"The studies of decentralisation policies reveal a kind of schizophrenia in developing countries about the desirability and feasibility of transferring powers and responsibilities from Central ministry to other organisations."

- G. S. Cheema and D. A. Rondinelli

REVIEW OF LITERATURES
In the past years there has been an avalanche of literatures in the field of decentralised planning, regional planning and rural poverty and rural development. No work that is fundamentally exploratory can flourish in a vacuum. This work is no exception to this rule. So the present chapter makes an humble attempt to review the relevant literatures on five broad themes: Decentralisation process, Rural poverty, Rural development, Rural Health and Rural environment.

2.1 DECENTRALISATION PROCESS:

The regional disaggregation of national strategies and policies has been in existence, for a long time which has helped in defining the role that each sub-national region should play in achieving specific national goals. When the central government decides that the regional problem sufficiently acute to necessitate the intervention of the centre, it resorts to sub-national planning. The 'river-basin' approach was first applied by Tennesse valley authority in US (Moore ed 1967). It found adherents all over the world. For instance the north east in Brazil, (Volta river) (in Ghana) Bio-region (in Chile), (Damodar Valley) (in India)

were all framed in that strategic line. Following first effort towards 'deconcentration', the sub-natural plans were started, with the hope that a mere autonomous process of regional development would emerge, but experience has shown that this has been partially successful. Hansen and Perlof (1942)², Moore ed (1967), Owen³, Gilbert (1976), Freedman and Alonso (1975) and Misra et al (1977) could be referred. Theories and policies revolving around import substitution and development from inside created an adequate political and social climate to question the growth-oriented policies. This led to the adoption of strategies increasingly aimed at regional redistribution and even decentralisation. Hence the emerging strategies had the dual orientation, of favouring both intra-regional vertical and horizontal integration.

Highly sophisticated techniques and models were applied to help maximise growth, minimise social costs and reduce political tensions (Richardson 1988). There were many decisions based on the application of mathematical models, aiming at harmonising the sectoral, regional or sub-national allocation of financial resources. A reading Kuklinski (1975), Waardenburth,⁴ Nijkamp et al,⁵ and

Chatterjee (1983) is very much interesting. On the contrary, studies made by Stohr (1975), Stohr and Tolding, and Hilhorst (1985) represent more realistic approach where detailed sub-regional appraisals were undertaken, which allows diagnosis of the major problems faced by a region and permits need-based investments to be made by the Government. This evolution of planning practice has received a good deal of attention on account of its relevance for regional strategy formulation. The important literatures on polarization reversal and growth pole strategies are: Friedman and Douglas, Boisier, Conyers, Hilhorst (1985), Lundquist, Richardson (1978,88), Stohr (1975), Taylor, Rondinelli (1983), Riddell (1985), Perroux, Higging and Savoie (1988) and Polenski.

11. Taybor DRF (1981) Some observations on theory and practice in Regional Dev. in Africa in Kuklinski A (ed)
Rural Development was defined as a strategy for improving the economic and social life of rural poor (World Bank 75). Development of backward areas aims at making the rural society economically less vulnerable. Three clusters of strategic choices, in terms of their relevance to rural development have been observed: (a) Reformist cluster, (b) Radical cluster, (c) Technocratic cluster. Griffin (1981), Gostsch (ed)(1973), Stevens, Arnon (1981) and Lea and Choudhuri (1983) make it very clear that no single development strategy, particularly for rural development can be relevant to a whole range of problems and contexts, and they require substantive innovation, and modifications.

The technocratic strategies assume that rural development can be achieved through technological change. Its main objective is to raise the agricultural production through technological advancements and free market operation. It calls for a 'big push' or 'rural transformation'. They emphasise efficiency and place low degree of reliance in public intervention. Three strategies aptly Christened as: 'Low intervention productivity' model, 'medium-intervention-solidarily' model and the high intervention-equality model (Inayatalla 1979). Micro level Field Applications were based on decision making models of agrarian change. Studies of Hayami and Kikuchi(1982),

Steuens (1977), Ruttam (1975), Binswanger and Ruttam (1978) are in these lines.

The radical strategies had its inception in Marxist ideology. It rejects gradualism and emphasise social ownership and control of the means of production. According to them the traditional forms of so-called modernisation strategies tend to reassert themselves; they are at best capable of providing marginal changes in the rural power structure. Sen (1981), Howard (1978) Ghose and Griffin (1980), Saith (1982), Hart (1983) and Sundaram et al (ed)(1989) are very critical about the so-called modernisation strategies. Russia, China and Vietnam have applied radical strategies for rural development. Chinese model have been dealt by Blair, 15 and Aziz (1978). An excellent comparative study is done by Chung et al 16 on rural development of China and Tanzania.

The reformist strategies are more Progressive which adopt a mid-way between technocratic and radical clusters. Johnston and Clark (1982), Morse et al (1981), Lele (1976), Hunter et al (ad)(1976), Harvey et al (1979), Chambers (1983), Ruttam (1975) are significant contributions on reformist strategies. Integrated rural development are example of reformist strategies, as it involves a multi-sectoral,


Land reform measures are partial fragmented, and incomplete. Practical action has been stunted by vested interests operating in political and social spheres. Baraclough, Korten et al (1984), Walinsky (ed) (1977), Griffin (1981) deal with these issues. The dynamics of political economy of land reforms in India is well documented by Khusro (1973), Joshi (1975) Eashvaraih (1985) and Gupta (1986).


deals with Asian experience of community management. Chopra, Kadekedi and Murty (1990) maintain that participatory development is very much crucial for rural development of India. Bhaduri and Rahman (1982), and Singh (1986) made very incisive studies on participation of rural masses in the developmental process.

2.2 APPROACHES TO DECENTRALISED PLANNING:

There are wide variety of approaches of decentralised planning. An analytical distinction between comprehensive approaches, the action-oriented approach and disjointed incrementalism approach is very useful.

(a) **Growth Pole Approach:**

It was originally conceived as a policy-instrument for promoting regional growth through the establishment and promotion of typically large scale industrial activity in a few urban centres. Hansen and Richardson (1978) are the original advocates of this approach. The pioneering contribution in India has been made by Sen (1971). But Misra et al. (1974) and Mukherjee (1990) show that the approach does not work.

(b) **USAID's approach**:

Ideas of Jonson has influenced Ruddle and Rondinelli (1978), who outlined the USAID approach to decentralised planning for integrated regional development. USAID's approach is a planning method that can strengthen rural sector, for exploiting fully rural developmental potential for meeting the minimum human requirements. ESCAP (1979) planning approach have a striking similarity with that of USAID. It consists of sectoral planning in rural electrification, transport, health, nutrition, water supply, physical planning and rural resource management. Hoselitz (1971), Taylor (1975) and USAID (1976) and Chetwyndo (1980) deal with these issues. Dusseldrop (1971), Funnel Southall deal with the applied aspects of the approach.

(c) **Rehovot approach**:

It was developed at the Rehovot-Development Centre of Israel. It was elaborated by Weitz (1971). It holds that development is a gradual process, a process of transformation, which occurs in definite sequences and is not in an erratic way. The main emphasis of Rehovot approach is on the existence of:

---


(i) a diversified regional economic resource base.
(ii) the mechanism of decentralised planning and decision-making for mobilisation of human resources.
(iii) a supporting system of services
(iv) the machinery for coordination of inter-sectoral planning including agriculture, industry and services sectors.
(v) the coordination of planning at various territorial tiers like farm, village and planning area.
(vi) the coordination of intra-sectoral planning at the project level.

The Israel regional planning exercise based on this approach was successful. Weitz (1971), Arnon (1981) all extensively deal with this approach.

(d) **P₄ micro Regional Approach:**

Van Raay is the propounder of P₄ approach; where regional development planning for rural upliftment is perceived as a normative act of stressing the need for making use of existing organisational arrangements and socio-cultural resources to the changing needs. The four components of the P₄ approaches are Priority clusters (P₁), Problems and Potentialities (P₂), Policy environment(P₃) and Project Complexes (P₄); They are all interactive and mutually reinforcing. The basic understanding recommendations, action evolution and future perspectives are treated as synchronic and equally important elements of a flexible
process of learning, intervention and adoption. This approach attempts to put the rolling plans into motion, starting with early identification of immediate problems, potentials and possible long term needs to be followed by a gradual expansion of the sphere of activity and intervention with progressive attention to the long term perspective. In developing countries the sub-national planning should provide, inter alia:

(a) a long term perspective plan providing the contours of direction.
(b) a modest time horizon for the plan to fructify,
(c) active participation of local population.
(d) recognition that resources are very scarce.
(e) quick action for resolving urgent problems.
(f) heavy dependence on commonsense, experience, and imagination (not on quantitative measurement).
(g) due allowance for the possible errors.
(h) continuous evaluation, monitoring and corrective action.

The aim of subnational planning is conceived of as the national and efficient allocation of scarce resources over time and space, for achieving ends in the broad field of economic growth, social justice, environmental quality and spatial organisations. Therefore, a continuous prospective process of comprehensive analytical orientation and selective action is one of the methodological choices.
for engaging in sub-national planning attempting at the
promotion of integrated rural development. Raay (1982) and
Ray and Hilhorst$^{24}$ depict the cases of application of
this approach.

(e) **Selective Spatial Closure Approach:**

This approach was developed by Stohr and Todtling (1978)
It relies on transactive planning. The foundation of this
approach has deep roots into new-populist notion of
development, incorporating the new-populists concern for the
ill-effects of centralisation and large scale organisations.$^{25}$
Selective spatial closure is taken as synonymous with
"selective-self reliance and endogeneous regional development"
which requires the territorial communities to mobilize to
their fullest extent the internal resources and endogeneous
development potential in economic socio-cultural,
environmental and political terms. But the execution of this
approach is neither easy or straight. Because this
approach is subject to plethora of political, social, cultural,
economic and ecological preconditions and constraints. The
empirical foundation on which the approach is grounded is
extremely narrow. There is no assessment of desirable
preconditions.

24. Raay HGT & Hilhorst JGM(1981) Land Settlement and
Regional Dev. in the tropics, results, prospects and
options, ISSAS, The Hague.

and Regional Policy, Methuen & Co, London.
(f) **Agropolitan district Approach:**

This approach has been originally dealt and developed by Friedman and Douglas (1978) and Gore (1984), though there are several versions of it. The formation of small politically empowered agrarian district, designing the developmental process, which respond to the local needs is at the base of this approach. It is built on the conviction that rural development is possible by empowering regions with the means of controlling institutional arrangements and ownership patterns internally and bargaining externally for allocation of national resources. The agropolitan district involves the creation of local government units and a net-work, which requires interalia, (1) Land reforms, (2) Devolution of power, (3) Change in federal tax arrangements, (4) Commitment of the centre to support the locally initiated developments.

