CHAPTER 9

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Education contributes to the effective development of human resources. Operating within education, guidance facilitates this task of education by providing educational, vocational and socio-personal information to help individuals to understand themselves and the world around and to make necessary adjustments. Guidance process consists of a set of guidance services viz. Appraisal, Information, Counselling, Placement, Follow-up and, Research and Evaluation services.

Continuous evaluation of guidance services is of paramount importance for improving the effectiveness of services provided. Better planning, co-ordination and articulation usually result from well-conceived evaluative studies. A review of related literature as contained in Chapter-3 of the present study reveals that the area of evaluation of guidance services is still unexplored by the researchers in India. Paucity of research studies in the area of evaluation of guidance services has led the investigator to undertake the present study.

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

The problem under study reads as follows:

“Evaluation of Guidance Services in High/Higher Secondary Schools of Punjab and Chandigarh”.

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

The objectives of the present study were:

1. To present a global evaluation of 'guidance programme in general' in the Punjab and Chandigarh.

2. To undertake service wise evaluation covering the major services i.e., appraisal, information, counselling, placement, follow-up and, research and evaluation services.

3. To compare the effectiveness of 'guidance programme in general' as well as 'specific guidance services' in the ‘Punjab and Chandigarh’ as evaluated by different groups of evaluators.

4. To find out if any 'urban and rural' differentials exist in the implementation of ‘guidance programme in general’ as well as 'specific guidance services' as evaluated by different groups of evaluators.
5. To compare the effectiveness of 'guidance programme in general' as well as 'specific guidance services in 'government and aided' schools as evaluated by different groups of evaluators.

6. To get the present guidance programmes and practices evaluated by policymakers, implementers and beneficiaries.

7. To reach overall conclusions about the effectiveness of 'guidance programme in general' in the Punjab and Chandigarh.

8. To arrive at overall conclusions with regard to the effectiveness of different 'guidance services' such as appraisal, information, counselling, placement, follow-up and research and evaluation services.

9. To identify the difficulties encountered by different implementers in the effective implementation of the guidance programmes.

10. To offer suggestions emerging out of the study for the better implementation of guidance services in the Punjab and Chandigarh.

**DESIGN OF THE STUDY**

The present study was oriented to evaluate the effectiveness of guidance services as provided in high/higher secondary schools of the Punjab and Chandigarh in the light of criteria formulated for evaluation purposes as well as the objectives of organising guidance programme in the Punjab and Chandigarh. The purpose was to find out the nature of services provided and their strengths and weaknesses with a view to improve upon the present situation. Evaluation of the 'guidance programme in general' and of 'specific guidance services' i.e., appraisal, information, counselling, placement, follow-up and research and evaluation services were taken up separately.

Descriptive survey method was followed to conduct the study which involved collection of data through administering various tools and techniques such as (i) questionnaires (ii) interview schedules (iii) checklist and (iv) observations made by the investigator.

The study was designed to collect data from the policymakers, implementers and beneficiaries. Data were collected from both 'government and aided schools' from 'urban and rural' areas of the 'Punjab and Chandigarh'.
SAMPLE

Selection of sample was done on the basis of multi-staged random technique. Eight of the twelve districts of the Punjab as well as the Union territory of Chandigarh were selected for the study. In each district of Punjab five schools were randomly selected out of which two each were government schools from urban and rural areas and one non-government aided school from urban areas. From Chandigarh, fifteen government schools from urban and four from rural areas were involved in the study. None of the non-government aided schools in Chandigarh was having guidance programme.

The sample for the study included — 1334 students from 59 schools from the Punjab and Chandigarh, 56 guidance workers, 59 each of administrators and teachers, 9 District Assistant Guidance Counsellors/Guidance Officer, 8 Assistant Employment Officers (V.G.) and 118 parents of the pupils.

HYPOTHESES

To achieve the objectives of the present study and to evaluate the programme in the light of criteria formulated for the study as well as the objectives of organising guidance programme in the Punjab and Chandigarh following hypotheses were formulated:

1. Guidance ‘programme in general’ is not being carried out effectively in the Punjab and Chandigarh.

2. Even the ‘specific guidance services’ such as appraisal, information, counselling, placement, follow-up and, research and evaluation services are not being carried out effectively in the Punjab and Chandigarh.

