TRADITIONAL MOORINGS: AYURVEDIC LEARNING & PRACTICE IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY PUNJAB

Introduction

This chapter aims to examine the social context of Ayurvedic learning and practice in Punjab during the nineteenth century, in a period that marked the transition of Punjab's administration under the Lahore Durbar towards its consolidation under British colonial administration.

Studies on the state of medical learning and practice in pre-modern societies tend to emphasize the social diversity that characterized the diffusion of medical learning, and the medical plurality represented in its practice. This approach however only provides the broadest and most generalized explanatory framework for a problem that needs simultaneously to be located within the distinct as well as specific local conditions that anchored medical learning and practice.

The first section of this chapter shall therefore attempt to reconstruct the condition of Ayurvedic learning in early nineteenth-century Punjab, with reference to the social networks and political system that shaped its identity. It will outline the social topography characteristic of Ayurvedic education and its practitioners, the diffusio
Finally, the second section of this chapter, set in the colonial period, will trace the social and political trajectory of Ayurvedic learning and its practitioners, refracted through the assumptions and priorities in medical education that were being increasingly clarified by colonial administrators towards the last quarter of the century.
SECTION I

The social context of Ayurvedic learning and its practice in early nineteenth-century Punjab, as elsewhere in North India, was closely associated with the teaching of advanced Hindu religion and philosophy in Sanskrit schools or *pathshalas.*\(^1\) The teaching in these schools was predominantly controlled by Brahmin Pandits who taught as well as often practiced Ayurved, and most of the students consisted of Brahmin pupils who learnt Ayurved, through the medium of Sanskrit, along with a curriculum characteristic of traditional Brahminical learning, that could range from Sanskrit grammar and logic, to Vedanta and prosody.

Leitner’s survey of indigenous education in Punjab, which was conducted in the late nineteenth century, re-constructed the nature of these Sanskrit *pathshalas* and their distribution. Ayurvedic learning, controlled by Brahmin Pandits, consisted of small schools that taught groups of 15-20 students and were sustained by the Pandit-Vaid’s own ritual functions in the local community or by small grants, mostly from local Hindu patrons. Leitner for instance, summed up all the features typical of a small town *pathshala* in his listing for a *pathshala* in Mubarakpur in Ambala district:

Pandit Naryan Dass, a good Sanskrit scholar, conducts a *pathshala* in Mubarakpur, where 25 pupils learn Sanskrit grammar, the Vaidic system of medicine, Astrology, Bhagwat, & c., gratuitously.\(^2\)

Sanskrit schools under the Lahore state were not characterized by the possession of large land grants and the teaching of Ayurved as well as its practice by the Pandits was therefore based largely in urban sites, where the Pandits depended upon contributions from the local Hindu community.

---

\(^1\) G.W. Leitner, *History of Indigenous Education in the Punjab since Annexation and in 1882,* Calcutta, 1882, reprint, Patiala, 1971, p. 82.
Sanskrit pathshalas were therefore located either in traditional centres of Hindu Brahminical learning such as Kurukshetra and Karnal, that were also Hindu pilgrimage towns or in larger towns like Ambala, Jullundur and Ludhiana that were all broadly in the eastern areas of Punjab and contained an important concentration of a Hindu population.  

In Punjab however, Ayurvedic learning and its practice in the early nineteenth century was also distinguished by its well developed association with Hindu and Sikh heterodox sects. The role of the Hindu and Sikh ascetic orders in the diffusion of the Baidak or Ayurvedic system played a crucial role in influencing the social composition of its practice and dissemination as well as defined the specific functions that practitioners of indigenous medicine assumed in the social life and political order of the early nineteenth century.

The involvement of the Hindu ascetic orders such as the Dadupanthis, the Jogis, the Jain priesthood as well as Sikh sects such as the Udasis and Nirmalas in Ayurvedic learning served to extend its diffusion to a large number of new and emerging centres of learning, as well as to areas that did not possess a concentration of Sanskrit pathshalas. The Udasis and Nirmalas were responsible for setting up centres of learning in the western districts of Punjab. They established monasteries or dharamshalas with Gurumukhi schools in large towns and cities predominantly in the districts of Amritsar, Gujranwala, Gurdaspur and Sheikhpura, with the Nirmala monasteries being particularly well established in Hoshiarpur and Gurdaspur as well as in the Malwa area of Patiala.

---

2 Ibid., pp. 14-46.
Aside from initiating the establishment of new centres of learning, the periodic seasonal movement of these sects to religious pilgrimage and fairs or sectarian meets contributed to the spread of Ayurvedic practice beyond the urban centres where it was traditionally concentrated. Besides, it helped also in linking traditions of Ayurvedic learning in Punjab with those elsewhere.

The Dadupanthis in Punjab for instance, were originally a sect founded in Rajasthan in the early seventeenth century. They traced their association in Punjab partly to the influence of Guru Arjan Dev; their order of Uttaradhesi was reputed for its learning in Sikh theology as well as their practice of medicine.6 Though settled in and around the area of Rohtak, Hissar and Patiala, this order moved every phagan season for an assembly near Jaipur and subsequently for a fair at Sambhar.7 Other sects like the Dhundia Jains of the Phagwara area in Punjab traced their association with Ayurvedic learning as far back as a seven generation old Guru lineage to the place of their origin, Bikaner.

It was not uncommon for ascetic orders to be involved in the systematization and propagation of Ayurvedic learning. Buddhist monastic orders in Ancient India had cultivated Ayurvedic learning in monastic hospices and universities, giving it a distinct intellectual basis and widening its reach to a lay public outside the social hierarchy and religious orthodoxy of the Brahminical order.8 To understand the manner in which these orders influenced the contents of a distinct tradition of Ayurvedic learning and practice in early nineteenth-century Punjab, we need to trace the

---

7 Ibid.
development of these orders and identify their changing role and function in contemporary society.

The adoption by these ascetic orders of a role in the diffusion of indigenous learning, including the teaching of *Baidak* as well as the practice of medicine, had gained importance early in the nineteenth century, when many of these sects were seeking to settle amongst lay communities in *dharamshalas*. The teaching of medicine as well as its practice became an important means to consolidate social influence as well as to find support and acceptance for ascetic teachings amongst the public.

The practice of Ayurvedic medicine for these orders was not only an important source of livelihood, they also obtained support from the local community towards their emerging monastic settlements. The Dadupanthis for instance, set up a large monastery in Rohtak and many of its members obtained support for their order by engaging as teachers of *Baidak*. Even in the late nineteenth century, Leitner’s Survey indicated the continuing presence of Dadupanthis in this area and mentioned the practice of medicine by two Dadupanthi faqirs, Manak Ram Sadh at Rohtak, and Atma Ram Faqir, at nearby Bhiwani, who ran small *Baidak pathshalas*.

In other instances, the teaching and practice of Ayurved not only served as a means of livelihood but also a means of gaining acceptance for a newly emerging sect and its doctrine. This was illustrated in the case of Jain *Dhundias*, a breakaway sect of the Jain *Terahpanthis* who seceded in 1817 from the larger Jaina order at Ahmedabad.

One of the five founding Gurus of this new order, Muni Meghraj, moved with his *chelas* to Phagwara to disseminate the doctrine of the new order or

---

the authority of the 52 shlokas, along with the teaching and practice of medicine. This establishment soon gained a reputation for its learning as well as for its lineage of Bairak scholars, and Megh Raj claimed in a later work written in 1827, that it had even attracted the patronage of a local Jain ruler, Churramal Jain.

The early nineteenth century was also marked by the growth in social influence and political position of the Sikh ascetic orders. Their role as traditional intellectuals found increasing patronage from the Lahore state and its Sardars. The Udasi and Nirmala orders in particular expanded their establishments, with the former founding nearly 60 new establishments in this period along with expanding their older dharamshalas in cities like Amritsar, Lahore, and Batala. The Nirmalas, largely concentrated in monasteries, also received grants and support from Sardars of the Lahore Durbar and feudatories such as the Bhangi Sardars and the Phul Rulers.

The Udasis, however, were the largest and most influential of these heterodox sects. Under Ranjit Singh, the Udasis rose substantially in social status as well as political prominence. The Udasi dharamshala did not remain merely a centre for theological debate and teaching but was often closely allied to the existing political order. Baron Hugel, an early nineteenth century traveler passing through Punjab, gives a description of the routine at an Udasi dharamshala at Kiratpur, an important centre for Sikh pilgrimage, that brings out this relationship:

At noon I reached Kiratpur, and was hospitably received at the Dharamshala of a set of Sikh Fakirs termed Udasis. In the course of the evening the whole party [ of

---

10 Gazetteer Phulkian States, p. 254.
12 Sulakhan Singh, 'Udasi Establishments', p. 75.
13 Darshan Singh. 'How Did the Nirmalas Preach', p. 151.
Udasis] engaged in prayer, in the course of which,[ they offered] their good wishes for their ruler, the Singh Sahib...and the other travelers in their dwelling.  

The Udasis were increasingly co-opted under Ranjit Singh as an influential class of intellectuals who supported the rule of the Lahore State and maintained social order. The latter became an issue of particular significance in key cities such as Lahore and Amritsar, where religious-martial orders such as the Nihangs and the Akalis constantly challenged Ranjit Singh's local administration. At Lahore, Dr Martin Honigberger, a European physician at Court who was once called upon to treat the imprisoned leader of a Nihang band, recalled one such threat to order in the city. He wrote:

In time of peace, the Nahungs gave a great deal of trouble to Ranjit Singh. On one occasion, he was even forced to place two pieces of cannon outside the Delhi gate of Lahore...because this band dared to intercept the communication of that city and they shut themselves up in Meean Mir, five miles distant from Lahore, thence they made their appearance as rebels, but they were defeated and forced to depart,...from the town also, to Umritsar.

Udasi intellectuals were therefore also influential jagirdars and functionaries. They were beneficiaries of large land grants, that were estimated in value as being close to those in the possession of the Sikh Guru lineages, such as the Bedis and the Sodhis. Aside from wielding considerable influence as land owners, the Udasis, with their large establishments in urban areas, were a visible and influential presence in cities like Amritsar where leaders like Pandit Sarup Das Udasi led residents and pilgrims to support public works such as canal building in the city.

The state sanction enjoyed by the Udasis attracted further patronage from Sikh sardars as well as community grants for Udasi dharamshalas and

---

centres of learning. This in turn sustained the dissemination of Ayurvedic learning and the provision of gratuitous Ayurvedic treatment and medical relief in Udasi akharas.

The largest Udasi educational centres, in particular the medical schools, were situated at Amritsar. Amritsar city had become increasingly the focus of Ranjit Singh’s court, and many of his courtiers had settled in the city and developed its various neighbourhoods. Education centres too had multiplied in the city with more than a dozen akharas at the turn of the century run by Sikh traditional intellectuals, like Udasis and Nirmalas.

