In the bid to make a comparative analysis of religious higher education systems in Kerala and Java, three kinds of explorations were made in the previous five chapters. In the first chapter the attempt was to trace the scholastic and cultural legacies that tie together the two non-Arab Muslim communities in the peripheral. The second and third chapters showed that how a common scholastic intellectualism as well as a shared cultural legacy caused resemblances in the unfolding of religious life and thoughts in successive centuries. These two chapters that explored the observance of Islam and the discourses surrounding it clarified how the Islamic life and religious discourses in both Kerala and Java resemble to one another and where all the differences come from. It was more or less a survey of the present scenario, precisely the transformations happened in these two communities since the onset of the 20th century.

After capturing a picture of the intellectual discourses and theological differences within these two non-Arab peripheral societies in the second and third chapters, the fourth and fifth chapters tried to make a descriptive study of Islamic higher education systems in both Java and Kerala respectively. The main focus was on two similarly-looking traditional systems of Islamic higher education developed in two different geographical landscapes. In both the chapters the description of traditional and indigenously-developed higher education system was followed by short descriptions on changes, transformations, modifications as well as new initiatives emerged due to pressures ranging from modernization and westernization to theological and fractional divisions. Now, this sixth and final chapter would just make a comparative analysis focusing on the similarities and differences in the religious higher education system. The attempt is to note the similarities in the spread of Islam, development and evolution of Muslim societies, their cultural, linguistic, ritual and other aspects, and the influence of the scholastic and
intellectual legacy and the ensuing religious education systems in the unfolding of these all.

The similarities between Kerala and the Southeast Asian nations start from the geographical landscape, and are apparent in as diverse issues as seasonal climates, agricultural habits, plantations to eating and dressing habits. The landscape of Kerala is much different from any part of India. It has much resemblance with geographical areas down south and southeast. From coconut trees to tea plantations and rice fields, Kerala has much to be likened with Sri Lanka, Indonesia, Malaysia and other areas in the region. Popularity of things like black tea, dry fish, rice-stews, tapioca, jack fruit, etc are almost similar in Kerala and Java. The prolonged monsoon with heavy showers is yet another point to link both the places.

Coming to issues related to Islam and Muslims the similarity starts from the common Hindu-Buddhist past, a point that has played its part in the formation of an individual identity in the Muslim communities of both the places. Those who would explore the Little and Great traditions prevailing in Muslim societies across the world, especially those who live in the peripheral far from the Arab World, and precisely where the Sufi-Scholar missionaries stood with the propagation activities, they can easily find out the cultural colours of the past being existing in their present day setting, but mostly without compromising the essential parts of their great traditions. "Wherever Islam went, it did not destroy the local culture, but transformed it into an Islamic reality. What were rejected were elements of a clearly un-Islamic nature. As a result, Islamic civilization developed into several distinct cultural zones including the Arabic, Persian, Black African, Turkic, Indian, Malay, and Chinese" (Nasr, 2002). Geertzs' comparative study on two Muslim communities at two extreme ends of Islam's geographical breadth amply tells us how this cultural variation works in the formation of individual Muslim, or any other, communities (Geertz C., 1975). Martin Van Bruinessen has tried to compare the Muslim communities in Indonesia and those in Kurdistan and has tried to point out many aspects that link both the societies, and it also showcases a common legacy that is shared by Muslims in Malabar as well. (Buinessen, 1998)
1. Arrival

The first chapter discussed in detail the conflicts of opinion regarding the arrival and spread of Islam in both the places. What emerged was a plausible conclusion that both the places were commercially linked with the Arabs, and Arab traders used to land in the coastal trade cities there, so to agree with the historical traditions that support the arrival of Islam in its first century itself is contextually justified. Incidentally, both the places showcases graves and traditions linked to the Companions (Swahabi) as well as Followers (Tabi’uon) of the Prophet substantiating the claims of an early arrival.

2. Community Formation

The evidences of a strong community formation and increased spread of Islam emerge in both the cases in periods after the 10th century. This is easily linked to various social and political transformations occurred in the Islamic centres of power, like the continued exodus of Prophet’s family and their aids in the Umawi period, migration of traditionalist Sunni scholars and their students following the predominance of rationalist views in the corridors of Baghdad-based Islamic power, gradual decay of Abbasid power, social and moral disintegration that led to the emergence and spread of various Sufi orders, etc., During this period, Kerala and Java witnessed arrival of many Sufi missionaries, scholar families and pious trade groups, and their gradual settlements easing the spread of Islam in the way they believed and observed it. This process of community formation somehow continued for about one millennium, precisely until the emergence of rules and regulations that blocked unlimited travels, unrestricted resettlements and relocations, as well as free flow of people, goods and ideas, in the name of new sovereignties and nation-states.

3. Influence of Malabar in Indonesia

A major aspect to be taken care of is the influence of South India, specifically erstwhile Malabar, in the spread of Islam in Southeast Asia. This is an almost neglected part of historical explorations in both the places. In Indonesia, there is a dominant tradition that they got Islam through missionaries and Sufi scholars from Gujarat, but there is no any
mention of Malabar, despite having many strong contextual evidences. Snouck Hurgronje supported the proposition of the south Indian origin of Indonesian Islam. However, he went on exploring the links with Deccan Muslims, who had been living as middlemen in trade between the Middle East and the archipelago, and said that they came to the Malay world as the first propagators of Islam. Nevertheless, he stopped short of exactly saying which part of South India. Drewes exclaimed why an investigation into the literature of the Muslim population of South India was not done to obtain a greater degree of certainty on questions regarding this (Drewes, 2000). Rejecting the Gujarat origin of Indonesian Islam, G. F. Marrison points to ‘the Moors of Ceylon, the Mappillas of Malabar and the Maracayars of the Coromandel Coast (Ma’bar), which are ethnic groups of mixed blood whose members are still traders and seamen’ (Marrison, 1951). Mentioning the Cheraman Perumal’s conversion in Kerala he resembles it with the whole raja-rajapasai tradition of Indonesia. Arnold is another scholar who projected similarities between Indonesian Islam and its counterpart in Coromandel and Malabar to claim a South Indian origin in the former. He maintains that merchants from Coromandal and Malabar, who frequented Malay-Indonesian trading ports, played an important role in the propagation of Islam there (Arnold, 1913). The Malay text Hikayat Raja-Raja Pasai (chronicle of the king of Pasai) and Sejarah Melayu (history of Malaya) mention that Islam arrived from South India (Fobson, 1981).

