# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgement</th>
<th>i</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td>x-xxxiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

1. Right to information- An introduction .......... 1
2. Concept of exemptions and right to information .......... 4
3. Exemptions and right to information- International perspective .......... 7
   3.1 The United Nations on freedom of information .......... 7
   3.2 UN special rapporteur on freedom of opinion and expression .......... 9
   3.3 Regional standards .......... 11
   3.4 The Commonwealth on access to information .......... 16
4. Concept of exemptions and right to information - The constitutional developments .......... 17
5. Right to Information Act, 2005: An overview .......... 23
7. Exemption from disclosure of information .......... 33
   7.1 Grounds for rejection to access in certain cases .......... 38
   7.2 Act not to apply to certain organisations-excluded organisation out of purview of the Right to Information Act .......... 39
   7.3 Doctrine of severability (partial disclosure) exempted and non-exempted information from disclosure: .......... 43
   7.4 Disclosure of third party’s confidential information or record .......... 44
8. Classification of exemptions in the Right to Information Act, 2005 .......... 52
9. Problem profile .......... 58
CHAPTER 2

EXEMPTIONS WITHIN RIGHT TO INFORMATION LEGISLATIONS IN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE: A COMPARATIVE STUDY

2.1 Concept of exemptions in context of right to information: 65

2.2 Scope of exemptions in right to information context – International standards. 66

2.3 Exemptions under the right to information legislations in overseas jurisdictions: An overview 70

2.4 Exemptions in right to information legislations in common law jurisdictions 75

2.5 Exemptions and public interest override in right to information legislations in various common law jurisdictions 85

2.5.1 Legislative framework, administration and enforcement of right to information legislations in various common law jurisdictions 93

2.6 Critical appraisal of exemptions and public interest override in various common law jurisdictions 101

2.6.1 Australian Commonwealth 101

2.6.2 Canada: Federal 110

2.6.3 Ireland 113

2.6.4 New Zealand 113

2.6.5 United Kingdom 115

CHAPTER 3

EXEMPTIONS IN THE RIGHT TO INFORMATION ACT, 2005

3.1 Specific exemptions and underlying public interest 127

3.1.1 EXEMPTION 1: Disclosure would affect security, economic interests, and relationship with foreign state; 128
3.1.2 EXEMPTION 2: Disclosure forbidden by court/tribunal............... 137
3.1.3 EXEMPTION 3: Disclosure would cause breach of privilege of parliament/state legislature................................................................. 146
3.1.4 EXEMPTION 4: Disclosure would harm competitive position of third party ................................................................................................................... 152
3.1.5 EXEMPTION 5: Information available in fiduciary relationship ...... 161
3.1.6 EXEMPTION 6-Information received in confidence from foreign government ................................................................. 179
3.1.7 EXEMPTION 7-Disclosure which would endanger life/physical safety ................................................................................................................ 181
3.1.8 EXEMPTION 8-Impede process of investigation................................. 193
3.1.9 EXEMPTION 9-Cabinet papers............................................................. 213
3.1.10 EXEMPTION 10-Personal Information................................................ 221

3.2 Doctrine of public interest under the Right to Information Act in India ...... 252
3.3 Review and analysis of public interest overrides in the Right to Information Act decisions of various information commissions and courts ......................... 261
3.3.1 Decisions where disclosure of information was in public interest ...... 261
3.3.2 Decisions where disclosure of information was not in public interest . 268
3.3.3 ‘Larger Public Interest’: A balance between public interest in exemption and public interest in access to information ..................................... 273
3.3.4 Decisions where information was disclosed after application of public Interest override test where public interest in disclosure outweighs the harm to protected Interests................................................................. 276

CHAPTER 4 ................................................................................................................. 284

EXEMPTIONS AND PUBLIC INTEREST OVERRIDE IN OVERSEAS JURISDICTIONS: JUDICIAL APPROACH ................................................................. 284

4.1 Eccleston: Overriding exemptions in public interest- A landmark case......... 285
4.1.1 The concept of the public interest ........................................................ 285
4.1.2 Public interest and the rights of the individual .................................... 289
4.1.3 Public interest in accountability of government and public participation in government

4.1.4 Balancing of public interests

4.1.5 The Information Commissioner’s analysis of the Howard principles

4.1.6 Reception of Eccleston in other Australian jurisdictions

4.2 Disclosure of information: Overriding exemptions in public interest – judicial approach in various common law jurisdictions

4.2.1 Australia Commonwealth - Decisions where the balance lay in favour of disclosure

4.2.2 Canada-Federal - Canadian Federal Information Commissioner - Decisions where the public interest test operated in favour of disclosure

