Chapter –V
Summary and Conclusions
CHAPTER – V

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

5.0 This dissertation is a study of a minority speech community, Kohistani, characterised by language contact in Ganderbal District in Jammu and Kashmir. Kohistani belongs to the Dardic group of Indo-Aryan languages and are based in northern Pakistan. A small concentration of Kohistanis are found in Ganderbal District in the state of Jammu and Kashmir. The Kohistanis in Ganderbal District trace their lineage to Kohistan in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province in Pakistan. The older members of the community assert that their forefathers migrated from Pakistan in late nineteenth century. In Ganderbal, where the study was conducted, the Kohistani is surrounded by Kashmiri, the dominant language of the state and another minority language, Gojri. Urdu which is the state language is generally used as a lingua franca among the various linguistic groups in Ganderbal District. The Kohistanis in Ganderbal are a multilingual community with varying degree of competence in Kashmiri, Gojri and Urdu. The Kohistanis also form the smallest linguistic group in Ganderbal. So in this study, we make an attempt to explore what happens to a minority language like Kohistani, which is implanted in a complex multilingual context.

5.1 In Chapter I, we provide an introduction to the dissertation. We have provided a discussion on Dardic to which language group Kohistani belongs. We have given a detailed account of the existing literature on different areas of language contact. We have also sketched a description of the Kohistani speech community in Ganderbal. In addition, we have presented a discussion on the theoretical framework and methodology utilized in this study. The data for this study was elicited using the modern sociolinguistic framework (Labov 1984).

5.2 In Chapter II, we have presented a discussion on the phonology of Ganderbal Kohistani. We have provided a description of the vowels and consonants, and their
distribution in Ganderbal Kohistani. There are thirteen vowels in Ganderbal Kohistani, out of which five are front (i, i:, e, e:, a), four are central (i, a, a:) and four are back vowels (u, u:, o, o:). Kupwara Kohistani possesses thirteen vowels as well (Ganai 2012). Kashmiri has sixteen vowels. There are three diphthongs (ai, ei, au) in Ganderbal Kohistani that are not present in Kupwara Kohistani. We find nasalization of vowels in Ganderbal Kohistani. However, unlike Kashmiri, nasalization is not phonemic in Ganderbal Kohistani.

There are thirty-four consonants in Ganderbal Kohistani. There are fifteen plosives (p, b, pʰ, t, d, tʰ, dʰ, ṭ, ḍ, k, g, kʰ, gʰ), five affricates (ts, tsʰ, tf, dz, tfʰ), seven fricatives (s, z, ʂ, ʐ, ʃ, ʒ, h), three nasals (m, n, ŋ), one trill (r), one lateral (l) and two semi-vowels (v, j). Ganai (2012) study of Kupwara Kohistani shows the presence of thirty consonants in Kupwara Kohistani. Ganderbal Kohistani has voiced and voiceless aspirated obstruents that are lost in many Dardic languages (Gutman and Avanzati 2013). Ganderbal Kohistani has retained three sibilants /s, ʂ, ʃ/ of the OIA like the other Kohistani varieties spoken in Indus Kohistan. Consonant clusters can occur in all positions in words, initial, medial and final. However, the preferred position is the medial position. Certain restrictions operate on the consonant clusters in Ganderbal Kohistani. Two aspirated consonants cannot form clusters in Ganderbal Kohistani. The consonant clusters cannot have alveolar or velar nasal /n or ŋ/ as the second member of the cluster in Ganderbal Kohistani. The only consonant cluster that can occur in word initial position is /ŋɡ/. Like many other Dardic languages, the processes of nasalization and palatalization operates in Ganderbal Kohistani as well. But these processes are not phonemic in Ganderbal Kohistani. Many Urdu loan words in Ganderbal Kohistani have undergone a number of phonological processes like fortition (/ʃʃ/ → /pʰ/ as in farq → pʰarək ‘difference’), (/x/ → /kʰ/ as in xaːs → kʰaːs ‘special’), anaptyxis (sirf → siripʰ ‘only’), apocope (pi:la → piːl ‘yellow’), velarization (qəlam → kalam ‘pen’), and affricatisation (jism → dʒisam ‘body’).