Taking a balanced approach, Woodward calls for a comparison of Javanese, Sumatran, Indian, Persian, and Arabic texts and patterns of ritual performance, in order to reconstruct the history of Islam in Southeast Asia. ‘These sources, and those concerning the spice trade, allow us to isolate two sources for central Javanese Islamic traditions: the Muslim communities of South India, particularly Kerala, and the Muslim empires of the Deccan and North India. Significantly, Kerala was influenced primarily by Arab traditions, while the Deccan was dominated by the Indo-Persian religious and political orders. Javanese Islamic culture combines elements of both traditions. Basic elements of Javanese Islam, including mosque architecture and the Shafiite legal tradition, appear to have come from Kerala, while the theory of kingship, some aspects of royal ritual, and mystical theory were shaped by Indo-Persian imperial traditions’ (Woodward, 1989).
One should add to this the contextual evidences that ‘Kerala lies on the most direct route from Makkah to Southeast Asia, making it a logical stopping point for both pilgrims and traders. Kerala was an important entrepot in the trade linking Arabia with India, Southeast Asia and China, and often the first landfall in India for merchants from South Arabia.’ (Woodward, 1989). Until as late as 20th century, more precisely, until the air becomes more popular as a mode of transport, Malabar and Coromandal coastal regions remained busy as a major hub of sea trade linking Arabia to Southeast Asia and China. The 14th century Arab traveler Ibnu Batuta, one of the primary sources on Kerala history, stresses this point saying that most of the Muslim traders in Kerala originated from Arabia and the Persian Gulf region, and Kerala served as a port of call for traders from Sumatra, Malaya, and China. This subject has been thoroughly dealt in the first chapter.

4. Arab Settlements

Settlement of Arabs and their gradual localization is seen as a major aspect that led to an easy way of community formation in both the places. Huygenje explains that the first penetration of Islam was through traders and dealers settling and marrying women native to the place where they had settled. Drewes concludes it commenting that it has nothing surprising in it for those who know how it has often happened in India and how Islam still gains ground in many areas. It was a penetration which proceeded peacefully and apparently soon led to the foreigners’ becoming related to prominent families of the land and occupying important posts in the running of the port such as that of Shahbandar (Drewes, 2000). The post of Shahbandar was given to a major Muslim trader in both the places, and he was entrusted to manage and oversee all businesses at the port. In Java there are a lot of pure and mixed Arab families that have totally dissolved in the locale. Down South we see Arab settlements having local marriages and families – the Mappilas of Malabar, Maraikkayars of Coromandal coasts and the Moors of Ceylon. Due to their interconnections and their mingling with the locals, all these communities have lost its exclusively Arab character.
5. Hadhrami Arabs

Answers to the main question of the study that ‘who taught them what’ are at the root of similarities evident among Muslim communities in Kerala and Java. The chapters above amply showed that the influence of Hadhrami Arabs—Sayyid families, Scholarly figures, Sufi missionaries and pious trade groups, and in several examples personalities and families that embodied more than one of the four category—played a major role in creating answers for the questions of ‘who and what’ in both the places. This influence decided the mode and transformation of reproduction and dissemination of Islamic knowledge there. Consequently, this defined the dynamism of entire Islamic culture, the modes of thoughts, the individual and social behaviors, rites and rituals, the nature of scholars and their students, the characteristic features of Sufi orders, and the entire modifications until the effect of a larger globalization, which has ended any need of physical contacts for being influenced, thanks to the era of sophisticated communication technologies.

Hadhramis were invited by resident kings to station in their places in order to take up multiple roles in their relocated places like resident scholars, traders, statesmen, and arbitrators. Kings and rulers in both the places encouraged the settlement of leading figures and families from Hadhramout to boost their trade and to show that they were now civilized and their abodes are comfortable places for the peaceful pursuit of profit, and in this way they advertised their maturity. In Kerala, the King Zamorin had encouraged conversion to Islam, asking to have at least one convert in coastal families, in order to have more personnel and seaborne trade.

6. Arab-Islamic Culture

Because of all these contacts, both Kerala and Java showcases an apt example of adopting an Arab-Islamic Culture that received needed indigenous transformations. There are many points that explain this aspect. It is significant that Kerala had never underwent a Persian-Islamic cultural transformation seen in other parts of South Asia, and it was never incorporated in the Indo-Persian political order that governed most of the rest of
India until the rise of British colonial power in the 19th century. Meanwhile, being part of the Indian Ocean realms, it adopted the Arab-Islamic culture in many ways. Java, like many other islands in the region, was also part of this big tradition.

7. Mosque Construction

The styles of constructing mosques resemble one another. In both Kerala and Java it is a mix of South Arabian model with the local architectural variation of known worshipping places. In Kerala, the idea of a Masjid was materialized in architectural form of Hindu temples, when the Muslim demand for a ‘building to worship’ was met by Hindu constructors and carpenters. The domed mosques of north India were notably absent in both regions prior to the 19th century. In Kerala, Java and Lombok the oldest mosques are constructed from wood rather than stone or brick, and have triple tiered roofs similar to those of South Asian Hindu and Jain temples (Dale, 1981) (Logan, 2004) (Miller, 1992) (Woodward, 1989). The resemblance of Masjids with the shrines of the other local communities is seen elsewhere as well. It is said that the wooden mosques of Poland's Tatar community, mainly confined to the northeast borderlands near Lithuania and Belarus, resemble churches because they were built by Catholic carpenters who had never seen a mosque. In the architecture of many Indonesian mosques and shrines, one can also see clear influences of Chinese Buddhist and other shrines as well.

