Conclusion and Findings

The present study focusing on “Social exclusion” seeks to debunk the idea that poverty is due to cultural inadequacies of the poor and underlines the economic, political, and cultural barriers, and discrimination faced by the poor in everyday labour. The first illustration of exclusion of Dalit Safai-Kamgar in India draws on earlier research as well as narrative glimpses on the emerging pattern of manual scavenging (Oommen; Shyamlal; Thorat; Aloysius; Ramaswamy: 2004: 2005; Prashad: 1995, Karlekar: 1982). Historically most stigmatized and marginalized scavenging and other kinds of ‘unclean’ working communities in India, it is observed that this inhuman scavenging labour had been done exclusively by Dalits (Scheduled Castes) across the country. In the case-study discussion, set in Pune in India, the changing dimensions of social exclusion of a particular group of urban municipal workers is explored. This example of case study shows how locally generated processes of identity-based social exclusion are articulating with internationally driven neoliberal policy prescriptions, leading to new forms of economic exclusion that, in turn, intersect with long-standing structural conditions that reinforce social exclusion. The second illustration of exclusion of Roma gypsies has observed its history of racial discrimination and segregation of Roma Gypsies, identity based exclusion reached its apogee under apartheid in Europe in general and Spain in particular. According to European parliamentary data (2004-2009), there are around 12 to 15 million Roma Gypsies living in the Europe; about 10 million live in EU countries. By the other sources, more than twelve million Roma Gypsies have been located in many European countries around the world. Ironically, there is no way to obtain an exact number since they are not recorded on most official census counts. Presently, data provided by social sciences as well as genetic research suggests that 8-10 million Roma Gypsies who live in Europe today are best described as conglomerate of genetically isolated founder populations. The EU consensus State policies have been recommending against continuing discriminatory treatment and exclusion of the Roma in formal and informal labour market. Furthermore, the problem most commonly faced by Roma/gypsy populations are racism and discrimination, low levels of education, high unemployment (50-90%), health standards well below those of the mainstream population, and very poor housing
conditions (Eurobarometer: 2007). In other words, Roma perpetuate as chronically poor, disadvantaged, economically challenged, exploited, stateless, anarchic, unstable etc. The condition of under development has not only persisted across historical time periods, it also extends spatially across large parts of the more densely populated areas of the globe. Roma Gypsies are originally from different European regions, ethnicities and brotherhoods with community support and solidarity networks. In doing so, I tried to separate out the Basque Roma Gypsies from other Spanish Gypsy groups in process marginalization into labour market due to several racial stereotypes.

Once again the focus is on intersection between identity based exclusion articulating in times of neo-liberal policy to form new forms of exclusion in labour. The comparison between these two groups draws upon their common background of ethnic and caste stigma and the way this operates in their labour lives especially in a context of internationally driven economic policy posing challenges to traditional forms of work. The point of comparison is also their organizational efforts under unions and NGOs.

The chapters in the thesis describe the lives and survival pattern of the overall fragmented Safai-labouring castes of Pune and Roma Gypsies (Gitanos) of Spain. This analysis shows that wide ranges of indicators of socio-economic disadvantages have different associations. While studying in a comparative way cross-cultural groups, it is clear that identities have made undeniable gains in socio-economic parameters; but parameters such as ethnicity and caste; sometimes escape the effect of policies as they assume new forms.

I have sketched some preliminary conclusions on how and why social exclusion leads to multiplicity of deprivations in social lives across both cross-cultural groups. This research concludes that both groups face social exclusion in different aspects of their lives. Those aspects are related to perceptions in job security, unemployment, poverty, inadequate government policy intervention and discriminations of new kinds. Both groups show poor health, low educational levels, and low vocational skills in the shrinking formal labour market. In addition, many face discrimination and social exclusion in the formal labour market. Importantly, they consider their ethnicity, underclass or traditional caste labour division of labour as a main reason for their long-term unemployment.
The first chapter set out by stating the dire problems of sanitary occupations across various parts of Pune and India in which I discuss the issue regarding caste-based manual scavenging with special reference to Indian Dalit scavenging communities. By doing so, I observed that there was dearth of literature on the issue of caste and scavenging in the context of Pune Safai and Sanitary worker. Here I have argued that the practices of manual scavenging in Pune is not clearly visible because such practices are diluted by diversification of the work into the Bigari and other sanitary inter-departmental categories under the Pune Municipal Corporation (PMC). Secondly, I extensively reviewed the existing literature concerning the traditional caste inheritance into manual scavenging practices in India from the British colonial period to post-independence India. I further contend by reviewing earlier Safai Commissions and Committee which have been appointed by the Centre and State Governments that working and living conditions have remained relatively unchanged. In this thesis, I examine how scavenging labour is closely related with various socio-economic conditions; such as caste based low status of job and job security Safai workers which influence the perceptions of life and work. Additionally, I emphasize different interrelated self-negating facets that arise in scavenging and Safai work. Drawing upon these questions, I try to bring the issue of manual scavenging into the mainstream debate on the occupational-induced discrimination rather than focus only on caste protocol. Therefore, “Safai labour” is seen as more appropriate to revitalize categories of stigmatized dirty occupations instead of manual scavenging in the globalized world. Then I trace out how the inevitable processes within these Safai labour operate along gender parameters in terms of feminization of Safai labour in some forms of labour activities. In addition, this chapter also draws upon and evaluates some of the insights from Durban (the U.N. Caste and Race Conference at Durban) attempting a comparison of safai-kamgar and Roma gypsies. This comparison is also propelled by one of the theories that link the exclusion of Roma Gypsies in then origin in the caste system in India. The quest for cross-cultural comparison of the study of Dalit Safai-Kamgar with Roma Gypsies was attracted because it allows a global ethnography of stigmatized identities and forms of labour.

In the second chapter, I examine the severe marginalization of Safai-Labour in the social, political, cultural domains using Social Exclusion as a theoretical framework. This chapter draws attention to why caste and manual scavenging issues may be
understood within the framework of Social Exclusion paradigm. I have drawn upon a theoretical framework of social exclusion deploying it relation with the Safai/scavenging labour processes in Indian caste-based Hindu social order. I first reviewed the multi-dimensional facets of the concept of social exclusion. The origin of the concept in Europe; especially in the France, and its development in Third World Asian Countries, was traced. On the other hand, there are related to the concept debates on synonymous-anonymous terminologies, qualitative and quantitative methods of analysis and criticism both by the European and Asian scholars. But primarily my aim was in this chapter is to understand the concept in relation to its global operationalisation, applicability and relevance to the concept to process of scavenging labour in India. Therefore this chapter made an effort to explore the complexities in the available literature of social exclusion as well as to justify its robust employment within the scavenging labour as a rigorous social exclusionary process even in post-independent India and in knowledge industrial societies.

Third chapter maps the research methodology and present an elaboration and rationale for exploring caste and gender sensibilities of safai/scavenger communities in PMC. I argued in the chapter for the need to employ a combination of methodologies ranging from reflexive ethnography on multiple sites through strategies of subjectivation. I made a case for combining the insights from Burawoy’s Global Ethnography and Bourdieus Miseries of the World. Linking the history to research methodology the objective based sample selection process, data collection methods through using reflexive ethnography and qualitative and quantitative analysis of data is laid out.

Fourth chapter deals with the case study for PMC Employees Union (Pune Mahanagar Palika Safai Kamgar Union) which is an active part of Shramik Kamgar Sanghatana to outline the resistance to social, economic discriminations for Safai-karmacharis/sanitary workers. I have explored this chapter with the aid of case study of the PMC Safai Kamgar Union. This relevant chapter on PMC employees union begins with necessary definitions and importance of case study method mapping shifting paradigms in its use though over viewing the three major authors. In the first section lays out the history of PMC Safai Union to be understood through its negotiations, earlier and ongoing resistance and struggle against unlawful resolutions, policies on social-health security made by the PMC as well as State authority against Safai-kamgar. The second section depicted the resistance and struggle for coalition
politics of union. For this my effort was to organize detail archives of various pamphlets published by the union itself. The third section of the chapter reflects on decisive suggestions, corrections on several issues pointed out by the union authority in the field of Safai-labour politics, the role of new middle class among the lower strata, organizational pressure group to bring about change in the mentality of the lower section for their own liberation and entry of Dalits in the present economic reforms, especially challenge of new labour contracts (Thededari), sub-contracts settings in PMC, long delayed procedures of recruiting heirs on Vashila-karar. Fourth section tries to investigate interweaving individual commitments with the union by exploring the views of selected male and female Safai-labour on their various severe personal, social, health and financial issues. In addition, last section tries to scrutinize the existing municipality and factory labour laws, legislations, present key recommendations by the government on Safai-labour.

