 12.7 percent desire to educate children up to 10th standard and 17.2 percent desire for higher education (graduation and above) of their children. This is not surprising as 79.70 percent respondents have realized the importance of education in life and they...
believe that education of children is beneficial and can help in improving the standard of living, getting employment and jobs resulting in brighter future, etc.

However the single most reason for this spectacular result can be attributed to spread of schools at the village and even falia level under ‘Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan’ even when the importance of annual Campaigns for enrolment, quality improvement and other schemes cannot be underestimated. The Dangs is better placed from both teacher pupil ratio and schools per 100,000 populations. It has 375 Primary Schools run by District Panchayat, 09 Govt. Ashram schools, 12 Private Ashram Schools, 09 Primary Schools (private) for 311 villages.

The result in respect of health is dismal in the district even with all campaigns and schemes as institutional arrangement unlike primary education is wholly inadequate and thinly spread with lack of doctors.

This will be amply clear if we look at the condition of secondary and higher secondary education. It till recently has few secondary and higher secondary schools especially science-stream schools. This has resulted into huge dropout after class VII and few students opting for science stream. However the secondary education will show the same result if newly started 23 High Schools and 04 Higher Secondary Schools are provided with enough teachers and residential schools status. Higher education is not much to speak of with one College of arts and commerce at Ahwa and an ITI.

As far as primary education is concerned, there are still issues which require immediate attention. The quality of teachers in the Dangs is quite diverse. Only 55.4 percent of the respondents are happy with the standard of education in the schools. Of that 25.8 percent respondents are not satisfied with the use of language and dialect of the teachers in the class. Among the tribes, satisfaction on the standard of education was expressed highest by Kotwadias (88.2 percent) and lowest by the Bhils (43.5 percent). Also the teachers from outside the Dangs generally do not speak the local dialects. Teachers prefer to use the Gujarati language in classroom interaction. The tribals in the present study have preferred Dangi speaking teachers, especially at the primary school level. Even local teachers in the knowledge of Dangi dialect prefer to use Gujarati language for classroom interaction. Another issue is the irregularity in attendance of teachers in remote areas even though majority of households have expressed satisfaction with teachers’ attendance. In schools with two teachers, the teachers in some cases only attend half time. This is largely because most of the teachers prefer to stay in bigger towns/villages or commute from their native places mainly due to lack of
accommodation at the village level. The tribals do not question the quality and type of education their children are receiving as these state actors are not under the control of local Gram Panchayats or Gramsabhas.

These young tribal students need counseling on various career courses and options available within their vicinity. Vocationalisation of education at middle/high school levels and employment-oriented courses need to be promoted. Also, subjects offered at the under graduate level should be related to the local economy such as forestry, horticulture, animal husbandry, etc.

6.4. Health

Health is an important indicator of human development and well being. Karl Gunnar Myrdal, the Swedish Nobel Laureate of Economic Sciences for the year 1974, had said in his Nobel Prize lecture that “A growing part of the poorest strata in a population may be more diseased, or at least be lacking in vigor, and may even become ever more inflicted, while the mortality rate is still decreasing, due to cheap and powerful medical technology made available after the war. People will continue to live and breed, only to suffer debilitating conditions of ill health to an ever larger extent. Thus, they will be ever less efficient with serious effects also on the productivity of the labor force.” A lot of schemes and programmes have been devised by governments especially for tribals. However, compared to some of the developed countries, the percentage of total budget is less than desired. Basu (1998) felt that in spite of expansion of health facilities in tribal areas and government’s efforts to improve health situation of tribals, hardly significant impact on the important health indicators of tribal people was achieved. The present study among the tribal communities of the Dangs district reflects encouraging results on utilisation of health-care systems as most of the households (71.7 percent) avail government health facilities including PHC (39.2) for treatment of common ailments. Majority households (97.5 percent) received health information from Anganwadi workers and health workers. It is again encouraging to note that overwhelming majority of the households benefited from the medicines received from PHCs (92.5 percent) and 98.3 percent regularly visit for child immunisation. Hence, in terms of health care facilities, the present study shows that there is acceptance of modern health care by tribals of the district.

However from the point view of adequacy of such facilities, they can be considered as socially excluded especially when most of the posts of doctors are vacant. Also there is negligible presence of private doctors in
the district and access to inadequate facilities is arduous from the point of view of transportation and geographical constraints. Kanagaraj (2008) in his study mentioned that access to health care is considered as one of the components of social inclusion and means of tribal integration.

If we analyse the health indicators, the Dangs is poor among all health indicators. The Dangs continues to report high TFR in 2001. Morbidity rate calculated by Commissioner of Health is 83.77 percent in 1000 population (1992-1994) as against 55 percent of the State. 55.5 percent tribal women in Gujarat suffer from Anemia as against 46 percent women in the State in 2001 (ibid: 132). Medical officers in the Dangs opine that this incidence had been found to be between 70 to 80 percent.

Table 6.3
Health Indicators – Gujarat and the Dangs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Particulars</th>
<th>Gujarat</th>
<th>The Dangs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CBR</td>
<td>33.56</td>
<td>24.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDR</td>
<td>8.80</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMR</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMR</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TFR</td>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>2.60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source 2c: Data collected from the district offices.

As mentioned earlier, the infrastructural facilities in the district are inadequate considering, geographical constraints, population depending on it and lack of private health care. There are only 7 PHCs for a population of 2,26,769 with a ratio of 1 PHC per 32,395 people! The entire district has 2 dispensaries. There is only one referral CHC at Vaghai. The single major health facility in form of civil hospital is available at Ahwa, the district head quarter. There are 9 ayurvedic centre completely disconnected with local healing practices which are also based on herbal medicines.

Table 6.4
Health infrastructure facilities in the Dangs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Villages</th>
<th>PHC</th>
<th>CHC</th>
<th>Dispensary</th>
<th>Private/Govt. Civil hospital</th>
<th>Ayurvedic centre/hospital</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>311</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following statement shows the details on registered births, Crude Birth Rate (CBR), Infant Mortality rate (IMR) etc.
### Table 6.5
District wise Registered Births, CBR, Registered Deaths, CDR, Infant Death and Infant Mortality Rate as per CRS, 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>District</th>
<th>Registered Births</th>
<th>CBR</th>
<th>Registered Deaths</th>
<th>CDR</th>
<th>Infant Death</th>
<th>IMR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ahmedabad</td>
<td>138796</td>
<td>20.2</td>
<td>44281</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>2328</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Amreli</td>
<td>38657</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td>7730</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Anand</td>
<td>51619</td>
<td>26.0</td>
<td>15925</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Banas Kantha</td>
<td>85714</td>
<td>29.3</td>
<td>10492</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Bharuch</td>
<td>32228</td>
<td>21.0</td>
<td>10609</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Bhavnagar</td>
<td>75836</td>
<td>27.4</td>
<td>14164</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Dohad</td>
<td>57158</td>
<td>29.5</td>
<td>5528</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Gandhinagar</td>
<td>31164</td>
<td>20.1</td>
<td>7822</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Jamnagar</td>
<td>46462</td>
<td>20.4</td>
<td>11221</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Junagadh</td>
<td>60683</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>14316</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>437</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Kachchh</td>
<td>50952</td>
<td>27.6</td>
<td>7931</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Kheda</td>
<td>52018</td>
<td>24.1</td>
<td>13758</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Mahesana</td>
<td>46605</td>
<td>23.7</td>
<td>11752</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Narmada</td>
<td>15194</td>
<td>27.5</td>
<td>3634</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Navsari</td>
<td>22656</td>
<td>17.1</td>
<td>9331</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Panchmahals</td>
<td>71843</td>
<td>31.7</td>
<td>10558</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>222</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Patan</td>
<td>37156</td>
<td>29.2</td>
<td>6812</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>PORbandar</td>
<td>12695</td>
<td>21.8</td>
<td>3132</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Rajkot</td>
<td>85661</td>
<td>23.2</td>
<td>21823</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>1121</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Sabarkantha</td>
<td>59465</td>
<td>25.9</td>
<td>11677</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Surat</td>
<td>110233</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>31323</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>1428</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Surendranagar</td>
<td>41168</td>
<td>23.2</td>
<td>7734</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>The Dangs</td>
<td>7249</td>
<td>32.7</td>
<td>1540</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Vadodara</td>
<td>79892</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>25470</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>769</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Valsad</td>
<td>34757</td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>9422</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>267</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gujarat</strong></td>
<td><strong>1345861</strong></td>
<td><strong>23.0</strong></td>
<td><strong>317985</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.5</strong></td>
<td><strong>9578</strong></td>
<td><strong>7</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


CRS Figures of the Govt. of Gujarat in its Annual Report on Health Statistics 2009-10 of January, 2011 indicate State CBR to be 23 and CDR to be 5.5. The State figures for IMR are 7. As far as the Dangs is concerned, the corresponding figures are as high as 32.7 (CBR) and CDR is also 6.9. Even its IMR is 8. The CBR of the Dangs is the highest among all the districts. As far as CDR is concerned, it is third highest in the State. The Dangs is sixth highest in the State as far as IMR is concerned. This brings out a very disturbing health situation in the district. Nutritional security is a severe problem amongst the women. Especially adolescent girls and pregnant women suffer from anemia, which is caused by a deficient and insufficient dietary pattern. People are mostly dependent on food grains and have little vitamin or protein rich...
food. Use of green vegetable and meat is almost absent except for a few months of monsoon.

As far as total beds in the District are concerned, the position is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PHC</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>Beds 42</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CHC</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Beds 30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Indoor patients in Government Hospitals of the Dangs were 43,953 in 2009-10 against 36, 06,269 of Gujarat. As far as outdoor patients are concerned, The Dangs’ number is 1, 57,829, against the State’s 3,36,00,000. (Annual Report on Health Statistics, 2009-10, Government of Gujarat, 2011).

The number of indoor and outdoor patients at the PHCs, CHC and Civil Hospital, Ahwa is one of the highest in proportion to the population of the District. This is primarily because of hugely inadequate health infrastructure and non-availability of private hospitals. Hence, the tribals flock to highly inadequate Govt. facilities which also are under-staffed.

Maximum utilisation of health care facilities is made by Kotwadias, with their access to faith healers being minimum for reasons unknown. However, majority of the Kotwadia households (94.1 percent) preferred home delivery. Hence, attention needs to be paid in motivating the tribal groups, especially the Kotwadias for institutional delivery for safe motherhood.

As a part of tribal culture, the households (53.8 percent) also visit faith healers for treatment. They are mostly treated with herbal medicines (70.1 percent). 48.5 percent of the households are treated through supernatural method of healing which includes ritual and chanting. The importance of the indigenous knowledge of cure and use of medicinal plants are of vital importance especially in the context when the modern medical infrastructure and services are either not available in the inaccessible and isolated tribal areas or not acceptable due to lack of awareness of modern medicine system and or not affordable due to their economic backwardness (GOI, 2001). Dr. P.K. Chaudhary, the Additional District Health Officer, said the problem of witchcraft is acute as such practices are popular among villagers (Indian Express, June 15, 2011). “It is a question of faith. These practices enjoy enormous support from villagers, which makes our task very difficult,” said Chaudhary, who oversees the
health administration through nine primary health centres, one community health centre and one government civil hospital. Dr. Chaudhary’s statement is misleading on two counts: He does not mention that the health infrastructure is wholly inadequate and hence people go to faith healers who are available at the doorstep. Also his presumption that such faith healing is to be rejected out right is contrary to many studies which prove that there is a degree of scientific basis to it.

Hence, there is a need to promote indigenous medicine systems among the tribes. Efforts need to be made by the government and academic institutions for conducting scientific research and providing and adequate financial support to promote indigenous medicine systems. There is also a need to mobilise, organise, train and promote network among the practitioners of tribal medicine towards sustaining these systems.

The nine ayurvedic centres available in the district can be converted into institutes to do research and support system from local traditional healing system which our survey shows is heavily dependent on herbal medicines. Use of non- Sanskrit Mantras (Chants) should be accepted as Mantra chanting at the time of collection, preparation and administration of medicine is basic to Ayurveda.

6.5. Perceptions of the Respondents’ on the Impact of Tribal Sub Plan

The various development works in the field of infrastructure and beneficiary schemes taken up by two main development agencies i.e. DRDA and TASP in the last 15 to 20 years are given in Appendix 4 and Appendix 5. The broad objectives of tribal sub-plan area are to reduce the gap between the levels of development in the TSP area and other areas of the state and to improve the socio-economic conditions of the tribals. The tribal sub-plan represents total development efforts of the region made by various organisations, agencies and departments responsible for individual sectors at the state and central government level (GOI 1981:5). A survey of perception of the tribals with regard to awareness, access to schemes, access to state actors and impact on their life of such schemes is discussed herewith.

6.5.1. Awareness of the TSP

Most of the respondents (60.8 percent) are aware of the TSP. The awareness about the TSP among Bhils is the lowest (47.8 percent) and it is the highest among the Kotwadias (82.4 percent). This shows that the
level of awareness is very low. *Kotwadias* are highly aware of various programmes as they are specifically targeted towards them.