Friedman and Douglas, not unlike Johnson, argue that the development efforts of agropolitan districts involve social facilities, infrastructures, agricultural improvements and light labour-intensive industries. The expansion of production within the unit should follow the principle of self-reliant development with the aim of creating a diversified local economy. It envisages 'industrial dualism'. Along with the cellular district economy, there will be a parallel urban based economy. The industries and activities of the corporate economy should develop
backward and forward linkages with the thousands of small industries in agropolitan localities. Agropolitan industries should be protected from competition generated by technologically advanced industries. But the protagonists of this approach is overly optimistic in assuming that it would break through priomordial power status structures and associated interests; and new organisational structures would emerge. Individual interest and territorial interests need not obviously be coterminous and development in the aggregate sense will not benefit each individual equally.

(g) Urban Development Approach

Richardson holds that investments to promote larger cities in the national urban hierarchy will lead to stability and improvement with centres of lower order. But Misra and Bhooshan rejected his thesis based on dichotomies, because rather than conceiving rural or urban as discrete entities, it is more appropriate to think of urban or rural towns or urban villages as an integrated continuum. By using the term 'rural growth centre' Misra R (1981,83) contributed to clarify the confusion revolving around the growth pie concepts. According to him, one should think of regional settlement complexes, wherein size, spacing and ordering of settlements are determined.

not by the theory of central places, but by the dynamic need of national and local societies. Miska et al argue for the creation of urban centres, planned at regional level, conceived of as a district in the Indian context. Rurban centres form part of his multilevel planning approach to integrated rural development where small town development constitutes a sub-strategy to be fitted into a broader developmental framework. Bhooshan (1980) provides an operationalisation of this approach in terms of rour pilot studies. He argues to harmonize the regionalisation of the local rural development programme and the small town revitalisation programme.

\[\text{(h) Multilevel Planning Approach:}\]

It is an integrated area-based rural developmental approach which is made up of sub-systems which are parts of an interdependent system. Misra (1979) advocates for decentralisation and peoples participation as critical components of this approach. He holds at once that the centre must remain strong in order that the country survives the external and internal pressures, but the local agencies must have adequate autonomy and power to strengthen the local and thus the regional and national economy. The difficulties of reconciling the conflictual claims are clearly mirrored in various studies made by:

Singh (1981), Tripathy (1979) and Misra and Natraj. 27

Its underlying principle is that proper decision making is possible at any level provided the strategy at each level is decided upon "after a careful consideration of the potentials, needs and limitations of the next higher as well as the next lower levels of planning. The higher level should give all macro-framework indicators and guidelines for planning. The lower levels must feed the higher level with information and has to prepare the plan from below, specificity and focus of planning should exist at five geographical levels: farm, village, sub-block, block and district.

Misra and Sundaram (1980) outline various steps involved in this approach: (1) identification of functions at each level, (2) establishment of planning machinery at each level, (3) indication of outlays available, (4) delegation of power, resources, and responsibilities in consonance with the tasks assigned, (5) defined procedures for plan formulation, execution and monitoring and (6) time framing for various stages of development schemes.

2.3 DECENTRALISED PLANNING IN INDIA:

Decentralisation, as accepted in this study is that the function of planning for the entire country is delegated to several territorial tiers in the country. The national economy as a whole is conceptually divided into several regions and for each region, a plan is
prepared, by a functionary, authorised to prepare a plan for accelerated economic development. In effect there are several plans operating, one for each tier of territory. The content, character, and scope of planning for different territorial tiers can vary, but the existence of several tiers, with a system of planning for each tier is an object reality. Decentralised planning therefore is taken as synonymous with multi-level planning and this is perfectly consistent with the concepts of space, region and regionalisation.

The country as a whole can be conceived of as the macro region, several states collectively can be conceived of as 'macro-meso+ region' each state can be conceived of as a meso region, each district can be conceived of as a macro-region and each community, development block can be conceived of as 'super-micro' region. This delineation of regions has a corresponding planning scheme and mechanism, there is the natural plan for the macro region regional plan for macro-meso region, state plans for meso regions, district plan for macro region and block plans for super-micro regions. Decentralised planning is the Indian context or least encompasses planning of various hues and colours. Planning for each territorial tier is conceived of as a subsystem of a larger and total system of regional planning. Therefore, while selecting contribution to decentralised planning, we have included in this review, contribution to regional
planning, regional plans, district plans, block plans, peoples participation in planning and plans of every description having relevance to planning at sub-national level.

Chakravarty contends that India's social structure is very rigid and hierarchical and issues that bears upon India's development prospects are inevitably very complex. The norm by which Indian Planning has been judged has generally been tempered not by an appreciation of what was possible in India, but by what has been done elsewhere, be in China or South Korea. India's initial choice of development strategy was not only justified but in same sense a natural one, although marred by inadequacies of design and implementation. It has constituted a major effort to reshape India's economy and society. Chakravarty remarks that the way out of the present problem lies not in giving up planning but in giving it a new content. Gandhian approach has much relevance today, which has never been seriously discussed either by main steam economists or by its left wing critics.

Hanson in his book remarks that the attempts of Indian Government to have grassroot planning have achieved little success. There has been some, but not much,

decentralisation of plan formulation to the district and block levels. Hardly any effective popular participation is in the process, while the involvement of the people in plan implementation, through the community projects and Panchayati Raj has been patchy and generally disappointing in its results. Even knowledge of the existence of a plan is not very widely spread. The reasons for poor response to official effort are to be found partly in administrative difficulties, partly in overwhelming apathy and people's ignorance. He argues that if the rural local self-governing institutions like Panchayati Raj were to function effectively as a development institution, its introduction had to be accompanied by revolutionary changes in the social and economic structures of villages. He points out that no such changes were feasible within the politico-administrative context which the protagonists of Panchayati Raj have necessarily to accept. Hence it inevitably emerged an enormous hiatus between intention and achievement. Therefore, he says Panchayati Raj institutions as contained in the Five Year Plan presumably still represent the official orthodoxy.

Mukherjee in his seminal work critically reviews the methodologies of decentralised planning. He makes a critical probing into the models adopted in West Bengal.

Gujarat and Karnatak: He contends that Karnatak model is unique with regard to monitoring system, which is worth emulating by other states. The West Bengal model is based on the fundamental truth that 'landlordism' is a structural bottleneck in any effective policy for agricultural development and poverty eradication. He lays out the existing scenario in various states of India with regard to district planning. He holds that, except for one or two exceptions, no state has adopted a well-set methodology for district or sub-district planning. His indepth analysis provides a fairly rich cafeteria of methodologies for planning at the district and sub-district level to choose from. He believes that the diversity of the needs of planning mirrored by the various parts of the country could be met by these 'multi-coloured' and 'multi-faceted' approaches and methodological instrumentalities. He highlights various issues appertaining to finalisation and implementation of local level plans.

Prasad in his book makes out a strong case for planning at the grass roots for a country of the size and diversity of India. The book indicates the broad framework with which such planning should be organised, discusses the reasons for its slow progress and evaluates the Indian experience with

special reference to Indian developments. It analyses the planning functions of institutions working at the district block and village levels, examines the planning process of various poverty alleviation programmes and provides guidelines on issues related to people's participation in grassroots planning.

It provides a detailed discussion of both the methodological and organisational aspects of micro-level planning with suitable illustrations drawn from field studies conducted by the author. It makes suggestions for raising the quality of planning at the grass roots.

Jha makes out a strong case for regional planning in recent years. Agricultural planning is an important part of the national planning of a country. The author deals with the problems of regional planning and manpower planning in the context of both India and Nepal. It is because of the lack of spatial planning that the social and economic structure of the country is still not motivated towards rapid economic changes in some regions, which result in unbalanced development of the country. He analyses various indicators of the inter-state disparities and the extent of regional imbalances prevailing in the economy. The strategy of agricultural developments in Bihar and Nepal and various factories which are responsible for the backwardness of Bihar have been analysed. He also discusses the poverty

alleviation programmes like IRDP and their impact on the generation of employment opportunities.

Rao makes a review\(^3\) of the studies on efficiency of plan implementation for ameliorating poverty in rural India. Rao's study examines the impact of available sources of irrigation, the impact of the use of HYV and the use of inorganic fertilisers on economic efficiency in agriculture. Rao has worked out an optimum cropping pattern by the use of linear programming, and estimated the demand for inputs in order to project the optimum levels of income. With the help of the central place theory technique, he identifies the functional gaps in the socio-economic facilities in the service centres and suggest that such gaps be bridged.

The growth models of economic development have become a stronghold. Das therefore argues that in order to transform the vast backward agrarian economy into a rapidly growing one and in order to achieve a self sustaining development process a radical resurrection in the planning strategy in stead of tinkering in planning techniques, is very much warranted in a decentralised frame work.\(^4\) Das in his edited volume analyses the most fundamental issues or rural development by delving deep into the problem of rural poverty, backwardness and other emerging problems of rural society.


rural societies, with a holistic point of view. He contends that decentralised planning can only ensure an integration between different decision levels and a meaningful compromise among various policies of different spatial and sectoral components and eliminate the suboptimal social choices.\(^{37}\) He strongly makes out a case for having a democratic decentralisation in the planning process.

Ghosh in his book\(^{38}\) expounds a new approach to the problem of socio-economic development in India. He analyses the causes of prevailing social tensions, primary roots of which lie in the economic sphere. He provides a holistic view of the multifaceted problem faced by the majority of Indians caught in the throtes of underemployment, poverty and illiteracy. Author's main focus is on ways of improving the approach to planning in India. He contends that decentralisation of the Indian polity leading to decentralised planning and the mobilisation of local effort along with de-bureaucratisation and deregulation of industrial growth are the need of the hour. He lays emphasis on local area developmental planning and proposes changes in the exact system of financial devolution from the centre to the states and from states to popularly elected local authorities.

---

Aziz contends that decentralized planning properly conceived and implemented, is far better equipped to achieve equitable growth by being more responsive to local problems and needs. Author's main purpose is to develop a general theoretical perspective based on a review of the actual experience of decentralized planning in the state of Karnataka. He delineates the institutional structure necessary to achieve the ends of decentralized governance. Among the main elements are its capacity to identify both local level needs and problems and the aspirations of people to facilitate people's participation and to both formulate and implement appropriate projects. Aziz recommends that the local bodies be endowed with a reasonably high degree of political and financial autonomy to overcome the deficiencies in the area of plan formulation and implementation.

