CHAPTER NINE

CONCLUSION

The VSK is undoubtedly a masterpiece of Bhattoji, which aims at a categorical processing of the invaluable data of the Sanskrit Grammar projected in the form of aphorisms by Pāṇini in the AST. The topic-wise rearrangement of the rules of Pāṇini, in the VSK was purposefully done for the benefit of the learners, and Bhattoji is successful to the fullest extent in this venture. The study of the AST becomes easier with the help of this valuable grammatical treatise for which the book is prescribed for the students of different standards. R. S. Banerjee, while discussing the topic of asiddhatva in Paninian Grammar, clearly accepts the necessity of the work of Bhattoji in the process of learning the rules of Pāṇini. Thus the VSK is applauded as a great treasure in the world of Sanskrit Grammar and this right acclamation can be showered to the chapters which are only the part of the whole. As a rule, when the whole achieves success, the parts cannot be debarred from getting the same. Similarly, the PP of the VSK, which is only a small prakarana in this voluminous book, has its unique contribution towards the final success of the work. It is true that this chapter is very small in size, only a few interpretative canons of Paninian Grammar being treated here. But the quantitative legacy of the chapter has been definitely waved off by its qualitative up gradation. The interpretative canons taken into account by Bhattoji in this prakarana are arranged

1 Bhattoji's Siddhāntakaumudi has arranged all the Sūtras of Pāṇini (about 4000) under various heads of topics. In its absence or in the absence of distribution of all the Pāṇini rules under various topics—study of the rules of Pāṇini would have been extremely difficult especially for a beginner. Introduction, CAP.
according to a grammatical sequence. The first paribhāṣā sūtra of Pāṇini, taken up here, speaks of the element necessary for the occurrence of the operation called guṇa and vṛddhi when they are specifically mentioned in a rule. The second rule states the inclusion of the vowel element in connection with the grammatical conceptions like hrasva, dīrgha and pluta when mentioned with the enumeration of those terms in a rule. Thus the first two interpretative canons of the PP are related to the operations like guṇa, vṛddhi, hrasva, dīrgha and pluta. Pāṇini, being a linguist, in the true sense of the term, has taken up a lot of Sanskrit words as his data, for establishing a processed derivational analysis where along with other grammatical functions, the operations guṇa, vṛddhi etc. are seen to occur every now and then. Pāṇini, as a result, has formulated the rules related to guṇa, vṛddhi etc. in his Grammar. The first two paribhāṣā-ś taken up by Bhaṭṭoji, in his PP, specify the locus of these grammatical activities, by employing condition on the occurrence of the respective operations. The first paribhāṣā rule of the AST is iko guṇavrddhi (1.1.3). Following Pāṇini, Bhaṭṭoji has placed this paribhāṣā at the outset of his PP. The next paribhāṣā chosen by Bhaṭṭoji is acaśca (1.2.28) which produces the similar type of effect although in the AST, a large number of rules is placed in between these two interpretative canons. These two paribhāṣā rules in the PP can be said to form a category supplying the respective vowels as the locus of grammatical operations concerned. Thus by placing these two sūra-ś consecutively, Bhaṭṭoji has shown his innovative outlook in the positional arrangement of the sūra-ś of similar nature.

It has been shown earlier that the next two interpretative canons of the PP, viz. ādyantarau takitau (1.1.46) and midaco nyāṭparah (1.1.47 ), are related to the norm of placement of augments of various nature. These two rules are also placed in the AST.

2. 98 rules
consecutively. Bhaṭṭoji in his PP has not broken the chain in this case and takes up these rules one after the other. Thus a sequence is followed.

