CHAPTER VII

Staffing Needs of Police Forces

I. Introduction

1.1. Definition: In order to survive and prosper, every organization needs well qualified, trained and highly motivated employees available in right numbers and at the right time. It is the management responsibility of 'Staffing' that ensures this. "Staffing is a function by which managers build an organization through recruitment, selection and development of individuals as capable employees."\(^1\) It is needless to say that the success of an organization depends on how well the role is performed by those structurally responsible for it. The truth of this statement can be tested by a close scrutiny of the working of any organization which hires a large number of employees. Modern police forces which are growing rapidly provide scope for such an exercise.

1.2. Need for a Sound Staffing Policy for the Police: As briefly mentioned in Chapter II, society and its processes have become highly complex. This has placed great demands on the Police leading to its growth in geometric proportions. A modern police force is now characterised by the following:

a. multiplicity of functions;

b. increasing intensity of operations; and

c. an enormous geographic dispersal of its personnel.

\(^1\) Dalton E. McFarland, p.238.
Staffing tasks become difficult in an organization of this nature because the system is becoming more and more impersonal. This situation is highly detrimental to the efficiency of an organization from which the public expects service of a high quality because it ultimately results in a mismatch of objectives.

Chapter II indicates how police image in India is not particularly good. An average Indian policeman at the lower level is regarded as brutal, corrupt, unhelpful and unintelligent. It is therefore clear that unless the quality of the individuals coming into the Force is sufficiently high, its image would not improve. We also know that a large number of recruits are not able to acquit themselves well because they are either overworked or not have the required incentive of quick career advancement to increase hardship and strive towards increased productivity. Very often such a situation is attributable to an unimaginative staffing policy. This emphasizes the need for a system approach to the problem and developments in the area of modern Management science provide the framework for such a system. It is against this background that recruitment, selection and career planning policies of police forces in India are proposed to be analysed here with a view to highlighting how a few modern Management techniques may help to fill the obvious lacunae now noticed. The fourth aspect of staffing, viz., personnel development which is synonymous mostly with training, will be examined in the next chapter. This is because it is a subject that needs elaboration by itself.
2.1.1. General: Commissions appointed to study the working of the Police in different parts of the world, including the U.K. Royal Commission (1960) and the U.S. President's Commission on Law Enforcement and the Administration of Justice (1967), have been near unanimous that Forces do not attract the best of talent available in the field. The Royal Commission was in particular exercised that this should be so when every other profession was able to get a fair share of the bright young men and women passing out each year from schools and colleges.² (This is the crux of the problem that faces the present-day police personnel manager, viz., how to ensure that individuals of real merit, academic and otherwise, are persuaded to seek positions in the Police and stay on in the Force). This is true not of the lower echelons alone but same is the case with regard to higher ranks. For instance, in the Indian Police to which, unlike in U.K. or U.S.A., there is direct entry to the top levels, a majority of recruits to the elitist Indian Police Service (I.P.S.) are those who had aspired to join the more prestigious Indian Administrative Service (I.A.S.) but who, for some reason or the other, had failed to do so. There is also the phenomenon of a number of I.P.S. probationers migrating to the I.A.S. and other civil services while being trained at the Police Academy, Hyderabad.

This Researcher spent considerable time in studying the history of premier police forces in the world including those in the U.S.A. and U.K. His study revealed the distressing fact that the initial attempt to hire young men with very modest educational attainments is the main factor which explains the current situation. This legacy of the past coupled with an apparent indifference on the part of governments who have been complacent because of the large number of applicants to police jobs has militated against any attempt at reforms, particularly the scientific study of jobs and the application of modern Management concepts.

2.1.2. Job Analysis: The most striking lacuna in the present practices is the failure to analyse the content of each job in a Force and its requirements. Governments and the police leadership have been satisfied with merely laying down minimum physical and educational requirements. It is true that a few Commissions such as the National Police Commission (1977) and other bodies such as the Committee on Police Training (1973) in India have attempted an analysis of the duties and responsibilities of superior and subordinate levels in the Police. But these have been far too general in nature and do not take into account the special requirements of the various categories of personnel within each rank that have come into being in the past few years. In the Tamil Nadu Police, a daily return from every Police Station analyses the time spent by the personnel on each item of duty. (A copy of this
may be seen at Appendix VII.) This report helps to conduct a critical examination of the manner in which manpower is utilised. No effort is made beyond this to undertake research, either continual or for certain periods of time, into what qualities are required of the holder of each job. The concept of a job analysis by means of a job description and job specification is almost totally alien to police forces in India. While this modern Management concept may not be able to bring about any radical reform of selection procedures, its utility in initiating limited change cannot be ignored. At present there is no evidence that police leaders are conscious of this.

2.2.1. Criteria for Selection: Every modern organization, whether in the governmental sector or in private industry, lays down a few basic requirements for those who desire entry into its ranks. These vary from one organization to another. Fundamentally, they fall into the following major divisions:

a. age;
b. physical standards;
c. educational attainments; and
d. previous work experience.

The emphasis on any one or more of the above four requisites would depend on the nature of the organization. This again would be a decision for the top-brass after taking into account the nature of functions to be performed by the recruits. In tune with this practice, police forces all over
the world have formulated certain standards for their recruits.

2.2.2. Age Limit for Recruitment: The question as to at what age should men and women be brought into the Force does not pose a major problem. At present, in India, there is recruitment to the following levels:

a. Constable - Grade II
b. Sub-Inspector
c. Deputy Superintendent/Assistant Superintendent.

On entry into the Force all the above are required to do hard field work. The first two, viz., Constabulary and Sub-Inspector, in view of the slender prospects of getting promoted to any level above that of Deputy Superintendent, are called upon to perform exacting field duties almost right through their career. Hence the need for their being picked up at a relatively young age so that, from the beginning, they are trained, physically and mentally, to undergo hardship without demur. Entry by those in the age group 18 - 22 is, therefore, quite welcome.

