AN ABSTRACT ON

EFFECTIVENESS OF DIRECT METHOD AND BILINGUAL METHOD OF TEACHING ENGLISH AT THE SECONDARY LEVEL IN WEST BENGAL

THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE UNIVERSITY OF KALYANI FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY IN EDUCATION

BY

SHYAMASREE SUR

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION FACULTY OF EDUCATION UNIVERSITY OF KALYANI KALYANI, NADIA WEST BENGAL, INDIA – 7412235

2017
1. INTRODUCTION

Language and literacy development, whether in the first or the second language, involve difficult challenges and complex processes. In teaching English as Second Language (L2) teachers face the same difficult challenges. If the students’ power of speaking in his mother tongue is properly developed, his power of speaking in English will be improved. Because, “when he begins to speak in English he will do so in the light of the experience gained in speaking the vernacular.” (Thompson and Wyatt).

Bilingual Method is a mixed approach in which a foreign language is taught with the help of mother tongue. Here the teaching of a foreign language allows using much more amount of mother tongue in the foreign language classroom.

The question whether to use mother tongue in the classroom is an age-old dilemma in a foreign language classroom. The recent monolingual approach suggests that target language must be used in a foreign language classroom as much as possible as the foundation for communication to maximise the effectiveness of learning the target language. Communicative competence cannot be developed without using English in a foreign language classroom as often as possible and without establishing English as the main language for communication. That does not mean that mother language should be totally banned, since current studies indicate that use the mother tongue in English teaching classrooms in a fair and judicious way can be helpful and can facilitate in the learning and teaching of English language both skill-wise and content-wise. To make input comprehensible, the use of mother tongue is generally necessary (1981:51). Also Willis suggests:

Banning mother-tongue use altogether may not be advisable. A study carried out recently in Turkish secondary school classes with 12-year-olds revealed that in circumstances when the mother tongue was totally banned in group talk, the resulting interaction tended to be shorter, more stilted and less natural. Many weaker students gave up after a very short time. If learners realize they are using the target language to communicate, they will still use their mother tongue on occasions, but they will use it in a way which is systematic, supportive and relevant to the task goal (1996:46).
Beginning with the Grammar-Translation Method, the mother tongue played a crucial role here since the use of native language made an inseparable part of the teaching and learning process. In about the early twentieth century, when several reform movements concerning the role of mother tongue appeared. Their main message was that the target language is a tool for communication and that the maximum use of target language would raise the effectiveness of teaching and learning.

While the Grammar-Translation Method was not focused on the use of target language and the role of mother tongue was crucial here, the Direct Method was its complete opposite since the mother tongue is avoided altogether. It has one very simple rule, which is prohibition of translation. In fact, the Direct Method got its name from the fact “that meaning is to be conveyed directly in the target language through the use of demonstration and visual aids, with no recourse to the students’ native language.” (Diller cited in Larsen-Freeman, 2000:23). This approach had the following principles:

- Instructions were conducted in the target language
- Oral communication skills were built up in a carefully graded progression organized around question-and-answer exchanges within a small group of teacher and students.
- Grammar was taught inductively.
- Vocabulary was taught through demonstration, objects, and pictures or by association of ideas.
- Correct pronunciation was emphasized.
- Teachers could be native speakers or had nativelike fluency in the target language.

(Richards and Rodgers, 2005:12).

According to Richards and Rodgers, the Direct Method was quite successful in private language schools, but later declined in European noncommercial schools. It was criticized that strict adherence to Direct Method principles was counterproductive, since teachers had to use long explanations to avoid using the mother tongue, when sometimes a simple translation would have been more efficient way to comprehension (2005:13). Howatt and Widdowson add: “banning’
the native language altogether was [...] rejected by teachers who saw much less harm in translating the odd word or phrase than in leaving pupils to flounder around [...]” (2004:225).

So the bilingual method is more effective due to following reasons:

Adolescents Pupils tend to be in silent reading in which ESL may be mostly if not completely incomprehensible.

They may exhibit high levels of anxiety, frustration and withdraw a due to a variety of stresses such as cultural differences, self concept, peer acceptance and developmental physical changes.

They often demonstrate faster academic language growth than younger students based on superior vernacular language (Bengali) in reading, writing, speaking, listening and understanding as well as superior cognitive development in native language.

