CHAPTER IX

CONCLUSION

Analysis

Preliminary Remarks - The reasons for the composition of great works during a particular period namely the 8th century to 14th century A.D. - The encouragement and Patronisation to Sanskrit Works by Muslims Kings with causes thereof - The decline of Sanskrit in Kashmir - Concluding remarks.
CHAPTER (IX) NINE

CONCLUSION

In winding up this thesis it may be stated at the outset that the contribution of Kashmir has not only embraced various branches of Sanskrit Literature but also has been an eye-opener in most of them. What was unknown in other parts of India and not thought of in any other country has been dealt with by Kashmirians from all aspects in a remarkable manner with a high degree of originality and perfection which cannot be met with anywhere else. New paths are traversed, new theories are expounded and new schools of thought are organised in a systematic and methodical manner to the amazement of scholars all over India and the world. The causes for this are not far to seek. They are mainly due to the strategic position of Kashmir where natural scenes exist in abundance and upon which the Divine Grace has been showered in plenty from time immemorial. The entire land of the happy valley of Kashmir is Uma herself according to an account given in the Neelamatapurāṇa. It was created by the sage Kasyapa as described therein. It is Kasyapapuri or Kasmirakaśyapi in the words of Jonarāja and Saradādēsa in the words of Bilhana.

1) तपस्वी देवि कश्मीरा तपस्विनीमा व्रती रिति ||
तपस्वी सरास्त्री नृत्तिनिदेवि संस्थिता || (N.M.P.P.25)

2) श्रीगोङिन्नङ्गुलिकावङ्गुलाकङ्कः निः हि
काश्मीर रक्षारथी सूपर्साति गुणशास्तिः || (Jon.Rāj.v.4)

3) सहोदरः कुमालकरणां नवतिति वृत्ती कविताविलासः ||
न शारदादेश्यपार्याः उष्ट्टिलस्य यवन्नति मया प्ररोहः || (Vik.I.v.21)
as already stated in the previous chapter. It has a rich recorded cultural history from the earliest times. It was one of the earliest homes of the Aryans where the first Vedic hymns were composed in all their beauty and grandeur. Sanskrit was a spoken language in Kashmir. Even women and children could speak in that language as fluently as they could in their mother tongue. Lastly Kashmir has been a meeting place of various cultures and religions with ample opportunities at every stage for the mutual exchange of views and a free policy of give and take. The new ideas which emanated from Kashmir to enlighten the masses outside its geographical boundary are mainly the inevitable outcome of such a coalition of cultures and synthesis of religious and social contacts. These are the main factors which helped such a wonderful mass of literature being produced by Kashmirians.

The names of various works written by Kashmirians on various subjects are at present lying scattered in different places and references. In some cases it is doubtful if the writer is really from Kashmir. All the names of such works are collected together in one place in this thesis under the relevant chapter or section according to the nature of the work. The works are discussed in all their aspects such as authorship, the subject matter, the availability, the date of the author and the composition, the commentaries on each one of them and the importance and utility from the point of view of this thesis. It is, therefore, now possible to have a fairly good idea at one glance how much Kashmir has contributed to each branch of Sanskrit Literature (poetics, poetry, philosophy, grammar, history, satire and miscellaneous) and how va-
valuable and useful the entire contribution is to the country and to the world.

The contribution to Sanskrit Literature suffered a serious setback in Kashmir with the advent of Muslim Rule there. The effect of this was that Sanskrit not only ceased to be a spoken language but also a written language. Its place has now been taken by Kashmiri, an Apabhramsa of Sanskrit formed by the intermixture of the Persian language. The development of Sanskrit Literature is now practically at a stand still in Kashmir. So the contribution from Kashmir from the earliest times upto the 17th or the 18th century A.D. at the most is dealt with in this thesis. It can be seen from a glance at this thesis that there are in all 210 writers from Kashmir on various subjects of whom 15 are original writers on poetics, 15 are commentators on nāṭya and alankārasastras, 20 are major poets, 12 are royal poets, 14 are minor poets, 15 are grammarians, 4 are vedic commentators, 29 are writers on Kashmir Saivism, 8 are Buddhist Philosophers, 4 are other writers on philosophy, 7 are historians, 25 are miscellaneous writers and 42 are those whose works have not yet been discovered. The total magnitude of the contribution of all these writers works upto nearly 400 works of which the major portion has been taken up by Abhinavagupta, Kṣemendra and Kṣemarāja to whom as many as 42, 38 and 20 works respectively have been ascribed.