Then, Bhaṭṭoji deals with the rules concerning the case terminations like the sixth, seventh and the fifth. But the rules sthāne 'ntaratamaḥ (1.1.50) which has nothing to do with any case endings, is placed just after the rule saṣṭhi sthāneyogā (1.1.49) because both the rules are closely connected with the term sthāna. In the AST, these two rules are placed one after another establishing a close relation between them. Bhaṭṭoji, in the PP, also follows the sequence accepting thereby their conformity. The interpretative canons for establishing the technical purpose of the seventh and fifth case endings in the operational rules are kept together following the footsteps of Pāṇini. Then Bhaṭṭoji considers the interpretative rules related to substitution. Four rules come under this group viz. alo'ntyasya (1.1.52), nicca (1.1.53), ādeḥ parasya (1.1.54) and anekālṣītsarvasya (1.1.55). In the AST, also these four rules are placed together. The inclusion of these rules in the PP of the VSK has added a great value to the chapter as a whole.

The last paribhāṣā rule of the PP of the VSK i.e. svaritenādhikāraḥ (1.3.11) projects its separate identity because of the utilization of circumflex accent, which at present is connected in no way with the classical Sanskrit. There are also other paribhāṣā rules of Pāṇini, which are connected with the convention regarding accentuation3, but they do not occur in the first chapter of the AST. Bhaṭṭoji has not taken any of them in the PP. So the arrangement of the meta rules of Pāṇini done by Bhaṭṭoji, in the PP discloses the fact that he has collected all these rules from the very first chapter of the AST. So it can be assumed that Bhaṭṭoji's aim was to present an introductory idea about the activity of the paribhāṣā rules in the Grammar of Pāṇini. Again the last three

3. ādyudātaśca (3.1.3) etc.
interpretative canons taken by Bhaṭṭoji in the PP are seen to be utilized very frequently in the grammatical process of Paninian schools. They show the idea of selecting the priority of the application of one type of rule over others which is seen to be a common custom in Paninian Grammar. Thus the rules of Pāṇini treated in the PP and the canons taken up here, are related to the basic grammatical conventions without the knowledge of which one can not dive into the deep grammatical ocean of Pāṇini. Moreover, the rules taken up in the PP show their respective importance in vowel gradation, augmentation and substitution which are regarded as the very common but indispensable functions in the Grammar of Pāṇini. It is important to note that the parībhāṣā-s enlisted by such authorities like Vyādi, Puruṣottamadeva and Nāgesa in their respective works may be varied, but they are mainly the deductions from the rules of Pāṇini. The PP, on the other hand, deals primarily with the interpretative rules of Pāṇini. This departure of Bhaṭṭoji in the treatment of parībhāṣā-s definitely proves his original thinking which in turn, points to his success in this project.

Grammarians are of opinion that the interpretative canons can be treated as auxiliary hypotheses. Dominik Wujastyk has stated this in his paper, Do Parībhāṣās wrongly Immunize Pāṇini’s theory against criticisms. If the Grammar of Pāṇini is regarded as a linguistic theory, the parībhāṣā-s can claim their position before the actual body of the theory begins. Bhaṭṭoji’s arrangement of Paninian sūtra-s in the PP, just after offering the idea of the technical terms, synchronizes with the strategy, which is followed in any scientific process of establishing a particular theory. According to A. Kelkar the parībhāṣā-s can be termed as immunizations and they possess a

---

4 For as we have seen, the parībhāṣās too are auxiliary hypotheses. op. cit. Proceedings of the International Seminar. p.100.
clarifying nature.\textsuperscript{5} So the knowledge of these interpretative canons is genuinely necessary to understand Paninian theory of Grammar. \textit{Bhaṭṭoji} with this in mind, has differentiated the generally accepted \textit{paribhāṣā} rules of \textit{Pāṇini} from other types of aphorisms. So the \textit{PP} of the \textit{VSK} can be utilized as a methodological tool in the diversified derivational process used by \textit{Pāṇini} in the \textit{AST}.