2. RESTATEMENT OF PROBLEM

Effectiveness of Direct Method and Bilingual Method of Teaching English at the Secondary Level in West Bengal.

3. OBJECTIVES OF THE PRESENT STUDY

1. To estimate the achievement of students in English treated through Bilingual Method.

2. To estimate the achievement of students in English treated through Direct Method.

3. To compare the achievement of students in language learning by the Direct Method and Bilingual Method.

4. To compare the achievement of students on four skills of language learning, namely. Listening, speaking, reading and writing.

5. To compare the achievement of students in language learning in respect of language structure and vocabulary comprehension.
6. To compare the retention of students in language learning by the Direct Method and Bilingual Method

4. HYPOTHESES OF THE PRESENT STUDY

H₁: The achievements of students treated through Direct Method and Bilingual Method do not differ significantly.

H₂: The achievements of students treated through Direct Method and Bilingual Method in four skills of English Language do not differ significantly.

H₃: The achievements of students treated through Direct Method and Bilingual Method on the structure of English Language do not differ significantly.

H₄: The effects of interactions between strategies and content organization on the achievement of students in English do not differ significantly within the school.

H₅: The retention of students treated through Direct Method and Bilingual Method in four skills of English Language do not differ significantly.

5. SCOPE OF THE STUDY

- This study would be restricted to students of Class IX only.
- This study would also be restricted to the students under W.B.B.S.E. only.
- The teaching would also be restricted to a selected prose piece and a poetry piece from the English Text Book “Bliss” from Class IX only.

6. DELIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

- The present study has been delimited to the students of class IX only.
- The study is limited to the students studying under West Bengal Board of Secondary Education (W.B.B.S.E.) only.
- The study considers students below the age group of 15 years only.
7. POPULATION OF THE STUDY

Criteria of selection of population:

The researcher here intends to compare the comprehensibility in English through Bilingual and Direct method as the field of research.

Hence, the researcher chooses the students of Class IX because they are the first class of secondary level and they are going to appear to an external (Secondary level final) examination conducted by West Bengal Board of Secondary Education after two years. At this stage their comprehensibility in English is required to be tested so that they can be given the right treatment for two years for the betterment of their English score in Board Exam.

The population of the study are the students of Class IX under W.B.S.S.E.

8. SAMPLE OF THE STUDY

The Sample of the study will be 200 students of Class IX of Kolkata and South 24 Parganas districts of West Bengal.

The sample of the study consisted of Ninth standard students enrolled under W.B.B.S.E. in West Bengal (India) in the academic year 2016. The sample of the study included The Sample of the study was 200 students of Class IX of Kolkata and South 24 Parganas districts of West Bengal, distributed over two sections: one section was assigned randomly to comprise group (1) as an experimental group, while the other section was assigned randomly to comprise group (2) as a control group.

9. TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES OF RESEARCH

Tool: - In order to obtain empirically dependable answers to the research questions and to test the formulated hypotheses, the researcher has to develop two types of tools:

1) Instructional tool and

2) Evaluation tool.
The researcher has made two lesson plans on proposed prose piece to teach in both the bilingual and the direct methods. The researcher also has to make a standardized, reliable and valid achievement test for making evaluation tool.

1) **Instructional tool**

Bilingual Method is a mixed approach which was followed by Indian Vernacular school for years. In present days structural approach and Functional Communicative Approach are emphasized more for teaching English. The researcher assumed that to learn English effectively (that is reading, writing and understanding whereas speaking less emphasized) the Bilingual Method would be more fruitful than the Direct Method. So, to prove her assumption, she applied the Bilingual method for experimental group and the Direct Method for the control group and thereby the mean score of two groups was drawn.

The teaching strategy for both the method that was applied to both the groups is elaborately presented through the lesson plan. A single lesson plan was made for both the groups but the technique of teaching was different.

2) **Evaluation Tool**

Now the researcher tries to find out the outcome of her teaching in both the methods (i.e. Bilingual method and Direct Method) by applying the achievement test as an evaluation tool on both the groups.

An achievement test covering all the instructional components of the prose piece (“A Day in the Zoo”) and a poetry piece (“Mild the Mist Upon the Hill”) of the text book (Bliss for Class IX) have been developed. The test item will be based on the levels of knowledge, understanding and application of cognitive domain based on Bloom’s Taxonomy of Educational Objectives.