In order to find out differentials at various levels/ in groups, about the evaluation of guidance programmes and practices following null hypotheses were also formulated.

3. No ‘state level’ differentials would be there in the evaluation of ‘guidance programme in general’ in the Punjab and Chandigarh as done by different evaluators i.e., (i) students (ii) guidance workers (iii) administrators (iv) teachers (v) District Assistant Guidance Counsellors/Guidance Officer (vi) Assistant Employment Officers (V.G.) and, (vii) parents of the pupils.

4. No ‘urban and rural’ differentials would be there in the evaluation of ‘guidance programme in general’ as evaluated by different evaluators such as (i) students (ii) guidance workers (iii) administrators (iv) teachers and, (iv) parents of the pupils.

5. No differentials would be there in the evaluation of ‘guidance programme in general’ as done by different evaluators such as (i) students (ii) guidance workers
(iii) administrators (iv) teachers and (v) parents of the pupils from 'government and non-government aided' schools.

6. No 'state level' differentials would be there in the evaluation of 'specific guidance services' such as appraisal, information, counselling, placement, follow-up and, research and evaluation services as done by different evaluators i.e., (i) students (ii) guidance workers (iii) administrators (iv) teachers (v) District Assistant Guidance Counsellors/Guidance Officer and (vi) Assistant Employment Officers (V.G.) for each of the services separately.

7. No 'urban and rural' differentials would be there in the evaluation of 'specific guidance services' such as appraisal, information, counselling, placement, follow-up and, research and evaluation services as done by (i) students (ii) guidance workers (iii) administrators and, (iv) teachers for each of the services separately.

8. No differentials would be there in the evaluation of 'specific guidance services' such as appraisal, information, counselling, placement, follow-up, research and evaluation services as done by different evaluators i.e., (i) students (ii) guidance workers (iii) administrators and, (iv) teachers from 'government and non-government aided' schools for each of the services separately.

TOOLS AND TECHNIQUES USED

Tools used for the collection of data were mainly questionnaires, interview schedules and checklist. Questionnaires were prepared for students, guidance workers, administrators, teachers, District/U.T. level incharge of guidance programme, Assistant Employment Officer (V.G.) and, parents of the pupil. Interview schedules were prepared for students, guidance workers, administrators, teachers, District Assistant Guidance Counsellors, Assistant Employment Officers (V.G.) and parents of the pupil. Checklist was used by the investigator to record the observations of the investigator.

METHOD AND PROCEDURE

Survey method was followed in conducting the study. The data were collected by administering questionnaires and interview schedules to the students, guidance workers, administrators, teachers, District/U.T. level incharge of the guidance programme, Assistant Employment Officers (V.G.) and the parents of the pupils. The Director of the Bureau of Educational and Vocational Guidance, Punjab was also interviewed. Checklist was used by the investigator to record her observations.
STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

Data were analysed by using statistical techniques like counting of frequencies, calculating of percentages and significance of difference between the percentages.

RESULTS

The results obtained from the present study can be categorised as follows:

Evaluation of 'Guidance Programme in General'

• Guidance and counselling is not a regular feature in most of the schools in Punjab and Chandigarh. The guidance services are generally available to high/ higher secondary classes only.

• Financial support to the guidance programme was lacking. In the absence of any separate fund the expenditure on organising guidance programme was generally met out of Amalgamated fund and Parent-teacher Association fund. However, the amount spent for guidance purposes was almost negligible in most of the schools.

• Generally, one career master/counsellor was appointed in a school, as a result the counsellor-pupil ratio was much more than desired.

• Guidance workers were least preferred for discussing with them their educational, vocational and personal problems by most of the students. In making decisions about their future vocation, parents' impact was dominant. In most cases pupils lacked required information about the post-high school educational and training requirements for entering the occupations of their interest.

• Guidance workers in general lacked sufficient professional education/training to discharge their guidance duties. Moreover, they were also not provided with facilities like special periods for guidance, relaxation in teaching workload in lieu of guidance duties, extra remunerations etc. in most of the schools.