In the thesis, fifth chapter on the socio-economic parameters explored the life and labour of scavenging labour through intra and intergenerational occupational mobility, effect on workers due to the changing modern technology and contractualisation in PMC sanitation, sewerage and vehicle garbage transportation, union participation of safai-kamgar and their opinions, socio-demographic condition, health problems, political, religious and community participations. Three generation history of their ascribed and achieved employment, poor response by officials and PMC hospitals, labour types, educational and occupational aspirations for their young generation, their opinion on entry of other Savarna castes in these degraded work, discrimination, economic backwardness, income layout, indebtedness and their investment in local finance groups was documented. Additionally, this chapter of qualitative narratives of Safai labour also provides the directions for a quantitative analysis of socio-economic parameters.

Lastly, six chapter focused on the current analyses of "underclass" and "urban marginalization" in the case of Spanish Roma Gypsies by showing wide range of socio-economic indicators regarding their educational, employment and perceived level of job security; education and perceived level of job security. This chapter undertakes a comparison of perceived job security in Roma and Safai workers; source of unemployment benefits and livelihood pattern; social benefits regulations, benefit recipients and types of social benefits; neighbourhood discrimination; and individual
wellbeing. The first section deals with dimensions of underclass exclusion by comparing cross-cultural relations for the case of Roma Gypsies. I have clearly argued the issue of ethnicity/racism in Europe is compatible with Indian caste and its occupational division of labour that are compelled to deprive these traditional occupational groups at large level. On the basis of such arguments, next section of this chapter reviews the existing literature while confronting and contending the questions of labour market exclusion for many of them. Third section understands the Spanish Basque Roma ethnicity by illustrating concrete experience of socio-economic disadvantages and multiple exclusionary processes which are faced by Roma themselves. Fourth section also evaluates the liberal agenda and inclusive strategies of NGOs and Roma civil society through Roma special inclusion and exclusion policies while providing the formal, vocational education for Spanish Basque Roma/gypsies enormous erosion of traditional ethnic economy in Spain. The comparison between the two groups is mapped graphical in the chapter. This chapter will spell out findings and conclusion on comparison between Safai-kamgar and Roma Gypsies that may provide the basis for policy recommendations for their working and living conditions matters. This cross-contextual study argues that a social exclusion framework is particularly valuable in guiding and synthesizing research on multiple exclusions of Safai-Kamgar while suggesting the inclusive measures to liberate them from social and occupational stigma in general and for Roma Gypsies from interracial stereotype and xenophobia within labour market participations, social integration and to have decent life chances across all forms of domains.

The conclusions presented here are based on data generated during over a period living in the Bilbao and Pune during which I undertook extensive participant observations and interviews.

**Major Findings and Conclusion**

While drawing out diverse job security parameters, 11 group categories were formulated based on occupations and gender (N = 117). By measuring these parameters, ongoing and anticipated anxieties or uncertainty of job security among Roma and Safai was estimated. The internal and external forces within labour market jeopardize the basic livelihood and stable job prospects for Roma and Safai workers. According obtained data, following job insecurity parameters could be delineated for Safai and scavenging communities and Roma Gypsies:
1. Feeling secure in present job and business: It can be argued that the Roma Gypsies involved in high risky and menial traditional occupations than Safai workers involved in all ranks of sanitation (Bigari, sweepers and mehtars) were less likely to dissatisfy to be secure in their jobs. Above all sorts of occupational and gender categories, the level of satisfaction upon feeling security in present jobs is slightly positive among both groups. By gender, Safai women workers were more likely to be secure in their jobs even when they occupied worse kinds of jobs than Roma women.

2. Economic crisis, prohibitory laws and sanitation technology as complications for survival: As regards with numerous complications for survival due to economic crisis, prohibitory laws have speeded up privatization; contract labour led subcontracting by creating flexible workplaces as well as arrival of a new sophisticated technologies. These factors manifest a complex situation for job security of Roma and Safai workers. To sum up, Roma workers fully dissatisfied due to economic crisis as compared to Safai workers. By gender parameter, Roma women were more likely to dissipate for their survival due to such job discrepancies vital than Safai women that caused by vital labour displacement.

3. Undergoing work-stress and job demands: On the matter of job stress for Safai worker, it has intensified expectations and responsibilities, ‘newly developed’ workplaces, increased workloads and escalated conflicting demands in the workplace, which, in turn, have created more job stress, rather than enhancing the opportunity for higher job satisfaction. Thus there is significant and positive correlation between job satisfaction and job stress. Roma women than men were fully dissatisfied to be stress-free and job demand in the labour market; whereas the Safai male and female equally dissatisfied by consistent stress. As comparing by aggregating only males and females belonging to Roma and Safai workers, male category from both Roma and Safai underwent more stress than female. It can be argued that both female and males across groups feel equally stressed and job demands on their workplaces due to unhealthy and uncertain working conditions.

4. Facing unsuitable working hours on workplaces: It can be argued that disproportionately for Roma and subsequently lesser Safai workers have to face precarious and dire working condition. By gender, both Safai and Roma females were more likely to be dissatisfied for having excessive working hours. Across all work
activities, many fewer Roma and Safai women than men reported excessive working hours.

5. **Spending most of time/hours in a day for job and business:** On the conditions of work-life balances for Roma and Safai workers when they are engaged in their jobs at routine basis, Roma and Safai workers, irrespective fewer women, reported that they have to spend most of the time for their jobs and businesses. As a result, majority of male workers were unable to spend their time for families, household activities and responsibilities, childcare arrangements, and helping for over-excessive housework.

6. **Earning well paid salary and monthly income:** Income stability is another dimension of income security. It can be argued that Roma workers are less likely to be satisfied than Safai workers due to labour market stagnation; such as informalization of labour, growth in self-employed traditional occupations, lack of formal education, economic crisis in tertiary sector and having inadequate technological skills or upskilling. Disaggregating by gender shows different rankings for male and female salary workers, as is the case with many of the other dimensions of decent work. Roma and Safai women from their working activities were equally satisfied on their income earning. By aggregating males and females within Roma and Safai groups, Roma and Safai males respectively fully satisfy and dissatisfy from their present income satisfactions. On the contrary, female belonging to Roma and Safai groups also more or less equally vis-à-vis satisfy and dissatisfy for income satisfaction.

7. **Facing precarious occupation related health difficulties:** Roma workers agreed fairly more than Safai workers to facing overwhelmingly precarious health difficulties. Regarding occupational segregation, reasonably more than 3/5 Safai in high skilled and risky jobs and ½ Roma recycling, cleaning and itinerant sellers were likely to fully and partial dissatisfy regarding many occupational health problems. By aggregating Roma and Safai males as compared to females fairly agreed over their health difficulties. Especially among the Roma groups, those most affected by the lack of these facilities were merely self-employed workers and largely men as they are supposed to work away from home.

8. **Facing the dangerous and precarious working conditions at workplaces:** Equally, Roma and Safai workers were more likely to agree to facing dangerous and
precarious working conditions at their workplaces. Similarly, it can be argued that roughly less than ½ Roma workers reported to fully satisfy due to not having workplace hurdles and plight. Regarding occupational classification, Roma recycling, cleaning and itinerant buyers as well as Safai Bigari, sweepers and mehtars were likely to fully dissatisfy about their serious and precarious working condition at their workplaces.

