CHAPTER VIII

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

8.0 Introduction

This research work started with the major objective to design and develop and instrument/model for measuring human resource quality in different organizations. It was also aimed at measuring changes in organizational culture, quality of work life and employee satisfaction consequent upon the efforts of TQM. Instrument developed has also been used to assess the variations in HRQI due to the impact of TQM practices.

8.1 HRQ Model/Instrument

A number of questionnaires and instruments have been developed in the past. A list of few of these instruments developed by T.V.Rao is given below with the objective to differentiate the HRQ instrument developed by the researcher.

1) HRD practice profile for assessing the extend to which various HRD activities and roles are being performed effectively by the HRD department

2) HRD climate survey questionnaire to measure the HRD climate prevailing in an organization.

3) HRD competency check list for assessing the extent to which any given HRD professional has the competency required to be an HRD manager and missionary.

4) Training effectiveness questionnaire to assess the extent to which the training function is being effectively managed.

5) Performance planning and development questionnaire to assess and monitor the implementation of development oriented appraisal.

6) Effective counselor attitudes questionnaire to assess the extent to which any employee has the attitude to be a counselor.

7) Supervisory and leadership beliefs questionnaire to assess the HRD styles of the line managers.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No</th>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th>Number of questions/statements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>HRD practice profile</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>HRD climate survey</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>HRD competency check list</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Training effectiveness survey</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Performance planning and development</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Effective counselor attitudes</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Supervisory and leadership beliefs</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.1  
HRD instruments


The main objective of this study was to develop a model/instrument to assess the HRQ in organizations. The instrument described in detail in chapter V, has been developed based on extensive literature survey. Fourteen indicators of HRQ were identified from the literature survey and also based on expert opinion. These indicators are also grouped under three variables namely CCI, QWL! and ESI. These three variables when taken together give rise to the HRQI. The instrument thus developed consists of 279 statements grouped under fourteen indicators of HRQ. The instrument is appended in the thesis.

It is relevant to compare the instrument developed by the researcher for assessing HRQ with that developed by T.V.Rao (1999) for HRD audit. This comparison is done to establish the relevance of the present instrument and also its significance.

The HRD audit questionnaire by T.V.Rao is very comprehensive and is administered to line managers and the HRD staff and it is meant for supervisory and English speaking categories. This instrument has eight dimensions and 258 items as detailed below.
Table 8.2
HRD audit questionnaire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th>No. items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Carrier system</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Work planning</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Development systems</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Self renewal system</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>HRD</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>HRD function</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Strength, weakness and suggestion</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The HRD score can be obtained by adding up the dimension wise scores. The overall score is the general level of HRD effectiveness of the company.

The HRQI instrument developed by the researcher has 14 variables and 279 items. They are spread on three dimensions namely CCI, QWLI and ESI.

Table 8.3
HRQI instrument

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th>No. items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Cultural Change Index</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Quality of Work Life Index</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Employee Satisfaction Index</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The HRQI score is obtained by adding up the dimension wise scores. The overall score of the HRQI is indicative of the quality of HR in the company.

8.2 Test Results

The instrument described above has been tested for reliability. It is observed that the instrument is reliable for measuring HRQ and its variables- CCI, QWLI and ESI. Significance analysis/hypothesis testing was also conducted to establish the utility of the instrument.
8.2.1 Reliability Test

Reliability of the instrument was tested using the reliability test in SPSS10. It has been observed that the statements used for assessing the levels of 14 indicators show an average reliability score of above 0.7. The reliability of the instrument when grouped under CCI, QWLI, ESI and HRQI is well above 0.9. This illustrates the fact that the instrument/model is statistically reliable.

8.2.2 Significance Analysis

Hypothesis testing was done to verify whether the changes are significant or not. Even though the two spells of surveys were conducted within a span of one year, all the selected organizations show significant improvements in all the indicators and finally in human resource quality. This also shows that the instrument is statistically valid in assessing the changes in the indicators of HRQ due to the efforts of TQM.

