CHAPTER II

******** REVIEW OF RELATED STUDIES

- Introduction
- Studies Concerning Self-esteem in Relation to some Variables
- Studies Concerning Changes in Self-esteem
- Studies Employing Group Counselling
- Summary
CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF RELATED STUDIES

Introduction

In this chapter some of the important studies and observations have been reported with a view to getting acquainted with the existing literature in the area of behaviour change. This brief review of the relevant literature will provide the framework for further research. Behaviour changes consequent upon psychotherapy have been studied by a number of investigators who tried to observe the processes that operate at the time when therapy is being administered. These studies are available in some standard journals or books. The investigator has tried to survey the literature in the field by referring also to some of the unpublished doctoral dissertations as well as published monographs.

Some of the studies reported in the beginning of this chapter pertain to the relationship between self-esteem and some important variables. The studies that follow deal with
changes in self-esteem consequent upon psychotherapy.

**Studies Concerning Self-esteem in Relation to Some Variables**

There are many studies which are carried out in India and in foreign countries about the relationship between self-esteem and some important variables, such as personality, adjustment, achievement, acceptance of others, social status, family, etc.

Hanlon (1954) studied the relationship between self-esteem and personality. Seventy-eight subjects were asked to describe their perceived self and ideal self by responding to 100 self-referent statements. The self-ideal congruence was then correlated with the subjects' percentile rankings on the California Test of Personality. The correlation between the personality test and the self-esteem scale was .78, which is quite high and positive.

Chase (1957) studied the relationship between self-ideal congruence and psychological adjustment among hospital patients. In this study the Q-technique was used. An adjusted group was compared with three maladjusted subgroups. The adjusted group was randomly divided into two groups, consisting of 25 patients each. The maladjusted group was made up of three subgroups - 19 psychotics, 20 neurotics and 17 patients with personality disorders.
The self-ideal correlation for the adjusted group was .64, which is significant at .01 level. The self-ideal correlations for the three mal-adjusted groups failed to reach the level of significance. It was found that the instrument measuring self-esteem alone could discriminate a group of adjusted from three groups of maladjusted hospitalized patients. Maladjusted patients saw themselves as being different from their ideals, while adjusted patients did not.

Fuster (1963) has also studied self-ideal congruence in relation to adjustment in a group of 52 Indian college students. In order to determine adjustment, the California Test of Personality was administered. Masani's test was also given to detect neurotic tendencies. Self-ideal congruence was found to be related to personal adjustment.

The relationship between self-ideal congruence and adjustment was studied by Pathak (1967). In all 300 students were selected. They were asked to sort 49 self-referent statements twice under two different instructions for measuring self and ideal self. The self-ideal congruence score was in the form of correlation between two sets of scores on the same statements sorted under two different instructions. For
measuring adjustment a questionnaire consisting of 42 items was prepared. The self-ideal congruence scores were then correlated with the scores on the adjustment questionnaire. It was found that the correlation between self-ideal congruence scores and the scores on adjustment questionnaire was highly significant and positive.

Self-esteem has some relationship with achievement. Chickering (1962) found that the lower the discrepancy between the self and ideal self, the higher was the academic achievement in school subjects.

Fuster (1953) in his doctoral dissertation aimed to study the relationship between congruence of perceived self-acceptance and ideal self-acceptance and acceptance of others in Indian college students. It was expected that the degree of relationship would vary from one community to another. Thirty boys and 30 girls from each of the four communities, namely, Hindu, Muslim, Catholic and Zoroastrian were selected for the purpose of study. In all 240 subjects were selected from the University of Bombay. All the students had a minimum of one year and two months of college education.

The measures of perceived self and ideal self were obtained from the students. In order to measure the acceptance of others, another test consisting of 38 self-
referent statements was administered to the same students. The mean correlation between perceived self-acceptance and ideal self-acceptance for Hindus was .42, for Muslims .38, for Catholics .29 and for Zorastrians .46. The congruence scores of each of the communities were again correlated with the total scores of acceptance of others in their respective communities. The resulting correlations of Zorastrian and of Hindu groups were significant at .01 and .05 levels of confidence respectively, whereas the correlations of Catholic and of Muslim groups failed to reach the level of significance.