The main sources of information about Tribal Sub Plan Schemes to the villagers are *Sarpanch* (47.9 percent) and *Talatis* (46.6 percent). Tribe wise analysis shows that the main sources of information of the TSP schemes for *Bhils* is *Sarpanch* (40.9 percent) and for *Varli* and *Kotwadias* it is *Sarpanch* (69 percent and 92.9 percent respectively) and *Talati* (65.5 percent and 100 percent respectively). Similarly, *Kokanas* also mentioned *Talati* (38.3 percent) and *Sarpanch* (43.6 percent) as the main source of information of the TSP. It goes without saying that the role of *Sarpanch* and *Talati* can not be undermined for when it comes to implementation of the schemes.

### 6.5.2. Access to Direct Benefits

Overall, out of 240 respondent families, only 31.7 percent i.e. 76 households availed direct benefits of the TSP schemes. Highest benefits are availed by the *Kotwadias* (52.9 percent) and lowest by *Varlis* (22.2 percent). This shows that individual and group schemes of economic development are not comprehensive and not all are covered. Among those who availed various Tribal Development Schemes, most of them mentioned availing benefit of housing scheme (48.7 percent), followed by land development scheme (25 percent), irrigation facility (22.4 percent), financial assistance for social occasions like daughter’s marriage etc. (22.4 percent). Out of 76 households who availed benefits of the TSP schemes, 13.2 percent faced difficulties in getting the benefits of the TSP schemes.

### 6.5.3. Access to State Actors

Bureaucracy is one of the most important major actors. Rule-making is significant because seldom, if ever, will an adopted policy action, such as a law, encompass all of the necessary details of how, when, and where the policy is to be implemented. Due to this power, the bureaucracy enjoys considerable discretion in interpreting the actual intent, method, and scope of a policy decision. (Theodoulou and Kofinis, 2004, p. 171)

Various development schemes in many fields are in operation for the overall development of the tribal community. The visit of the
administrative officials is important at village levels, to reach the people at grassroots for effective implementation of the schemes. With regard to access to various actors for direct benefits, only 7.5 percent are found to contact any person or NGO to take benefit of the TSP schemes. 17.1 percent contacted the government officials for availing the benefits of the TSP schemes.

Majority of the respondents (82.1 percent) mentioned that government officials visited their village to explain various TSP schemes. It is observed in the present study that mainly Talatis (56.3 percent), Gramsevaks and Government officials (35.5 percent each) among the officials are seen visiting the villages either to explain about the benefits or help them in getting various benefits of Tribal Development schemes. The Talatis and Gram Sevaks have multiple villages under their jurisdiction. They are the street officials and their access needs to be improved for better awareness and access to the TSP schemes especially in the light of the fact that they are most important disseminators of information along with Sarpanch in the village.

6.5.4. Impact of Tribal Sub Plan Schemes

There is perceived economic upliftment of most of the households (78.9 percent) after availing benefits of the TSP schemes. All Bhil, 90.9 percent Kokana and 58.3 percent Varli house-holds opined change in their economic life for better. However, dissatisfaction is noticed among Kotwadias as most of them (77.8 percent) opined that their economic condition has not improved even after availing benefits of the TSP schemes. All the Kotwadias also opined that the TSP schemes could not improve their social life. More than half of Kokanas (68.2 percent) and Varlis (50 percent) and less than half of the Bhils (45.5 percent) expressed improvement in their social life after availing the TSP schemes.

To conclude, if we look at the overall economic position of the respondents, such impact even when positive is minimal and not strong enough to lift them above poverty line. Nor has it helped them to find employment on sustainable basis within the district as can be seen from large migration. May be the saving grace has been the migration income.

6.6. Policy Content, Context and Actors

This section, taking the discussion further, aims at critically assessing implementation of the TSP using the concepts discussed in Chapter 2.
In the foregoing pages we discussed and analysed the social economic status and impact of developmental efforts of the Government under the overall umbrella of the TSP. We found that level of awareness about the TSP Schemes among the respondents is very low. We also found that they largely depend on Talati and Sarpanch for information of and access to the schemes. Also we could see that only 31.7 percent of the respondents have received direct benefits under family targeted schemes. Most of such direct benefits consist of housing schemes (48.7 percent) followed by development schemes like land reforms (25 percent), irrigation facilities (22.4 percent) etc. As far as impact of the TSP scheme is concerned, though majority of them experienced economic upliftment after availing benefits of such schemes, most of them continue to live below poverty line. We also saw that there is tremendous improvement in literacy. Also acceptance of modern health practices is very high despite poor infrastructure and non-availability of doctors.

Almost all other various actors have also opined that the result and impact of the TSP are at the best mixed and nowhere near to the objectives envisaged. Shri Ghelubhai Naik opines that there is overall improvement in education and some positive impact on health and income level. However, there are issues of concern like unemployment among educated youth, poor quality of primary education, shortage of officers and doctors, and poor implementation of MGNREGA scheme and the Forest Rights Act. Shri Vadibhai, a top non-official has also opined that though the situation has improved, huge poverty persists with availability of food still a problem. He opines that Government’s adoption of survey technique with new criteria for identification of BPL families is not proper and does not give enough weightage to critical criteria like availability of food and livelihood.

The district officers are also of the view that the impact of the TSP is positive, but it requires tremendous improvement. They were of the opinion that migration has decreased by almost ten percent due to MGNREGA scheme. However, due to guaranteed employment at migrating site, the tribals still prefer to migrate. They identify lack of water resources as the weakest link in development of agriculture and other related sectors of the district. These officers were critical of negative attitude of banks with regards to financial inclusion, their lack of professionalism and non-posting of bank officers and employees in required numbers. They identified animal husbandry, dairying, forest based industries as the potential areas to increase employment. They wanted the forest to play a bigger role in strengthening livelihood options of the district. They were unanimous with regard to spectacular
performance of the district with regard to literacy. However, they raised concern for the lack of adequate and quality teachers for post-primary education and unemployment among the educated youth. They were also of the opinion that more grant-in-aid schools, especially science and English-medium, should be allowed to be opened by proven educational NGOs in the district. The present policy of recruitment of teachers on contract basis and state level recruitment is working against the Dangs as potential teachers give last preference to the Dangs district. As far as health is concerned, the focus group of the district officers was worried about persistence of anaemic condition of the majority of the population, especially women. There is an improvement in aspects like immunisation and mother and child care. However, there is a huge shortage of health infrastructure and doctors.

We will examine the nature of the policy design (content) and policy context of the TSP policy and schemes. A critical analysis of the world view, role and behaviour of various stakeholders/actors and how policy implementation is either promoted or sometimes undermined by these actors will be made.

According to Grindle and Thomas, policy implementation is not a linear process but an interactive, political and administrative process. Following this model, we focus on the biggest stake holder state along with the reactions of various actors. Here we will study and assess implementation aspect from content as well context of the TSP. It can be interesting to look at the proposition that ‘what is implemented may thus be the result of political calculus of interests and groups competing for the scarce resources, the responses of implementing officials, and the actions of the political elites, all interacting within given institutional and socio political context’ (Grindle 1980:10). Such study can help in devising strategies to deal with impediments to successful implementation of a policy so that objectives are achieved fully.

For this we will use long’s Actor oriented research technique. Following Long, we consider that the separation of policy, implementation and outcome is a gross oversimplification. There is a need to study interface between implementing agencies and local groups and actors. Here we will try a) to identify the problems and concepts as presented by particular actors so as to understand the conflict in the worldview and b) types and contents of social relationships and activities that involving various actors. This approach will be used to understand why policy implemented may have different outcomes than planned. This approach,
further, will be used to understand the diversity in outcomes, uneven allocation of benefits and costs of intervention.

This impact of the TSP on the tribals is discussed along with the important variables so as to bring out the worldviews, role and behaviour of various actors. The actual implementation process is juxtaposed against the planned one which is prescribed as a distinct part of national planning exercise to address specific needs of the Tribals. An attempt has been made to understand the mutation, either for good or bad, in the policies, implementation process and results. Naturally the idea is to bring out implementation as it is at the national, state and particularly at the district level in its raw form. This should help us understand, in a better manner, the TSP implementation, different world views and the behaviour of various actors to the same policy and plans. The following variables identified by Grindle have been taken to study the implementation process of the TSP.

**Policy Design and contents of the TSP Approach**

(a) Integration and Coordination among various Implementing agencies.
(b) Is the implementation bottom up or top down?
(c) Response system and flexibility.
(d) Multiplicity of decision points, schemes and agencies.
(e) Did the policy anticipate implementation problems?

**Policy Context of the TSP Approach**

(a) Geographical constraints.
(b) Capacity: financial and human resources.
(c) Economic factors.

In addition, social exclusion within tribal community will also be analysed. Actor oriented approach will be used to bring out the process of conflict and exclusion. This will help in assessment of the structural factors which determine and sustain poverty and inequality. Also world views of various actors and changes thereof are discussed. Corruption and rent seeking is brought out as discussion takes place.

**6.6.1. Policy Design and Contents of the TSP Approach**

In light of less than positive impact of the TSP, let us start discussion by examining policy design and policy contents the TSP against its own
goals – that it would be integrated, bottom up, participatory, flexible and responsive.

(a) **Integration and Coordination among various Implementing agencies.**

Flexibility is supposed to be the hallmark in the TSP (GOI 1981:5-10). Simple single line administration and avoidance of multiplicity of schemes and programmes is to be ensured. The felt needs of the tribals in consultation with tribals and NGOs are to be considered (ibid). What has happened, in reality, in the Dangs?

The TSP strategy calls for an area based integrated approach. In reality, there is a huge gap between intention and action at all levels starting from the centre to the state and down the bureaucratic hierarchy.

Srikumar a state officer from Tribal Development Department states, “Government and officers have forgotten that the TSP is area specific. Hence, area approach is followed only for the fund of Gujarat Pattern, which is just 20 percent of total state budget. Line Departments do not follow area approach. This has resulted into standardisation of schemes and they do not reflect local needs.” The sectoral plans in the TSP document of the state government do not give area wise plans. A top non-official of the district also says that there is no coordinated planning at present. He opines that there is preponderance to target oriented implementation. The concept of planning by considering and backward linkages is only on paper. Even the targets are largely financial in nature and if physical targets are given, they do not reflect the final outcomes. Actually, at the grass root level, objectives of the TSP get diluted to “achieving targets”. According to Haribhai, a top non-official, “Planning is like blinds describing an elephant; one doesn’t know what others are doing”. Discussions with the TSP officials, district officers and NGOs reveal that each department prepares plan on its own and holistic attitude is largely lacking.

As far as Gujarat Pattern is concerned, the projects are sanctioned by the district committee and holistic planning is done. However, even here, Haribhai, the top non-official of the district says it is more like agreeing with the agenda (thappo ja marvano) as generally, projects are put in the district committee at the last moment. No prior consultation is done with the members. Nor does a mechanism exist which collects, processes and documents felt needs systematically. District officers also agreed that the proposals are prepared by them on the basis of their perceptions of the
felt needs of the tribals and representations received. Even in the case of District *Panchayat*, proposals are sent to the district committee without prior consultations with elected representatives. Kulkarni, an irrigation officer, informs that despite many check-dams constructed by his department and other agencies, lack of co-ordination among departments like agriculture, animal husbandry and banking sector has not allowed full use irrigation potential.

The mechanism of reflecting felt needs of the people in sectoral plans is very weak. Generally, such sectoral plans are prepared on the basis of guidelines issued by the concerned departments leading to lack of initiatives on the part of local bodies and district officers to go for innovative schemes. In theory, as per the government instructions, every district is supposed to prepare a district plan. In the Dangs, the officers were not sure who is responsible for preparation of such a plan resulting into absence of a district plan which is backbone of the TSP strategy. Suman, a top development officer agrees that there is a lot of confusion about the TSP and TASP. The TASP office of the Dangs and state tribal department deals more intensely with Gujarat Patterns fund compared to the sectoral funds. Detailed review of Gujarat Pattern fund is done only at the district level. For this research, we, for example, could not get a comprehensive plan for the district from the TASP office or from the Tribal Development Department despite repeated attempts. The reports of expenditure and performance with regard to 80 percent funds are sent directly by the district officers of the line departments to their higher up.

It can be concluded that the present system is not integrated even on paper.

(b) Is the implementation bottom up or top down?

According to Grindle, implementation can be affected if interests of actors suffer (Grindle 1980:8). Due to resistance of bureaucrats, mainstream leaders and other dominant actors the policies and administrative structures were not modified to reflect the spirit of the TSP. Sectoral Plans are prepared from top to bottom based on yearly budget exercise at the State level. The line departments continued to plan mostly at the state level. As a result, the plans prepared at the project level in the Dangs are largely based on the policies and norms prescribed for the mainstream in mind.
According to Srikumar, the resistance of the finance department and line departments ensured non-implementation of the radical provisions of PESA. The Tribal Development Department gets only 20 percent of the amount instead of the promised 100 percent. The Finance department prevented the Tribal Development Department to be in overall charge of the tribal fund. As a result, at present, he says, not more than 10 to 12 percent allocation of plan goes to the TSP as against proposed 17.75 percent. In recent years, this percent has gone up, however the funds are either not utilized fully or they are diverted to non-tribal schemes (Times of India, 19 September 2011).