The book edited by Chaturvedi and Prasad seeks to put together a number of selected articles concerning various facets and problems of administration and implementation of planning in India. These articles not only sum up the India's experience but have relevance for other developing countries and holds lessons for the future planning efforts.

horizontal coordination continue to plague the planning and implementation process. Any simplistic or populist approach can not solve either issue of scarcity of resources or of distributive strategy and its parameters. These are the related issues which have been the focus of attention of respective authors.

Chaturvedi in his paper makes out a very strong case for peoples participation. On the basis of his experience he remarks that official machinery by itself is not suitable for carrying out the developmental programmes which call for a great deal of unitative and participation on the part of the people themselves. 41

Lea and Chaudhury in their book have stressed the need for integrated rural development at local level, which should have the planning attributes in common. 42 (a) to fulfil the basic needs and raise the standard of living of rural masses. (b) to make rural areas more productive and less vulnerable to natural hazards, poverty and exploitation. (c) to ensure an active participation of the mass of the people in order to make the development self-sustaining. (d) to promote administrative decentralisation and rural self-government.

They contend that a micro-grassroot planning can hardly succeed if it is not well-coordinated with the development

strategy and the socio-political set up at other levels like district, region, state and nation as a whole. Complementarily between rural development strategy and national economic development strategy is a necessary pre-condition for the success of development planning.\textsuperscript{43} More important is local participation, local organisation and skillful use of historical experience by policy makers. The role of human element, individual and collective can hardly be overstated in this respect.

UNCRD\textsuperscript{44} emphasise that access to accurate base line statistics on relevant decision variables at rural local level is quite essential in the implementation and management of all programmes and projects. Participation of local people in rural development programme through local decision making and local institution plays a dominant role. So peoples participation in the planning, management and decision-making process is a foremost element in the success of decentralisation policies and programmes. It is held that such participation should not be merely episodic but systematic. It requires appropriate institutional mechanism in village to train cadres at the local level.

\textsuperscript{43} Ibid. pp.335-36.

Narayan in his book contends that the role of Panchayati Raj has to be reviewed with reference to two aspects - the foundational aspect and the infrastructural aspect which are organically linked with each other. He discusses the important trends and examines the success of Panchayati Raj in creating the developmental conscience among the rural people. He holds that people's participation which has been on increase in the initial stages is once again on the decrease. It does not appear to have percolated down below to the rural masses. The rural people considers the development programmes as state-sponsored, if not state imposed and the sense of identification and partnership is lacking. Rural people by and large continue to be both fatalists and defeatists in their psychology and here the dent if any can at best be said to be very weak.

Thomas-Padmanabhan hold that inspite of several development programmes and massive investment have been made, majority of the people of India are poor. They raise the question does the socio-economic structure promote or hinder development? They have undertaken the study on


46. Ibid. p.XXIV.

47. Thomas PA and K.Padmanabhan (1991), District Planning Northern Book Centres, New Delhi, p.188.
development perspectives of North Arcot district in Tamil Nadu with a view to find answers to the above questions. They contend that southern regions of the district are deprived of the benefits of industrial development. Wide disparity in the development between rural, urban and tribal regions continues to hamper the growth of the district economy.

Chopra et al. have given an analytical treatment to common property resources. They have developed a good case for making people responsive to and responsible for community resources, resulting in better gains for themselves. It is a very relevant contribution, which adopts the cluster analysis approach highlights participatory linkages.

Bhadouria in his study holds that it is the spirit of decentralisation which can effectively contribute to the projects and programmes of area planning and balanced rural development. Decentralisation should not be looked upon as a mere mechanical device. In fact decentralisation requires the internationalisation of democratic values. In operational terms, decentralisation shall gain and fructify only if the political environment is attuned to it. He argues that the successful plan must be sensitive to micro level variations.

while taking into account the limitations posed by the national priorities, resources and investment funds. He remarks that if the main responsibility of decision making and implementation of development plan of the district or block level is left to the bureaucratic hierarchy democratic decentralisation will turn to be a farce.

Das in his paper attempts to identify the necessary changes in the philosophy of development planning without which meaningful steps towards the decentralisation of the development planning and plan implementation regime cannot possibly be taken. He highlights the fundamental ideological issues of contemporary decentralisation debates. He opines that the confusion in the minds of most Indian proponents of decentralisation in development planning arises from the fact that they are seeking to achieve the benefits of decentralisation without giving up the centralist philosophies of development planning. The real crucial decentralisation problems are being actually side stepped in contemporary debates on decentralisation. The author believes that while Gandhian solutions are incomplete and imperfect, they represent still the best starting points for meaningful discussions of the problems involved.

50. Ibid, p.6
52. Ibid p.35.
Seetharam in his paper argues that unless we make clear to ourselves the conceptual apparatus of multi-level planning, its theoretical foundations and political implications, we shall be confused regarding what we are setting out to achieve. Devious attempts have been made to skirt these basic issues and look upon multi-level planning merely as an exercise in playing with organisational hierarchies with the objective of shuffling, the best deal. Such attempts at model building without a clear cut methodology are bound to flounder.

Budhraja in his paper highlights the role of bureaucracy and holds the view that there is rapid deterioration of Community Development spirit. The author analyses the current trends in the working of the rural development activities. He suggests a number of steps for strengthening of planning set up at the district and block levels. He argues that all the Panchayati Raj Institutions which are presently lying dormant must be reactivated to play their roles of the desired levels. The administrative apparatus at the district block and village levels should be closely linked with the working of Panchayati Raj Institutions.

Shiva argues only Panchayati Raj can facilitate a close fit between multi-level technology and multi-level planning, through local involvement and guidance. In a complex differentiated society, vast amount of information must flow at ever faster speed. On the basis of the feedback, the policy makers and administrators or managers should be able to involve improved tools, procedures and methods. Feedback from lower layers should be used to improve the operational policy in the face of administrative and technocratic myopia.

The study of Mascarehas aims at understanding the role of dairying within the overall rural development strategy in India and examining the development of the diary cooperative structure in Anand of Gujrat. The author presents a balanced picture of Anand model of dairy development and attempts to draw lessons from both its achievements and shortcomings. The study addresses many critical issues in rural development, which ought to be explicitly raised if one is committed to the policy of economic growth with social justice. It makes a balanced and comprehensive analysis of one of the more innovative strategies of rural development in India.


Khare in his paper contends that in decentralised planning, people are taken into confidence, all the schemes are discussed with them in all details, their implications, costs and advantages accrued to them are communicated to them. The author remarks that now a stage has come when the centre, states and the districts should have well defined areas of jurisdiction, which shall go a long way in accelerating rate of economic growth of districts.

Mohan and Gupta in their article hold the view that the planning effort should start at the grassroot level for the balanced growth of all the regions and all the sections of our people. Such an approach will lead to a proper social justice and better economic development. They argue that the Community Development Programme was closer to micro level planning, but did not produce desired results. In many spheres there was lack of coordination and multiplicity and overlapping of economic activities. The authors provide a set of suggestions for improving the efficacy of district level planning in the country.

Budharaja in his another paper attempts to analyse the existing structure of set-up at the district and block levels in the state as well as in the context of already established three-tier Panchayati Raj institutional framework. He tries to identify the inter-block variations in the development through some selected socio-economic indicators and evaluates the policy steps already taken up by the State Government to narrow down the intra-district imbalances.

Pachauri in his recent study provides very important insights into the rich and diverse experience of non-governmental organisations (NGOs) that have implemented exemplary, innovative programmes targeted to poor and disadvantaged communities in India. There is a special focus on particular problems and constraints. The first section of the book provides twelve case studies and the second section includes 8 chapters that examine cross-cutting issues and providing comparative analysis to set the case studies within a larger policy context.

The empirical findings of Norman and Esman relating to 16 countries. Bangladesh, China, Egypt, India, Indonesia, Israel, Japan, Korea, Malaysia, Pakistan, Phillipines.

Srilanka, Taiwan, Thailand, Turkey and Yogoslavia reveals that involvement of rural organisations in rural development makes a significant contribution to the effectiveness of planning and the efficiency with which available resources can be utilised. It strengthens administrative accountability and articulates the needs of rural people in general and the intended beneficiaries in particular so that the goals, priorities and operations of rural development programmes can be responsive to or at least take account of their requirement. The local organisations can provide more detailed informations on local conditions and possibilities than central agencies can acquire and handle. They found no case where only one institution carries the full responsibility of rural development. Complementaries among various institution are more important. The authors hold that the extent and effectiveness of linkages between and among institutions, horizontally as well as vertically between local organisation and the structures at the Centre which set policy and allocate resources are significant for the success in rural development.

Bhadouria & Bhandari in their paper\textsuperscript{62} emphasised the need for people's participation. They argue that micro planning at the village level should be given an appropriate place in the overall process of economic development of the

\textsuperscript{62} Bhadouria BPS and Bhandari RCS(1989) Peoples' Participation and local organisations in the implementation of decentralised policies and programmes at the macro grassroot level (ed) Chapter p.257.
region. On the whole the administrative machinery, the rural local institutions, voluntary organisation, local leader have to come together, combine their efforts and activities with their intimate knowledge of local area and community in order to help the formulation, implementation and monitoring of more realistic plans for local areas.

Reddy in his book focuses on multilevel planning, since the major challenge to the Indian plan process, he says is in identifying and understanding appropriate multilevel planning framework. He has given two case-studies based on his personal experience. He remarks that plan process actually required not only an understanding of the subject matter of planning, but also an appreciation of the agencies in which the planner has to operate and the procedures that govern the planning process.

2.4 RURAL POVERTY:

Haq holds that the essence of economic growth lies in making the labour produce more than he is allowed to consume for his immediate needs and to invest and reinvest the surpluses thus obtained. He further contends that a poverty curtain has descended right across the face of the world, dividing it materially and philosophically into two

different worlds; two unequal humanities one embarrassingly rich and the other desperately poor. This invisible barrier exists within nations as well as between them. The struggle to lift this curtain of poverty is certainly the most formidable challenge of our time.

There is a good deal of controversy on where to draw the dividing line between the poor and the non-poor. There can, however, be hardly any difference of opinion that a poor person is one who does not have command over or access to the basic material requirements of life such as two square meals, clean drinking water, and a bare minimum of clothing and shelter, even if one leaves aside the other non-material requisites such as education and health. Most of the discussion on poverty in India has tended to be concerned only with nutritional requisites for a sheer physical subsistence, because it is basic requirement for survival. The 'poverty line' in most studies is drawn on the basis of nutritional requisites.

