DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis entitled “THE PENDULUM EFFECT IN CHURCH HISTORY IN THE MOVEMENTS ON EMOTION AND INTELLECT: A CHALLENGE FOR BIBLICAL CRHISITANITY IN THE 21ST CENTURY,” submitted by me for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) is the record of work carried by me during the period under the supervision of Rev. Dr. V. M. Spurgeon, and has not formed the basis for any Degree, Diploma, Associateship, Fellowship, Titles in this University or any other University or other similar institution of Higher Learning.

Date: S. ANTONY DEVASHAYAM
Dedicated to

Operation Mobilization

The organization which shaped me for two decades

Rev. Andrew B. Natarajan

Superintendent, Madras North Dist., Methodist Church

Who showed me the Light and set me on course for the Lord
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM  
1.2. ELABORATION OF THE PROBLEM  
1.3. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH  
1.4. PURPOSE STATEMENT  
1.5. OBJECTIVES  
1.6. RESEARCH QUESTIONS  
1.7. SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS  
1.8. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY  
1.9. LITERATURE REVIEW  
1.10. CLARIFICATION OF TERMS  
1.11. PLAN OF STUDY

## 2. HISTORY OF THE EMOTIONAL AND INTELLECTUAL MOVEMENTS

2.1. MOVEMENTS ON EMOTION

2.1.1. MONTANISM

2.1.1.1. Background  
2.1.1.2 Montanus, the Founder  
2.1.1.3 Tertullian and Montanism  
2.1.1.4. Character and Tenets  
2.1.1.5. The Growth of Montanism  
2.1.1.6. The Opposition  
2.1.1.7. The impact on Christianity

2.1.2. MONASTICISM  
2.1.2.1. Introduction
2.1.2.2. Historical Background 35
2.1.2.3. Causes of Monasticism 36
2.1.2.4. The Monks and the Monasteries 37
2.1.2.5. Monastic Theology 37
2.1.2.6. The Development of Monasticism 38
2.1.2.7. Conclusion 39

2.1.3. MYSTICISM 40
  2.1.3.1. Introduction 40
  2.1.3.2. Background 40
  2.1.3.3. Acts of Mysticism 42
  2.1.3.4. Types of Mysticism 43
  2.1.3.5. Famous Mystics and their Teachings 43
  2.1.3.6. Conclusion 46

2.1.4. PIETISM AND METHODISM 47
  2.1.4.1. PIETISM 47
    2.1.4.1.1. Historical Background 48
    2.1.4.1.2. Founders 49
    2.1.4.1.3. Teachings of Pietistic Movement 51
    2.1.4.1.4. Effects of the Pietistic Movement 52
    2.1.4.1.5. Contributions 53
  2.1.4.2. METHODISM 54
    2.1.4.2.1. Introduction 54
    2.1.4.2.2. Historical Context 55
2.1.4.2.3. Wesley’s Life and Work 57
2.1.4.2.4. Theological Contributions 58
2.1.4.2.5. Conclusion 60

2.1.5. PENTECOSTALISM AND CHARISMATIC MOVEMENTS 61

2.1.5.1. PENTECOSTALISM 61

2.1.5.1.1. Introduction 61
2.1.5.1.2. Historical Context 61
2.1.5.1.3. Beginnings and Growth 62
2.1.5.1.4. Beliefs and Practices 64
2.1.5.1.5. Salient Features 65
2.1.5.1.6. Impact on Christianity 66

2.1.5.2. CHARISMATIC MOVEMENTS 67

2.1.5.2.1. Introduction 67
2.1.5.2.2. Background History and Origins 67
2.1.5.2.3. Characteristics of the Charismatic movement 68
2.1.5.2.4. Conclusion 71

2.2. MOVEMENTS ON INTELLECT 72

2.2.1. GNOSTICISM 72

2.2.1.1. Introduction 72
2.2.1.2. Background History 73
2.2.1.3. Major Teachings 74
2.2.1.4. Church Fathers and Gnosticism 76
2.2.1.5. The Nag Hammadi Discovery 77
2.2.1.6. Impact on Christianity 78
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2.2.4.4. Interpretation of Scripture</th>
<th>102</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4.5. Meaning of Salvation</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4.6. Conclusion</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. THE PENDULUM EFFECT: EMPHASIS ON EMOTION OR INTELLECT 107