Funds, functions and functionaries are not transferred, despite constitutional amendments, to tribal Panchayati Raj Institutes (PRIs) fully despite radical provisions of PESA. The officers are still under a line department head; recruitment, promotion & punishment of line department are largely controlled by the ‘HQs’ (Head Quarters of line departments). Even with regard to transfer of primary teachers a lot of restrictions of the state apply.

Detailed review of the Gujarat Pattern fund is done at the district level. For sectoral TSP, however, such review is lacking except for the budget of the District Panchayat, admits Vyas, a revenue officer. Such reviews are done by the line department at the State level.

In the field of education, there have been encouraging results in terms of literacy. However, the quality of the primary education is still poor. This was substantiated by education NGOs and Pandya, a senior development officer in 2005. However the actors now opine that quality of primary education is also improving though at a slow rate. However, the air in the field of education is heavy with the top-down approach. Let us take the example of primary education. Four committees are in place to improve primary education viz. Village Education Committee (VEC), Parents Teacher Association, Mother Teacher Association and Village Construction Works Committee. Gitaben, a Sarpanch, says she signs most of the proceedings without attending all committee meetings. The secretary of the school trust and principal of the school, Jagdishbhai agrees that till now, all the agendas prepared and tabled by him have been approved without any amendment so far. Revenue officer Vyas says principals instead of people select members of such committees.

These committees report directly to Cluster Research Centre (CRC) which through district co-ordinator who is also District Primary
Education Officer reports to the state director of *Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan* (SSA). Village *Panchayats* and *Gramsabha* are completely left out. The district officers agreed that the working of VEC and other committees is not discussed in the *District Panchayat* committees which are headed by non-officials. This is despite the fact that under Gujarat *Panchayat* Act, primary education has been transferred to *Panchayati Raj* Institutes (PRIs). In case of health also village health committee’s reports are not reviewed by Village *Panchayat / Gramsabhas*, *Taluka Panchayat* or District *Panchayats*. Only Public Health Officer receives such reports which are not put in the health committee of the District *Panchayat*. The Public Health Officer receives such reports from field staff and they are sent to the health department in form of statements. District *Panchayat* officers regret that this has led to non-ownership of schools and health sub-centres by the Village *Panchayats*. Many suggested that instead of putting *Sarpanch* as chairman of so many committees, various village *Panchayat* members can be made chairmen. Also, these committees should be working directly under village *Panchayat* for integrated and co-ordinated approach.

The role of *Gramsabhas* in creating awareness for effective and participatory planning and social audit cannot be over emphasised. *Gramsabha* can be a potent instrument in effective implementation of the TSP approach. However, such *Gramsabhas* have not been delegated necessary powers as envisaged in PESA. Today it has largely become a stage for politics, mud-slinging and ineffective proceedings.

(c) Response System and Flexibility

According to Grindle, the success of a policy also depends upon responsiveness of the system so as to provide flexibility, support and feedback (Grindle 1980:13).

Prabhu, a saint and an NGO head, is of the opinion that the state policies and plans are thrust upon the district making implementation difficult and wasteful. As far as 80 percent of the TSP fund is concerned, the norms, standards and the funds available for each scheme and programme for each district are pre-determined. Addition and deletion of a scheme, change in norms, change in allocation of fund is very difficult and time consuming. With regard to 20 percent of the fund, it is controlled by Tribal Development Department and allocation of the fund is made TSP area-wise. The plan is prepared by the District Tribal Development Council headed by District Minister. This fund is again largely based on
detailed norms fixed by Tribal Development Department and the flexibility is still not to the extent desired. Only nucleus budget has the desired flexibility.

Projects prepared at the District level by consulting local tribals and their leaders have been found to be more effective. Almost all district officers wanted flexibility with regard to norms and standards in preparation of the schemes. They cite examples of successful projects like dairy development project prepared under Rashtriya Shram Vikas Yojana, Vadi Projects and various group irrigation schemes, etc. However, only a small fund is given for flexible planning in form of 'nucleus' budget.

The dairying development in the district has been quite successful. A district officer opines that it is largely because it was prepared and well planned by the district in partnership with dairying co-operatives of nearby district with forward & backward linkages, and was financed from RSVY, a central scheme. A note on this success story is given in Appendix 6. The spectacular results in literacy is also result of flexible policy of more schools, more teachers and enrolment and quality improvement campaigns with focus on girl enrolment which emphasised people’s participation. The earlier significant work done by two institutes: Rutumbhara and Deep Darshan are narrated in Appendix 6.

Ghelubhai Naik, a Gandhian activist says, “The Dangs has done very well in literacy. This is due to a flexible policy of establishing more schools in the district (with 219 schools per 100,000 persons in 2000-01 as against the state average of 75). This policy, coupled with measures like: increasing awareness about education among tribals, impact of adult literacy movement, mid-day meals, free uniforms and other incentives like bicycles, scholarships and special mass-enrolment drives have increased enrolment in the district.”

However, same flexibility is not seen when it comes to secondary and higher education. For example, the Dangs has only one Arts and Commerce College with inadequate hostel facility. Also, there is only one technical institute in the district in the form of an ITI. According to Prof. Kartik, Dangi youths are interested in job-oriented courses. Considering that students become introvert during their social interaction with non-tribal people, he suggests that a career and guidance council centre should be started. He is confident that good district library, hostel facility and vocational training can make a Dangi youth compete successfully with non-tribal students.
Two NGOs viz. Rutumbhara and Deep Darshan who run secondary schools and have done pioneering work in the Dangs in the field education are not able to start science stream as new state policy doesn’t sanction new grant in aid classes or schools. Haribhai says, “After independence the strong non-tribal communities, through Caste Trusts, have got huge number of grant-in-aid schools sanctioned for their communities. We are left in lurch when our leaders got capability to start such Trusts and institutes”. This new policy hurts the Dangs more compared to other non-tribal areas with more aided schools, says Prabhu. Ashram Schools generally have been found to be effective but suffer from inadequate infrastructure facilities especially hostel facilities. Hence, admissions are restricted, forcing tribal students try their luck in residential schools/hostels of nearby districts.

An Education Officer, Shri Gamit opines that there is great enthusiasm amongst girls to get educated. Government started seasonal residential hostels from the year 2000, for the children of migrating families. However, he suggested that there should be at least one hostel amongst three to four villages. This request is not being agreed to. Vadibhai, the top non-official is also of the opinion that the capacity of the residential seasonal hostels for children of migrated families is not adequate and its capacity should be increased to minimum 5000.

There is an acute shortage of teachers in the Dangs both in terms of quality and number. Also many posts of teachers, especially science and Mathematics are vacant. As the Dangs is given last preference by the recruited teachers, quality teachers are not available, especially with regard to subjects like Mathematics and Science. The present system of paying only ` 4500/- for initial five years before the teacher is made permanent if not discontinued at least for district like the Dangs, the problem of the quality and quantity of teachers will continue. He suggest that teachers ready to serve the Dangs should be paid more than other districts (at least ` 6000/- per month, he suggests). He further suggests that the teachers opting for the Dangs should be made permanent after three years. Such suggestions are made but are not agreed to as they are not in conformity with the State policy. This will ensure the quality and there would be enough number of teachers in the District, he says.

Shri Gamit is, however, worried about the serious problem of lack of quality and adequate teachers for the Secondary Schools. Under the Rashtriya Madhyamik Shikshan Abhiyan, since last two years, 28 Secondary Schools have been sanctioned. However, the Government has not given permission for recruitment since last two years and hence,
today all these 28 schools are running with just one teacher against sanctioned strength of 5 teachers! Even the posts of Principals are vacant! The government also does not allow recruitment of Secondary teachers on contract basis. Because of this, enrolment of students in these new schools is not more than 50 to 60 students. Also, as these are not residential schools, tribals prefer to send their children to residential schools of nearby districts if they can get admission. The Government has sanctioned ` 1.5 crore for each secondary school for infrastructure facilities; however lack of hostels and teachers may seriously affect the programme and harm youth of the district. He was worried that during the teachers’ recruitment process, the Dangs may not get teachers for science and mathematics at all. The fruits of transformation in primary education will be lost if secondary education does not become flexible to the needs of the district, he sighs. He is of the opinion that if the quality of secondary education is to improve, adopting separate norms for the district to attract quality teachers in adequate numbers is the need of the hour.

In the field of health, health workers and Anganwadi workers have been able to ensure accessibility of services to the tribals. However, the norms of health sub-centres do not consider the geographical constraints of the district. Even with the existing standards, the Dangs should have 65 centres against existing 47. This affects vaccination and preventive health care work in the district. Vadibhai is also of the same view. A Health worker, Ms. Vilasben accepted that she is not able to do full vaccination work as she has 10 villages to serve. Lack of transport adds to the problem. Due to many falias (sub-villages) within village, she is most of the time on foot. She admitted that she skips vaccination work of hard-to-access interior areas as she is overburdened. Ms. Desai, one health official cited example of a scheme of supplementary nutrition to pregnant mothers in the Dangs not being sanctioned as it does not fit in the state norms even when it is accepted that Dangi women are anemic and require extra nutrients. Had the TSP been implemented in the true letter and spirit, policy fit for the Dangs in this regard could have been decided.

As discussed in this Chapter in section on impact assessment, the number of PHCs in the district is wholly inadequate if we consider geographical constraints, scattered villages in the hilly terrains and even falias (sub-villages) scattered over a large area within the village itself.

Senior Health Officer, Dr. Shri Ram has opined that more than 50 percent of the posts of doctors are vacant (of 13 doctors, 7 posts are vacant). Even the sanctioned strength is not enough to meet the heavy demand of
medical services by the tribals in wake of their increasing acceptance of modern medical facilities. Huge vacancy of posts of doctors at PHCs, CHC, Vaghai and the only Civil Hospital at Ahwa is a serious issue. But this situation has persisted now, since long, and no serious policy initiative is forthcoming for decades. A senior revenue officer, Acharya was quite frustrated of this long standing problem. According to Dr. Shri Ram, health sector of the Dangs requires minimum seven more Female Health Workers. He is of a strong opinion that norms of sub-centres and PHCs should be relaxed if the Dangs has to perform and match state performance even when the later itself is poor on many millennium goals. He cites example of sector of primary education which has seen radical improvement in literacy due to availability of teachers and flexibility in starting schools.

The most inflexible department is forest, which is governed by the central laws. Shri Gandhi, a forest officer along with many others in the district cites many cases where development works could not be taken up due to forest laws. Development projects like drinking water projects, irrigation projects, telephone lines, percolation tanks, houses for poor and roads could not be taken up. Till recently even Gamtals, on which villages stood, were part of the forest. When I was DDO in the Dangs in 1992, I received notices from forest department for criminal prosecution for constructing schools, Anganwadi and houses for the poor in the Gamtals! Despite the recent relaxation of permission procedure, such permissions are hard to get and takes a long period of time.

Shri Gandhi admitted that because the forest laws had not recognised cultivation rights of the tribals in the beginning, politics of votes have ensured a cycle of encroachment and repeated regularisation of forest lands. According to him, forest laws have put the systems of protection of the forest and environment at the centre instead of tribals for whom forests are life line for sustaining their livelihood, culture and tradition. A lack of comprehensive view in this regard has resulted into more damage to the environment cause than anything else.

(d) Multiplicity of decision points, schemes and agencies

Grindle has warned that policies with multiple goals, larger spread of geographical and organisational sites of decision making can affect implementation (Grindle 1980:9-10). The TSP rightly advocated a single line administration with minimal schemes. Multiple Schemes, Agencies and Parallel Committees with multiple decision making points have
actually adversely affected successful implementation of the TSP approach.

There are more than 50 agencies and 350 schemes for the tribals with multiple decision point in the Dangs! In the case of rural development, funds are released directly by the Rural Development Ministry of Government of India. Other Central Ministries also release funds to their concerned line departments in the State. The State allocates funds to its line departments, agencies, corporations and boards. The story repeats at the district, taluka and village level. Naturally, creation of multiple agencies has led to multiple schemes creating confusion among the tribals and implementers at the grass root level.

A stark example of multiplicity of schemes is with regard to housing sector. There is central scheme called *Indira Awas Yojana*. The State Government also implements another housing scheme called *Sardar Awas Yojana*. Also there is one more housing scheme operated by Tribal Development Department through office of the TASP. To top all these schemes, there is a *Katmal* Scheme operated by the Forest Department which provides timber and bamboo to the tribal families for construction of houses. Such multiplicity has resulted into duplicity, multiple bureaucracy and conflicting norms in the housing sector. The tragedy is that target beneficiaries are the same. A TASP official Shri Patel pointed out serious irregularities in the schemes of construction of houses for tribals. There are three housing schemes i.e. (1) *Indira Awas Yojana* (2) *Sardar Awas Yojana* (3) *Awas Yojana* by Tribal Area Sub Plan agency. The TSP *Awas Yojana* fund is given directly to the NGOs and they report to the Taluka Panchayat. However some *Panchayat* officials prepare duplicate records for the same beneficiaries for the *Indira Awas Yojana* also. They submit bills to their higher offices and claim money under *Indira Awas Yojana* from the DRDA. As the implementation of these two schemes is done by District and *Taluka Panchayats*, duplicate bills are claimed and the Fund is misappropriated. Even the basic information of list of beneficiaries under these two Schemes is not submitted for cross verification!