8.2.3 Factor Analysis

Factor analysis was conducted on the data to verify whether the number of statements can be reduced or not, so that the instrument becomes easy and handy to administer. The details of factor analysis have been presented in chapter VII. From the analysis it is observed that one can think of modifying the instrument with less number of statements. However, this will lead to a drastic reduction in the reliability of the instrument. Hence it is desirable to use the instrument in its original form when one requires micro level assessment of changes in the indicators of HRQ.

8.3 Survey Results- A summary

From the analysis of the data it is observed that there is an increase in Cultural Change Index (CCI) in all organizations from first spell to second spell of survey. QWLI and ESI have also increased in all organizations except in organization 10. Human Resource Quality Index has shown significant improvement in all the ten organizations from first spell of survey to the next spell. It can be concluded that the instrument/model developed by the researcher is capable of assessing the levels of
each indicator and also human resource quality. Periodical assessment using the model gives ample opportunity for the organization to identify the areas of weaknesses. Further based on the assessment the organization can plan activities to improve the indicators of HR quality. There is scope for improving the instrument by extensive studies in different organizations. It may not be out of place to point out that some of the organizations have shown interest in conducting repeated surveys using the instrument and getting the feedback for designing their future programs for improving the human resource quality.

The results of the survey establish the linkage between TQM practice and Cultural change. Efforts in TQM definitely bring out a change in the way people think and act within the organizations. The training and developmental programmes equip the employees with necessary skill and ability to continuously improve the level of performance. Change in culture is not an easy task. Focused efforts of the organization to bring in cultural modifications will definitely succeed over a period of time.

TQM is not culture specific. Very often people ask whether a certain culture is a pre-requisite for introducing TQM. A culture is represented by the language or special words that people share, by the way things are done and the way people relate to each other. Obviously some conditions enable the smooth introduction of TQM while others hinder it. But a given culture is not a precondition for introduction of TQM. It may be remembered that a culture is a product of the way the system has been over a period of time. In TQM, therefore, the efforts will be for changing the system, and cultural change occurs as a natural consequence.

The results of this survey establish the linkage between TQM practices and QWL. An organization getting a score of 210 or above out of 350 may be considered to be successful in having a QWL conducive for facing the challenges of change. The assessment conducted by the researcher shows an increase in the level of each indicator. The management efforts are contributing positively to the improvement of work life.

The way an organization attracts, develops, motivates and retains people determines the success and failure. TQM practices should create new form of work organization, encouraging the skills, flexibility and commitment of the employees. The control approach to people management is still much in evidence. This strategy was appropriate in a world of limited changes, long product life, increasing markets
and poorly educated work place. However, in a fast changing and competitive environment, management should aim at developing people and building quality work environment. TQM efforts should be directed to structure the workplace in such a way as to energize and motivate employees so that the quality of work life improves and becomes satisfying to the work force.

The ESI measured using the instrument has shown significant enhancement in every organization except one. This has been presented in detail in chapter VII. HRQI of all the organizations along with the changes in HRQI in the first spell of survey to the second spell of survey with in a gap of one year have been clearly discussed. HRQI has increased significantly in all the organizations. As has already been mentioned, the organizations were selected deliberately keeping in mind that they were not affected by any factors other than TQM activities. This aspect has been discussed in detail in the earlier chapter. It can thus be concluded that the improvement in human resource quality in all these organization was due to the impact of TQM.

Finally as stated by Martins and De Tolado (2000) an organization gets only one chance to implement TQM, if it fails for lack of commitment, fails completely. Conversely it is important to ensure improvement in personal quality/human resource quality for the success of TQM. Product quality and process quality follow as a natural consequence of improvement in human resource quality. As stated by Ulrich (1991), organizations do not think, manufacture, decide, nor take advantage, people do it all. Hence for the success of TQM, efforts towards continuous improvement in human resource quality are essential and in other words improvement in HRQ is a natural out come of TQM.