The Bungas, or the rest houses around the tank of the Golden Temple at Amritsar, were supported mainly by the Sikh Sardars and the Lahore state. The largest and most prosperous of them was the Bunga Brahm Butt, associated with Sarup Dass Udasi. Both the Bunga Brahm Butt as well as the other Udasi Bungas at the Golden Temple such as Bhai Wasti Ram’s Bunga and the Jallianwala Bunga were closely associated with the teaching of Ayurved studies.18

The Bunga associated with Sarup Das Udasi was reputed for its large Gurumukhi school, and Leitner’s Survey of Sikh educational establishments in the city recorded that it had as many as 100 to 150 chelas or disciples.19 It taught Sikh theology, the Hindu shastras and offered subjects such as medicine, music and calligraphy. These Bungas often had reputed Udasi scholars associated with them who were renowned for their medical practice as well as for their command over specific medical treatises.

19 Leitner, History of Indigenous Education, p. 54.
The institutional basis provided to Ayurvedic learning by the large Bungas and akharas was sometimes extended through smaller Gurumukhi schools based in local dharamshalas, that offered training in Ayurved. Leitner’s Report estimated that such schools were located in large towns or at centres of importance for Sikh pilgrimage. They were mostly intended to teach primary level Gurumukhi instruction along with the teaching of certain Sikh religious texts.\textsuperscript{20} After a primary course in Gurumukhi, certain Gurumukhi schools also offered teaching in the Baidak with a curriculum that consisted of texts in Punjabi Bhasha. Leitner described a typical course in Baidak offered by a Gurumukhi School:

The pupil who wishes to devote himself to medical practice now reads the Nighant (drugs), Saringdhar (prescriptions and pathology) and the Nidan (causes of diseases and diagnosis) in Gurumukhi.\textsuperscript{21}

The teaching of Ayurved at schools run by ascetic orders such as Udasis and Nirmalas, as well as by the Jains, was marked by its use and cultivation of the Punjabi Bhasha. Their social position as well as their religious doctrine marked the heterodox sects outside of the Brahminical intellectual tradition and its Sanskrit-based learning. Their role in diffusing Ayurvedic learning in the medium of Sant Bhasha, consisting of several dialects written in Gurumukhi script made Ayurvedic learning accessible beyond the sphere of Sanskrit based knowledge.

The Nirmalas, particularly of the order based in Amritsar, were trained at their Bungas as tikkakari\textsuperscript{22} and were involved in the late nineteenth century in the composition of tikkas in Ayurved. These tikkas were annotated or edited interpretations of old Sanskrit treatises and their commentaries, and were widely used by a readership of Vaidys and Vaid pupils.

\textsuperscript{20} Ibid., p. 35 (emphasis in text).
\textsuperscript{21} Ibid.
The various Guru-chela lineages of noted Vaidas amongst both the Udasis and the Jains were also associated with authoring a large number of works on Baidak, often anthologies or pothis in Punjabi, that continued to be consulted through most of the nineteenth century by Vaidas and Vaid students. Baba Amir Das Udasin, Pandit Bal Mukand, and his chela Vaidya Sheetal Dass of Kapurthala, composed works such as the Amir Prakash, Vaid Kalpataru and Byadh Binashak that were used in Ayurvedic teaching not only amongst the Udasis, but also used by lay Vaidas pursuing Ayurvedic learning. The Jain Muni Meghraj’s work Megh Vinod was the first—and until as late as the 1900s the only—competent translation of an important sixteenth century anthology called Bhauprakash. Subsequent works by Megh Raj, such as the Megh Vilas (1827), Megh Mala consisted of his own prescriptions and were valued even for their literary merit due to his introduction of new genres of verse composition in Punjabi Bhasha.

The Lahore Court under Ranjit Singh as well as the regional courts of many of his feudatories were an important centre for patronage and sanction for Ayurvedic learning and practice. Bhai Wasti Ram, Baba Amir Das and Pandit Balmokand were well known Udasis who taught and practiced Baidak and were also associated at various times with Ranjit Singh’s Durbar. Bhai Wasti Ram, the founder of an Udasi Bunga at Amritsar, was reputed for his medical skills and also held important court appointments along with a large jagir in the Gurdaspur area.

The milieu of the court however, also represented a highly competitive environment for medical practitioners, with royal patrons as well as

---

24. Ibid. Sant Bhasha was often referred to in later histories of Punjab literature, as Punjabi Bhasha.
courtiers often extending patronage and providing professional mobility to various kinds of medical men and traditional intellectuals. The courts, in their patronage of certain practitioners, Pandits, and astrologers, contributed to making the occupational hierarchy of medical men and traditional intellectuals highly fluid. Much like the circumstances in the Lahore court, regional courts of various feudatories too patronized a number of medical men, who were summoned for medical consultations and competed for elite patronage. A contemporary travel account of the court of Raja Sansar Chand of Kotoch, a hill Raja, described a medical consultation that involved a member of the royal family and a number of local physicians:

On the night of the 30th of June, Fateh Chand, the Raja's brother... was taken seriously ill... At the Raja's desire I went to see him. Upon the floor on one side of his bed was a row of lamps... Eight or Ten Hindu and Mohammedan physicians sat or knelt around the bed... 28

Court physicians at the Lahore Court, both Vaid as well as Hakims, for instance, had to work under the supervision of the skilled jurrah or surgeon, Faqir Azeez-Ud-Din. The Faqir, who had been trained by a reputed surgeon in Lahore, Hakim Hukum Rai, had won Ranjit Singh's favour on treating the ruler for a battle injury following the siege of Multan. He had subsequently enjoyed a meteoric rise, with his appointment as Ranjit Singh's personal physician and also later as his prime minister. 29

Even outside the court Vaid practitioners seem mostly to have practised closely alongside Yunani Tibb practicing Hakims. Honigberger's account of court consultations in the city as well as those among elite clients at Lahore, indicated the close and overlapping occupational spheres that marked the practice of medicine by Voids and Hakims in Punjab. He described a typical upper class consultation as follows:

...Consultations were generally held in the presence of the patient so that he might choose whichever remedy he preferred. In the assembly of the Hakims the Persian language was spoken, and the technical terms used were Arabic, which no patient could understand; but if there were present any Hindu physicians or Pundits [astrologers] which was always the case when consultations were held at respectable houses, then the Indian language was spoken, because generally the Indians are not versed in the Persian.30

Ayurvedic learning in nineteenth-century Punjab was identified with and taught as a separate system of learning but in practice it lacked independent professional authority. The Vaid practitioner attended on clients along with the Yunani Hakim, whose system of learning was far more widely diffused and influential in Punjab than that of the ‘Baid’. Leitner’s Survey for instance indicates a concentration of reputed Punjabi Hakims and schools teaching Tibb in centres like Delhi and Amritsar31 along with a large number of Yunani practitioners in each of the districts, including in the Eastern divisions.

The strength of Yunani Tibb practice was based on the widespread diffusion of Arabic learning, and the popularity of Persian that served as a court and service medium amongst a cross-section of the elite and professional groups in Punjab. Maktabs or Persian sections of Arabic schools were extremely well attended as they taught skills that were crucial for Government employment and a career in court. Many of the maktabs in Delhi and Amritsar that were listed by Leitner were supported by wealthy Hindu Rais es and Sikh notables and often employed Pandits and Sikh traditional intellectuals for instruction in Persian.32

---

31 Leitner, pp. 4, 52.
32 Ibid., p. 72.
Unlike the Koran schools, the *maktabs* also taught professional studies such as law and literature, and the study of medicine often seems to have the 'most accessible scientific subject in many [such] schools...'.

The study of Tibb medical treatises was facilitated by the knowledge of Persian and Arabic that was widely acquired by scholars and pupils who attended these institutions. The Sikhs in particular were reputed for producing scholars who specialized in 'a combined knowledge of both classical languages Sanskrit and Arabic', and also formed an important section of Yunani practitioners. In Amritsar city for instance, nearly 20 out of 28 or so well established Hakims of the city in the late nineteenth century were Sikh *Bhais*.

Contemporary European accounts that observed the organisation of medical practice in Punjab described the knowledge and skills of Yunani and Ayurvedic practitioners. They emphasized the predominance of the 'Hindi Baid' and Hakims who, in their position as full time medical practitioners, were seen as dominating the existing professional hierarchy. These accounts were influenced by their attempt to identify the counterpart of the nineteenth century European physician in these practitioners. Honigberger for instance, placed the Hakim and 'Hindi Baid' respectively as the practitioners solely representative of their medical traditions. In practice however, the Vaid physician identified by these observers was far more difficult to locate, with his services and his sphere of practice commonly overlapping with the *attari* or druggist-chemist, associated with the preparation of Ayurvedic prescriptions, who proliferated in towns and cities.

---

33 Ibid., p. 73.
34 Ibid., p. 30.
35 Ibid., p. 52.
The *attari'*s training and his practice is vividly described in a family biography of Bhai Jaimal Singh, a druggist and minor Sikh intellectual who established his practice in the 1870's in the town of Tarn Taran. The *attari* was traditionally of a trader caste and his training, unlike that of the Vaid, was largely practical, based on his experience at his shop, though often coupled with instruction in the composition of drugs, based on the study of a *Nighantu* or treatises on drugs.

Bhai Jaimal Singh for instance, first opened his own independent *attari* shop selling Ayurvedic medicines after training with a local *attari*. He, however, pursued further studies in certain texts related to his practice, even consulting some Ayurvedic works under the guidance of a Sikh Bhai at the local *dharamshala* at Tarn Taran. Despite his limited training, the *attari* often worked as a Vaid practitioner. Bhai Jaimal Singh's biography for instance, claimed that the Bhai's services were widely sought by local officials, and that his medicines were often considered more effective than that of local Vaids and Hakims.

Contemporary medical texts too indicate that Vaidic practice was a widely contested sphere, with Vaid practitioners and medical men like the *bazaari* *attari* often performing competing medical functions. The *Baidya Jeevan*, a *tikka* of a popular Vedic text called *Lollambiraj*, addressed the problem posed by *attaris* who posed as Vaids and identified the *attari*'s lack of training in any medical system, his lack of erudition in writing prescriptions, ignorance of the medical theory of humors and inability to diagnose by

---

36 Sant Sampuran Singh, *Safal Jeewan*, Amritsar, n.d. Tract published by his family for limited circulation and available at the Bhai Mohan Singh Vaid collection, Punjabi University, Patiala. His younger son Bhai Mohan Singh Vaid was to become a renowned Vaid-publicist. The family ran a well-known pharmacy that still has functioning branches in Tarn Taran and Amritsar. See Chapter 4, Section II for more details.

