Chapter-VIII

SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

8.1. Introduction

The burgeoning empirical literature on Social Capital by various social scientists, now accepts the idea that social capital is a multidimensional concept. This allows each author to focus on a particular aspect of the concept, according to the aims and scope of the study. Empirical works every time address different dimensions, adopting particular measures using different data sources. This makes any general assessment difficult. There is a diversified literature on social capital in all branches of social sciences. Furthermore, the importance of social capital in economic models is emphasized by researchers like Ostrom (Ostrom, 1994). Recent literature on social capital can be classified into the following groups

4. Literature dealing with the definitional issues of social capital
5. Literature dealing with the measurement issues of social capital
6. Literature dealing with the effect of social capital on development.

While some of the contributions are theoretical, some are empirical. The empirical research suffers from different problems because of its ambiguity and versatility. There is neither a commonly accepted definition, nor a universal measurement method of social capital.

8.2. Research Gap

Due to the multi dimensionality of the concept of social capital, it is a challenging task to measure the social capital. However several researchers measured it from different dimensions. But most of the studies are confined to western countries. There are very few studies in the Indian context (Anirudh Krishna, 2002). Though the Tibetan Settlements have been in India since 1959, no research study relating to social capital was conducted in any of these settlements. The present study is in a way an exploratory study to understand the socio economic background of the Tibetans in India, Social capital issues and the role of administration in promoting social capital.
8.3. Objectives

The literature has demonstrated that the creation of social capital is a complex process heavily influenced by social, political, and cultural factors as well as by the dominant types of economic activities. The challenge of development agencies such as the World Bank is to operationalize the concept of social capital and to demonstrate how and how much it affects development outcomes.

Social Capital plays an important role especially in the case of Tibetan communities as this community lives in a refugee status. It is a unique situation where the people are governed by the Exile Tibetan Government, located on Indian soil and depend on services provided by the Indian Government. Under this complex scenario, relationships and bonding which are the main source of Social capital play an important role in sustaining the livelihood of this community.

Present study makes an attempt to understand the development model of Tibetan settlements and the role played by Social capital. The specific objectives of this study are

1. To analyze the socio-economic conditions of Tibetans living in Tibetan settlements in Karnataka
2. To measure social capital empirically in the context of Tibetan settlement
3. To analyze the development programme implemented by Tibetan Government in Exile
4. To identify the determinants of social capital
5. To study the effect of social capital on Tibetan peoples’ well-being

8.4. Research Methodology

The present study is based on the primary data collected from the two Tibetan settlements located in Bylakuppe of Periyapatna Taluk namely: the Tibetan Dickey Larsoe Settlement and Lugsung Samdupling Tibetan Settlement. There are 16 camps in the Tibetan Dickey Larsoe Settlement and each camp has around 35 households, whereas there are 6 camps in Lugsung Samdupling Tibetan Settlement and each camp has around 100 households. The Primary data were collected from total of 127 sample respondents through a pretested questionnaire. The ten percent of the households in every camp from the Lugsung Samdupling Tibetan Settlement constitute 10 sample
respondents from each camp whereas it is 4 sample respondents from each camp of the Tibetan Dickey Larsoe Settlement, at Bylakuppe town in Periyapatna Taluk of Mysore district of Karnataka State.

A detailed survey was conducted using the questionnaire prepared by the World Bank, to measure the presence or absence of social capital. The questionnaire contains three sections. Section one, deals with the demographic details of the sample population. Under this section, the information relating to the education, occupation and gender of the respondents were asked. Section two, tries to measure the structural social capital by using the proxy indicators like membership in a network, nature and density of memberships, degree of participation and collective action by the members in groups. Section three, an attempt is made to measure the presence or absence of cognitive social capital among the members by the use of proxy indicators like the degree of solidarity, cooperation, trust, cohesion and conflict among the members of the network.