9. Having a tough and boring nature of work: Most Safai workers; especially PMC casual and purely contract workers compared to Spanish Roma workers complained about their routine, boring and uncreative nature of their work. They sought more challenging working dynamisms either by changing workloads and contractualisation in Pune Municipal Corporation (PMC). Overall, the most common response of Roma and Safai on working condition was ‘partly challenging and partly boring’. By gender, Roma female responded were likely to fully satisfy for their routine difficult jobs; while Safai female likely to equally dissatisfy and satisfy about their boredom of work. Safai contract woman informants had recently quit the domestic work due to meager monthly income for households.

10. Experiencing closeness and proximity with work and business and people around and their localities: It can be argued that majority of opinions which obtained from Roma and Safai workers suggested sharing with each other due to homogenous identities, cultural background, and caste, religious or even ghettoisation. By gender, females belonging to Roma and Safai workers were likely to be fully satisfied for their attachments to workplace proximity. Disaggregating opinions of Roma and Safai workers, mostly Roma workers and 62% (40 of 65) Safai workers were likely to be fully satisfied for expressing their intimacies into workplace vicinities and milieu.

11. Having a great deal of influence in deciding how to do own work: One of it explains the Roma workers tended to have great deal of influence in deciding how to do or follow their own traditional activities than Safai, sanitary, mehtar and sweepers. It can be analyzed that most of Roma and Safai workers are having a great deal of influence while deciding how to do their own work. Conversely, Roma traditional workers tended to have great deal of influence in deciding how to do own work rather than Safai, sanitary, mehtar and sweepers. Similarly, mostly Roma workers (who mostly engaged in cleaning, self-employment, and market selling and buying trade) have strongly regarded that their cultural inheritance provokes and promotes them
vastly towards self-employed nature of jobs; whereas subsequently Safai workers (engaged mostly in traditional scavenging, cleaning, sweeping, refuge carrying, and corpse disposal nature of tasks) tended to share such kinds of views. By gender, Roma and Safai worker males outnumber females on same views.

12. **Job offers good prospect for career advancement and job and business promotions:** Safai workers tended to be more optimistic than Roma workers for their job career advancements. Based upon occupational nature, about significantly large numbers of Safai workers who are primarily engaged in most dangerous and risky jobs and different ranks of Bigari were quite pessimistic that they would be occupying higher positions under PMC Departments. Even ¼ of Safai workers urged to claim and exercise their customary heir claiming right (*Vashila-Karar*) for their children. By gender, enough numbers of Safai and Roma women compared to their men counterpart were less optimistic; may be because of some work culture adversities: probably career breaks for women are mainly motivated by the need to spend more time with family. These factors interrupt their decisions: need more time for the children, sufficient household income, lack of job satisfaction, need more time for other family members, feeling of being “stuck in a rut” professionally. As working conditions of part-time workers are concerned, Safai and Roma were reported to have income and nature of employment differences compared to that of full time workers. The main differences are that those working shorter hours are less likely to perform complex tasks; part-time workers are less optimistic about their prospects for promotion; part-time workers are less likely to receive training and to learn new things at work; and full-time workers are more likely to find their job intellectually demanding than part-time workers.

13. **Level of job satisfaction:** Overall, a moderately high level of job satisfaction is reported by both. By comparing differently the Roma and Safai job satisfaction level, quite equally 3/8 populations among Roma and Safai workers are satisfied with their jobs and businesses. In accordance with occupational segregations, more than ½ populations among Roma workers who especially engaged in cleaning, street selling, recycling jobs and Safai in sanitary, sweeping and mehtar were more likely to be satisfied in their present jobs or business status. By gender, Safai women were less likely to be satisfied than Roma women; whereas Roma and Safai males were more or less equally satisfied by their jobs; whether based on standardized or non-standardized nature.
14. Underestimation on the basis of job, ethnicity and income status: Roma and Safai workers were able likely to fully dissatisfy due to experiencing underestimation on the basis of their job, ethnicity and the income status. Given each separately, Roma and Safai workers were more likely to dissatisfy due to experiencing discrimination based on their job, ethnicity and income status. Regarding occupational classifications, Roma cleaning, recycling and itinerant buyers were likely to fully dissatisfy than Safai Bigari, sweeping and mehtars discrimination based on their job, ethnicity and income status. By gender, females outnumber males belonging to Roma and Safai workers in feeling discrimination based on their jobs, underclass and ethnicity.

15. Feeling of isolation from mainstream: Roma and Safai workers were more likely to dissatisfy due to feeling of isolation from mainstream society. It can be argued that Roma are more likely to feel isolation from mainstream society than Safai workers. By gender, Roma and Safai males outnumber females vis-a-vis feeling of isolation. To be more specific, the lower rates of exposure and lack of friendships of Roma in Bilbao to mainstream society, including policing and cultural stigma create ethnic barriers. And eventually the low socioeconomic status of Roma workers may persist, risking the creation of persistent underclass status. Whereas the isolation of Safai castes and communities, traditional Safai workers are caused by the extreme poverty, feelings of marginalization, low sense of citizenship and social isolation. There are also lack of opportunities for civic participation, lack of opportunities for cultural expression, and lack of understanding from mainstream.

Drawing upon the results of job security parameters, it can be argued that Roma workers face lesser and lesser vertical occupational mobility due to reluctant tendency of third-generation youth toward formal and productive educational aspirations; cultural dogma to be avoiding the suppression of Roma from mainstream cultures in the absence of urban assimilation and class based occupational fluidity. On the contrary, Safai workers strive more towards a high vertical occupational mobility than Roma due to having inevitable urban and modest socio-political assimilation that leads their consciousness towards more class and less caste based intolerances of mainstream society; the constitutional reservation based on caste and socio-cultural backwardness which enable most of these traditional scavenging and Safai castes and groups for basic formal education and self-independence. To be more specific, the
lower rates of exposure and lack of friendships of Roma in Bilbao to mainstream society, including policing and cultural stigma have led to create ethnic barriers.

Before moving to conclusions it may help to recall that this study begun with a set of questions about why we may locate scavenging labour as a form of social exclusion:
1. Why are scavenging castes relegated to class IV in all government institutions despite several rehabilitation programmes and schemes for their emancipation by central government as well as states government too? What are thus the objective conditions of exclusion?
2. How does the scavenging labour become a rigid caste-based occupation wherein scavengers begin to think that is their privilege and right to do the hereditary occupation of scavenging and manual jobs? What are subjective positions of exclusion?
3. How do women scavengers perceive dual kinds of labour exploitation mediated by caste and gender? What are subjective positions on intersections of caste and gender exclusion?
4. What does mean national development and progress engineered by in process of globalization when seen from the standpoint of Safai Karmacharis who have no say on or benefit from such progress? Should not the quality quantum and scope and such progress be measured against the rights status of the Safai Karmacharis?

The study also evolved as comparative one, albeit accidentally asking how comparison may help us to understand ways in which racial and caste based exclusions are taking new forms consolidating under global capitalism.

Research questions thus framed were:
a) How does caste based low status of job, job insecurity and low education level affect Safai Kamgars perception of life and work?
b) How do Safai Kamgars perceive their multiple exclusions across different life domains?
c) How do caste and gender concretely associate with multiple exclusions of Safai Kamgars?
d) How does the union intervene in processes of exclusion? What are the inclusions and exclusions fostered by the unions?
e) What does a comparison between Roma/Gypsies/Gitanos and Safai Kamgars open up for an interest in social exclusion?