If the responsibility of framing rules for the composition of good poetry has been voluntarily taken up by Kashmir on its own shoulders as could be seen from the large number of works on poetics written by Kashmirians it is mainly not only due to the condu-
conducive environments in which it is situated but also due to the spontaneous and insurgent flood of ideas that rushed into the fertile brains of scholars of the type of Bhāmaha, Udbhaṭa, Ānandavardhana, Abhinavagupta, Māmata and others. So the Alankāraśāstra had to take its birth there. No other place than Kashmir was worthy for its auspicious origin as the atmosphere was lovely and salubrious there. Several schools of thought successively sprouted mulp placing before the world of scholars one or the other requisite of good poetry as the essential one. For example, Udbhaṭa founded the Alankāra school and was supported by Rudraṭa and also Rudrabhaṭṭa; Vāmana started the Riti School and Ānandavardhana originated the Dhvani School.

As opposed to these three initial schools that started functioning, three more schools namely Rasa, Vakrokti and Aucitya were established by Bhāṭṭanāyaka, Kuntala and Kṣemendra respectively. Though Kṣemendra did not refute the Dhvani theory, the other two namely Nāyaka and Kuntala supported by Mahimabhāṭṭa put up a stern fight against the Dhvani theory and even went to the extent of disproving its existence. But they could not succeed in eclipsing the Dhvani theory. Still, it is pleasing to note that there was in Kashmir, a move for opposing even the all-pervading Dhvani theory. If at all it proves anything it shows the existence of critical acumen and intellectual stamina among Kashmir scholars and the ability that exists in them to put up new and novel ideas before the circle of critics and scholars. But unfortunately the work of Bhāṭṭanāyaka exists only in fragments and that of Kuntala remains undeciphered in the 3rd and the 4th chapters though a transcribed copy
copy of the manuscript is available in the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poona.

The possibilities of reconstructing the work of Bhattacharyya from the available fragments of his work are discussed in the thesis and an elaborate account of the unpublished 3rd & 4th Chapters of Kuntala's work is also given to the extent possible, with a view to unearth what exactly is contained in it. Though the idea of Vakrokti was there from the earliest times, the credit of analysing it in a proper manner and pointing out its inevitability in good poetry goes to Kuntala without doubt. The value of his work from the point of view of originality and utility is discussed at length with apt quotations from the unpublished text in which the kārīkas and the vrūtē are so mixed up as not to enable separation being effected between them easily. But still, the broad lines on which the entire topic is handled could be understood. It is in deed very interesting to read the minute classification into which he divides vakrata as existing in words, phrases, sentences, incidents and even in plots as a whole. Apart from the opposition it presents to the Dhvani theory, the novel way in which the idea of vakrata is treated does not fail to win the admiration of scholars. There is no doubt that this particular topic did not originate anywhere else and so the glory of Kashmir remains unchallenged in this respect.

Even so in respect of the Hṛdayadarpana of Bhattacharyya. The dominant part that rasa plays in poetry and the several phases of its existence seem to have been dealt with in it as could be gathered from the fragments that are available in several works. For
For instance Abhinavagupta quotes frequently with deep reverence. Though he opposed the Dhvani theory, Abhinavagupta quotes him and twists the interpretation by saying that he does not fundamentally differ from the view of the exponent of the Dhvani theory. This no doubt reveals the master mind of Abhinavagupta but still it cannot help disclosing the value that scholars derived from his work.

The prince of commentators is Abhinavagupta whose masterly exposition of the Dhvani theory and the principles of Nātyaśāstra in his Abhinavabhāṣātī stands unexcelled even to-day. In some places the commentary is more authoritative and forceful than the original itself as has already been pointed out in the Chapters on poetics of this thesis. The speciality about his commentaries is that he quotes a number of earlier critics and analyses the views of each one of them. Even when he condemns them he does so in a dignified and graceful manner. His Himalayan contribution to philosophy is not only unique and original but also rich and remarkable. It is impossible to gauge the depth of his scholarship. He was not satisfied with one teacher and not even with a good number of them. His thirst and hunger for knowledge were so acute that he had to go in quest of teachers like the bee hovering from flower to flower in search of honey. ¹ There were many in Kashmir who followed in the footsteps of this wonderful teacher who has been rightly honoured with the title 'वाचायमान.' with which he is more popularly known than by his real name.