Factors influencing structural and cognitive dimensions of social capital were characterized by using regressions analysis. Binary Logistic Regression estimation procedure was adopted. The following equations were estimated.

\[
\text{Structural Capital} = f(\text{education, occupation, duration of stay, age})
\]

\[
\text{Cognitive Capital} = f(\text{education, occupation, duration of stay, age})
\]

8.5. Hypotheses

1. Structural dimension of social capital depends on the age of the population
2. Cognitive dimension of social capital depends on the education level of the population

8.6. Tibetan Diaspora

Tibet has a long history of once being an independent country and had been ruled by the different Tibetan kings/Emperors for generations. Tibet had relationship with its neighboring countries dating back to the 7th century because at that point of
time the foremost king Songtsen Gampo of Tibet first married a Nepal princess. Tibet had the neighbouring countries like China towards its east, Nepal and India towards its west, Eastern Turkistan on the north, Myanmar towards its south east and Bhutan towards its south.

By the year 1959, the Chinese Liberation Army successfully occupied all of Tibet and as a result many Tibetans, lead by His Holiness the XIV Dalai Lama fled from their motherland Tibet. They reported to the neighboring countries like India, Nepal and Bhutan as refugees and got all sorts of major rehabilitation support from the respective host Governments, at that point of time. Presently there are 53 Tibetan settlements all over the world and out of these 35 are in India, 11 in Nepal and 7 in Bhutan.

His Holiness the XIV Dalai Lama and his fellow Tibetans after taking refuge in India, established the Exile Tibetan Government now being known as the Central Tibetan Administration (CTA), was first set up at Mussoorie in April 1959 and in the following year shifted to Dharamshala in Himachal Pradesh. Under the able guidance of His Holiness the XIV Dalai Lama, the exiled Tibetans had to kick start their livelihood with the resettlements for the displaced Tibetans, thus, the (Central Tibetan Administration) CTA was formed, after getting due permission from Pandit Jawarhar Lal Nehru, the then Prime Minister of India, to inculcate and practice democratic principles and traits among the citizens. The Central Tibetan Administration, like any other independent country’s Government of the world had its own Charter that provides for a clear separation of power among the three organs of the administration, namely: the Judiciary, the Legislature and the Executive respectively for the Democratic functioning to the exiled Tibetan. Under the Executive Organ, there are seven Departments that frames and execute policies for catering the needs of its exiled citizens.

8.7. Socio economic profile of the respondents

In Lugsung Samdupling Tibetan settlement, there are 6 camps with approximately 600 households, of which about 10 percent of them i.e. 59 households were randomly selected as sample. In Tibetan Dickyi Larsoe settlement, there are 16 camps with approximately 512 households, of which about 10 percent of them i.e.68
households were randomly taken as the samples. So in total 127 respondents were interviewed.

The sample comprises 49.26 percent of male and 50.74 percent of female population. It is interesting to observe that 89 percent of population is literate and only 11 percent are illiterate. The sample includes 34 percent dependent population and most of them were students whereas the independent population is 66 percent.

The occupational classification of the respondents shows that 54.21 percent of the sample population are employed, of which about 20 percent are dependent on agriculture, about 9 percent are dependent on business and 3.22 percent are employed as teachers, the data also depicts that 45.79 percent of the sample respondents are unemployed which includes women, students and children below 3 years of age (others). The Tibetan in 1960-70’s depended mainly on the agriculture, as they lacked in the language, education and skills to pursue any other occupation. Gradually they acquired /learnt the local language and shifted to the sweater selling business, during winter, which had become the annual routine for them to migrate to the near-by towns.

Social capital has two important dimensions. They are
- Structural social capital, and
- Cognitive social capital.

