7.1 Introduction

The present study was conducted to investigate the effectiveness of three selected strategies Direct Method, Functional Communicative Method and Grammar Translation Method, in terms of students’ achievement in English, in relation to different levels of students’ attitude towards English and students’ intelligence.

The experimental results were systematized and interpreted in the light of the different objectives and hypotheses formulated for the present study. Data were analyzed to observe the main and interaction effects of instructional strategies on the criteria of immediate learning and retention of the learning content in English. The findings and discussions in accordance with the objectives of the study are presented in the following sections.

7.2 The Findings at a Glance

The study was conducted to estimate the relative effectiveness of three models (DM, GTM and FCM) in teaching English at the Secondary level. Considering the basic objectives and hypotheses under study, the treatment was conducted with three models in eight schools. The sample consisted of 300 students of class-IX of the selected schools. To estimate the matching and homogeneity, an Entry Level Test in English was administered on the selected groups. The homogeneity of groups was verified and it was found that two treatment groups under three different models were homogeneous on the basis of their entry-level knowledge related to the selected contents. The study was conducted to estimate the interaction effects of instructional models, students’ intelligence. Different sets of tools were used in the study:

i) Set-I: Students’ intelligence (RAPMT) test;

ii) Set-II: learning materials in three different models (DM, GTM and FCM);

iii) Set-III: achievement tests; and
iv) Set-IV: retention tests.

The treatment was done by the researcher himself with three different models and utmost care was taken to minimize the effects of extraneous variables during study. The intelligence test was administered on the students before conducting the treatment. During treatment with models, learning materials on specific models were used. On completion of the treatment, F test was administered on the treatment group to assess the homogeneity on the basis of Raven’s Intelligence test scores.

Pertaining to $H_1$

It is observed (table-6.4 and 6.5) that the values of $t$ are significant at .01 level between strategies. It has also been found from the results that the mean achievement score of students treated through $S_1$ is greater than that of $S_2$ and $S_3$. Thus the results lead to justify the gain in favour of $S_1$. It has also been found that the mean of $S_2$ is greater than that of $S_3$. The findings lead to infer that the strategy $S_1$ is significantly effective for teaching English, where medium of instruction is Bengali.

Pertaining to $H_2$

It has been found from the table-6.7 and 6.9 that the values of ‘t’ are significant at .01 level between strategies. It has also been found from the results that the mean achievement scores of students treated through $S_1$ is greater than that of $S_2$ and $S_3$. Thus the gain is in favour of $S_1$. It has also been found that the mean of $S_2$ is greater than that of $S_3$. So the findings lead to infer that the strategy $S_1$ is significantly effective for teaching English at the secondary schools where medium of instruction is Bengali. The experiment was conducted on the students of Class IX, with diversified English text such as prose and poetry. It is seen from the table-6.8 the means of achievement test scores of students on prose treated through three different selected strategies. However, for precision, ‘t’ test between means has been made. Table-6.9 revealed that the values of $t$ are significant at .01 level between strategies. It has also been found from the results that the mean achievement score of students treated through $S_1$ is greater than that of $S_2$ and $S_3$. As the mean achievement score of students treated through $S_1$ is greater than that of $S_2$ & $S_3$ so it may be said that the effects of $S_1$ was significantly better than $S_2$ & $S_3$ on students learning. It has also been found that the mean of $S_2$ is greater than that of $S_3$. Thus the findings may be deducted that the $S_1$ is significantly effective for teaching English where medium of instruction is Bengali.
Pertaining to H₃

The analysis has been made to estimate the treatment effects of the GTM, DM and FCM (both poem and prose) on the achievement of boys and girls. The value of t is significant at .01 level at table-6.10, 6.11 and 6.12. It has also been observed that the achievement of boys in English treated through the S₁, S₂ and S₃ were significantly better than that of girls. The result leads to infer that the boys group established superiority than the girls group in their achievement in English. The analysis has been made by the treatment effect of the GTM, DM and FCM (poem) on the achievement of students with different sex groups. The result of the tables 6.13, 6.14 and 6.15 indicate that the achievement of boys in English treated through the S₁ S₁, S₂ and S₃ were significantly better than that of girls. The analysis has been made by the treatment effect of the GTM, DM and FCM (poem) on the achievement of students with different sex groups. The result of the tables 6.16, 6.17 and 6.18 indicate that the achievement of boys in English treated through the S₁ S₁, S₂ and S₃ were significantly better than that of girls.

Pertaining to H₄

It is found from the table- 6.19 that the first order interaction effects due to content under strategies (content × strategy) were significant. It is revealed that the achievements of students on prose, irrespective of strategies were significantly better than on poem. The results lead to conclude that the nature of content has a significant effect on the achievements of students in English.