Pandit (1969) in her M.A. dissertation studied self-concept differences in relation to identification and social class. The sample of the study consisted of 105 boys and 105 girls of Std. X selected from five schools of the Baroda City. The Social Class Test, Self-concept Test and the Test of Identification were administered to them. It was found that boys and girls did not differ and self-concept was not related to social class as well as identification.

Self-concept and its relation to parental identification was studied by Steward (1959). It was hypothesized that the similarity of the child's actual
child-concept and the ideal child-concept with the parents' actual child-concept and ideal child-concept would be related to the vocational interest of the child. It was found that there was no relationship between anyone of the son-mother identification measures and agreement of measured interests with the preference of an occupation.

In his doctoral dissertation Pathak (1966) studied the self-concept implementation theory of Super by deriving specific hypotheses from the theory. He aimed to study the relation between self-concept and perceptions of the roles in the preferred occupation. It was assumed that the congruence of the perceptions of the self and of the roles in one's own preferred occupation would be greater than that in the case of non-preferred occupation. It was further hypothesized that self-ideal congruent cases would generally be satisfied with the occupations they had selected. Persons showing self-ideal discrepancies were studied in detail in order to obtain information about their personal development. The correlations between self-perception and the perception of the roles afforded by preferred and non-preferred occupations were computed. Satisfaction scores and self-ideal congruence scores were also correlated. The findings showed that in the case of student teachers, student doctors and student social
workers, the congruence of the perception of the self and of the roles in one's own selected occupation was greater. The correlation between the self-ideal congruence and satisfaction scores was also positive and significant in the case of all other groups except the group of student lawyers.

Rosenberg (1965) studied self-esteem and its relationship with a number of variables, such as, social class, father-son relationship, birth order, family and psychosomatic symptoms. In general it was found that children from higher social classes were somewhat more likely to accept themselves, that is, to consider themselves worthy than those from lower social class. In terms of percentage, only 51 percent of the members of the highest class ranked high on the scale of self-esteem. This was true for 38 percent of those in the lower class. It was also shown that adolescents who reported close relationship with fathers were considerably more likely to have high self-esteem and subtle images than those who described these relationships as more distant. This study indicated that somewhat larger proportion of children of divorced or separated parents had lower self-esteem than those children whose families were intact. The child's birth order in the family had little association with self-esteem. Finally
it was observed that the lower the subject's self-esteem level, the more likely was he to report experiencing various physiological disturbances.

Jorgenson and Howell (1969) predicted that self-ideal congruence would decrease from ages eight to twelve and stabilize from 13 to 18 years of age. The self and ideal concepts were measured by means of a Semantic Differential Instrument utilizing 20 pairs of bipolar adjectives with a nine-point scale between each pair. The responses of 391 subjects on Semantic Differential Scale supported the prediction for males and not for females. It was found that the self-ideal congruence stabilized from ages 13 to 18 for both males and females.

Studies Concerning Changes in Self-esteem

Changes in self-esteem in relation to psychological stress and support were studied by Majmundar (1968). In this study it was assumed that the psychological stress would lower one's self-esteem index, while support would tend to increase it. It was further hypothesized that no sex difference would be found in the changes of self-esteem as a result of stress and support. The sample consisted of 120 boys and the same number of girls of Std. X between the ages of 14 to 17. The tests for measuring self, ideal self and anxiety were administered.
Anxiety measure was taken to represent the index of stress. From the results it was found that self-esteem changes under conditions of stress and support were in the expected directions. This was true for both male and female subjects. The sex difference was insignificant.

Mathew (1970) has also carried out a study on self-esteem changes as a function of stress and support. After obtaining the measure of self-esteem 90 boys were randomly divided into three equal groups of 30 each. One group was subjected to psychological stress by means of oral and written materials. The second group was subjected to a situation of great encouragement and support while the third group served as a control group. For all the three groups self-esteem measures were obtained before and after the administration of treatments. The support group showed a significant increase in self-esteem, the stress group showed deterioration in self-esteem and the control group did not show any appreciable change from pre-to post-tests.