Broadly, two types of indices are used for measuring the extent of poverty. The most common index is the percentage of population in poverty or the head-count ratio. In symbols, this is expressed as:

\[ H = \left[ \frac{P_2}{P} \right] \times 100 \]

Where $H$ denotes the percentage of population below the poverty line, $P_l$ denotes the absolute number of persons in poverty, and $P$ denotes the population of the country. Another measure\(^\text{66}\) that has been used is so-called poverty gap. It measures the degree of poverty by the short fall of all the poor's income from the poverty line. The poverty gap is denoted as:

$$g = \sum (z - y_i)$$

Where $g$ denotes the poverty gap ratio, $z$ denotes the poverty line, and $Y$ the income of the $i$th person below the poverty line. The income gap ratio is useful for estimating the quantum of income transfer needed to lift the poor above the poverty line. In case of both the indices, the problem is created in defining and determining the poverty line. The well known Sen index of poverty is based essentially on the second measure. Sen has defined in general terms that poverty index\(^\text{67}\) is given by a weighted sum of the income gaps of the poor. Thus:

$$P = \theta (z, P_l, P) \cdot \sum_{i=1}^{n} \lambda_i \cdot v_i (z, y_i)$$

Where $\lambda_i$ is the income gap $(z - y_i)$, $y_i$ is the $\mathbb{R}_+$-vector of incomes of the poor, $v_i$ is the distributional weight on the poor person $i$ and $\theta$ is a normalising constant. A particular index can be derived from it by choosing precise norms of determining the values of $\theta$ and $v_i$.


In India, much debate and controversy has taken place around a number of studies that look at the problem of poverty. The question that has attracted the most is whether proportion of the population living below the poverty level has increased or decreased in recent years. Starting with the work of Minhas and Bardhan\textsuperscript{68} in 1970, there have been among others, studies by Dandekar and Rath,\textsuperscript{69} Ojha\textsuperscript{70} Vidyanathan\textsuperscript{71} and Bhatty\textsuperscript{72} etc. Most of the studies have used National sample survey data to obtain a percentile break down of consumption expenditure. Dandekar and Rath have used an estimated minimum calorie intake level of 2250 per day. By estimating the cost of the minimum diet and comparing it with the sample survey data, one can obtain the number of people whose incomes are below the level required to purchase the minimum level of subsistence. These are then defined as the poor. Where changes in the magnitude of poverty have to be estimated overtime, account


\textsuperscript{69} Dandekar V.M. and Rath N (1971), Poverty in India, \textit{Indian School of Political Economy}, Pune.

\textsuperscript{70} Ojha P.D. (1970); A configuration of Indian Poverty, Inequality and levels of having Reserve Bank of India, Bulletin, January.


\textsuperscript{72} Bhatty I A (1974) Inequality and poverty in Rural India, \textit{Sankhya}, Vol.36, June and December.
has to be taken of changes in the level of prices so as to have these expenditure figures in constant terms.

Zaheer, in his informative article entitled, "Rural Poverty and its Eradication", observes that the general belief that Indian poverty of recent origin is erroneous and misleading. He has proved that the percentage of people below an income level of Rs.200/- per head per annum are poor, and calculated the percentage from 1861-1973.

Minhas identified the one hundred sixty four million rural poor in 1960-61 as belonging to the rural labour households. Of the remaining, a large proportion would appear to belong to land-operating (non-labour) households in the poor and some would appear to be distributed among small land-owners, who do not operate their land. Minhas' work besides being the first of its kind in India, by identifying the poor in this manner, makes a notable contribution in the field of policy seeking for the removal of poverty.

Ojha's estimates showed a higher proportion of poor people below the poverty line. He has adopted a calorie norm of 2250 per capita per day for an average Indian. The foodgrain equivalent of this is computed to be 518 gms for


the rural and 137 gms for the urban areas per person per day. Applying these norms, he has calculated that 52 per cent of all rural people and 8 per cent of the urban population fall below the poverty line in 1967-68.

Pranab Bardhan's (1970) results are in direct contrast to those of Minhas, while he uses the same NSS data for distribution of consumer expenditure. Bardhan uses a minimum income level of Rupees fifteen at 1960-61 prices. Starting from that, he argues that the National income deflator is not an appropriate price index, because it does not accurately reflect the set of prices facing the poor consumers. He has also looked at the regional pattern in the incidence of poverty in rural India taking the same consumption basket represented by rupees fifteen per capita per month at 1960-61 at all India rural prices as the minimum. He has worked out what this would cost in different states and from that derived estimates of poverty in the states at the two points of time.

The study of Dandekar and Rath (1971) has attracted much attention while their statistical procedures are not flawless in that they make a number of fairly arbitrary adjustments to the basic NSS data, their basic conclusions are not very much off the point. Their study covers both the urban and the rural sector. Their assumption of two thousand two hundred fifty calories per adult male as the required minimum intake for subsistence works out of
1960-61 prices to Rs.170.8 per annum. For a number of reasons, the urban consumer would typically need to spend a higher amount, Rs.271.7 to purchase the same amount of nutritional value. Thus it works out that in 1960-61, about 40 per cent of the rural population and a little under fifty percent of the urban population would be below the poverty line. In 1967-68, after allowing for changes in the price level about forty per cent of the rural and a little over fifty per cent of the urban population, are still be below the poverty line. For the rural population, therefore the Dandekar and Rath results lie in between the Minhas and Bardhan estimates, in that they find no significant change in the proportion of population below the poverty line in the late 1960s.

Ojha (1970) has looked at both rural and urban poverty for 1960-61 and at rural poverty only for 1967-68. For 1960-61, he compares actual food consumption in gramps per head of rural and urban population with a nutritional minimum of five hundred eighteen grams per head daily for rural and four hundred thirty two grams for urban population. He has found that nutritional deficiency persisted in the rural area for expenditure levels up to rupees fifteen to eighteen per capita per month. For the urban population, the corresponding level at which consumption ceased to be deficient was rupees eleven to thirteen per month. In this basis Ojha estimates that in 1960-61 roughly 51.8
per cent of the rural population or 184.2 million people lived in poverty, while for the urban area, the proportion was only 7.6 per cent, a total of six million people. However, if the same level of calorie intake is taken for both sectors, the urban population need an expenditure level of rupees twenty one to twenty four to avoid nutritional deficiency and the proportion below the poverty line increase to about forty five per cent.

Taking an income level of Rupees one hundred thirty two per year to denote poverty, which is roughly half the national average for 1960-61 and is considerably lower than the range of rupees one hundred seventy to two hundred fifty used by other, Vidyanathan finds that 15.7 per cent of rural population living in poverty i.e., about fifty six million. He also points out that the NSS data and the national income statistics give quite different answers to the estimate of poverty. The NSS data give a higher estimate of the proportion of the rural population living in poverty for both 1960-61 and 1967-68 than the national income data, and they indicate an increase in the incidence of poverty over time, where as the latter data indicate a more or less stagnant level of poverty.

Bhatty (1974) examined the measure of absolute poverty in terms of per capita income in relation to the inequality of income distribution among the poor for the National Council of Applied Economic Research Survey on effectiveness of rural employment in India using July 1968-
June 1969 data. Using Sen's measure of poverty, for making welfare evaluation, his study emphasized the relative incidence of poverty among regions and classes of rural population with reference to alternative poverty levels. He has chosen the following five poverty levels of per capita annual income in 1968-69: Rs.15, Rs.20, Rs.25, Rs.30 and Rs.35 per month. He has estimated that about 70 per cent of rural population are below the poverty line (based on the norm of an income of Rs.30 per head per month) in 1968-69.

Lal, taking poverty line determined by Dandekar and Rath and Bardhan for rural India, and using Rural Labour Enquiry and NSS data, estimated incidence of rural poverty from 1956-57 to 1970-71. His study has proved that incidence of rural poverty is declining during this period.

Rajkrishna, on the basis of NSS data, has observed that no trend in the poverty ratio was visible at the all-India level. He has found that out of 15 states there are only three states, namely Punjab, Tamil Nadu and West Bengal, where the trend is non-zero. In fact, In Tamil Nadu and West Bengal, the poverty ratio is increasing at

76. Lal Deepak (1976) Agricultural Growth, Real Wages and Rural Poor in India, EPW 26 June.
the rate of 1.7 per cent per annum during 1961-64. Only
in one state, i.e. Punjab, the poverty ratio is found to be
declining at a rate of 3.5 per cent per annum. He has
established an arithmetical relation between measured poverty
and measured unemployment, and conclude that poverty is, of
course, positively related to unemployment.

Ahluwalia \(^7\), taking two alternative poverty measures,
like the percentage of the rural population below the
poverty line and the Sen poverty index (1973), estimated
long-run trend of incidence of poverty in rural India. At
first he has shown the trend of incidence of poverty over all India taking two estimates. Estimate-I is obtained by
applying the all-India poverty line for various years to the
NSS consumption distribution for rural India. Estimate-II
is obtained as a weighted sum of the estimated percentages
of poverty in individual states, calculated from the NSS
distributions for individual states and the state
specific poverty line. As there are substantial inter-
state differences in prices in the base year, and
furthermore, inflation occurred at different rates across
states, it is argued that Estimate-II is a better estimate
of the incidence of rural poverty. According to his calcu-
lation the percentage in poverty has declines initially from

\(^7\) Ahluwalia MS (1973): Rural Poverty and Agricultural
Performance in India, Journal of Development Studies,
Vol.XIV, No.3, April pp.299-323.
over 50 per cent in the mid-fifties to around 40 per cent in 1960-61, raised sharply through the mid-sixties, reaching a peak in 1967-68, and then declines again. The Sen Index also displays the same pattern. The incidence of poverty for almost all states, using either of the two poverty measures declines up to the early sixties and then peak in 1967-68 or 68-69, and declining steadily thereafter. Saith's rebuttal of Ahluwalia's all-India results is achieved by introducing agricultural prices into Ahluwalia's model. On the basis of his results, Saith concludes that, although agricultural output growth is inversely related to rural poverty, rising prices have had adverse effects on the poverty. Furthermore, even after allowing for prices, the time trend is significantly positive, indicating there are other factors contributing to poverty. It is noted that the measure of agricultural growth aged by Ahluwalia and Saith are not the same. Against the Net Domestic Product in agriculture per rural population used by Ahluwalia Saith used the index of agricultural production as gross e output indicator.

Van de Walle has studied the effect of population growth on rural poverty in India. Previous studies of the time trend of rural poverty in India agree in assuming that population size does not influence poverty independently.

of per capita agricultural output. His article examines this assumption for the period 1959-60 to 1970-71 using a pooled model with variable slope coefficients to avoid the problem of collinearity between population estimates and time. The results suggest that poverty in India during the 1960s was a function of both agricultural production and population growth; negatively related to the former and positively to the latter.