8.8.1. Measuring Structural Social Capital
Structural social capital refers to the networks/groups/structures ie. Formal or informal; that provides identity, belongingness for the individuals in some groups, whether small or large. Thereby able to promote goodwill, reciprocity and norms (cognitive social capital) among themselves that not only helps for the active members but also to the not active members (bystanders) of a group. Thus these structures perform as instruments of community’s wellbeing and development. Structural social capital is a foundation stone to the creation of cognitive social capital.
To operationalize the concept of social capital, the group networks nature, density, degree of participation, reciprocity and collective action were used as proxy indicators of social capital. Presence and absence of Groups and networks is identified as one of the indicators of measurement of social capital in any community. The Tibetan settlements, since its inception, formed several group and network, to fulfill various needs of the people. People enrolled themselves as member in different groups or networks to fulfill their various objectives. Some of the groups were formed just to cater to their social needs while others were formed to cater to their economic, political, religious, aesthetic, recreational, health and hygiene aspects. Survey results revealed that 18.05 percent of the populations are members of the village committee, 12.91 percent are members of cooperatives, 9.49 percent are members of farmer's group and 9.35 percent of the populations are members of NGO.

The data on relative importance of different groups reflects that the maximum number of respondents rated the Neighborhood Association (42.4 and 16.49 percent), the most preferred group, in the first and third preference respectively. Because it provides instant assistance of every kind, for coping with different mild socio economic problems, due to physical proximity, with the neighbours. In the second preference, the most preferred group is to the cooperatives (19.49 percent).

The nature of membership indicates whether the members are closely related to each other by blood relation or are they from diverse family background, which are the homogeneous or heterogeneous groups respectively. This shows that real nature of Social Capital ie., whether the social network is based on the kinship or social advantage of being together in a group. The survey data revealed that 83.46 percent of members are not from the same extended family. This means that only 12.61 percent of the group members are from the same extended family implying that members are from the diverse family background. This implies that, the level of social capital is high.

Degree of membership overlap also indicates the extent of structural social capital. The data shows that there is much overlap in the membership in all the three groups, because most of the members, who were the members in Neighbourhood Committee, also were members in the Cooperative and NGO. According to Putnam, Coleman and Nan Lin, they all have this common notion that dense network as a resource. To preserve the Tibetan culture and identity in exile, the CTA emphasized the importance
of maintaining cohesiveness by providing separate settlements to promote physical proximity to the Tibetan refugees.

Human being as a social animal of typical kind, it is not just enough for people to belong to any formal or informal groups. It is equally important for them to participate in it to elicit their hidden talents to provide mutual assistance or to acquire tangible or intangible possessions by involving in their groups. Data collected through survey shows that 61.22 percent of the members are active in their groups (active degree of participation), which is a resource to the community as stated by Nan Lin and his colleagues in the Strength of Strong Ties.

Who makes decisions is equally important in promoting bonding among the group members. The democratic decision making gives opportunity for the members to trust each other. Therefore, the decision making processes among the community organizations is considered as an indicator to measure social capital. The findings of the survey show that more than fifty percent of the respondents from all the three important groups expressed that decisions are made democratically. It is reported that their leaders usually make decisions in a democratic way, ie. the leader asks group members what they think and then decides. The decisions taken in the groups are democratic and multilateral as they arise from consultation with the group members and participation by them.

Association with the group depends on the benefits that the individual receives, both tangible and intangible benefits. The survey results reveal that 70.87 percent of the respondents felt that by belonging to these groups they had acquired new skills. The tangible benefits that the members receive are financial assistance to take care of health and education needs, housing needs, etc. The intangible benefits experienced are in the form of generalized trust, safety, security, social protection, belongingness, solidarity etc., that are in operation in their settlements, which are very essential for Tibetans to sustain and develop in exile.
8.8.2. Measuring Cognitive Social Capital

Cognitive social capital refers to the intangible aspects like trust, belief, cooperation, social and economic solidarity, goodwill, harmony, norms etc. that is exercised consciously or subconsciously within or across the members of their respective group.

In order to empirically measure the amount of cognitive social capital, among the respondents, the proxy indicators from the World Bank Questionnaire like, the degree of trust to other people in the village and vice-versa, the degree of social and economic solidarity towards others or vice-versa in a given circumstances, seeking or rendering help from/to insider or outsider, in case of dealing with adverse situations, information exchange among the members and the amount of cooperation and harmony among the citizens were used.