With the accent on a higher education for the recruits coming into police forces, older individuals will have to be necessarily drawn. Relevant here is the pushing up of the higher age limit of candidates coming into the I.P.S. from 24 to 28. In the opinion of this Researcher, any individual older than 25 years, is unlikely to be fit to undergo the travails which are the lot of an entrant. A modern police force which is engaged in the task of formulating a fresh man-power plan will have to take a policy decision and this could be derived from a close study of the levels of relative efficiency of the older and the younger recruits.
2.2.3. Physical Standards: The need for a member of a police force to possess an impressive physical figure cannot be underestimated. He has to present a picture of smartness and dignity. At the same time he should appear tough without being barbaric or rude. He should also have enough physical reserves to cope with difficult field situations in which public peace is disturbed by anti-social elements. These requisites indicate that the selection process should prescribe a few physical standards which every applicant should satisfy. Generally, these take the form of a minimum height, weight and width. In addition, a few Forces have laid down a 'Physical Efficiency Test' which expects the attainment of modest standards in activities such as jumping, running and throwing.

During his interviews with those inside and outside the Forces this Researcher did not come across any difference of opinion over the need to retain requirements of physical ability. The consensus was that on no account should any relaxation of these be shown to any individual whatever be his other merits. A few respondents took exception to the one given in favour of children of retired or serving members of the Force for being enlisted into the Constabulary. This is a ticklish issue which has to be re-examined in the context of the need to sustain the morale of subordinate policemen to whom prospective employment of their children into the Force is a major incentive to efficiency and good conduct.

2.2.4. Educational Qualification: Perhaps the most crucial
decision is the one with regard to the optimum educational level of every recruit. While the same attainment cannot be prescribed for all ranks, a rational manpower plan will have to decide on the minimum scholastic achievement. There is a raging debate on this, both in India and the U.S.

Broadly speaking, the grounds cited in support of an educated recruit fall into the following two categories:

(i) The qualities expected of recruits are those which a higher liberal education is generally believed to nurture, viz., a knowledge of social, economic and political conditions, an understanding of human behaviour and the ability to communicate, together with the assumption of certain moral values, habits of mind and qualities of self-discipline which are important in sustaining a commitment to the public service. The merits of a general liberal college education for any youth of intelligence and ambition are unquestioned. The liberal arts education provides "ethical and moral indoctrination that legitimizes existing power arrangements and re-enforces appropriate attitudes for the sustenance of democratic institutions and the peaceful co-existence of diverse population groups ..... a curriculum

that emphasizes breadth and flexibility may better equip students to meet unpredictable vocational demands.  

(ii) The complexities of modern policing require a high level of intelligence and articulation on the part of even lower functionaries. Police duties are no longer mechanical. However clearly one may split and delineate them so that the really intellectual tasks are done at higher levels, there is a growing need for police subordinates also to exercise judgment and discretion in their day-to-day work. One perceives this trend even in a country like India where the rate of growth of literacy is yet to catch up with the West. In India, thanks to the proliferation of courses in Adult Education and the phenomenal expansion of the various media, a large number of persons who have not received formal education are becoming surprisingly highly articulate. In tune with this welcome development in society, it is but appropriate that the members of the police forces have an intellectual equipment that is at least slightly higher than a majority of those whose life and property they are expected to protect.

Detractors of the theory that higher education produces a better class of police officers base their case on the following grounds:

---

4 Lazarsfeld et al., "The Uses of Sociology" (Basic Books Ltd., 1967), in Saunders, p.82.
(a) Police work is of a routine nature (particularly at the lower levels) that hardly requires any extraordinary intelligence. Further, technological and scientific advances, as also the growing industrialization and urbanization of society, have not had that much of an impact on police duties as it is believed to be. Basically, the policeman is expected to maintain peace in the community and this makes a demand more on his physical reserves than his mental faculties. What is required of him is his ability to put in long hours of hard field work. In the same way, prevention and detection of crime also require only an element of perseverance or the ability to tackle known criminals. (In this context, reference is very often made to the use of third-degree by policemen to solve crime and their reluctance to employ methods of science and technology to facilitate their work. The group that is not warm to the idea of an educated police recruit derives a lot of strength from the cynicism of many police officers themselves over the utility of scientific methods of investigation.)

(b) If men with a level of education higher than that is required for the job are brought in, they will sooner or later become demoralised and therefore become of little use to the Force. Placing a highly educated individual to perform chores of a mechanical nature would prove ruinous to the individual as well as to the organization which employs him. The situation is particularly dangerous when the organization is large, highly bureaucratic and is marked by one-way
communication. The chances are that the man who finds himself over-qualified for the job is not identified at the proper time. The impact of this situation on his state of mind should be deleterious to a public utility body such as the Police from which the common man expects the most efficient service. Poor morale could lead to the capricious action by a frustrated policeman and this can cause a lot of damage to police image.

(c) It is actually dangerous to recruit highly educated men because their questioning attitude would prove a source of trouble and embarrassment to the Force whose major strength is unquestioned obedience to traditional methods of work. This argument against higher education rests on the belief that the Police should continue to be rigid hierarchical organization if it is to give a good account of itself. It indirectly discountenances the validity of the concepts of modern Management such as Management by Objectives (MBO) and Participative Management (PM). In effect, it squarely rejects the suggestion of any democracy in the internal management of police forces and places great emphasis on the need for an authoritarian style to ensure an effective police force.

This conflict of opinion on whether police forces should have highly educated recruits - particularly at the lower levels - has a great relevance to India in the context of the growing increase in the rate of literacy. The debate has assumed special import against the background of the police
stir witnessed in the country during 1979. The fact that a large number of well educated young recruits gave leadership to agitating policemen has led to serious misgivings over the wisdom of drawing highly educated youth into the Force at the Constabulary level.

2.2.5. Past work experience: This Researcher did not come across any instance of lateral entry into police forces, except in a few technical positions. Hence the criterion of previous work experience is not of any relevance to the Police. Among direct entrants, there are of course a few who had earlier worked for other organizations. But such experience is hardly reckoned at the time of recruitment.