Conclusions
The research findings from two field sites pointed to a much more complex picture of interplay among caste, class, gender and ethnicity. The findings are interesting in a number of respects. The present study reveals ways in which caste-racial/ethnic background, mediate labour market participation to create multiple exclusions in life domains. There are three major and other co-findings of this thesis:

1. **Significant relationship between the caste, gender division of labour in safai scavenging works**
Drawing on ethnographic work conducted among municipal officials, PMC employee union supervisors, street sweepers in Pune, multiple domains of labour practices among the PMC Safai workers are of serious concern within social exclusion discourse. As a result of small sample size and some incompatibility PMC contract and permanent categorical proportions, this research leaves more questions than answers. The case of safai labour demonstrates that the gender and caste divisions of labour in Pune District have been historically linked with the practices of social hierarchy and occupational traditional legacy. The connection between caste and gender is most evident in the differential control men exercise over women’s identity, labour and sexuality; this had tended to favour men. In other words, contemporary forms of lower-caste women’s labour in India are historical consequences of both their gender and their caste positions in society, especially more so the context of changing scavenging labour relations. To see why the women belonging to scavenging communities are shifting their occupation from domestic servant to contract sanitary labourers is important. Their status in two hierarchies- caste and gender - women belonging to scavenging and safai communities serve as handmaidens to the community’s changing economic needs and social space. Scheduled Caste women are in greater number engaged in the occupation constituting 24.6% out of total SCs percentages as 64.5% compared to women across other castes categories. Roma Gypsy women engaged in either nursing janitor (7.7%) and scrap collecting being support to petty traditional itinerant businesses constitute 20%. Unlike men from both segments of Safai labour and Roma, the occupational health of women in these menial jobs indicates much more at stake. Their unorganized manual
labour occupations, due to the appointed state safai labour commissions like Lad commission, Malkani commission etc., have been replaced by a variety hereditary municipal paid jobs as well as the insecure safai jobs under contractual or sub-contractual system in the increasing advanced and technological sanitary labour systems. The consequent breakdown of old scavenging labour system and its transform into advanced sanitary cleaning methods intensifies the intersecting exclusion based on caste and gender.

2. Significant relationship between ethnic/racial, gender divisions of labour in Roma ethnic diaspora

Spanish Roma gypsies have seen one of most historical persecuted ethnic-minority groups in the European countries in general and Spanish Basque Roma communities in particular. The case analyses show that majority of population sustain decent livelihood and quality of life due to extreme stereotyping attitudes of non-Roma gypsies toward gypsies, inadequate labour participation due to lack of formal or vocational education in government led public institutions, non-endorsed ethnic minority status among many European countries, and acute scale of job insecurity in their own traditional tertiary employments such as metal scrap collections, and street vending etc. The first finding is related to Roma/gypsy community’s socio-economic status. Roma gypsy community has problems accessing social benefits of education, health and the labour market in addition to having negative living conditions. The arguments of “underclass” and “urban marginalization” coincide with these results. Not only occupation, but also race, ethnicity and gender are linked together with Roma status as ‘inferior’ citizens. Secondly, Roma community is a closed community in their relations with non-Gypsies with regard to marriage and social network. The third finding is associated with Roma community’s perceptions of their identity, which shows variations within community. In this regard, Roma is taken to be the ‘‘other’’ of not only the non-Gypsies but also Gypsy identity is accepted as the ‘‘other’’ even of Roma. To gender understanding, labour market barriers faced by Romas in Spain, however, there is a widely shared negative common perception of Roma. They are seen as a group that is resistant to integration. In this context, barriers against the entry of Roma in the labour market are quite significant. It is commonly believed that Romas “do not work”, or even “would steal from their employers”. Employment offices report that many companies openly refuse to employ or even
interview Roma applicants. As a rule, employment discrimination is more visible in the practice of private companies, but is not limited to the private sector. Indeed, Roma NGOs have registered numerous cases of discrimination by both private and public employers. These practices are even more acute against Roma women. Additionally, Roma women also carry the burden of maintaining and preserving the purity of caste and ethnicity.

3. Intergenerational mobility and occupational trajectories

The intergenerational occupational mobility is found to be relatively high among Safai communities due to caste based inherited status and inevitable drop out from the mainstream vernacular education and customary law of government. State transgresses labour security laws and fostered formal contract labour and subcontracting. Whereas both intra-generational and intergenerational occupational mobility among the Roma Gypsies is found merely low due to massive change in labour market and skills and erosion of traditional ethnic economy. In addition, Safai Kamgars occupy higher proportion of occupational engagement in both formal and informal sanitary and cleaning jobs. The result shows that the sweeping and sanitary as well as well as into other cleaning and health departments are highly occupied by significant population of Scheduled Castes (SCs) consists by 64.6%; subsequently Nomadic Tribes (NTs), Other Backward Castes (OBCs), and Scheduled Tribes (STs) constitute 20% and unreserved castes Safai workers (15.4). Whereas Roma Gypsies occupy higher proportion of occupational engagement approximately scrap collecting jobs, street selling, recycling typologies (garbage collection, care-repairing selling and buying). Some proportion did not get in the miscellaneous engagement like criminal and drug peddling or trafficking due to multi-tasking nature of Basque Roma groups. Roma Gypsies occupy the recycling/ tertiary nature of job scrap collecting dealt with 38.5%; subsequently market vending/peddling/hawking (17.3%), other semi-skilled jobs (painter, carpenter, janitor, mechanic (15.4%). Importantly there is prevalent category as a social educator in private State and national organisations enumerates 21.2% out of total sample population. In the case of Roma recycling workers, it seemed that social exclusion did not cause in lot of unhappiness and anxiety in a newcomers.
4. Increasing forms of informal labour

Roma/Gypsy people limited chances in labour market in addition discrimination and segregation together contributes their exclusion. They also lack access to social benefits. While informal work helps families make a living and survive in the short-term, it further contributes in the long-term to erratic livelihoods and economic uncertainty in the long-term. A large labour force outside the formal market has negative effects on government tax revenues, economic productivity, and the establishment of a stable market economy. Hence, Gypsy/Roma people belong to lower class and class position is seen like a stigma due to nature of job holding through irregular, occasional and poorly-paid, part-time, underemployment, underpaid work, and self-employed etc. To Safai workers, the processes of industrialization, modernization and now with globalization have initiated changes in the caste status and occupation which have led to the social mobility of lower castes/occupational groups. The occupational mobility shows various directions of change in occupation, a large number of persons in the present generation have moved towards other jobs—such as contractor, industry house-keeping labour suppliers and so an so forth. The younger generation of Safai communities probably does not show any interest in traditional work because of the stinking nature of the work and the lower status it carries in the occupational hierarchy.

To Roma, negative stereotyping concretely involves and worsen their possibilities to an equal enjoyment of all basic human rights such as housing, health care, education, employment, participation to political life, access to law, justice and legal remedies. When looking at research results it is important to keep in mind the historical background of the analysed situation. As regards data on Roma it is important to understand how the traditional economic activities they have been developing until now are being either destroyed or restructured due to further market requirements. That is the case for scrap metal, paper, and industrial waste, and more recently to the mobile trading who are no longer viable alternatives for the younger generations. They have to look for other labour options. They have already started to do so. The results of the research show that despite recent developments in the Spanish labour market, especially concerning improvements in activity rates and reduction in unemployment, unemployment continues to have the greatest effect on those facing greater difficulties in gaining access to the labour market, which is the case of the
Roma population. Altogether this obvious under-representation in the labour market, the results also point to serious situations of disadvantage in the said labour market giving rise to initial disqualification preventing merited and desired permanence in job posts; a high degree of precariousness; and persistence of non-regulated activities and non-protected employment spelling the absence of labour rights.

5. Pro-active role of voluntary organizations against precarious nature of labour
The Dalit Safai Trade Union has brought about change in improvement of their social and occupational status, but not at large scale. Safai union are more active in resisting and negotiations with government appointed Safai Commissions in order to prevent the hereditary character of caste based recruitment and trying to homogenize all the departmental designations refuting the customary labour laws in Safai works. Safai kamgar’s income poverty and economic growth is subject under the state´s capricious nature, revised, reconstructed Safai Commissions and political community leaders. While Roma Civil Society including various voluntarily public and private organizations; such as FSGG and KDK, have brought out change in national ethnic minority status and compensatory educational benefits for Roma kids and their traditional skills by providing formal education and training. Roma income poverty and economic growth is subject under the NGOs and INGOs project cultures and social accountability with their institutions. It is in micro level.