Visaria studied the probable relationship between poverty and unemployment both in rural and urban India. He has concluded that there is a clear nexus between poverty and unemployment in India. This would not warrant the tempting conclusion that generating more employment is the single solution to the problem of poverty. According to him the rates of rural and urban unemployment (person days unemployed as a percentage of person days in labour force) in the lowest expenditure group (less than ₹11 per capita per month) are 22.4 per cent (rural areas) and 29.2 per cent (urban areas) respectively in 1977-78. It is observed that the expenditure per month per capita goes on increasing the rates of unemployment go on declining. This phenomenon is uniform for both sexes and both rural and urban workers.

The book of Schendel seeks to understand the cause

of mass poverty in three regions of Asia, i.e. Bengal, Kaveri Delta and lower Burma, which had once been parts of the same British Indian Empire. The agrarian Societies in these regions had experienced and responded differently to the process of their incorporation into the world capitalist system. But their similarity lies in the fact that they are still among the poorest. Poverty in the third world, thinks Schendel, is never a historical accident, but the outcome of the development of capitalism on a world scale which affected pre-existing patterns of poverty and created a new regional inequalities sustained by various forms of surplus extraction. Poverty is a consequence came to be concentrated in certain peripheral societies with considerable difference among themselves, reflecting uneven development of capitalism. Consequent pamperisation could continue for such long time because the primary producers could not effectively resist this process. The peasantry in all these areas were proletarianised in varying degrees. This book raises many other issues relating to the course of poverty in south India and south east Asia.

Hirway in her study scans the target group approach of poverty eradication programmes in India with special reference to Gujrat. The unique feature of her study is that it analyses a set of target group programmes within

the context of four different types of villages, taking
into account the economic structures, the social framework
and power alignments of these societies. She shows how
these special programmes instead of loosening the hold
of the power structure, strengthen it in myriad ways and how
they deprive the poor of the benefits of even those programmes
which are specially designed for them. She argues that
target group approach of rural poverty alleviation is not
likely to deliver goods and radical changes in the approach
are called for.

Etienne's another study, is an interesting and
informative book, which gives a detailed account of the
Indian rural scene at the grass roots level and her useful
suggestions for rural poverty alleviation. He has been an
intrepid and indeed irrepressible observation of rural
development in India. He has focused his perceptiveness
and intuitive wisdom with respect to a village of ordinary
appearance in Bulandshahr district of Uttar Pradesh.

Nayyar in her book presents a systematic measurement
of poverty in rural India on a state-wise basis and analysis of
the factors underlying the observed inter-state differences.

84. Etienne Gilbert (1988) Food and Poverty, India's half
won battle, Sage, Delhi, p.272.

85. Nayyar Rohimi (1991) Rural Poverty in India, an
analysis of inter-state differences, Oxford
Univ. Press, Bombay.
Based on alternative concepts and criteria she provides estimates of rural poverty both absolute and relative covering a period of 1960-61 to 1983-84. She uses cross-section and time-series evidence to highlight differences across space and time and discusses the relationship between poverty and malnutrition, disease and morbidity, and the inadequacy of health and educational facilities. Through regression analysis she identifies the reasons for inter-state differences in rural poverty and attempts to establish a causality between poverty and each of the explanatory variables. She also examines major poverty alleviation programmes and conditions of agricultural workers, who form the majority of the rural poor.

Sharma on the basis of his large-scale survey of a cross section of cultivating households in the state of Maryana finds that 56% of cultivators had adopted HYV and in terms of area coverage it was 44%. This was made possible by considerable progress in infrastructure viz irrigation and electricity etc. He estimated that the differences in output elasticity of modern inputs are positive, which suggests that small farmers suffer from resource constraints in making effective use of modern input. The percentage of households below the poverty line and also the intensity of poverty among

---

The adopter households are consistently lower as compared to non-adopters. The results of his finding however pertain to a period more than a decade ago.

The study of Bhattacharya—co ndoo-Maiti-Mukherjee provides a comprehensive analysis of the absolute and relative levels of living of India’s rural population over a period of 30 years (1952-83). They examine disparities in consumption across households in rural India, the trends in such disparities and the trends in the incidence of absolute poverty. They have developed a theoretical model for the country as a whole and estimated the poverty relationship suggested by the model from empirical data in order to explain intertemporal variations in the incidence of rural poverty. Their analysis is then extended to examine the extent to which the all-India results carry over to selected states of India. They conclude that the prices of goods generally bought by poorer people have risen more steeply than those articles purchased by the relatively affluent and bottom 40 per cent of rural population has remained chronically poor.

2.5 RURAL DEVELOPMENT:

Etienne in his study provides an exemplary

documentation of the rural realities in five Asian countries. What guarantees the enduring importance of this volume is not the fact that observations are corroborated with a solid data base but the author's continuous interaction with the societies and rural people. His study is free from any dogmas and biases. Analysis is lucid, penetrating and provides the realistic picture.

Bhagawati analyses the political economy of development and economic and social structure of underdeveloped countries. He deals with the process of transformation, where he highlights the planning framework, space dimension, manpower planning and choice of technology. He concedes that economic progress is certainly not easy to engineer. The planners in the underdeveloped countries face an uphill task. They need to understand fully the many economic, social and political factors which must condition and shape their action if it is to succeed. It needs not merely expertise but insight and imagination.

Bardhan in his book, concedes that land labour nexus figures prominently in explanations of rural poverty in countries with high dependence on land and agriculture. In land scarce countries, large numbers are deprived of the access to land even as activators. The reward for their


labour gets limited to steer subsistence required for survival. He further observes that as the small owners get immiserized and gradually pushed into the status of semi proletarians, both due to demographic pressures and economic distress, the ranks of wage corners swell. The retarded capitalism a legacy of colonialism keeps the benefit of technology limited while its displacement effect tends to be larger; the result is overcrowding in agriculture. Under these conditions the incidence of rural poverty is seen to be unchanged over time. Bardhan in another book,\(^91\) does step away from micro-quantitative studies to get an overview and focuses his attention on some of the political processes governing accumulation, rather than distribution.

Bardhan's attempt in another study,\(^92\) to discern some patterns in the chaotic and seemingly disconnected events in the political and economic life of India in recent years is carried out in an analytical framework which is clearly marxian in its fundamentals. The most important contribution the book makes is a certain class analysis of Indian society, a certain concept of the role of the state that he advances and a certain kind of class struggle that he describes as leading to the present crisis of Indian society.


Half of the text and statistical tables are used to present a terse but convincing picture of the state of affairs in the Indian Economy, whereas the remaining half is devoted to attempts at political economic explanations for that state of affairs. He dismisses that corruption and inefficiency are the results of the very existence of the public sector. South Korean success is only due to the ability of the system to largely isolate the framework of economic policy from the clientalist demands of the political process. He traces the failure of the Indian political leadership to achieve the necessary insulation of the economic decision-making to the nature and function of the Indian democratic system, which is a subtle and resilient mechanism for conflict management and transactional negotiations among the proprietary classes.

Dubhashi, has done a very good job by drawing attention to the need for integrated policy and organisational strategy. He highlights three stages and three aspects of agricultural and rural development policy. He focuses on Institutional policies, technological policies and economic policies. He concludes by asserting that the rural development has great significance in the process of economic development of India.

Sims in his book, provides an excellent case study of the impact of public policy and character of the political regime on agricultural growth and rural development of agrarian economies. He analyses the official priorities and reclamation strategy, distribution pattern of fertilizer and credit and the impact of farm lobbies on agricultural policy with particular reference to Punjab. The author deals with many crucial and complex issues, which are rarely treated so directly elsewhere.

Agriculture is no longer the central economic activity of post-industrial societies of test and accordingly the agrarian question has ceased to be a major economic and political issue. Not so in the rest of the world. In countries of Asia, Africa and Latin America which are yet to complete the transition from an agrarian to an industrial society the agrarian question still remains at the centre of economic and political discourse. Delhi workshop on rural transformation (organised under the auspices of Indo-Dutch programme of Alternatives in Development in Oct. 1986) forms a part of this discourse and the volume edited by Breman and Mundle is a selection of papers presented in that workshop. The varying interpretations of the agrarian question, read in a specifically Asian context frame the


canvas of this volume. Some of the countries featured are China, India, Indonesia, Japan, South Korea and Taiwan. The sixteen papers present a fascinating picture of rural transformation in Asia, outlining the most critical issues and demarcating the essential benchmarks.

Pandiari's study\textsuperscript{96} based on both primary and secondary sources of data as also on oral histories and the records of local organisation is a theoretically important one. He highlights the political economic issues of agrarian change with respect to Nanchilpadu during 1880-1939. It is of considerable interest to policy-makers, historians, economist and all those interested in development and present state of Indian agriculture.

The paper of Basu and Kashyap\textsuperscript{97} examines the rural non-farm sector across different agro-climatic conditions with emphasis on identifying regionally differentiated agricultural development processes in relation to the size of the non-farm sector. Their approach is sequential and exploratory, scanning the macro and micro level studies and as such does not seek any generalisation. They hold that the process of rural development should be integrated with the rural-urban employment linkages by appropriate policy interventions.

\textsuperscript{96} Pandian MSS (1990) \textit{The Political Economy of agrarian Change}, Sage, Delhi, p.192.

Desai and Namboodiri\textsuperscript{98} analyses the performance of rural institutional finance system and draws implications for its improvement. This system has performed better in deposit mobilisation than in financing agricultural output and investment. Its performance on the functional structure of loans and loan recovery leaves much to be desired.

Dreze's paper\textsuperscript{99} presents some fresh evidence on the performance of the Integrated Rural Development Programme (IRDP). In the light of this evidence and of the findings of earlier studies, the author provides an assessment of the functioning of IRDP. His concern is not primarily with the nitty-gitty of the implementation of the programmes but with the central question about IRDP does this programme reach the poor and to what extent does it enhance their living conditions? There are certainly more effective routes to the eradication of rural poverty through public action, which should receive greater attention, he adds. Government should not abdicate its responsibility by claiming against all reasons that programmes such as IRDP are going to make a big difference.


Maheshwari’s study, written in a clear and blunt style, provides valuable insights into the evolution of policies and programmes for agricultural and rural development and their performance since independence. He analyses the effectiveness of IRDP, community Development Programme and Panchayati Raj institution in relation to rural development. He also highlights on the technology for rural development and rural development bureaucracy. The author has many interesting things to say about conflict of goals and inconsistencies in implementation inherent in India’s rural development administration.