Pertaining to H₅

It has been found from the tables-6.20 and 6.21 that the student’s achievement scores and retention scores affects due to content under strategies (content × strategy) were significant. It is revealed that the achievements of students on both poem and prose, irrespective of strategies were significantly better than retention test. The results lead to conclude that the nature of content has a significant effect on the achievements of students in English.
Pertaining to H₆

Table-6.22 and table-6.23 revealed that the value of $\chi^2$ is significant at .01 level, meaning thereby the distribution of students treated through different strategies on the achievement of students at the 60 × 60 criterion level differ significantly. The result leads to infer that Strategy1 i.e. the approach of Grammar Translation Method establishes superiority than the other two strategies irrespective of the nature of contents.

Pertaining to H₇

It is seen from the table-6.24 and table-6.25 that the value of $\chi^2$ is significant at .01 level, meaning thereby the distribution of students treated through different strategies on the retention of students at the 60 × 60 criterion level differ significantly. The result leads to infer that Strategy1 i.e. the approach of Grammar Translation Method establishes superiority than the other two strategies irrespective of the nature of contents.

7.3 Discussion

Regarding the effects of strategies, the findings of the study revealed that in case of immediate learning the achievement of students under Grammar Translation Method differ significantly than the achievement of students under Direct Method and Functional Communicative Method or Approach. It can be concluded from the finding that Grammar Translation Method establishes superiority over Direct Method and Functional Communicative Method or Approach for teaching English at the Secondary level on the criterion of immediate learning. The mean achievement scores of the students treated through GTM is significantly better than Traditional method of Teaching i.e., FCM of teaching (W.B.B.S.E.). This indicates that the GTM established superiority over the Traditional method of Teaching in English.

The distribution of scores in the achievement test scores at the post test treated through different strategies (GTM, DM, and FCM) were shown separately. The mean and standard deviations of scores of those different categories of distribution in the achievement test were 11.6, 8.43 and 10.08; 3.45, 2.93 and 3.24 respectively. From the above statement it was apparent that the experimental group performed better through Grammar Translation Method (GTM) in the achievement test than other two strategies i.e., Direct Method and Functional Communicative Method.

Regarding the effects of teaching with different contents (i.e., poem and prose) on students’ learning the results indicate that the values of t are significant at .01 level between
strategies. It has also been found from the results that the mean achievement score of students treated through GTM is greater than that of DM and FCM. Thus the results lead to justify the gain in favour of GTM. It has also been found that the mean of $S_1$ (GTM) is greater than that of $S_2$ (DM) and $S_3$ (FCM). The findings lead to infer that the strategy $S_1$ is significantly effective for teaching English, where medium of instruction is Bengali.

The present study also conducted the effects of teaching on learning of different sex group. The analysis has been made to estimate the treatment effects of the GTM, DM, and FCM (both poem and prose) on the achievement of boys and girls. The value of $t$ is significant at .01 level and the gain is in favour of boys group. Thus it may be said that the achievement of boys in English treated through three Strategies were significantly better than that of girls. The difference of mean scores in the achievement test of the experimental boys group and experimental girls group was found to be 2.25 which was highly significant at 0.01 level. So, the experimental girls group performed better in the achievement test than the experimental boys group.

In case of first order interaction effects due to instructional strategies, contents and students’ intelligence, it has been found that the interact effect under Grammar Translation Method is significantly better than interaction under Direct Method and Functional Communicative Method or Approach. It is generally observed that intelligence and achievement have a positive correlation. The present study is also found that slightly higher intelligence group achieves slightly better among the methods. Hence, intelligence is one of the most influencing teaching-learning variables of our classrooms. On the criterion of retention, it is seen that interaction effects of students treated through different strategies differ significantly among treatment groups. It may be further mentioned that in respect to the rate of forgetting, Direct Method and Functional Communicative Method is comparatively effective than the Grammar Translation Method.

Results of the tables 6.22 & 6.23 indicate that the first order interaction effects due to content under strategies (content × strategy) were significant and revealed that the achievements of students on prose, irrespective of strategies were significantly better than on poem. The results lead to conclude that the nature of content has a significant effect on the achievements of students in English. Results of the table 6.24 & 6.25 indicate that the student’s achievement scores and retention scores effects due to content under strategies (content × strategy) were significant. It is revealed that the achievements of students on poem, irrespective of strategies were significantly better than retention test. The results lead
to conclude that the nature of content has a significant effect on the achievements of students in English.