Same pattern of multiplicity of schemes exists in the fields of animal husbandry, agriculture, irrigation and self employment. The DRDA and the TASP offices as well as line departments have schemes on all these subjects. Many committees set up by the state government have also pointed out in detail this problem recommending scrapping of many such duplicate schemes without much success.
Multiple committees at the village level are another problem. Gitaben, a Group Village *Sarpanch* of ten villages hardly finds time to attend 35/40 meetings out of annual schedule of 150 meetings of various committees of which she is chairperson. Gitaben, *Sarpanch* says she doesn’t attend all the meetings but signs all the proceedings! The secretary, who is also the principal of a primary school, informed that the agendas are prepared by him and till now all the agendas have been approved without any amendment by the *Sarpanch* and the committee. The street level bureaucrats also echo this feeling and state that there are many committees at the village level which leaves little time for them to do the office work. As discussed, there have been encouraging results in the Dangs as far as literacy is concerned. In order to improve quality of primary education, government has formed many committees viz. Village Education Committee (VEC), Parents Teacher Association, Mother Teacher Association and Village Construction Works Committee. These committees are formed at the level of village by the education department through principals of primary schools. They are, however, independent of village *Panchayat* even when *Sarpanch* is chairman of these committees.

Acharya, a top revenue officer, wants project administration, District Planning Board and District Rural Development Agency to be handled by single officer to avoid multiplicity of schemes and for better coordination.

**Did the policy anticipate implementation problems?**

The TSP strategy emphasised the need to avoid problems experienced in the past: system rigidity, top-down planning and multiplicity of schemes and agencies (GOI 1981:13-189). To avoid these likely problems, contextual approach was advocated while preparing the TSP and projects. Serious review of important national policies including forest, industry and mineral development was expected (ibid: 40). However, any thing disturbing the status-quo in favour of tribals was resisted by the strong actors and non-tribals. Federal structure with resisting multiple decision makers with multiple geographic sites and dominant actors ensured that the laudable intention remained largely on the paper. Long’s actor oriented approach suggests study of role, behaviour, interface, and influence of various actors if policies are to be devised and implemented successfully. In a country like India, where tribals are in the periphery of social, economic and political life, dominance of state-actors and non-tribals was expected. The mutation of policies, schemes and programmes has been the hallmark of the TSP. Even the grand PESA has not been implemented in its true spirit in almost all states as that will mean
handing over power from the state actors and non-tribals to tribals with regard to forest, rivers, mines and minerals and other natural resources. Even extra ordinary powers given to Governors in the constitution to protect tribal interests has hardly been used by them in independent India. This is despite the fact that reports of exploitation, injustice and land alienation have been documented by many experts and social activists.

This is the biggest failure of decision makers of independent India. They did not bring the issue of the conflict of interests of various actors (in which tribals will be at receiving end) on table while devising the TSP approach.

6.6.2. Policy Context

Grindle argues, as indicated in chapter 2, that we need to carefully assess the implications of the policy context. Here, we would discuss geographical conditions, capacity in the form of financial and human resources, economic factors, impact of migration and cultural factors in form of clash of worldviews.

(a) Geographical Conditions

The Dangs consists of areas with hills, dense forest and inaccessible interiors. Despite increase in motorable roads and private vehicles, some areas are difficult to access during the monsoon. Flooding of the four rivers due to annual heavy rainfall makes it difficult to navigate from one village to another. The village level workers find it very difficult to serve multiple villages because of these constraints. Also, the poor find it difficult to reach the PHCs and the only civil hospital at Ahwa during health emergencies, confirms Dr. Patel, a medical officer.

The tribals of Dhula village inform that huge rainfall and sloppy terrains along with river and rivulets with high velocity of the water flow result into soil erosion of cultivable land in the district. Also the rivers are difficult to harness due to high velocity. The soil is hence less fertile. The fields are on slopes making cultivation difficult.

Haribhai has different and radical opinion about these geographical constraints. He would rather think of exploiting these constraints in a positive manner. He asks the planners to explore opportunities available from rich bio-diversity, varied herbal plants, dense forest, four rivers and Saputara, the only hill station of Gujarat. He suggests construction of big dams on the four rivers throughout the river courses instead of letting go
the water to the sea. However Mr. Kulkarni says that construction of such dams does not fit into the cost benefit norms of the state government. Haribhai opines that such norms of the mainland have no meaning for the Dangs and should be relaxed.

The top revenue officer, Shri Acharya is of the opinion that the district should be divided into minimum 3 to 4 blocks to plan and implement the schemes properly. Even Shri Vadibhai, the top non-official has opined that there is a need of separate planning for the eastern part of the Dangs which has a severe problem of infrastructure and livelihood compared to other parts of the Dangs.

It can be said that the bountiful nature needs to be harnessed by a long-term plan with commensurate policies. Also an organic link between natural resources and livelihood needs to be established even if that entails larger investment compared to mainland projects in the field of irrigation, agriculture, forest based industries and basic infrastructure.

(b) Capacity: financial and human resources

The success of a policy largely depends upon ‘the degree to which individuals, groups, organisations and societies are able to perform functions, solve problems and set and achieve objectives in a sustainable manner’ (Wit, 2004). According to Grindle and Hilderbrand (cited in Wit 2004) such capacity in the field of human resources, organisations, networks and institutions need to be in place. The policies without such a capacity can be a failure. Here we discuss two aspects of capacity: financial and human resources interspersed with institutional and organisational aspects of the capacity.

In recent years, the central and state governments have been allotting significant funds to tribal areas under various welfare and development schemes. All the district officers were of the view that there is no problem of fund. They were however worried about the lack of capacity in form of human resources, organisations and institutions to use these funds in more productive and effective manner. The biggest problems, according them are (a) non availability of skilled and technical manpower in form of experts, officers, teachers and doctors and (b) lack of adequate infrastructure in the field of health, animal husbandry, irrigation, secondary/higher secondary education and technical institutes.

Suman, a development officer opines, “The problem is not lack of funds but the absorbing capacity of the economy, availability of technical and
administrative staff and the lack of realisation of the need to make forest
and agriculture, central to the livelihood options in an integrated manner.” Such policies though require much more investment and paradigm shift in the concept of cost and benefit.

Haribhai, Ghelubhai, Prabhu and almost all NGOs also agreed with officers of the district on this aspect.

Looking at the allocation of funds under VIIIth (1992 -1997) and IXth (1997-2002) five year plans, the Dangs has been able to spend almost all the grant which was given to it under the TSP. In the VIIIth five year plan, against the total fund of ` 57.59 crores, ` 57.3 crores were spent. In the IXth five year plan, against grant of ` 108.65 crores, ` 104.76 crores were spent though it is quite low against plan amount of ` 151.19 crores. In the Xth five year plan, in the first three years, the Dangs has spent ` 90.12 crores against received grant of ` 91.93 crores and plan amount of ` 95.96 crores.

To reiterate, the biggest problem in the Dangs is related to the quality and the adequacy of implementers. In 2005 about 20 percent of the posts in the Dangs are vacant as it was so in 1992. Approximately 30 percent of Class-I officers’ and 27 percent of Class-II, the posts lie vacant. Most of the posts are technical and critical in nature. In the health sector, there is non-availability of skilled personnel like Doctors. Only 4 out of 14 posts of consultants are filled at the only civil hospital and there is no gynecologist. The patients refuse to be referred to hospitals outside the district due to their poor conditions. PHCs and the CHC had 50 percent of its posts of doctors vacant.

Similarly in the animal husbandry department, only three out of seven vacancies for veterinary doctors were filled. 40 percent of vacancies in DRDA affect performance and quality, opines development officer Suman. Also forest officer Gandhi complained that managing the forest, with as many as 30 percent vacant posts of foresters, was impossible. Prof. Kartik informed that only 16 out of 29 vacancies for teaching posts in the only college at Ahwa, was filled. Similar was the story in the case of vacancies of science teachers’ in the government higher secondary schools. In 2011, the situation has not improved especially in the field of health and secondary education.

As far as ambitious MGNREGA scheme is concerned, again an issue of severe shortage of officers has been experienced. Shri Gadia, another
development officer complains that for a scheme with a grant of 59.5 crores for the year 2011-12, no permanent officer has been posted for this scheme. Even Deputy District Programme Co-ordinator for this scheme is employed on contract! This has resulted into ineffective implementation. In DRDA, also, of seven officers, four officers are on contract basis.

The reasons of such a situation are not far to seek. The Dangs is not considered a preferred district for posting. Generally, posting in the Dangs is considered to be a punishment. One officer, Shri Bhatt is bitter that he was posted in the Dangs because of his differences with his superiors. Dr. Patel lists out the reasons for reluctance on the part of officials to work in the Dangs. According to him, the Dangs is in a corner of the State. There are not many good primary and secondary schools including good English medium schools. After globalisation, English has become a preferable medium of instruction in mainland Gujarat. Also, the government residential quarters are either not available or are not properly maintained especially those meant for rural bureaucrats. Not many good houses are available on rent also. Also at the state level, the constraints and difficulties of implementation are not appreciated while evaluating the work. According to him, there are no incentives for working in the district in the corner with lack of modern facilities especially in the remote, interior and hilly villages. Shri Bhatt asks, “Why officers of proven efficiency in the mainland are not posted in the Dangs if they really want to bring in development?”

As a result, most of the officers are always trying to get out of the district, according to Revenue officer Vyas. He asks, on the line of Shri Bhatt, “Why officers of proven efficiency in the mainland are not posted in the Dangs even when policy states so? Why posts are kept vacant? Why is a special incentive policy not in place?” Suman is bitter that despite the feedback given by the district heads for not using the Dangs for punishment posting, the practice continues with impunity.

Srikumar states that there is a lack of empathy and commitment among bureaucracy. The elected tribal leaders especially from PRIs are not conversant with developmental administration, many being illiterate. Hardly, a few NGOs with proven record can be found in the district. Private doctors, private engineers, chartered accountants and other professionals are almost non-existent in the district.
(c) Economic Factors

The success of a policy also depends upon the economic setting in which a policy is implemented. The Dangs is basically an economy based on subsistence agriculture. There was only 555 hectares of land under irrigation, which is 0.53 percent of gross irrigated area against state average of 33.88 percent in 2000. Now in the beginning of 2011, the area covered under irrigation has increased to 11 percent thanks to Group Irrigation Schemes and Check dams. However this is still not enough to sustain the increasing population and to stop Labour migration.

Only one monsoon crop, mostly of Nagli, paddy and some pulses, is grown in a year though some tribals have now started growing ground nut, mushroom, rose plants and fruit trees/plants. In recent years, a big scheme of fruit plantation (Wadi scheme) has been taken up. However, the results are yet to be seen on a large and sustainable scale. There are only 80 petty units employing around 1200 persons as far as industries are concerned. In the period under study, not a single Small Scale Industry (SSI) has come up showing complete industrial backwardness.

“The biggest problem in the Dangs is that of unemployment, despite the contrary claim of the state government,” says Babubhai, a Panchayat non-official. According to him, excluding some pockets land is less fertile. Forests, which is central to Dangi life, has not been able to provide livelihood to the tribals in the form of forest produce, forest based industries, herbal medicines and even wage employment. Gandhi, the forest officer, says that with the present policy on forest, his department cannot provide more than half a million man-days employment against 72 million man-days required for 100 days of employment. Haribhai is of the opinion that the tribal economy has been adversely affected by the policies set by non-tribals since British rule and hence the very realisation that forest should be central to the livelihood strategy in the Dangs is missing in overall planning.

(d) Impact of Migration

The fallout of unemployment has been seen in large-scale migration every year. Various actors estimate the migration to be between 40,000 to 50,000 persons per annum. Our survey puts this figure to 35 percent. Though migrants have increased their income to some extent, it has adversely impacted health and education as tribal families move out with children. Visit to many schools and villages have revealed that tribals move out immediately after monsoon harvesting and come back only
after 7/8 months just before monsoon. Manubhai, a tribal, says that the labour Mukkadam advance money to him and others forcing them to migrate out to pay the debt. The educational and health facilities at work sites are meagre or non-existent. The labour market in the sugar industry is non-organised resulting into low wage payments and poor working conditions. The interest of labourers is mostly neglected due to strong sugar and industrial lobby. Many NGOs stated that the competition to attract investment among states has resulted in the labour laws taking a back seat. Most of the children, who move out, fail in the examination and end up repeaters, says Jagdishbhai, a teacher, affecting the quality of education. Migration affects implementation of various schemes as the poor are out of the district most of the time.

6.6.3. Worldviews and Social Discontinuities

As discussed in the foregoing pages, the world view and behaviour of various actors is, many times, not only divergent but even contradictory. An attempt is made to further assess worldviews of important actors, their interface, social discontinuities and resultant impact on implementation.

Mr. Solanki, a tribal anthropologist, was of the view that tribals have different worldview than that of the non-tribals. He points out that even within tribals communities of the Dangs; the worldview of Bhils, Kokana and Varlis differ from one another.

