Chapter – 9

Findings and Recommendations

9.1 Findings of the study from Maharashtra and Rajasthan

The objective-wise findings of the study are listed below-

- **Objective 1**: To identify the dimensions of quality of services of a Tahsil office.

**Finding 1.1**

The factor analysis shows that the service quality dimensions fall into three factors in case of Maharashtra.

**Maharashtra**

Factor 1 - Cronbach’s Alpha - 0.954
Factor 2 - Cronbach’s Alpha - 0.874
Factor 3 - Cronbach’s Alpha - 0.869
All items within the factors together - Cronbach’s Alpha - 0.958

**Finding 1.2**

The factor analysis shows that the service quality dimensions fall into three factors in case of Rajasthan.

**Rajasthan**

Factor 1 - Cronbach’s Alpha - 0.975
Factor 2 - Cronbach’s Alpha - 0.832
Factor 3 - Cronbach’s Alpha - 0.795
All items within the factors together - Cronbach’s Alpha - 0.956

**Finding 1.3**

The factor analysis of the data of internal customers of Maharashtra shows that the service quality attributes fall into eight factors-

1. Satisfaction with job, training
2. Initial training
3. Information support
4. Equipments
5. Customer expectations
6. Technology
7. Training at regular intervals
8. Training policy

**Finding 1.4-**
The factor analysis of the data of internal customers of Rajasthan shows that the service quality attributes fall into seven factors-
1. Infrastructure and support
2. Competency training for job performance
3. Departmental training policy
4. Training at regular intervals
5. Existing training system
6. Training for stress management
7. Job satisfaction

**Finding 1.5-**
The frequency tables show that the overall satisfaction among the customers regarding the tangibles is-
- Maharashtra- 72 percent
- Rajasthan- 82 percent

- **Objective 2-** To find out the relationship between training and job satisfaction among the employees of the Tahsil office.

**Finding 2.1-**
The frequency of employees who agree that the existing system of training is efficient
- Maharashtra- 4 % fully agree and 13 % partly agree
- Rajasthan- 58 % agree

**Finding 2.2-**
The frequency of employees who agree that newly recruited employees have been trained at regular intervals is
- Maharashtra- 39 % agree and 38 % fully disagree
- Rajasthan- 13 % fully and 33 % partly
Finding 2.3-
The frequency of employees who agree that they have been trained at regular intervals is
Maharashtra- 15 % agree and 69 % disagree
Rajasthan- 13 % fully and 33 % partly

Finding 2.4-
The frequency of employees who agree that they have been trained for what they are doing is
Maharashtra- 35% agree and 58% disagree
Rajasthan- 75% agree and 21% disagree

Finding 2.6-
The responses of the employees whether they should be trained at regular intervals are-
Maharashtra- 99 % agree Rajasthan- 99 % agree

Finding 2.7-
The percentage of employees who are satisfied with their job is
Maharashtra- 42% fully agree; 29% partly agree; 21% undecided
Rajasthan- 81 % fully agree and 15 % partly agree

Finding 2.8-
The correlation and regression analysis shows that the employees’ job satisfaction is a function of training at regular intervals, efficient training system and job training.

Maharashtra- Satisfaction with job=
0.861 + 0.398 (Training at regular intervals) + 0.394 (Efficient training/ Transfer of learning) + 0.131 (Training for Competency)

R= 0.813 R square= 0.661 sig.= 0.000 p < 0.01
Objective 3-To find out the relationship between satisfaction with training and quality of services delivered.

Finding 3.1-
The satisfaction among the employees regarding training is-
Maharashtra- 12% fully agree 24% partly agree; 23% partly disagree and 21% fully disagree
Rajasthan- 41% fully agree and 41% partly agree

Finding 3.2-
The frequency tables show that the overall satisfaction among the customers regarding the quality of services is-
Maharashtra- 63 percent
Rajasthan- 82 percent

Finding 3.3-
The correlation and regression analysis shows that the customer satisfaction is a function of employee behavior that instills confidence, modern looking equipment, prompt service and provision of information in case of Maharashtra.
Maharashtra-
Customer satisfaction = 0.112 + 0.411 (employee knowledge) + 0.349 (modern looking equipment) + 0.227 (prompt service) + 0.213 (provision of information)
R= 0.841 R square= 0.707 sig. = 0.000 p< 0.01

Finding 3.4-
The correlation and regression analysis shows that the customer satisfaction is a function of employee knowledge to answer questions, responsiveness of the employees, provision of information and courtesy in case of Rajasthan.
Rajasthan-
Customer satisfaction = .249 + .367 (Knowledge to answer questions) + .318 (Responsiveness of the employees) + .099 (Information provided by employees) + .174 (Courteousness of employees)
R= 0.928 R square= 0.862 sig. = 0.000 p< 0.01
• **Objective 4** - To find out the relationship between a well defined training policy and employee satisfaction with training.

**Finding 4.1**-
Regarding the departmental training policy the responses of the employees are-
Maharashtra- 99 % fully agree
Rajasthan- 97.5 % fully agree while 0.6 % partly agree.
Findings 2.1 to 2.7, 3.1 also apply to the objective number 4.

• **Objective 5**- To compare the training polices of Rajasthan and Maharashtra.

**Finding 5.1**-
The Z statistics for population comparisons for internal customers at P < 0.01 and 5% level of significance show that Rajasthan is ahead of Maharashtra in case of services and equipment, availability of funds, physical appearance of offices, toilets for employees, availability of books, staff, employee training, information, technology, recognition, efficiency of training system, job satisfaction, satisfaction with training.

**Finding 5.2**-
The Z statistics for population comparisons for external customers at P < 0.01 and 5% level of significance show that customer satisfaction is much more in Rajasthan than Maharashtra.

• **Objective 6**- To provide guidelines to frame training policy for the employees of Tahsil offices from the State of Maharashtra so as to improve the quality of service provided to the customers.

All the above findings contribute to the fulfillment of objective 6.

9.2 **Additional findings regarding employee stress**

1. **Findings for Maharashtra**

**Finding 1.1**- Stress and Expectations from people
Test of significance: Chi-square test statistic: 33.454, p-value < 0.01. Hence we conclude that there an association between work related stress and more work expected from employees.
Finding 1.2- Stress and job satisfaction
Test of significance: Chi square test statistic: 15.255, p-value < 0.01. Hence we conclude that there is an association between work- related stress and being trained for job competency.