The process of preparation of the achievement test and the process of standardization have already been discussed in sub-topic : research design.

10. **METHODOLOGY OF THE STUDY**

In order to obtain empirically dependable answers to the research questions and to test the formulated hypotheses, the researcher has developed two types of tools : 1) Instructional tool and
2) Evaluation tool. The researcher has made a lesson plan on the proposed prose piece to teach in both the methods: Bilingual Method and Direct Method and to prepare a standard evaluation tool the researcher has made a standardized, reliable and valid achievement test.

Now, following tests were adopted to find out the significance of difference of mean scores in achievement in English of the students. Hence, comparative study of mean scores in achievement of experimental and control groups were computed with the help of:

1. F-Test
2. T-Test
3. Chi- Square Test

11. FINDINGS AT A GLANCE

1) From the overall achievement score of Bilingual and Direct group, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

2) From the achievement score obtained from School-1, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

3) From the achievement score obtained from School-2, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

4) From the achievement score obtained from School-3, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

5) From the achievement score obtained from School-4, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

6) that there is no difference in Listening Skill in between Bilingual and Direct Group.
7) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-1, it may be said that there is no difference in Listening Skill in between Bilingual and Direct Group.

8) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-2, it may be said that there is no difference in Listening Skill in between Bilingual and Direct Group.

9) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-3, it may be said that there is no difference in Listening Skill in between Bilingual and Direct Group.

10) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-4, it may be said that there is no difference in Listening Skill in between Bilingual and Direct Group.

11) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group, it may be said that there is no difference in Listening Skill in between Bilingual and Direct Group.

12) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-1, it may be said that Direct Method significantly helps to improve the Speaking Skill among the students than the Bilingual Method.

13) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group School-1, it may be said that Direct Method significantly helps to improve the Speaking Skill among the students than the Bilingual Method.

14) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group School-2, it may be said that Direct Method significantly helps to improve the Speaking Skill among the students than the Bilingual Method.

15) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group School-3, it may be said that Direct Method significantly helps to improve the Speaking Skill among the students than the Bilingual Method.
16) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group School-4, it may be said that Direct Method significantly helps to improve the Speaking Skill among the students than the Bilingual Method.

17) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group, it may be said that Bilingual Method significantly helps to improve the Reading Skill among the students than the Direct Method.

18) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-1, it may be said that Bilingual Method significantly helps to improve the Reading Skill among the students than the Direct Method.

19) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-2, it may be said that Bilingual Method significantly helps to improve the Reading Skill among the students than the Direct Method.

20) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-3, it may be said that Bilingual Method significantly helps to improve the Reading Skill among the students than the Direct Method.

21) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-4, it may be said that Bilingual Method significantly helps to improve the Reading Skill among the students than the Direct Method.

22) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group, it may be said that Bilingual Method significantly helps to improve the Writing Skill among the students than the Direct Method.

23) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-1, it may be said Bilingual Method significantly helps to improve the Writing Skill among the students than the Direct Method.

24) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-2, it may be said Bilingual Method significantly helps to improve the Writing Skill among the students than the Direct Method.
25) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-3, it may be said Bilingual Method significantly helps to improve the Writing Skill among the students than the Direct Method.

26) After skill-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-4, it may be said Bilingual Method significantly helps to improve the Writing Skill among the students than the Direct Method.

27) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English Prose at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

28) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-1 it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English Prose at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

29) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-2 it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English Prose at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

30) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-3 it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English Prose at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

31) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-4 it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English Prose at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

32) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English Poetry at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

33) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-1, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English Poetry at Secondary level than the Direct Method.
34) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-2, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English Poetry at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

35) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-3, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English Poetry at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

36) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-4, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English Poetry at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

37) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching Vocabulary in English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

38) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-1 it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching Vocabulary in English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

39) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-2 it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching Vocabulary in English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

40) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-3 it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching Vocabulary in English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

41) After content-wise analysis of the achievement scores obtained from Bilingual and Direct group of School-4 it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching Vocabulary in English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

42) After testing the effect of interactions between strategies and content organization on achievements of students in English of Bilingual and Direct group, it may be said that there is a relation between achievement and instructional strategy and the gain is in favour of Bilingual Method.
43) After testing the effect of interactions between strategies and content organization on achievements of students in English of Bilingual and Direct group of School-1, it may be said that there is no relation between achievement and instructional strategy but gain is in favour of Bilingual Method.