37 This is corroborated by the status and relative prosperity of his family as recollected in his son, Mohan Singh Vaid's biography and his diaries. See Chapter 5, Section I.
pulse reading as the most visible distinguishing traits of a 'quack Vaid'. It noted:

The medicine of a Vaid who is a trader is not judicious[,] for his preparation will only worsen his [the patient's illness]; the untutored Vaid is one who has not been trained in Baidak shastras and merely employs medicine from experience ['Suni Sunai Dawai'] and therefore Swami Bal Mookand\textsuperscript{38} outlines all the features of a quack Vaid of this nature.\textsuperscript{39}

Most vernacular medical treatises that were composed at this time reflected a concern to identify the legitimate Vaid practitioner. Two features of his professional legitimacy—his scholastic training regulated by a Guru and his competence in theoretical treatises of the Baidak system—were commonly cited as a means of distinguishing a ‘Suvaid’ from a quack or ‘Kuvaid’.\textsuperscript{40}

It was not merely the competence offered by training and education but also his social authority that distinguished a Vaid practitioner from the quack. The Vaid student studying these treatises was therefore repeatedly instructed on the medical etiquette or code of conduct that needed to be cultivated by a Vaid practitioner.\textsuperscript{41} The Vaid’s moral and social authority was sought to be developed by delineating precise and formal guidelines as to the manner of being invited for a consultation, the manner of the bearer sent to summon the Vaid, the ritual means of inviting a Vaid and finally, the Vaid’s demeanour in interacting with his patient. Despite these efforts, the identity of the Vaid and his sphere of practice remained largely ill-defined, with a range of medical men of varying training and social-intellectual position engaged in its practice.

\textsuperscript{38} The Udasi author.
\textsuperscript{41} Ibid., p. 7.
SECTION II

The earliest impact of British colonial rule in Punjab on indigenous medical learning and its practitioners was experienced by the medicine men at court—Vaids, Hakims, Jurrah surgeons and traditional intellectuals—whose services were now brought to an end. The Punjab Administration Report of 1851-2, described these developments noting that:

...The numerous dependents of the last regime are...provided...for...the office bearers of the court, the Chamberlains, the mace-bearers, the soothsayers, the physicians, the savants...are all [now] borne on the pension rolls of the British State.\(^{42}\)

Even under the Council of Regency supported by the British, the emphasis on introducing western medical practitioners into the system of state medical patronage had already been indicated. The Durbar’s Darul Shefa or hospital, at Lahore, was placed under the superintendence of the British medical officer, McGregor; he was assisted by Honigberger, who now found a more significant professional function under the new administration.\(^{43}\) Honigberger, who had under Ranjit Singh's rule only been allowed to observe the working of this hospital was now provided with facilities to practice in it. Brahmin assistants were provided to him to prepare his medical prescriptions as well as Jurrahs to help him in his operations.

The death of the court milieu represented an important loss of access for Vaids and Hakims to the social status and prestige associated with court employment. However, the most substantial setback to indigenous medical learning and its traditional teachers emerged later in the nineteenth century. The logic of the Punjab Government's new land settlements had matured

\(^{42}\) Leitner, p. 162. Emphasis in text.
\(^{43}\) Honigberger, Thirty-Five Years, pp. xviii-xix.
and the older revenue grants—dharmarth emoluments distributed by the Lahore State to support traditional intellectuals and educational institutions—now began to be curtailed. Leitner’s survey recorded that Brahmin Pandits and Pandas who had holdings that supported Sanskrit pathshalas largely based in the districts of Jullundur and Hoshiarpur, faced an increase in assessments on their grants. The Pandas of Mubarakpur for instance, in Hoshiarpur District, who used their grant to support a medical school, were recorded as facing an important loss of income.\footnote{Leitner, \textit{History of Indigenous Education}, p. 91.} 

The Udasis and Nirmalas, in particular the former who had enjoyed substantial social status and wielded influence through their landed resources, faced a gradual reduction in their grants. Amongst many other prominent Udasi land grantees, the chelas of Baba Amir Das Udasi lost most of their endowments in the 1870s and Leitner’s survey reported that the size of their dharamshala as well as the number of their disciples was much diminished.\footnote{Ibid., p. 52.}

Pandit Sarup Das Udasi’s descendants were associated with the largest and most prestigious Udasi grants. Successive land revenue settlements in Amritsar District however resulted in a growing loss of income. The value of the grants to this Udasi establishment had amounted to Rs. 18,000 under Sikh rule, and by 1850 had been reduced to Rs. 5,000 and further, by 1882 with the death of its reigning Mahant Brahm Hari, its holdings were only worth Rs. 3,000.\footnote{Ibid., p. 52.}

The impact of these developments upon the course of indigenous education was to considerably alter the scale of its institutions of advanced learning. Ayurved taught at large schools in the Bungas and in monasteries was now
increasingly restricted in its institutional base, to smaller pathshalas that were mostly dependent upon support from their students and the local public or private patrons.

In Leitner's survey for instance, the typical location of Ayurvedic teaching was in small pathshalas that were run by Pandits or members of certain ascetic orders. In Amritsar itself, Leitner mentioned only the school in the Bunga of Sarup Das Udasi. In Amritsar itself, Leitner mentioned only the school in the Bunga of Sarup Das Udasi. The other Bungas and Akharas noted earlier in the century for their association with Ayurved no longer seemed to be as prominent.

Ascetic orders such as the Udasis and Nirmalas increasingly turned for patronage to the old Sikh aristocracy and the rulers of the native states. Some of the Bungas such as those supported by the Ahluwalias and the Patiala and Nabha rulers continued to receive royal patronage even in the late nineteenth century. However, lacking any wider social authority or political support, traditional intellectuals concentrated increasingly on religious-theological functions, and reduced the scale of their involvement with advanced education and the practice of medicine.

The focus of the new administration in Punjab in its attempts to promote medical education was centred around the Lahore Medical School that was established in 1860. The function of medical education in the new setting was to train medical professionals to staff the growing Government medical establishment in Punjab. This priority persisted until the late nineteenth century.

---

66 Amritsar District Gazetteer, for 1883-84, Lahore, 1885, p. 53.
67 Leitner, p. 54.
68 Ibid.
69 A discussion of the colonial priorities in education and its impact upon local society follows in chapter 2.
71 Ibid.
century, and British colonial initiatives to promote the study of medicine and the support of its practitioners in the decades following Punjab’s annexation were guided by the priority of setting up a subordinate medical profession. Indigenous practitioners initially enjoyed a limited access to the subordinate ranks of this emerging medical establishment. They were employed in rural dispensaries and were also a part of the provincial vaccination staff.

The Government’s attempts to introduce training in Western medical education through the Lahore Medical School met with a limited local response in the initial years. The School had a high dropout rate in its Assistant Surgeon class and until the 1870s, it was unable to meet the needs of the province for well trained native doctors. Indigenous practitioners, both Vaids and Hakims, were therefore given a place in the school and were taught Ayurved and Tibb along with Western medicine, so as to enable their employment as native doctors in the Government’s dispensaries.

The condition of the Lahore Medical School and its training hospital however fell far short of these ambitions. The latter for instance, was viewed even in the 1870s as being, ‘most inconvenient and in a sanitary point of view all together the worst hospital...in India.’ Vastly inferior in the standard of their teaching staff and facilities relative to medical colleges in the Presidencies, the condition of both the Lahore as well as the Agra medical schools was rated so low that doubts were cast even upon the training and diplomas conferred by these institutions.

As a result, the Government of India coordinated efforts to reform the curriculum of the Lahore Medical College, abolishing local level degrees

---

52 Ibid. Later known as Lahore Medical College.
53 Ibid.
such as those of the 'native doctor', and replacing them by rationalised
courses and degrees that provided for a training of Licentiates as well as
Hospital Assistants. The Lahore hospital too was relocated and an
improved course of practical training for students from the medical college
was planned at this hospital.

The reform of medical education implied that the Government's medical
administrators chose increasingly to identify the theoretical training
provided at these institutions as the distinguishing feature in the identity of a
professional practitioner. The course in indigenous medical learning at the
Government Medical College was stopped as the certificates obtained by the
Vaids and Hakims attending these courses were seen as a means of giving
state sanction for their systems of learning.

Defining a professional identity for western medical learning was
increasingly accompanied by an attempt to characterize indigenous medical
learning and its practitioners as empirics. The occupational diversity of
indigenous medical practice, composed of a range of medical men, was
emphasized to illustrate its 'lay' identity. As the course of colonial medical
intervention unfolded in the latter half of the nineteenth century, colonial
medical administrators in their attempts to monopolize patronage would
increasingly define the superior, scientific rationality of western medicine in
relation to its 'difference' from indigenous systems of medical learning.

In effect however, the introduction of British colonial administration was
contributing to a process of disorienting the occupational structure of
medical practice. The end of court patronage and the emphasis by the

54 Ibid.
55 "On University Education in Medicine", in Punjab Government, Home Education, No. 1,
Dec 1886.
56 Ibid.
colonial state on the possession of a theoretical, institution-based training so as to claim professional authority, ended the scope for professional mobility enjoyed by medical men such as the Jurrah-surgeons and faqirs.

Traditional intellectuals such as the ascetic orders, involved earlier in the practice of medicine, had to reorient the place of medical healing amongst their activities, gradually creating conditions for the redeployment of their traditional intellectual skills in the newer urban hierarchies and associated ideological polarities that were emerging by the end of the century.

**CONCLUSION**

Ayurvedic learning and practice in early nineteenth century in Punjab was closely associated with traditional intellectuals belonging to the heterodox orders. Their teaching of Ayurved was based on their function as traditional intellectuals and introduced social diffusion as well as political sanction to Ayurvedic learning and its practice, that closely linked it to the social life and political system under the Lahore state.

The end of the Lahore state and the introduction of British colonial rule in Punjab marked the end of the political sanction enjoyed by indigenous learning and its practitioners. The priorities of Punjab’s administrators by the late nineteenth century increasingly focused around medical learning in Government medical colleges, so as to give pre-eminence to the western medical practitioner or medical ‘professional’ who, by his association with this institutionalized learning, was distinguished from all other empirical practitioners.

---

The conditions under colonial administration however, also began to evolve certain institutional and intellectual norms that identified the empirical nature of indigenous practitioners; through its administration and understanding of local society it also served to narrow the occupational plurality of indigenous medical practice. In subsequent years, this created the conditions for Vaid practitioners to define their identity as well as to consolidate the terrain of their practice.
BRITISH PUBLIC DOCTRINE, URBAN PUBLICISTS AND MISSIONARIES: THE CHANGING SOCIAL WORLD OF INDIGENOUS MEDICAL PRACTITIONERS IN PUNJAB (1840s-1880s)

Introduction
Following the annexation of Punjab, in an oft-quoted and in what turned to be a prescient speech, Sir John Lawrence, Punjab's Commissioner, cautioned a gathering of local Punjabi gentry and aristocracy of the dangers of turning away from 'good education'. Descendants of shopkeepers and tradesmen, he warned, would otherwise begin to monopolise 'exalted places of honour and trust.'

As it happened, British public doctrine with its paternalist-evangelist shaded social vision for Punjab, in a dialectic with an indigenous, urban elite that sought employment and representational status, was to see much of this prediction realised.

By the time the Hunter Commission visited Punjab in 1882, mostly to reiterate the directives of the Education Despatch of 1854; relations between colonial public doctrine and indigenous public opinion had begun to be restructured. The English-educated service classes that the government's education system had conceptualised, represented an urban leadership that shaped public opinion and public arena activities. They formed and led an

---

urban 'public' that no longer had ties with the feudal aristocracy and Jagirdars, and was now cut off from ties with rural power structures.

