CHAPTER 5. CONCLUSIONS OF THE STUDY, ITS CONTRIBUTION TO EXISTING KNOWLEDGE, AND SCOPE FOR FUTURE STUDY

5.1 Summary and Conclusions

The study validates the transformational leadership qualities of Shivaji. These are relevant even today. Shivaji’s leadership had all the elements (the 4Is) of Bass’s concept of transformational leadership. The study showed that welfare (of the followers) also is crucial to transformational leadership. Indeed, there are sufficient indications that it enriches the 4 Is. (1985).

The study has fulfilled the objectives of the study:

- To identify the characteristics of today’s leadership, and the tools required by present day leaders that will enable them to succeed.

- To identify the skills that Shivaji used as a leader and compare them with the leadership skills that are needed today

The data collected in the study, and their analyzes have helped to validate previous studies and add to knowledge. The rich descriptions provided by respondents (through interviews) have helped in gaining new insights on the characteristics and attributes required of a successful leader. These leadership behavior can be used by present practitioners for reflection then adapting to their own practices.

The researcher believes that the findings of this study provide a framework for analyzing Shivaji as a Transformational Leader. Moreover, it is an improvement over the transformational leadership model as welfare element surfaced in the study.

The findings of the study have also led to a more comprehensive definition of transformational leadership: “Transformational leadership, is the ability of the leader, backed by his (or her) skill, character, intelligence and deeds that are significantly concerned with the welfare of the people (followers) with emphasis on ethics, moral value and trust”. This definition incorporates the elements that give transformational leadership a more holistic meaning.

The following themes of transformational leadership emerged from the study: Architecting leadership, leadership core, leader behavior, relationship building, practice
what you preach, premises of good leadership, self-awareness, essentials of business environment, formal crowning/coronation of the leader, attention to the individual needs of employees, leader as a role model, trust them (the followers) and be trusted in return, attention to individual needs of employees, personal gain, nurturing/coaching/mentoring employees, the four Is and vision are frequently reflected in the leader’s behavior.

**Theme 1: Architecting Leadership**

Architecting leadership is emphasized in the four Is of transformational leadership (Inspirational Motivation, Individualized Consideration, Intellectual Stimulation, Idealized Influence) and Vision. All respondents in the study confirmed their understanding of Transformational leadership as revolving around the Four Is and Vision.

Bennis and Nanus (1985) proposed four common characteristics of a transformational leader, of which vision was one. A leader must show the ability to implement not only the current vision, but also the ability to foresee the future vision. To architect leadership, leaders must practice Intellectual stimulation by becoming coach/mentor and facilitator for their employees. The leaders accepted that much improvement is needed in this aspect of their leadership.

Leaders must go beyond what they must do within the system and give attention to employee development and their personal welfare and wellbeing. This calls for selflessness. All 17 entrepreneurs among the respondents agreed that selfless leadership is essential. The 42 business leaders who were not founders found practices of self leadership only in scenarios like crisis if they arise in the organizations.

The leadership practice for all these respondents was also dependent on what early life experiences they received from their seniors, models and parents.

This is a primary requisite of the Transformational leadership Model of Bass. “Transformational Leadership has more emphasize on intrinsic motivation and with positive development of the followers represent more appealing view of leadership than transactional leadership which is a cold process” Bass and Riggio (2006).
The study revealed that leaders must have good listening skills which help them to become good decision makers. The art of listening goes a long way in resolving issues quickly and prevent issues from turning into serious problems. An organization grows when the leader is open to ideas, suggestions and views given by all stakeholders in the organization.

Senge (2006) had described leaders as those developing a vision collaboratively with their followers for the vision to become successful and obtainable. The vision, as mentioned by the respondents of the study, was the vision of the company and its founder. It was an individual vision and not one which was collectively formed. The need of today is to have a social vision that includes the building of the character of employees and the nation with a bottom up approach.