Finding 1.3- Stress and recognition for good work
Test of significance: Chi-square test statistic: 13.840, p-value < 0.01. Hence we conclude that there is an association between work- related stress and recognition for good work

2. Findings for Rajasthan
Finding 2.1- Stress and Expectations from people
Test of significance: Chi square test statistic: 5.367, p-value > 0.05. Hence we conclude that there is no association between work related stress and more work expected from employee

Finding 2.2- Stress and job satisfaction
Test of significance: Chi square test statistic: 7.720, p-value > 0.05. Hence we conclude that there no association between work related stress and being trained for what employees are doing.

Finding 2.3- Stress and recognition for good work
Test of significance: Chi square test statistic: 2.294, p-value > 0.05. Hence we conclude that there no association between work related stress and job satisfaction.

9.3 Applicability of the Quality Principles of Deming
The results of the study show that most of the fourteen key principles to managers for transforming business/ organizational effectiveness offered by Edward Deming are equally applicable to the Government organizations as well. These principles, a core concept on implementing total quality management, are a set of management practices to help companies / organizations increase their quality and productivity.

1. **Create constancy of purpose for improving products and services.**

   The constancy of purpose is an inseparable part of quality management. Here, in the context of services of the Tahsil offices, we do not discuss ‘total quality’ but the minimum acceptable quality standards to start with. Many a times it is observed that the original purpose of the service is lost in excessive pressure of rules and regulations. Constancy of purpose coupled with simplifications of rules and procedures will greatly improve quality service delivery. The issue of caste or domicile certification is a classic example of service which is drifted from its original purpose due to innumerable rules, GRs and guidelines.

   - Plan for quality in the long term.
   - Resist reacting with short-term solutions.
   - Don't just do the same things better – find better things to do.
   - Predict and prepare for future challenges, and always have the goal of getting better.

2. **Adopt new philosophy.**

   The age old methods and procedures of working need to be replaced by modern philosophy of working. New philosophy with old values and ethics is the mantra of the times.

   - Embrace quality throughout the organization.
   - Put your customers' needs first and design products and services to meet those needs.
   - Be prepared for a major change in the way business is done. It's about leading, not simply managing.
   - Create your quality vision, and implement it.

3. **Cease dependence on inspection to achieve quality.**

   Revenue machinery strongly believes in inspections for quality management. The belief has to be removed. Management of quality at each and every step
automatically eliminates the need of inspection and dependence on others to check quality and finding mistakes. Self awareness of quality needs is essential. ‘Massive training is required to instill the courage to break with tradition. Every activity and every job is a part of the process’ (Reilly N B \textsuperscript{325}, 1994) is perfectly applicable if this aim is to be achieved.

- Inspections are costly and unreliable – and they don't improve quality, they merely find a lack of quality.
- Build quality into the process from start to finish.
- Don't just find what you did wrong – eliminate the "wrongs" altogether.
- Use statistical control methods – not physical inspections alone – to prove that the process is working.

4. **End the practice of awarding business on price alone; instead, minimize total cost by working with a single supplier.**

The principle is not directly applicable to the services under study.

- Quality relies on consistency – the less variation you have in the input, the less variation you'll have in the output.
- Look at information suppliers as your partners in quality. Encourage them to spend time improving their own quality.
- Not all services come without a price tag. Provision of all services free of cost is not possible in today’s financial position of the department. It is time that the leadership thinks of putting a price tag to the services offered. The fees charged may be very small for any common citizen to afford but equally good to create revenue for sustenance of the department and maintenance of quality. The basic needs like photocopying, stationery, maintenance of machine (like computers, fax, Xerox) may be taken care through these funds. A PPP model suggested above may also be given a thought.

5. **Improve constantly and forever every process for planning, production and service.**

   This principle too applies to the services under study. Innovation is the key to improvement and sustainability. Innovative practices like ‘Door-delivery of Food-grains’ instantly became popular because of their reliability and utility.

   - Continuously improve your systems and processes. Deming promoted the Plan-Do-Check-Act approach to process analysis and improvement.
   - Emphasize training and education so everyone can do their jobs better.
   - Develop a model to reduce waste and to improve productivity, effectiveness, and safety.
   - We are very good at planning but equal weightage should be given to implementation of the plans.

6. **Institute training on the job.**

   As discussed in the previous chapters training is extremely neglected in this organization. On the job training has been suggested by the Anderson Manual almost 80 years ago. Still we are far from achieving it. On the job training should be institutionalized. Provision of *mentors* to newly recruited employees and on the job training through planned inputs and supervision by the mentors will build the knowledge, skills and confidence among the employees. The method does not need additional expenses but it can effectively and completely replace formal institutional training.

   - Train for consistency to help reduce variation.
   - Build a foundation of common knowledge.
   - Allow employees to understand their roles in the "big picture."
   - Encourage staff to learn from one another, and provide a culture and environment for effective teamwork.
   - Appoint mentors for staff improvement.
7. **Adopt and institute leadership.**

This is a very important principle for any organization aspiring for quality. A strong leadership is needed to bring about change which is inevitable if quality improvement is to be achieved.

- Expect your supervisors and managers to understand their staff and the processes they use.
- Don't simply supervise – provide support and resources so that each staff member can do his or her best. Be a coach instead of a policeman.
- Figure out what each person actually needs to do his or her best.
- Emphasize the importance of participative management and transformational leadership.
- Find ways to reach full potential, and don't just focus on meeting targets and quotas.

8. **Drive out fear.**

Innovation should be encouraged but at the same time the achievements/innovations should be rewarded. Fear of failure and lack of recognition of good work should be removed from the minds of employees.

- Allow people to perform at their best by ensuring that they're not afraid to express ideas or concerns.
- Let everyone know that the goal is to achieve high quality by doing more things right – and that you're not interested in blaming people when mistakes happen.
- Make employees feel valued, and encourage them to look for better ways to do things.
- Ensure that your leaders are approachable and that they work with teams to act in the organization's best interests.
- Use open and honest communication to remove fear from the organization.
9. **Break down barriers between staff areas.**

There are invisible barriers between staff areas in all the organizations. Few examples of staff barriers are direct recruits versus promotes; class barriers; social and political barriers. These barriers hamper the growth of the organization and dampen the spirit of togetherness. There should be a spirit of camaraderie among the employees developed through open and supportive policies. Training for all should be coupled with equality for all.