5.3 In Chapter III, we have discussed some essential grammatical features of Ganderbal Kohistani. We have considered the morpho-syntactic features of nominal and verbal categories of Ganderbal Kohistani. The nouns in Ganderbal Kohistani
inflects for number, gender and case. The nouns in Ganderbal Kohistani show two-way number distinctions. The plurality in nouns is indicated by suffixation or ablaut (vowel change). The nouns can be pluralized by suffixing (i) ‘ɨ’ as in mehẽf ‘buffalo’ → mehẽfɨ ‘buffaloes’; (ii) ‘a’ as in māʃf ‘man’ → māʃ:fa ‘men’; (iii) ‘ō:’ as shown in ťukur ‘basket’ → ťukurō: ‘baskets’ and (iv) ‘e’ as in pʰriʃa ‘angel’ → pʰriʃte: ‘angels’. The Urdu plural affix e: is used with some Urdu loans. It is to be mentioned that many Urdu loan words take Kohistani plural affixes to denote plurality. Many of the Kohistani nouns denote plurality by undergoing the process of ablaut (vowel change). The vowel change can occur at both word final and medial positions as illustrated in tʃʰu: ‘nut’ → tʃʰo: ‘nuts’ and mātɨ ‘girl’ → māto: ‘girls’. Some of the nouns in Ganderbal Kohistani do not change in their plural forms. For instance, margalaɨ is used for ‘friend’/‘friends’.

The animate nouns in Ganderbal Kohistani follow natural gender system, that is, masculine and feminine. The feminine forms are expressed by a numbers of ways, affixation, vowel or consonant change and suppletion. Variants forms of Urdu and Hindi feminine affix ‘i:’ are used in Ganderbal Kohistani to mark feminine forms.

The various feminine suffixes used in Ganderbal Kohistani are (i) ‘ɨ’ as in daːla ‘grand-father’ → daːli ‘grand-mother’; (ii) ‘i:’ as in mātɨ ‘boy’ → mātɨ ‘girl’; (iii) ‘i:’ as in iːtʃ ‘bear’ → iːtʃɨ: ‘sows’; (iv) ‘dɨ:’ as in mohła: ‘clergy’ → mohlaːdɨ: ‘female-clergy’ and (v) ‘nɨ:’ as in tırkʰãːd ‘carpenter’ → tırkʰãːdɨnɨ: ‘female-carpenter’. A prefix ‘gʰir’ is used to indicate feminine in Ganderbal Kohistani. In Ganderbal Kohistani, the counterpart of māʃ ‘man’ is derived by prefixing ‘gʰir’ as in gʰirmːaʃ ‘woman’. Feminine forms are also formed by both vowel and consonantal ablaut as illustrated in kutfur ‘dog’ → kutfɨr ‘bitch’ and goh ‘horse’ → goj ‘mare’. A few animate nouns in Ganderbal Kohistani undergo the process of ‘suppletion’ to denote the female counterpart of the masculine nouns as exemplified in kʰavːaːd ‘husband’ → gʰəɾjû: ‘wife’. A few animals such as dʒaːn ‘snake’, golî ‘pigeon’ do not distinguish between masculine and feminine forms. Unlike Kashmiri, Ganderbal Kohistani does not use palatalization to form feminine. The case in Ganderbal Kohistani is expressed by attaching affixes, such as, φ (Nominative/Accusative), ə: (Ergative/Dative), gin (Instrumental), naː (Ablative/Locative), laː/ maː/ ai/ ei
(Locative), ä:/ ai (Genitive) and o: (Vocative). A single suffix may indicate two cases. Kohistani like many other Dardic languages show split ergativity.