3.1. EARLY CHRISTIANITY TO MONTANISM (2ND CENTURY): TOWARDS EMOTION 108

| 3.1.1. Introduction                  | 108 |
| 3.1.2. Spirituality during the Apostles Era | 108 |
| 3.1.3. Spirituality after the Apostles Era | 110 |
| 3.1.4. Montanism – Emphasis towards Emotion | 111 |
| 3.1.5. Conclusion                    | 114 |

3.2. GNOSTICISM (2ND & 3RD CENTURIES): TOWARDS INTELLECT 115

| 3.2.1. Introduction                  | 115 |
| 3.2.2. Gnosticism in Its Christian Form | 116 |
| 3.2.3. Gnosticism: Towards Intellect  | 117 |
| 3.2.3. Conclusion                    | 120 |

3.3. MONASTICISM (3RD – 10TH CENTURIES): TOWARDS EMOTION 121

| 3.3.1. Introduction                  | 121 |
| 3.3.2. The Beginnings                | 121 |
| 3.3.3. Monasticism: Towards Emotion  | 124 |
| 3.3.4. Foundations                   | 124 |
| 3.3.5. Spirituality: From Corporate to Individualistic | 125 |
| 3.3.6. Conclusion                    | 126 |
### 3.4. SCHOLASTICISM (11TH – 14TH CENTURIES):
**TOWARDS INTELLECT** 128

3.4.1. Introduction 128
3.4.2. Background 128
3.4.3. Scholasticism: Towards Intellect 129
3.4.4. Conclusion 132

### 3.5. MYSTICISM (14TH – 15TH CENTURIES): TOWARDS EMOTION 134

3.5.1. Introduction 134
3.5.2. Mysticism: Towards Emotion 136
3.5.3. Decline 139

### 3.6. REFORMATION ORTHODOXY (15TH – 16TH CENTURIES):
**TOWARDS INTELLECT** 140

3.6.1. Introduction 140
3.6.2. Background 141
3.6.3. Reformation: Towards Intellect 141
3.6.4. Decline 144

### 3.7. PIETISM & METHODISM (17TH & 18TH CENTURIES):
**TOWARDS EMOTION** 146

3.7.1. Introduction 146
3.7.2. Historical Background 147
3.7.3. Pietism: Towards Emotion 149
3.7.4. Methodism: Towards Emotion 151
3.7.5. Conclusion 153

### 3.8. LIBERALISM (19TH – 20TH CENTURIES): TOWARDS INTELLECT 155

3.8.1. Introduction 155
3.8.2. Post- Pietistic Era 155
3.8.3. Liberalism: Towards Intellect 156
3.8.4. Conclusion 161

3.9. PENTCOSTALISM & CHARISMATIC MOVEMENTS (20TH CENTURY): TOWARDS EMOTION 162
3.9.1. Introduction 162
3.9.2. Pentecostalism: Towards Emotion 163
3.9.3. Charismatic Movements: Towards Emotion 168
3.9.4. Conclusion 171

4. CHALLENGES OF EMOTIONAL AND INTELLECTUAL MOVEMENTS FOR CHRISTIANITY 172
4.1. WEAKNESSES OF THE EMOTIONAL MOVEMENTS 174
4.1.1. Montanism – Holier Than Thou Attitude 174
4.1.2. Monasticism – In their Own World, Out of the Common Man’s Reach 179
4.1.3. Mysticism – Neglecting Reason, Everyone Has a Say 185
4.1.4. Pietism and Methodism – Church Within a Church 191
4.1.5. Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements – Always ‘Looking Above’ 195
4.2. WEAKNESSES OF THE INTELLECTUAL MOVEMENTS 203
4.2.1. Gnosticism – Moved Out of Reality 203
4.2.2. Scholasticism – Not for Common Man 207
4.2.3. Reformation Orthodoxy – Missed the Pendent in the Necklace 213
4.2.4. Liberalism – Always ‘Looking Below’ 218
## 5. BIBLICAL TEACHINGS ON EMOTION AND INTELLECT IN SPIRITUALITY