Shah in his paper holds the view that orthodox economic planning is unlikely to prepare the nation to meet the challenge of rapid agricultural and rural employment growth. India should focus, he asserts, on devising radical and innovative strategies that can yield and sustain 5-7% annual growth rate in the value of output of agricultural sector. This seemingly unachievable goal can be achieved only by redesigning the chemistry between the state and own institutions of economic development in our markets, our legal framework, our economic organisation in the Private, Public, cooperative and informal sectors.

Gulab in his paper examines the role and relevance of rural employment generation programmes in or of the district (Anantpur) of Andra and suggests that the close participation of voluntary agencies in the programmes would enhance their effectiveness. By this subcontracting system, which is hindering the flow of full benefits to the works can be controlled.

The contribution of Augustine is an excellent combination of 8 essays by eminent persons. The authors have debated many important issues. The book gives an overall view of the economic, political, psychological, theological analyses of development and presents some field experiences.

The volume authored by Dr Singh seems to be a comprehensive volume on rural development covering all the three important aspect of rural development—principles, policies and management. It examines the meaning of rural development, its pace and level, the lessons learned from India's experience with various rural development programmes, and how these programmes should be managed. The book consists of 18 chapters which are grouped into three parts. First part comprises 5 chapters which are devoted to an exposition of the meaning, objectives, measures, hypotheses and

determinants of rural development second part contains 8 chapters which deal with rural development policies, models, policy instruments and selected rural development programmes followed in India. Third part includes 5 chapters which together cover various organisational and managerial aspects of rural development such as planning, organising, financing, implementing, monitoring and evaluation.

Singh contends that macro planning is of necessity, based on highly aggregated data and on considerations that are usually of broad significance. In view of different agro-climatic, technoeconomic and socio-cultural factors obtaining in different regions of India, national planning to be realistic and effective, has to be decentralised to sub-national and sub-state levels. According to Singh, India's approach to development planning has been predominantly macro-oriented emphasising national goals and priorities.

Nair and White in their volume contend that the current thinking in development has shifted from the dominant paradigm of innovation to a less 'top-down' approach which acknowledges the significance of a micro-level focus with coherent linkages to the macro-level. They argue that the development process requires full participation of the

105. Ibid, p.266.
people if there is to be a commitment to development decisions and development communication can play an important role in facilitating their wider involvement. The volume with 18 original essays presents diverse viewpoints regarding the need for rethinking on the effectiveness of existing development models. The underlying concern is to reconceptualize development communication. The new model presented by the editors addresses the transition from the tip-down approach to one which involves people at the grassroots in the development processes and decisions. Among the issues explored by the contributors are inequality, dependency, development indicators, participating approaches, and the use of modern communication technologies.

Desai, in his study (1988) observes that old the measures and programmes of development have benefited by and large, those who are already well-off. The fruits of development have not reached the section, living below the poverty line. His study consists of 30 experiments and evaluations which are grouped into four parts. Part-I covers the experiences of State and voluntary agencies. Part-II deals with institutional experience, Part-III analyses the individuals and cooperative endeavour and part-IV brings into focus foreign experience in domain of distribution of the fruits of economic growth. He holds that the success of rural

development programme depends upon organisational arrangements, the adoption of an appropriate strategy for the development of micro-regions, clear guidelines relating to the investment-mix of projects and active participation of the beneficiaries in the planning process. Over and above these, it requires a strong and explicit political will and commitment on the part of governmental authorities to meet squarely the question of rural poverty.

The study throw up valuable insights not only into the deficiencies in the implementation of rural development programmes; but into the many aspects of development administration, including the attitudes of local functionaries and beneficiaries. In spite of methodological weaknesses, it suggests in brief, the need for an integrated approach for decentralisation, flexibility, peoples participation.

The study made by Dholakia attempts to make a deep analysis of the dynamic aspects of the development process and provides a very useful insight into many policy questions of national and regional importance. It presents carefully constructed comparable estimates of very crucial aggregated like real output, employment and the real stock of capital in the various states. The study covers a period of two decades from 1960-61 to 1979-80. It develops a framework for an analysis of regional disparities. It considers such factors such as worker's rate, industrial

structure, capital intensity, capital productivity, labour productivity etc. It has followed the identity approach, though the results have been corroborated by the alternative approach of the sources of growth.

Prasad holds that the national leaders renewed time and again the Gandhis pledge of wiping "every tear from every eye." They viewed with one another in making repeated rhetorical pronouncements of socialistic item of society, rapid growth with social justice etc. Since then 45 years have elapsed. The negative achievements is seen in terms of the fact that whatever marginal gains have accrued to the nation after independence have been unevenly distributed among classes as well as among regions. Unemployment, under employment and disguised unemployment continue to increase. Let alone the movement towards socialism, even the capitalist transformation of the economy is slow and lopsided. A large part of the agricultural sector still in the stranglehold of semi-feudal production relations, suffers from low levels of technology and its production fluctuates due to the vagaries of nature. The feudal ethos still pervades the country, though in varying degree and feudal identities of caste, creed, community, ethnic and linguistic identities continue to enmesh the people.

Bardhan and Rudra in their survey of 80 villages of 5 districts of West Bengal in 1981-82, observed that the boundaries of the village labour market in an agrarian economy are often rather narrowly delimited and heavily dependent on social and territorial affinities. Labourers do not go to work in adjacent villages where the wage rate may be higher. Personal connections between employers and employees within a village are far more important in labour mobility than short-term wage differences. These affinities are often cemented by relationships of regular consumption of credit and wage advances. Territorial loyalty serves as a guarantee of non-default of loans and plays an important role in matters of emergency. They hold that in the absence of any developed market for credit and insurance, these relationships of unequal dependence perpetuate the territorial segmentation of the rural labour market.

Agrawal in her study holds that although the problems of rural poverty, unemployment and destitution have long been the stated concern of development policy in most third world countries, yet there continues to be little appreciation that in many instances, these problems are also gender-specific. Therefore any serious attempt to alleviate these

conditions and/or prevent their further aggravation would require a particular focus on the women of poor households. She further contends that the accuracy of national level statistics, which usually serve as the principal data input in the framing of development policies, is severely impaired by biases which lead to an undercounting of women, but as workers and as those available for works. She spells out the nature and sources of these biases and attempts to provide pointers on how they could be corrected and some of the data gaps filled.

Ninan, against the background of global poverty and income distribution pattern, analyses the trends and causal factors behind rural poverty in India both at the national and state levels during 1957–87. He divides the entire period into two phases; 1957–68 and 1969–87. He finds that trends in incidence of rural poverty in India was positive and significant in the first phase, while it was negative and significant in the second phase. His observations are valid for India and across its states as well, using alternate measures of poverty (head count ratio and sens' Poverty Index). He attempts both a time series and cross-section analysis of the causal factors behind rural poverty in India, especially probing into the role of agricultural

growth access to subsidized food through the PDS population pressures on environmental resources, rural consumption levels and inequality and infrastructure development on the incidence of rural poverty across the states.

Krishnan examines the success and failure of Indian economy in integrating population issues with development planning and what were, would be, the consequences of rapid population growth for the alleviation of poverty in the country. He emphasizes that very little emphasis was placed on promoting the crucial role of social and human development. In the final section he presents a broader analysis of a few important questions relating to labour market adjustments in response to population growth. He touches upon the question of inadequacy of the concepts used in measuring employment and unemployment within the institutional and social structure prevailing in different parts of the country, the relationship between agricultural wages and agricultural productivity and the likely pressure on employment generated by the enormous rise in labour force during the next 35 years.

Mishra analyses the complex socio-economic and politico-administrative scenario in India and locates his theme on poverty in that context. Radical redistribution of land

and other productive assets would provide them rural poor with better economic and social security but, he admits that, this would require a change in government policy and lot of empathy and sensitivity on the part of administration and enforcement agency. The author is very much confident, that in spite of built-in-biases in a feudal class-dominated rural society and apathy in the bureaucracy, mass literacy campaign used as a tool for empowering the rural poor can overcome these persistent hurdles.

Gaur's edited volume consisting of 17 research papers, covers the most important facets of rural economy of India. Authors in different chapters examine the impact of various development programmes on the target groups. The main thrust of the volume is that, although there has been some improvement in general economic activity in the country, the structural problem of rural economy could not be solved to despite planned efforts for rural development over more than 4 decades.

The edited volume of Prasad including 15 important contributions of experts makes an indepth analysis and highlight the important constraints of rural development. Prasad contends that the analysis of constraints is relevant for the multitude of socio-economic programmes of the government for the rural poor.

In order to understand the impact of economic growth on poverty, it is important to measure separately the impact of changes in average income and income inequality on poverty. Kakwani-Subbarao make an attempt in this direction. They examine past trends in distribution and growth of consumption and assess their relative impact on the poor over time and across states. Their study addresses several pertinent questions on rural poverty. They consider the potential indirect role of agriculture and manufacturing, as well as the contribution of anti-poverty programmes that have been in operation for over a decade now and the trends in social sector expenditures and their outcomes.

Chadha has set himself to focus firmly on the case of Punjab since independence, to study in depth its rural economic transformation. His book is very interesting not only because it is buffrased by facts and figures and backed by sound analysis, but also because its objectives are very clear. It provides a thorough narration of the Punjab model of development.

Book of authored by Mandal addresses itself to the various issues and evaluate rural development in relation

to the response to the various approaches and programmes in rural development. It looks at some issues like: community versus market, self-sufficiency, land reforms, rural credit growth with equity and decentralised planning. It adopts a descriptive rather than an analytical approach to the issues.

2.6 RURAL HEALTH:

Jain's edited volume 121 is the outcome of the set of seven papers presented in an international conference held at Kuala Lumpur, 1990. The volume deals with the quality of care and measuring and monitoring the quality of services along with the definition and impact of quality of care in population programmes. The last chapter (written by Parveen Visaria and Leela Visaria) makes an exploratory analysis of quality of Family Planning services in Gujarat state. The authors observe that the information provided to rural couples is in reality conditioned by the targets of the programme shift for different methods of family Planning (F.P). Though the quality of care offered by the health and family planning works in rural areas is often characterised as poor, they argue that the dissatisfaction among the Family Planning acceptors in the villages are extremely low.

According to Jain, quality of FP service involves six elements; easily understandable information given to clients, assurance of provider's technical competence, positive interpersonal relations, availability of adequate choice of contraceptive methods, adequate follow-up, mechanism and appropriate constellation of services. Judithe Bruce, in her paper, forcefully argues for integrating women's interest into the FP programmes. Giridhar focuses on strategic interventions to enhance the service-quality and recommends for the "responsibility centres", to be created outside the routine bureaucracy.