It is no wonder then that Kālidāsa too, the national poet of

¹) बासुदेवाच्य यथा २३२: पुष्पाकुण्यान्तः प्रेमतः।
विज्ञानाच्य तथा किञ्च गुरोऽपेक्षाः प्रेमतः। (T.A.Ahn.XIII.v. 335)
of India, must have been born in Kashmir. It looks as though every scene in his dramas is laid somewhere in and around Kashmir and every description of natural landscape on the Himalayas in his Kumārasambhava and Meghadūta reminds us of some sacred spot in Kashmir and modern places are identified with those spots. It has rightly been conjectured by some scholars that the birth-place of Kalidāsa must be somewhere in Kashmir. Composition of poetry and original works in Kashmir was as natural as the growth of grapes and kumkum there. There were royal poets, grammarians and Vedic commentators who contributed their share to Sanskrit Literature. While Kśemendra wrote satirical works describing the several facets of society in Kashmir, Kśemarāja wrote learned commentaries on the philosophical works of Vasugupta, Somānanda and Abhinavagupta on Kashmir Śaivism. If Bhāṭotpala wrote on astrology and astronomy Śāṅgadeva wrote on music and medicine. The credit of writing chronicles and historical kāvyas also goes to Kashmir resulting in the stupendous production of Raṭātarangini in quick succession by Kalhana and his faithful line of disciples, Jonarāja, Śrivara, Prājyabhāṭa and Suka. Similarly anthologies are written by Śrivara and Vallabhaddeva, prayer-poems by Jagaddhara, Ava-tāra and Gopaḷa and ethical works by Kśemendra and Bhallata. All these definitely indicate the great past of a great land. Dr. Kaumudi rightly observes as follows: - "Kashmir has all though its history been a great seat of arts and learning. Here flourished from days of yore various schools of thought and culture. Art and Literature blossomed forth, bringing in their train influences and inspirations from the different parts of the world."

"The ancient Aryans, when they set their foot on Indian soil,
soil, made Kashmir, with the high mountain ranges of the Himalayas, one of their earliest homes. Seekers of truth and knowledge came here from different nooks and corners of the then known world to seek solace and inspiration from the eternal mountains. Religions and creeds grew and throve there, and then spread enlightenment to other regions of Asia. Thus a distinctive cultural and spiritual tradition was founded and many a great shrine and monument, reminding the people of this tradition, was raised in different parts of the great Valley. These architectural ruins and remnants are to-day the embodiment of those great spiritual achievement."

"How vividly do these scattered ruins, though half-crumpled and faded, confirm the praise bestowed upon the Kashmiris in the Rajatarangini! ... What greater praise could these monuments elicit for a people who have still preserved their ancient traditions of refinement and grace?"¹

It can now be concluded that there was a great impetus for the composition of new and original works in Kashmir only during a particular period namely from the 8th century to the 14th century A.D. Not only many works were written but also in many branches of learning. Thus works on poetics practically commenced from the 8th century A.D. with Udbhata if not Bhāmarti. Similarly works on the Trika system of philosophy also began to be written about the same time and historical works also fall in the same period. The reasons for this are clear and specific. Firstly the literary glory of Kashmir was at its zenith during this period. Secondly foreign ambassadors like Fahian, Hiuentsang and Itsing visited India so that

¹) P. 28 of Kashmir, Its Cultural Heritage.
that there was ample opportunity for exchange of ideas between the great nations of the world especially China, Persia and Greece. The Kings that ruled Kashmir were not only enlightened but also generous. For instance Kings like Jayāpīḍā and Avantivarman were not only patrons but also poets themselves who understood the real intrinsic worth of learning and knew how to honour those who dedicated their lives at the feet of the Goddess of learning. If it were not so it would have been impossible for King Jayāpīḍā to have gladly parted with one lakh gold coins as daily salary to Udbhata, the President of the Royal Assembly of Poets during his time. Kalhana has very characteristically stated that during his time King Jayāpīḍā invited scholars from all parts of India in such large numbers that there was poverty of men of merit there. It was a seat of learning whose fame had reached the nooks and corners of not only India but also of the world. The environments and the natural gifts of the land were highly conducive for fine production from the pens of poets and philosophers.