He recalled a Dangi Bhil who was not sure of next meal telling him “What will you take away from this world? What do you have which I don’t have?”

It is difficult to implement schemes due to this type of worldview of the Dangis. A Dangi is satisfied if his basic needs are fulfilled. NGOs argue that extra efforts are required due to such worldview. Many bureaucrats tag them as lazy and wasteful which stems from their inability to understand tribal worldview.

Due to this worldview of living in the present, a tribal tends to spend money earned from migration income and Malki trees in purchase of vehicles (jeeps and motorcycles), liquor and after social customs, inform Prabhu, and, Gandhi, the forest officer. Our research shows significant ownership of motorcycles among the respondents. Vadibhai a top non-officials when asked about this phenomenon quipped.” Don’t go by ownership of motor cycles and jeep while judging their economic status. There may not be any food in the house but he will still purchase such
things from the proceeds of *Malki* trees and migration income!” Actually many raise debt in advance of such earnings. Many NGOs and bureaucrats consider such spending wasteful and advocate issuing saving bonds instead of cash for *Malki* scheme.

Another problem, which troubles implementers, is that most of the tribals, excluding some Christians, believe in traditional healing, leading to non-use of modern treatments. The doctors term faith healing as superstitious and dangerous and an obstruction to successful implementation of the health schemes. Dr. P.K. Chaudhary, the Additional District Health Officer, said the problem of witchcraft is acute as such practices are popular among villagers (Indian Express, June 15, 2011). “It is a question of faith. These practices enjoy enormous support from villagers, which makes our task very difficult”, further adds Dr. Chaudhary, who oversees the health administration. Dr. Chaudhary’s statement is misleading on two counts: He does not mention that the health infrastructure is wholly inadequate and hence people go to faith healers who are available at the door step. Also his presumption that such faith healing is to be rejected outright is contrary to many studies proving that there is a scientific basis to such practice. Tribals and many non-tribals believe that herbal medicines are very useful. Janubhai, a folk healer informed that he uses mainly herbal medicines for treatment and in case of serious ailments, he refers them to the doctors.

It will be interesting to learn about worldviews of senior district officials. They are at the cutting edge of implementation and are one of the strongest actors. All the district officers consider tribals innocent but ignorant. They also consider tribals to be trustworthy. However, there is a difference of opinion when it comes to readiness of tribals to accept changes. Almost 50 percent of the officers think that tribals are not ready to accept change. Surprisingly, even when the Dangs has done very well with regard to literacy, almost all the district officers termed tribals as illiterate! The NGOs and bureaucrats opine that the leadership suffers from lack of capacity and vision. The district leadership has not been able to manage District Agriculture Produce Committee, which could have protected tribals from exploitation of traders. Similarly, the management of forest labour co-operative societies is far from satisfactory, says tribal leader Haribhai. Bagul, an ex-*Sarpanch* admitted earning illegal money to the extent of ` 50, 000 in his stint of one and half years as *Sarpanch*. This reflects an act of cooption by the system that essentially belongs to the mainland.
Professor Kartik is of the view that Dangi youth becomes introvert due to interaction with non-tribals and suffers from inferiority complex. Also, their problem with Gujarati reflects in their speech and writing as they mostly use the Dangi language.

Interestingly, the tribals consider those from the mainland as outsiders. Even when Dangis are mainly law abiding, trustworthy and innocent, they believe that the bureaucracy lives on their money generated from the forests and informally terms them as mostly inefficient and corrupt. On the other hands, almost all district bureaucrats termed them as innocent but ignorant and illiterate.

The role of the national government with regard to forest laws has already been discussed. The State Government is yet to fully transfer funds, functionaries and functions along with devolution of power to the tribals at the grass root level under the PESA, says Haribhai, a top political leader.

However, Mr. Shah, a state official, is of the opinion that the PESA has been passed in hurry, has a lot of ambiguity and lacks an implementation strategy! It may be remembered that under the PESA, it is the state and not the centre, which loses power. Srikumar, the state official, blames the state as well as the district bureaucracy for non-implementation of PESA in true spirit. Mr. Shah was of the view that tribals are not ready for such powers and such can be misused as has been proved by the complaints of corruption and inefficiency of such PRI non-officials. However Mr. Haribhai is of the opinion that this is an argument which has no merit as such opinion can be expressed for state and central non-tribal non-officials and bureaucracy also.

Surprisingly, all district officers excluding officers of primary education department were quite critical of centralisation of powers with the departments at the State level with regard to planning, preparation of schemes and fixing norms for various activities. All officers were unanimous that more power should be given to district officers and agencies as that will allow flexible and effective planning and implementation. Shri Vadibhai, the top non-official was also of the opinion that the norms with regard to various schemes especially regarding health facilities and irrigation dams should be relaxed. Shri Gamit, the education officer has expressed satisfaction with regard to state and district planning and norms. This is not surprising as a lot of relaxation in norms with regard to funds, additional schools and
recruitment of additional primary teachers has been given due to Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan and other initiatives by the State Government.

The district officers also were very critical of the working of the Forest Department especially with regard to its rigidity in form of central laws. They were of the view that forest has to be the anchored around which other livelihood options including agriculture should be planned. They wanted forest department to plan its activities in such a manner that other livelihood options become stronger along with forest itself becoming a strong livelihood provider. They were of the view that such a strategy is possible without harming environmental concerns.

Shri Vadibhai, the top non-official was also very critical of the role of the forest department. He opined that forests which used to provide main livelihood to the people of the Dangs, today have become rather an obstruction to their development. He advocated that forests should take care of tribal needs like drinking water, water for irrigation, availability of fodder, plantation of horticulture and other fruit trees instead of concentrating of commercial exploitation of the forest for timber only.

As far as Forest Rights Act is concerned again strong State Actors have ensured that the Tribals do not get their rights over the land which they are holding since centuries as part of Jhoom cultivation. The worst affected are the Bhils as they were the original inhabitants of the area. Also they were less active in getting their rights over the land recognised. It is not surprising that the violent agitation of early 1990s had maximum support from areas dominated by Bhils. It was also largely aimed at getting the rights of cultivation in forest recognised.

The implementation of the Forest Rights Act in the district is far from satisfactory as can be seen from the following table:

| Application received | 7,320 |
| Application rejected | 4,500 |
| Application sanctioned | 200 |
| Application referred to CDA | 2,500 |
| Application pending | 142 |

The tribals in the group discussions were completely dissatisfied and angry at non- recognition of their rights over the land despite a central act to that effect. Bhanubhai Tadvi, President of the Gujarat unit of Adivasis Sabha (state unit of tribal communities has opined that the procedure
being followed to allot land is difficult and tribals may be deprived of their entitlement due to non-cooperative attitude of the forest department officials (DNA: 3/11/09)

Shri Ghelubhai Naik and Shri Babubhai, a top non-official of the district are also of the view that the implementation of the Forest Rights Act is very poor due to negative stand of the Forest Department. They both stressed the need of implementing the Act in true spirit.

Due to low literacy and low educational level, not many Dangis are in government service. Most of the bureaucracy is from the nearby districts. Most of the actors at district level were peeved at the irregularity of village level bureaucrats. However, health worker Vilashben blames the district and state policy makers and officers for poor health delivery system. She asserts that, as it is humanly impossible for her to service the area due to difficult terrain, multiple villages, and ignorant tribals.

More than fifty percent respondents have shown unhappiness with regard to education quality. While teachers of these villages blamed migration, ignorance of the parents and irregularity of the children for poor quality of education, Ashram schools, on the other hand, attributed less than average performance of their students in the secondary education to the poor quality of primary education.

Implementation is mutated from its desired goal by action and reaction of various actors. Many departments divert their TSP fund to non-tribal areas. Many departments like Industries and Mining have no provision of TSP fund.

A classic example of mutation with regard to schemes is with regard to various wage employment schemes. The basic objective of such schemes is to provide wage employment, creation of assets being secondary. However, invariably such schemes end up creating public assets by even utilising machinery instead of labour sometime.

Thus, the discontinuities in the worldviews do affect the implementation in the sense that the implementation strategies are prepared by state actors based on their world view. The problem becomes acute as the policies are largely reflections of the non-tribal worldview. Haribhai asked, ‘Why the government does not plan and implement schemes the way we want?’

The State Actors, both political leaders and bureaucrats, have ensured that the purpose of 73rd and 74th amendment is largely defeated. The
Committees headed at the level of Village, *Taluka* and district by the bureaucrats and State Ministers have been created even in the matters relating to *Panchayati Raj* institutions. These Committees have been able to bring back the power in favour of bureaucracy and state political leaders. A number of circulars have been issued by the State Government to the district officers of the line department on deputation to the *Panchayats* so as to facilitate the State over control all the three tiers of the *Panchayati Raj*. Of all funds allotted under the Tribal Sub Plan, 80 percent of the funds and its planning is done by the Line Department with least flexibility at the district level. Even the district planning boards which were to be headed by District *Panchayat* President have not been formed. It was proposed that Boards formed under chairmanship of the District *Panchayats* will prepare plan for the total fund which is received by the district. However, the State Govt. has appointed District Minister as the Chairman of the District Planning Board with a limited mandate for preparing planning of 20 percent of the fund and funds allotted to the District Planning Board.

**PESA and Role of State Actors**

It is now proved that the provisions of PESA have been defeated by not incorporating them in the State's Laws. In Gujarat, also PESA has not been implemented in the right spirit. The power of planning, and implementation as well as control over natural resources have not been provided for the State land. The biggest failure on the part of the State Government is non-transfer of *Panchayat* Cadre bureaucracy. The recruitment of even many Class III cadres is controlled by the State Government through line departments. The concept of the Government of Gujarat ‘*Chalo Taluke*’ if not implemented properly, will actually result into further centralisation of the powers in the hands of the state and bureaucracy.

**Corruption and Rent Seeking**

Corruption is all pervasive and the Dangs is not immune to it. Corruption in development schemes and programmes, however, can adversely impact the efficacy of such efforts.

Here we will discuss specific instances of corrupt practices as noticed through discussion with various actors.
Vasava, a senior development officer informs that he has noticed fudging of accounts and misappropriation of funds with work being done on paper in the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Scheme (MGNREGA) in the Dangs. It is not surprising that in the Dangs the Central Government has ordered an inquiry in implementation of MGNREGA. Majority of the respondents in our study have been found completely ignorant about the Scheme. Even when majority of them desire availability of wage employment within the district and nearby their villages, our study shows 35 percent people are migrating outside district. This means that there is lack of serious planning with regard to the scheme. Vadibhai, the top non-official has also complained of corruption in MGNREGA works by Forest Department. Some of the actors have complained of nexus between Panchayat officials and non-officials on one hand and village level functionaries on the other.

Vasava was very critical about corruption in Malki Tree Scheme. He says 75 percent of the realisation of the auction money is taken away by the Forest Department either through official charges or through bribe. In MGNREGA Scheme, 80 percent of the fund is wasted. Development officials of Taluka Panchayat in collusion with District Panchayat officials give cheques directly to the Sarpanch for MGNREGA. Fudged records are created with fudged workers' registers.

As far as NGOs are concerned, there are both good and bad NGOs. The district officers and the district leaders have opined that the NGOs can be effective depending upon their capacity and commitment. Mr. Vasava is skeptical about local NGOs established by the non-tribals. He was of the view that there should be a strict selection process based on proven track record of the NGOs on actual outcomes in form of reduction of poverty, creation of sustainable livelihood etc.

He also stated that there are serious irregularities in construction of houses for tribals as mentioned elsewhere in this research work.

Corruption is systemic and endemic. Prabhu, an NGO activist informs that illegal tree felling continues in all border villages with the connivance of the officials. In wage employment schemes, the minimum wages are seldom paid. Officials and contractors are hand in gloves. Bribery is a common practice for getting benefits under various schemes.

A lot of tribals have complained of corruption in schemes like Malki tree, wage employment in Forest work and MGNAREGA. Even a top non official of the district accused of serious irregularities in MNREGA
works of forest department. Also many tribals have accused forest officials of either not taking action against illegal tree cutting or they being hand in gloves in such illegal activities.

At the time of filling the Survey Form of respondent families at Dhulda and Dhuda villages, all respondents hesitated to give information on corruption in Malki scheme. However after the survey forms were filled, in group discussion, all of them told that almost 50 percent of the money which they receive is paid as bribe or transaction cost, the latter consisting of the cost of storage, transportation and auction. They complained that that they have to pay bribe at every stage at the time of submission of application form, at the time of survey, transportation and at the time of payment.

Charuben, a BPL Bhil woman despite migrating every year finds it difficult to maintain her family. In response to the benefits received by her family, she reacted angrily, “Garibla kon Dehe? (Who helps poor?)” All the benefits are cornered by Kokanas. We get nothing, as we are all the time in the sugar factories.”

Sankriben, a Bhil woman when asked why she is boiling poisonous roots, she quipped, “Where is the food? Where is the work? We have to live hence; we boil and eat poisonous roots.” Though such instances are not many, but it does show prevalence of severe poverty.

The NGOs suggest selection of beneficiaries and convening the Gramsabha when the migrants are in the district. Manubhai, a beneficiary of multiple schemes, believes that contacts, influence, and bribe are necessary for getting benefits. He has got benefits from six schemes, as one of his relative is a political leader.