People's dependence on each other at the time of some unexpected happening at home is an indicator for cognitive social capital. The primary data collected from the sample respondents of the two settlements show that 91.3 percent of them could first turn to their family members to help. Beside family members, 75.6 percent of the respondents rated that their neighbours would help to overcome the situation. Presence of cognitive social capital is measured in terms of presence of solidarity in facing sudden personal loss.

The presence of cognitive social capital is also assessed by the amount of economic solidarity shown at the time of crisis by their social network members. The primary data depicts the fact that 79.5 percent of the respondents felt that their family members would be the first to assist them financially in their financial crisis situation. In the second preference, 33.3 percent of the respondents said that their neighbours would be expected to provide financial assistance and then by their friends (30.9%), as the third preference.

The nature and amount of trust to the group members were also one of the proxy indicators used by the World Bank to measure the cognitive social capital. The generalized trust among the members in matters of lending and borrowing is very high. Because more than 84 percent of the respondents said that they do trust one
another. Only 15.75 percent said that they do not trust one another in matters of lending and borrowing.

Collective action is important because it brings in both tangible and intangible benefits. Thinking about the welfare of others, other than their neighbours, brings in reciprocity among rest of the members. In order to understand the attitude of the respondents towards their contribution for the welfare of others, the respondents were asked about their willingness to contribute time and money. It was found that 67.72 and 72.44 percent of the members were ready to contribute time and money respectively.

The present study on the inter-village comparison on contribution of time and money for common development clearly supports the fact that not only the Tibetan people in the sample respondent village but also the Tibetan in other villages also contributest an appropriate quantity of time and money toward common development activities. Because more than 54 per cent of the sample respondent said that the villagers in the sample village contribute about the same as those in other villages. This collective virtue of the villagers in different villages is in fact the effect of the existence of the local networks and associations in their villages well aware of their collective virtues.

Giving priority to the personal interests is the natural instinct of the human being. Due to this personal issues get first priority rather than the collective issues. This would lead to the disintegration of the specific group or community and thus the general citizens. We could see that more than 95 percent of the sample respondent said that the type of relationship found within their village is harmonious but only 4.72 percent of the respondents said that the relationships among the members were disagreeable.

The level of conflict in the community is considered one of the proxy indicators of low social capital. The data reveals the fact that 88.19 percent of the sample respondents said that the citizens in their village are peaceful, but 11.18 percent of them said that the citizens in their village are conflictive.
The survey data also reflects the fact that the community leaders play an important role in resolving the dispute of their citizens, just in-case any such situation arises. Because about 60 percent of the respondents said that their camp leaders would help resolve the dispute. This is reflection of one of the important function of the camp leaders, indeed acting as a local judge.

8.9. Development Programmes implemented in Tibetan Settlements

The secondary data collected from the Planning Commission of CTA, Dharamsala shows that the budget allocated on Department of religion and culture was 2.29 percent in the Integrated Development Plan (IDP)-3 and had increased to 3.89 percent in the IDP- 4. The budget allocated on Department of Health was 16.18 percent in the IDP-3 and had decreased to 13.73 percent in the IDP-4, it had decreased by 2.45 percent over the plan period.

The important programmes implemented at the La\STS (old) settlement are in the area of irrigation, health and sanitation, drinking water and infrastructure facilities.

8.10. The Camp Leaders

The Camp Leaders play an important role in the execution of different programmes implemented by the different departments of the CTA, by acting as a bridge between the settlement office and the public in different camps.