6. Modes of Inclusion of Roma and Safai unions and organizations on persistent labour exclusion, Stigma and humiliation

1. First Mode of Inclusion- Prevention of exclusion, caste stigma through promoting the Safai labour into sole job designation as “Safai Bigari”. Union literature depicts the resistance and struggle for coalition politics of union, the institutional inclusion efforts of the PMC Safai Employee Union and historical reorganisation of formal and informal labour; forms of past and present negotiations, resistance and struggle against unlawful resolutions, policies on social-health security and modernization of sanitation techniques made by the PMC as well as State authority. Historically, Pune Shramik Trade Union has emerged from classical left ideology against the Indian State’s exploitative and capitalistic policies for downtrodden labour working classes for their intrinsic survivals and labour dignity. It has immensely contributed for informal based menial working class mobilizations, the movements of mobilizations against right-wing and mainstream state apparatus had resulted in the formation of
legal state recognized trade union in Pune. Moreover, it seeks to demolish the caste-ridden mentality of Safai workers and tries to address the caste inheritance right to work in PMC service. The traditional caste inheritance into manual scavenging practices in India from the British colonial period to post-independence India. It is examined that how scavenging labour is closely related with various socio-economic conditions; such as caste based low status of job and job security Safai workers which influence the perceptions of life and work. "Safai labour" is seen as more appropriate to revitalize categories of stigmatized dirty occupations instead of manual scavenging in the globalized world. So to say, Safai Kamgars Union is active in resisting and negotiating with government appointed Safai Commissions in order to prevent the hereditary character of caste-based recruitments. Ironically, the practices of manual scavenging in Pune are not clearly visible because such practices are diluted by diversification of the work into the Bigari and other sanitary inter-departmental categories under the Pune Municipal Corporation. As a result, PMC union works on issues of survival and non-stigmatization of these categories and it also sharpens the questions of present arrival of exploitative sub-contracting labour, constraints within its community leaders and political inheritance thus escalating their efforts to minimize the backlash of consistent changes in sanitation technology. By huge negotiations with PMC and State Commissions (such as Lad Commission and Safai Kamgars Commissions), the union has sought to eradicate the social and moral stigma in different life-spheres of those executing the caste-laden occupational discriminations. The caste-based labour occupancy is a double edged sword which not only instigates their engagement in their traditional poverty culture but also ties-up with technology-induced crises in the multiple labour activities.

Prevention of Exclusion through assimilation and integration programmes and policies through promoting compensatory, intercultural education and formal vocational training (ACEDER PROGRAMME): Against the cultural stigma and consistent economic and industrial crisis in Roma traditional economy, the mode of institutional inclusion by the Spanish public and voluntary organizations/NGOs (e.g., Roma Development Foundation and Kale-Dor-Kayiko etc) have attempted to revitalize the educational reforms for Roma Gypsies whether compensatory, intercultural formal and vocational training. The inclusion is necessary because the Roma Gitanos themselves do not recognize their different forms of societal exclusion from
the local, national and international policy ramifications. By the effect of it, the State and European inclusion has intangibly developed in terms of Roma and non-Roma togetherness, integration and assimilation policies do even leaving challenges before active citizenship and nationality as Spanish-Basque due to having neither unique cultural groups nor homogenous by other autonomous regions. As organizational inclusive consensus over the social and economic security assistance in Basque State is concerned, it defines the social exclusion of Roma/Gitano can be seen as emerging from various stereotypes of a group or community within society. Roma exclusion is seen on the basis of sex, racial ethnic group, and by the educational illiteracy. Similarly, “the general level of exclusion can even be understood in terms of the collection of the Renta Basica and Paro (house rent assistance). Basque government provides unemployed people such kinds of assistance so they do not feel excluded. The system of social security against multiple exclusions works out in the forms of the economic assistance (ayuda) as a main source of income in Basque Country which are paid very modest to unemployed people compared to other Spanish provinces. Since the onset of Roma assimilation and mainstreaming by stimulating formal and vocational education, unlike the adhoc efforts taken by Basque Roma organizations, numbers of suggested education policies and programmes by local Basque socialist and democratic government have failed to execute proper implementation. Consequently, Roma Basque organizations, whether State-driven or private stake-holding, have been taking small-scale initiatives Intercultural and formal vocational technical education and also compartmentalize the Roma traditional informal education. Due to lack of implementation of the compensatory education programme, Roma civil society organizations have able to create space by getting cooperation between Basque Public schools and Roma groups; especially kids. These efforts of Roma Gypsy organizations create spaces in the menial, flexible and short-term municipal contact jobs such as painters, drivers, carpenters and shop assistants especially for Roma men and janitors or cleaners for women in public hospitals and old-age sanctuaries.

To sum up, the social exclusion framework seeks to debunk the idea that poverty is due to cultural inadequacies of the poor and underlines the economic, political, and cultural barriers, and discrimination faced by the poor in everyday labour. Thus, social exclusion of Romas can be viewed as persistent phenomenon due to lack of
educational deprivation and their traditional role in tertiary labour market. Therefore the role of Roma organizations which serves as catalysts for social change is become important. In addition, it can be explicitly seen that exclusion of Roma/Gitanos can be seen into various stereotypical forms against a group or community within society. The apartheid discrimination is experienced by all kinds of groups such as blacks, whites, and other brownish people. With gender point of view, it is said that women face triple exclusion due to their biological and social constructed reality by the society. Exclusion of women is underlined by sex, racial ethnic character, and even the educational illiteracy. Under the Roma NGOs project that entitled “mainstreaming the people”, the processes of exclusion and inclusion suggest equal justice in the opportunities in work, workplaces, in an education for each segment of minorities within society other than pushing into margin”. That is why the social inclusion would have to be focused on the integration and participation of the members. Ironically, Roma faces inevitable exclusion from “Equality in opportunities” and it is still escalating.” From the labour point of view and labour market insecurity and income uncertainty, the social exclusion and underclass status raise the question that the informal Roma workers have concentrated in ghettos or decaying peripheries or dispersed as homeless. The problem emerges due to the lack of training for the skilled and professional jobs but 30% among them have recipients of social assistance by Basque State. Presently, the regular occupational income for them is found to be critical. Traditionally, the recycling/itinerant jobs of the Gitanos are dwelled into peripheral economy. Since last 70 years, the traditional jobs of Roma Gitanos are informally accompanied with industrial recycling sector despite having assimilation and inclusion policies by Basque government. Ironically, their informal and tertiary low-income jobs work does not recognize as per industrial workmen laws. In addition, Roma Gypsies are enormously displaced from traditional jobs because of newly emerged tertiary sector while modifying old recycling trades that require particular skills in recycling waste material collection. That recycling skill is not met by the high-skilled formal and vocational training under State integration policy. It caused inevitable uncertainty to survive their livelihood. Presently, picking the industrial waste or scrape is legally an offence because the scrap materials surrounding industries are regarded as commercial asset under new environmental pollution acts. Moreover, under such recycling restriction, the vast industrial modernization is taking place to be avoided the waste and soil pollution. No industry
wants to recycle the industrial garbage. Industrial garbage becomes an asset and valuable to industries. The scrap collection work is undergoing more critical situation in which the market recession reduces the prize values in the market. There are lots of private metallic scrap collecting enterprises adjoining with stills factories. By that mean, such displaced economy is bringing new forms of unemployedness and insecurity. It can be said that the situation broke the employment security and income and thrown out from their traditional skills. The picking the metal garbage is almost prohibited by reinforcing state regulations. As economic security and rehabilitation, Basque government continued social minimum (Ayuda economica publica). This assistance guarantees as monthly paying 600-700 Euros for house rent. Preliminarily, such kind of state assistance is preferred to mostly qualify people. Among the chattara occupations, many Roma have presently entered in street selling jobs.

2. Second Mode of Inclusion - Administrative Inclusion (appraising the guidelines of Lad Committee Report on Safai and scavengers).