8. Localized Muslim Names

In Indonesia one can see many other cultures that have been Islamised, and an Indian influence is evident in a lot many things. In their language, we find many terms derived from Persian, Sanskrit, Tamil and various other Indian languages. The Indonesian names are very much Indian with many Sanskrit words. The researcher could find a lot of people with the typical Indian names like Devi, Surya, Aditya, etc. Many people mentioned that they have two names one Islamic and one Indonesian. The former one is what is common

158 http://www.reuters.com/article/idUSTRE68C3KT20100913
in Muslim world and the other one is typically Indonesian\textsuperscript{159}. However, there is an increasing trend to keep only purely Islamic names, thanks to globalization. This is more evident in Pesantren circles where I rarely saw typical Indonesian names. In the case of Kerala, the pure Islamic names are popular these days and people use to make it highly fashionable selecting beautiful Arabic-Persian-Urdu words. There is no any culture of naming with pure Malayalam words as it is used by majority Hindu community. However, there has been a culture of keeping localized Arabic names or Malayalam names that evolved in a Mappila-Muslim-Arabic-Malayalam milieu. It is assumed that the contemporary elder generation would be the last ones of people named with such words. These names include – Chekku (derived from Ishaq) Ermullan (Ramadan) Beeran (Mihran) Moideen (Muhyuddin) Moin (Mu’een), Eramu (Rahman) Beepathu (Beevi Fatima) Kadia (Khadeeja), Aayichu (‘Aayisha)\textsuperscript{160}. A very notable aspect of name-giving among Indonesian Muslim, especially in Pesantren circles, is naming of children after the authors of important religious texts like Kurdi, Sanusi, Ramli, Malibari, Ghazali. There are many people named Malibari after the Makhdum authors of Fath al-Mu’in and Adhikeya, texts very popular in Indonesian Pesantren circles.\textsuperscript{161}

9. Anti-Colonial Struggle

The arrival of Portuguese in the Indian Ocean in the 15\textsuperscript{th} century backed by imperial arms and savagely destructive tactics evoked a similar response in South India and and Southeast Asia. The newly emerged Aceh, which fast became major commercial Islamic power in the region, opened a new front against Portuguese, and it had envoys to the rulers of Calicut, the King of which was opposing the Portuguese onslaught with the help of his Muslim Navy. By 1560, Aceh became the focal point of a formidable eastern Jihad

\textsuperscript{159} The name of my host in Jakarta was Aditya Ihsan Supriyadi. However, in Pesantren circles, there is a general trend to keep purely Islamic names.

\textsuperscript{160} There are also many words used among Malayali Muslims that also represent this kind of culturally-motivated linguistic evolution – an area that should be dealt by a separate research.

\textsuperscript{161} In a Kiai gathering held at a Karawang mosque, two hours away from Jakarta, I met a Kiai called Salih Malabari. He told me he was named so as he belongs to a village called Malabar in the South Java. He was not sure of why his village was named Malabar.
effort directed against the Portuguese. According to Wink, Aceh was an ‘Islamised harbor principality with largely Arabian underpinnings derived directly from the holy land or indirectly via South India, in particular Malabar. With the Mappilas of Malabar - to whom they had been closely linked for centuries - the Acehnese were the sole Muslim communities in India and Indonesia to develop a ‘suicidal Jihad syndrome’ (Wink A., 1989). The role of scholars in the anti-colonial struggle is also interesting. Azra has mentioned about Makkah-based Indonesian scholars Al-Palimbani and al-Fatani who appealed to fellow Jawi Muslims to launch a jihad against the Europeans colonizers. In Kerala, we see Makhdum scholars of Ponnani, Qadis of Calicut, Sayyids like Mamburam Sayyid Alawi and his son Sayyid Fazal and also other key personalities like Umar Qadi and others leading the anti-colonial struggles through pages and stages.

10. Lasting Interest in Sufism and Related Rituals

Chapters above clarify that adherence to the Shafi’i Madhhab is one explanation of commonality between Kerala and Indonesia, as did the Kurds, the Arabs of Hadramawt and Egypt. This point has an influence to some extent, but the Madhhab issue is relevant only in jurisprudential issues. Studies by Azra and Bruinessen point out that some of the most influential Arabian teachers and scholars with whom Indians and Indonesians have deep-rooted contacts belong to Maliki Madhhab, including the 20th century scholars Sayyid ‘Alwi b. ‘Abbas al-Maliki and his son Muhammad b. This makes it clear that there are many other common grounds like similarity of religious attitude, an attraction to mysticism and metaphysical speculation and a firm belief in miracles and wilayat and waliyy - the so-called sainthood.

This lasting interest in Sufism, both in its learned and popular varieties, can be seen in most of the rituals and thoughts being found in both the places. The metaphysical and philosophical Sufism is epitomized in a large number of works being taught as well as read and referred to by traditionalist scholars. A big attraction towards the scholastic Sufism of Imam Gazali is ubiquitous as was seen in the syllabuses of Pesantren and Pallidarss described above. Yet another popular work being taught either through formal syllabuses or through informal teachings between Sheikhs of orders and their Murids is
Tanvirul Qulub by the Kurdish scholar Muhammad Amin al-Kurdi. Other works of scholastic Sufism like Abu Talib al-Makki’s Qut al-Qulub, Ibnu ‘Arabi’s Futuhat, Abdul kareem Jeeli’s works, etc, are also popular among scholars of the field in both the places. The popular devotional varieties of Sufism can been seen embodied in literatures like Mawlid, Malappattu, Manaqib and in many other kinds of literary contributions, in addition to a number of devotional rites and rituals.