The Central Tibetan Administration had created excellent mechanisms for the effective participation of community through various hierarchical levels. The Central Tibetan Administration, like any other independent country's Government of the world had formulated its own Charter that provides for a clear separation of power among the three organs of the administration, namely: the Judiciary, the Legislative and the Executive respectively for the democratic functioning of the exiled Tibetans. Under the executive organ of the CTA, there are Seven Departments that formulate different plans and policies, which will be approved by the Kashag/Planning Commission, to safeguard the interest of the citizens. The concerned departments send their circulars to the Representative offices and the representative offices in turn forward it to the common people, through the camp leaders. The camp leaders are accountable to the Representative of the Settlement concerned, the Chu-poen (which means a leader of 10 households) and Padhue (literarily means assembly of the
patriots) are accountable to their respective Camp Leaders. The camp Leaders are directly elected by their camp residents for a period of one year.

The survey data on the age group classification of the camp leaders reveal that majority (54.55 percent) of the camp leaders were in the age group of 40-60 years of age. About 27.27 percent of the camp leaders had passed class X and the remaining 72.72 percent of them were below class X. None of the camp leaders were graduates.

8.10.1. Camp Leaders and Social Capital

The common vision of all the camp leaders in both the settlements, or, for that matter of the whole exiled Tibetans all over the world, are to maintain their identity, by not only preserving its rich culture, tradition, language and Religion, on the foreign land but also promoting it to their younger generation by making it more valid, relevant and viable by making innovative changes in it, as per the requirements of the 21st century citizens.

But when it comes to the specific projects, in the two Settlements, 50 percent of the camp leaders have the projects related to the development of the economic infrastructures such as: setting up of solar light, construction of community hall, playground for nursery children, to construct basketball ground. Whereas 22.73 percent of them have the projects related to the development of social infrastructure such as: to arrange scholarship for the student who belongs to economically backward households, to conduct evening studies, purchase and installation of drinking water treatment plant, to solve water and sanitation problem. But 27.27 percent of them have no project in hand, due to lack of time and fund.

From the above analysis, it is clear that camp leaders have an important role in promoting social capital in the Tibetan community. The responses of the leaders and the focus group discussions revealed that camp leaders promote Bonding Social Capital among the public. It is evident that by inviting people of their respective camps to assemble in the community hall, to disseminate the circulars of the various departments, a common platform is created to the public for collective thinking and learning interactions, leading to informed decisions and efficient use of scarce resources. Interaction enables people to build communities, to commit themselves to each other, and to knit the social fabric.
The study also revealed that the camp leaders, being the representatives of the respective camps, promote Bridging social capital between their citizen and the local Indian or across different departments within the CTA framework. Since the camp leaders come under the jurisdiction of the department of homes, they do have the legitimate authority to provide bonafide certificates to the citizens for various purposes. The different departments also seek recommendation letter from the camp leaders and the settlement representatives, for the execution of various welfare programs, recruitment of the personnel in their departments etc.

8.11. Social Capital and Well-being

The impact of social capital on well being is explored by enquiring about the perceptions of respondents in causes of differences in citizens' integrity, participation in collective action etc.

The perceptions of the sample respondents show that 33.07 percent of the respondents attribute the differences in integrity to the differences in educational attainment. According to another 26.77 percent of the respondents, the differences in wealth divide the citizens. On the contrary among the factors which do not contribute to the differences, 74.80 percent of the respondent said that difference in religious belief, not at all causes division of the members. One important observation to be found is that difference in wealth, social status and generation gap creates somewhat division among its citizen.

Regarding the exclusion the data reveals that the incidence of exclusion is maximum in case of job training with 5.51 percent of the citizens being excluded. Overall the incidence of exclusion is very less.

As per the reasons cited by the respondents, 4.72 percent of the respondents said that the difference in income and occupation were the main economic factors that influence exclusion.