Bass’s model mentions leaders having vision and foresight. The study confirms that the vision must include a social aspect which helps character, necessary for society and nation.

Leaders must manage with their people skills to influence, motivate, coach and mentor their people. A prerequisite is selecting the right person for the right job. Selfless service, demonstration of ethics, good character, value-based leadership are crucial.

**Theme 2: The Leadership Core**

There was unanimous agreement that “Goal setting and execution” should be practiced from the beginning and interaction with the employees (followers) must be continuous. This is necessary for achieving the vision and mission of the organization. However, the respondent-entrepreneurs found it difficult to meet the goals they set. In this context, Hallinger (2007) emphasized on the connection between personal goals and organizational goals.

The study confirms that the participating leaders practiced goal setting but continuous follow up, clarity and execution had problems.

Podsakoff et al. (1990) describe how transformational leadership and goal difficulty are linked. They conclude that one of the key elements of transformational leadership behavior is “setting high performance expectations”. High expectations imply more difficult goals. Whittington et al. (2004) use a similar argument in stating that
transformational leaders use challenging goals to communicate high expectations. Discussion with the respondents did not result in the explicit articulation of the need for good character, moral values and trust.

Transformational leaders of today have to build collaborative eco-systems in which the employees can learn continuously. Leaders must endeavor to develop more leaders rather than followers. In this context, most respondents said that they found it difficult to create leaders. Thus, decisions and problem-solving are centralized processes. In his study, Leithwood (1992) shows how transformational leaders continuously help and collaborate with employees to solve problems.

Theme 3: Leader Behavior

Transformational leaders are required to demonstrate certain competencies for empowering their employees. Confidence, ability to motivate, commitment, superior communication skills, creativity, visionary inspiration, ability to influence, foresight are required on the part of the leader. All respondents in the study were unanimous in their view that communication was the most crucial influencing factor in the organization. They credited their leadership behavior to being quick learners and self-aware. These characteristics are directly associated with those of transformational leadership as proposed by Bass (1985). However, the manner in which these leaders made their people feel important, gave them respect, showed concern for them and treated them fairly was not evident in their responses. To most of the respondents, it was sufficient that their employees received a salary and were covered by medical insurance, and the educational expenses of their dependent children were partly met.

Theme 4: Relationship Building

Continuous interactions, communication and handholding of employees during the on-boarding process go far in their acculturation. The respondents said that goals are discussed during performance appraisal and on-boarding. Alignment of organizational and employee goals has been difficult. This is in contrast to Shivaji’s goal of unifying individual and society’s goals with his goal of Swarajya.

Theme 5: Practice what you preach
There was unanimous agreement among the respondents that they achieve the standards they set if they want their employees to follow them. Leaders must demonstrate positive and constructive behavior for their employees to emulate. Only then would the leaders earn the respect of employees. Four respondents in the study admitted that they were not very receptive to their employees’ feedback that they were not being fair and just in the treatment of subordinates. It needs mention here that Shivaji was an exemplary leader, imbuing his followers with ethical conduct, value-based behavior, high character, morals, fair and just treatment to all the employees. He practiced what he wanted the employees (followers) to practice.

**Theme 6: Premises for Good Leadership**

All respondents reported that they had attractive reward and compensation systems in their respective organizations. In the case of founder-entrepreneurs, a formal mechanism for grievance redressal was being implemented. They also emphasized the need for appointing trained counselors to solve their problems. However, all respondents expressed their inability to solve psychological problems.

There was convergence among 42 respondents on the schemes and policies in place for the employees. They agreed that without such practices, they would have been portrayed negatively in the social media. Therefore, listening to the employees and solving their problems is a necessity. In this context, mention must be made of Shivaji’s seal which proclaimed that Shivaji worked for the welfare of all mankind.

There is also evidence from the letters written to his followers enjoining them to take care of the resources of the land and its people. Such concern appears to be missing in the business leaders of the present day. The women respondents said there was not sufficient stress on fair and just treatment, and intolerance of indiscipline and misbehavior.