44) After testing the effect of interactions between strategies and content organization on achievements of students in English of Bilingual and Direct group of School-2, it may be said that there is a relation between achievement and instructional strategy and the gain is in favour of Bilingual Method.

45) After testing the effect of interactions between strategies and content organization on achievements of students in English of Bilingual and Direct group of School-3, it may be said that there is a relation between achievement and instructional strategy and the gain is in favour of Bilingual Method.

46) After testing the effect of interactions between strategies and content organization on achievements of students in English of Bilingual and Direct group of School-4, it may be said that there is no relation between achievement and instructional strategy but gain is in favour of Bilingual Method.

47) From the overall retention score of Bilingual and Direct group, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

48) From the overall retention score of Bilingual and Direct group of School-1, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

49) From the overall retention score of Bilingual and Direct group of School-2, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

50) From the overall retention score of Bilingual and Direct group of School-3, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.
51) From the overall retention score of Bilingual and Direct group of School-4, it may be said that Bilingual Method establishes superiority in teaching English at Secondary level than the Direct Method.

12. LIMITATION AND SCOPE OF FINAL RESEARCH

Goal of ESL instruction is to increase academic achievement. Rhetoric or academic competence is necessary for developing conceptual and topic knowledge in specific content areas. Language is a learning tool to transmit culture and social frameworks of conceptual and topic knowledge. Language is a socialization tool to initiate children in cultural thinking style, cultural affective and spiritual styles, and verbal and non-verbal cultural styles of social interaction. Bilingual developmental programmes which is an extension of translation method, have an epistemological cognitive orientation in which L1 (first language) and L2 (Second Language) learning is considered an active process of concept formation. Following this method a cultural development may be achieved if further research work be adopted.

- In this study the researcher has faced a problem of taking less number of samples due to time constraint and non-cooperation on the part of schools. So, taking a broad representative groups from different parts of rural and urban areas of West Bengal, further study may be done for precise results.
- The researcher has left out the language structure and grammar section which could not be tried out due to time-constraint but this section may be carried out by other researchers.
- An attitude scale can also be formed measuring the attitude of both teachers and students on both the methods of language teaching.
- The researcher only tested the two methods, Bilingual and Direct method to prove the progress in English Language Teaching. The some investigation may be conducted by using the same tools and techniques or methodology for different methods of teaching English like grammar translation method, structural approach, functional communicative approach, cognitive Code Approach, cognitive Approach, Oral Approach, situational language teaching, content bases method, sheltered instruction method etc.
12. RECOMMENDATIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

The argument being that use the mother tongue in English teaching classrooms in a fair and judicious way can be helpful and can facilitate in the learning and teaching of English language both skill-wise and content-wise. We should finally free ourselves of the old mistaken belief and try to commend the existed connection between the mother tongue and foreign language.

My research results recommend and point to a careful use of native language when teaching grammar in the English classroom. However, the use of native language in teaching English grammar should be one of the many tools that teacher should use when dealing with grammatical aspects of language.

Using the students’ native language in the classroom helping students to raise their awareness and knowledge about the similarities and differences between the two languages, and helping them to discover different methods to practice and to express themselves in the target language. The good teacher should know when and where the code switching is suitable.

In light of the findings of the study, the researcher recommends the following:

1. The Ministry of Education in West Bengal (India) ought to give teachers proper trainings (workshop, seminars) on the role of native language in teaching English grammar for EFL classroom and strategies to improve students’ motivation and efficiency by combining Mother Tongue with English when necessary.

2. Teachers ought to deal with students’ need and try to use Mother Tongue language when necessary in English grammar classroom.

3. It is recommended for the writers of English courses for the basic stages should make reference for the students’ mother tongue (Mother Tongue) whenever suitable.

4. Teachers should carefully use the target language in the English classroom, minimum use of mother tongue is permissible but not total translation word by word or sentence by sentence.

5. Teachers ought to help students to minimize the use of first language in the English classroom to acquire and learn the target language fully.
REFERENCES


Newton, anneCovell, Editor, English Teaching Forum, Aforum anthology.


_____________________________________________________________________________

Signature of the Supervisor ____________________  Signature of the Researcher ____________________