8.12. Collective Action

Scarcity of resources enhances the level of collective action and the collective action enhances the wellbeing of the citizens in general, because due to collective action, not only the members but also the bystanders (who are not the members) are benefitted.
The data shows that about 19 percent of the respondents joined frequently with others in the village to address the common issue. On the contrary, there were 15.75 percent of the respondents that never joined with others in their village to address a common issue. For the collective action to be in action, the pre-requisite for it is that the citizens in general should have a desired quantity of spirit to perform collective action to redress their collective issues. This bedrock of the spirit of the citizens will create goodwill that greases the wheel of the relationship in the networks. So the citizens are endowed with the preliminary attributes required for addressing the collective issues of the networks. This is shown in the following table, where about 60 percent of the respondents said the spirit of participation in their village is average. More than 21 percent of the respondents said their villagers spirit was high, more than 13 percent said that their villagers spirit is very high. On the contrary, only few respondents said that the spirit of the villagers' is low and very low with 1.57 and 3.94 percent respectively.

8.13. Social Capital, Empowerment and Village Development

Social capital influences self empowerment positively. Generally an individual or an institution who feel that they are part of the community feels empowered. To assess the aptitude of the respondents that brings a positive change in village, the respondents were asked to express their opinion on how much they feel they can influence the activities in the village. It is interesting to observe that more than 27 percent of the respondents said that they can influence a lot and about 57 percent of the sample respondent said that they could influence to some extent.

The opinions of the respondents about the changes in the level of prosperity in the last five years was collected and it shows that according to 47 percent of the respondents the village prospered in the last five years. About 48 percent of the respondents said that they strongly agree to the statement. But only about 2 and 4 percent of the respondents disagrees to the statement. According to them part of this can be attributed to the programmes implemented by CTA and the other part could be due to the linking social capital.
8.14. Findings

Tibetan has their set of (charter) organs to function as a sovereign nation, in the refugees status, with their own political leader, judiciary, legislatures and the executive bodies. So, the fear of democracy being overpowered by the social capital group as said by Robert Putnam as a bad outcome is irrelevant in this present Tibetan context, as they have strong macro and micro social capital in operation.

Voluntary contribution of time and money had been used as a strategy by the CTA for inequality aversion, through different learning interactions under different learning context that are created in the Camps. It brings the high-income and low-income group people together in the camp, which enhances cohesiveness and reciprocity among the common masses.

It is also observed that trust is an important driver of long-term growth. It lubricates the wheel of all other socio-economic activities. The research findings also support this argument. Camp Leaders in different camps of the Settlement promote this most important input for the development of the Tibetan community.

One important contribution of Social capital for the development of the Tibetan community is in the area of education. Due to the efforts of Central Tibetan Administration in general and Department of Education in particular, sufficient funds were being raised for supporting education through scholarships. Thus, it is an important outcome of the Linking Social Capital at the macro level.

There were quite a few numbers of drop-outs from the school; due to presence of Linking Social Capital of the CTA these students were provided with the opportunities to pursue vocation education of their choice at other places.

8.15. Suggestions

There was more number of graduates who has received general education with the support of the Department of Education's scholarship for the past few decades. Now there is dearth of human resource with technical and professional education. Therefore the Department of Education should make a paradigm change in its strategy of providing the scholarships to its youngsters, as per the situation demands.

The Central Tibetan Administration should train their leaders of different social groups on emerging issues. The leaders should be trained on understanding macro policies and their impact on micro variables. The training of the CTA should assist the networks to select right funding agencies, areas of intervention and intervention strategies.
There are quite a lot of graduates and post graduates in different disciplines among the second generation Tibetans who were not employed and therefore they prefer leaving their jurisdictions in search of jobs. This is creating a threat of disintegration of the Tibetan identity. Thus the CTA has to find some source of long term investment to generate employment opportunities at the grass-root level.

Provision of basic support system to the educated employed couples, in the form of crèches or mid-day meals to their children in institutions they work.

The camp leaders are to be provided with technical knowledge on ensuring effective community participation and documentation process.

Social capital is extremely important for Tibetan community because the community is being administered by a government in exile and the people are living in a refugee status. The relationship among the members of the community and the community's relationship with the local administration, where this community is located, determine the social and economic life of the people.