Ganderbal Kohistani has many pronouns. The personal pronouns in this speech variety indicate person, number and case. Distinct pronouns are used for denoting first, second and third person. The personal pronouns show two way number distinctions: singular versus plural. These pronouns also show case marking. The third person personal pronoun in Kashmiri and many other Dardic languages show three-way distinction: proximate, remote I (within sight) and remote II (out of sight) (Koul and Wali 2009, Koul 2008). But Ganderbal Kohistani does not reflect any kind of proximity versus remote distinction. Honorificity distinction is also not present in Ganderbal Kohistani. The possessive pronouns reflect person and number distinctions. However, unlike personal pronoun, possessive pronouns indicate gender distinctions in first person plural, zà: “our Masc” and zaĩ “our Fem”. Animacy distinction is also indicated in third person singular pronouns: tasi: ‘her/his’ and u:ʃu: ‘its’. Reflexive pronouns are formed by adding ‘nan’ ‘self’ to pronouns as in mĩ: nan ‘myself’, tĩ: nan ‘yourself’ and so on. The two primary interrogative pronouns in Ganderbal Kohistani are “kaũ”, ‘who’ (referring to animate) and “gih”, ‘what’ (referring to inanimate). In addition a few more interrogative pronouns are used. The interrogative pronouns used in Ganderbal Kohistani begin with the voiced velar stop /g/ or /k/ as in gin ‘why’, gĩfe: ‘how’, go:lah ‘where’ and kal ‘why’. The form kaũ, ‘who’ performs the function of relative pronoun as well as indefinite pronoun.

Ganderbal Kohistani uses both simple verbs and complex verbs. The simple verbs occur alone and /or with substantive verb (Be) tʰu:/tʰi:/tʰo:/tʰi:. The complex verbs are formed by combining Noun + Verb as in ja:d ‘memory’ hau ‘Be’ ‘to remember’, Adjective + Verb as in kʰuʃ ha:l ‘happy’ karau ‘to do’ ‘to make (someone) happy’, and Adverb + Verb as in dʒu:dũ: ‘hurry’ karau ‘to do’ ‘to hurry’. The verbs in Ganderbal Kohistani show Tense and Aspect marking. Person, Number and Gender marking is shown in a very limited way. Gender and number are reflected in substantive verbs. The imperfective aspect (habitual and progressive) is indicated by verb plus a
substantive verb tʰu:, ‘Be-Sg-Masc’, tʰi:, ‘Be-Sg/Pl-Fem’, tʰo:, ‘Be-Pl-Masc’. The verb stem is affixed with –am, when it occurs with a first person singular subject and –ig if the subject is first person plural. The habitual and progressive aspect are not distinguished in Ganderbal Kohistani. Frequency adverbs help in distinguishing habitual from progressive. The imperfective events or situations located in the past are denoted by affixing –ā: or –jā: to the verb stem that may or may not occur with a substantive verb. The ‘perfective’ aspect that marks ‘completed actions or situations’ are designated by affixing -tf to the verb stem. The verbs in perfective aspect do not occur with verb ‘Be’ in Ganderbal Kohistani. Ganderbal Kohistani does not mark verbs instantiated in past tense very often. Perfective aspect is more prominent that past tense in Ganderbal Kohistani. Ronnqvist (2013) claims that in Dardic languages past tense is a secondary implicature following perfective aspect. A few instances of verb affixed with jā: indicate past tense in our data. The past markers ā: or jā: are used basically to separate imperfective located in the past from the imperfective situated in the present context. In Ganderbal Kohistani, future tense is expressed by affixing a: to the verb stem plus substantive verb to: “Be-Sg/Pl-Fut-Masc” or ti: “Be-Sg/Pl-Fut-Fem”. In the non-finite verbal category, we have discussed ‘infinitive’ and ‘conjunctive participle’. The infinitives are formed by affixing –au to the verb stem and functions as a gerundive in Ganderbal Kohistani. The conjunctive participles are derived by adding -ajni to the verb stem.