**Theme 7: Self-Awareness**

The entrepreneurs among the respondents stressed on the qualities of good character, morals, values, ethics, honesty, integrity, selfless service. However, the respondents who were appointed to their positions pointed out there is a significant gap between intent and execution.
Bennis and Nanus (1985) described “deployment of self, the characteristics of the leader who was self-deployed included commitment, determination, persistence, consideration and kindness”. Shivaji possessed these qualities.

**Themes 8 and 9: Essentials for business Environment**

All the respondents in the study agreed that respective organizations had multiple ways of engaging with their external customers. Schell (2008) states that the transformational theory of leadership is effective and has been shown to correlate well with business success in a variety of environments.

Ideally, according to forty-two respondents, customers are categorized into internal (employees of the organization who become customers due to interdependency of the functions) and external customers (the ones who buy and pay for the organization’s products and services).

Fulwiler (2013) proposes his ideology of not only health and safety (H&S) excellence, but also excellence in other critical business functions such as cost, quality, productivity, customer service through Transformational leadership.

**Theme 10: Formal Crowning/Coronation of the leader**

All the respondents agreed that a leader is recognized as one only through success. He/she must earn the trust and respect of the employees. Employees are drawn to successful leaders.

Shivaji was formally coroneted as king. In their research on Transformational leadership, Kellowaya, et al (2012) examined its relation to and employees’ psychological well-being. Trust plays a mediating role. The study tied the role of trust in leader and discussed its positive relationship with employee wellbeing. Kennedy (2013) also confirms trust being an important factor for the success of Transformational leadership.

**Theme 11: Attention to the personal needs of employees**

Attention to their personal needs makes employees more committed to their leader. Treating employees with respect and trusting them gives the leader the drive in the organization. Commitment and loyalty should first be exhibited by the leader because learning takes place by observation.
Shivaji grew up among common people. He readily mixed with them and was always willing to look into their problems, placing people’s needs before his own. The respondents in the study said that with three generations of employees, it was very difficult to understand each employees’ personal needs. There is substantial diversity in cultural backgrounds and personalities. Hence, today’s leaders must make extra efforts to empathize with their employees.

**Theme 12: Leader as a role model**

Every single trait and behavior begins with one’s self, which was agreed by all the respondent-leaders. Shivaji was a transformational leader who not only attracted loyalty and willingness for sacrifice among his followers, he also appealed to their higher moral values by changing their attitudes, as evidenced in the literature review.

Kouzes and Posner (1987) cite several studies, all of which indicate that the leader’s characteristics most valued by followers are honesty, integrity, and truthfulness. Thus, in their view, transformational leadership connected leaders and followers through morality and values.

**Theme 13: Crisis or Disaster**

The respondents were unanimous in their opinion that times of crises compel them to step up and lead from the front. Who are suitable to business organizations when organizations are undergoing crisis (Tichy and Devanna, 1986). Beck-Tauber (2012) confirms that the most valid and proven leadership style in a crisis environment, is one which gives emphasis to the positive effects and commitment levels and the best leadership. Singh (2008) confirms that transformational leaders and transformational leadership are suitable to business organizations when organizations are undergoing crisis (Tichy and Devanna, 1986).

**Theme 14: Trust them, and be trusted in return**

Trust is a fragile element in the relationship between the leader and employees. Once earned, it must be maintained and if lost, it is gone forever. Yukl (1989b) observes that one of the key reasons why followers are motivated by transformational leaders to perform beyond expectations is that followers trust and respect them.
That trust and loyalty play a crucial role was confirmed in a study by Baol and Bryson (1988). Study of Shivaji’s leadership captures the faith and belief of employees. He was successful in establishing and maintaining the trust of his followers because he believed himself to be a trustee of Swarajya. It must be recalled that Swarajya was meant for the wellbeing and welfare of the employees (followers).