The present study conducted with another main independent variable, i.e., students’ intelligence on the basis of Ravens’ Intelligence Test scores. The mean and standard deviations of scores of those different categories of distribution i.e., boys and girls in the intelligence test were 16.26 and 16.32; 4.2 and 3.92., and the findings reveal that the value of F is not significant at .05 level, meaning thereby two groups are homogeneous on the basis of Raven’s Intelligence test scores. Students were selected randomly from eight secondary schools as samples for the study. It may be inferred from the result of ‘F’ that selected boys and girls did not differ significantly on the basis of their levels of intelligence. Thus the groups were matched for the purpose of conducting experiment.

Entry level test was administered on all the students of class IX. The method of randomization was adopted to select matched groups on the basis of Entry Level Test scores. The test of homogeneity was also adopted to estimate the nature of matching statistically. The mean and standard deviations of scores of those different categories of distribution i.e., boys and girls in the Entry level test were 20.66 and 18.68; 7.5 and 7.49. In this test (Table 6.2) the value of F is not significant at .05 level. Thus, the selected groups were homogeneous on the basis of entry level test in English.

7.4 Limitations of the Study

The researcher has conducted the study in different areas, with different schools and the different modes of education, with different groups of students and in different areas of knowledge in English. But to consider the feasibility and the availability of the resource the study has been delimited on the following lines:

i) The District Bankura was selected as the area of the study.

ii) The secondary schools affiliated by the WBBSE (West Bengal Board of Secondary Education) were selected for the study.

iii) Only secondary schools of three categories: Boys’, Girls’ and Co-Education had been taken for the study.

iv) Only the students of class IX of the selected schools were taken as sample, as the class IX was considered as the delta class under secondary education.
v) Only prose and poetry of the English syllabus of class IX were taken as contents for the study.

vi) Only the cognitive domain was considered to estimate the achievement of English in the study.

vii) During the conduct of the study the investigation earned certain valuable experiences, which could be helpful for future parallel studies. The researcher presents the following suggestions for due considerations:

- A large number of sample under various schools may be included to conduct the study;
- The special attention should be given for the development and refinement of tools used; and
- All other probable related factors affecting students’ achievement may be highlighted and should be controlled as far as practicable.

7.5 Suggestions for Further Research

The study indicates the need for conducting further researches on the following lines for a complete understanding of the problem:

i) Further researches may be done to evolve an effective method of teaching at the Secondary level;

ii) Further experiments may be conducted to identify the effectiveness of different methods of teaching in different subjects;

iii) The experiment may be replicated according to the curriculum of different Boards of different states;

iv) Studies may be conducted covering more Secondary schools of different districts of West Bengal;

v) Researches may be done to identify the various factors responsible for under achievement of students at the Secondary level; and

vi) Researches may be done among the students of different categories under different socio-economic strata.
Effective instructional strategies are the prime area of teaching profession. A professional teacher seems to be an effective classroom teacher too. Since the theory of teaching is yet to be developed, endeavours have been started empirically verify the theoretically ideal methods of teaching into the classroom practices. Present study indicates some new focus towards the application of methods of teaching in English under the impacts of some variables like knowledge and intelligence. This finding may help the practicing teachers to choose the appropriate strategy in their real classroom situations. Of course further studies in this field may also enlighten the areas of effective instructional strategies in teaching-learning system of our country.

7.6 Educational Significance of the Study

The present study seems to hold the significance for teaching English to Class IX students within the frame of experimental settings. It may have both the theoretical and applied significances.

i) It is a humble endeavour towards the development of models of teaching based on the three fundamental methods of teaching English (DM, GTM and FCM);

ii) It is an approach to develop the Social Sciences teaching strategies;

iii) It is a strive to find out the effectiveness of the methods of teaching in the field of education;

iv) An attempt to identify the relative effectiveness of instructional strategy, students’ performance in English and students’ intelligence has been made on the criteria of immediate learning, achievement and retention; and

v) The present study may be an attempt to develop the emerging theoretical concepts in Educational sphere.

vi) It is the classroom application of the teaching methods such as the Direct Method; the Grammar Translation Method and the Functional Communicative Approach / Method;

vii) The methods of teaching may help the students in developing skills (LSRW) of teaching English during the classroom;

viii) The textbook writers can do not analyse and organize the contents in logical and psychological sequences according to the principles of the Direct Method; the
Summary and discussion

Grammar Translation Method and the Functional Communicative Approach in order to activate the students’ mental processes;

ix) By structuring the contents of a subject according to the principles of the Direct Method; the Grammar Translation Method and the Functional Communicative Approach the curriculum designer can highlight the broad principles of the subject matter and connected experiences for the better cognitive learning of the students; and

viii) Realizing the findings of the present study the administrators may provide conductive teaching-learning environment towards the Direct Method; the Grammar Translation Method and the Functional Communicative Approach teaching strategies for the purpose of betterment of learning outputs of the students.