\textit{It is true that \textit{Bhaṭṭoji} has discussed all the \textit{paribhāṣā} rules of \textit{Pāṇini} in his \textit{VSK}. But he has placed them according to his own grammatical scheme. And it is for this reason that these interpretative canons are placed and dealt with in various \textit{prakarāṇa-s} of the \textit{VSK}. Moreover, a good number of \textit{jañapaka paribhāṣā-s} are discussed by \textit{Bhaṭṭoji} on various occasions throughout the \textit{VSK}. As for example, the \textit{paribhāṣā yatrāneka vaidhamāntaryām tatra sṭhānata āntaryān bāliyāḥ} has been attached by \textit{Bhaṭṭoji} along with his \textit{vṛtti} to the rule \textit{sṭhāne ʾntaratamaḥ}. Though K. \textit{Das} in his book \textit{PPSG}, takes this \textit{paribhāṣā} as a mere elucidation of the rule \textit{sṭhāne ʾntaratamaḥ}, \textit{Nāgėśa} has treated it separately because of the recurrence of the word \textit{sṭhāne} in the rule \textit{sṭhāne ʾntaratamaḥ}, which could have been attached by \textit{anuvṛtti} from the rule \textit{sāṣṭhi sṭhāneyogā}. In this way, the \textit{vṛtti} of \textit{Bhaṭṭoji} to different Paninian aphorisms in the \textit{VSK}, furnishes various interpretative canons of Paninian Grammar. According to S. \textit{Bali}, \textit{Bhaṭṭoji}'s treatment of \textit{paribhāṣā-s} put a great impact on \textit{Nāgėśa} in the arrangement of \textit{paribhāṣā-s} in his \textit{PBSS}.\textsuperscript{6} This fact proves that \textit{Bhaṭṭoji} had a profound

\textsuperscript{5} A. Kelkar also expressed....while paribhāṣās and varttikas might be termed immunizations, the latter are revisions, while the former are merely clarifications, as quoted by Dominik Wujastyk. ibid. p.103.

\textsuperscript{6} The impact of the treatment of the paribhāṣās in the Kaumudi on \textit{Nāgėśa} is clearly noticeable... \textit{Bhaṭṭoji} arranged paribhāṣās in the order of their affiliation with the sutras of the \textit{AST}, the \textit{Śekhara} of \textit{Nāgėśa}, for the first time re arranges all the paribhāṣās in the manner in which they could help the prakriyā arrangement of the Kaumudi. BDHSG. p.108
knowledge of the *paribhāṣā*-s pertaining to Paninian Grammar. The small size of the PP may be due to the fact that Bhaṭṭoḷi, through this chapter intends to present an idea of the interpretative canons of Paninian Grammar which would be beneficial to any beginner in this field. The idea produced by the PP, can take a learner forward towards the operational aphorisms of Pāṇini. Though the size of this *prakaraṇa* is comparatively small, the canons undertaken here are capable of covering a huge number of functional rules of the AST. Here lies the unique success of the PP of the VSK. Thus it can be deduced from the present project that:

(a) the PP of the VSK has been able to produce an idea about the function of the interpretative canons in the field of grammatical arena,

(b) the canons undertaken here are related to vowel gradation, augmentation, suffixation and priority of one variety of Paninian rules over other type,

(c) the *ṛttī* attached to the rules in the PP can offer a clear meaning of the rule concerned and accordingly these rules comes to be easier to understand,

(d) though the number of the rules taken by Bhaṭṭoḷi in the PP is small in comparison to the *paribhāṣā* rules of Pāṇini, they do entangle a great number of operational rules. In this way, this chapter contributes immensely to the formation process of quite a good number of words of Sanskrit language,

(e) Bhaṭṭoḷi’s idea is seen to be fruitfully reflected in some *paribhāṣā*-ś of non-Paninian schools also,

(f) The PP of the VSK can be used as a hypotheses of the theory analyzed through the AST. The qualitative value of this chapter is capable of overcoming its volume and thus it can offer ideas towards the philological study of the Paninian theory of Sanskrit language. If the value is considered,
the volume can not come in the way. The PP of the VSK also, with the
treasure of its value remains as a source of sensitive study for the methodical
analysis of the sūtra-s of Pāṇini for ever.