All however did not go according to plan. The colonial administration had limited control over these developments and later sought to demonstrate less direct initiative in the momentum that their policies had gathered. Much of the lesser middle classes in small towns and cities were educated not by government but by private agencies such as the missionaries. When indigenous agencies began to dominate the agenda of reformist education, the missionaries in turn initiated their own parallel and interacting trajectory in urban, public discourse.

The anglicized elite of the early reformist leadership carried forth and interpreted collective and particularist ways of identifying their interests, and sought to guide the content of the state's evolving discourse on indigenous language and learning. Public men and elite leaders however, found that their own leadership began to be more broad-based only when there was a diffusion of public debate and when the new institutionalized changes penetrated smaller urban centres. It was then, that a vernacular educated, small town middle class, of which indigenous practitioners such as the Vaids formed a part, began to contribute to these developments.

Indigenous practitioners such as the Vaids were also incorporated into this changed social setting, and began to project their interests through overarching collective interests that were beginning to be demarcated. By the last quarter of the century, the social bearings of indigenous practitioners were gradually being transformed, creating in turn the linkages for subsequent mobilization and ideological alignments.
This chapter therefore aims to trace the changes in state public doctrine and its relations with urban social leadership and public opinion, that indirectly began to shape the institutional conditions and ideas that were to create the setting for small town, vernacular educated practitioners to perceive themselves and the contents of their learning in terms defined by these changes.

Central to this chapter is the conceptualization of initiatives vis-à-vis indigenous medical learning, that allied it to the politics of and mobilization around the broader identities represented by vernaculars such as Punjabi and Hindi. The first section will trace the emergence of certain institutional changes that were represented by the articulation of educational concerns, the growth of early associations and societies in urban centres, as well as the rise of print and the press; this created the conditions for the construction of politicized claims relating to vernacular languages, and in turn began to relocate indigenous learning and intellectual traditions in urban public debate.

The latter section will examine the redefinition of missionary attitudes towards the emerging, influential urban middle classes towards the end of this period. Their introduction of medical mission work implied a movement away from the educational concerns that had shaped for them a polemical and competitive evangelizing image in urban, public debate. Their social inroads provide an insight into alternative networks and ideological spaces that they created to anchor changing attitudes and priorities in missionary work. Medical missionary work, in its influence and reception also demonstrated some of the limitations in the claims and rhetoric that were advanced by the colonial administration through the claims of western scientific medicine.
SECTION I

Some years after Punjab was annexed, the Edinburgh Review in 1841 had already written the obituary of the passing of the Age of Reform. Nevertheless, Punjab’s direct system of commissioner-based rule with its vigorous and reformist vision of administrative initiatives soon came to represent a strong and interventionist administration, that aimed to ‘to stamp the impress of its system on the rough surface of society, and to mould the broad features of new institutions.’

Recent scholarship agrees that Punjab’s heroes were canonized in biographies and mutiny accounts written in the 1850s and 1860s. Nevertheless, early Punjab administrators, even in the first decades of their rule, had already begun to define the contours of a social vision that informed their attitudes towards and understanding of, the basis of their social legitimacy and relations with indigenous society.

Punjab’s early civilians, brought up under the tutelage of Dalhousie, manned a system of administration that was direct and unitary in its structure. These officers had been schooled in the liberal paternalism of the Thomasan school and in their attempts to regulate social relations in the province, they therefore shared an anti-aristocratic bias, along with support for a free peasantry and respect for customary rights in land.

Amongst the first initiatives of the political settlement initiated by the new administration, therefore was to circumscribe the claims of those in the

---

2 Selection from GOI Records, Report of the Board of Administration for Punjab, 1851-1853, p. 25 (hereafter, PAR).
service of the old Durbar and the aristocratic *Jagirdars* who had formed an important social leadership in town and country.

It was not uncommon with the passing of rulers, and changes in administration, that elite and courtly classes suffered a rise and fall in fortunes. Yet the marginalization of these classes under colonial administration had an important implication for it implied a public doctrine that was beginning to alter power holding relations, and identify new allies for social control in town and countryside. It presaged the consolidation of land tenure legislation and education related reforms that would be elaborated in the coming decades.

Both the liberal-paternalist as well as the private Anglican evangelical belief that influenced the attitudes of the early Punjab Civil Servant, shared an emphasis on the importance of a reforming education system. Since their early campaigns under Charles Grant, the evangelists had conceived of education as providing a necessary ‘moral environment’ to its recipients. Paternalist beliefs in the civilizing power of law and government now converged with these evangelical priorities to support the setting up a system of government schools.

Early Punjab Administration Reports repeatedly voiced the need to elevate the ‘social morality’ of local, Punjabi society. ‘Popular education’ with a sound professional and not merely literary emphasis was the panacea, effecting this upliftment by means of encouraging the founding of elementary schools that were to be guided by the newly established (in 1856) Education Department. Initially, however, personal beliefs translated into individual initiatives, were more energetic than wider educational

---

initiatives by Government. The earliest efforts to set up district schools based on the levy of local cesses were therefore initiated by officers like Richard Temple, Herbert Edwardes and R.N. Cust.

Before the Mutiny, paternalism in Punjab's administration was in its most vigorous and untrammeled form, unhindered by the systematization of government and the political concerns that would follow in the wake of the Mutiny. If the translation of these social reformist ideologies be evaluated in practice, the early decades showed the laying down of a strong foundation of law and government along a Utilitarian conception.

Liberal paternalism and evangelical interest in education however, were to take shape gradually and were not without their contradictions. In the decade following the Mutiny, primary education under the aegis of the newly founded Education department was edged out by private missionary initiatives that benefited from the grants-in-aid system set up by the Despatch of 1854. Primary education itself, despite being an agenda that was so central to paternalism, was sidelined in favour of a growing debate regarding higher education and its contents.

After the Mutiny, and the pronouncement of the Queen's Proclamation, the colonial government consolidated its efforts to define a sphere of limited, 'secular', interests that directly concerned itself only with political concerns. Even before the Mutiny, government at Calcutta had begun to frame a public doctrine that reiterated these concerns, such as in the Despatch of 23 March 1847 to the Madras Government. In Punjab, officers and their evangelizing engagements had already become a subject of censure as in the

---

case of R.N. Cust and fellow officers who were remonstrated with and asked to explain their attendance of Christian baptisms.\(^7\)

By 1862-3, during the Punjab Missionary Conference, the official presence, represented by officers such as Cust, Donald Mc Leod, Colonel Lake and Prinsep, continued to be strong, but clearly the age of a direct and official commitment to and engagement with missionary concerns had definitely ended. For instance, in a discussion on lay cooperation, the role of the 'official laity' was defined by a Punjab officer as simply engaging in 'the secularities of mission work'. Though religious engagements in their private capacity continued to be committed and would continue, it was evident that the Punjab officers as 'public men [had] to act upon, the principles laid down by the Government.\(^8\)

The earliest universities had been founded in the Presidencies in 1856 and in provinces like Punjab, the process of increasing control and supervision, and a 'routinization' of government attitudes and conceptions now began to evolve. The Punjab government was no longer under the Commissioner system, and general administration such as in the departments of Justice and Education was expanding.

The 'secular' education elaborated by the Punjab government was a source of employment for urban educated groups. It was aimed at creating ties between service class groups with government administration, and it began to create competition and mobilization amongst various groups who pressed for greater representation in government service.

However, despite its attempts to withdraw from direct commitments to administer education by encouraging private agencies, the Punjab

\(^7\) A. Mayhew, *Christianity and the Government of India*, London, 1929, p. 112.
government continued to be influential in its attempts to set the norms of institutionalized education and its contents. In its education policy, the colonial government had, even in its directives in the Despatch, expressed concern over the condition of the local vernaculars and their function in primary education. In subsequent years, the question of identifying and using vernaculars became an important concern of government education policy, based upon the assumption that there was the need for a common language for government administration and education.

As early as in 1851, Urdu had already been identified as the provincial vernacular that was to serve as the official medium for administrative work in Punjab. Its progress and use was initially confined to the circle of official usage. Public perception of Urdu-based education as taught in Government schools viewed it merely as a means to government employment.9 The issues and debates concerning the place of the vernaculars in education was however far from settled. The concerns of an Orientalist movement in higher education in the 1860s-1870s raised issues regarding the place of the vernaculars in education and the continued support of indigenous learning. This movement objectified the contents of indigenous learning and tied the latter closely to the colonial states’ construction of language-based discourse.

Before a centralized policy on higher education along the lines indicated by the Wood’s Despatch began to consolidated in Punjab, local officers, intellectuals and an indigenous urban elite briefly attempted to define an Orientalist concern and priority in higher level education in the province. The mobilization of this opinion was led chiefly by members of a society,

---

8 PAR, 1851-3, p. 200.
the Anjuman-I-Punjab,\textsuperscript{10} that was composed of leading Punjab officers including Dr. Leitner, who was a member of the Education Department along with leaders from an aristocratic elite and the service classes.

The Oriental College movement, as these concerns came to be referred to, represented the demand for a distinct institutional base for higher education in Punjab, separate from the dictates of Calcutta University. The concern to establish an independent Punjab University, with an interest in promoting oriental studies and vernacular languages, received support from several senior Punjab officers. Donald Mc Leod, Punjab’s Lt. Governor, was a leading patron of the Oriental University demand for Punjab, and Orientalist concerns in higher education enjoyed steady support during his career in Punjab.

As a result of this campaign, the Punjab University College was founded on 1 January 1864, with the objective of addressing the question of higher education in a manner distinct from the other Presidency Universities.\textsuperscript{11} Its concerns were to promote the study of western learning and science, by means of Oriental learning and language studies. It aimed to establish studies in the Oriental College towards the development of local vernaculars that were to serve as vehicles for this exchange.

Scholarship at the Oriental college, its supporters argued, was aimed to cleanse the local vernacular of all its perceived impermanence and irrationality in script and also to study and develop a standard scientific vocabulary. Donald Mc Leod’s address at the Punjab University convocation outlined the aims of the foundation of the College as:


The formation of a really superior vernacular literature, such as would enable the people of Hindostan to acquire, through their own language usage, some insight into knowledge possessed by other lands. ¹²

Indigenous medical learning aside from the study of Oriental languages formed a central part of the Oriental College courses. Studies in Ayurved and Tibb were to form the early half of the course followed by an introduction to elementary aspects of western scientific, medical learning. Diploma Certificates were awarded by the University on completion of the course, attesting to the professional and recognised training in indigenous medicine now sanctioned by the government. ¹³ In 1882, for instance, nearly 20 students were awarded these diplomas and this training, making these practitioners eligible for government employment in Local Boards and Municipal Committees, for which the government had framed laws for recruitment.