11. Visiting Graves, Kissing Hands, Seeking Baraka

Visiting the graves of respected religious people in order to seek baraka and keep a roohi contact (spiritual attachment) with them is part of the traditionalist culture in both Kerala and Java. There are a number of places that are famous in the name of persons buried there, and people use to visit there occasionally. While these special graves are called Maqam in Kerala it is called Keramat in Java. Traditionalist Muslims used to observe death anniversaries of revered people buried there with a lot of programs ranging from communal prayers, Khatmul Quran programs, Wa’az programs and special food distribution for big gathering masses. The entire process is called Urus. In Indonesia, traditionalists used to observe the death anniversaries resembling much of what are said about Kerala, and they call it Houl. Other than visiting the graves, (a) seeking baraka or blessing from the remains of the pious ones and (b) kissing the hands of respected Sayyids, Sheikhs, Sufis, scholars, and even all respected elders like parents, are traditions spread in both the places. However, in Java the culture of kissing hands of elders with respect is very common, and it can be seen among all strata of people. In Kerala, kissing hand is limited to respected Sayyids, highly qualified pious scholars, and Sufi Sheikhs. Kissing hands of parents, elders or any teacher is rare or nil. Modernists see this as a part of Shirk they accuse in the traditionalists. They say that there shouldn’t be any extra respect or bowing showed to any created things.

12. Learning the Life of Pious Ancestors

In both the places, traditionalists give much importance in learning and passing through generations the exemplary life stories of pious scholars of the past as they consider it as
part of moralistic education a seeker of religion and student of sacred knowledge should get. They think that a page from the biography of a pious leader would do the effects of a thousand bookish lessens. Officially or unofficially they learn and understand their spiritual ancestors’ biography and their religious and saintly qualities, in order to emulate their praiseworthy characters, ethics, piety and etiquettes and behaviors in the life. There is a concept of seeing the teacher as a spiritual father. More than the family lineage, scholars give importance to their Tariqa Isnad and ‘Ilmi Isnad, and often both become same. This shows an unbroken chain of pious and God-fearing transmitters reaching to the Prophet.

13. Esoteric Rituals

Yet another tradition common in South India and Southeast Asia is the importance being given to esoteric rituals of reciting Mawlids and Ratibs in groups. Mawlid is the observance of the birthday of Prophet Muhammad which occurs in Rabi’ al-awwal. It is also a generic term for the birthday celebrations of other historical religious figures such as Sufi sheikhs and scholars. The main part of the ritual is collective reciting of prose and poetries (in Arabic, sometimes in vernaculars) written extolling the remembered person.

13.1. Barzanji & Manqoos Mawlid

There are many popular texts used in each area while observing the Mawlid ritual. In Kerala, Manqoos Mawlid is the most popular. Attributed to Sheikh Zainuddin Makhdum Sagheer, Manqoos is a shorter version of Sharaful Mawlid having only five Hikayats (narrations) and five intermingled Beiths (Songs or poems) that depict the happenings said to have occurred surrounding the Holy Birth of Prophet. It is said that Makhdum authored this shorter Mawlid when the people of Malabar was affected by some deadly disease, and he asked the people to recite this Mawlid at their homes and mosques in order to get away from the deadly disease with its barakat. This text is recited not only on the birthday of prophet, but on a numerous other occasions, like during various life cycle rituals and ceremonies, during personal or familial difficulties, during disease and disasters, and on many joyful occasions as well, in addition to reading it simply out of
piety and religiosity. There are people who use to recite Manqoos Mawlid on daily, weekly and monthly basis.

Meanwhile, Barzanji Mawlid\textsuperscript{162} occupies the place of manqoos Mawlid in Java. According to Bruinessen, Barzanji is the most popular religious text throughout the Archipelago, second only to the Qur'an itself. ‘This text is recited not only on the 12th of Rabi’ al-awwal, the Prophet's birthday, but on numerous other occasions: at life cycle ceremonies such as the first cutting of a baby's hair (‘Aqīqa), in crisis situations, as a part of an exorcising ritual, or routinely as a regular communal expression of piety. In many localities of Indonesia, there are weekly Barzanji recitations that bring the local community together. This Mawlid continues being reprinted; there are various editions on the market, and several Indonesian 'Ulama have published their commentaries on the text or translated it into local languages. There is probably not a single Indonesian Muslim who has not attended a reading of the Barzanji at least a few times in his life’ (Bruinessen, 1999).

13.2. Ratib

Ratib is collective chanting of litanies (awrad) encoded by leaders of Sufi orders or any of eminent Sufi Sheikhs. There are many collections of such Ratibs for each and every Sufi order, to be recited in prescribed manner and times. This include versions from Qurān, Adhkar (litany) reported in Hadith, names of Allah and his prophet, Sura al-Fatiha recited invoking the prophets, respected sheikhs and forefathers. While performing the Ratib ritual the participants respond to the call of the leader, fervently singing devotional verses in unison, punctuated by sharp beats of their tambourines and executing movements of their head and torso. The famous Ratib al-Haddad is very much common and popular among Kerala Muslims. Almost all traditional mosques have the habit of reciting it collectively every day after Isha prayer. Many Mappilas still keep the tradition of reciting it at their homes every evening. Ratibs like Qadiriyya or Jeelani

\textsuperscript{162} Barzanji is basically the name of the most influential Sayyid family of 'Ulama and tariqa shaykhs in southern Kurdistan. The Mawlid entitled 'Iqd al-jawahir and known as Barzanji was written by Ja’far b. Hasan b. Abd al-Karim b. Muhammad al-Barzanji (1690-1764), who was born in Medina and spent all his life there. He wrote a number of devotional works that became extremely popular throughout the Muslim world at the time and have remained so in Indonesia until this day (Bruinessen, 1999).
Rifaa‘i, Shadhili, ‘Attas are recited in Kerala at various occasions. As far as Java is concerned, the culture of observing the Ratib is very popular, and Ratib al-Haddad is the most popular, and in many mosques and houses they use to hold special weekly Haddad recitation involving mass gathering.

