Chapter 5
Summary and Conclusions

In society, social work carries out a task based on its ethical foundation which includes promotion of social justice and equality, alleviation of inequality and defending of the less well-off. Everything starts from the principle of human dignity (SOSNET, 2004).

The Social Work profession “promotes social change, problem solving in human relationships and the empowerment and liberation of people to enhance well-being. Utilizing theories of human behavior and social systems, social work intervenes at the points where people interact with their environments. Principles of human rights and social justice are fundamental to social work.” As such, social workers are a key component of modern social service provision. Among other things, they provide counseling, assist individuals in accessing social services and other benefits, lobby for the disenfranchised, and engage in actions designed to influence social policies (USAID, 2008, 1).

5.1 Summary

Part I of the concluding chapter of the study on profile and job satisfaction of Childline personnel thesis will present the salient findings based on analysis of data obtained from Childline Project personnel. Childline Projects operate to render assistance to children in distress. The personnel of Childline are employed by the NGO.
5.1.1 Support to City-based Childline Projects

It was found that across the six variables, the personnel indicated that support to City-based Childline was mostly 'occasionally'. However, the Supervisors indicated that support was always received (15.79 per cent) and 'frequently' (21.05 per cent). This operational issue needs attention as Childline is a partnership model; support and cooperation are critical to the success of the helpline.

5.1.2 Commensurate Pay

The responses indicate that pay was not considered as commensurate to work (Table 4.3). Since Childline is an emergency helpline, an adequate personnel compensation package is essential to not only attract qualified professionals but to render quality services under the project with commitment.

5.1.3 Motivation to Work

Motivation among personnel is recognized as an essential element in organisational development. The analysis of responses of Childline personnel indicates that females are more motivated (63.89 per cent) as compared to males (47.71 per cent). All age groups reported high level of motivation to work. The motivation to work was higher in personnel with more experience (41.67 per cent). There was no difference in terms of marital status for motivation to work. Similarly, both the designation groups – Supervisors and DSPs reported fairly high percentage of response (47.37 & 52.38 per cent).
5.1.4 Conditions for Enhancing Job Performance

The responses of personnel indicated that a majority of them favoured hierarchy, "revised / hiked pay & perks" and 'skill / information training". While all the Supervisors favoured a revised pay, about 87.3 per cent DSPs also indicated revised pay as a condition. The other options chosen were "better service conditions" (DSP: 80.00 per cent; Supervisor: 36.84 per cent) and 'vehicle for calls' (DSP: 57.14 per cent; Supervisor: 68.42 per cent). The ranking of conditions highlighted that emphasis on revised / hiked pay followed by skill training. The responses were unanimous that pay revision is an important factor for job performance.

5.1.5 Correlation of CLP Data

The age-wise data on personnel matters showed positive correlation between age group of ‘upto 20 years’ with ‘31 to 40 years’ (r=1.00, p< 0.01 level). Similarly, the age group of '20 - 30 years' with '41 to 50 years' (r=0.67, p< 0.01 level). The age-wise CLP data for Operational issues showed that age group 'upto 20 years' had a positive correlation with age group "20 to 30 years' (r=0.80, p< 0.01 level). The correlation between males and females on CLP data showed that of the three categories, personnel matters and operational issues had a positive correlation (r=0.85, p<0.01 level; r=0.67, p<0.01 level respectively). The categories which had positive correlation were personnel matters and project implementation (r=56, p<0.05 level; r=70, p<0.05 level respectively). The correlation between DSPs and Supervisors indicated
positive correlation for the category of Project implementation ($r=0.78$, $p<0.01$ level). The correlation of educational level of personnel for personnel matters, only 'under metric' with 'matric + Inter' and 'graduation' was found significant ($r=0.95$, $p<0.01$; $r=0.66$, $p<0.01$). In the project implementation category, the correlation of educational group of 'under matric' with "matric+Inter", "graduate' and "PG+' were found to be significant. The education group of 'matric+Inter' with 'graduation' and 'PG+' was also found significant (Table 4.14). The correlation of work experience (in months) for personnel matters indicated significance for "37 – 60 months" group with 'more than 60 months' group ($r=0.87$, $p<0.01$ level). Correlation was also found significant in the project implementation and operational issues categories (Table 4.15).