- Build the "internal customer" concept – recognize that each employee is equally important in producing the service and their output.
- Build a shared vision.
- Use cross-functional teamwork to build understanding and reduce adversarial relationships.
- Focus on collaboration and consensus instead of compromise.

10. **Eliminate slogans, exhortations and targets for the workforce.**

- Let people know exactly what you want – don't make them guess. "Excellence in service" is short and memorable, but what does it mean? How is it achieved? The message is clearer in a slogan like "You can do better if you try."
- Don't let words and nice-sounding phrases replace effective leadership. Outline your expectations, and then praise people face-to-face for doing good work.

11. **Eliminate numerical quotas for the workforce and numerical goals for management.**

- Look at how the process is carried out, not just numerical targets. Deming said that targets encourage high output and low quality.
- Provide support and resources so that production levels and quality are high and achievable.
• Measure the process rather than the people behind the process.
• Emphasize on people centric approach rather than purely process centric approach in case of service delivery.

12. **Remove barriers that rob people of pride of workmanship, and eliminate the annual rating or merit system.**

   • Allow everyone to take pride in their work without being rated or compared.
   • Treat employees the same, and don't make them compete with other employees for rewards or recognition. Over time, the quality system will naturally raise the level of everyone's work to an equally high level.

13. **Institute a vigorous program of education and self-improvement for everyone.**

   • Improve the current skills of employees.
   • Encourage people to learn new skills to prepare for future changes and challenges.
   • Build skills to make your workforce more adaptable to change, and better able to find and achieve improvements.

14. **Put everybody in the organization to work accomplishing the transformation.**

   • Improve your overall organization by having each person take a step toward quality.
   • Analyze each small step, and understand how it fits into the larger picture.
   • Involve every employee in the organization in order to achieve a complete change. Partial change takes the organization to nowhere and creates confusion.
• Change should be simultaneous and quick. The longer you take to adapt to change milder is the impact of change.

• Use effective change management principles to introduce the new philosophy and ideas in Deming's 14 points.\textsuperscript{326}

9.4 A possible PPP solution for Better Service Management

One of the principles discussed in the previous section is regarding adoption of a new philosophy. Privatization is the new philosophy. Everything cannot be controlled and managed by the Government. Some of the functions can be handled to the private sector without disturbing the core functions of the department. The following section discusses the concept of a public private partnership (PPP) in quality improvement- especially with respect to the infrastructure and tangibles.

Public Private Partnership means an arrangement between a government / statutory entity / government owned entity on one side and a private sector entity on the other, for the provision of public assets and/or public services, through investments being made and/or management being undertaken by the private sector entity, for a specified period of time, where there is well defined allocation of risk between the private sector and the public entity and the private entity receives performance linked payments that conform (or are benchmarked) to specified and pre-determined performance standards, measurable by the public entity or its representative. PPPs have the potential to be used more widely in India for the delivery of basic infrastructure services. But a set of policy, regulatory and capacity issues will need to be addressed for this to happen. PPP can be applicable to those services which are traditionally supposed to be provided by the Government. PPP has been successfully implemented in infrastructure sectors, first in telecommunications, and now in ports and roads, and in individual projects in other sectors. There is the potential for PPPs to contribute more and help meet the infrastructure gap in India. PPP can bring in quality infrastructure at low costs and affordable prices. Common Areas of Application are as follows- Roads, Schools, Hospitals, Bridges, Water treatment, Property management, Recreational facilities, Information technology, and Social services.

\textsuperscript{326} Adapted from http://www.mindtools.com last visited on 23/09/2013
The Government, due to paucity of funds, time constraints and difficulty in maintenance on account of poor availability of class four staff (ban on recruitment) is unable to provide the necessary infrastructure to the public. It is the principal duty of the Government to provide the basic amenities to the public/ customers. As the Government is unable to provide these facilities at all the places at all the times, a PPP model may help. The ‘Facility Centers’ (FC), as they may be called, may be built, developed and operated by a private company. The land in the vicinity of the Tahsil Office may be provided by the Government. The Government may devise a Special Purpose Vehicle (SPV) to develop, build, operate and maintain the Facilitation Centre. The Facilitation Centre may include facilities like Xerox and Printing hub, public toilets, staff toilets, waiting rooms for the public and rest rooms for the staff, a canteen for the public and staff along with some space for activities like Setu, internet café etc. The wastes generated in the public toilets and canteen can be used to generate either biogas which can be used in the kitchen or electricity for running the facilities. This will ensure waste management as well as an uninterrupted supply of gas/electricity as the need may be. This will also generate local employment and self employment for operation and maintenance of the Facility Center. The facilities may be provided at affordable rates to the public and subsidized rates to the staff.

Figure 9.1 A simple PPP model

SPV- Special Purpose vehicle (Source- Marian M and Magdalena K³²⁷)

We may refer to the Case Study of Sulabh International Social Study Organization (Popularly known as the Sulabh Shouchalaya movement) by S. K. Rastogi\textsuperscript{328}, IIM, Ahmedabad. The recycling of wastes and payment received for the facilities shall provide funds to the Private partner to maintain and sustain the project.

Strategy - The Government may choose any one of the following strategies of operations.

(i) Design-build-operate (DBO)
(ii) Design-build-own-operate-transfer (DBOOT)
(iii) Design-build-operate-maintain (DBOM)
(iv) Finance- design- build- operate- maintain (FDBOM)

The control by the Government may be through regulation (quality control) as is a prevalent practice today.

### 9.5 A Model of service Quality

A model of service quality emerged from the analysis and interpretation of data of this study on service quality of administrative services of Tahsil offices and the role of training in improving the quality of these administrative services.

The model is developed independently by the researcher based on the outcomes of the study. Some of the common attributes of service quality are similar to the Service Quality Model developed by Parasuraman et al\textsuperscript{329} (1985). This similarity cannot be eliminated. It shows how a service transaction takes place between the customer and the service provider (FLE). The customer approaches the employee, interacts with the employee on a number of occasions, the employee too interacts with the customer and exchange of information takes place. The customer arrives with a number of expectations which are converted into perceptions with each transaction with the employee.