13.3. Dabus Of Java – Kuththa Ratib In Kerala

Modernists use to criticize and ridicule Rituals like Ratib and Mawlid. However, there are some traditional cult-like rituals that face strong criticism and opposition even from the part of many traditionalists itself. Interestingly, we find both in Kerala and Java a kind of ritual that adds a practice of self-mortification to the Ratibs. According to Bruinessen, in Java and in several regions of the archipelago, one finds remnants of an invulnerability cult known as debus. Its practitioners stab themselves with large skewers, swords and other sharp objects without suffering wounds. At present degenerated into a popular entertainment, debus is derived from the well-known practices usually associated with the Rifa‘iyya sufi order. However, in northern Banten Debus is also associated with the Qadiriyya order. Although the Qadiriyya shares with the Rifa‘iyya its loud and ecstatic dhikr, its followers do not as a rule stab or cut themselves’ (Bruinessen, 1999).

A ritual called Kuththa Ratib (Vettum Kuththum Ratib in some places) of similar kind is well-known in Kerala, and it is also seen as part of a cultural practice now. The name itself shows the nature of the ritual. Vettum and Kuththum are Malayalam words for stabbing with staggerers and smashing with swords. While performing this they pierce the body with sharp metal objects. The practitioners, mainly those who claim ijazah in Rifa‘iyya order, claim that their ritual is in fact harmless and they perform it to show the proof for the sacred ability given by Allah to the Waliyy they invoke, in this case the 13th century Sufi scholar Ahmad al-Kabir al-Rifa‘i. They say that such practices would do no harm to their bodies or the skin, due to the protective powers of the prayers recited and due to protection from Allah. All the prayers they use during this practice are unambiguously Islamic. In Kerala, there are some professional groups that are experts in

---

163 Bruinessen says that the only other place he noticed of Qadiriyya people engaging in these kinds of practices is Kurdistan. The most influential Qadiri shaykhs of Kurdistan, in fact, belong to the said Barzanji family, interestingly, it is said that the Barzanji was recited during a Debus performance (Bruinessen, 1999).
doing this seemingly ‘dangerous’ ritual. However, there are severe criticisms from various parts surrounding this practice.

13.4. In Love with Sheikh Muhyiddin Jilani

There is a conspicuous similarity in the custom of increased attention given to the 12th century reformer and Sufi-scholar Sheikh Muhyiddin Abd al-Qadir Jeelani in both the places. According to Bruinessen, In Indonesia, Jilani’s death anniversary on 11th of Rabi’ al-Akhir is observed with high spirit and devotion by reading his Manaqibs, written by various scholars, in addition to other devotional activities. In many parts of Java this used to be done also on the 11th of every other month. There is a hagiography of al-Jilani written by Muhammad Barzanji himself, named Lujayn al-dâni fî manâqib ‘Abd al-Qâdir al-Jilâni that has penetrated into even the most remote corners of the Archipelago. Bruinessen says that reading this and other Manaqib of respected forefathers for protective or expiatory purposes, or simply as an act of devotion, has long been a common and widespread practice in Indonesia (Bruinessen, 1999).

The same description can be given about the ways traditionalist Kerala Muslims use to celebrate and love this great Sufi-reformer. Known widely by the name of Muhyiddin (one who enliven the religion), there are Muhyiddin Ratib (name used for Qadiriyya Ratib), Muhyiddin Mawlid and Muhyiddin Mala. The last one is a very popular hagiographical work extolling the shaykh and describing his unique qualities as well as miracles attributed to him, skillfully written in the local Mappila language of Arabic-Malayalam by a great 16th century Malabari scholar Qadi Muhammad al-Kalikuti. Written in the Malappattu genre of Arabic-Malayalam literature and known for its

---

164 Arabic-Malayalam language is a blend of Malayalam base, Arabic script, and Malayalam plus some Arabic, Tamil, Urdu and Persian vocabulary, a few additional orthographic symbols being utilized according to need. It was the product of a necessity apparently developed through a combined effort of Kerala Muslims, who were not well both in Arabic and local tongue Malayalam, to make the study of religious knowledge, prayers and forms of rituals easier. It is believed that Malabar Muslims would have started writing in this language in 9th or 10th century. The script of Arabi-Malayalam got many face-lift and renovation in course of time at the hands of eminent reformist personalities like Sanaullah Makti Tangal (d 1912), Chalilakath Kunchahammed Haji (d 1918) and Vakkam Muhammad Abdul Qadir Moulavi (d 1932). Many religious as well as political and secular magazines were published in this language starting from late 19th century. Traditionalist Samastha Kerala Jam`ayat ul-’Ulama has still been publishing a major chunk of Madrasa textbooks in Arabic-Malayalam, and half of the articles in each edition of Mu’allim monthly, published mainly for Madrasa teachers, are written in this language.
literary quality, *Muhyiddin Mala* has received tremendous popularity among Kerala Muslims. They use to recite the same on various occasions, especially on devotional and religious purposes as mentioned in the case of Barzanji’s Hagiography in Indonesia. There are many traditional Mappilas, men and women, who use to recite this daily, weekly and monthly. Also, there are other popular *Manaqibs* of saintly figures written in *Malappattu* genre of Arabic-Malayalam literature, widely recited on various occasions, though this customs are on decrease these days. One to be mentioned specially is a *Malappattu* describing the *Manaqib* of Nafisat al-Misriyya, called Nafisat Mala. This Mala is recited near a pregnant woman close to delivery, believing that this would make her delivery easy.

14. Pesantren & Pallidarss

It was mentioned earlier that resemblances in Islamic culture are strongly related to the answers for questions of ‘who taught them what’, and here we see the traditions of *Pesantren* and *Pallidarss*. Detailed descriptions of these two traditional systems of religious higher education have been made above, in addition to transformations it underwent due to modernist and secularist pressures. The two systems showed the education career of a traditional Islamic scholar in both the places. It shed light on the legacy of production and dissemination of Islamic knowledge in these two peripheral non-Arab Muslim societies, which have constantly kept in touch with the mainland and centre of Islamic culture and knowledge. Here we just do a passing mention of the resemblances as well as differences in the two systems.