Daniels in his book 122 argues that there are a number of macro decisions that need to be considered while designing a health-care system. These macro decisions determine (a) what kind of health care services will exist in a society, (b) who will get them and on what basis (c) who will deliver them, (d) how the burden of financing them will be distributed and (e) how the power and control of these services will be distributed. These decisions which critically affect the level and distribution of our well-being involves issues of social justice. 123 These issues of social justice are: how much of equality should there be? What inequalities in access to health care are morally acceptable? How should the burden of achieving

123. Ibid. p.8.
that equality be distributed? The author says that we are yet to evolve a framework and a set of principles which may serve as a "public and final" basis for resolving disagreements about how basic institutions such as health institutions should be designed. So far there appears to be no consensus on any set of principles to resolve the conflicting claims advanced by different groups within a society.

Muraleedharan in his paper¹²⁴ that the purpose of public policy both in market and non-market economies has always been to reduce barriers in access to health care. To achieve this purpose, another addressers two pertinent questions: What does equality of access to health care mean? What can be done to promote equality of access? The author argues that the indispensable element for establishing an equitable and sustainable health care system is to introduce checks and regulations to protect the interests of the user as well as the providers (of both market-driven and centrally controlled). Providing equal access to health care to all sections of the society is fraught with all kinds of complex conceptual, measurement and ethical problems. Ultimately, he concludes, the political and community commitment and involvement determines the foundation for a fair health care system.¹²⁵

¹²⁵. Ibid, p.1296.
Jones and Moon in their study deal with some measures of equality of access to health care. They consider: (1) equality of public expenditure, (2) equality of cost of health care, (3) equality of physical acceptability, (4) equality of use and (5) equality of outcome. The first one results in allocation of the available resources to the members of the society in equal proportion. The second one implies that the cost of obtaining a health service should be the same for all individuals. While it established equality in terms of cost of care, it ignores the principle of ability to pay. The authors argue that use of health services is a direct consequence of proximity to those resources. Travelling a long distance to make use of a health care facility affects the actual use of it, for it involves loss of time, effort and money. This deficiency can be remedied by recognising the social groups for whom distance is a major barrier to access and locating the facilities in discrete positions. Thus measuring inequality of access is very useful for micro level understanding of the prevailing conditions.

A recent study of Griffith laments that if maternal and child health, rural health services and control of infectious diseases are high priorities in health policy of government of India, the policies have not yet been effectively

127 Ibid. p.242.
translated into budget priorities. It finds a strong urban bias. It finds that states with higher infant mortality notes are spending lower per capita and these states also have a low per capita income. He observes a negative relation between per capita income and infant mortality. Apart from suggesting that urban spending be frozen and that expenditures are targeted to rural areas it offers two specific suggestion to promote equity in health care: (1) user fees and insurance can be used to support Private good, with government funds allocated to programmes that provide benefits extending beyond individuals. (ii) government should target its expenditure effectively to poorest areas and those with the worst health indicators. The study urges the central government to play a much larger role to improve the health status of poor, as they cannot expect much benefits from the private sector. Such a policy, the study suggests, is a better way of dealing with equity issues.

ICSSR - ICMR study observes that there is no health education programme in India worth the name. It hardly reaches the masses of rural people especially the poor. It

128. Griffith CC (1992) Health care in Asia: a comparative study of cost and financing, The World Bank, p.120.
highlights that overwhelming evidence of health education effectiveness is marked contrast to the paucity of health education efficiency. This is explained due to the fact that health educators lack the skills for educational diagnosis. The Policy implications, the study highlights, is to spend more on health education. Health education is one of the neglected areas. It can no longer be justified purely on humanitarian ground. In fact, it plays, the study concludes that, a complementary role in the delivery of health services, be it curative or preventive. It is true that preventive medicine is not always cost effective from the standpoint of both society and individual. But health education can/should be part of preventive as well as promotive strategy. It can stand on its own as the better alternative to other intervention options.

Roger in his famous compendium seeks to provide the first detailed account of Indian health services since 1947. First part of the book describes the place of indigenous system and role of colonial state. The second part explores the health policy in India since independence. The successive chapters deal with health plan and expenditures, the politics of medicine in India, the health service structure medical education and training and India's place in World health economy. His concept of politics

remain confined to Pressure groups and interest group and the peccadilloes of peculiar individuals, utterly ignoring the categories which subsume them. He holds up the case of malaria and small pox eradication programmes to put forward the very tenuous claim that foreign agencies did not really set health priorities.

Antia in his study\textsuperscript{132} believes that entire emphasis of medical training is entirely on cure and not on prevention. The modern hospitals only deals with the tip of the iceberg. The medical profession has neither the training nor capability to deliver health care to our common rural people. The sophisticated urban medical services monopolised by the elite class, in the absence of a generalised scientific culture and in the presence of an archaic administrative infrastructure, ended up in a poor caricature of western model. All welfare measures including health care has become a large and profitable business. The medical profession working in splendid isolation has failed to perceive health in its wider perspective. The author holds that the failure to deliver health care especially to the population is because of the dearth of appropriate strategies and a lack of professional and political will.\textsuperscript{133}


\textsuperscript{133} Ibid. p.2237.
Anita and Bhatia's book offers the rich experiences of ten striking examples of community based health care projects, being carried out in various parts of India, that have literally transformed the overall well being of the people and areas of their concern. The significance of the book is three fold: (a) It gives a clear diagnosis of the maladies from which our health care system suffers, (b) It demonstrates through several case studies how such maladies can be overcome effectively with people's involvement; this forms the second section of the book covering experiences of 10 NGOs, and (c) It offers the distilled wisdom to the policy makers and builds an alternative model for health care that can not only help the country to achieve the goal of "health for all", but more importantly without any substantial increase in the budgetary allocation for health care sector. Authors have faith on the Panchayat raj system, which facilitates devolution of power. Truth is that PRIs have not been given a chance to serve as the vanguard of development in India. An effective panchayat raj, where employees work under open surveillance of the people, can alone mobilise people's effort for their individual and mutual benefit.

135. Ibid. p.277.
George in one of his paper looks into the specifics of Maharastra's development in health in the context of other socio-economic indicators to examine the relationship between health sector development and capitalist growth. In his recent study he explores various dimensions of health care in India, with a particular reference to its state of Madhya Pradesh. It focuses on household health expenditure in two districts of Madhya Pradesh, namely Sagar and Morena. It is the outcome of a research project sponsored by DANIDA. It covers 770 households comprising a population of 5202, with 62.08% hailing from rural areas. Its reference period is August 1990 and Jan 1991. The study points out that health care comprises 8.95% and 7.7% of the monthly expenditure. The prevalence of morbidity is 311 per thousand. The ratio of direct to indirect expenditure on health care is 81:19. It does not match with earlier study of NSSO or NCAER. The methodological vigour of the study lends credibility to its conclusions. The study points out that difference in perception of illness is partly due to socio-economic status of individuals. As the class status increases it is found that there is an increase in the mean cost per illness episode, mean cost per visit and the mean annual per capita expenditure.


Purohit and Siddique in their analysis of macro level informations hold that the pattern of utilisation in India has some desirable outcomes, namely, growing popularity of indigenous non-allopathic systems and growth in private sectors involvement in expensive tertiary care. As against the national health policy guidelines the regional disparities in health service utilisation among different expenditure groups of states as well as rural urban disparities tend to continue. Further the authors contend that in spite of inadequacy of health services and prevalence of inequality in utilisation, there has been no serious governmental initiative to encourage appropriate utilisation by means of devising health insurance and other cost recovery mechanism. There lies therefore, an urgent need to carefully into some of these aspects such that the policy guidelines could be really implemented in a satisfactory manner.

Gopalan in his paper hold that health system of most of the developing countries have come under increasing strain in recent year. All health programmes have had their deleterious repercussions on public health. He argues that as we move to the next century we face a cruel paradox that despite growing prosperity and spectacular technological

advances, the task of ensuring health and well-being for the citizens of the world is becoming even more difficult, expensive and complicated than ever before. We have to conquer some "old enemies" to public health and face new challenges of public health. This will demand greater national vigilance and increased international cooperation.

The contention of Rohdi-Chatterjee-Morley is that reaching the goal of health for all by 2000 AD in India is an impossibility. As of 1994, of 860 million people not more than 5% have access to basic sanitation facilities and no more than 30% have access to safe drinking water. Their edited book (with 22 essays contributed by 28 authors) has twin issues as the guiding goals of narrating the experiences of various national, international and community based programmes: under what conditions can development projects aimed at improving people's health can succeed? and how can such programmes be replicated and sustained over a period of time? The authors have demonstrated that political determination is an absolute necessity to achieve the stated goals. A holistic approach should be adopted to health. We need to adopt more rapidly proven effective interventions, not merely for the sake of saving material resources, but for the sake of saving lives of millions of helpless people. The issue of balancing between efficiency and equity must be evolved subject to specific local conditions and needs.

2.7 RURAL ENVIRONMENT:

Streefkerk's edited volume¹⁴¹ is a significant collection on health and energy programmes in India. It consists of 13 papers from authoritative researchers in their respective fields. They deal with various rural energy and rural health programmes undertaken by the public authority, some of the papers focus on the experiences of Gujrat state. Its value lies in the meticulously compiled details of what happens in the field level and why.

Rao in his recent book¹⁴² with 13 papers deals with five broad themes: agricultural growth, rural poverty, environmental degradation, participatory rural development, and economic reforms in relation to agriculture. All these themes are very much relevant to the present study. It makes a fairly successful attempt at an unified view of present status of Indian agriculture and action required to improve its performance. Growth and poverty interact with environment in complex ways. Poverty alleviation and environmental standards can be improved by participatory rural development through local panchayat raj institutions.


The author concedes that rural environment is a cause of great concern. Deforestation is a greater threat than chemicalisation of agriculture in India. Major reason for the pressure on forest and CPRs today is not so much to raise the supply of food, as it is to provide a source of livelihood. He observes that beneficial efforts of input subsidies have now been more than outweighed by adverse effects, not only in terms of macro-economic imbalances but also in terms of inefficient use of resources resulting in environmental degradation. One of his strong recommendation to improve the performance of India agriculture combined with social justice and environmental improvement is to step up public investment in infrastructure particularly in irrigation, in research and extension. He is very optimistic that bio-technology has the potential of a pro-poor bias and environmental soundness.

Banarjee and Parikh in their paper 143 holds that India needs to seriously consider demand side management (DSM) options to meet the growing electricity requirements. He plans out a DSM plan for the high tension industries in Maharashtra. Ten DSM options have been considered and programme costs have been included for each DSM options.