---

\textsuperscript{328} Rastogi Siddhartha Kumar, “A Case Study of Sulabh International Social Service Organization”, FPM II Economics, Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad

Any service transaction has two distinct parts— the customer and the service provider. The service transaction occurs between these two parts. The customer approaches the service provider with some expectations in mind. The customer expectations about the service are influenced by the need of the customer, his/her past experiences and the sharing of experiences with previous customers. The customer communicates with the employees or service providers. On the other side, the employees of the organization...
communicate with the customer, try to understand his/ her need, exchange information and process the application of the customer using their knowledge and skills. Actual service may be said to be delivered when the customer’s need is fulfilled and the transaction is completed.

On the other hand, apart from the expectations about the process of service delivery the customers also have expectations about their comfort and facilities. Customers expect basic amenities like washrooms, canteen and facilities like photocopying to be available within a comfortable range and at affordable prices. It is the duty of the organization to provide the facilities to the customers. The organizational policies play a major role in provision of funds and infrastructure in order to sustain provision of these facilities. A model for development of the facilities is presented in a later section in this chapter.

Training is one of the effective and tested tools for performance enhancement, as well as upgradation of knowledge and skills of the personnel. Organizational motivation and morale, as reflected in attitudes and administrative culture, are rendered relevant and sharply focused through effective training programs. The employee knowledge, skills and attitude can be enhanced through planned and focused training inputs.

The awareness of the customer expectations on the part of the management and employees along with an awareness of the concept of service quality forms the base of this model. This awareness will result into policy formation and its strict implementation on one hand and conscious competency development through training of the employees on the other hand. Training too needs a strong policy support from the management or administration. Hence management awareness and support are necessary for quality service delivery.

The model represents all the factors of service quality derived from the study of Tahsil offices and the arrows in the model represent their place of influence at all the stages of creation and delivery of service. The model is more applicable to the services provided by the Tahsil offices from Maharashtra but may be applied to other administrative services as well.
9.6 Recommendations on Employee Training-

Public administration reform strategies are aimed to identify measures for ensuring the modernization of public administration in order to optimize decision-making, to improve human resource management, public finance, quality of public services by promoting and introducing quality management elements. The this study tries to identify the quality policies and their implementation, the use of the quality management instruments in practice and the analysis of the impact of the accession process to administrative setup, regarding the promotion and development of quality management in the Revenue Department by means of the policy documents and strategies in the analyzed states. Through the selection of the analyzed States within the study, the researcher has attempted to offer an overview regarding the introduction and use of the quality management instruments in public administration. The research of this study is based on the policy documents and training strategies in the States analyzed, taken from the Internet, having as source the official websites of several public institutions.

Training is clearly considered as one of the important components of an organization’s human resource strategy, but certain challenges, such as lack of time and budget constraints, impede the ability to train employees. In general, these constraints have a greater impact on smaller businesses than on larger businesses. The fact that respondents from small businesses feel their ability to train is limited may partially explain why they also place less value on training compared to their larger counterparts. This shows a need for effective, low cost training that can be delivered in a timely fashion. Businesses and organizations that use effective training give their employees the knowledge and skills to do their jobs efficiently which is a win-win-win scenario for businesses, employees, and customers. Previous have shown us that most businesses prefer to use online training when they can. As the trend towards online training becomes more pronounced this may help reduce some of the time and cost constraints currently associated with training.

The analysis of the quantitative as well as qualitative data of the internal customers from both the States throws light on a very well defined training need. The Organization’s top management needs to ensure that there is appropriate selection and training of employees so that they are able to perform and display the qualities of
responsiveness and reliability regarded by customers as being important. The public service department needs to provide more training to the employees to enhance their customer service skills. The training should focus on employee ability to help customers resolve their queries and problems quickly. In the process of resolving such problems, they should show a caring, courteous attitude and a sincere interest in helping customers. Furthermore, service providers should improve their knowledge and skills so that they can provide a fast and reliable service to their customers. When they promise to do something for the customer within a certain time, they must fulfill that promise. More importantly, service enhancement through customer orientation will provide the public sector with an opportunity to gain confidence from the public. It is desirable that quality management tools would be implemented in all institutions of public administration - mainly for reasons of transparency, credibility and efficiency.

The employees have strongly held that proper and timely training inputs at various levels of service are extremely necessary for improvement in service quality. The training based on well defined training needs will address the knowledge and skill requirements of the employees making them well equipped to deliver quality services. The people’s needs are continuously changing, so are the technologies and processes. One time analysis of training needs is not sufficient to address these needs. Training needs analysis (TNA) is a continuous process. New needs arise and old ones become redundant. Hence continuous updating of the needs analysis has to be done.

The timely training based on training needs is one of the measures to improve service quality. The analysis of data suggests that there is a need of training at various levels of service. The focus of training should be to transform the functioning from a traditional bureaucracy focusing on the provider to a traditional bureaucratic production oriented towards the citizen; from a traditional bureaucracy focusing on the provider to the determination or co-determination of the provision, oriented towards quality, by the citizen or client. These goals can be achieved by policy reforms and proper implementation of the policies. One of the policies is the training policy. The training policy should have a clearly defined vision, mission and well set goals to be achieved in a time bound manner. Policy without time bound objectives is worthless as it does not impose any time limit for implementation leaving scope for
delays. Training, like medicine, gives best results when given in the right dosage at the right time. Untimely training and medicines both are either of no use or dangerous to the health of the organization or the patient respectively.