We see four minimum basic elements in a *Pesantren* - the pondok (dormitories), the mosque, the study of classical Islamic *kitab* (texts), the *Santri* (students), and the *Kiai* (leader). In the *Pallidarss* also we see the same ingredients. However, instead of a separate lodging facility, the *Pallidarss* in Kerala utilizes the *Masjid* itself as the dormitory. Here the difference in *Masjid* construction can also be seen. The researcher could not see any storied mosque outside Kerala, other than mosques built outside by Malayali Muslim Diaspora.
Some of the major differences between Pallidarss and Pesantren include; the education in Pallidarss is completely free. The students have nothing to pay. Besides, the resident community and well-wishers often give them Hadya and Sadaqa in cash and kind, or as remuneration for different religiously-valued rituals they do for them. In Pesantren, the student has to find out his living expenses, though the education is free for them. Traditionally, they use to work for the Kiai in their paddy fields, etc, in order to maintain the expenses they incur. In Pallidarss, the students get the food from houses, or the committee arranges a canteen for the students adjacent to the mosque, or the resident members entrust hotels in the locality to feed the students – in all the ways the students have not to think about his food expenses as well as its preparation.

In most of the Pesantrens the expense of the food as well as the responsibility of its preparation is upon the students. In the Pallidarss system, it is the Mahallu committee that bears all the expenses and takes all the responsibility of installing and running a Pallidarss. The Mudarris is an employ under them. The committee would pay him, and he has not to think about finding the financial expenses of the Pallidarss. In the Pesantren system it is the Kiai himself responsible for the running and finding expenses of the Pesantren. Moreover, the chief Kiai own the Pesantren property, mostly he would have inherited it from his forefathers. In many Pesantren villages, the Pesantren Kiai happens to be the richest man, or the elitist person, among all of the residents. His house will be the one with all the facilities. In case of Mudarris of Pallidarss, they generally do not be rich people, and they depend upon the salary and other remunerations from the Mahallu committee under which the Pallidarss is being held.

There are more resemblances than differences among the Pesantren Kiai and Pallidarss Musliyar. Both are very influential people, and they have a very good influence over the common people. Being religious heads and somebody who live with piety, people approach them for all their religious issues. Many believe that a prayer spoken by them is powerful than of a common person. One should always remember that only pious, scholarly, exemplary and God-fearing Kiai/Musliyar get this respect and reckoning in both the places. Others might be getting some expressed respects. However, people respect with full heart those above-mentioned religious heads only. They use to visit such
Kiai/Musliyar, kiss their hands, ask them to pray, eat the remnants of their meal, be ready to do any kind of service for them, help them meet all their material needs – all in a belief that such forms of closeness with the Kiai/Musliyar brought them religious merit. There is also some Kiai/Musliyar who, besides doing the pastoral functions, engage in activities like healing, counseling, and rituals to ward off danger.

Both Kiai and Musliyar dress in an indigenous style. However, the dress of Musliyar and their students are closer to the Arab culture than that of the Kiai. Dhoti and Shirt is a typical Malayali dress. The religious students and teachers of Malayali Muslims insist to use white Dhoti and Shirt, in addition to white turban neatly tied covering the head. If not Turban they use skull-cap. Many insist to tie the turban over the cap. This dress is said to be a localized form of Yemeni dressing style. All Pallitarsses and traditional religious institutions adopt this dressing as a compulsory one. People generally frown upon a religiously educated person if he dresses in other common styles. In Java, the dress of the Pesantren milieu is sarong, checkered shirt and a black skull-cap called kopia. Wearing white dress is not necessary for the religious men. According to the researcher's experience, only scholars from the Sayyid family or respected Arab families use to wear white dress, in the way Keralite 'Ulama do.

Meanwhile, two habits of Kiai in Java will be quite embarrassing for their counterparts in Kerala. One is the widespread habit of cigarette-smoking among both the Kiai and Santri. It is never frowned upon in the Pesantren milieu, and mostly the Santri take up the smoking habit either from their Kiai or senior Santris. Thick smokes of cigarettes would dominate any Kiai gathering. Though the government-regulated Indonesian 'Ulama Council has issued fatwas discouraging the habit, it seems that smoking would stay in the Pesantren milieu for a long time. In the Pallidarss milieu of Kerala, smoking is considered a big taboo. There are only a very few religious persons who take up the habit, and even they get frowned eyes from all parts. The second one is the habit of shaving the beard. Most of the big religious 'Ulama this researcher met during the fieldwork do not keep any beard and they do a clean shaving, something considered a forbidden thing among the religious scholars in Kerala.
Traditionalist scholars in both the society keep same kind of theological positions in issues they have conflict of opinions with the modernists of their land. The issues being discussed between the modernists and traditionalists are almost same, like the tawassul, istigasa, visitation of qabar, the language of Friday Jumu’a Khutuba, rituals related to death, Mawlid, ratib, etc. Meanwhile, a major difference could be seen among the traditionalists in Java and Kerala. It is regarding women’s participation in public issues. What the researcher could understand is that there are no much debates going on regarding this issue, because traditionally Javanese society is known for the participation of their women in all kind of public affairs from farming to office works. Rather than putting a total ban on public participation of their women folk, they have streamlined it for the better. The researcher could meet a number of big women scholars and it is a common thing for Indonesians, be they traditional or modern, to send their girls for Pesantren education and get many of them higher-educated in religious subjects and to make them ‘Aalima and Ustada (feminine forms of ‘Aalim and Ustad). The traditionalist NU has a women wing with nation-wide branches and widespread activities. Female students in NU-affiliated Pesantren enthusiastically participate in such activities165. There are many female officials working in the NU headquarters at Karamat Raya, Jakarta. The traditionalists generally keep a balanced approach regarding women’s participation in mosque activities. When enquired, many traditionalist scholars said that they would not encourage women’s participation in the mosque Jama’at and all, instead they would encourage them to offer prayer at home, and at the meantime they would not prevent those who want to come and attend the mosque. However, as they see Jumu’a is not wajib (compulsory obligation) for them, they don’t come. Otherwise, those who work outside and who will be on travelling they would come and participate in the Jama’at. As far as traditionalist scholars in Kerala are considered women’s participation in public affairs is strongly discouraged and frowned upon. We mentioned earlier that there has not been any attempt until recently to give female students any kind of higher education in