With little concern for the varied linguistic repertoire that characterised the traditional course of study as well as the practice of indigenous medicine, the Oriental College began to redefine conceptions of indigenous medical learning, by associating the education of Vaids and Hakims with that of specific vernaculars. Hindi, for Ayurved and Urdu, for Unani, were identified as the vernaculars whose vocabularies needed to be supplemented from Sanskrit and Arabic and Persian respectively so as to prepare Vaid and Hakim students for courses in western medicine. ¹⁴

Orientalist assumptions and the medical training that they framed had little in common with the traditional teaching of Ayurved and Yunani in Punjab. Hindi for instance, had never been part of the traditional curriculum of Ayurvedic teaching, its association mostly as a script that was used by the

¹² J.F. Bruce, A History of the University of Punjab, Lahore, 1933, p. 254-5.
¹⁴ Ibid.
Bania-mercantile classes. The Orientalist view was that a knowledge of the vernacular was a prerequisite for the reception of higher rational-critical learning. This led to an attempt at structuring a newly conceived system of indigenous education, in which Ayurved and Yunani were associated with the politicized construction of and fate of the vernaculars.

Being part of university curriculum was also a mark of state sanction, and validated the status of a language, and indirectly its political constituency. Demands for instance, for the inclusion of Punjabi in the classical language Department’s curriculum of the university, were based upon this perception, and aimed at gaining grounds for the recognition of Punjabi in the Gurumukhi medium from the government. In the 1880s however, indigenous medicine, taught in the vernaculars at the Oriental college, was also perceived as enjoying an official sanction, a sanction that was to be questioned more and more.

English had already been recognized as the language that would monopolize the medium of higher education and the persistence of a vernacular-based training in indigenous medicine at the Oriental College increasingly came under criticism. Unlike English, the vernaculars, its critics argued, reflected all the irregular, custom and religion-based features that were characteristic of indigenous society. Their demand for the exclusion of higher education in the vernacular medium from the institutional space of government colleges, once conceded, was to lead to the use of the vernaculars in education by private agencies. Hindi, Urdu and Punjabi continued to be associated with advanced indigenous learning in private colleges, but also came to have a public function in the ongoing project of constructing ‘particularistic’ identities.
In the face of this opposition, the Oriental College's courses for Ayurved and Yunani conducted in the vernacular were short lived. They were transferred to the Lahore Medical College only to be rapidly wound up from there, once a reform and rationalization of the studies and courses at the Medical College began to be undertaken. However, the teaching of indigenous medicine in Hindi and Urdu was now in turn taken up and elaborated by indigenous, private bodies such as the Arya Samaj and the Anjuman-e-Islamia. Both these institutions now patronized Ayurved and Yunani teaching respectively in their colleges, and private, institutionalized teaching of both systems of medicine also began to be based in Hindi and Urdu.

The Orientalist case for making indigenous learning more scientific in content by the input of a Sanskrit and Arabic vocabulary was to become an enduring legacy in the future of all institutionalized curriculums of indigenous medical learning. Ayurved at the D.A.V. College for instance, was now taught in Hindi with substantial Sanskrit inputs, making it a curious linguistic-intellectual hybrid in Punjab, one that would constantly need to seek support from outside.\(^{15}\)

The criticism of the Oriental College and its studies reached its peak by the 1880s, their most prominent detractors being senior officials of the Punjab Government and Senate members of the Punjab University. In successive convocation addresses, senior government officials asked for a restructuring of the Oriental College course. They suggested that the proportion of western learning in its curriculum be substantially raised, and that comparative methods of studying oriental subjects be introduced.

\(^{15}\) In later years, the claims to scienticity of vernacular languages, particularly Hindi-as-Rashtra Bhasha were to argue against Sanskrit vocabularies.
Indigenous medical learning was selected for strong criticism and a case for its removal from the Oriental college courses was framed.\textsuperscript{16}

In many of these speeches, indigenous medical knowledge was held forth as typical of all that had already been identified as more broadly characteristic of indigenous learning itself. Ayurved and Yunani medicine were represented as embodying homogenous traditions of Hindu and Islamic learning. Their hereditary organization, the location of their medical knowledge in ancient ‘religious’ texts,\textsuperscript{17} and their reliance on linguistic interpolations of these texts rather than on scientific theories of evolution were all viewed as a reflection merely of the authoritarian, custom and religion based social life that western scientific education and colonial modernity were attempting to redress.

These conceptions in every way made the indigenous practitioner and traditional intellectual a ‘social’ rather than a professional/secular being. The indigenous practitioner was indistinguishable from his social moorings, and these in turn objectified his learning and attempted to locate it within the generalized particularist identities that had emerged under colonial rule.

The criticism of indigenous medical learning and the demand to exclude it from the ‘scientific’ contents of western medical knowledge and the ‘secular’ sphere of University education had another important and indirect implication. In fact, both the teaching and curriculum of the Oriental College as well as the criticism that it generated tended to generalize or universalize the conditions of and features inherent in Ayurvedic/Hindu and Yunani/Islamic medicine. Ayurved was already established in Orientalist

\textsuperscript{16} Speeches by Baden Powell, Aitchison and Rattigan in convocation addresses to the university between 1884-7. Extracts in Bruce, \textit{History of the University of Panjab}.

\textsuperscript{17} Yunani Tibb though not associated with religious texts directly, was perceived as a ‘false’ system and associated with false religions.
researches as ‘Hindu’ medicine and earlier education projects in the Bengal Presidency had already articulated these generalizations in the debates over the teaching of indigenous medicine in the Native Medical Institution in Calcutta.\(^1\) This papered over the heterogeneities in indigenous medical learning and practice that would have otherwise undermined the construction of these generalizations. In the future, for Hindu Vaid practitioners in Punjab such criticism also created the conditions for the construction of new rationalizations for their learning, that would be rooted in a Hindu reformist agenda, and in turn seek to lend authority to its singular claims. It would further alienate Sikh Vaid practitioners, directing them towards reformulating these generalized identities so as to locate Ayurvedic learning within a distinct ambit of Punjabi based interests of an ethnic, Sikh identity.

The debate over the trajectory of Orientalist education within Government policy was informed by official Reports, speeches by Punjab government officers, and most substantially by Leitner’s *Report on Indigenous Education*. Associations like the Anjuman-i-Punjab discussed the issues, and Leitner’s newspaper, *The Indian Public Opinion*,\(^1\) carried these opinions. This led additionally, to the careful evaluation of the returns of the Education Department, and initiated new surveys and quantification, such as Leitner’s extensive ‘list’ of traditional intellectuals in the province, that objectified indigenous learning.\(^2\) Issues concerning indigenous learning or its contents, including Ayurvedic and Yunani medicine, began to have a ‘public’ use and began to also be appropriated and defined by indigenous publicists and reformist groups.


\(^2\) Peril, The Anjuman-i-Punjab, p. 353.
The act of generalizing the contents of indigenous learning, and constructing particularist stereotypes regarding traditional intellectuals were aimed at extending certain monopolizing concerns. The Orientalist College movement was marginalized when Punjab University was being established, and more specifically, when the curriculum of the Lahore Medical College was beginning to be revised, resulting finally by the 1880s, in consolidating reforms in higher education. The reforms in higher education implied the consolidation of the spheres of western scientific learning. Indigenous medical learning constructed as an irrational and unscientific tradition rooted in religious scriptures, was the natural binary of scientific medicine and its secular medium of English education.

In the same years, along with the criticism of the Ayurvedic and Yunani classes in the Oriental College, local experiments to induct and train Hakims or indigenous practitioners of Yunani medicine were also facing criticism. Opposition to the 'Hakimi' system that consisted of training Hakims or their offspring in the Lahore Medical School, was voiced both by colonial administrators as well as by Indians in the Subordinate Medical Service.

The 'Hakimi' system, that came to be opposed in the late 1870s and 1880s, had been initiated in Sialkot district by Colonel Mercer. It was extended to the four or five districts adjoining Sialkot, and was reported in the early years of its administration, as being a small scale but successful project. Its aims were, 'to employ the services and influence of these persons [Hakims] who already possess the confidence of the native community in overcoming existing prejudices against the use of European remedies', and it raised considerable support and finances from local communities.

22 Ibid.
Within less than a decade of its initiation, the effectiveness of the Hakimi system was being questioned in official Reports that found its Orientalist assumptions, consisting of attempting to graft Western scientific methods over indigenous learning flawed and contradictory. The debate within the medical department shifted in favour of abandoning this programme after a decisive Report by two upcoming Indian assistant surgeons, Chetan Shah and Sahib Ditta Mal, who made for a case against this programme.23

Chetan Shah's argument was voiced not only in the Department's Report, he also chose to mobilize support through his writings in an Urdu journal that he jointly founded with Sahib Ditta Mal in 1875.24 The 'Hakimi' System and its provision for training Hakims at the Lahore Medical school was intended to address the issue of the place and status of vernacular educated native doctors in the emerging western medical profession. Native doctors, some of whom were recruited from the ranks of practising Hakims or from their families, were seen as being incompletely qualified because of their limited training in western medicine; their degree and training seemed increasingly obsolete when growing ranks of sub-assistant surgeons and assistant surgeons were being trained at the Lahore Medical College.25

Chetan Shah's and Sahib Ditta Mal's writings in the journal Maratul Tababat were still trying to shape the social and professional bearings of an

---


24 The Maratul Tababat is probably the earliest medical journal in the vernacular published in Punjab.
emerging western medical profession. To maintain the occupational identity of western medical practice, more rigorous tests for native doctors were campaigned for and an outright retirement of incompetent native doctors was recommended. Their journal had a subscription that consisted mostly of a service class of government medical practitioners. It sought to convey their professional demands to the government, and also attempted to construct a professional service identity by reporting and discussing postings, honours and relevant government legislation.

The *Maratul Tababat*, written in Urdu, represented a western medical profession that was yet to anchor its learning and status in its association with English-based teaching. In its formative years in Punjab, the emerging western medical profession contained many of the heterogenities of language and learning. In the continuing use of the vernacular in its teaching as well in the continuing existence however limited its presence, of Ayurved and Yunani classes in the Lahore Medical School, western medical learning was still to be distinguished by its ‘scientific’, ‘secular’ credentials.

The rhetoric against indigenous learning, more specifically indigenous medical learning, that dominated the movement to restructure the curriculum of the Oriental College, contained ideological constructions regarding ‘false systems’ of medicine, that often found less conviction in the perceptions and practice of western medical practitioners such as Chetan Shah and Sahib Ditta Mal. There was still seemingly no contradiction between their criticism of an Orientalist curriculum of Western medical learning and their willingness to engage in professional exchange and to

---

25 By the 1880s, the medical school had produced 140 assistant surgeons and native doctors. *G.O.P., Home, M&S*, June 1880, No. 19A.

26 By 1888, the Native Doctors Degree had been scrapped in Punjab’s medical schools.
take support from indigenous practitioners whose contributions on drug use and medical treatment were also discussed and published in their journal.\(^{27}\)

Elaborating on their encouragement of interaction between practitioners from both systems, the editors commented:

Some readers have stated that there are discussions in this journal regarding angrezi hikmat as well as claims regarding the efficacy of English medicines and that therefore [they] would refuse to buy it. [There are other] readers [who] have also said that Yunani learning and its medicines are discussed in [this journal] and since we have no faith in it we shall not support it. The advantage of this Rasala however lies in its usefulness for those who are ignorant of western medicine. And to familiarize those who know only angrezi tababat with Yunani Systems. This does not seem to us like a drawback but a matter of [its] advantage.\(^{28}\)

The Punjab government’s education policy, and its acceptance of Urdu as the official medium had begun to create an Urdu reading and writing service class. Printing and publishing, such as in the case of the Maratul Tababat in the medium of Urdu however, also reflected the new boundaries in communication introduced by this change. Traditionally educated Vaids and Hakims still did not participate in this sphere of print discourse because of their unfamiliarity with Urdu journalism.\(^{29}\) For the some reason, even native doctors with a traditional education showed little interest in the contents of an Urdu journal.\(^{30}\) Later, in the 1890s-1900s when indigenous practitioners had begun to print and polemicize in the Urdu press, the English medium of medical education and separate spheres of institutionalized practice amongst western medical practitioners made such interaction more difficult as well as unlikely.