Self-esteem as it is commonly understood, is a stable organization of the various perceptions of an individual. This, however, does not mean that it is rigid. It should change, but it should not fluctuate. Various investigators
have formed opinions about what changes characteristically tend to occur in the clients' self-esteem during the administration of therapy.

The name of Rogers (1951) is well known in the area of counselling and psychotherapy. It was he who was responsible, as a result of his pioneering efforts, for stimulating and conducting systematic research into the nature of processes occurring during the treatment of a patient. Most of the researches conducted by Rogers and his associates, relate directly to an understanding of the nature of psychotherapy. Rogers never intended to develop a theory of self, but it was dictated by the research findings concerning the nature of psychotherapy. Rogers tried to show by referring to the verbalizations obtained from clients during therapy how changes take place in the self structure of an individual. Literature on client-centered therapy is replete with such examples. Rogers seems to prefer the method of classifying the verbalizations of the client in some pre-determined, mutually exclusive categories. These verbalizations are then counted and thereby some understanding is gained about the nature of the processes that operate while therapy is being administered. Rogers deserves a great deal of credit for stimulating this type of research.
Rainy (1948), a student of Rogers, made an objective study of self-concept changes during counselling interviews. He discovered through content analysis that clients during therapy administration tended to move from a negative evaluation of self to a positive evaluation of self. The data were taken from 14 completely recorded counselling cases. Six categories were established in order to classify the contents. It was observed that at the outset of therapy the clients gave a preponderance of disapproving or ambivalent self-references. With the progress of counselling, fluctuations in self-approval occurred. In the successful cases there was a marked shift from a preponderance of self-disapproval and ambivalence to a strong emphasis on self-approval.

Seeman (1949) analyzed 60 interviews drawn from the counselling of 10 clients. The study involved the recording, transcribing and classifying 6,570 client statements and counsellor responses. Observations were made at the end of each fifth of the counselling process so as to reveal differences between early, middle and late sessions. He found that statements of insight increased from four percent in the first fifth to nineteen percent in the last fifth session. While studying the process of therapy, he found that 'statement of problem' tended to decrease during the interviews, whereas statements of insight and self-understanding
increased considerably. Another aspect studied by Seeman is the type of attitude expressed by the client. He showed that in the beginning of therapy the clients seemed to voice mostly negative feelings while at the end of therapy a change occurred in a positive direction. In the last two-fifths of the counselling process, clients showed an increased understanding of themselves.

Self-acceptance was found to be correlated with acceptance of others to the extent of .5 and .66 in Sheerer's (1949) and Stock's (1949) studies respectively. These studies indicate that if an individual thinks well of himself, he is likely to think well of others, and that, if he disapproves of himself he is likely to disapprove of others. Sheerer also found that clients who experienced successful client-centered therapy became more accepting of self and this change was accompanied by an increase in the acceptance of others.

Gordon and Cartwright (1954) conducted an investigation to study the effect of psychotherapy upon client's attitudes toward others. Various tests and scales were used in place of content-analysis. Their findings failed to support the hypothesis that client-centered individual psychotherapy produces changes in clients' attitudes toward others in the direction of greater acceptance of, and respect for, others.
This failure may be due to the fact that the therapy was not successfully administered to the clients. The predicted changes would occur only when the therapy is successful. Thus, the effectiveness of therapy is judged in terms of behaviour changes which it is supposed to produce. This is a circular argument. If there is a way to forecast the type of behaviour changes before therapy administration, the circularity could be avoided.