5.6 Salient findings on Job Satisfaction

Job satisfaction was measured using the Job Satisfaction Scale (Singh & Sharma, 1990). Mean, Standard Deviation and 't'- test were used for analysis. Job satisfaction in terms of the six independent variables is briefly indicated.

5.6.1 Gender

The overall job satisfaction on gender & job satisfaction indicated that males were found to have higher degree of satisfaction as compared to females ($t=2.06$, $p<0.05$, $N=145$).
5.6.2 Age
Almost all 't' values were found insignificant. However, middle-aged personnel of Childline Project have higher job satisfaction as compared to the younger and older colleagues.

5.6.3 Experience
Table 4.18 shows that with the increase in experience, the degree of satisfaction goes up proportionately in case of total job satisfaction and all its components.

5.6.4 Marital Status
Though married personnel were found to have high degree of job satisfaction as compared to their counterparts (unmarried personnel), the difference was found to be insignificant (Table 4.19 7 Figure 4.3).

5.6.5 Designation Groups – Supervisors & DSPs
Supervisors had a high degree of satisfaction as compared to Direct Service Providers (DSPs). However, DSPs had considerably higher degree of satisfaction on intrinsic variables which indicates that DSPs work selflessly without gains and rewards.

5.6.6 Education
A gradual increase in degree of job satisfaction corresponding to the level of educational qualification can be observed. Otherwise, education level did not display the significant impact on job satisfaction.
5.2 Conclusions

5.2.1 Dynamic Model

The findings of the study described in the earlier section clearly indicated that the personnel working in the Childline find the work climate highly unsupportive. Furthermore, for the Direct Service Providers, these findings are based on only dissatisfaction with personal matters. There is reason to believe that these personnel find it difficult to work effectively in Childline. There is extensive evidence that lack of job satisfaction and inappropriate job-oriented skill make the personnel low performers. The first set of studies revealed that, on one hand, Childline Organisations are struggling with unfavourable working conditions, on the other hand, the supportive agencies are also not providing sufficient support for comfortable working. Based on the findings, the fact emerges that inadequate functioning of Childline or delayed help to the children has to be considered by taking the factors such as low job satisfaction, poor motivation, deficiency in job-oriented, skill-based training and existence of not-so-congenial working conditions for Childline Project Personnel. Figure 5.1 presents a model to explain the inadequate functioning of Childline Project and as a result delayed justice to the victims.

The model as presented in Figure 5.1 has been conceptualized as a dynamic model. It postulates that inadequacy in personnel matters and low job satisfaction may result from forces operating in work climate or due to dissatisfaction with personal matters. Poor motivation will not allow the personnel to work dynamically. Also because of poor
motivation, the skills required for effective performance will not result into reality at field-level and, as a result, influence the performance of Childline Project Personnel.

The model also postulates that inappropriate skills required for effective implementation on the part of DSPs will get influenced negatively. This may happen two ways. Firstly, it is possible that because of poor or negative motivational level, the DSPs may not feel enthusiastic of perform to their capacities at field level on the other hand in the absence job specific skills, the personnel may find it difficult in certain situations to perform effectively resulting in perceived stressing work climate. Since majority of the Childline Organizations are run by NGO's and they are depending on funds provided by the Government on the one hand, and on the other hand they need support from agencies such as CIF, CAB and other supportive agencies as city level, which do not come forward as and when required. Any breakdown in this support may
result in demotivation of DSPs and creates a stressing work environment.

5.2.2 Childline Project Administration and Personnel
Childline India Foundation follows a well-planned process to introduce Childline Services in a city. The due diligence also involves, among other things, identification of city-level Childline organisations to implement the Project. The Childline Project also prescribes the minimum criteria for filling the posts provided in the Childline Project, the broad physical setup, location of call centre in proximity to shelters for children, the duty-plan for the personnel manning the 24 hour Call Centre etc.