2.3. Archaic selection methods: Closely related to the apathy flowing from the excessive number of applicants for police jobs in India is the lack of innovation in selection methods. While the system of selection to the I.P.S. has undergone a few cosmetic changes, the one that prevails for picking the Constabulary and Sub-Inspectors has remained almost static over the years. It is true that legal requirements governing selection to the public services and the need to maintain ethnic balances without giving an impression of favouritism do not permit major experiments. However, within the parameters of this situation there is some scope for the application of a few techniques that have proved their worth in private industry. A lack of zeal for fresh ideas aimed at improving selection procedures is thus another distinguishing
2.4. Career Planning: An area of almost equal concern relates to the judicious planning of the career of personnel recruited into the Force. The problem is not actually relevant to an employee during the first four or five years of his service. Whatever be his rank, a recruit is required to go through a particular career path initially before preparing himself for advancement. For instance, in the Police, a Constable recruited by the Districts first gets posted to the District Armed Reserve and later, on the basis of his educational qualification and seniority, becomes eligible to be posted to Police Stations. It is only after he spends a few years in the Police Stations that he gets considered for a shift to special units such as the Special Branch, Crime Branch, Training College, etc. In the same way, a Sub-Inspector/Assistant or Deputy Superintendent of Police spends the first few years of his service in the District Police before being reckoned for appointment to the above-mentioned special units. Hence, career planning becomes relevant only after about five years of service in the regular line.

Work in special police agencies is of a highly sensitive and confidential nature. Hence, traditionally, personnel chosen to man positions in these organizations are vetted for their integrity as also for their professional ability. This system had been working fairly satisfactorily till a few years ago. With many of the special units undergoing phenomenal expansion during the past few years, this
emphasis on integrity and professional competence has been somewhat diluted because of the enlarged need for personnel. As a result, one finds many misfits coming into these agencies. The increased demands of special units also results in very junior personnel being taken out of the regular line at too early a stage in their career. This is poor career planning because all such personnel do not pick up the rudiments of field work and this operates to their disadvantage when they revert to the districts at the end of their tenure with the special units.

No major effort is made to ensure that a member of the Force acquires experience of a considerable variety during his career so that, when he reaches senior positions, he is able to take a wholistic view of every problem thrown up to him. While specialisation has its advantages, it is not of help when one is pitchforked into leadership positions. There are any number of instances of senior and middle-level officers having worked right through their career in assignments with a special unit. Such men suffer in comparison with those who have all-round experience when cases of both categories are considered for advancement within the Force. There are also examples of many senior officers belonging to the I.P.S. migrating from the State Police Force to work in Central Government agencies for a long number of years and losing total touch with regular police work in the State. This situation causes many problems, both personnel and operational.

The lack of thought given to placement as a personnel policy is also very often in evidence from the disregard of
seniority and work experience of individual members of the Force as also the sensitive nature of a particular post when officers are chosen for various assignments. While, technically speaking, all posts at a level can be held by officers holding a particular rank, very often, each post varies from another in terms of prestige, power and responsibility. For instance, in a State Force, every District is headed by an officer of the rank of Superintendent of Police. There are districts which are large and sensitive from the point of view of crime or law and order and hence require the leadership of a mature and experienced officer. Very often one finds that young and inexperienced officers are posted to head such districts. This is hardly a good placement policy. Such postings are ill-advised from the point of view of the needs of the district as well as the judicious shaping of the career of a junior officer.

In these days of high cost of travel, acute shortage of moderately-priced housing, difficulties in getting children admitted to good schools etc., there is a reluctance on the part of officials to shift from one place to another. Senior civil servants and those in the higher brackets of income placed in private industry share this dislike of a transfer with low paid employees. Personnel at all levels therefore tend to gravitate around a location of their choice. For the individual employee this is quite logical and reasonable in view of the inconvenience of uprooting the family from one place where they are well settled and transplanting them into
a new soil where there are any number of difficulties in commanding basic facilities such as housing, education, medical care, etc. But this situation connotes a number of problems for the leadership which has to accommodate the interests of the organization and those of its individual members. Although there are salutary regulations which discountenance an employee from staying too long in a particular place, these are invariably observed only in the breach. Many personnel therefore fail to acquire valuable knowledge of different geographical territories covered and functions performed by a police force.

There is at the same time a complaint that police forces do not have a firm and clearly-defined policy with regard to transfer of personnel. As was mentioned in Chapter III ('Working Conditions'), many Forces are guilty of indiscriminate transfers. These are ordered very often to punish an erring employee or to accommodate the favourite of a higher functionary. In a few other cases, transfers are the result of a lack of personnel planning. Frequent transfers — sometime more than two or three in a year — suffered by a member of the Force demoralizes him and his family. As a result he develops utter indifference towards his work and an antipathy to his leadership.

2.5. Personnel Unit: Perhaps the most striking lacuna in Indian police administration is the absence of a well-defined cell that could be made responsible for looking after personnel functions. No doubt, there are individual officers at the
headquarters of a State Police Force, such as the Deputy Inspector-General (Administration) and Assistant Inspector-General, who are expected to turn out mostly personnel work. The fact remains that they also serve as Staff Officers to the Director-General/Inspector-General. The quantum of work involved and the day-to-day tensions that are a part of this role, distract them so much that their contribution to personnel management is far from substantial or effective. Their attention to day-to-day personnel problems itself being perfunctory, it is not a matter for surprise that long-term policy issues hardly interest them. Hence, personnel problems are left to the caprice of subordinate administrative staff who have only clerical ability and cannot bring to their work a knowledge of the problems faced in the field by police executives. The consequence of this is, therefore, ad hoc and very often harsh decisions and the familiar sight of an unseemly conflict between the two segments of the Force. The unreasonable power wielded by the clerical staff in personnel matters also results in the field executives trying to curry favour with the former by using questionable methods. This situation is hardly conducive to morale at the operational level.