\(^{27}\) Maratul Tababat, Amritsar, 1877, vol. 13, No. 1, p. 15.
\(^{28}\) Ibid, p. 11.
\(^{29}\) The Editors stated this while discussing the response of ‘Ayurvedic and Tibb Hakims’ to their journal. Urdu also probably had little ‘status’ in their eyes viewed merely as a language learnt for Government employment.
\(^{30}\) Maratul Tababat, p. 8.
The first generation of college-educated Punjabi medical practitioners were still to consolidate completely their common professional bearings or identity. However, externally their progress in securing wider social networks and public status as a part of a service class making up the new urban elite, and in mediating public opinion to the government in forums such as municipal committees and voluntary associations was already secure. Lala Chetan Shah, for instance, was an author of many medical tracts in Urdu that secured him a mention in Leitner's Report. He was invited by municipal committees such as that of Amritsar to make presentations and advise them on sanitary and vaccination based precautions for that city. He and his colleagues received commendations from the government and as the secretary of the Anjuman-Rafa-i-am, he was also to make a testimonial before the Hunter Commission.

The decline of the role of the feudal aristocracy in the urban public sphere was gradual but its diminishing role in urban public discourse was visibly evident in its membership of and influence in movements such as the Anjuman-i-Punjab and the Oriental College Movement. The Anjuman-i-Punjab in the early years of its existence, derived an important section of its membership from the ranks of feudal Jagirdars and gentry. These members represented the 'generous minded, spontaneous contributors' that were lauded by Leitner, who had made large contributions towards the Oriental College Movement.

For Orientalists like Leitner and officials of Orientalist sympathies such as McLeod, who led the Anjuman-i-Punjab in the 1860s and 1870s, this feudal aristocracy represented an important means of maintaining social order and

---

33 Maratul Tababat, p. 13.
‘reverence’ in the countryside. In their function as patrons of an intellectual elite, and as men of literary ambitions and cultural taste themselves, they contributed to sustaining and ordering social relations in Punjabi society. Orientalist scholars, and officials in the Punjab government who supported a patriarchalist bias to the government’s initiatives, believed that in the state’s education system as well its agrarian reforms, the interests and social world represented by these groups needed protection.36

The Anjuman-i-Punjab was an important mediatory body both for certain officers as well as for the feudal aristocracy. Between 1868 and 1870, when John Lawrence, as Governor General, began to press for a paternalist Land Tenancy Act to be implemented, this legislation was met with repeated petitions and energetic public campaigns were undertaken in support of the traditional, landed interests.37 The Anjuman-i-Punjab petitioned both at the level of the Supreme Government, as well as to England on the Muzaras or land tenancy code issue, and Leitner campaigned to influence this through writings in his newspaper.

The Anjuman-i-Punjab’s case was put forward as representing native ‘public opinion’, and was supported by nearly 200 individual petitions that were mobilized from Jagirdars. The key issue was to define ‘past usages’ in land tenancy and to convince the government about the ‘size of the land holdings’. Petitioners initially achieved some limited success in presentations to a provincial level, land reforms committee. However, the government was neither convinced that these groups represented native ‘public opinion’, nor that the Punjab Jagirdars were merely holders of ‘modest acreage’ and that they would not represent the problems that had...
already emerged from the 'bloated' land holdings of the Zamindars of the early Bengal settlements. 38

Within a couple of years of the passing of the Land Tenancy Act there was a significant fall in numbers of the Jagirdari membership of the Anjuman. 39 Urban service class members and intellectuals in the Anjuman had shown little interest in supporting the later round of land tenancy related petitions, and it was these groups who would begin to increasingly dominate the Anjuman.

The Anjuman-i-Punjab in the 1870's dominated the sphere of literary activities and reform in Punjab's urban centres. With more than 300 members and with branches in various Punjab cities, it had an important role, training the new service classes, and intellectual elite in mobilizing support through print and petitions as well as in projecting their function in representing collective 'public' interests to the government. It had already established a role for itself in these years, advising the government on issues of religious observances and custom that needed to be addressed when government defined its policy on fairs, pilgrimages and reform such as banning female infanticide. 40

By the 1880s, new societies led by intellectuals and government employees who had earlier been members of the Anjuman-i-Punjab had been founded. Two of the most influential leaders of the Lahore Singh Sabha (1877), Bhai Ditt Singh and Bhai Gurmukh Singh, and of other societies such as the Anjuman-i-Islamia had earlier been members of the older Anjuman.

38 Ibid, p. 359.
40 Ibid, pp. 344-51.
Issues that had concerned the Anjuman-i-Punjab such as education, the support of vernacular languages like Punjabi, and the printing and preservation of historical documents persisted for some time. However, they were now beginning to be interpreted and projected to construct the identities that bodies like the Singh Sabha, Arya Samaj and the Anjuman-i-Islamia were competing now to define.

The arrival of the Hunter Commission changed the pace of this mobilization. In Punjab, unlike in the North Western Provinces, the debate over the choice of Hindi or Urdu as a medium, or over the contents and aims of primary education had until then exercised very little public debate. It was the agenda set by the Commission\textsuperscript{41} that raised immediate expectations and created print-based polemic over the Hindi-Urdu question, along with the claims of Punjabi being forwarded by the Sikh Guru Singh Sabha leadership.

The Hunter Commission itself had a limited brief and sought testimonials from selected local representatives who shared a consensus with the Commission members regarding certain aspects of the education policy. Aside from odd members of the old gentry and some scholars who were teaching at the Oriental College, it called overwhelmingly upon a service class that agreed—or at least at no point contradicted—these assumptions regarding 'popular' education based upon the identification and teaching of vernaculars. Scholars like Leitner, were lone voices who continued campaigning for indigenous education and commended the work of the Oriental College to the Hunter Commission. The norms and standards of the government's education system had already been settled, and Leitner's claims for higher education did not even indirectly form a part of the brief of the Commission.
The Commission’s interviews and the petitions sent to it revealed that the concern to identify a single, official vernacular for the province had penetrated even smaller towns and cities.\footnote{Hunter Commission Report, pp. 119-22.} These interviews also brought out the widespread confusion and diversity of opinions regarding this issue. Scripts and language were referred to interchangeably and many of the petitioners conceded that the rhetoric around Hindi and Urdu as representatives of Hindu and Muslim cultural claims, had little relation to the reality of social and cultural practice in the province.

The Hunter Commission did not by itself promote any new agenda on the question of the provincial vernacular, yet it widened the interest in identifying with a chosen vernacular that was closely linked in print and publicity to the process of consolidating sectional interests. In 1866, the Sat Sabha which was founded in Lahore by Punjabi Hindu and Bengali Brahmos, decided to use and propagate Punjabi.\footnote{Kenneth W. Jones, \textit{Arya Dharma: Hindu Consciousness in Nineteenth-century Punjab}, Calcutta, 1978, p. 24.} Some years later, the Anjuman-i-Punjab, consisting of Muslim, Hindu and Sikh traditional intellectuals and professionals, put forward its claims to represent Punjabi literature and demanded the inclusion of the language in the Oriental College course.\footnote{Perill, The Anjuman-i-Punjab, p. 352.}

During the Hunter Commission enquiry and in subsequent years, language claims were more specific in their politics. The Singh Sabha Sikhs, represented particularly by the Lahore Sabha, who had begun to make Punjabi in the Gurumukhi script the defining basis of their claims to community identity.\footnote{Petitions to Hunter Commission in \textit{Hunter Commission Report}, pp. 562-3.} The Lahore Singh Sabha led by a leadership...
predominantly from the service classes had an agenda that focused upon the importance of developing a Punjabi print and press. Khalsa schools that expanded in the 1900s were later to be the institutional base for this Punjabi Gurumukhi teaching that was cultivated by the Singh Sabhas.

The Arya Samaj too began to focus upon its identification with Hindi in the Devnagri script. It fashioned this progress through D.A.V. Schools, in a province where as a witness to the Hunter Commission had conceded,\textsuperscript{46} there had been almost no such institutions previously. It was the Arya Samaj's initiative in developing this school network in the next decade, that made for its penetration into smaller towns in Punjab.

It was the widening use of the print medium and its reach into the Punjab mofussil that had the earliest impact upon the diffusion of urban politics beyond the large cities. It carried the contents of urban public discourse on questions of collective, religious mobilization and language, far wider, to be interpreted not merely by an Anglo vernacular elite but also by a vernacular educated, lay literati in small urban centres.

After the introduction of printing presses in Punjab by missionaries of the Ludhiana Mission in 1834, urban, private agencies had rapidly employed this medium, resulting in a steady increase in newspapers, books and tracts. By 1893, the district of Lahore had as many as 60 registered presses.\textsuperscript{47} In large cities, the Aryas and Singh Sabha leadership had already established their presses\textsuperscript{48} and by the 1890s an increasing number of private individuals, often with direct or indirect links with the new caste kinship or community based sabhas were taking the initiative to set up presses. Traditional

\textsuperscript{46} Hunter Commission Report, p. 217.
\textsuperscript{47} P.A.R., 1893-4, pp. CLIV-CLV.
\textsuperscript{48} The Lahore Singh Sabha founded the Khalsa Press in the 1880s; the Wazir-i-Hind Press was founded in 1892 and served the needs of the Khalsa Tract Society.
intellectuals like Pandits and Gianis were quick to be initiated into this medium; their enterprise, often supported by an urban patron, consisted of persisting in a new medium with the older genre such as translations of religious texts like the Adi Granth, religious commentaries etc. Some Nirmalas and Udasis, closely associated with the compilation of annotated anthologies on indigenous medicine now had their medical works printed; but these too hardly reflected the wider public use of the press that these intellectuals were to attempt in later years.49

Urdu printing and publishing had begun to dominate private enterprise in vernacular printing even by the 1880s.50 The Punjab Census of 1881-1890 for instance, revealed that nearly half of the books printed in Punjab in that decade were in Urdu, followed by Punjabi, with Hindi coming in a very poor third.

However, print-based, popular deployment of a vernacular was not always an accurate indicator of the ideological commitment and support that existed for that vernacular. In the case of Hindi for instance, Arya commitment to Hindi in the Devnagri script was widely reiterated in the years following the Hunter Commission’s visit though the Arya Samaj was yet to sponsor and publish any significant newspaper or journal in Hindi. Even Arya publications, in other languages, such as the Arya Patrika,51 argued for the support of Hindi and its development by emphasizing the need for the institutionalized support of Sanskrit.