Training should be provided at three levels during the service tenure of the employees-

1. At the time of recruitment
2. At the time of promotion/transfer to a new post/deputation to an altogether new department
3. At a fixed interval in order to enhance the knowledge and skills in accordance with the changes in the technology, Acts and rules

The employees, except Tahsildars and Naib-tahsildars are not provided any training on recruitment. An untrained employee makes lots of mistakes. The employee either learns from other senior employees from observation or guidance. The employee also learns from his/her own experiences. The learning takes a very long time and the learner never knows what he has learned is the correct thing or not. This is a very dangerous practice as it does not ensure quality services by the employees. In case of Rajasthan at least the Talathis, who are the grassroots level employees handling the revenue records are given a full-fledged training followed by a strict examination at the time of joining service. They are well equipped with the knowledge about their job and the rules and regulations governing their job. No such training is provided to the ministerial staff in Rajasthan. In case of Maharashtra, the situation is still worse. Neither Talathis nor clerks are provided any induction training at the time of recruitment. The system of regular training is not present in both the States. A few employees get some kind of training sporadically based on their availability at the time of arrangement of the training programme. There is no rule for selection for training; neither is it given on the basis of a well defined training need. The training policy of Maharashtra also falls short of defining the training needs and the criteria for selection for time bound training. Also, in spite of the availability of well established training institutes at different places in the State the training of the FLEs is extremely neglected.

Even in case of the Tahsildars and Naib-tahsildars apart from the foundation training at the time of recruitment, no time bound training is provided during their
service. Those who get repeated training are either posted in one of the training Institutes or has been lucky enough to get repeated training. Also, the training he/she receives may not be useful to the employee. It just provided a change from the routine.

Job rotation is one kind of training which given the employee exposure to various aspects of the job and develops an understanding of the functioning of the organization. The employees have strongly insisted on job rotation in order to achieve efficiency and thorough knowledge of the functioning of the organization and to break the monopoly of employees who are holding the same compilation desk for years together.

Another important aspect is the validation and evaluation of the training. There should be a very strong evaluation system in place in order to study the impact and success of training given to the employees. The transfer of learning to the workplace should be ensured in order to make the training successful and get good returns on the investment on training.

The impact of training can be assessed only when the performance assessment criteria are in place. There is a need to assess the existing performance criteria and lay down new performance criteria in light of changes in the technology and work culture. Also, the working should be more simplified and use of technology, internet and networking should be improved. Online systems should be operated by the employees of the Tahsil office and not by contractual employees.

Employee welfare should also be a part of the policy of the department. The data shows that majority of the employees are facing some kind of stress. Training in only one of the many ways to managing stress. Apart from training regular health check up camps, employee welfare activities, yoga and other activities should be introduced as a policy. The corporate companies are much ahead of the government in this regard. The government should encourage its employees to join health activities and assist them to get the facilities at subsidized rates like the corporate companies. The work-life balance of the employees should be strictly maintained. Ultimately healthy employees run healthy organizations.
Apart from training of the existing staff there is a strong need of recruitment of new staff. The employees have been over burdened with work because of paucity of staff. The reasons for shortage of staff may be non-recruitment of new staff, drafting of good staff member to higher level offices, non-transfer of employees as a policy matter. Another reason is the non-revenue work allotted to the employees. The implementation and monitoring of schemes of other departments like health, education is given to Revenue department resulting in gross negligence of core revenue work. This results in delays, customer complaints and subsequent dissatisfaction. The non-revenue workload should be reduced and core revenue work should be handled seriously and on priority.

There have to be drastic policy changes in order to implement reforms in order to make the service more citizen centric than process centric.

**9.6.1 Induction Training of Class I Officers**

The class I officers from the State Services, especially Revenue Department are required to undergo a two year probationary training period. It comprises of an induction training of around 45 days at YASHADA followed by various attachments to different Revenue and non-Revenue offices followed by an independent posting on one level below the post on which the person is selected.

This pattern of training is followed for the Deputy Collectors and Tahsildars directly recruited through the State Public Service Commission. A similar pattern is followed for the Naib Tahsildars who too are directly recruited through the State Public Service Commission. The current training structure needs lots of improvements as it tries to cover all the general topics common to all departments and Revenue specific subjects within the same framework of 45 days. The district training that follows this foundation training is coordinated by the concerned Commissionerate or Collectorate and YASHADA has no role to play in it.

The Deputy Collectors, Tahsildars and Naib Tahsildars are the functionaries who coordinate a wide range of activities at the District level. They have a diversity of training needs which are to be met through a well-structured training. The training of State level class I officers has to be on the lines of IAS training to equip the officers
for the kind of assignments they are likely to have in the first ten years of their career. The foundation training has to be extremely effective and should create a long term effect on the training. Hence it must have long term objectives to be achieved effectively through a variety of inputs and activities. The structure of training provided today falls short of this requirement. There is a strong need to change the training structure for the Dy. Collectors, Tahsildars and bring it at par with the IAS training. The two years induction training of the officers should be governed by YASHADA as the coordinating and controlling agency. The structure of the induction training may be as shown in the table 9.1 below.

Table 9.1 Possible Structure of Foundation Training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Duration</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Broad contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>*YASHADA Common Foundation Training for All</td>
<td>7 weeks including extra-curricular activities, village attachments</td>
<td>Develop the necessary skills, knowledge and attitudes to discharge the responsibilities of a class I officer of the State Government; to develop a spirit of camaraderie among the officers</td>
<td>Public administration, law, political concepts and economics, management, values and ethics,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maharashtra Darshan- a well-designed itinerary</td>
<td>1 week or a longer duration included in the foundation training</td>
<td>To provide an opportunity to understand the geographical, cultural, historical, political diversity of the State, to know about the other services as well</td>
<td>Visits to various places in Maharashtra and understanding the culture of the place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenue Specific Professional Training at YASHADA</td>
<td>4 weeks</td>
<td>Develop the necessary skills, knowledge and attitudes to discharge the responsibilities of a class I officer of the Revenue Department of the State Government;</td>
<td>Maintenance of law and order, Performing magisterial functions under various statutes, Coordination with the local police and other departments, Conducting of elections, Administration of the land records and revenue system, Disaster management and relief/rehabilitation operations, Implementing development programs, Management skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**District Attachment- To be coordinated by YASHADA</td>
<td>13 weeks</td>
<td>To provide an opportunity to apply the knowledge and skills acquired during the foundation training to real life situation</td>
<td>Attachments to various district level revenue and non-revenue offices and study assignments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>***First phase of debriefing Session at YASHADA</td>
<td>1 week (Optional. This week may be merged with the district</td>
<td>To reflect on the learning and experiences in the district attachments; to fill the gaps in the understanding of the trainee officers; to solve queries/</td>
<td>Seminars, case studies, live projects, group discussions and assignments, panel discussions and sessions to fill any gaps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training</td>
<td>Problems of trainee officers; To prepare them for independent posting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Posting - Phase I</td>
<td>6 months</td>
<td>A preparatory phase to make the officers take charge of an independent post and apply his knowledge and skills. A confidence building exercise. To apply the learning to real life situation.</td>
<td>Decision making, application of the learning to real life situations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Posting - Phase II</td>
<td>1 year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>***Second phase of debriefing at YASHADA</td>
<td>1 week-mandatory for all officers</td>
<td>Problem solving</td>
<td>Seminars, individual presentations, interactive sessions for experience sharing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* The foundation training should be provided immediately after the officer joins service. This does not generally happen because of a number of reasons-
  a) The officers want to write the civil services examination for one more time.
  b) The Divisional Commissioner/District Collector under whom the trainee officer starts his district attachment do not relieve the officer.
  c) Any administrative delays.