III. A few Modern Staffing Concepts

3.1. Introduction: Management Science has made considerable progress in systematizing the principles that should govern the personnel function. The endeavour has been to render
prediction of manpower requirement, methods of selection and recruitment, criteria for placement and the techniques of training, as scientific as possible. A strict adherence to methods advocated by Management writers eliminates uncertainties and confusion in personnel management. It is a sad fact that a few police forces in India had invited trouble recently from their subordinate ranks because of a lack of faith in the efficacy of definable and objective staffing norms. Induced by the belief that modern police organizations have quite a few lessons to learn from Management theory on 'Staffing', this Researcher, makes a brief reference to them in this part.

Management Science tells us that the starting point of a sound staffing policy is the preparation of a plan document which puts down the following information:

a. The objectives/goals of the organization;

b. The probable shifts in such goals/objectives during the next 10 years;

c. Manpower currently available within the organization, in terms of numbers and skills;

d. The estimated accretion in manpower required to meet future demands as also the field from which such manpower could be recruited.

The above represents an aspect of the manpower plan which has been referred to in some detail in the previous chapter. Management Science firmly believes that there is no compromise on this point and that no personnel department can deliver
3.2. Job Analysis: Modern Management scientists approach the issues of recruitment and selection with great care and circumspection. They spurn the traditional belief that an individual with a modicum of education and intelligence could be picked up at random and placed in any job. On the contrary, they place great emphasis on the scientific study of each job, its content, and the qualities it demands from its holder.

Job analysis is basically a process of studying and collecting information relating to the operation and responsibilities of a specific job". The two steps in undertaking such an analysis are:

i. Job description; and

ii. Job specification;

While the former is an organized factual statement of duties and responsibilities of a specific job, job specification is "a statement of the minimum acceptable human qualities necessary to perform a job properly".

Strictly speaking, job analysis is a process of data collection. The four most favoured tools of undertaking this analysis are:

i. Questionnaire;

ii. Written narratives;

iii. Observation; and

iv. Interview.


6. Ibid., p. 111.
A survey undertaken in a large number of firms of various types in U.S.A. indicated that the interview was the most popular method. It has generally been found that an interview which follows the administration of a questionnaire and is backed up by observation, produces the most accurate job analysis.

Many successful private organizations have found job analysis to be a sure means of obtaining the right human material. But government establishments do not set much store by it. It is this Researcher's stand that by subjecting all its jobs down to the level of Constabulary to such analysis, a Force can greatly enhance the quality of its recruits and, therefore, its performance.

3.3.1. Selection Methods: The phenomenal increase in the number of highly educated young men and women clamouring for well-paid jobs, the increased complexities of the operations of modern organizations and the near clinical public scrutiny of their working are three factors which compel every employer to opt for the best available candidates in the employment market. This situation has to a large extent eliminated caprice and patronage in the process of selection to a majority of jobs. Consequently, one witnesses various attempts, particularly in private industry, to establish objective scientific methods of selection. Modern Management Science has been engaged in this task of rendering selection techniques sophisticated and at the same time functional. Basically, the traditional methods of written test and personal interview
have been retained and have been supplemented by a few new ones.

The written examination is a formal test which seeks to assess the candidate's knowledge of the subjects which he had learnt during his regular course of study in an educational institution as also his ability to express his thoughts in an analytical manner within a prescribed time. A majority of private organizations, in addition to this test or in its place, resort to the following:

a. Intelligence Test: This proceeds on the assumption that a candidate who does well in this test is likely to learn his work faster than the others. There are, however, reservations over the utility of this test because of the lack of agreement on the definition of 'intelligence' itself. Further, the degree of importance of various factors which this test seeks to measure, such as verbal comprehension, mathematical aptitude, inductive reasoning and memory, varies from job to job.\(^7\)

b. Aptitude Test: While this measures mainly the candidate's general ability to learn, a few psychologists have succeeded in devising tests which reveal how suitable a candidate is to a job for which he is competing. The objective here is to select a person who is likely to show a high degree of success after he has been trained.

---

Generally, aptitude tests are resorted to for recruiting candidates to jobs which involve the display of mechanical, clerical, linguistic, musical and academic capacities.\(^8\)

c. **Personality Test**: This is related to the belief that one's personality is a vital factor in how well he performs in his job. This test attempts to "measure motivation to work, to identify potentially disqualifying defects in temperament and to discover other personality characteristics that may affect job behaviour".\(^9\) Since candidates applying for a position normally strain themselves to make the most favourable impression on the employer, it is unlikely that they would come out with straight-forward and honest answers. This is a serious limitation on the utility of this test in making a correct assessment of a candidate's values and beliefs.

The **interview** which gives an opportunity for the employer to come face to face with the candidate and thereby help assess the latter's bearing and demeanour, has come to stay as one of the major selection tools. It complements the role performed by the written test and enables a reasonably accurate measurement of an individual's power of expression and his ability to interact with others. This method no doubt suffers from many infirmities chief of which is, the limited time available in which to make the assessment because of the large number of candidates who have to be so tested.

\(^{8}\) Flippo, p.160.

\(^{9}\) Strauss and Sayles, p.375
3.3.2. Reliability and Validity of Tests: While the above methods of selection are no doubt comprehensive and generally render personnel policy fairly certain, there is a need for every organization to constantly engage in research to satisfy itself that the existing methods fulfil the objective of recruiting talented individuals. They further suggest that an effort should simultaneously be made to develop new tests or modify existing ones wherever the latter reveal certain lacunae. In other words, there should be a procedure in every organization which would ensure that there is a continuous evaluation of the methods of selection for their (a) reliability and (b) validity.

A method of selection is reliable if the results obtained therefrom are consistent. This would mean that a candidate going through the test for the second or third time under almost similar conditions will secure about the same score. When the scores obtained by him vary drastically, it is a definite signal that there should be a rethinking on the desirability of persisting with the test in its existing form.