• Parents were not generally made aware and associated with the guidance activities of the schools. Parent-teacher Associations existed in most schools but those were not functioning effectively. However, school authorities tried to maintain direct and indirect contacts with parents.

• The Director of State Bureau of Educational and Vocational Guidance, Punjab was not professionally trained. But the Guidance Officer from
Chandigarh and all the District Assistant Guidance Counsellors were professionally trained.

- The Director of State Bureau as well as the District Assistant Guidance Counsellors were facing problems like shortage of accommodation, funds, sufficient staff, lack of transport facilities, adequate powers for effective implementation of the programme, etc. But such facilities were made available to the Guidance Officer in Chandigarh.

- Vocational guidance unit existed in District/U.T. employment exchanges in Punjab and Chandigarh. Most of the Assistant Employment Officers were provided with enough staff and given full freedom to carry out the guidance programme. However, there was lack of co-ordination between employment agencies and guidance agencies and schools.

- As regards differentials in the evaluation of 'guidance programme in general' by the students and parents, significant differences existed to some extent between the responses of students and their parents from the schools of 'Punjab and Chandigarh', 'Urban and rural area', schools and from 'aided and government' schools. But no marked differences were found with regard to the evaluation by guidance workers, administrators and teachers from different groups.

Evaluation of 'Specific Guidance Services'

- The major shortcomings in the implementation of Appraisal service include — psychological tests were not being administered to students; appraisal data were hardly used for counselling purposes but used by a few teachers mainly for remedial teaching and, the incomprehensiveness of cumulative records maintained in schools.

- The strong points of information service were — provision of guidance corners in schools, organisation of guidance activities like educational talks, orientation talks and career talks and the provision of information material to schools. The weak points included — limited and outdated material, non-availability of material in regional language, information material not being used by students, lack of systematic filing system and display of material and lack of activities like career conferences, exhibitions, field trips, career weeks, career clubs etc.

- With regard to counselling service the weak points were — professionally ill-equipped guidance workers, lack of suitable place to ensure privacy and
calm atmosphere for counselling purposes, neglecting problems in personal and vocational planning areas and non-availability of referral agencies like psychologist, psychiatrist and counsellor. The strong points include - provision of separate place for guidance in some schools, easy accessibility of guidance workers, students helped to solve educational problems, practice of taking individual cases from schools for counselling by District Assistant Guidance Counsellors/Guidance Officer, availability of 'doctor' as referral agency and help rendered by Assistant Employment Officers (V.G.) to information seekers in form of individual and group guidance and preparation of case studies of individually guided individuals.

- Placement service as provided in schools was mainly concerned with educational rather than vocational placement. There was lack of provisions for part-time jobs and help in making realistic educational and vocational choices and plans. At employment exchanges job placement of applicants was provided but hardly any arrangement was there for providing part-time jobs.

- The follow-up service was mainly concerned with follow-up of students 'who are in the schools' rather than 'follow-up of high school leavers'. Alumni associations were almost non-existent. Information obtained through follow-up was hardly used to improve upon guidance services. Follow-up of the applicants after placement was grossly neglected at employment exchanges.

- Hardly any research and evaluation was done in different guidance areas in schools and at employment exchanges. However, the Guidance Officer and some of the District Assistant Guidance Counsellors reported positively in this regard. Most of the schools were reported to be providing information and counselling services. However, all the existing guidance services needed improvement. Vocational guidance services were termed as 'very effective' by Assistant Employment Officer from Chandigarh and as 'effective' by most of the Assistant Employment Officers(V.G.) from the Punjab.

- As regards differentials in the evaluation of 'specific guidance services' some significant differences were found existing in the responses of students from the schools of the 'Punjab and Chandigarh', 'rural and urban' areas and from 'aided and government' schools. But no marked differences were found in the evaluation of 'specific guidance service' by guidance workers, administrators and teachers from different groups.
Difficulties faced by Evaluators in the effective functioning of the Guidance Programme

- Lack of financial support to the guidance programme was pointed out as the major hurdle in the effectiveness of the programme.

- Lack of full-time counsellors, lack of incentives to the guidance workers, professional incompetency of guidance workers, ineffective in-service training, absence of orientation programmes for teachers and educational administrators were also pointed out as the other impediments in the effective functioning of the guidance programme.