YASHADA may declare the dates of the Foundation Training immediately after the joining orders are issued so that all the trainees directly join at YASHADA for foundation training. It should be a policy decision that the officers should directly join YASHADA and begin their probationary period with foundation course. YASHADA should follow it up at the secretarial level to ensure that the newly appointed officers join the foundation course as a single homogenous batch. Only under exceptional cases the officers may be allowed to miss the foundation training. A schedule of all the phases of training should be prepared and communicated by YASHADA well in advance to the departments of the officer trainees. YASHADA schedule should have a strict priority above any other departmental schedules except, may be, elections.

**The district attachments are coordinated by the concerned Commissioner and/or Collector’s office. However to bring uniformity in the inputs of the district attachments and to make them more effective and productive it is recommended that the overall coordination should be done at the State level. Mentors may be appointed to groups of 3-4 trainee officers in order to follow their progress. The mentors may assess the assignments given to the probationary officers. The assessment may be sent
to YASHADA for evaluation and overall performance attachment of the trainees. This will bring uniformity in the training structure and quality in the inputs.

*** The first phase of debriefing is necessary in order to solve any queries or problems of the trainee officers and to prepare them for independent posting. However it is marked optional in order to increase the time for district attachments.

The independent posting is variable in case of the various cadres recruited through the State Public Service Commission. It sometimes varies with the division as well. This is the most important phase in the probationary period as this is the time when the officer gets a chance to apply his learning to real life situations, take decisions and learn through experience. A week’s debriefing session before this phase is highly recommended.

Table 9.2 Duration of on job Training of class I officers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Officer’s Cadre</th>
<th>Independent Posting</th>
<th>Duration in months</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Dy. Collector</td>
<td>Tahsildar</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>One Taluka SDM</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Probationary SDM</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Tahsildars</td>
<td>Naib Tahsildar</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Probationary Tahsildar</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Naib Tahsildars</td>
<td>Awwal Karkun</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Naib Tahsildar (Revenue)</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

****The second phase of debriefing is indispensible and must not be compromised in any case. This phase of debriefing is necessary in order to

1. Take care of all the difficulties and problems the trainee officers might have faced during the independent posting;
2. Experience sharing among the trainee officers;
3. Sessions on topics on demand by the trainees;
4. Prepare the trainees to take larger responsibility as a full-fledged officer.

9.6.2 Mid Career Training of Class I officers

The data on training of officers illustrates that very few officers have undergone training other than Foundation training. Those who have been promoted to higher cadres have not even undergone a single training in their service period. Even
when some officers have undergone some other kind of training there in no set pattern or schedule of this training and sporadically some officers have been selected and sent for training.

The need for mid-career training is derived from the premier that as an officer goes up in the hierarchy the nature of his job changes. Though the statement in the 10th Report of the ARC\textsuperscript{330} is about IAS officers it is equally true in case of class I and class II officers of the State Government. The changing nature of the job needs specialized competencies which cannot be learnt on the job. Hence mid-career training is a must for the State Level officers. The changes in technology, rules and policies too need updating and mid-career training provides a means for this.

A structured mid-career policy on the basis of the policy for IAS officers devised in 1986 and revised in 2007 should be devised by the State Government. There may be two kinds of programmes- compulsory and optional. Both the training programmes should be linked to career progression.

The mid-career training, like the IAS training, should have the following features-

1. Bringing all the officers from the batch together for training and interaction;
2. It should be a mandatory requirement for promotions- non participation may ban further promotions;
3. A training provided between the 7th and 9th year of career, before promotion to a higher level, should be mandatory for all the officers. Similar training is now provided to the RAS officers from Rajasthan. This training will be focused at developing the competencies necessary to handle higher level of job and new responsibilities. Another alternative, like the Indian Revenue Services is to provide compulsory training on promotion. This training may be focused at competency development, especially management and leadership skills, and judicial decision making skills. The course duration may be of one to two weeks.

4. Another compulsory training at the end of 15 years of service and then at the end of 25 years of service may be provided to the officers in order to hone their decision making and managerial skills.

5. Apart from the compulsory training courses specialized optional training courses may be designed for the officers based on their needs. These courses may be on generalized topics like e-governance, stress management, gender issues or very specialized topics which are department specific.

6. Officers may be encouraged to enhance their competencies by attending educational programmes like MBA, MPM, PGDRM, PGDUM, PhD, foreign training along with trainer development programmes like DTS, DoT, TNA, EoT, MoT etc.

7. With the increased emphasis on updating professional knowledge and skills it is important that public servants are encouraged to acquire higher qualifications during their career. Members of Group ‘A’ services should be encouraged to acquire professional qualifications like Master in Public Administration preferably before they reach the level of Additional Collector or IAS. This would be useful since they have to function in an assigned domain where the expectation is of greater professionalism and conceptual understanding. For the same reasons the practice of civil servants writing papers for reputed journals needs to be encouraged.331

9.6.3 Training of Class B, C and D Employees

   Naib Tahsildars are from the group B services and are appointed either by promotion from AK or Circle Officer or by cadre nomination from Civil Service Examination as per recruitment rules 1998. The Naib Tahsildars nominated through civil services are provided foundation training either at YASHADA or at Amravati/Aurangabad/Paithan Prabodhini depending on the geographical area of their posting.