Selection methods should also be tested for their validity, i.e., whether they are able to highlight in each candidate, the presence or absence of certain qualities which the organization is looking for. It is here that the concept of job analysis referred to earlier in this para assumes importance. If, for instance, such analysis has revealed that

\[10\] Flippo, p.155.
a certain level of intelligence is required for the satisfactory performance of the job, the Personnel Manager will have to make sure that the test administered has the measurement of intelligence as its primary objective. The experience of a few business firms is that validation studies can be conducted with the help of present employees ("concurrent validity") and new applicants ("predictive validity"). The performance rating given to the groups would indicate the degree of validity of the test in question.\textsuperscript{11}

3.4. Career Planning: Every organization has a well defined responsibility for planning the career of each of its employees. This is an important aspect of personnel policy which can be ignored only to the detriment of employee morale and performance and, therefore, organizational effectiveness. Hence the importance which personnel managers in industry pay to the proper placement of their men at every stage of the latter's career. In governmental agencies, the validity of career planning is accepted in principle but the concept is very often disregarded because of various pressures that operate on officials who look after personnel functions.

A career is "a sequence of separate but related work activities that provides continuity, order and meaning in a person's life".\textsuperscript{12} In effect, it is "a series of properly sequenced role-experiences leading to increasing levels of

\textsuperscript{11} Flippo, p.156.

\textsuperscript{12} Ibid., p.225.
responsibility, status, power and rewards". These two striking definitions should make it clear why an individual employee attaches such importance to every decision that the personnel department takes in respect of the place where he will work and the conditions that will obtain thereat. They also highlight how necessary it is for the personnel manager to keep in mind that every move of his would affect the employee concerned psychologically if not materially. It is a lack of such consideration that has brought strife and disorder for some organizations. Examples of police forces getting into grave trouble on this account are legion.

Modern Management Science also takes cognizance of the 'Career Conflict' that has emerged with rising female employment and the consequent necessity to ensure that spouses are given the same location to work or when one of them is moved out, it is possible for the other to continue his or her employment at the former's new place of posting. Even where the husband or the wife alone is employed, a shift brings in tremendous inconvenience to the family. A career development programme cannot turn a blind eye to this and be insensitive to the adverse reactions to a transfer of location from the employee concerned. "Changing values make the old 'take it or leave it' policy increasingly out-of-step with modern society". The programme should, without prejudice to the interests of the organization, be able to give an element of choice to the employees on their location.

13 Flippo, p.226.
14 Ibid., p.231.
IV. Extension of Staffing Concepts to Police Personnel Management

4.1. Lacunae in present practices: The survey of staffing practices in a typical police force in India attempted in Part II of this chapter highlights the following major shortcomings:

a. The exercise of 'job analysis' is unknown to many police forces. There is, therefore, no sound guide to the task of establishing standards for recruitment.

b. Within the constraints imposed by a relatively poor pay structure, career prospects, etc., there is no major effort to attract accomplished youth with an aptitude for police work. Selection methods are archaic and do not provide for new requirements expected of recruits.

c. The concept of 'placement' has received such limited recognition that its presence is hardly felt.

d. There is no single agency at the level of Force Headquarters which has the time and expertise to formulate and thereafter execute recruitment and placement policies.

The above lacunae deserve the attention of any project which aims at personnel reforms. It is in this perspective that this Researcher proceeds to record a few suggestions.

4.2.1. Relevance of Job Analysis: 'Job Analysis' as mentioned in Part III of this chapter is an endeavour to break a job into the various items of duty which it comprises and the
qualities which each of such items demands from the holder for their efficient performance. Chapter II (Appendix II) outlines the hierarchy in a modern police force in a State of India. There are at least ten levels in each Force. Normally the ranks of and above that of Deputy/Assistant Superintendent are regarded as supervisory. That this demarcation is unreal will be borne out from a quick glance at Appendix VII which makes an attempt to catalogue the functions of each functionary in the Tamil Nadu Police. Except Constables Grades I and II, every one of the rest of the Force combines in him or her, both original and supervisory work. It is this cold fact that justifies the case for a thorough job analysis in every Police organization.

It is for the subordinate ranks that an incisive job analysis is quite useful. This is because they perform vital functions. Many of them rise to the levels of Deputy Superintendent and Inspector and hence the right human material who can grow with their jobs will have to be picked up at the time of selection. Viewed in this perspective, the division of the Force into the Armed and Unarmed Wings is rational and justified. The chores performed in the two wings are, broadly speaking, dissimilar and call for somewhat different human and professional qualities. It is because of this that this Researcher views with concern the action by a few well-meaning police leaders that almost does
away with the distinction in order to boost the sagging morale of Armed Police personnel.

4.2.2. Transfer of Armed Police to Unarmed Wing: Certain decisions have been taken which permit the migration of the Armed Police personnel to the Unarmed Wing at different levels. Viewed in isolation, the move is welcome because such mobility ensures greater promotion opportunities and introduces the needed variety into the career path of Armed Police personnel. In trying to promote the morale of a group of employees who have traditionally complained of a lack of opportunity to display their talent, police leaders appear to have thrown overboard the very valid criteria which had originally influenced the decision to create a separate Armed Police Wing at the State level in order to quell major organized violence by anti-social elements. The belief that this Wing required men known more for their physical toughness than intellectual prowess and a willingness to act under the guidance of the unarmed Wing, had led to the laying down of stiff physical standards but a relatively low educational attainment.

Bringing such material - albeit after a length of service - into the regular line of Unarmed District Police negates the initial rationale of police organizers. It could lead to a dilution of the quality of performance of those who had right through been in the District Police and who provide the basic police service. This situation has come about because of a failure to do a clinical 'job analysis'. There is, therefore,
a need to maintain a distinction between the Armed and the Unarmed Wings by separately clustering the jobs on the basis of principles outlined in Part III of this Chapter.

4.2.3. Analysis of Positions in Unarmed Wing: The next move should be to analyse jobs within the Unarmed Police which accounts for a bulk of the Force. (Such an exercise is not called for in the case of the Armed Wing as a majority of jobs fall into the same category in terms of responsibility and nature of functions.) For this purpose, three categories could be taken up separately. They are:

i. Jobs at the Police Station.
ii. Jobs at the District Headquarters.
iii. Jobs at the Force Headquarters.

These three differ not only in terms of power and responsibility, but in respect of job content as well.