Arya pamphleteering and newspaper-based polemic began to intensify in the 1880s and 1890s, but it continued to employ the Devnagri as well as Urdu

49 These were versions in printed form of earlier handwritten pothis and popular Vaidak or Ayurvedic works such as the Bhau Prakash, Megh Vinod etc.
50 Urdu publishing occupied 45.3% of the market, Punjabi, 20.6% and Hindi only 9.5%. Census of Punjab, 1881-90, Lahore, 1890, p. 271.
script in the initial years. As the Arya Samaj expanded institutionally in the 1890s, many of Punjab’s smaller cities like Multan, Gujrat, Ferozpur also began to see initiatives by local Arya publicists to publish polemics about Arya reform, its education agenda as well as articles on its engagements with Islamic, Christian and Sikh belief.

While the Arya use of a Hindi-Devnagri vernacular consisted by and large of borrowing the Khari Boli-based and standardized Hindi forms that were evolving in the United Provinces, the spread of print posed important challenges for the Lahore Singh Sabha leadership. Their attempts at print publicity were led by the Chief Khalsa Diwan and an intellectual elite that consisted of Bhai Ditt Singh and later Bhai Vir Singh who began through their publishing and publicity efforts to establish a literary canon, and standardized forms and styles for Punjabi through the growing Punjabi press.

The widening circle of Punjabi print and press created opportunities for a lay literati in small towns to participate in defining the contents of the discourse that the Singh Sabha leadership had begun to elaborate upon. Small towns like Bhasaur, Ferozepore and Tarn Taran had already seen the foundation of the most active Singh Sabhas, initiating an energetic expansion of activities, partly consisting of talks, debates, meetings but also in the sphere of print and publicity. Small town officials, including vernacular-educated groups such as indigenous practitioners were to become elements that would shape these new institutions and ideas.

SECTION II

The course of the Government of India's education policy, and its espousal after the Mutiny of a 'secular' sphere of sanction was also a source of concern for Christian missionaries. Christian missionaries had been campaigning in India as well as Britain to influence the contents as well as direction of educational reforms even before the Hunter Commission. Amongst many of their lobbying initiatives, in 1878, Christian missionaries had founded a General Council on Education in India and pressed their demands forward to Lord Ripon.\(^52\)

Christian missionaries along with reformist agencies therefore actively pressed for framing the agenda taken up by the Hunter Commission investigation; they also formed an important component of the Commission. In Punjab, a number of venerable missionary pioneers and mission heads were called to testify and to elaborate upon their expectations regarding their educational concerns in the province.

Missionary opinion had a distinct stand on the contents as well as control and direction of the education policy. In so far as content was concerned, the issue was not so much to deny the place of secular education, as to emphasize the indispensability of its moral content. Bishop Valpy French, the first Bishop of Lahore, clarified this when he admitted that an educational agency was not one that solely addressed religious concerns.\(^53\)

Regarding the control of education-based concerns, missionary witnesses were clear that they wanted less stringent grants-in-aid rules along the lines of thought expressed in the Despatch of 1854; they expected in addition that

the government would withdraw from the field of higher education in favour of the missionaries. 54

The Hunter Commission however, merely confirmed emerging trends in the Government's stance on developments in education. For the missionaries, the Hunter Commission was disappointing in that it upheld the priorities of secular education and continued to anchor grants-in-aid rules on this ideal. Further, the Government had begun to centralize higher education in the provinces, and had confirmed its continuing hold over it, superseding the claims of any private agencies. 55

The Hunter Commission and its recommendations did not merely mark the beginning of the end for missionary interest in educational work. More crucially, in terms of ideas and attitudes amongst missionaries, the years before and following the Hunter Commission marked the revaluation of missionary concerns and of the direction of missionary work itself. It led to the initiation of missionary efforts to evaluate the identity of their work in the wake of the state's doctrine on education; it marked as well, the beginning of a process by which the missionaries began to redefine the scope and interest of their work as they began to address urban, public opinion. It was in the emerging debate concerning medical missions and in the authorizing idiom of western, scientific medicine that those ideas and concerns began to be articulated.

To understand the consolidation of medical missionary work in Punjab's urban arenas, we need to understand missionary perception of their work and its function in the mid-nineteenth century. Christian missionaries made their most substantial inroads in to urban public life after Punjab's

55 Ibid.
annexation, by means of their educational work. The earliest and most influential of missions to begin work in this area was the Ludhiana Mission of the American Presbyterians that set up a mission school in Ludhiana in 1845.\(^{56}\) Other important missions that expanded in later decades were the Church Missionary Society\(^{57}\) and the Sialkot Mission,\(^{58}\) as well as a later entrant, the Cambridge Mission that based its work mostly in South Punjab.\(^{59}\)

The Christian evangelical mission was to be conveyed through education, based upon the idea that education would serve as a ‘preparatory’ towards the objective of receiving the Gospel. Missionary Conferences discussed the objectives of mission educational work as being aimed towards Punjab’s urban centres where the enthusiasm for English education amongst the middle classes was to be converted into direct evangelical gains.

The aims of education in its early decades of work was based upon missionary faith in simple, direct transformations of the recipients of education. Members of the Missionary Conference of 1862-3, voiced an unambiguous objective, when they argued that:

\[\ldots\text{We cannot be satisfied with any amount of mere civilization, enlightenment, or general elevation of character, united with the profoundest respect for Christianity. Our great object is the conversion of India.}\]\(^{60}\)

The fallout of the Mutiny and the Government’s position on education-based intervention, had however already begun to introduce changes that

---


would shape this attitude. The expansion in the number of government
schools that followed the establishment of education departments in
provinces like Punjab and the United Provinces threatened to dwarf
missionary education. In the United Provinces for instance, even between
1860 and 1878, government and non-Missionary enterprise had rapidly
begun to threaten the enrolment in mission schools. In Punjab, too, the
American Presbyterians, who dominated educational effort in the province,
were beginning to suffer similar setbacks.

However, even well into the 1880s and 1890s, Missionary educational effort
in Punjab, both in primary and secondary education, continued to preserve a
dominant place in nearly all of the province’s urban centres. Missionaries
reflected their enduring influence in the education department when Forman
pressed the Punjab Government not to establish competing government
schools in district headquarters where mission schools were well
established.

When finally overtaken by competition, it was the growth of local, private
schools and colleges of groups like the Arya Samaj that established
themselves as influential educational agencies. In 1882, the American
Presbyterian School still had no important rival in a large city like Jullundur,
but within five years, a local D.A.V. School had established itself and
even the Forman Christian College at Lahore faced a similar problem in the
growing popularity of the D.A.V. College at Lahore.

While institutional competition in educational work was growing, it was
also the image of missionary labours and their commitment to religious-

---

61 Ibid., p. 170.
62 Ibid., p. 172.
63 Ibid., p. 174.
64 Ibid.
moral instruction that was viewed by missionaries as being under threat. Even in the 1860s, the imposition of a secular curriculum by the University of Calcutta, and at the local level, the intervention and checks by the Education Department had been a source of resentment amongst missionaries.\textsuperscript{65} In the public mind too, there seemed to be little distinction between Government and mission establishments.\textsuperscript{66}

The dilemma regarding the continuing place of mission educational work was only partly about the aims and scope of missionary labours. It also concerned another issue, namely, of missionary relations with the urban, educated classes that would be increasingly based on missionary debates in the following years. A revaluation of missionary attitudes on this question of urban, social relations began to emerge in these years, as missionaries attempted to shape a new idiom and understanding of their work.

The Decennial Missionary Conference of 1892-3 at Bombay directly addressed the question of the place of the urban, educated classes in the field of missionary works. It also set the tone for a changing focus and understanding of missionary work itself and its place in urban, public discourse.

Missionary leaders at the Decennial Missionary Conference argued that the importance of missionary work amongst the urban, educated classes needed to be evaluated in terms of the influence of these classes as leaders of 'public opinion'. It was these groups that had mobilized print publicity, that had founded literary bodies and were now beginning to set the direction for

\textsuperscript{66} Ibid, p. 38.
public debate. Their importance to the missionary lay in their position as an indigenous leadership. 67

The importance of cultivating urban public opinion stemmed partly from the fact that missionary evangelization had now shifted focus from towns to concentrate on the countryside. In Punjab, it was in the countryside that mass conversions such as that of the Meghs were being conducted in Sialkot district. Sialkot-based Shuddhi movements were being spearheaded by the Arya Samaj, and a vigorous print based campaign aimed at the local public and United Presbyterian Church activity in the district had been launched. 68

In an age of representative politics where demands were supported by quantified claims, these mass conversions were met with vigorous effort at 'upliftment' work by the Arya Samaj. For the purposes of urban public life however, the theatre of contest between missionaries and Aryas had shifted from the cities to the countryside. The celebrated individual conversions of educated, urban Hindus by their teachers, such as that of Professor Ram Chander of the Delhi College, 69 or that of Forman College students had now decisively passed.

The missionaries identified a new social leadership in the urban, educated classes who were attempting to represent general, public interest. Even in the late nineteenth century however, missionary meetings such as the Decennial Conference had not merely recognized the passing of an older order, they had also begun to define the manner in which missionaries were to address urban public opinion in its broadest spectrum. Missionaries from even small towns like Batala pleaded that they seize 'social opportunity' as

69 C.F. Andrews, Zaka-Ullah of Delhi, Cambridge, 1929, pp. 36-41.
and when it offered itself to them, through participation in local societies and associations. 70

This argument, namely, for missionaries to address themselves ‘less to dogma and more to practice’ was justified by an appeal that found widespread response in the Decennial Conference. 71 The effort in missionary work had to be to show the Christian practice of ‘love and outspoken testimony’ when addressing themselves to opportunities through groups like the YMCA etc. for ‘personal, religious work among non-christians’. 72

Ewing, Principal of Forman Christian College, Lahore described the practical application of this approach by an illustration of the interaction between missionaries and the Arya Samaj, which was the key representative of middle class Hindu politics at Lahore:

To those who work among the educated people of Lahore the Arya Samaj is an instrument of no small importance. Their organisation may be described as partly religious, but more largely social. Its membership is generally speaking characterised by its antagonism to Christianity. In endeavouring to influence them or indeed any class of educated non-christians, nothing is more important than that the missionaries entertain and manifest sentiments of sympathy for that which interests them in connection with their social and moral life. 73

Medical work itself was only a small part of the agenda of this discussion. Yet, as the session began to discuss the objective of, as well as the indirect appeals of, medical missionary work, its potential to communicate the personal, devotional aspects of Christianity seemed promising. 74 Its

71 Ibid., p. 271.
72 Ibid., p. 300.
73 Ibid., p. 300.
74 Ibid., p. 307.
reception, indirectly, and therefore by example, was seen as the main advantage of medical mission work.