In today’s organizations, there is a governance deficit. Not enough importance is given to fair treatment and justice. There is also high tolerance for indiscipline and misbehavior. To earn trust, the leader must consider the problems of his employees as his own. It is necessary to emulate Shivaji. Kellowaya, et al (2012), in their study, confirm the crucial role of trust in the leader and its positive relationship with employee wellbeing.

**Theme 15: Attention to individual needs of the employees**

Respondents-leaders responded that they addressed such needs through facilities like insurance, medical facilities and customized policies for taking of personal needs of employees. Forty-two of the leaders, who were working in diverse sectors of business, said that policies must be framed for the holistic development of employees. But they also admitted to the disconnect between policy intent and implementation when the employee strength increases. In this context, Frey (2007) mentions that Transformational leaders are proactive and have a better understanding of the environment, forming goals after identifying the needs and interests of their followers.

**Theme 16: Personal gain**

On this point there was a consensus among the respondents that the practice of leadership only for personal gains would lead to negative outcomes for both employees and the organization. In fact, awareness of this aspect was so high that all the leaders had examples to share in which the pursuit of personal gain lead to adverse consequences for the business. In this context, it must be mentioned that Shivaji always put the interests and needs of the employees first.

It is difficult, said many of the respondents, to eliminate self-interest in their work. Transformational leadership is premised on the leader selflessness and aligning employees’ goals with the organization’s goals.

**Theme 17: Nurturing, coaching and mentoring employees**
All respondents did this in many ways. However, they also stressed that there is not a failsafe method and there can be no assurance that the objectives will be met. A reading of history tells us that Shivaji nurtured his employees (followers) to achieve his quest for Swarajya. The leaders who were not founders but appointed to their positions said that there are challenges in nurturing employees individually due to organizational constraints. They could give attention to this need only within the framework of the organization’s human resource policies. However, it is also important to note that transformational leadership results in increased organizational satisfaction, commitment, and effectiveness (Bass, 2000).

Literature review and Podaskoff’s (1990) study confirm that transformational leaders exhibit a range of positive behavior: articulating vision, fostering acceptance of group goals, expectations of high performance, providing individualized consideration, intellectual stimulation, presenting an appropriate model of behavior.

All respondents agreed that Shivaji possessed all the qualities characteristic of transformational leaders. But, to keep with changing times, one respondent also mentioned that leaders must be technologically aware because, increasingly, businesses are being driven by technology. Another added that creativity and innovation are the new growth paradigms.

Selfless leadership, feeling of trusteeship, building the character of the people and the nation are essential for leadership. Two of the respondents claimed to have tried to emulate various aspects of Shivaji’s leadership, such as inspiration, individual consideration and charisma. All respondents said that their first role models were their parents.