Prof. Chaudhary informs that Songadh Paper Mill gets bamboo at the rate, which was fixed 150 years ago by the British. Pandya, the development officer informs that the Dangis do not get market rates from the traders for their agriculture produce. No support prices are announced unlike for mainland crops. They are forced to sell Nagli at much lower price vis-à-vis prevailing market rate. Prof. Chaudhary cites example of turmeric crop scheme in which tribals were forced to distress sell due to lack of marketing. The roses grown by Dangis, as part of floriculture project is available in Ahwa at 1/10th of the market price due to lack of market links, storage and speedy transport. Maliben, a member of the dairy co-operative and has two cows who raises a fundamental question
on pricing of agriculture product, is bitter about the price of milk which is disproportionately low to a bottle of drinking water.

The tribals’ access to various schemes is more dependent upon their relationship with local leaders and bribing capacity. As we have seen, the Bhils have less access to such benefits due to dominance of Kokanas and Varlis. When we talk of elite capture it is more in this sense and also in the form of control over institutions by a few educated tribals and control over policies and resources by non-tribals at the state and national level.

The provisions of schemes are many times openly flouted as Bagul, a tribal contractor informs that wage employment schemes are executed with machines, which is prohibited. Various actors also talk about collusion between NGOs and bureaucracy. Rambhai, a tribal contractor, agrees that he takes sub-contracts from the NGOs and other contractors. He admits using machines instead of workers and do not pay full wages. Gauriben, a tribal woman, complains that she gets only `60-70 a day and that also after completion of the project. Prof. Chaudhary advocates transparency within NGOs to stop corruption and collusion with local bureaucracy. Most of the NGOs suffer from the problems of credibility and capacity.

Thus we can see interplay of various political, economical and historical factors in a process, in which the Dangis are losing out as weak actors in an interface with other actors. Their frustration was expressed by violence and militancy in the early nineties. The corrective measures in form of increased plan layout, half-hearted devolution and faulty and inadequate bottom up planning, do not address the issue fully. The structural issues of recognising their rights over natural resources and empowerment remain as elusive as ever.

**Change in Worldview**

An appreciable change in worldview towards education irrespective of gender is seen. This is despite many educated unemployed youth are without job/better livelihood. A small number of tribals have started accepting modern agricultural practices. There is now some positive change in habit of savings. Also Ghelubhai says that drinking has reduced due to influence of Hindu saints. Suman believes that decrease in consumption of liquor has occurred due to positive influence of Hindu sects, Christianity and many other saints from Maharashtra. This change has been reported by NGOs and bureaucracy in group discussions also.
Further research is needed to understand such change. The Satipati sect followers would not accept any government benefits till very recently. However these followers are now ready to receive such benefits. The district administration is unaware of such change in their worldview and continues to treat them as a non-target group. Also there is a great enthusiasm to accept modern health practices & vaccines despite poor infrastructure and lack of doctors.

Also, perceptible change with respect to acceptance of new practices and ideas are seen due to increased exposure to outside world due to improved communication and transport facilities but largely due to migration. If not handled well, however, this can also erode community living and bring in ills of modern life.

**Process of Social Exclusion and Role of Actors**

De Haan (1988:15) argues that the key areas of exclusion include: Human rights- legal, human and democratic, access to resources, and support networks and voluntary organisations. We will here assess the process of social exclusion of tribals from perspective of denial of their rights, access to natural resources and loss of livelihood. Also, the social exclusion of *Bhils* and role, interests and power of various actors will be highlighted.

We discussed the degree of social exclusion of the Dangis on the basis of various human development indicators in earlier section. Here, an attempt to analyse the process of social exclusion which has occurred due to configuration of historical, economic, political and cultural factors over a period of time is made.

Tribals in India have suffered greatly at the hands of non-tribals. The *Rajputs*, after being defeated by the *Mughals* in medieval period, attacked tribal chiefs in mainland Gujarat, who in turn, retreated to interior forests and hills with their tribesmen.

The *Bhils* of the Dangs are also believed to be such a group. The *Kokana* entered the Dangs in the beginning of fifteenth century. The contact of these tribes with outside world was limited. The Dangs’ economy in medieval period was connected with outsiders especially with traders who used to pay to the tribal chiefs for forest cutting. The Dangis also used to sell bamboo baskets, carpets, honey and other forest produce in return for clothes, cheap jewellery, salt, etc. The Chiefs used to collect fines (called *Hak*) from the nearby regions even by carrying out regular
attacks. Even strong kingdoms like Gaikwad and Marathas used to pay such amount (Hardiman: 1994). The chiefs also had relationship with the moneylenders of nearby towns who used to advance loans against sure repayment from income of the forest and Hak from the nearby kingdoms.

After illegal occupation of the Dangs by the British in the garb of lease of forest, the chiefs and the tribals lost most of their rights. The chiefs knowing the military power of British limited themselves to making protest orally and on paper.

The British brought the concept of commercial exploitation of forest, as against emotional attachment of the tribals, resulting in large-scale deforestation.

After independence, the government toed the line. The control of policy making by mainland strong communities has ensured protection of their privileges in economic, political and social arena in name of ‘national interest’ and environment. The integration attempts, based on ‘top down policies’ and ‘public interest’, have increased their vulnerability. Politics of vote has ensured a cycle of encroachment by non-tribals and repeated regularisation of forest lands by the state which covertly furthers interest of non-tribals as against tribals.

**Social Exclusion of Bhils**

Just like all other tribals of India, the Dangis have not reached to the development level of the mainstream as evident from their bottom rank position in almost all indicators. However, within tribal communities of the Dangs, an interesting analysis with regard to social exclusion of the second largest tribe that of the Bhils is presented here below:

The economic disparities within tribal community also need to be attended to, as those socially excluded may not be able to avail benefits of government schemes affecting policy outcomes. The process of social exclusion of Bhils started after the entry of British in the nineteenth century (David Hardiman 1994:40).

As per report of CEE (2009: 4-5) historically, the Dangs was considerably stratified socially even during British rule. The Kokana were inclined to take benefit of education and other development programmes. They dominate the forest labour cooperatives. Also they have been able to make use of political reservations. After independence the situation of
the *Kokana* improved, whereas the situation of the *Bhils* declined. The situation even today is more or less the same.

It is difficult to know the present population figure of *Bhils* due to non-availability of Census figures after 1981. As per 1981 Census, *Bhils* were 25.81 percent of the district population. The findings of this study also support the claims of social exclusions of *Bhils*. The *Bhils* depend on hunting, forest produce and subsistence agriculture for their livelihood. 64 percent *Bhil* households were found without land as compared to 76 percent households having agriculture land. Almost 2/3rd of the *Bhil* households had annual income less than ` 15000. No *Bhils* were found with savings as against 26 percent saving households. When it came to taking benefit of the government schemes, only 29 percent of the *Bhils* have availed such benefit during the study period. In the survey, 71 percent *Bhil* households were found to be migrating every year as compared to 44 percent of the total households. Jagdishbhai, a primary teacher, informs that all *Bhils* in his village migrate out, as 80 percent of them are labourers. In terms of education also, 54 percent *Bhils* were found literate as compared to overall literacy figure of 59 percent.

Some strong indicators of social exclusion of *Bhils* in the Dangs district are discussed here:

As far as the possession of agricultural lands is concerned, the *Bhils* (58.7) own substantially less land than the *Kokanas* (81.3 percent) and *Varlis* (75.9 percent). With regard to awareness about the TSP among respondents, *Bhils* is the lowest (47.8 percent) and it is the highest among the *Kotwadias* (82.4 percent). Among all the tribal groups, only *Bhils* (2.2 percent) are found to cover a distance of more than 10 kms for livelihood.

It is not surprising that the migrants are the highest among the *Bhils* (60.9 percent) of all the tribal households.

Even with regard to status of pucca houses, *Bhils* have only 8.7 percent pucca houses as compared to *Kotwadia* (41.2 percent) *Kokana* (16.3 percent) and *Varlis* (11.1 percent). With regard to drinking water, none of the households of *Bhils* has drinking water facilities in their houses against 7.9 percent of the total households. Also, maximum distance (501-1000 meters) is covered by the *Bhils* (32.6 percent) to fetch drinking water as compared to other tribal communities. Only 6.5 percent *Bhils* and 5.6 percent *Varli* tribes have the availability of the toilet facilities in their houses, as compared to substantially higher proportion among the *Kotwadia* and *Kokana* tribes (23.5 percent and 18.7 percent respectively).
In similar manner, ownership of the vehicles is found to be the lowest among Bhils (4.3 percent) as against overall 20.4 percent.

From literacy point of view, among the six tribal communities, illiterates are the highest among Bhils (32.6 percent) while the lowest among Kokana (21.1 percent).

As can be seen from the Table 6.6, the percentage of labour among all tribes is the highest among Bhils (42.55 percent).

### Table 6.6
Statement Showing Details of Tribe-wise Land Holding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Kokana</th>
<th>Bhil</th>
<th>Varli</th>
<th>Kotwadia</th>
<th>Kathodi</th>
<th>Gamit</th>
<th>Others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Population of the Dangs</td>
<td>186729</td>
<td>77404</td>
<td>51071</td>
<td>26811</td>
<td>2387</td>
<td>650</td>
<td>8080</td>
<td>20326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>41.45</td>
<td>27.35</td>
<td>14.36</td>
<td>01.28</td>
<td>00.34</td>
<td>04.30</td>
<td>10.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Farmer households</td>
<td>11542</td>
<td>5108</td>
<td>4023</td>
<td>1863</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>471</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>44.43</td>
<td>34.86</td>
<td>16.14</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>00.48</td>
<td>04.80</td>
<td>00.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Agricultural Labourers</td>
<td>4174</td>
<td>1478</td>
<td>1776</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>35.41</td>
<td>42.55</td>
<td>04.96</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>00.28</td>
<td>01.50</td>
<td>00.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Artisans</td>
<td>1694</td>
<td>768</td>
<td>578</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>45.34</td>
<td>34.12</td>
<td>13.87</td>
<td>01.65</td>
<td>00.06</td>
<td>02.48</td>
<td>02.48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: DRDA, the Dangs 2001 and District Focus Group – 7 June, 2011

As per the discussions with focus group with district officers, it transpires that there was not a single Sarpanch or a member of Taluka Panchayat or District Panchayat from Bhil community in 2005! This showed their complete exclusion from the public life. However, now after the recent elections, the situation has slightly improved even when representation of Bhils compared to their population is very low. So is the case with Varli, Kotwadia and Kathodi. Table 6.7 is prepared on the basis of focus group with district officers shows representation of various tribes in PRI.
Table 6.7
Statement Showing Tribe-wise Political Representation in the Dangs in 2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Panchayat level</th>
<th>Total No.</th>
<th>Representation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kokana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Gram Panchayat Sarpanch</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>52 (61.40%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Taluka Panchayat Members</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>17 (73.91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>District Panchayat</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>14 (82.35%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Focus Group 2011

When it comes to representation in democratic institutes, the MLAs have always come from the Kokana community. The Presidents of Taluka Panchayat and District Panchayat are also always from the Kokana community. The present Taluka Panchayat President and Vice Presidents are from Kokana community. Of eight Committees of District Panchayat, 2 Chairmen are from Bhil community and remaining from Kokana community. At Panchayat level the Taluka Panchayat President from Kokana community whereas the Vice President is from Gamit community. Chairmen of Taluka Nyaya Samiti and Executive Committee are also from Kokana community. Hardiman in his study has found that even when Kokanas were under Bhil authority, they always considered themselves socially superior (Hardiman 1994).

It is not surprising that the disturbances and violence witnessed in 1990s were largely from Bhil dominated areas. It is a fact that in the 1990s tribals were, as a campaign by the State Forest Department, stopped from cultivating the land which was falling in the forest area and led to a huge violent agitation with the help of outsiders and even Naxalite leaders. They started agitation against the state for their rights to forest and land. The agitation has lost force due to recognition of rights of Dangis over trees on their regularised land and promise of development. However, Kusumbing, a non-tribal warns that if corrective measures are not taken, there can be Bhil uprising against other tribes and the State again.
6.7. Summary, Main Findings and Conclusions

6.7.1. Introduction

India has made several Constitutional provisions for the development of tribals. Various developmental programmes have been launched during the last five decades not only to protect the interests of tribal population but also to improve their living standards with the ultimate aim of bringing them to the mainstream of national life. The tribal development strategy has undergone a series of changes in the successive Five Year Plans on the basis of experiences of success and failures (though largely based on later). As a result, coupled with overall growth of Indian economy and impact of general development in the field of education, health, agriculture, communication etc, the tribal communities are undergoing significant transformation on all major fronts. This pace has increased significantly in the last decade.

The Constitution of India has advocated the policy of positive discrimination and affirmative action. Special protection is also given to Scheduled Areas that are predominantly populated by Scheduled Tribes. Recognising that constitutional safeguards to improve the quality of life of tribal population need to be backed with financial provisions, the concept of Tribal Area Sub Plan (TASP) was introduced in 1974 in which financial allocations at the Central and State level are made in proportion to the population of tribal communities. The Tribal Development Department in each state is entrusted with the planning and budgetary powers for Tribal Area Sub Plan funds. The Integrated Tribal Development Projects (ITDP) also began to be implemented in the '70s through specially empowered Project Administrators. These officials have considerable powers over activities of other agencies working in the field and they monitor the work of other departments.