Miran and Chandrasekhar analyses the growth experience of Indian agriculture and its implications for growth, equity and sustainability. They examine the association between growth and instability and factors behind yield instability, using cropwise and disaggregated time series data. They analyse the cost economics of Indian agriculture covering several crops and regions. The authors observe that while irrigated crops and those with access to modern farm technology have dominated the growth process, dry crops and drought-prone regions like Karnataka in South India to have shared the gains of agricultural growth. But this growth process has been accompanied by higher instability in yields and increasing costs of cultivation. After analysing the factors responsible for this, they discuss the various strategies and interventions needed to accelerate and promote sustained agricultural growth under diverse environments and constraints.

Bhattacharya contends that over dependence on traditional sources and non-availability of commercial energy in rural areas have resulted in low energy consumption in India. Since the rural component dominates the total consumption only region-specific village studies can clearly highlight

the constraints affecting the consumption of non-commercial and non-conventional energy. The author estimates the total cost incurred by the rural economy of Sirsi in Jaipur district (Rajasthan) on energy consumption from a linear programming exercise by obtaining the optimal consumption pattern of energy sources subject to fulfilment of different demand and availability constraints.

The paper of Mundle¹⁴⁶ taken stock of what the developing countries have learned from experiments with interventionist policy and discusses some crucial issues in the development debate, namely, the role of the state—vis—a—vis the market agriculture versus industry and import substitution versus export-led growth. Mundle holds that economics of development emerged in a milieu of market failures, following the great depression and now deal of 1930s, when societies in the east as well as the west and north as well as south embraced the idea of the interventionist state. He argues that apart from marking macro-economic stability, government in developing countries must intervene in sectors like health care, education, infrastructural development and conservation of environment.

Das in his edited volume¹⁴⁷ consisting of 12 chapters each contributed by eminent scholars in the field, discusses the causes and consequences of ecological crisis which is

the most crucial concern all over the world today. The authors focussing their experience on different dimension of environmental degradation of different countries and regions have emphasised the need to have an ecosystem approach to economic development and offer practical insights into the ecosystem framework as an appropriate development alternative.

Although environmental issues are now the focus of alternation we coherent perspective on the interaction between society and environment has yet emerged. Sen's edited volume is an attempt in this direction. The volume consists of five parts. Papers of Vandana Shiva, Pereira, Kapial Vatsyayan, Suneet Chopra, Ray Burmon and David Turner etc. enriches the book. The volume ends with a lively and informal conversation with Medha Patkar, who recounts how the mass movement against the Narmada Project emanated from steady tribal alienation created by development. The book thus looks at environmental problem from the perspective of the people whose fate is directly linked to the environment.

2.8 OBSCURANTIST APPROACHES IN INDIA:

All plans and methodologies deal with questions of productivity, income and employment. The environmental issues are not explicitly incorporated in the plan strategies. The relative neglect of the management of natural resources and an obscurantist approach to the vital dimension of environmental preservation reflects the magnitude of our reckless plundering of natural resources. It indicates at least why man has endangered the environment to this crisis proportion. If one examines the planning approach in this light, then all the methodologies can be rated as surrogate mirrors of our mind regarding depletion of natural resources, ecological imbalance and environmental degradation.

Developmental activities are desirable only when consideration of environmental sustainability and resource management have been built-into the development programmes. Environmental preservation and natural resource management should receive due importance at all levels in a multi-level planning superstructures as they partake the nature of public goods, and have externalities.

Bhahme's approach to district planning, which was adopted to build marthawada Regional Plan, took the

explicit note of environmental considerations. It is very critical to econometric approaches. It emphasises to projects and their implementation with the help of cooperatives. The emphasis is on an integrated approach where preservation of environmental and natural resources, human capital formation and industrial growth along with agricultural growth all together constitute the planning process. Strategy favoured in this methodology is that in both the agricultural and non-agricultural sectors, rise in productivity and employment has to be brought about, while underlining that the conservation of natural resources should constitute an integral part of the entire exercise.

Gadgil's approach, which was adopted for the preparation of the well-known Wardha Plan rejected the 'projects to strategies' approach. His approach consists of four interlinked aspects (i) physiographic plan, (ii) plan for conservation of natural resources, (iii) plan for productive activity and (iv) programme for the provision of adequate employment. It asserts that the district plan is not a summation of the lists of the departmental schemes. The conservation and development of natural resources have the strongest and most explicit exposition in his methodology. Second stage of Gadgil's approach out of seven stages in the formulation of integrated district plan, starting from a "Physio-geographic plan" down to "coordination and synchronization", exclusively relates to conservation of
natural resources. The approach draws much from the theory of sectoral inter-connectivity which emphasises production externalities.

Methodology prescribed by Dantawala Committee, is at the other extreme. It advocates the 'strategies to Projects' approach for planning at the sub-district level, assuming away the existence of any on going planning process, where natural resources are explicitly sought to be utilised intensively. This methodology neglects the aspects of conservation and management of natural resources. But it argues to prepare a "resource inventory, where the inventory' is a basic document on the basis of which specific action programmes, centering round the most predominant activity of the locality can be built. Resources in the 'inventory' presumably constitutes natural, human and material resources.

The AVARD methodology, which underlines the preparation of well known Mushari Plan and East Block Plans accepts projects to strategy "approach. It envisages fairly detailed analysis by sectors followed by coordination reconciliation, reorganisation and articulation of the

150. It is not a methodology in the strict sense of the term. But it has caused rural development through growth of agriculture and agro-based industries, within an integrated area plan framework. Considerable emphasis on employment for the "Antyodaya" Family and the non-working womenfold in the rural sector imparts the plan texture of "target-group" approach,
results of the process in a strategic context. There is no reference to and analysis of 'environmental sustainability.' It is more a manual for preparing a block plan, rather than a methodology per se. The absence of formal area economic analysis sectoral analysis and project identification can lead to an inadequate understanding of intersectoral implications of problems needs and project proposals.

The Rayalaseema Methodology, built upon planning for an inter-district region, is based upon the implicit assumption of natural resource management. It lays emphasis on choice of techniques. Unlike other approaches, it is explicit with regard to both local area analysis and the tools to be employed in planning at the sub-state level. It assumes non-existence of any planning exercise at the relevant level. So it does not prescribe to use such data and studies as may be already available.

The NIRD methodology, which was, in its earlier version adopted for formulating Raichur plan, does not per se deal


152. Venugopal Reddy prepared the plan for Rajalasemma region. He delineated the primary and secondary activities in agriculture on the basis of agro-climatic conditions. He argued for the most desirable growth rate of income and the corresponding investment requirement, and sector wise allocation of investment to be determined on the basis of potentialities.

153. This approach belongs to the growth centre-approach advocated by Lalit Sen and others for a very long time. It is the traditional approach of the Hyderabad-Mysore nexus.
with natural resource management. It moves from objectives, goals, strategies to projects and enjoins the concept of 'vested Plans'. Though it argues to take cognizance of peoples perception yet it does not provide any convenient mechanism for ensuring peoples participation and collective wisdom of local people.

The Dharampur Methodology\textsuperscript{154} assumes non existence of any planning and pays very little attention to natural resources management. It is observed from the detailed questionnaire prescribed by it for conducting village survey and collecting, primary data. It admits 'strategies to projects' approach and favours "cluster approach" rather than individual beneficiary-oriented schemes. It rejects any predetermined course of action for each household.

Misra Madel clearly belongs to the category of strategy to projects" approach, but without any natural resource management consideration. This model puts emphasis on identifying thrust areas and target groups of the local area. Once it is done, appropriate projects shall be ascertained. This approach in area planning approach by and large, with hierarchy of targets.

Gujrat model's main thrust is on development of agriculture. The criteria for allocation of resources between districts (Taluks lays profound emphasis on

\textsuperscript{154} It was experimental in Dharampur Taluk of Valsad district of Gujrat.
agricultural backwardness" and "irrigational backwardness". It envisages a three-tier planning superstructure: State plans, district plans and taluka Plans. This circumvents the limitation of data-non-availability at sub-district level, by introducing the "village-Amenities survey", in terms of which it identifies 73 basic village amenities and compiles computerises and updates them on an annual basis. However this model does not explicitly deal with either natural resource management or with issues relating to environmental preservation.

Karnatak Model is too well-known to be dealt here. It admits two components in the district planning exercise Zilla Parishad component and Mandal Panchayat component. While the former conforms to "strategies to projects" and the latter conforms to projects to strategies. This methodology envisages a well-defined planning procedure which encompasses identification of area, developmental needs, preparation, prioritisation and monitoring of projects. It puts sufficient emphasis on the capacity of Panchayat Raj Institutions rather than on technical methods. It envisages a unique system of monitoring plan implementation. But very clear that the model does not explicitly deal with natural resource management and environmental issues.

The West Bengal methodology puts profound emphasis on project identification at village and block levels.
Projectisation receives top priority and planning per se is a casualty. It realises that numerous problems that best our rural economy do not admit solutions at one-go and cannot be tackled concurrently. They have to be dealt on the logic of first things first. By project prioritisation people at village, panchayat and block levels ensure that most pressing problems are solved first, which is not possible under planning from above. Project prioritisation is the best articulation of felt needs of the common man which is the critical element in any decentralised planning framework. It requires no preconditions of national priority setting, clearance and technical and bureaucratic assistance as is otherwise very necessary. This methodology provides the required beeway and flexibility to launch decentralised planning at the district and sub-district level without providing far a huge planning machinery and system of checks and balances. Being product oriented, this methodology tends to be symptomatic in its prescription for solutions of development problems rather than preventive or anticipating. It may losssight of the general path of

156. In Westbengal methodology, the institutional arrangements for articulation, formulation and administration of the plan at district and sub-district levels have been fairly well stabilised. It focus on achieving development through raising, the consciousness of the people, through eliminating the state of assetlessness' of the rural poor and through socio-economic transformation of the social framework.
development and may fail to work out a development scenario for the territory being planned for. Therefore this methodology, does not explicitly, emphasise the environmental issue.

Thus much of these studies are based on a straightforward extension of conventional welfare-theoretic models encapsulating problems of rural poverty and rural development in general. Uptill now comprehensive attempts at building an integrated model in a dynamic setting with a holistic approach have been exceptionally rare. The present work draws heavily from many useful studies cited above. It is not the primary purpose of this study to criticise the previous studies, nor goes it have any pretentions of having a comprehensive coverage. Rather the purpose is to provide an overview of barely sufficient breadth and depth to introduce the arguments in subsequent chapters.