Butler and Haigh (1954) studied the relations between the perceived self and ideal self consequent upon client-centered counselling. The discrepancy between the perceived self and the ideal self was considered to reflect a sense of dissatisfaction. They assumed that this dissatisfaction could be reduced through counselling. Self-ideal congruence was measured by them in an experimental group of 25 clients before therapy, after therapy and at the follow-up point six to twelve months after the conclusion of therapy. The same programme of testing was followed in a control group, matched for age, sex and socio-economic status. In order to know whether the clients motivated for counselling showed change in relationship between self and ideal self as a result of the sheer passage of time, 15 members of the experimental group were tested at the time they requested for counselling. They were tested again after the 'wait-period' of 60 days alongwith other clients.
The self-ideal correlation in the experimental group before therapy ranged from -.47, a marked discrepancy between self and ideal, to .59 indicating greater congruence. The mean correlation at pre-therapy was -.01. At the conclusion of therapy, the mean was .34, and at the follow-up point it was .31. This represented a highly significant change supporting the hypothesis that client-centered counselling results in a decrease of self-ideal discrepancies. In the same group the mean self-ideal correlation was -.01 before a wait-period of 60 days and at the end of the 60-day period there was no change. Thus the change which occurred during therapy period was clearly attributable to the therapy and not to the passage of time. The control group showed a very different picture from the experimental group. The initial mean correlation of self and ideal self was .58, and this did not change being .59 at the follow-up point.

It is reasonable to conclude from this study that one of the changes associated with client-centered therapy is that self-perception is altered in such a manner that it is more valued. The change is not a transient one, but it persists long after the conclusion of therapy. It is also clear that the changes have not occurred simply as a result of the passage of time. They are definitely associated with therapy.
Rudikoff (1954) compared in a small group of clients the changes in their concepts of self, the ordinary person and the ideal during control period, therapy period and follow-up period. It was hypothesized that the self would change more during the therapy than during the no-therapy period and it would also change more than the concepts of the ordinary person or of the ideal during the therapy period. The instrument used in this study was Q-sort. For the self-concept the subjects were asked to sort the items so as to yield a picture of their self-concept as they perceived themselves to be. For the concept of the ordinary person the subjects were asked to express their own opinion of people in general. The self-ideal was measured by asking them to sort the items keeping in mind the type of persons they would like to be.

It was observed that at both pre-therapy and post-therapy testing the mean correlation for the concept of the ordinary person in relation to the ideal was higher than the mean self-ideal correlation. At the post-therapy it was found that the mean self-ideal congruence was considerably higher than the mean ordinary-ideal congruence. The mean self-ideal remained higher than the mean ordinary ideal correlation at the follow-up stage.
Rogers (1954) with the help of his associates undertook an investigation to study changes in the maturity of behaviour as related to therapy. In this study, it was assumed that after the completion of therapy the individual would behave in ways which would indicate a greater degree of emotional or behavioural maturity. There are very few instruments which can be used to measure one's everyday behaviour. The Emotional Maturity Scale developed by Willoughby (1954) was used in this study to measure the quality of behaviour. E-M Scale was administered to the clients and each of their two friends prior to therapy, after therapy and at the follow-up point at least six months after the conclusion of therapy. Each friend was requested to rate, in addition to the client, one person, well-known to him. This person was named in this study as 'control-individual'. The purpose of this was to determine the reliability of friends' ratings.

In general it was observed that where client-centered therapy has been in progress there is a significant observable change in the client's everyday behaviour in the direction of greater maturity and where there has been no movement or little movement in therapy, some deterioration in behaviour is observed.
Hoffman (1949) devised three-point Behaviour Scale which was administered to 10 cases. No appreciable change in behaviour maturity was found when the total results were considered. But when the cases were divided into two groups on the basis of their success in therapy, it was found that more successful cases showed a significant increase in the maturity of behaviour, whereas less successful cases showed little change.

Assum and Levy (1948) Kauffiman and Rainy (1949) and Rogers Natalie (1948) concluded from their studies that in successful client-centered therapy there was a decrease in psychological tension. They used Discomfort Relief Quotient devised by Dollard and Mowrer (1947) in order to measure the degree of psychological tension existing in the subjects. They found that verbal behaviour indicating psychological tension tended to decrease throughout the course of the interviews.