However, a key aspect that emerged from the study is the issue of personnel policies such as perks, entitlements, increments, paid leave, facilities for free travel; health-related benefits for self and family etc. These aspects are left to the concerned NGO. While organisations with adequate resources can implement these personnel policies, NGOs which face fund crunch are forced to limit and not offer the best to their employees. This can be addressed by corporate support for Childline NGOs so that programmes and personnel benefit along with children.

5.2.3 Factors affecting Childline Project Personnel
The Case workload for Childline personnel is not worked-out. The nature of receipt of calls over phone is unpredictable. Moreover, Childline India
Foundation (CIF) has not stipulated caseload for neither the Supervisors group nor for Direct Service Providers. There is indeed a practical difficulty in setting caseload for personnel as their job responsibility is not fixed and generally, roles among (and not between) the two groups (Supervisors & Direct Service Providers) are interchangeable.

The recruitment and management of staff is the function of the Childline Organisation. CIF has only the responsibility of capacity building of these personnel to keep them updated of developments. Legal protection of personnel, access to legal counsel, special ear-marked funds for welfare of personnel and other issues are a grey area. Retaining staff is the responsibility of the Childline organisation, which is, in turn, responsible for outcome of the efforts. There is a gap in liability, knowledge enhancement, incentives to personnel.

The Project is funded fully by the Ministry of Women and Child Development, Government of India. However, several budgetary aspects concerning professional Social Workers are meagre. The legal protection available to Government servants is unavailable to Childline personnel though they deal with typical cases of trafficking, child labour, bonded labour etc. These issues are left to the organisation employing Childline personnel to tackle.

Salaries are not commensurate with the work demands. In fact, they cannot be equated to minimum wages for un-skilled and semi-skilled
workers. The personnel need to undergo training / obtained educational qualifications as prescribed and work with children / people. The application of professional skills in relationships, counseling etc. and case management including documentation is of paramount importance.

Child welfare services such as Childline Project need professional personnel to meet the challenges of children in distress, abused or neglected. Unfortunately, due to various considerations such as budgetary constraints, project costs, availability of professional Social Workers for low-paying jobs such as the Childline Project, the personnel tend to have practical orientation and a zeal to work with children in distress. Even though, unemployment is rampant and the demand-supply situation for Social Workers is fair with Social Worker students passing-out from Schools of Social Work, the acceptance of low salaries, below-par working conditions, lack of incentives and lack of upward mobility, Childline Project is unlikely to attract talented professionals into its fold. The West is also facing a similar trend and difficulty. "... child welfare agencies have difficulty in recruiting and retaining qualified staff. This is due to high caseloads, poor working conditions, limited resources, low salaries, declassified positions, policy and values confusion, no clear career path, and lack of quality supervision. Furthermore, the expanding opportunities for professional social workers in a variety of practice areas, combined with the difficulty of working in child welfare, often leads social workers toward other fields of practice" (SWPI, 2010).
The requirement of minimum qualifications in Social Work for personnel manning child welfare services is an open subject. The challenge is not only confined to Indian Social Workers. In US, surveys have found that though child welfare services are identified as "a social work domain, yet less than 30 percent of child welfare workers have professional social work degrees (BSW or MSW). In some states (of US), the number of professional social workers in public child welfare is as low as three percent, with fewer than 15 percent of states requiring a BSW or MSW degree for any child welfare position' (CWLA, 1999).

5.2.4 Way Forward
The findings of the study enabled an understanding of profile and job satisfaction among Childline Project personnel. Concomitantly, as Herzberg stated in his Motivation – Hygiene theory (the Two-Factor Theory), certain implications can be drawn for employers of Childline Personnel. Herzberg, in the Two-Factor theory had recommended job enrichment as an answer to foster and sustain job satisfaction. "Herzberg argued that job enrichment is required for intrinsic motivation, and that it is a continuous management process. According to Herzberg, the job should have sufficient challenge to utilize the full ability of the employee. Employees who demonstrate increasing levels of ability should be given increasing levels of responsibility. If a job cannot be designed to use an employee's full abilities, then the firm should consider automating the task or replacing the employee with one who has a lower level of skill. If a person cannot be fully utilized, then
there will be a motivation problem' (Netmba, 2002). Childline Project Organisations can consider job enrichment to raise potential and contribution of their personnel for better professional services to children of the country.