5.4 In chapter IV, we have the discussed the linguistic outcomes of multilingualism on Kohistani in Ganderbal District. We have mentioned in chapter I, how Kohistani a minority language is embedded in a multilingual context in Ganderbal District. We have analysed a huge corpus of natural data from Ganderbal Kohistani. The analysis of data from Ganderbal Kohistani suggests that even though Kohistanis have been able to maintain their own language, they have borrowed extensively from Urdu, especially. Studies on language contact have revealed that “borrowing” is the most common linguistic outcome of language contact (Haugen 1950; Muysken 1980; Poplack et al 1988; Thomason and Kaufman 1988). The borrowed lexicon in Kohistani represents all grammatical categories: nouns, pronouns, verbs, adjectives, adverbs and conjunctions. The highest percentage of borrowed words represents
nouns (53.9%), followed by adjectives at a distant 20.1% and verbs covering 16.2% of the borrowed words. This finding is in line with other studies, which have shown that major class content words (nouns, verbs, adjectives) have the propensity to borrow more (Haugen 1950, Poplack et al 1988, Sankoff 2002). We also find a small percentage of adverbs and conjunctions in Ganderbal Kohistani that are borrowed from Urdu. A quantification of the borrowed nouns in Kohistani reflects that 92.6% of the borrowed nouns in Kohistani are from Urdu, of which 65.8% are shared with Kashmiri as well. Thus, 26.8% borrowed nouns in Kohistani are shared with Urdu alone. On the other hand, Kohistani shares with Kashmiri only a small fraction (7.3%) nouns. The Urdu loan words (noun) in Kohistani include basic lexicon (kinship terms and body-parts) and other terms referring to food-items, nature, education, profession and general items. The lexicon associated with education, knowledge and religion in Ganderbal Kohistani are loaned from Urdu. This is because school education as well as religious instructions are in Urdu.

Despite the fact Ganderbal Kohistani co-exists with Kashmiri, the dominant language of the state, the influence of Kashmiri on Ganderbal Kohistani is very minimal. This can be attributed to the fact that Ganderbal Kohistanis use Urdu for any inter-group communication with Kashmiris and the other linguistic communities. Most of the Kohistanis have competence in Kashmiri, but they fear that they may be laughed at or ridiculed if they commit any error, hence they prefer to use Urdu or even Hindi with the Kashmiris and other linguistic communities like Gojri and Pahari. In the recent times, Hindi has also become quite popular with the Kohistanis. Kohistanis use Hindi words like “su:r” ‘sun’ instead of ‘fa:ms’ or ‘a:fta:b’ and ‘mã:s’ ‘meat’ instead of ‘go:fl’. In addition, Hindi and Urdu share many lexicon, so it is easy for Kohistanis to conveniently shift to Hindi.

The borrowed lexicon in Ganderbal Kohistani has been phonologically integrated with the basic phonology of Ganderbal Kohistani. A number of phonological processes operate on the borrowed words (See Chapter I, IV). Nevertheless, there are about 35.6% words that have retained their own phonology and have not adapted
Kohistani phonology. A majority of the nouns and numerals have adapted the Kohistani phonology. In contrast, a majority of the adjectives, verbs, adverbs and conjunctions show very little integration with Kohistani phonology. Ganderbal Kohistani has also borrowed a few affixes from Urdu.

This is the first study of Kohistani speech community in Kashmir from the standpoint of language contact. This study throws light on the fact that even though Kohistanis have been able to maintain their language, they have incorporated a large amount of lexicon, covering all parts of speech from Urdu. They have also borrowed a small percentage of lexicon from Kashmiri. Kohistani have also borrowed some morpho-syntactic features from Urdu. The influence of Urdu on Kohistani transcends other languages like Kashmiri and Gojri. One of the short comings of this study is that we could not assess the role of social variables used in sociolinguistic studies.

However, it is hoped that this study will contribute to our understanding of language contact phenomena.