Thetford's (1948) study showed that as a result of therapy the client showed an increased tolerance for frustration. Nineteen individuals who were selected for the purpose of study were subjected to a standardized situation involving failure in repetition of digits. Various psychological measures were taken before, while undergoing and immediately after frustration. Immediately
after this experimental frustration, the clients had undergone individual or group therapy or both. At the conclusion of a series of therapeutic interviews, they were again subjected to experimental frustration. Similarly a control group of 17 clients was subjected to frustration in the beginning and this was repeated after a length of time comparable to that of the experimental group. The experimental group differed significantly from the controls. An index of variation in heart rate also discriminated significantly between the two groups. In other physiological measurements the differences were consistent in the expected direction, but were not statistically significant. It thus appears from the findings of this study that after therapy the individual was able to cope up with situations of emotional stress and frustration with tolerance and without feeling disturbed.

Muench (1947) administered Rorschach to 12 subjects prior to and immediately after the therapy. The results indicated significant changes in the direction of better adjustment. These results were confirmed in another study carried out by Hamlin and Albee (1948). They used 16 control clients and found no significant changes in Rorschach patterns of this group. Muench used no control group. In his study he used the Bell Adjustment Inventory and Kent
Rosanoff Word Association tests in addition to Rorschach. The results on both the tests showed movement in the direction of improved adjustment. In the case of Bell Adjustment Inventory the changes were in the expected direction in two of the five areas only, namely, health and emotional adjustment. On the Kent Rosanoff test the overall change was in the direction giving more normal associations and the difference between the pre- and post-tests was significant at .01 level of confidence.

Haimowitz (1951) gave Rorschach test to 56 clients before and after therapy. Thirty-two clients were interviewed either individually or both individually and in group. Thirty-four subjects were interviewed in group only. The control group of 15 individuals, comparable to the experimental group with respect to age, sex and education was also used. In order to evaluate Rorschach in terms of the therapeutic concepts of client-centered therapy, she (Haimowitz) developed a series of ten rating scales. The result showed significant improvement in the experimental group in comparison to that in the control group. It thus appeared that the changes of the sort found in the experimental group did not tend to occur in a similar comparable group, not subjected to therapy.
Mosak (1951) studied 28 neurotic clients who were interviewed 15 times. The measure of Rorschach was obtained before and after counselling therapy. No significant change was found. Rorschach protocols were judged by three experimental clinicians. They found that two cases showed much improvement. Nearly half the clients showed slight improvement and the remaining were unchanged. He also used Bell Adjustment Inventory. As in Muench's study here also the greatest change was found in the areas of emotional adjustment and health. There was improvement in home and occupational adjustment areas also. Mosak administered Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory and Hildreth Feeling Attitude Test to know whether the tests showed any change in behaviour. The Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory showed significant decreases on five of the nine diagnostic scales and on the two of the validity scales. The Hildreth Feeling Attitude Scales which were rated by the clients cover the individual's feeling state, his energy level, his degree of optimism regarding the future, his mental state, his attitude toward work and his attitude toward others. The clients showed significant improvement in all these scales. When the results of pre-therapy tests were compared with those of post-therapy tests, it was found that the improvement in the Feeling Attitude Scales was quite
considerable. The clients were rated on the same scale also by the therapists before and after therapy administration. It was found that the therapists tended to rate the clients lower, before and after therapy than did the clients themselves.

Carr (1949) administered Rorschach to nine clients before and after therapy. He used the same adjustment indicators as those used by Muench but found contrary results. Five cases showed no change, whereas four cases showed slight improvement.

Cowen (1950) studied 27 clients to whom the personality test was administered before therapy and 20 months after the conclusion of therapy. In this study the follow-up interviews were used. Significant changes were found in the direction of better adjustment and these changes were in general corroborated with those obtained in the follow-up interviews.

Studies employing Group Counselling

Winkler, Tiegland, Munger and Kranzler (1965) studied 121 underachievers. These pupils were randomly assigned to five groups. Six male counsellors counselled them 14 times, each time for 30 minutes. At the conclusion of counselling interviews it was found that none of the
treatment resulted in significant improvement either in grades or in personality test scores.