4.2.3 Ireland - Decisions of Irish Information Commissioner held that the public interest was better served by granting the request

4.2.4 New Zealand- Decisions of the Ombudsman where the public interest in disclosure outweighed the harm likely to arise from disclosure

4.2.5 United Kingdom-Decisions where the public interest in disclosure outweighed the harm likely to arise from disclosure

4.3 Non-disclosure of information: Overriding exemptions in public interest – judicial approach in various common law jurisdictions

4.3.1 Australia Commonwealth-Decisions of Administrative Appeals Tribunal-Decisions where the balance lay against disclosure

4.3.2 Canada: Federal-Decisions of Canadian Information Commissioner-Decisions where the public interest test operated in favour of nondisclosure

4.3.3 Ireland - Decisions where on balance the public interest was better served by withholding the information

4.3.4 New Zealand-Decisions of the Ombudsman where the public interest in disclosure did not outweigh the harm caused by disclosure
4.3.5 United Kingdom- Decisions of the UK Parliamentary Ombudsman where the public interest in disclosure outweighed the harm likely to arise from disclosure ................................................................. 376

CHAPTER 5 .................................................................................................................................................................................. 389

EXEMPTIONS AND PUBLIC INTEREST OVERRIDE: SUGGESTIVE APPROACH FOR THE RIGHT TO INFORMATION ACT, 2005 .......................... 389

5.1 Exemptions and public interest override under the Right to Information Act .......................................................... 390

5.1.1 Premises governing exemptions in the Right to Information Act ........ 390

5.1.2 Foundation of exemptions and disclosure of information in public interest ............................................................................................................................... 393

5.1.3 Burden of Proof in public interest override test .................................... 394

5.2 Evolving a model for conducting public interest test .................................................. 396

5.3 Practical guidelines for weighing the public interest ........................................... 422

5.3.1 Withholding ground is the relevant interest to weigh against other public interest consideration favouring disclosure of information .......................... 423

5.3.2 Balancing exercise i.e. comparing relevant factors for and against disclosure ................................................................................................................................. 425

5.3.3 Balancing the public interest factors .................................................. 426

5.3.4 Dealing with any overlap between factors ............................................. 426

5.3.5 The number of relevant factors is not determinative ......................... 427

5.4 Irrelevant factors: Factors which should not be taken into account by a public authority in the weighing exercise ................................................................................................................................. 428

5.4.1 Identifying irrelevant factors .................................................................. 429

5.4.2 Disregarding irrelevant factors ........................................................... 432

5.5 Relevant factors to be considered by a public authority while applying public interest override test ................................................................................................. 433

5.5.1 Factors as a squeal to give effect to the protected interests .............. 434

5.5.2 Relevant factors taken from previous decisions or other sources such as preamble ................................................................................................................................. 435
5.5.3 Relevant factors in favour of disclosure identified from changes in community concerns ................................................................. 436

5.5.4 Relevant factors identified by an applicant or a third party ............... 437

5.5.5 Suggested approach to identify relevant factors favouring disclosure and nondisclosure ......................................................................... 437

5.6 Factors in favour of the disclosure of information .................................. 438

5.6.1 Government accountability ................................................................. 438

5.6.2 Public participation in government ..................................................... 438

5.6.3 Public awareness .............................................................................. 439

5.6.4 Special interest of class (Justice to an individual) ................................ 439

5.7 Factors against the disclosure of information ....................................... 442

5.7.1 Factors underlying exemptions that contain a harm test ................ 443

5.7.2 Efficient and effective conduct of government operations .............. 443

5.7.3 Private interests (fairness to an individual) ...................................... 444

5.8 Overview of exemptions and public interest issues favouring disclosure ...... 446

5.9 Suggestive list of public interest factors drawn from the case laws from overseas jurisdictions which are relevant in context of Right to Information Act .......... 451

CHAPTER 6 ............................................................................................................................. 456

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS ........................................................................ 456

6.1 Conclusion ............................................................................................. 456

6.2 Suggestions ........................................................................................... 466

6.2.1 Awareness raising ........................................................................... 466

6.2.2 Standardising approaches.............................................................. 467

6.2.3 Law reform ..................................................................................... 468

6.2.4 Development of the jurisprudence for the system............................ 468

BIBLIOGRAPHY ..................................................................................................................... 474

Books/Articles............................................................................................................. 474

Seminar/ Conferences .................................................................................................. 476
Statutes referred.................................................................................................................476
Reports/proceedings/debates:.............................................................................................477
Website sources ..................................................................................................................478