Government of Gujarat has attempted to evolve a development paradigm for tribal communities which focus on equity and social justice. Its approach is decentralised, people centered and participatory. At all levels of policymaking, planning and implementation, the State Governments have tried to frame strategies that are favourable to the tribal people and lead to their empowerment. It has tried to ensure that development strategies do not displace the tribal people and safeguard their interests and bring about ownership of the resources traditionally inherited by them. While envisaging the tribal development plans, schemes and programmes, the focus has not been on the mere maintenance of
subsistence level living for survival. Rather, they strive to assure
dignified living and working conditions for the tribal communities.

Scheduled Tribes are overall socially, economically backward and
marginalised. The long-standing problem confronting tribal communities
is the high incidence of poverty. Therefore, planning for the weaker
sections of the society needs to be purposeful and action-oriented.
Poverty Alleviation Programmes, Area Development Programmes and
Human Resources Development Programmes are the main thrust areas of
the State's efforts. Overall, the policy for the overall integrated
development of tribal areas and their people is being envisaged and
pursued. Programmes are being implemented through integrated
development efforts under the Tribal Area Sub Plan. The strategy
evolved since the Fifth Five Year Plan has been fine-tuned and further
modified over the subsequent plan periods for intensive and well-
integrated development of the tribal people. Due to the magnitude of the
problem, however, efforts that are far more concerted are yet needed for
accelerating the speed of the overall development of Scheduled Tribes in
the State.

Their remote dwellings within the forest and hill-based undeveloped
economy have been the main contributing factors for the backwardness
and poverty of the tribal communities. Development of these areas and
of the people requires special attention and consideration as well as
intensive efforts towards their integrated overall development. They need
to be raised above the poverty line by providing them with suitable
economic assets. The fruits of planned development are required to be
ensured through efficient and responsive administration.

Gujarat Pattern aims at meeting the need-based priorities of tribals and
improving their quality of life. In last few years, different sectoral
programmes like roads and bridges, irrigation, health, education,
agriculture, soil and water conservation, electrification etc. have shown
significant success. In addition, road, check-dams, school buildings,
Primary & Community Health Centres, electrification of hamlets and
wells, chilling plants, houses for poor, sanitation and drinking water
facilities have been given priority. The efforts to bring them above
poverty line however have not seen the success it is desired.
6.7.2. Summary

Chapter 1 Introduction and Research Methodology

We introduced the subject on the above by bringing out clearly the problem of poverty and under development of the Indian tribals. We also touched briefly upon the historical evolution of developmental efforts and mentioned broad objective of the TSP which include:

(A) The long term objective of the strategy is (GOI 1981:5):
   1. To narrow the gap between the levels of development between tribal and other areas.
   2. To improve the quality of life of the tribals.

(B) The immediate objectives included:
   1. Elimination of exploitation.
   2. Socio-economic development.
   3. Building inner strength of the people and improving their organisational capabilities.

The concepts like TSP, integrated area development and inter sectoral integration were introduced. This study was taken with the following objectives in order to understand whether the TSP has improved the quality of tribal life and whether it has been able to narrow the gap between tribals and non-tribals:

1. To understand the administrative and Implementation set up of the Tribal Sub Plan.
2. To examine the socio-economic background of respondents.
3. To examine socio economic impact of Tribal Sub Plan schemes on the tribal community with reference to Human development Index (literacy, health and income) with special reference to employment and migration.
4. To examine impact of the TSP schemes on various tribal groups and social exclusion if any.
5. To understand factors affecting the Implementation.
6. To understand the role of various actors in the Implementation processes.
7. To suggest measures for better implementation of the TSP.

Multi social survey techniques to understand the socio economic conditions of the tribals, the impact of the TSP and its implementation process were used.
Anthropological field work in form of (a) Socio-economic survey of the families, (b) Participatory observation (c) Interviews with various stakeholders (d) Focus group, and (e) Village survey was undertaken.

An interview schedule was prepared and effectively used for understanding socio-economic status of the tribals and impact of the TSP.

Also as this study involved studying role, behaviour and worldview of various actors, close interaction with them was necessary. Records of informal interviews, group discussion and observations available with me since late 2005 were used. Also observations and experiences of extensive touring of almost all the villages and habitats as development head of the Dangs in early 1990s have come as great help as will be explained later. Informal interviewees included local opinion leaders like Village Sarpanch, school teachers, field staff, officers and political and social leaders.

The Dangs district consists of 311 villages. Among them 08 villages were selected for the present study. Eight tribal villages were selected from the four geographic zones of the district are Borkhet, Chichinagavtha, Dhuda, Daguniya, Dhulda, Dungarda, Linga, and Pipaldahad. A sample size of 240 respondents was taken. From each village, 30 respondents and total 240 respondents were interviewed randomly. Since the total number of sample is not very big, it was possible to contact all the 240 respondents.

Four days were scheduled for socio-economic survey, interviews and collection of data. Second visit for 4 days was used to fill in the gaps after initial data analysis and for focus group discussions. Help of research assistants to carry out socio-economic survey of families was taken.

Interview schedule was prepared keeping in mind the objectives of the present study. The schedule which is part of the report as Appendix 2 includes primary demographic details about respondent’s family, its economic condition, livelihood and asset ownership, forest produce, employment, animal husbandry, migration etc. It also covers status on education and health in detail. Further it covers details on their awareness of and access to development schemes, benefits received from the TSP schemes, impact of such benefits on their life and problems of access.

Five focus groups’ meetings as follows were organised to get diverse views on the impact of the TSP and its implementation.

- Three villages, Borkhet and Dhulda.
- Panchayat officers,
• Other District officers
• NGOs.

Record of focus groups of two other villages namely Nadagkhadi and Kadmal (other than 8 sampled villages) was used. Most of the important NGOs working in the districts were covered.

Final meeting with development officers and collector was also arranged in June 2011 as wrap up session.

A two pronged strategy has been followed to achieve the objectives of the study. (a) Impact assessment of the TSP on the tribal life has been done using variables on income, literacy and health. Secondly, analysis of this impact using Grindle’s Interactive Model of Implementation.

Impact Assessment
Human development concept was used to assess the impact of the TSP Schemes, its strategy and its implementation as a whole. In this study, the impact of the TSP on the tribal life was analysed from point of view of three indicators: a) poverty, b) education and, c) health. For this, we used HDM status of the Dangs taking Gujarat Human Development Report 2004 and subsequent data as a basis. Special Attention is given to employment, migration and impact of NREGA scheme. Social exclusion of the tribals was discussed by using HDMs.

For impact assessment the following variables were considered:

Independent Variables
All demographic, social, and economic attributes of sample respondents are treated as independent variables,
(a) Demographic variables: (i) size of households and (ii) Literacy level, (iii) tribe sub groups
(b) Socio Economic Variables: (i) type of house (ii) pattern of land ownership and income (iii) occupational structure (iv) income from wages (v) migration (vi) right to forest land (vii) tree ownership scheme (viii) income from other sources (ix) consumption pattern (x) expenditure pattern and (xi) savings and indebtedness.

Dependent Variables
The impact of Tribal Sub-Plans Schemes on socio-economic condition is the dependent variable.
Implementation Process: Policy Content, Context and Actors

According to Grindle and Thomas, policy implementation is not a linear process but an interactive, political and administrative process. Following this model we focused the biggest stake holder state along with the reactions of various actors. Here we studied and assess implementation aspect from content as well context of the TSP.

For this we used Long’s Actor oriented research technique which postulates that the separation of policy, implementation and outcome is a gross oversimplification and that there is a need to study interface between implementing agencies and local groups and actors.

This impact of the TSP on the tribals was discussed along with the important variables so as to bring out the worldviews, role and behaviour of various actors. The actual implementation process was juxtaposed against the planned one which is prescribed as a distinct part of national planning exercise to address specific needs of the tribals. An attempt has been made to understand the mutation, either for good or bad, in the policies, implementation process and even results. This helped us understand, in a better manner, the TSP implementation, different world views and the behaviour of various actors to the same policy and plans. The following variables identified by Grindle were taken to study the implementation process of the TSP.

Policy Design of the TSP
(a) Integration and Coordination among various Implementing agencies
(b) Is the implementation bottom-up or top down?
(c) Response system and flexibility
(d) Multiplicity of schemes and agencies
(e) Did the policy anticipate implementation problems?

Policy Context
(a) Geographical constraints
(b) Capacity: financial and human resources
(c) Economic factors

Chapter 2 Tribal Community: An Overview

In the beginning of this chapter, a brief discussion is presented with reference to the meaning of “Tribe”, Characteristics of the tribes, tribal Census, their socio-economic profile etc with reference to India.
Then, an introduction of the research Area, Gujarat State and the Dangs District is given. It covers details on geographic, demographic and economic aspects of the state and the district along with introduction of tribal communities of the Dangs.

Tribals are officially recognized by the Indian government as "Scheduled Tribes" in the Fifth Schedule of the Constitution of India. India has the largest concentration of tribal population anywhere in the world except perhaps in Africa. According to the 2001 census, population of the schedule tribe in the country was 8.43 crores. Constituting about 8.2 percent of the total population, approximately there is 1 tribe man for every 13 Indians. They occupy around 15 percent of the total geographical area of the country, sally in difficult and inhospitable terrain in the hills and valleys. Schedule Tribes in India are broadly compose of 250 tribal groups speaking about 105 languages and 225 subsidiary dialects. Though there may be variations within the tribal community in India.

The tribes are dispersed all over the country and speak different languages and dialects. They also differ from one another in racial, socio-economic and cultural aspects. The Proto-Australia racial type is the dominant racial type among the Indian tribal communities except those living in the sub-Himalayan belt. A Negroid element is also found in some parts of the South Indian tribes. Dravidian is the most predominant language used by the tribes in South India. Tibeto-Burmese languages are spoken by tribes in Eastern India and North Eastern regions. Most tribes live in forested and mountain areas. Their economy till now was subsistence agriculture or hunting and gathering.

As far as Gujarat is concerned, entire tribal belt of Gujarat can be divided into three zones, i.e. North Zone, Central Zone and South Zone. While the North Zone comprising of Sabarkantha and Banaskantha districts has 8 per cent of total tribal population of the state, the Central Zone comprising of Panchmahal, Dahod and Baroda districts accommodates 36 per cent of the total tribal population of the state and the South Zone comprising of Narmada, Bharuch, Surat, Navsari, Valsad and the Dang districts houses 53 per cent of total tribal population. Only 3 per cent of the tribal population is spread out in the rest of districts of Gujarat. Literacy rate amongst tribal is 36.45 per cent as per 1991 census. 14 percent land in tribal areas is cultivable. Similarly, only 25 per cent of land in tribal areas is forest land. There are 26.30 percent (6, 88,880) tribal families who are living below poverty line.
The Dangs, our area of study, is one of the most backward districts of Gujarat State considering indicators like agriculture, irrigation, education, health, living standard etc. The region is extremely poor and it has only about 13.68 percent of total arable land under irrigation, which is very low as compared with the state (36 percent of total arable land). The district is educationally backward with a comparatively low rural literacy rate (59.65 percent) with a major part under the poverty line. However, the region has a great potential for the development of forest and natural resources, which if utilized properly may substantially improve the living condition of the rural poor, particularly, small and marginal tribal farmers and agricultural labourers.

The total population of the Dangs district, as per 2001 Census, is 1,86,729 out of which 93,974 are males and 92,755 are females. The Dangs district accounts for 0.37 percent of the State's population. This comprises 1,75,079 (93.76 per cent) Scheduled Tribes, 921 (0.49 per cent) Scheduled Castes and 10,729 (5.15) per cent) others. The population density in 1991 was 349 persons per sq. km. which has increased to 449 persons per sq. km in 2001. There is no urban area in the Dangs district. The major tribes found in the district include Bhil, Kokana, Warli, and Gamits. There are also other numerically smaller tribal groups such as Nayaks, Kathodias and Kolcha (Koldha). The Kotwadia, Kathodi and Koldha are declared as primitive tribes. A detailed description of these tribes is given in this chapter.

Chapter 3  Background and Administrative Structure for Implementation of Tribal Sub Plan Approach

In this chapter, administrative structure of Tribal Sub-Plan has been discussed. Starting from the centre and state level, the administrative apparatus up to village level is presented. Coordination and planning mechanism at the cutting edge i.e. district level in form of District Tribal Development council headed by a minister and represented by officials, non-officials and experts and Executive committee headed by the collector have been covered. A detail presentation on important initiatives and schemes of Gujarat with regard to tribal development is given.

Chapter 4  Review of Literature

The reviews of earlier studies on different dimensions of tribal development in India in general and in Gujarat in particular are presented in this chapter.
The literature review includes review of evolution of concept of tribal development, various provisions of various schemes in various Five Year Plans and discussions on *Panchsheel* principle are covered. The Dhebar Commission Report of 1960, the Shilu Committee Report of 1969 and Elvin Committee Report 1956 and other reports and literature have been discussed. The review of literature on tribal administration has been done with the scholarly works of L.C. Jain (1981), Padam Nabh Gautam (1987), L.M. Prashad (1981) and Tarlok Singh (1974).