7.7 Concluding Remarks

With the long and varied experience of teaching English to students of class V to X in rural areas’ secondary school of Bankura district in West Bengal, the researcher would like to share some of the vengeances in teaching English as second language. The main aim of the researcher is to dispel the illusion of English language learning. It tells that English can be learnt comfortably even by the people who were born and bred up in adverse conditions. Most of the students accomplish their schooling in their mother tongue i.e. Bengali and Santhali. Most of them are belonged to socially and economically disadvantaged section. Though they have attained heaps of marks in core subjects, they remain very poor at English still. The students have an unknown fear and fever over English all these years. Now, let us examine some of the various factors which make English as a souring grape for rural students even today.

The first and the foremost factors is the socio-cultural and financial background of the family. As most of the parents are illiterate and many cases first generation learner, they cannot directly take part in the daily routine of their children though they aspire for their childrens’ future prospect. Hence, the students’ performance lacks parental supervision and guidance which is very necessary at this part of their education. The illiterate parents cannot realise what their children pursuing neither they do afford time to consult the teacher about the progression in studies of their children. Every minute during the day time is valuable for
them as they have to struggle to get their livelihood. The boy or girl is also sent for work on wages at the specified time of the year which affects their education very dearly.

An interesting observation of this study that the performance in English of the students whose parents are employees and belong to higher middle class is better than that of the students whose parents are illiterate and belong to lower middle class. The probable reason perhaps is that the parents in the first case can spare time to consult the teacher about the ongoing of their children once a while and can guide them if necessary. Thus there has emerged an undesirable difference between the two classes. Consequently, it is established in rural areas as a proven fact to say that English is tough to study and understand despite the fact that English is the easiest language in the world to learn.

But it was also proved every now and then that the students from the second group also showed greater interest and expertism in English Language Learning. The credit goes to the student and their teacher who was successful in inculcating curiosity among the students in spite of their financial irregularities and improper brought up. So, mere poverty cannot create a gulf between students and their English language efficiency.

Without grammar, words hang together without any real meaning or sense. In order to be able to speak a language to some degree of proficiency and to be able to say what people really want to say, some grammatical knowledge must be grasped. By teaching grammar the teachers not only give the students the means to express themselves, but also fulfill their expectations of what learning a foreign language involves. There are no miracles on the way to learn a language. No matter how students are taught grammatical concepts, syntactic constructions and stylistic devices, or language conventions and editing concepts, they will not automatically make use of these in their talking. What this thesis intends to focus on is how to improve students’ grammatical competence and linguistic competence through the Grammar Translation Method.

Based on the theory of the Grammar Translation Method, this thesis compares the Grammar Translation Method and the Functional Communicative Approach. In order to prove the effect of the Grammar Translation Method, the author of the thesis makes an experiment on her own classes. After one class teaching practice, the Grammar Translation Method is proved to be a suitable and successful teaching approach at Class IX who will be stepping into the Madhyamik syllabus in West Bengal. Firstly, the learners in the experimental class made a significant progress in grammar learning after experiencing an
experimental class. Secondly, learners with the Grammar Translation Method in the experimental class made more progress in grammar learning than those who used the Functional Communicative Approach in the control class. Thirdly, the students’ confidence in learning English was improved. Even those who lacked confidence in English in the past have become very active in the classroom activities.

Be in the view of school students’ actuality in West Bengal, the best way to improve the situation is to combine both the Functional Communicative Approach and the Grammar Translation Method in teaching English Grammar. That is because the Functional Communicative Approach emphasizes fluency and the Grammar Translation Method is concerned with accuracy, fluency and accuracy are the target for English learning.

The important factor in English language teaching is the English teacher. Modern day English teacher must deploy new methodology to freshen things up. Literature must be taught in a way that the students can identify themselves and their surroundings with what they study in English. During English classes, the English teacher must also go beyond literature and grammar to provide much needed general knowledge to the students. Slow and steady discussions regarding topics that touch and aware students can also be used to enhance their skills. These discussions and informal sessions can bridge all the gaps between teacher, student and the subject. Teachers should find some way of helping pupils to enjoy their language activities, and of building their confidence, because this is the only language that requires full confidence from its speaker. All these things coupled with a helping English teacher shall also create a familiarity between the students and English language. After all, a good teacher is the one who makes the subject interesting!

It is as clear as crystal that English language has an enormous future in our country and also has a long way to travel. In a land of so many local languages, English will continue to complement the mother languages. It is the only language in the world that is safe in terms of its identity and for English, the only way, is the way up.