One such medical missionary speaker illustrated the latter, in the words of a Hindu youth who had closely benefited from and observed medical missions:

There are your preaching missionaries: we don’t mind them, we needn’t listen to them; and there is your educational missionary. We don’t mind him, we wouldn’t hear him; there are your books and papers, we need not read them; what we really fear is... your medical missions, for by your medical missions you win our hearts, and when that is done, what is there for us but to do as you say.\(^\text{75}\)

Dr. Henry Martyn Clark,\(^\text{76}\) a CMS medical missionary from Amritsar who spoke up in support of the Medical Missions Resolution, supported the indirect and piety-at-work nature of Christian medical missions. Like with many other missionaries in the late nineteenth century, however, this emerging orientation coexisted seemingly without contradiction with the pursuit of older methods of polemicizing. Only a few years preceding the Bombay Decennial Conference, Dr. Clark had founded a journal called the *Punjab Mission News*.\(^\text{77}\) Many of its issues, as well as books that Dr. Clark got printed, had continued to direct, polemical confrontation with the Aryas. Issues of the *Arya Patrika* regularly carried news of Dr. Clark’s journal and writings, and Clark and the *Patrika* as a result had strongly worded exchanges on subjects of Christian dogma and Arya beliefs.\(^\text{78}\)

It was soon after the Punjab Medical Missionary Conference of 1862-3, that the first generation of medical missionaries began to arrive in Punjab. In a

\(^{75}\) Ibid., p. 308.
\(^{76}\) Sent in 1882 to Amritsar to a C.M.S. Medical Mission, R. Clark, *The Missions of the C.M.S.*, p. 70.
\(^{77}\) Sometime in 1887. Unsure of specific date.
\(^{78}\) *Arya Patrika*, Vol. III, No. 21, 8 Nov. 1887; and various references in editorial notes in the same year.
session at this conference that was devoted to discussing the value of medical missions, Robert Clark of the C.M.S. had argued for the usefulness of medical missionary work as an auxiliary to evangelization. Viewed as an effective aid ‘to disarm prejudice’, in difficult areas of missionary work such as at the Frontier or with regard to zenana work, its usefulness had been conceded, resulting soon afterwards in the foundation of a Medical Missionary Society in the province.

Since the earliest days of missionary work in Punjab, medical missionary work had been a useful sphere of activity for missionaries who carried quinine and medical chests in their itinerations or treated needy cases within the mission compound. While some Missionaries like Robert Clark’s wife had acquired basic training in medicine, others like John Newton confessed to being purely self-taught. Native converts who knew some indigenous medicines, continued their practice which was not put to the aid of missionary work, with the understanding that it had ‘general usefulness’ in earning goodwill while pursuing evangelical work.

The arrival of the medical missionaries was related to the founding of a parent body, the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society in England. The American Presbyterians too began to send medical missionaries after training students in their theological schools such as at Princeton, for medical studies in the new medical schools.

Medical missionaries who began their work in the 1860s, and later in Punjab, were medical professionals trained in western medical practice and they were unambiguous in their identification with a western medical

---

80 On 24 Jan. 1864. H.M. Clark, Robert Clark of the Punjab, p. 238.
81 Ibid, p. 257.
82 Ludhiana Mission, Historical Sketches of India Missions, Allahabad, 1886, p. 40.
scientific tradition that they rationalized as being the product of a Christian civilization and as the visible material manifestation of its enlightenment.

As products of an evangelical training, their understanding of medical issues and problems was essentially a moral one. Both the American Presbyterians of the late nineteenth century as well as the C.M.S. missionaries reflected separate currents of evangelicalism that broadly emphasized a ‘social gospel’ of community and public morals. In England, evangelical clergymen pressed forth in village and town councils the agenda for Chadwickian sanitary reform. In the American Presbyterian churches too, missionary work was now based upon a wider range of social activities that was reflected not only in medical missionary projects but also in attempts at understanding local custom and environment—especially in a religious and moral environment such as in India’s—as being a determining influence upon the diseased condition of those that they treated.

As medical missionary work matured in later years, its agents, through their combination of western medical skills with a moral idiom within which they understood their work and its subjects, often commented upon the nature of the government medical establishment. Medical Missionaries saw themselves as an alternative agency that was parallel to the evolving course of the colonial government’s medical concerns.

Even in the latter decades of the nineteenth century, they had begun to mobilize their knowledge of work in urban centres in Punjab, to provide western medicine through dispensaries. Work in urban centres was to get specific sanction when the CMS’s parent committee, decided in November

\[83\] Punjab Missionary Conference, 1862-3, p. 112.
\[84\] S.M. Pathak, American Missionaries and Hinduism, p. 93.
1891 that it was setting aside its previous policy of restricting medical mission work only to regions where the ‘gospel could not be preached by ordinary methods’. It admitted that ‘the prejudice, isolation and difficulties, which exist in Indian cities, and which could only be overcome by a medical mission...[had] not even been recognised.\(^87\) Medical missions were sanctioned in cities such as in Amritsar, that had an important missionary centre, along with outlying village missions such as in Tarn Taran, Ajnala, Wagah etc.\(^88\)

In its penetration of various urban centres in Punjab, medical missionary work was marked not merely by its presence in large cities like Lahore and Amritsar, it was in fact notable for its presence through dispensaries and later women’s hospitals, in towns and even market centres such as Ludhiana, Ambala, Hoshiarpur and Ferozepore.

In these towns, medical missionaries often consolidated relations that shared social and civic concerns with a vernacular educated, leadership. Robert Clarke had been a member of the Amritsar Municipality for many years, and many missionaries were members of small town municipalities like Tarn Taran; Reverend Guildford for instance had longstanding relations with local leaders and Municipal Committee members such as Bhai Mohan Singh Vaid with whom he collaborated on public initiatives for urban improvement.\(^89\) Reverend Allnutt of the Cambridge Mission carefully analysed his somewhat reluctant membership of the Delhi Municipal Committee, justifying its usefulness in making missionary work and its

\(^{86}\) Missionary medical work in its expanding practice, its pressure on and interaction with the Punjab Government’s medical concerns shall be examined in a separate chapter.

\(^{87}\) R. Clark, *The Punjab and Sindh Missions*, p. 71.

\(^{88}\) Ibid.

\(^{89}\) Reverend Guildford wrote an obituary on Bhai Mohan Singh Vaid’s death that was later published by his family in a commemoration volume. Personal communication from his son, late Sukhbir Singh Vaid.
interaction with an indigenous social leadership more easy to negotiate, since, 'By meeting naturally with many native gentlemen on a footing of pure equality and for general business purposes, I have been able to understand them, to enter into their method and process of thought, to see them as they actually are'.

The efforts of medical missionaries to find a place in urban social life through Christian service, projected western medical practice as Christian piety and benevolence rather than evangelization. No doubt evangelizing often continued to be stressed in medical missionary literature published in columns on 'Medical Work' in mission journals or as tracts such as 'A Plea for Medical Missions'. This literature was aimed at an audience of contributory societies and individual donors to Mission causes back 'home', not potential converts.

Most medical missionaries either directly or indirectly conceded that medical work in mission dispensaries was merely practising the 'spirit of healing'. Typical of such admissions in Mission Reports, a medical Missionary from an American Presbyterian-run dispensary, wrote in 1886 saying:

The custom of preaching to the patients on their assembling for treatment has not been practised by us. It has always seemed impracticable to me situated as we have been. The smallness of the accommodations, added to the hurry of the people to get their medicine and be off, have made it seem difficult to make the work directly evangelistic, thought that is indirectly so I have not the smallest doubt.

However the 'Christian' nature of medical missionary work was always undisguised even if presented in the form of medical service alone. The

---

religious inspiration behind medical missionary work and its association with the Christian Missions was not lost on urban public leadership that came into contact with it. In less favourable assessments by the latter, its associations with evangelization would continue to linger. When an initial proposal to fund medical work by the C.M.S. Mission came up in Amritsar, it faced active resistance from the city's municipal councillors who clearly identified it with Christian evangelization, resenting the missionary influence amongst local officers. 93

Yet along with the persistence of these views, many American Presbyterian medical missionaries in their Annual Station Reports concerning dispensary work reported a growing recognition of their work from the local public leadership. Medical missionary work was beginning to establish a new idiom in which to locate western medical initiative, namely a devotional, Christian one, that had begun to establish a distinct place for its service.

No doubt we have mainly the missionary archive to vouch for these growing successes; many of these Reports were no doubt spurred by the need to justify continuing medical missionary work. Nevertheless, numerous instances of elite philanthropy and contributions from small town municipal committees, particularly later in supporting the growth of mission hospitals, attest to the social inroads that medical missionary work was gradually making in public life in Punjab's cities and small towns.

In Ferozepore for instance, the rapid expansion of the mission dispensary within less than a decade of its establishment, was supported by funds contributed by Arya Samaj leaders and business people who had earlier resisted the work of the dispensary. 94 Aside from voluntary contributions

from local traders, even the local municipal committee had committed itself
to a monthly grant to the mission dispensary. The medical missionary
commenting upon these developments regarding dispensary work, noted:

Now I submit that these and like acts are significant. The sums contributed are not
very large a few years ago those who contributed were all indifferent to us and our
work, many of them suspicious of us, and many hostile;...and yet they know for we
proclaim it that our avowed object is to further the interest of Christianity.\(^95\)

Making an institutional and ideological space for Christian medical work
cannot simply be explained in terms of it mobilizing networks with the
English educated, service class alone. No doubt private visits by women
medical missionaries found less resistance from a ‘Babu’ class, with whom
missionary education such as through prominent colleges in large cities, had
already cultivated personal networks. In cities like Lahore, Dispensary
Reports willingly admitted the openness of the English-educated, service
classes in accepting their medical services. The Ludhiana Mission Report in
its section on medical work at the Lahore dispensary illustrated this
experience; its medical missionary, Dr. Thedie wrote:

My outside work is almost entirely among Hindus, and chiefly among the Babu
class. I find these people very satisfactory to work amongst. Many of the men have
been educated in mission schools and have therefore some confidence in
missionaries. They are not as a rule able to pay large fees, but are much more
willing to then richer people generally are.\(^96\)

Even the beginning of medical missionary work in the 1880s and 1890s had
made an impact upon a small town, vernacular-educated gentry and
educated class. Amongst urban, public patrons—Arya Samajis, local \textit{Raise}s,
\textit{Sardars} etc—medical missionary work was in subsequent years beginning
to establish local spheres of influence that were constructed around a
specific idiom of medical service. Its ideas and service began to draw upon

\(^95\) Ibid., p. 69.
local networks of patronage that recognised its distinct interpretation of medical work. 97

Missionary medical work in Punjab expanded in the following decades, though it was not entirely successful as we shall see later, in always establishing for itself an identity separate from state agency. Nevertheless, by beginning to consolidate lateral networks of local, urban patronage, and by trying to establish a moral, Christian basis for western medical work, it was to have an impact upon the content and construction of public discourse in urban public arenas. The moral, medical idiom, was to spawn imitation and elaboration in reformist activity and Vaid journals, and its projection of Christian/religious medical work questioned the limitation of the construction of certain binaries in medical discourse relating to the secular/western medical concerns sanctioned by the colonial state as well as the religious/indigenous constructions and claims in Vaid mobilization and rhetoric.

97 *Ludhiana Mission Report for 1885*, Ludhiana, 1885, p. 75.