The first step is one of a description of the job. This Researcher would advocate a questionnaire for this purpose because police personnel tend to be circumspect and reticent when interviewed face-to-face but normally open up when asked to write out their views, of course without having to reveal their identity. Further, greater precision is assured when one is allowed to put down his thoughts on a subject with which he is familiar but is one which is difficult to describe verbally in a few minutes. The questionnaire administered should be a combination of the objective type of questions which can be answered in just a phrase supplied from among many and those for which response could be a
description at length. Only such a mixture would yield data of sufficient utility to the analyst. While respondents may be expected to give a clear account of the duties performed by them, they are bound to give vague but carping comments on supervision given and received. This is because police subordinates believe that they are being supervised far too closely and the supervisory levels hold the view that the former are becoming increasingly resistant to supervision.

The next step is that of 'job specification' which is basically one of fixing human requirements for the holding of a job or class of jobs. This is a difficult exercise because there can always be a difference of opinion on which of two standards that are close together should be prescribed. For instance, there is a debate in the Police as to whether it is enough for a Constable-recruit to have completed school education or should he have a University degree. Taking into account the increased complexity of police tasks, it is pertinent to ask whether this complexity is so great as to warrant fixing college education as the basic qualification for an applicant to the position of a Constable. Similarly, a Sub-Inspector is expected to do hard field work and should have the mental toughness to face mob fury. At the same time, he is required to comprehend the nuances of great many laws that he has to enforce if he is not to stray into illegalities. This demands a mandatory level of education combined with a sufficiently high degree of intelligence. The job analyst has to weigh the relative importance of these factors and decide
on standards which are appropriate. The phenomenon that one witnesses of the Sub-Inspector being less educated than a few of the Constables working under him in the Police Station is an index of the lack of application of the concept of job analysis.

In the opinion of this Researcher, 'job specification' for the levels of Constabulary and Sub-Inspector in a Police Station should attempt to lay down standards as below:

i. physical measurements;
ii. educational attainment;
iii. intelligence level;
iv. knowledge of law; and
v. knowledge of departmental procedure.

While the first three standards should dictate recruitment policy, (iv) and (v) should be post-training measurements. Although current practices aim at such standards, there is no serious study of jobs followed by a rigid prescription that the standards fixed should necessarily be attained for recruitment and for subsequent placement.

A logical plea is that a similar exercise should be done in respect of personnel operating at the District level, viz., those working for District Special Branch, District Crime Records Bureau, District Crime Branch, etc. At present this is not done. As a result one finds misfits who create problems for themselves and for the organization. Perhaps more important is the need to analyse jobs at the Force Headquarters level. This is because such positions are sensitive and performance here makes or mars the image of the Force as a whole.
4.3.1. Selection Methods: The obvious complacency of governments and police leaders explains their reluctance to examine the soundness of traditional methods of selection. It is not that all the tools currently employed have outlived their utility and should, therefore, be abandoned or that a majority of the men selected are of a poor calibre. The Researcher's strong belief is that a few innovations should help to bring in a greater number of the more talented and suitable youth available in the employment market than what the present methods do. Such innovations can come about only if current modes of selection are tested for their reliability and validity. Hence the first step for the personnel manager is to initiate research studies that would help to arrive at a rating of each of the tests employed in terms of its reliability and validity. This is a concept that has not been given any thought to by the Police.

4.3.2. Reliability and Validity Studies: A few of the serving Constabulary and Sub-Inspectors belonging both to the Armed and Unarmed branches posted in different geographical territories may be picked up as the samples for reliability and validity studies. Care should be paid to the choice of samples so that personnel of three categories, viz., those whose performance in the Force has been outstanding, those with a colourless record and those with a series of positively bad reports, are represented in about the same number. It is necessary that a Board comprising senior officers and a Management Consultant is formed at the headquarters to undertake
this exercise. The effort should be to subject the samples to the same tests which they had undergone at the time of their selection at least thrice, over the course of a week and rate their performance. Even after giving due allowance to probable regional differences in the standard of tests (written and oral) and the subjectivity differences that are likely to creep in when two different groups are the examiners, such studies can be looked upon as a guide to the soundness of the tools of selection employed by the department. This exercise should be an annual affair so that possible lacunae are gradually filled and near perfection is achieved over a period of about five years. Such a drill should, apart from guiding the police personnel, may help to lend credibility to police selection methods and to disseminate the impression that they are generally free from favouritism and patronage.

4.3.3. Modification of Existing Selection Methods: A series of physical efficiency tests and a simple written test of general knowledge followed by a brief viva voce constitute the selection procedure for the Constabulary and Sub-Inspectors in a majority of State Police Forces in India. The Constabulary are recruited almost right through the year by each District Superintendent of Police for the Unarmed Branch and by each Commandant of Special Police Battalions for the Armed Branch. Sub-Inspectors are, however, recruited once in two or three years by the State Police Headquarters even if vacancies occur annually. In view of the large numbers involved,
particularly for the selection of Constabulary, the tests are far too brief and perfunctory to inspire any confidence among a majority of the aspirants. Although this is the case with the selection process for a number of low-level positions in public services, this Researcher feels strongly that this cavalier approach should not characterise recruitment methods to the Police which performs vital functions and whose diminishing image is causing anxiety all round. There is, therefore, a case for the re-examination of the existing procedure for the selection of Constabulary and Sub-Inspectors.

The first step in such a process of reappraisal would be a thorough job analysis. A meaningful analysis can be done only by a group of experienced police officers assisted by a renowned Management Consultant who has specialised in the field. This group should be vested with powers to visit Police establishments at will, call for records and also interview personnel at all levels. It is essential that officers who comprise the study group are self-effacing personalities who would encourage free discussion so that even lower police functionaries are not inhibited from giving frank expression to their views. It would be expedient for the group to wind up its study with a detailed discussion with the head of the Force and his immediate deputies at the Force Headquarters. This would considerably enhance the acceptability of the final report.