5.2 Contributions of the Study

Table 5.2.1: Leadership Qualities needing Improvement in the present day

Table 5.2.1 presents a comparison between Shivaji’s qualities and those shown by today’s leaders. The comparison shows the gaps which leaders must try to close for being considered as transformational leaders.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Point No</th>
<th>Dimensions for improvement for today’s leaders</th>
<th>Shivaji’s leadership</th>
<th>Modern Leaders</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Social Vision for employee building, character building, nation building and business building</td>
<td>It was long-term and cascaded to the boundaries of state. The vision connected with the people, thus building individual character as well as the nation. Shivaji’s vision was for the welfare of mankind</td>
<td>Vision is for the short term and biased. The long-term vision is known only to the leader. The social element is not evident in the vision. Diminishing Social Vision (character building, people building and nation building)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Leader creating leaders</td>
<td>Excellent on the job training was given to create leaders. Shivaji created leaders by instilling his own values. He was the epitome of morals, characters, ethics, trust, and. He also regarded himself as only the trustee of the business (Swarajya)</td>
<td>There is shortage of leaders who have the vision to create leaders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Creation of leaders on expertise and skills Competency Mapping</td>
<td>Shivaji developed leaders based on their competencies and expertise. He allocated work according to their expertise. The Ashtapradhan council, Kanunjabita in his business and the decision-making abilities of his employees is evident in the various incidences that we know</td>
<td>Leaders need to understand that they will not have all the answers, they must help people seek the answers and be willing to seek appropriate expertise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>about from published studies.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Integration of competent people-and their expertise for organization</td>
<td>Shivaji was more interested in people and their expertise than about the task they had to perform. The people’s problems were his problems. He addressed them with a sense of justice and fair treatment. His welfare programs showed the importance Shivaji gave to his people.</td>
<td>Leaders attach greater importance to targets than people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Leaders as role models (character, ethics, trust, honesty, self-awareness, morals, humility, compassion, authentic, Innovation, Courage, Risk Taker)</td>
<td>Shivaji was a role model to all because of his conduct and strict adherence to ethics, morals and trust. He was a person of unblemished character.</td>
<td>Leadership begins with oneself. A leader must be self-aware. Leaders have a greater responsibility towards their followers. This is one aspect of leadership that must be built on.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Continuous welfare and wellbeing of employees</td>
<td>Quick addressal of grievances, severe punishment to those found guilty of misconduct, and in tolerance approach and misbehavior.</td>
<td>Lack of commitment to continually improve employee welfare.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Shivaji gained experienced by studying the terrain, people and doing a SWOT analysis of his opponents</td>
<td>Many leaders have a short fall and fail to do accurate terrain analysis and SWOT analysis of opponents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A sense of Trusteeship</td>
<td>Shivaji regarded himself as the trustee of his organization (Swaraj)</td>
<td>Diminishing sense of Trusteeship among today’s leaders. Leaders consider themselves as the owners first.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Dealing with the mental impact of defeat, making an emotional appeal</td>
<td>Shivaji instilled confidence in his followers, building up their mental strength and making them ready to fight the next battle.</td>
<td>Employees seek counselors and psychologists help. The leader barely knows his employees to understand their mental state. The emotional appeal is absent. People’s problems are seldom seen as the leader’s problems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Unblemished and clear image</td>
<td>Shivaji’s character was unblemished</td>
<td>There are shortcomings in the character of most leaders that prevent them from being role models for their followers (employees). Various studies have presented sufficient evidence to underscore the necessity for leaders to be persons of high integrity and sound character.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Trust is the glue that binds employees</td>
<td>The trust factor helped Shivaji and his followers to be closely knit group. Every person in the group knew that his family would be taken care of if they had to die for the cause of Swaraj.</td>
<td>Leaders do not trust their employees. Often, they encourage groups and politics to secure their position. This results in loss of trust in the leader as well as among the employees.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Needs of employees and others before them Protector and Benefactor of employees</td>
<td>Shivaji was concerned not only with the welfare of employees but also their families.</td>
<td>Today’s business leaders are only concerned with compensation in monetary terms - salary, insurance, etc. But it is essential to recognize that people have issues and needs that are specific to them, and that leaders must make the effort to understand them. Such an approach must be built into company policy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Respect and chivalry towards women</td>
<td>Shivaji had deep respect for women and appreciated their efforts and contribution to society. He ensured that women were safe and protected.</td>
<td>Leaders must frame and implement effective policies for respectful treatment at the workplace as well provide for their safety and security. Management must be intolerant of bad behavior.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Eliminating Indiscipline and corruption at grass root level</td>
<td>Corrupt and arrogant sardars, many of whom helped the Mughals, were removed from their positions. who took help of Mughal sardars.</td>
<td>Corruption is rampant today. It is the leaders who must set the standards of corporate governance. There should be no tolerance for corrupt practices.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Goal Setting</td>
<td>Shivaji set clear goals for fulfilling his vision.</td>
<td>Goal-setting in today’s corporates does not reflect vision. This is reflected in poor corporate performance. Leaders must give this aspect its due importance. It is their responsibility to communicate vision and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Fair treatment, justice; no tolerance for misconduct and bad behavior.</td>
<td>Shivaji was skilled at choosing the right person for the right job. His assessment of a person’s competency was unparalleled. People were selected on merit. There was no discrimination on the basis of caste.</td>
<td>Governance deficit in today’s corporates have resulted in groupism, discrimination and differential treatment at the workplace. Leaders are morally bound to treat everyone in a fair and just manner and not tolerate bad behavior.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>The right job for the right person (mapping skills to work to obtain best performance)</td>
<td>Shivaji had mastered this practice. He was rarely wrong in his choice of a person for a given job.</td>
<td>This need to have the right person for a given task is often overlooked in organizations. This affects organizations in various ways - sub-optimal performance, employee dissatisfaction, poor inter-personnel relations, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Operational Autonomy and empowerment</td>
<td>Shivaji infused the much needed empowerment his followers so that they could take decisions in their area of work. There is sufficient published evidence indicating the level of autonomy his officers enjoyed. The empowerment in turn enhanced their loyalty to Shivaji.</td>
<td>Business leaders must encourage autonomy and empowerment to their employees. This will make them more responsible and nurture the next line of leaders.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The findings of the study indicate the importance and need of transformational leadership, which is vital for progress in business as well as society. This study also shows a) how to emulate Shivaji’s leadership qualities, and b) the gaps which exist between need and practice of leadership qualities.