PMC Safai Employees Union contributes to bring about changes in social and occupational status and even leftist ideology based political perceptions within Safai and scavenging castes ghettos in Pune by confronting with Safai Commissions and State agenda to withdraw the caste-ridden customary recruitments of backward Safai castes and also executed to homogenize all traditional caste-laden derogatory working designations into common paraphrase called as “Safai Bigari”. The registered PMC Safai Employees Union claims that PMC has continued subcontracting a large number of workmen on contract basis and that too in blatant disregard of the provisions of the Contract Labour (Regulation and Abolition) Act, 1970. These contract labours in PMC involve the work of lifting, deposing human corpse, crematorium work, transporting dumping of debris, garbage, slit, house gully material so on and so forth. However, BMC Act enumerates the obligatory and discretionary duties to the municipal corporation. Its Section 61 gives a list of the obligatory duties of the Corporation regarding cleansing of drains and drainage, scavenging and the removal and disposal of excrementitious and other filthy matters, and of all ashes, refuse and rubbish for which it shall be incumbent on the Corporation to make adequate provision by any means or measures which it is lawfully competent to use or take. Section 63 of the BMC Act enumerates several duties which may be provided for by the Corporation at its discretion and Clause (k) of Section 63 provides, "any
measure not hereinabove specifically named, likely to promote public safety, health, convenience or instruction.” Furthermore, the government had appointed the Lad Committee to suggest various measures to redress the grievances of Bhangi/Safai workers employed in the service of Municipal Corporations and Municipalities. The efforts of Safai Commissions and Committee which have been appointed by the Centre and State Governments that working and living conditions have remained relatively unchanged. Under the existing recommendations and suggestions of municipal laws and Safai commissions and committees (e.g. Lad committee), the PMC Safai Employees Union deliberately attempts to set the legal framework under the registered Pune Shramik Trade Union for the improvement of working and living conditions of informal contract workers. It also suggests to the State government bodies to be reformed the aberrant provisions within committee’s recommendations that lead to persistence of these workmen in their traditional jobs (mainly for the SCs) and precarious health conditions.

Similarly, the inclusionary model of Roma civil society has been undergoing noticeable change for the improvement of their quality of life. As a third mediating tool with collaboration with Spanish public social and financial institutions (e.g. EDE Foundation, Roma Community Development Foundation-FSGG etc), the non-profit Gypsy voluntary organisations (Kale-Dor-Kayiko and Initiativa Gitana, Baracaldo Gypsy Association-ASGB etc.) has enumerated the demographic population of Roma gypsies by conducting household and income surveys of Gypsies in Basque Country; dispelling drug-peddlers and traffickers in the Gitano community and; protesting and confronting with local and national level for the inclusion as an largest ethnic minority recognition in Spain.

3. Third Mode of Inclusion – Struggling against the process of feminization of labour

In addition, Safai labour operates along gender parameters in terms of feminization of Safai labour in some forms of Safai labour activities. To gender inclusion, the union has explicitly addressed this issue to be expanded the existing women’s labour into other forms of feasible Safai, supervisory, clerical and non-Safai menial jobs. Several attempts of the union to bring together the gender and labour intersection into different forms of disciplinary labour in PMC have become little attentive by the officials. The PMC officials in turn do neither appreciate the labour mobility nor
labour dignity of most traditional caste women (especially belonging to the Valmiki-Mehtar, Matang and Mahar SC castes) to grab different kinds of non-menial jobs despite having modest and good education. Bringing the participatory gender neutrality for decision making in unionized Safai labour, PMC has intentionally institutionalized women representation by bringing them into Union governing committees.

Formalization of traditional Roma women labour through the process of alternative vocationalisation under Spanish ACCDER PROGRAMME: Under various European, Spanish and Basque Roma development plans, most of the Roma welfare non-profit voluntary NGOs (e.g. Roma Community Development Foundation-FSGG) encourages the unemployed and low-income Roma women while providing formal vocational training for nurses, janitors, cleaners, cook and sewing machine operator alongwith mandating inter-cultural education. In last five years, there is reasonable Gypsy women recipients have able to participate in these formal courses and hence could be grabbed specific fix-term temporary jobs. In addition, such formal vocational inclusion also helps these trained women to gain some sort of labour dignity and job demand in the labour market and their own Gypsy community.

7. Adopted privatization- mechanization of manual sanitary works
I studied all kinds of sanitary workers and their affiliated Departments to determine whether they considered privatising the contracting sanitation collection service. The presence of a PMC municipal sanitation union reduces the likelihood that a city considers the contracting-out option and the likelihood of adoption of the privatization alternative. Labour cost reducing technological innovations is regarded as a mixed blessing. Certainly output may be beneficially affected, but on the other hand lifestyles and social values can be adversely disrupted. The main questions today are centered on how the introduction of new sanitation enabled technologies and new organisation of work affects the day to day life of workers. The bright side of the picture shows that new technologies did alter some of the worse aspects of sanitary cleanliness into precarious and toxic worksites, while traditional Safai labour is put at stake.

8. Arrival of new sophisticated induced sanitation technology
Due to sophistication of sanitary technology and job security among the job/ local government, there is arrival of significant number of high middle castes in this less
dignified occupation. They in turn are subcontracting the labour to SCs. While due to the strict industrial disposal policies in recycling treatment safety, recycling labour activities of traditional Roma itinerants are prohibited across public areas through state municipal laws that led to precarious job insecurity. State welfare system failed to recognize the labour of these scavenging and Safai castes- that become family/household occupations of these most caste communities for whom this was traditional occupation. Whereas due to state welfare policy, significant numbers of Roma women have relied on state employment benefits and minimum wage (RMI) that is why the Roma/Gypsy males do not have labour mobility and routinized jobs faced by women.

9. Multiple stigma-led informal occupations
Safai workers are deprived by huge occupational stigma and discrimination by other service castes and within their counterpart caste. While being a Roma the social stigma and negative stereotype of the community also work out in the public life-lead to neighbourhood isolation (ghettoized fashion) and recruitment in jobs and cultural misrecognition.

Discrimination against the Roma/Gitanos community
Discrimination continues to be one of the major barriers to the incorporation of the Roma community in society as citizens with full rights. According to all opinion studies, the Roma always come out as one of the most poorly valued groups socially and it is undeniable that this social rejection leads to discriminatory practices that manifest themselves on a daily basis in many different contexts, both public and private; in particular, in education, employment, housing, healthcare services, the justice system, the police. The level of citizenship expressed by Safai labour focuses on subordination and that of Roma Gypsies distress and secondary citizenship. Roma women feel this more citizenship - problem more intensity than Roma men. Various case studies or anecdotes brought out a picture of race/ethnic and caste voicelessness. Case studies of three generations of Safai labour demonstrate that these groups suffer disproportionate rates of poverty, a situation that is passed on generation to generation.

The findings reveal that women and members of lower caste groups experience a range of inequalities in health and nutrition, education, wage, occupation and ownership control, and access to assets and resources. Finding revealed that
increasing Gypsy population has been associated with illicit drug markets, crime and inevitable employment in public sector. However there is still clear division between the local communities and gitanos and the level to which they are integrated in the local non-gypsy communities is not clear. Women are worse off-low in matters of entitlement, social barriers, and discrimination.

10. Critical appraisal of the role of civil society in inclusion
If we acknowledge that social exclusion is distinct from, but often accompanies, poverty outcomes, and that social exclusion implies something different from other relational concepts such as racial oppression or gender subordination, then we can argue that a social exclusion perspective, while difficult to operationalize, provides us with a useful heuristic tool for understanding both persistent and mutating patterns of social disadvantage. It provides a way of understanding the relational and institutional dynamics that serve to include some and keep others out in a connected but polarized global economic context. To what extent the concept of social exclusion implies a focus on the causes of poverty and inequality as well as on the outcomes, and encourages the exploration of macro-micro linkages. This is not least because social inclusion is offered as an alternative to social exclusion.

Social inclusion of Roma is a problem; overall living conditions are inadequate; unemployment of Roma remains high; police abuse against Roma is a persistent problem; many Roma children face de facto segregation at school, and forced evictions continue. Some Roma Gypsy NGOSs and INGOs, such as that of Spain, recognize that they stand as nodes of greater or lesser importance in an interconnected global network. The case of Pune Safai labour, appears less proactive in trying to position themselves in relation to the changing dynamics of inter-urban competition. In both cases the persistence or legacy of exclusionary axes at the national and local levels articulate with those emanating at the global level. Moreover, the case-study examples show that new exclusionary processes associated with global trends and pressures graft themselves onto existing dynamics of social exclusion that play themselves out locally.