The next step in the process of evaluation of the existing selection tools is the recasting of tests in the
light of the report submitted by the above study group. A major addition to present tests could be one which assesses the aptitude of every applicant for work in the Police. The format for such a test will have to be carefully devised with the assistance of a group of renowned psychologists. The actual testing should itself be ultimately entrusted to psychologists. At what stage of the selection process could this test be administered to an applicant is a matter for debate. In the opinion of this Researcher, this test should be given alongside the Physical Efficiency Test which demands minimum standards in running, throwing and jumping. A similar minimum rating could be prescribed for the psychology test as well. Only those who qualify in both the tests may be allowed to appear for the written test.

The written test for the selection of Constabulary could still comprise a single paper which evaluates the applicant's general knowledge and his ability to innovate for tackling problems of different kinds which confront an average policeman in the street.

There is a definite case for widening the scope of the test for selection of Sub-Inspectors who are required, on their own, to discharge tasks which call for a higher level of comprehension of social and legal problems. (This is a view subscribed to by a number of senior officers interviewed by this Researcher.) It would appropriate to have a series of three papers as below:

i. an intelligence-cum-personality test;
ii. a general knowledge test that would evaluate the candidate's awareness of happenings around him; and

iii. a test of the candidate's knowledge of a subject which he has studied in college at the graduation level.

This combination would be a considerable improvement over the existing written examination which hardly tests the candidate's mental equipment. In order to eliminate any subjectivity in the evaluation of answers, it would be appropriate to have objective-type of questions. This would not only help to avoid allegations of favouritism but facilitate the use of computer to quickly finalise results.

The viva-voce no doubt suffers from the criticism that it is subjective and perfunctory. This is no reason why it should be given up because it helps a personal assessment of the candidate's demeanour, reflexes and his power of verbal expression. One way of improving the credibility of such a test is to give a little more time to each candidate than now so that the board of examiners gets a genuine opportunity to size up a candidate and the latter is also allowed time to collect himself and answer questions in a composed mood. This is possible only if the number of candidates to be interviewed is restricted to the minimum. Instead of summoning every one who has taken the written test, it would be sufficient to call only twice as many as there are vacancies. The interview board could comprise three members, one of whom may be a senior retired police officer with a reputation for
integrity and professional competence and the other two, serving officers known for the same qualities.

The final selection could be from a merit list drawn up on the basis of the total marks obtained by a candidate in the written examination and viva voce put together. In compiling this list, the need for adhering to Government regulations on a certain quota of reservation for Scheduled Castes & Tribes and Backward classes should be given due regard to so that the ethnic composition of the Force is well balanced.

4.3.4. Wider and Imaginative Publicity to Recruitment: Private industry firmly believes that it should recruit the best talent available in the field. Untrammelled by the regulations that colour governmental personnel policies, many firms employ aggressive methods to attract the bright lot. Instead of a selection procedure that aims at eliminating the bad (which is a negative technique), industry engages itself in a wide search for the really outstanding young men and women with suitable qualifications. As a part of this process, we have now the familiar method of 'campus selection' wherein personnel managers go to educational institutions, contact the faculty, locate students with promise and thereafter interview the latter for offering suitable positions. There is actually intense competition among firms to procure talented youth.

It is the firm view of this Researcher that the Police hierarchy should shed its complacency and recast its recruitment methods in such a way that there is greater publicity to the Police as a fruitful career and an effort is
made to choose the highly achievement-motivated and accomplished youth who can be identified in educational institutions. At present the Police receives such adverse publicity in the media that bright and accomplished young men and women straightaway eliminate the Police from their options. This is disappointing if one reckons the tremendous opportunities which the Force offers for serving the community, a goal which impels a sizeable number of youth when they are looking out for a career. This situation can be partly remedied through a planned programme of action that would comprise campus (both in school and colleges) lectures with audio-visual aids by senior police officers on the police system and functions and more imaginative and catchy advertisements in the press, radio and T.V. whenever recruitment is proposed to be done. Such propaganda in favour of the Police as a career should highlight how the opportunity to serve those in distress more than compensates the poor emoluments and promotion prospects that are difficult to improve appreciably for many years to come.

There is a need also to amend recruitment rules so as to facilitate the appointment of outstanding youth, i.e., those with impressive academic and extra-curricular achievements, directly into the Force at the levels of Constabulary and Sub-Inspector without their having to go through the prescribed examinations, except the psychology test. There can be no serious objection to this as this is analogous to an existing practice in the prestigious Indian
Institutes of Technology where students who had topped their final school examinations are admitted to the Bachelor of Technology Course without having to appear for the entrance examination. Such direct entry into the Force could be against 10% of the vacancies that are likely to be filled at any particular time. This would serve as a real incentive to those accomplished youth who do not otherwise care much for a job in the Police.

4.4. Career Development Programme: Paragraph 2.4 highlights how the concepts of Career Planning and placement have had only a limited impact on police personnel policies. Paragraph 3.4 delineates these concepts as viewed by Management researchers. This Researcher concedes that these cannot be wholly and rigidly transferred to police personnel administration because decisions regarding the positioning of officers and men belonging to a Force are influenced by so many factors, some of which may be only a little related to professional requirements. Within such parameters, however, a career plan drawn in respect of each level of personnel can be implemented.

The Government of India has attempted a semblance of career planning in respect of I.P.S. officers. Apart from spelling out the training programmes that each officer will have to attend before being considered for elevation to the rank of D.I.G., it has prescribed certain lengths of service after which the officers will earn their promotion. Periodical circulars to State Governments on the subject have also been issued. But the Government of India has been reluctant to go
beyond this and prescribe a full-length plan that would cover a major part of an officer's career. This is possibly because of an anxiety to avoid criticism of interference in an area that falls within the discretion of a State Government.

This Researcher's interviews with senior I.P.S. officers however indicate that the latter would welcome a rigid career plan prepared by the Government of India in consultation with State Governments and prescribed for their mandatory adherence. It is felt that such a plan would go a long way in reducing the grievances of many I.P.S. officers who genuinely feel that they had received a raw deal in respect of their career management. The need of the hour therefore is a single document that would plan the career of I.P.S. officers till they reach the level of Inspector-General, a position many of them attain after putting in about 25 years of service. (Planning for the rest of one's worklife may not be necessary because the prospects of further advancement are slim.) This plea should deal with the benefits of a spell for each officer in different branches of work, highlight the importance of ensuring a minimum tenure in each place of posting and prescribe clearly-worded criteria for elevation to higher ranks that would leave little scope for the unjustified supersession of certain officers (who had become persona non grata) on grounds other than merit. Only such a plan would render the governments accountable and keep them away from subjectivity and arbitrariness in personnel administration.