165 In a Karawang Mosque, 2 hours from Jakarta, the researcher could meet a number of big traditionalist female Islamic scholars gathered to participate in a scholarly discussion regarding Isra and Mi’raj. Placed separately on the other and outer sides of the mosques, they were also carrying kitabs with them to make their points. All the volunteers in charge of food for that gathering were female activists of NU.
religious issues other than through the occasional wa'az programs. Traditionalists in Kerala insist that if somebody takes any religious class for women they should do it behind a veil. A female organization on the traditionalist line is simply unthinkable. They strongly oppose the modernists like Mujahid and Jama‘at for instituting separate organizational platforms for women, and for hailing women to the mosque. No women are allowed to offer prayers at any mosques belonging to the traditionalist Sunnis, save some recent developments that caused construction of some facilities adjacent to Sunni Mosques in towns and on the side of highways in order to allow travelling women to offer their prayers. One can see that in such places it would be written that the particular facility is strictly for women on travel.

To be linked to a working network of ‘Ulama, their students and of those who are spiritually related to them is a characteristic of traditional religious higher education system in both the places. In the Pallidarss/Pesantren milieu ‘who teaches you’ is an important question, and one’s quality is evaluated equally on ‘who his teacher was’. While writing the biography of one scholar, it is a common thing to mention the names of teachers and the names of the Pesantren/Pallidarss one got their religious training. Young teachers would send their students after certain stage to their main teachers. This network, and schooling under the influence of this network, can amply explain one aspect of all religious divisions among both the communities. People in the network would follow the big teacher they have spiritual connection with when they come up with new ideas, differing perspectives, or theological debates, even though they didn’t clearly understand the differing views or get convinced with the new theological opposition his teacher has made.

The Pesantren/Pallidarss played a key role in consolidating the traditionalist authority and support when both the places witnessed modernization and secularization and the consequent emergence of a number of religious organizations since the onset of 20th century. We discussed the structure of the ensuing theological differences, divisional platforms, and multi-faceted activities in the second and third chapters. Whereas the Pesantren, its Kiai and Santri became the backbone of the traditionalist movement Nahdlatul ‘Ulama in Java, it was the Pallidarss, the Musliyars, their students and the
ubiquitous _Mahallu_ system that helped traditionalist _Samastha_ consolidate its power and authority. In both the places, though the modernists triggered powerful opposition and attracted many people with a lot of well-appealing propaganda, the majority community remained traditional due to the influence and strength of these traditional systems of education.

Striking resemblances emerge when the curriculum and syllabus of _Pesantren_ and _Pallidarss_ are compared. The majority of the Arabic texts known as _Kitab Kuning_ in Java are known in the _Pallidarss_ milieu of Kerala. Whereas the Javanese scholars authored a number of commentaries, super commentaries, explanatory works and glosses on the major classical Arabic texts in order to make its understanding easy for _Pesantren_ students, Kerala scholars also did the same for _Pallidarss_ and _Shari’a_ colleges there. While some Kerala-borne texts have found places in the syllabus of _Pesantren_, like _Fathul Mu’in_ and _Adkiya_, no Indonesian works are found in Kerala system, and even no works from that region is known in Kerala, despite the prolific Javanese writer Nawawi Al-Bantani having written a commentary on _Qurrat al-‘Ain, Matn of Fathul Mu’in_, in the name of _Nihayatul Zain_.

The approach to the studies of Quran and _Hadith_ and the _Usul_ of both is same in _Pesantren_ and _Pallidarss_. These two had no much importance earlier. Both teach _Jalalain_ and _Baidawi_ in _Tafsir_ while other _Tafsirs_ are used for references.

The _Asha’ari- Shafi-Gazali_ influence in theology, Jurisprudence and _Tasawwuf_ respectively is at the heart of syllabuses at both _Pallidarss_ and _Pesantren_. The texts of _Sanusi_ and _jawahir al-Kalamiyya_ are known in _Ash’arite ‘Aqida_. Other than this, _Pesantren_ teach many locally authored texts. The absence of _Sharah al-‘Aqida_ in the _Pesantren_ syllabus is highly notable, while it is a major text in Kerala syllabus.

In _Fiqh_, the bigger texts are almost same like _fathul mu’in, Mahalli_ and _Tuhfa_. In the primary level localized modifications are done, but both based on _Shafi Madhhab_. Bruinessen talks about popularity in _Pesantren_ of four genealogical trees of works in _Shafi fiqh_, descending from Rafi’i’s _Muharrar_, Abu Shuja’ al-Isfahani’s _Taqrib_ (or
Mukhtasar), 'Abdallah b. 'Abd al-Karim Ba-Fadl’s *Al-muqaddima al-hadramiyya* and Malibari’s *Qurrat al-'Ayn* respectively. 'Ulama in both the places consider Ibn Hajar’s commentary on Nawawi’s *Minhaj al-talibin* the most authoritative, followed by Ramli’s commentary. They prefer Ibn Hajar in cases of differences between these authorities. While the Taqrib family is the most popular in Indonesia, *Fathul Mu'in* is obviously the most popular in Kerala. The Taqrib family is rarely used in Pallidarss milieu, whereas the *Al-muqaddima al-hadramiyya* family is known, though not popular, and taught in some institutes like Darul Huda. Other non-textbook classic *Kitabs of fiqh* are equally known in both the places and are frequently referred by Musliyar/Kiai.