In the beginning, a discussion on concept of segregation, policy of segregation, integration and *Panchsheel* have been developed with the help of literature of various experts/scholars.


The above discussion and review of literature painted a very gloomy picture on the efficacy of the strategy and developmental efforts of the state. The developmental programmes seem to have achieved only limited success in improving the quality of life of tribal people. In view of the huge diversities among tribal communities and regions, it is difficult to arrive at conclusion on different dimensions of tribal development.

There, it seems, is serious problems of (a) accessibility of different development programmes to the tribals, (b) nature and extent of tribals’ participation in the development process and (c) devolution of powers to the tribals in the real sense.

The review of various literature and studies also indicated that geographical conditions, status of economy, status of the tribals and resources base vary from one tribal area to another. This may require a situational approach if the TSP is to become a success.

Chapter 5 Survey Results

In this chapter, an attempt is made to analyse the primary and secondary data collected keeping in mind the objectives of the study and the results are presented into three sections as follows:

(1) Socio-Economic Status of the respondents and households which includes respondents’ profile and socio economic status of the households.

The respondents’ profile includes their age, education, occupation and BPL status. The socio-economic status of the households includes variables like demographic profile (male/female household size, religion and sub-tribe). The economic profile includes type of house, size of the house, facilities like drinking water, toilet, furniture, vehicle etc. The household income has been presented tribe-wise and has been further divided into income from agriculture, migration, forest produce, animal husbandry, poultry and child labour.

(2) Socio-economic impact of Tribal Sub Plan schemes in the field of livelihood and Income, literacy and health.

General socio-economic impact of the TSP on the households have been examined from the point view of livelihood sources, distance
of such sources from their residence, migration, benefits of MGNREGA, details on debt and savings etc. A detailed analysis of scheme of MGNREGA, agriculture, migration, animal husbandry, forest produce and wage employment from forest work, *Malki* scheme, implementation of Forest Rights Act has been made.

As far as education is concerned, literacy level of household members by gender and age has been presented. Also a survey on perceived need of education has been made. Also, a survey of facilities availed from various schemes on education have been made.

In the field of health, the information with regard to diseases, place of treatment, facilities available during pregnancy, availability of health care facilities, visit to faith healers, immunisation and role of *Anganwadi* and health workers has been presented.

(3) Direct benefits received, awareness, accessibility and perception on the TSP.

This section covers information with regard to direct benefits received by the households from various family targeted schemes, their awareness of the TSP schemes, accessibility to development officials, their sources of information and their perception on impact of such schemes on their life.

These results are also analysed tribe-wise, bringing out interesting results with regard to varying profiles of the households, their socio-economic status and varied impact of developmental efforts.

**Chapter 6 Impact Assessment and Policy Content, Context and Actors**

This chapter draws broad conclusions on the basis of survey, other secondary data and literature on the subject.

Simultaneously, it discusses policy implementation, as it was found at the district level so as to bring out the world views, roles and behaviour of various actors. This discussion is based on group discussions, interviews, secondary data and observations.

The main findings and conclusions are given at the end of this chapter.
Chapter 7  

Policy Recommendations

The last chapter deals with important policy recommendations.

6.7.3. Main Findings and Conclusions

The TSP is aimed at narrowing gaps between levels of development of tribals and of other areas and speeding up processes for social and economic development of the tribal with improvement in the quality of life. The tribals in India have lagged behind from human development perspective despite many development initiatives, Tribal Sub Plan being the most ambitious one. The Dangs, a tribal district is characterised by extreme poverty despite bountiful nature. This paper has tried to assess the implementation of the TSP in the Dangs.

The strategy has disappointed many, not least the tribal people of the Dangs. The gaps that occurred in the policy planning and implementation come to the fore while looking in depth at the processes of policy and implementation. Though there are some silver linings as seen from Human development perspective. It indicates positive changes in the field of education and health. But then compared to state indicators on human development, the Dangs is at the bottom except in the field of education. The HDMs indicate a high degree of social exclusion which is multi-faceted.

In short, the TSP has made marginal impact on the tribal life of the Dangs against the investment and efforts excluding literacy. Education has shown promising results in the form of remarkable increase in literacy. A strong desire for education irrespective of child gender is reflected in the tribals. This finding is contrary to the notion that tribals are disinterested in education. The presence of more than 400 graduates and postgraduates, though unemployed, is a testimony to the positive change occurring in the district. A few activities like dairying, Wadi project and irrigation has also seen a positive change. The success of dairying project proves that a meaningful partnership between government and civil society on one hand and tribals on the other hand, can do wonders. Reputed NGOs with commitment can be important instrument of tribal development as experienced in the field education in the form of Deep Darshan and Rutumbhara.

The biggest problem of the Dangs is lack of sustainable livelihood. Tribals are forced to migrate in distress. Forest has simply failed to be a livelihood option. It has also failed to be the anchor to other livelihood
options like agriculture, forest-based industries and animal husbandry despite it having all the potential.

As we analysed, it becomes apparent that the institutional arrangements are more reflective of the perceptions, interests and priorities of non-tribals rather than the vision and the spirit of the TSP. The implementation structure is largely top-down. The tribals’ rights over land and forest have not been respected fully. Powers under PESA have not been fully delegated. Lastly, multiple schemes and departments still rule the roost and have rather multiplied. The policy design has largely failed to avoid the anticipated problems.

There is a gap between the intention and action at all levels of governance. The present strategy of the TSP is integrated only with regard to Gujarat Pattern Fund, which is around 20 percent of the plan. For the remaining fund, project level, integration is not seen. The budgetary provision for the TSP is around 10-12 percent as against the required 17.5 percent. The Devolution of power to tribal Panchayati Raj Institutions is a step in the right direction; much needs to be done especially with regard to implementation of PESA. The link between top-down participatory committees and Village Panchayat is very weak. Also, present public participatory techniques in which state non-officials and bureaucracy control everything, need overhauling in light of PESA. The increased role of NGOs is a positive development though it needs to be punctuated by accountability of NGOs. In the Dangs, Gramsabha has been a strong instrument of public awareness.

As it gradually unfolds in the paper, the objectives have been only partially achieved. Grindle’s proposition that implementation is an interactive process is amply proved.

The forces of political economy and the non-tribal actors have ensured almost complete social exclusion of the tribals. Actually the contents of the TSP policy only partially answers the structural issues raised in the Panchsheel due to impossibility of radical reforms under the present socio economic and political set up which inherently work against the poor, under-privileged and tribals. The tribals as actors are losing out to others. The social discontinuities with regard to worldviews and dominance of mainland development ideology in the form of globalisation are likely to further marginalise tribals. The tribals, not surprisingly, react with increased solidarity, violence and militancy.
To conclude, it can be said that the organisational set-up and administrative structure of the TSP is in the process of development and is fairly helping to improve the condition of the tribal and given some time and by making some organisation and administrative improvement, it can play an effective role in improving the condition of the tribal people and thus help is working towards the goal set out in the Tribal Development Policy of the State in the Indian Constitution. Given mutual trust and co-operation between bureaucracy and the tribal, the Federation can be put on the path of progress for the welfare of the tribal and in the service of the nation as a whole.

Scheduled Tribes or tribals belong to one of the most socially excluded sections of Indian society for centuries. The government and planners have formulated and implemented various policies through various five-year plans and the TSP approach. Such efforts are aimed at socio economic development of this group so as to bring them at par with main section of the society. The present study is conducted in the Dangs district, a tribal district of Gujarat, with the main objective to assess the impact of Tribal Sub Plan schemes on tribal sub-groups and implementation thereof.

In the district, total eight villages were selected randomly. Total 240 households belonging to four tribal communities such as Bhil, Varli, Kotwadia and Kokana of eight were selected depending upon their availability in the village at the time of survey.

The impact of Tribal Sub Plan (TSP) schemes shows positive changes to some extent in literacy, and utilisation of health facilities. Economic upliftment and expansion of these is appreciable improvement in basic amenities and infrastructure facilities with regard to drinking water, electricity, roads, and schools. Area under irrigation has increased to 13 percent though very low compared to the state average. Though poverty has reduced, its prevalence is very high compared to the state and the national average. The government’s target to bring at least 50 percent of the tribal families above poverty line is yet to be achieved.

The main goal of reducing gap in development of tribals and mainland people is nowhere in sight. The Dangs have improved its position with regard to literacy in the state but otherwise its overall position in Human Development Index will still be one of the lowest.

It is noteworthy, that only 7.9 percent of the households in the study area have drinking water facilities within their dwellings and Bhils are the
most dis-advantaged group. They are either deprived of or in disadvantageous position in availing various developmental facilities like housing, toilet, modern facilities, benefits of the TSP schemes etc. Strategies need to be planned for their welfare.

*Kotwadias* are found most advanced in availing various government facilities. However, dis-satisfaction is noticed among *Kotwadias* as most of them feels that their economic condition has not improved even after availing benefits of the TSP schemes. All the *Kotwadias* also opined that the TSP schemes could not improve their social life. In depth research is required to assess the reason for their dis-satisfaction before planning for further strategy.

Encouragingly high literates among the household members of age 7+ years (75.1 percent) are found in the study area. The present study reveals most of the parents desire to provide higher education to their children mainly to improve the standard of living condition. The young tribal students need counseling on various career courses and options available within their vicinity. Vocationalisation of education at middle/high school levels and employment-oriented courses need to be promoted. Also, subjects offered at the under graduate level should be related to the local economy such as forestry, horticulture, animal husbandry, handicrafts etc.

One of the main problems in education is that of language. Most of the tribal languages and dialects are in the most rudimentary stage and there is hardly any written literature for which teachers find difficult to explain in local tribal dialect which makes the education uninteresting for the students. Special intensive training on tribal language of the teachers is essential for an effective education.

The present study reveals that the tribals are engaged in various primary and secondary occupations throughout the year to earn their livelihood. Due to the paucity of available work they engage themselves in multiple occupations and resort to migration in lean season. The livelihood systems in the area are primarily dependent on combinations of cultivation (67.9 percent) and agriculture and forest labour (61.3 percent and 11.3 percent). The tribals (35.4 percent) also found to migrate to neighboring districts or state for earning livelihood. Migrants are the highest among *Bhils* (60.9 percent). The migration is distress migration and its impact on education, health and developmental programmes is negative especially as the working conditions at migrating places are devoid of any health, education and civic amenities including basic shelter. And this is despite special laws to protect interests of the
migrating population. The strong sugar lobby and other mainland employers have bent all laws in their favour. The state actors have largely failed or neglected in implementing the labour laws. It is not surprising that labour laws have taken a severe beating in wake of economic reforms and obsession with growth through corporate and private investment.

In these depressing circumstances, strategies need to be planned and efforts should be made to generate income schemes using local level resources and engaging them in the development process. For this land and forest need to be brought in centre stage of development strategy with development of water resources so as provide a sustainable employment.

Other promising areas are dairying and animal husbandry. It is now displayed that forward and backward linkages with local planning can do wonders and that just handing over milch cattle or birds is not sufficient. The dairying project should be further spread with extensive training to tribals in the field of animal rearing, feeding, taking care of animals, marketing of milk, procuring fodder for animals etc. Follow-up monitoring is essential to check and facilitate them in understanding difficulties and finding solution. Efforts need to be made by the government to provide water.

Different tribes have different traditional occupations. Kotwadias are traditionally dependent on bamboo craft for their livelihood. The community is facing problems in retaining their traditional craft due to problems of raw material, which is green bamboo. Many traditional craft items have become redundant with change in agricultural practices, change in lifestyle of people and advent of substitute products. Community could not develop new products to keep pace with the changing times due to unawareness (Tribal Development Department, nd). Kotwadias need to be trained for the production of the craft and furniture items. Younger generation who has lost interest in traditional craft due to difficulties faced by the craft, needs motivation to join bamboo craft courses. Proper skill education courses and training can help them modify the products according to the present day demand of urban market.

Poverty leads to poor savings among the tribals in the present study as only 22.5 percent are managing to save some portion of their earnings. Self-help groups need to be formed among each tribal group to help poverty alleviation.
Access and utilisation of government health care facilities along with traditional indigenous method of treatments are high among the tribal groups in the present study. There is a need for promoting indigenous medicine systems among the tribes. Efforts need to be made by the government and academic institutions for conducting scientific research and providing and adequate financial support to promote indigenous medicine systems. There is also a need to mobilise, organise, train and promote network among the practitioners of tribal medicine towards sustaining these systems.

Corruption is a very serious issue especially in a vital sector like developmental administration. Besides Kotwadias, other tribal groups and leaders and even officials complained of serous corruption in housing, MNNREGA scheme, Malki schemes etc. A zero tolerance to corruption with stringent provisions in the law and awareness among tribals to fight such practices is need of the hour.

Overall development is possible with community awareness. The social workers, the grassroots organisations, the tribal religious leaders have to come forward towards mobilising, organising and advocating for the tribal right to quality life and livelihood.