   The study revealed that a very large number of the employees have been provided any training for what they are doing. The existing system of training needs to be restructured in order to cover all the service cadres. All the service cadres have their own place in the departmental structure and have a unique job profile. None of the jobs can be considered less important as each has its specific contribution to the organizational functioning and achievements. It is a typical hierarchical structure in

which the lower strata support the upper ones or in other words the performance of
the upper management is supported and enhanced by the performance of the lower
cadres in the departmental hierarchy.

The lower cadres are actually the frontline employees and service providers to
the citizens. It is the interaction with these employees that the customers decide their
views about the government. For a common man the FLEs are the government! In
case of Naib Tahsildars 67 percent posts are filled through promotion while 33
percent are filled through nomination. Hence only 33 percent of the NTs get an initial
training while a majority of the employees promoted to NT cadre are deprived of any
kind of training. This discrepancy needs to be removed. All the 100 percent
employees recruited as NTs must be provided training. The inputs may differ
depending on the mode of recruitment, years of service completed and cadre from
which promoted to Naib Tahsildar.

The Avval Karkuns or senior clerks are promoted from the clerical cadres.
Circle officers are promoted from Talathi or Patwari cadre. The class III employees
from the front line public interface do not receive any planned training at any time of
their service. No training is provided even after promotion from class III to class II
level though the requirements of the class II are different. The employees are
sporadically sent for training and many a times they are either sent for a training
course which they do not need or not allowed to attend the training course they
desperately need. The training of these front line employees may be arranged at the
District of Sub-Divisional level under the supervision of the Sub- Divisional Officer.
The training may be provided during office hours from say 4pm to 6pm in the evening
for a fortnight followed by an examination. Arrangements may also be made to
provide coaching to employees who are appearing for qualifying examinations.

A very comprehensive training policy for induction training, mid-career
training- compulsory and optional and other training opportunities has to be devised
and strictly implemented in order to improve the performance of the employees and
boost their morale. Coupling the training with service rules is also necessary for
improving seriousness about training.
One striking difference found between the training initiatives of Maharashtra and Rajasthan is that the Patwaris from Rajasthan who are equivalent to Talathis from Maharashtra are given a very comprehensive 9 months’ training in the Patwar Training Centers since 1957-58. The rigorous training followed by a strict examination makes the Patwars eligible for further service. The Patwars who are posted in Tahsil Offices, SDM offices or on field deliver very good services because of the initial training. These Patwars on promotion as Kanungos (Senior Clerks) though deliver good services are not provided any training on promotion. None of the other cadres like Kanungos (AKs), LDCs, peons are provided any kind of systematic training.

The class II and III employees need a systematic training for competency upgrading at regular intervals throughout their career. The training courses may be of two distinct types- compulsory training at recruitment, mid-career and promotion; optional training during service with a minimum of three years of service experience in a particular cadre. These optional training courses may subject specific like finance rules, service rules, revenue matters, information technology, stress management, health management and yoga, personal finance management, values and ethics, change management, mentoring skills and any other topics relevant at that time.

9.6.4 State Training Policy

The State Training policies of Maharashtra and Rajasthan are compared in the previous chapter. The policy documents of NTP, STP- Rajasthan, STP- Maharashtra are displayed at the appendices 1 to 3 respectively. This section is based on the recommendations of the ARC and the researcher’s own interpretations of collected data and service experience as a Senior Class I officer as well as a Recognized Trainer.

The National Training Policy (NTP) implemented in 1996 and revised in 2012 expects all the States to devise their own training policies depending on their specific needs. Based on the Kerala implemented its State training policy in 2003. Rajasthan declared its State training policy in 2008. The State training policies of Kerala and Rajasthan are very exhaustive with clearly defined goals of the policy, vision and mission statements.
The State Training policy of Maharashtra represents all the Departments of the Government of Maharashtra and hence is expected to be very clear and well structured as a guideline for devising departmental training policies. To make the policy document more cohesive and meaningful in terms of its purpose and implementation some suggestions for improvement are suggested below-

A. There should be clearly defined short term and long term objectives set in the policy. Objectives provide a direction to the efforts.

B. The current training scenario in the State and major challenges regarding training should be discussed in order to help the reader understand the background of the policy.

C. Very clear vision and mission statements of the policy should be defined for long term goal setting. The vision and mission statements may be devised on the basis of the NTP.

D. Vision and Mission of the STP-
   Training the employees is a long term responsibility of the Government and perpetuates throughout the career of the employees. Training is necessary in order to accentuate the process of employee welfare through competency development for better performance. Training helps the employees to make conscious efforts to impart their duties to the public on one hand and their organization on the other hand. Today when the moral and ethics of the employees are challenged by the public, the image of the Government is tarnished because of the recurrence of malpractices like corruption training plays a vital role in restoration of the lost image of the government service. The public service should be built on a strong edifice of customer focused management and quality service delivery taking in to account the expectations of the customers and a thriving to fulfill these expectations through a process of continuous development and total quality management. The State training policy should thus have a clear vision and a long term mission to transform the employees into duty conscious, ethically strong, competent, responsive and motivated members of a dynamic workforce committed to the welfare of the public.

A very brief and clear mission statement may be as follows-
The mission of the State Training Policy of Maharashtra is to impart need based training to all the employees of the State Government so as to develop the necessary competencies, right attitude, and sense of commitment, duty consciousness and motivation to take challenges and impart customer friendly services for promotion of welfare of the public.”

E. Training based on Clearly Analyzed needs-
   It is always practical to impart training which is based on scientifically analyzed and Need clearly defined training needs. The STP should provide very clear guidelines for the analysis of training needs of the officers and employees of the various State departments, Agencies and Organizations. The process of TNA may be carried out by external agencies for the sake of quality as it needs lots of time and efforts to apply scientific tools to identify training needs. Also an impartial analysis is possible only when an outsider third party tries to look at the organizational situation from outside than the insider who generally feels that he knows everything about the organization. Correct analysis of performance problems and derivation of training needs is possible when the organization is studied by an unprejudiced agency.

F. Training plan and methodology-
   The STP should provide very clear guidelines for devising a proper training plan and adoption of the right methodology for training. The training plans for all the employees starting from super class I officers to the newly recruited class IV employees should be clearly laid down in the policy in unambiguous terms. Clear guidelines for induction training, mid-career training and optional training courses for various cadres should be laid down in the STP.