### 5.1. INTRODUCTION

### 5.2. BIBLICAL TEACHINGS ON EMOTION AND INTELLECT

#### 5.2.1. Spirit and Reason

#### 5.2.2. Suffering and Joy

#### 5.2.3. Grace and Works

#### 5.2.4. God’s Love and His Anger

#### 5.2.5. Fruit of the Spirit and the Gifts of the Spirit

#### 5.2.6. Liturgical reading and Charismatic style

#### 5.2.7. Looking Above and Looking Below

#### 5.2.8. Word and Prayer

#### 5.2.9. Theological Knowledge and Spiritual Experience

### 5.3. CONCLUSION

## 6. RECOMMENDATION AND CONCLUSIONS

### 6.1. IMPORTANCE OF EMOTION IN SPIRITUALITY

### 6.2. IMPORTANCE OF INTELLECT IN SPIRITUALITY

### 6.3. A CALL FOR BALANCE IN THE 21ST CENTURY

### 6.4. CHARACTERISTICS OF A BALANCED MOVEMENT

### 6.5. TOWARDS THE FUTURE, THE NEXT MOVE

## BIBLIOGRAPHY
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I thank God for His grace and mercy which sustained me throughout my academic pursuit and enabled me to complete my studies.

I extend my deepest gratitude to my supervisor, Dr. V. M. Spurgeon, Associate Professor, Dept. of Philosophy, Madras Christian College (MCC) for his constant help and encouragement. More than the role of a supervisor he took upon himself the role of mentoring me with love.

My sincere thanks to Dr. M. Gabriel and Dr. K. Joshua (Professor and Head of the Department of Philosophy, MCC) for their encouragement and support. Heartfelt thanks also to the other faculties of MCC who are in the same dept. I would like to thank Dr. Pannerselvam, Head, Dept. of Philosophy, University of Madras.

I would like to place on record my gratitude to Mr. Peter Maiden, International Director of Operation Mobilization, for his motivation and support during this study. Without the help of my colleagues in International College of Cultural Studies at Hyderabad, this study would have not been possible. Thanks to all of them. I am also thankful to Rev. Dr. Dasan Jeyaraj, Rev. Dr. Augustine Koshy, Mr. Manoj Khristi, Mr. Sushanta Sahu, Ms. Subhashini and Mr. Gunasekar. I also thank OM leaders Rev. Dr. Joseph D. Souza, Mr. Kurian Varghese, Bishop Paothang Haokip, Rev. J. S. Raja, Mr. Jeyapaul (DSI) Rev. B. S. John and Rev. Manohar (GSCC). I want to thank Rev. Dr. Anuj Patro and Ms. Aarti Patro.

Several Christian leaders stood beside me during this endeavor. My special thanks to Mr. Shaji Mathew and his wife Jaya (Qatar), Rev. Dr. D. B. Kulothungan (Founder Maharastra Village Ministries, Nagpur), Mr. Harsha Kumar, Pas. Selvakumar David (Rehoboth Prayer Tabernacle, Chennai), Mr. Rufus David
(SAIACS), Rev. A.M.V. Joseph, (Divine AG Church, Madurai), Pas. Peniel (Kuppm), Pas. Philip and Mrs. Emilie (His Grace Ministries, Bangalore), Dr. David George Kirubakaran (Salem), Rev. Immanuel Durairaj (Shepherd Care, Delhi), Mr. Ashok Kumar (Singapore), Dr. K. Rajendran (WEA), Mr. Bobby Suman Maisa (One Hope Inc., Delhi) Mr. Williams (Hyderabad), Mr. Sam K. John (Kingdom Friends Network), Mr. F. Ponraj (Chennai), Mr. Ben Spotts and Mr. Vinod and Mrs. Amala (Bangalore). My Nellai friends who deserve thanks are Pas. Samuel Dharmaraj, Pas. Swamaraj, Pas. Sam Jebadurai & Rev. Yohan Raja (Good News Mission, Palayamkottai).

I would like to acknowledge the contributions of Dr. Gideon Ganesh, Rev. Ramanathan, Dr. Stanley Jones, Rev. Johnson, Mr. Livingstone, Mr. Yesan (SAIACS) for their valuable suggestions and comments.

My sincere thanks to Mr. Robert Spotts (USA), Mrs. Lima Eugene, Mrs. Meera Sai, and Mr. David Bright for editing this thesis.

Since the first day of this pursuit, my family stood with me and gave their whole hearted support in many ways. I would like to thank my wife Vinuo Devasahayam, and daughters Arpitha Evangeline and Selvina Margaret who put up with my struggles, and never ceased to support me throughout the period of my research. My youngest brother Mr. John S. spent several hours in helping me, in spite of his work pressure. Special thanks to younger brother Mr. George and my sister Mrs. Margaret Peter. In spite of their own difficulties and limitations, my dear parents Mr. S. Selvanathan and Mrs. S. Jesumani were always a source of encouragement through their support and prayers.