A similar career plan may be drawn up in respect of
non-I.P.S. recruits of all ranks. This is relevant more to the Unarmed branch if one concedes the premise that those belonging to the Armed Police should grow within their own wing and not be allowed to migrate to the former. The Unarmed branch offers many opportunities for rotation and vertical movement. Those could be exploited in such a manner that a Sub-Inspector who begins his career in a Police Station and who has turned out reasonably good work, ends up as a Superintendent of Police either in a District or in a special unit such as the Special Branch or Crime Branch at the State level. In between, the career plan should ensure that he has a stint in Law and Order (i.e., preservation of public peace) and Crime and Special Branches before specialising in one of them. In the same way, a Constable who commences his life in the District Armed Reserve and who has an unblemished record of service, should be able to end at the level of Deputy Superintendent. He may also be helped to specialise after he attains the rank of Sub-Inspector.

The career development programme for subordinate ranks in the Police should, in addition, provide for the following:

a. Guidelines for Transfers: This is an area of vital importance because of the complaint of indiscriminate shifts of personnel causing great misery to families. Basically, a tenure of three years at a location should be fixed for each level and any transfer before this period should be supported by detailed grounds in writing by the officer ordering it and
which has to be reviewed by the next level of supervisor. There should also be a facility for aggrieved personnel to represent to the head of the Force if they believe that the above guidelines have not been complied with. Only such clear regulations would bring down if not totally eliminate caprice in the matter of transfers. It should also be mandatory for a supervisory officer to entertain requests for transfer to a specific location from a member of the Force who has done three years in a station, provided there are no serious grounds which militate against his posting at the place desired by him. If there are such grounds, these again should be reduced in writing and this note should be reviewed by the immediate supervisor.

Superior officers should also take into special consideration, cases of both the spouses being employed and ensure that as far as possible they are posted at the same location. The present injunction in many States against a police official being allowed to remain in a station for more than three years may be relaxed in such cases by two more years in which time the other spouse may make arrangements which would enable him or her also to shift to the proposed place of posting of the police employee. It is here that the importance of advance intimation of a prospective shift assumes significance. It should be mandatory for the superior to order transfers at least two months in advance of the commencement of a school/college year so that an employee is mentally prepared for shifting his children to a new location.
b. **Career Counselling:** Police personnel, particularly those at subordinate levels, require to be told of the opportunities available within and outside the Force in which they are functioning so that they are enabled to take vital decisions about their future. This has become specially relevant now in India with the mushrooming of police organizations at the national level. It is possible that policemen with special qualifications would like to migrate to an agency where such qualifications are valued and are given extra weightage. This can be facilitated by the personnel manager collecting such information and making it available to interested policemen in the form of periodical bulletins. The setting up of a small 'Guidance Bureau' at Force headquarters would also be welcome.

c. **Self-development:** Many of the Constabulary join the Force even before acquiring a college degree without which it may be difficult to aspire for direct entry into higher ranks or contemplate migration to other avenues of employment. Enlightened personnel policy would make it obligatory for the Force to provide the facility to such men for improving their educational qualification through instructions to groups of personnel outside their working hours. Similarly, the acquisition of a knowledge of languages and skills such as photography, automobile driving, maintenance of electrical and mechanical equipment, the learning of trades such as carpentry, smithy, tailoring, etc., should form part of a development programme to willing policemen at all levels. Such a
4.5. Personnel Machinery for the Police: Personnel management is a wholetime affair that requires the undivided attention of a body of professionals who possess knowledge of the latest techniques developed by Management Science. This is the philosophy that has brought success to large firms in private industry. Not all governmental agencies have comprehended this truth and have therefore muddled along much to their disadvantage. The Police is unfortunately one of them, in spite of the fact that more than any other organization, it needs a regular outfit that would put personnel administration on a sound footing. This is one sure way of conserving the morale of all ranks and curbing the arbitrariness in man management that has characterised many police forces all over the world.

To fill the lacuna caused by the absence of a well-defined personnel unit, this Researcher would advocate the creation of a Directorate of Personnel in every Force, small or big. The details of such an outfit have already been spelt out in paragraph 4.3.2 of the previous Chapter on 'Planning'. It would considerably help to streamline personnel management and eliminate subjectivity and uncertainties against which policemen at all levels repeatedly complain. Success to a large extent would depend on the quality of men who constitute the Directorate. They should possess an up-to-date knowledge of the developments in the area of Personnel
Management and should also be individuals with a self-effacing personality. More than this, it is incumbent on the Force leaders to make the Directorate personnel understand that the latter are staff functionaries who should on no account usurp the authority of the line managers. Only this would pave the way for the smooth internal management of a Force.
SUMMARY

Staffing is an important function through which an organization is built. It comprises the processes of recruitment, selection and development of employees along lines that would enable them to give an effective account of themselves. A large man-intensive organization such as the Police needs a comprehensive and rational staffing policy. The scrutiny of many Forces however reveals that their staffing practices suffer from many shortcomings. A few of these are: (i) a failure to undertake job analysis and fix requisite standards for recruitment; (ii) archaic selection methods that only eliminate the unfit and do not attract the best of talent; (iii) disregard of the concepts of career planning and placement; and (iv) absence of a whole-time well-defined machinery for looking after personnel management tasks. A judicious study and application of modern Management techniques would greatly remedy the situation. An incisive job analysis, use of new tools of selection that would not only help to select the best but leave out those without an aptitude for work in the Police, the framing of a sound career development programme and the setting up of a Directorate of Personnel that would take over personnel policy formulation and monitor implementation of policies, will all sharpen staffing practices in the Police.