The researcher’s purpose was to add to the body of existing knowledge about Shivaji and leadership. This study helped the researcher to gain better understanding of the theory of transformational leadership.

The result of this study will be of interest to the business leaders, entrepreneurs and potential managers who wish to tread the path of leadership. It would also be immensely helpful for the students and scholars studying leadership and may help practitioners to improve their leadership skills and style to increase effectiveness at their workplaces. They may also enable leaders to drive social changes. This study also provides insights on how to identify and nurture potential leaders.

5.3 Limitations of the Study

This study had the following limitations:

- The emphasis was on the development of ideas, processes, measures, and steps taken to identify a transformational leader through the Four Is model of transformational leadership;

- Historical data was obtained from individuals who had researched Shivaji as a subject of study. The researcher depended on their power of recall to reconstruct and interpret certain events;

- The in-depth interview techniques were useful, but there was no way to cross-verify if the interviewees gave the exact details and descriptions;

- There are variations in the narration of historical events, as well as their interpretations. Further, many interpretations are based on particular ideological perspectives (National Seminar on Contestations of Shivaji conducted by the Department of Civics and Politics, University of Mumbai, 2016);
• Much of early records of Shivaji’s rule are in the Modi script, which is nearly obsolete. Although there is movement to revive it, there are not many people who can read and interpret writings in Modi;

• Charisma and influence can mean different things depending on the context and perspectives from which they are discussed;

• All respondents were not proficient in English. Hence, some of the responses had to be translated into English;

• Future research on the subject could focus on entrepreneurs;

• There is scope for study of leadership at various hierarchical levels;

• The study sample was based in the Mumbai Metropolitan region, which is considered to be representative of India. Future studies could be region specific- East, North, South, etc.;

• There is scope for conducting a mixed methods study.

5.4 Recommendations for Future Study

• The researcher suggests that more studies be carried out on Shivaji’s leadership to understand his decision-making style and influence on followers.

• There is a need to study Transformational leadership in various stages of evolution of an organization.

• The researcher also feels that the four Is can be studied independently to understand the impacts of it in the best possible manner.

• There is scope for study of pseudo-transformational leadership. Idealized influence in times of crisis in organizations also needs further investigation.

A new definition of transformational leadership has been proposed: “Transformational leadership is the ability of the leader, backed by his skill, character, intelligence and deeds which greatly look into welfare of people with an emphasis on ethics, moral value and trust.” Here, the dimension of welfare needs further study.

The components and dimensions of good governance through leadership of Shivaji could also be researched.