The increasing multiple social exclusions among scavenging and safai communities have led to monopolisation of scavenging labour in general. There is increasing
feminization of poverty and feminization of scavenging labour for women over the period of time under neo-liberal Indian state policies.

11. Roma educational attainment related findings

It can be concluded that despite the programmes and strategies that harnessed by Roma civil society organizations, there have remained cultural dilemmas between Roma recipients and designed teaching method apparatuses in terms of negligence of traditional Romany culture in school curriculum, non-involvement of education based on Euskera Basque language, unable to mitigate the Roma kid’s class attendance intervals due to their family informal itinerant trades and their seasonal migration from different place to place or market to market. This pattern exacerbates the marginalization and ghettoization of Roma. Ironically, most of these classes in public schools have got over-represented by the disadvantaged sections of Spanish society such as Roma and other immigrants. The Spanish population have been shrinking their number into public schools due to over-numbering of these sections and stale educational climate and hence Roma family seek to enrol their kids into private Spanish schools where they get their community sensitive education. The education is tended to be assumed a standardized commodity and vigorous cultural value by Spanish society, which they find lacking in such assimilated schools and consequently the cultural integration or assimilation programmes which designed for Roma education improvement seem quite unresponsive, stagnant and partially productive for its basic objectives.

12. The skills gap (lack of upskilling) and State-sponsored labour training

Access to education is central to equality of opportunity but education systems tend consistently to fail victimized communities. They often perpetuate casteism and discrimination, while members of historically victimized groups tend to under-achieve, transmitting inequality to the next generation in India, a high number of Dalit children (especially belongs to scavenging and Safai communities) drop out of school. Many do so to supplement their family’s income, or because they cannot pay school fees. Some leave because they lose faith in education. The literacy gap between Dalits and other Indians has remained virtually changed. A government quota policy exists to ensure the Dalits have access to skilled employment. Numerous obstacles to obtaining an education exist, including fees, the cost of materials, and discriminatory
treatment by teachers and other children. As a result, they possess fewer qualifications, members of victimized groups tend to take their traditional and unskilled jobs.

13. Long-term unemployment pushes Roma into crime and survival
Responses reflected some of the difficulties both groups described as the barriers to escaping poverty and social exclusion, such as unemployment and low education levels, but also the expressed desire to be represented in government agencies.

14. Passing continuous legacy of right to sweeping work
PMC Safai labour communities have fiercely guarded municipal sweeper jobs, which customarily pass from one generation to the next, involving multiple family members and rarely passing outside the group. As such, it can be argued that this excluded group itself engages in acts of closure, in order to appropriate or protect resources and advantages afforded by its exclusion. Thus, by utilizing the prejudices associated with their ancestral occupation and caste origins, the sweepers have achieved and retained for themselves access to a secure form of livelihood at the expense of other groups of higher social status. Dalit scavenging castes have a tradition that once they designate a Safai Kamgar/Bigari in PMC Departments, they usually never terminate their job until their death. If the PMC sweepers want to leave, they nominate an alternative based on Vashira-karar to the PMC. Those from families who have been municipal sweepers across a number of generations and who have accumulated some assets and security, sometimes ‘sell’ their jobs, passing on their work as private sweepers to others in their networks. Some, having inherited the right to a municipal job, ‘rent’ it out to others who perform and get paid for the work on a month by month basis but do not get paid in their own name and cannot claim the lump sum payout and pension on retirement, which of course goes to the legal job holder. In these and other ways, Safai labour also bends and ruptures the formal system. It is reported among case studies of Safai workers and their families, as many as 34% (more than 1/3 of the total Safai population) among all ranks of sanitary workers noted that their recruitment was done based on heir or customary heir right (Vashila-Karar) when they began their job career. Among these respondents, about 11% (1/9 rate of population) Safai workers especially young sanitary workers who were got entered in such jobs through the traditional Customary law ‘Vashila-Karar’ was due to their low level of education, poverty or limited employment opportunities and earlier low income sources. Scheduled Castes Safai workers outnumbered other caste groups to be recruited based
on the customary law. Similarly, some sanitary workers ambiguously answered over the persuasion of customary heir right jobs to their children. From 83 multiple responses among 42 respondents, more about 29% responses (more than ¼ of population) tended to encourage children or relatives for the PMC Safai jobs after formal retirement. Subsequently, 25% (1/4 of the population) tend to conform over PMC job as a traditional claiming source.

15. Hazardous working condition

Women and the poor are the most exposed to occupational hazards because they are often forced into the most dangerous and unhealthy occupations. These overlapping risks reinforce the need for government policy to balance economic growth with a concern for worker’s healthy environment. Laws referred by Indian Government into local Municipal Bodies for Safai and Informal scavenging jobs do merely an adverse condition to meet the formalizing these uniform but unorganized labour force along single line. There is social hierarchy between the ranks of PMC staffs and workers on the availability and supply of the basic amenities under the PMC. On the whole, several workers pointed to inadequate amenities and access to basic amenities for life such as housing, drinking water, medical facilities as well as lack of medical care provisions and pay compensations and well education. Therefore, there is poor working and living conditions of the sanitary workers due to no safety inspection and unsatisfactory provisions of safety devices, by the officials. The finding suggests that comparatively less hazardous nature of PMC have meant, the incidence of the accidents is on the low side. However, less and less efforts are being taken by PMC for their safety and preventions of the accidents. Consequently, hazardous work manifests itself, in the first instance, in injuries to the human body. In the extreme cases, this also results in death or severe disabilities. Since these injuries or fatalities are required to be reported. Work hazards are also responsible for occupational diseases or occupational illness and injuries related poisoning. Apart from these diseases, pesticides are also inflicted among the workers especially who works in the Kitaknashak Department and water treatment plant and sewage treatment plant. It reported dangerous working condition, maltreatment from the PMC as well as private employers/contractors. These diseases are seen as noticeable diseases, crippling accident rates, disability accident rates counted major risks for the workers.
16. Redefinition of ‘unclean occupation’

One of the findings of this research was that Dalits in every PMC Departments continue to be ensnared into categories of work that are culturally regarded as most intensely polluting, unclean and socially degrading. Most of the so-called unclean occupations are associated in one way or the other with death, human waste or menstruation, all of which are engulfed by the dense cultural beliefs of pollution. There have always been some tensions between the Mahar/Neo-Buddhist, Matang and Valmiki-Mehtar in account of historical factors. Both believe that the other is inferior and marriage is endogamous within the caste. The unclean occupations forced upon Dalits that are related to human death include the digging of graves; fire the cremation of dead bodies and setting up the funeral pyres. Death is considered so impure and unclean those, in Indian caste system it is Dalits alone inevitably engaged into such occupations. Additionally, the unclean occupations derive from the culturally polluting character of human waste. Under PMC ward areas, the manual removal of human excreta, often with bare hands, survives as a deeply humiliating vocation despite it having been outlawed. This pollution extends in many cases to cleaning of sewage tanks, drainage canals and the sweeping of streets. Unclean occupations create not only deep psychological scars but also physical health problems. In the study several elderly and retired PMC Safai-Kamgar engaged in carcass cleaning developed huge boils and rashes on his shoulders as a result of carrying carcass. A range of health problems were reported from elsewhere as well, as a result of the intensely unsanitary character of their vocations, unmitigated by modern technology. Even this occupation is considered polluting and is the monopoly of Dalits. It is also interesting that unspecific PMC labour categories have a very high proportion of Dalit workers who are employed for precarious unclean waste carriers. In cases where the modern economy or municipal management requires the transport of solid waste or carcasses, even the drivers of these vehicles are drawn from the Dalit community. Municipal authorities routinely employ only Dalits for scavenging. In several cases, Dalits who persist in unclean occupations do so as they feel powerless to resist, or even because they accept their caste roles. Economic compulsions prevent most Dalits from escaping humiliating hereditary occupations. They may earn little by carrying subcontract works from many upper caste Safai karmacharis. Scavenging may secure them regular employment in the local bodies. These secure earnings contain the seeds of the cruel dilemma of the most socially disadvantaged and oppressed Dalits who are
trapped in hereditary ´unclean occupations´. Adherence to occupations such as scavenging or disposal of carcasses and human bodies in Sassoon Hospital Pune, which are indispensable for any society, but which no other group is willing to perform, bestows them with a monopoly status that gives them greater economic security than many other disadvantaged groups. But this is at the price of the most savage and extreme social degradation. This, then, is the core of their dilemma: if they seek economic security, they must accept the lowest depths of social degradation; but if they wish for social dignity, they must accept the price of economic insecurity and deprivation. However, the major change reported is that in many cases, these activities are now performed by few, rather than all. The older generation is more obliging whereas younger Dalits resist. However, escape to the anonymity of caste system does not always guarantee liberation from the stigma of unclean occupations. It has been observed that Dalits in rural unclean occupations migrated to towns, but even there find work mainly as road sweepers and drain cleaners. There seems no escape for them from social ostracism.