G. Availability of Trainees-
   It is a well set and most unwelcome practice that employees are not relieved and sent for training. Many a time’s employees who are notorious and not in the good books of their bosses are sent for training. Also employees come to training with their own personal agenda and hence have little or no interest in training. Many times the nominating authority replaces the nominees at the last moment. The
new person nominated for training at the last moment is not prepared for the training. The investment in training in terms of money, manpower, machinery, materials goes waste in all these cases. A few possible solutions to this problem may be as follows-

- Linking training with need.
- Linking training with service records, promotion, increments.
- Strict rules for nomination of employees for training. Sending the right person for the right kind of training. Stringent selection procedures.
- A strict ban on repeated nomination of employees for training courses- a statewide database of employees may help in tracking these cases.
- Training should be given priority and only under extreme situations should employees be exempted from training.
- Nominations may be invited on rotation and the training institute’s decision should be final.
- Improving the quality of training. Training should be a time for value addition in the knowledge and skills and not just a time for change and relaxation though good and effective training serves both the purposes equally well.

H. Availability of Trainers-
Availability of trainers of good quality in terms of domain knowledge, communication skills and willingness to teach is very crucial in making training successful and effective. The NTP remarks that “trainers are the heart and soul of any training…. Trainers today are picked more by accident than by choice…. It is therefore important to have the right persons selected as trainers because very substantial investment would have to be made in them for modeling them as effective trainers…. A person once developed as a trainer should be used as a trainer even while he is posted in the field.” The State training policy should have clear guidelines about trainer development and availability of these trainers even when they are posted on the field. YASHADA as the apex training institute and implementing agency of the STP should maintain and continuously update a statewide inventory of trainers and coordinate with various training institutes for availability of trainers. A scheme of incentives may be suggested. Even
competent and willing retired officers and employees may be appointed as trainers on contract basis.

I. Roles of Training Institutes-
The State Training Policy should lay down clear guidelines for the role of the more or less regional training institutes like Prabodhinis. Their functioning and responsibilities, target group and type of training they are supposed to conduct. There has to be an absolute role clarity among the existing training Institutes. It may be worked out as follows-
1. YASHADA as the Apex training Institute of the State Government should cater only to the class I and II officers from the State- starting from induction training to retirement planning through mid-career training.
2. The Amravati Prabodhini and Paithan Prabodhini may cater to the class III employees starting from their induction training up to retirement planning through mid-career training. These institutes, like the RRTI and APRTS from Rajasthan may be completely dedicated to the training of NTs (direct and promoted from AKs), AKs and clerks. The Aurangabad Prabodhini may be dedicated to training of Talathis with induction training course for Talathis and mid-term training courses for other class II to class IV cadres.

J. Uniformity in Training Structure-
In order to bring uniformity in the training structure from all the Institutes the pattern discussed in the paragraph on roles of training institutes is a good solution. A committee of trainers from all the training institutes may be formed in YASHADA in order to scrutinize designs of training courses conducted by these institutes. There has to be uniformity in the structure and inputs of similar training courses conducted at different locations. The trainer development courses of the Department of Personnel and Training may be taken as an example of how the uniformity is achieved.

K. Restructuring of existing training courses-
1. Training needs of any organization and its employees keep on changing with time and technology. New policies like the RTI create new training needs. Hence it is necessary to revise the course structure over a fixed period of time. The best
means of restructuring a training course is on the basis of trainees’ feedback. The feedback of trainees attending the training course over a period of time gives a good insight on the changes to be made in the structure of the course. Thus trainee feedback should not be considered merely for reaction level evaluation of the training course but also for bringing about improvements in the structure on the basis of needs of the trainees.

2. Another important activity proposed here is validation and impact assessment of the existing training courses run for a very long time in the training institutes. This exercise should be done at the end of every financial year in order to find out the relevance of the training course and either suggest changes in its structure or recommend termination of the course. The exercise is necessary in order to bring about value addition in the existing courses and create space for new training courses that cater to changing needs. YASHADA may appoint a group of trainers to carry out the job in the month of March every year when there are very few training courses and the faculty members are available.

L. Transfer of learning-
Training has a very specific purpose in organizations, performance improvement or enhancement. Training is said to be successful when it bring about acceptable changes in the performance of the trainees back in their organization. Many a times this purpose is defeated because the course directors are more concerned with the number of training courses arranged by them than the change their training courses brought about in the organization. This is now the need of the time to shift the focus from meeting targets to meeting performance standards. This is a difficult task as many times the trainees do not get a chance to apply the newly acquired knowledge and skills to their job situation. The reasons are many but the solutions are few. Firstly training based on well defined need will ensure that the employee gets what he wants and hence transfer of learning is ensured. Secondly sending the right person for the right kind of training course will also be helpful. Lastly ‘training for all’ will create awareness among the bosses to support their subordinates in applying their newly acquired knowledge and skills to their job. Uniformity in procedures and state-wide networking of the Revenue
machinery will also help in streamlining the processes and increase the efficient application of knowledge and skills.

M. Strict implementation of the training policy-

It has been discussed earlier with reference to the Patwar training in Rajasthan that it is not the existence of a training policy which is important but the will power at the administrative level to impart training to their staff which is more important. In case the Rajasthan the training policy was formulated very recently in 2008 but the training structure is in place since 1957. Thus the training structure was in place much before the policy formulation and implementation. Maharashtra has a different scenario. We have a very weak training structure at present and the policy is in infancy. We need a very strong administrative support and willpower to implement the STP and prevent it from remaining a mere document. For this to happen the policy document itself has to be very strong and should leave no stone unturned and no gaps left for any kind of escape. Training has to be developed into a way of life and an inseparable part of the organizational culture.

9.7 Departmental Training Policy

The Second Administrative Reforms Commission (ARC)\textsuperscript{332} in their tenth report on “Refurbishing of Personnel Administration- Scaling New Heights” published in November 2008 have discussed in minute details the process of capacity building through systematic structured training inputs separately for class I as well as middle level officers and group B, C, and D personnel. The recommendations need to be considered for an exhaustive and clear policy formulation for the employees. The STP and the training structure of revenue staff is discussed in detail in the previous paragraph. The Revenue department needs to devise a comprehensive training policy for the officers and staff.