Caplan (1957) compared the outcome for experimental and control groups of junior high school boys, grades seven to nine. The group counselling was assigned weekly to experimental boys. The Q-technique was used to measure self and ideal self at the outset and end of the group counselling. The data indicated non-random increases in the congruence of the self and ideal self-sorts for the experimental group and not for the control group.

Catron (1966) used the Q-technique to appraise the impact of group counselling upon 13 groups of high school students. The counsellor helped the clients how to deal with feelings underlying choice-making and problem-solving. Analysis revealed that perception of self changed significantly for improved adjustment, but no significant change was found for perception of the ideal self or the ordinary self.

Clements (1966) used the technique of group counselling for preparing high school seniors for their college environment. He randomly selected 180 senior students from a high school. These subjects were divided into three equal groups, namely, one treatment group and two control groups.
The group discussion was based on attitudes, fears and aspirations. It was found that the subjects of the treatment group showed less anxiety concerning self both prior to college entrance and after beginning college.

Seven Negro boys and seven Negro girls were separately subjected to group counselling. Gilliland (1968) found that after one year of group counselling these Negro subjects showed significant gains in vocabulary, reading, English usage, occupational aspiration and vocational maturity.

The study conducted by Laxer, Quarter, Isnor and Kennedy (1967) showed no improvement for experimental subjects who were treated for their behaviour problems. This failure was attributed to insufficient period over which they were treated and the non-commitment on the part of the subjects to change their behaviour.

Chestnut (1965) evaluated the effect of structured and unstructured group counselling for gifted college underachievers. The subjects who were assigned to unstructured group were permitted to discuss whatever originated spontaneously in their group. The counsellor for the structured group encouraged the clients to discuss and to develop skills for coping with the genesis of poor achievement. At the conclusion of treatment it was found
that the subjects in the structured group had improved grades significantly more than their controls. At the three-month follow-up, their grades were still significantly better than those of the unstructured group.

**Summary**

Of the various studies reviewed in this chapter, some of them pertain to the relation between self-esteem and certain variables. Other studies pertain to the changes in self-esteem due to the effect of psychotherapy. The various studies concerning the relation between self-esteem and other variables show that self-esteem is positively correlated with the California Test of Personality, adjustment, achievement, social class, relationship with father and stability of the family. The two studies also show that the stress condition lowers the self-esteem, whereas support condition increases it. In a number of studies dealing with changes in self-esteem, it is shown that clients move from negative feelings to positive ones and from self-disapproval to self-approval. The increase in self-exploration with the accompaniment of insight was shown in one study. During therapy the number of statements of insight increases, whereas the number of statements of problems decreases. With this the self-understanding increases. The changes in the clients' attitudes due to the effect of therapy are also shown in a
few studies discussed here. The congruency between self and ideal-self increases after the administration of psychotherapy. In one study it was shown that increasing self-awareness is correlated with success in therapy. In successful therapy, there is a marked increase in the development of natural behaviour and a marked reduction in psychological tension. The effect of the therapy is such that the person becomes able to deal with situations more confidently and with a greater degree of tolerance. Successful psychotherapy also leads to better adjustment. All the studies point to the fact that the subjects' behaviour could be changed under the influence of psychotherapy.

There are a few studies in which group counselling was employed for school children. These and many other studies carried out to know the effectiveness of group counselling indicate that some success is achieved if group counselling is properly given to the subjects. The failure to obtain desirable changes is generally explained in terms of insufficient number of counselling sessions, non-commitment on the part of subjects to change their behaviour, lack of proper structuring within the group, etc. The results of various studies cannot be compared because details concerning
the counsellor's preparation, the nature of the group, the extent of willingness on the part of subjects to discuss freely, the specific counselling procedure followed, the measurement, employed, etc. are not available. The fact, however, emerges that group counselling does work for effecting desired changes in the behaviour of the subjects and the changes in the treatment groups are significant in comparison to those in the control group.
REFERENCES


