# CONTENTS

Acknowledgements iii-iv

Table of Cases v-xiii

CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION 1-72

Meaning of the term Reservation 2
History of Discrimination 3
  Ancient Period 3
  Muslim Period 4
  British Period 5
  Pre- Independence Period: 11
  Post- Independence Period: 14
Constituent Assembly Debates 22
Adoption of the Constitution of India 28
Constitutional Provisions regarding reservation 28
Scope of policy of reservation 30
  1. Political Reservation 30
  2. Job Reservation 32
  3. Educational Reservation 34
Time-limit of Law and Policy of Reservation 35
Case for Reservation for Muslims, Christians and other minorities 35
  British Period 35
  Post-Independence Period 36
Position of Scheduled Castes in the State of Punjab 38
  Social Disabilities in Punjab 40
  Educational Backwardness of depressed classes 41
  Colonial Rule and Employment Avenues 42
  Socio-Economic upliftment of the Converts Untouchable 42
  Separate Identification of the Sikh Community 44
  Status of Depressed Classes among Sikhs after Independence 45
  Recognition of Untouchable Sikhs as Scheduled Castes 46
Status of Women 47
Status of Women in the Ancient Law at the International Level 47
Position of Women in India 48
  Ancient Period 48
  Muslim Period 49
  British Period 49
  Post-Independence Period 50
Statement of Problem 50
Significance of Study 53
Likely Contribution of the Study 53
Review of the Existing Literature 54
Object and Purpose of study 57
Hypothesis 57
Research Questions 58
Data Base and Research Methodology 59
Tools for the Collection of Data 59
Primary Data 60
Secondary Data 60
Chapterization plan: 60
Chapter Two: Reservation policy in India for SC and ST including Muslims and Christians. 60
Chapter Three: Reservation policy in India for OBC and other weaker sections of society. 60
Chapter Four: Comparative study of reservation laws. 60
Chapter Five: Role of judiciary 61
Chapter Six: Empirical Study 61
Chapter Seven: Conclusions and Suggestions. 61

CHAPTER II 73-149
RESERVATION POLICY IN INDIA FOR SCHEDULED CASTE AND SCHEDULED TRIBES INCLUDING MUSLIMS AND CHRISTIANS 73

Constitutional Provisions in favour of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes 76
Clause 1 of Article 15 77
Scope of Clause 1 77
Prohibition of Discrimination 77
‘The State’ 78
‘Discrimination’ 78
‘Religion, race or caste’ 78
‘Sex’ 78
‘Place of Birth’ 79
Clause 2 of Article 15 79
Scope of Clause 2 of Article 15 79
Clauses 3 and 4 of Article 15 80
Scope of Clause 3 80
Scope of Clause 4 81
Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes 81
Right to admission into State educational institution 81
Clause 5 of Article 15 82
Clause 1 of Article 16 82
Scope of Clause 1 82
Clause 2 of Article 16 83
Scope of Clause 2 84
‘Only’ 84
‘Sex’ 84
‘Descent’ 84
Clause 3 of Article 16 85
   Requirement of residence as requirement of employment in a State 85
Clause 4 of Article 16 85
Clause 4A of Article 16 86
   Reservation of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes 86
Clause 4B of Article 16 87
   Unfilled reserved vacancies to be considered as a separate class 87
Clause 5 of Article 16 87
Article 46 87
Article 243D 87
Article 243T 87
Articles 330 and 332 88
Article 334 88
Article 335 88
Articles 338 and 338A 88
Article 339 89
Clause 1 of Article 341 89
Clause 1 of Article 342 90
Article 366 90
Beneficiaries of Policy of Reservation in India 90
   1. Scheduled Castes 90
   2. Scheduled Tribes 91
   3. Other Backward Classes 91
National Commissions for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes 92
First National Commission for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes 92
Second Commission for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes 93
Third Commission for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes 93
Fourth Commission for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes 93
Constitution (Eighty-Ninth Amendment) Act, 2003 94
The first National Commission for Scheduled Tribes 94
The second National Commission for Scheduled Tribes 94
Object of providing Reservation 94
Types of Reservation 94
   1. Reservation in Political Institutions 95
   2. Reservations in Educational Institutions 99
   3. Job Reservation 111
Political Mobilization 122
Muslims and Christians 127
Article 29 129
Article 30 129
Article 350-A 130
Article 350-B 130
   1. Political Representation of Muslims and Christians 134
   2. Literacy Rate among Religious Minorities 135
   3. Employment among the Religious Minorities 137
Conclusion 143