In conclusion, TQM should aim at continuous improvement in HRQ, conquering all obstacles which come in the way. Human quality in an organization provides support to all functions in the journey towards TQM.

8.4 Limitation of the study

1. Only ten organizations have been taken up for the study, three in public sector and rest in private sector. Further the surveys were conducted in two spells with in a gap of one year. One year period is not an appreciable gap for quantum improvement in human quality as the variables are behavior oriented.
and intangible. Repeat surveys using the instrument every year may give significant information on the various indicators.

2. The surveys had been conducted at the supervisory level only. It is observed that such instruments are normally administered only to supervisory and managerial employees. For example HRD score card developed by T.V.Rao is been administered only to supervisory level employees. In small organizations particularly, the seven private organizations in the sample, the researcher could meet and administer the questionnaire to five to ten respondents as the middle level employees are only that many in number.

3. This instrument consists of several statements which require proper logical reasoning and understanding and hence it may not be appropriate to administer this instrument to lower level employees.

8.5 Areas for future research

The instrument developed by the researcher has been tested in ten organizations. It has been demonstrated that this instrument will be a very useful tool for organizations practicing TQM. This instrument can be used to give periodical feedback regarding areas of strength and weaknesses as regards to HRQ. It is suggested that the instrument may be administered in large number of organizations for modifications and final corrections. The following areas of research can be undertaken using this instrument

1. The instrument can be administered in knowledge based industries with requisite modifications in the statements and evaluated for consistency and validity.

2. The instrument may be used for benchmarking organizations in respect of HRQI.

3. Research can also be undertaken to design and develop training programs based on the out comes from periodical administration of this instrument.
8.6 Conclusion

This research was started with the main objective of developing an instrument to assess HRQ in organizations. An instrument was developed based on extensive literature survey and expert opinion. Statistical validity of the instrument was established. Further using the instrument surveys were conducted in two spells in ten selected organization. The data thus collected was analyzed and has been presented in chapter 7. From the research it is concluded that the instrument developed is capable of assessing the level of HRQ in any organization (refer section 7.8). This instrument has the following major uses.

1. This instrument may be used to assess HRQI of any organization.
2. It can also be used to benchmark organizations based on HRQI. The HRQI of a world class organization can be taken as a benchmark to compare different organizations. In other words the HRQI of a socially accepted organization in a state may be compared with that of different organizations.
3. The assessment using the instrument will enable the management of any organization to design and develop appropriate training and development strategies to improve HRQI.
4. Organization can also benchmark CCI, QWLI and ESI using this instrument.

In the process of globalization and liberalization of Indian economy, the rule of the game has changed. Most of the giant organizations are going for mergers and acquisitions. As per the data of Center for Monitoring Indian Economy (CMIE), the mergers and acquisitions of Indian organization have increased in recent times. But the success rate is very low because of the cultural mismatch and failure in human resource management. It is now a proven fact that the technology is not the only significant point among successful organizations. It is the people who give the leverage. Employees are the permanent associates and it is they who serve the organization with their work, talent, creativity and drive. "Human dynamics play a pivotal role in surmounting obstacles, defusing complex situations and achieving organizational goals" (Biswaajeeet Pattanayak-2004). Just like a man is known by company he keeps, an organization is known by the people it is comprised of. Thus the quality of HR is the most critical factor for organizations to face today's
challenges. The HR of an organization represents its largest investment. In fact, government report shows that approximately 75% of national income is spent to compensate the employees. Hence it becomes very important to sustain and improve HRQ. In short all efforts of management and leadership should be to assess and develop the HRQ in the organization. This instrument developed by the researcher is available for use by industry and the same can be improved by future researches.

This research has provided excellent opportunities for the investigator to understand the various concepts of quality management and provided in depth understanding of human dimensions in organizations. The researcher being a student of management considers this work as his life time achievement. The investigator having done the research feels fully confident to continue such activities for self development and to contribute significantly towards HRQ improvement in organizations.