17. Inadequacies and leniencies in Scavenging Acts: Employment of Manual Scavengers and Construction of Dry Latrines (Prohibition) Act, 1993 to eliminate manual scavenging and sheer emancipation of sanitary workers involved in all forms of manual scavenging and heinous practices. The suggested old amendments have to be modified within this Scavenging Act under certain clauses, including the scope of definition of manual scavenger, power to exempt, appointment of implementing authorities, power of executive authority to prevent environment pollution among other and to be reconsidered for a comprehensive law. The problems embodied in amendments have to tackle newer and pervasive forms of manual scavenging regarding sewer manhole and septic tank cleaning still going on are inactive. Even after India´s independence, the working conditions of the PMC sanitary workers have remain virtually unchanged for a over a century; using a stick broom and a small tin plate for informal sanitary contract workers; while wheelbarrow or carts by municipal corporation authorities while cleaning faeces from public and private city areas. Consequently, among them many sanitary workers have to live in extreme health deteriorations by virtue of their occupations. Ironically, the consequences of newer scavenging practices probably withdraw safety precautions and supervision and without any emergency medical support. The hazardous include exposure to harmful
gases such as methane and hydrogen sulphide leading to instant death and or cardiovascular degeneration, musculoskeletal disorders like osteoarthritis changes and intervertebral disc herniation, infections like hepatitis, leptospirosis and helicobacter, skin problems, respiratory system problems and altered pulmonary functional parameters.

18. Health-care services and delivery
In Gypsy/Roma community access to health care is the most problematic one after to access education and employment that is these groups have to face lot of deficiencies in health care system. It is revealed that two third of total women respondents among the Roma/Gypsies have no access to treatment for gynecological disorder, a crucial area of health concern for women. While Pune Municipal Corporation workers informed that they often required to enter the choked sewers exposing them to innumerable health hazards. Consequently they consumed liquor with the impression that it would save them from harmful effects of working in unclean hazardous environments. They, therefore, suggested restoration of temporary washing facility at the site of sewer mouth as one of the remedies. Over the health concern, I argue that the consistent prejudices, reluctances and malpractices of PMC officials and ward level strains of PMC political and civic authorities in general while providing adhoc safety measures due to resistance by the PMC Union are inadequate. There is a need to redefine recommendations made by Safai Commissions for improvements in living and working conditions as well as the scarcity in access to be delivered regular health check-ups and over the increasing spate of work related casualties on large scale for Safai workers probably deteriorate their normal life-expectancy and quality of life.

19. Feminisation of contractual labour
In other words, men and women belonged to Roma Gypsies than Safai workers are far more heavily concentrated in casual labour due to the prevalence of casual and informal forms of employments. While Roma women engaged in informal traditional sectors are substantially having limited types of works and hardly skilled informal and public sectors open to females especially in Bilbao context. To Safai women, the casual nature of Safai women’s greater representation into monthly salaried work and are classified as salary workers since most received a fixed monthly salary. It was often reported that many Safai contract and casual women workers are predominantly women and have had earlier been in domestic jobs (molakarin). Consequently, mostly
these casual Safai women were drawn to Safai and sanitary works due to limited salaries, uncertain terminations, mental strain caused by illusions or prejudices of households and frequencies of irregular working calls in a day itself.

20. Female headed households
In situations of upward mobility into both cross-cultural groups, women often see less of the benefits than men and gender discrimination certainly does not disappear in better-off households; in fact it may intensify. In general, where a woman’s productive work is not visible, or where gender differentials in earnings are high, women may be particularly prone to discrimination in the household. In most households, women’s relationship to and uses of income are quite different from those of men. Although women frequently manage household budgets and consumption, they may have little direct control over income and often do not even know what husbands earn. The relationship between female headship and poverty is not clear and there is considerable debate over the definition of female headship. Female headed-households tend to be concentrated among Dalit Safai households.

In conclusion, it has reported that labour market prospects and character of households among Roma and Safai women are affected by changing divisions in households labour and work orientations. However women’s labour on productive spaces in the data shows that women are less likely to be considered as being bread winners. Roma women outnumber Safai women which are partly called as a woman-headed household. Both Roma and Safai women are not allowed to work in hard sector due to having patriarchal cultural impositions. It is a reason that Roma families are probably benefited the supplementary and contingent labour of their women and mostly forcing them to collect the government economic minimum assistance (in forms of housing rent allowances- Renta basica and Paro) based on numbers of family kids. However, the working Roma women expand their sources by working and doling out some economic benefits, a short-span consistency of the income earning of Roma women does not recognize the status as a woman headed household. In addition, the economic crisis occurred in the retail market and micro-tertiary jobs have forced to part-time contingent works to Roma women than Roma male and leads to persistent job insecurity.Although a low percentage of Safai caste women (25%) are involved in Safai labour ,their long-span income consistency is more likely to allow them to obtain the status as a woman-headed household.
Predicaments in doing fieldwork in ethnic enclaves: ethnographic observations

In conclusion, I would like to reflect on my fieldwork experience – on two diverse sites and through different projects. Firstly, I was involved in survey initiated by Dr. Ambedkar Chair under Pune University for investigating the caste composition in the PMC workers hence I visited to several distinct workplaces which are still seen as stigmatized places. Municipal workers work in dead-house in public hospital, people working in disposing the unidentified bodies, dead-body carriers and then crematorium disposing and gravediggers. Moreover there were also those involved in dog squad, mutton and fish markets, and drainage workers. Secondly, my own Ph.D fieldwork was done across various ward areas of Pune city to address multifaceted exclusion of safai-kamgar and union’s resistance, whether political or social. Thirdly, I was appointed as a project fellow on the project entitled ‘The Socio-economic Study of the Denotified Nomadic Tribes in Kolhapur District.” And finally my stay in Deusto University as Erasmus Mundus PhD scholar for a year, I undertook and then conducted fieldwork in the Spanish Roma gypsies for understanding the quality of life and quality of work life into employment, educational, health and demographic level data.

Looking back, I recall, as Bourdieu (2003) tells us a researcher must mobilize his past in the research, he/she must submit these returns to the past to rigorous examination. Participant objectivation undertakes to explore not the “lived experience” of the knowing subject but the social conditions of possibility – and therefore the effects and limits – of that experience. I had to look into my own caste and labour history, the ignorance my education had produced in doing fieldwork. The inherent difficult of such a posture has often been noted, which presupposes a kind of doubling of consciousness that is arduous to sustain. How can one be subject and object, the one who acts and the one who, as it were, watches himself acting? What is certain is that one is right to cast doubt on the possibility of truly participating in foreign practices, embedded as they are in the tradition of another society and, as such, presupposing a learning process different from the one of which the observer and her dispositions are the product of ethnographic practices. My multi-sited research across different locations as Burawoy (2003) has commented helps to understand globalization – as not just an effect but a process unfolding both in similar and diverse ways and scales in different spaces.