xvi
CHAPTER III  
RESERVATION POLICY IN INDIA FOR ‘OTHER BACKWARD CLASSES’ AND OTHER ‘WEAKER SECTIONS’ OF SOCIETY  

Beneficiaries of the Reservation Policy  
1. Scheduled Castes  
2. Scheduled Tribes  
3. Other Backward Classes  

Constitutional Provisions regarding Reservation in favour of Other Backward Classes  
Clause 4 of Article 15  
Scope of Clause 4 of Article 15  
Clause 4 of Article 16  
Scope of Clause 4 of Article 16  
Article 340 of the Constitution  

Concept of Reservation in favour of Backward Classes  

I. Determination of status of the Backward Classes  
Who are the Other Backward Classes?  
Constitutional Assembly Debates  
Parliamentary Debates  
Backward Classes Commissions  
1. Kaka Sahib Kalelkar Commission  
Practicability of the Recommendations of the Commission  
2. Mandal Commission  
A. Social  
B. Education  
C. Economic  
Recommendations  
Government’s actions on the recommendations of the Mandal Commission  
3. Permanent Backward Classes Commission  
4. Commission for Economically Backward Classes  

Central Lists of Other Backward Classes  

Inclusion of more and more Castes in the Other Backward Classes  
II. Extent/Quantum of Reservation  
Valid Reservation and its Extent  
Exclusion of Creamy Layer  
Review of Income Criteria  
Reservation for the Other Backward Classes in the Higher Educational Institutions  

Constitution of the Backward Classes Commission in the State of Punjab  
Legislations in the State of Punjab in favour of the Other Backward Classes  

Types of the reservation policy in India  
I. Reservation in the Legislative Bodies  
II. Reservation in the Educational Institutions  
Position of Other Backward Classes in Under Graduation Level  
Reasons for the high drop-out rate among the Other Backward Classes  
Position of Other Backward Classes in Higher Education
Educational forwardness of the Other Backward Classes 200
Educational Backwardness of the poverty ridden sections among Other Backward Classes at Higher Education Level 203
III. Reservation in the Government Services 204
Accretion of problems due to the policy of reservation 213
Demand by different Communities for the inclusion in the category of Other Backward Classes 214
Agitations owing to demands for inclusion in the category of Other Backward Classes 216
Reservations for the Other Weaker Sections/ Special Groups (Other than Women) 218
1. Reservations in favour of the Disabled Persons 218
2. Preferential Treatment in favour of Military and Defense Personnel and Ex Servicemen 219
3. Reservation in favour of Sportsmen 219
4. Reservation in favour of the Wards of the Political Sufferers 220
5. Reservation Benefit in favour of the Members Nominated by the Government/Minister 220
6. Protective Discrimination in Favour of Women 220
Provisions for Women under the Indian Constitution 222
1. Less Political Participation of Women 225
2. Educational backwardness of women in India 228
3. Under-representation of Women in Employment 229
Conclusion 232

CHAPTER IV 245-343
COMPARATIVE STUDY OF RESERVATION LAWS 245

1. The International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination 248
2. The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 249
3. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 250
5. Other International Norms and Institutions 253
I. History of Discrimination 256
1. United Kingdom 256
2. United States of America 257
Slavery 257
The Jim Crow System 258
Towards Equality 259
3. South Africa 260
Apartheid and the International Law 263
4. Malaysia 265
The Social Contract Algorithm 266
5. Brazil 267
6. Pakistan 268
7. Sri Lanka 269
8. India 270