The immense care and unending insistence on teaching classical Arabic grammar are common in both the places. There are many common texts in the syllabus like *Zanjan*. *Pesantren* utlises many different texts like *'Imriti, Mutammima, Ajrumiya*, etc., while *Pallidarss* use many texts authored by Ponnani scholars. Though the Ponnani *Alfiyah* is not known in Java, the love with *Alfiyah* and the style of its learning is almost same. One of the big differences in teaching the instrumental sciences is in the syllabus for Rehtoric or *Balaga* (with its subdivisions of *bayan, ma’anis*, and *badi*’). There is no any trace in *Pesantren* syllabus of *Mutawwal* and *Muqtasar* which are considered as decisive texts in Kerala *Pallidarss* system. Instead of this, two other classical *kitab* dominate the *Pesantren* curriculum; *Jauharul Mknun* and *Uqudul Juman*.

The other major difference comes in the *Ma’aqulat* subjects. While the *Pesantren* has a very low-profile presence of these subjects, the preeminence of these subjects in the *Pallidarss* syllabus is obvious. No texts of *Mantiq, Falsafa, Falak, Hisab* and *Kalam* are included in a regular syllabus of *Pesantren*. I was told that there are special teachers and special *Pesantren* where these subjects are specialized and only those who are highly interested in it would go to study it. However, the subjects and texts famous in these areas of knowledge are conspicuously absent in all the sources regarding the *Pesantren* tradition. *Sullamul Munauraq fi 'Ilm al-mantiq* by al-Akhdari (the author of *Al-jawhar al-maknun*) is s widely used textbook in *Mantiq*. Damanhuri’s commentary on this, *Idah al-mubham min ma’Ani al-sullam*, is also popular in Indonesia. In addition to this there are some other commentaries and glosses.
Meanwhile, the entire group of texts known in Kerala Pallidarss in these Ma'aqulat subjects is almost unknown in Pesantren. The conclusion one can reach at regarding this is that the syllabus of Pallidarss curriculum, initiated by Ponnani Makhdum scholars was similar to what it is continued so far in Pesantren of Indonesia. The importance on Fiqh, Ash'ari theology, Ghazalian Tasawwuf and Arabic grammar, in addition to Tafsir (jalalain and Baidawi) and moralistic Hadith was the characteristic of this syllabus. All the timely modification occurred following the changes in, and in accordance to the contacts with, the Arabs.

At the same time, the Kerala Pallidarss syllabus underwent a radical change following the establishment of Vellur’s Baqiyat Arabic College and large scale presence of Malayali knowledge-seekers there. Baqiyat was, as we discussed above, inspired by Nizami Syllabus which had its main focus on rational or intellectual sciences flourished in Persian-Arabic Islamic culture, developed and promoted by epochal scholars like Taftazani, Dawwani, Jurjani, and others. The Pesantren did not get that influence upon their syllabus and curriculum. Now the modern Islamic colleges of Kerala that are fast replacing the traditional Pallidarss system has adopted a new approach towards this rational subjects reducing its presence in their syllabi.

Finally, we have seen the new trends in the field of Islamic education being taking place at both the places. The new changes cannot be taken and dealt with in one setting, because one can see a lot of differences in the focus, aim, objective, education philosophy, vision and mission of each new experiment in this field. Majority of the new experiments are based on the objective that the graduates of the religious institutions should not be left out of the mainstream job-market. The impact of job-oriented western education on the religious education system is so rampant that almost everybody in the field has started asking questions like ‘what is the job-value of this subject’, ‘why we should learn that knowledge’, ‘what we can earn with this’, ‘why we should include this fruitless complex text in the curricula’, etc, and most of the experiments go after answering these questions, and end up with a tailor-made syllabus that would produce a good and qualified job-seeker, but never a good, prolific and qualified religious scholar in the genre of the old greats, who were experts in diverse fields of knowledge.
simultaneously. The era of specialization has also claimed its toll on religious education system. In the olden days, to be a specialist in one branch of knowledge meant simply that he has in-depth and more-than-others knowledge in that field, but he will be equally efficient in other fields. What emerged in the study is that the efforts to produce a true religious ‘Aalim (‘Ulama/ Kiai/Musliar) are very less, and most of the efforts are to produce ‘Muslim intellectuals’. The difference between these two terms can be recognized from among the common people from all walks of life who still look to the traditionally-trained religious scholar for their religious issues.

One highly positive transformation was noticed in the new trends of religious higher education in Java. Thanks to the government’s initiative, a number of Islamic universities are functioning in the country, attracting a big chunk of its student community from the Pesantren background. To put it another way, the Pesantren graduates are getting a big chance to be part of the formal higher education through this system of state Islamic universities. The most positive trend in this is that the university setting has enormously decreased the enmity among theological groups and a kind of intellectual as well as healthy dialogue are taking place among students from diverse background.

This can explain the existing healthy and cordial relations between the two major religious groups – NU and Muhammadiyyah. Most of the present-day leaders of these two groups used to meet and be friends in the universities, which equally open doors for any student from any background. In a university campus, the mode of dialogue and debate becomes friendlier, and this gives them a good chance to understand each other and realize the differences, and moreover, to realize that there are chances to be different in views, perspectives and theological positions. Though the government-run Arabic colleges and Arabic departments at the secular colleges and universities are doing this job among the diverse groups of Kerala Muslims, it would take a long time for Muslims in Kerala to reach at this very much friendly stage.

166 While visiting Sayyid Shyarif Hidayatullah state Islamic University, Jakarta, the researcher stayed in a small house rented by a group of senior students at Pusat, close to university. My host Miftahul Huda, a Pesantren graduate from Jombang, was a top leader of NU’s youth wing. Meanwhile, one of his roommates was a graduate from a modernist Pesantren and was working as an office assistant in the headquarters of Muhammadiyyah in Jakarta.