- Lack of provisions for separate place and periods for guidance purposes, lack of up-to-date and comprehensive guidance literature supplied regularly to schools, non-availability of guidance literature in regional language and non-availability of psychological tests had been the other hinderances in making the programme effective.

- Lack of awareness on the part of parents and interest shown by pupils, lack of appreciative attitude and co-operation on the part of administrators and teachers and lack of co-ordination among Education Department, employment agencies and schools have proved deterrents in making the programme popular and effective.

Effectiveness of the Guidance Programme in the light of Objectives set forth For Organising it

As regards objectives of organising guidance programme in the Punjab, the objective of acquainting students and their parents with the guidance programme was being met to a lesser extent. The objectives of helping the students to solve their personal and educational problems and extending help in choosing the subjects had been achieved to a fair degree. The students were helped to make educational and vocational plans to some extent only. As regards the self-assessment of their assets and weaknesses the programme was not meeting the requirements.

Moreover, there is need to renovate and restate the objectives in the light of recent changes in the pattern of education.

With regard to the objectives of organising guidance programme in Chandigarh, the objective regarding help extended to students to solve their educational and personal problems had been achieved to a fair degree. The objective of helping students in making choices of subjects/courses on the basis of self-understanding and knowledge had hardly been achieved. As regards objective of streamlining students effectively at +2 stage into
vocational courses, only an initiation was made in a few schools in Chandigarh in 1987 in this direction. The objective of helping students in their educational, career and life planning had not yet been achieved.

CONCLUSIONS

In the light of the results of the present study following major conclusions can be drawn:

Guidance and counselling is not a regular feature in most of the schools in the Punjab and Chandigarh. The services are available to high/higher secondary classes in most of the schools. No separate fund existed for guidance purposes and the amount spent on organising guidance activities is almost negligible in most of the schools. Counsellor-pupil ratio is much more than desired.

Guidance workers are easily accessible but they are least preferred by students to discuss with them their problems. Help is extended to students mainly in educational area to the neglect of personal and vocational problem areas. Parents’ impact is dominant in vocational decision making of their wards. Students lacked required educational and vocational information. Parents are not generally made aware and associated with school guidance programme.

The State Bureau in Punjab is not manned by a professionally trained person but the Guidance Officer in Chandigarh as well as the District Assistant Guidance Counsellors are professionally trained. The District Assistant Guidance Counsellors are not provided with adequate facilities.

Vocational guidance services at employment exchanges are provided effectively. However, there is lack of co-ordination among employment exchanges, guidance agencies and schools.

As regards provision of specific guidance services only ‘Information’ and ‘Counselling’ services are being provided and the other services are almost neglected. However, all the existing services need improvement.

As regards differentials in the evaluation of ‘guidance programme in general’ and the ‘specific guidance services’ some significant differences are found in case of beneficiaries from the schools of the ‘Punjab and Chandigarh’, ‘rural and urban areas’ and from ‘government and aided’ schools. However, such differences were not marked in case of implementers of the programme.

The major hinderances in the effective implementation of the guidance programme include – lack of financial support, lack of provisions for full time counsellors,
lack of incentives to guidance workers, professionally ill-equipped guidance workers, lack of provisions for in-service training/orientation programmes for guidance workers, teachers and educational administrators, lack of physical facilities, non-availability of psychological tests, lack of comprehensive and up-to-date guidance literature, lack of administrative support, lack of awareness on the part of parents and students about the utility of the programme, lack of coordination among various agencies working in the field of guidance etc.

The existing guidance programmes in the Punjab and Chandigarh are not fully achieving the objectives set forth for organising such programmes.

SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

• The present study was confined only to the evaluation of 'guidance services in the Punjab and Chandigarh. A similar study can be conducted covering more states of the northern region of India, or a comparative study of the school guidance services in states of two different regions.

• A similar study of evaluation of Pupil Personnel Services at College and University level can be conducted.

• A comparative study with regard to the evaluation of guidance services by policy makers, implementers and beneficiaries of the programme can be undertaken.

• Impact studies in form of 'follow-up' a few years later of students who had received guidance at school stage can be undertaken to find out the effectiveness of school guidance programme.