II. Evolution and Development of Affirmative-Action program 273
1. United Kingdom 273
   1. Equal Pay Act 1970 274
   2. Sex Discrimination Act 1975 274
   3. Race Relations Act 1976 274
   5. Employment Equality (Sexual Orientation) Regulations 276
   6. Employment Equality (Religion or Belief) Regulations 276
   7. Employment Equality (Age) Regulations 276
   9. Equality Act 2010 277
   Achievements of Affirmative Action Program 278
2. United States of America 278
   Executive Orders 281
      (i). President Theodore Roosevelt (1901-1909) 281
      (ii). Warren G Harding (1921-1923) 281
      (iii). Executive Orders 9980 and 9981 282
      (iv). Executive Order 10479 282
   The Civil Rights Legislation 282
      (i). President J F Kennedy and Executive Order 10952 282
   The Civil Rights Act 283
      (i). President Lyndon Johnson and Executive Order 11246 283
      (ii). President Richard Nixon and the Philadelphia Order 284
      (iii). President Gerald R Ford 284
      (iv). President Jimmy Carter 285
      (v). President Ronald Reagan 285
   Judicial Journey of the affirmative action programmes 286
   Achievements of Affirmative Action Program 288
3. South Africa 290
   The employment Equity Act 291
   The Equality Act 291
   Achievements of Affirmative Action Program 292
4. Malaysia 293
   Achievements of Affirmative Action Program 297
5. Brazil 298
   Classification of Race 299
   Reservation in Public Universities 300
   Reservation Policy at the Private Universities 302
   Reservation in the Government 302
   Achievements of Affirmative Action Program 303
6. Pakistan 304
   The Judicial Move on Affirmative Action Policy 307
7. Sri Lanka 309
   1. University Admissions Policy 309
2. The Language Policy 311
3. State Employment 313
   Achievements of Affirmative Action Program 315
8 India 316
   (a). Reservations in Legislative Bodies 316
   (b). Reservation in Government Services 317
   (c). Reservations in Educational Institutions 317
In Public Sector and University Admissions 318
   Achievements of Affirmative Action Program 320
Comparison of affirmative action policies 320
Conclusion 326

CHAPTER V 3 43-424
ROLE OF JUDICIARY 343

1. Political Reservation 348
2. Educational Reservation 350
3. Job Reservation 383
Court Proposes Government Disposes 405
Conclusion 408

CHAPTER VI 425- 506
EMPERICAL STUDY 425

Part A
Interview of the members of the General Public including persons belonging to
Scheduled Castes, Other Backward Classes, General Category, Muslims and
Christians 427
I. Status of the persons interviewed 428
   1. Category 429
   2. Sex 429
   3. Marital Status 430
   4. Age-Groups 431
   5. Qualification 432
   6. Occupational Status 433
   7. Availing the benefits of reservation 436
II. Interview Schedule 438
   1. Awareness of respondents regarding the presence of the Provisions of
      Constitution providing the benefits of reservation to of different categories
      in India 438
   2. Awareness about the structure of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled
      Tribes/Other Backward Classes 442
   3. Awareness of the criteria/method adopted for inclusion in various
      categories of weaker sections 444
   4. Justification of the criteria for inclusion of castes in the category 447
   5. Choice of best criteria 451
6. Awareness of respondents towards the exclusion of the creamy layer 454
7. Action for exclusion of the creamy layer 457
8. Justification of demand for exclusion of creamy layer from Scheduled Castes 461
9. Justification of the demand for reservation within reservation 464
10. Justification of the demand made by persons belonging to one category for their inclusion in other category 468
11. Creation of a casteless society 471
12. Discrimination to Muslims and Christians 475
13. Adequacy of representation of women 478
14. Success of the policy of reservation 482
15. Winding up/ Changing the policy of reservation 485
16. Implications of the policy in the era of globalization, liberalization and privatization 489

Part B
   Observational Study 492
Conclusion 499

CHAPTER VII
CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS 507-539

Conclusions 507
Suggestions 531

BIBLIOGRAPHY i-xiii

APENDIX I xiv-xvi