Particular mention must be made, in this connection, of the extraordinary encouragement that was given to Sanskrit learning during this period (especially the latter part) even by Muslim Rulers such as king Zainulabidin, Sultan Hassa-nshah and Emperor Akbar. They were not only noble and cultured but also extremely broad-minded. They could not think with aprejudice or a bhas of any kind whatsoever, because they had assimilated the real essence of their scriptures and had understood that all religions speak of the same universal God and merge in Him like all the rivers in the

---
1) Rāj. IV. v. 495.
the Ocean as stated by Kālidāsa in his Raghuvamsa. It was their samskāra to have devoted their time and attention to poetical and philosophical works in Sanskrit and the Purāṇas and the epics. They were not satisfied with their own enjoyment and utility derived from a deep study of these well-known works. They wanted even those who did not know Sanskrit to reap the benefits of pleasure and usefulness. It was with this intention that they spared no pains in getting most of these works translated into other languages like Persian and Arabic. Great scholars were entrusted with the task of translating them so that they could be within the reach of every citizen in and out of Kashmir. This is what Dr. Kaumudi says on the munificence and magnanimity of Sultan Zainul-abidin:—"Zainulabidin spent large sums of money in collecting rare books from far and near and getting them translated. He founded a library, one of the biggest in the Islamic world of that century. During his last years, which were unhappy because of the dissensions in his family, the Sultan consoled himself with the study of the philosophy of the Yogavāsiṣṭha. He shut himself up in a room and spent his days in hearing from Srivara the Mokṣopāya or the message of Hindu philosophy, as a panacea for all ills and misfortunes of this earthly life." In the same manner there were translations of well-known Persian works into Sanskrit so that the exchange of ideas was mutually and not one-sided.

The bright flame of classical Sanskrit traditions began to flā-

1) कृष्णहृदयमेंमिन्ना: पन्थान: सिक्षितव:।
त्वस्कृत निषिद्धकोष जान्त्वीया व्यापके।।
(R.X.v.26)

2) P. 46 of Kashmir Its Cultural Heritage
flicker and fall after the death of King Zaimulabidin. The Hindu society in Kashmir began to disintegrate and marked the decline of Sanskrit study. Persian language began to spread its influence on the masses and have its strong-hold on them. The enthusiasm for Sanskrit Learning and composition of beautiful works began to gradually disappear. Its place was taken by a local language namely Kashmiri which was born afresh by a mixture of Persian and Sanskrit. The land which was the living place of the Goddess of learning and where the growth of poetry was so luscious and lavish along with saffron and sugar-cane in the words of the great poet Bilhana, yielded to foreign influences and suffered a tremendous fall from the throes of which it has not yet recovered. But still, the rich heritage which has descended through the blood among the Kashmirians down to the present day is visible even in the compositions of the vernacular. For instance the lofty teachings and tenets of Kashmir Saivism are found in the verses composed in Kashmiri by Lalla, the woman philosopher of Kashmir. This spontaneity in the composition of poetry is visible in the works of modern Kashmir writers although in a language slightly different from Sanskrit.

The cultural background which is imperishable as it is deep-rooted is always there to prompt the Kashmirian writer to produce useful and valuable mass of literature. Dr. Rajendra Prasad, the President of the Indian Republic while inaugurating the 19th All India Oriental Conference in Delhi on the 27th December 1957 has rightly observed as follows in his illuminating address: - "The Indian culture, was similarly flowing through the ages receiving tributes from various other countries, sometimes shrinking, some-
sometimes subdued but ever on the move and ever rising. This is a matter of deep study by those who are in a position to interpret things of the past which has been forgotten in many respects, because that past might enable them to enrich the present and shape their future. .... Our ancestors are accused of ignorance of history and their disregard for history because it was impossible to fix the dates of certain great works and great authors but it matters little for humanity whether a book is written 500 years before or after if it is good in its contents. "1

The people of Kashmir today may be mostly Muslims. The Hindus may be in a minority. They became converts only by force of circumstances as is revealed from the pages of history and as clearly stated in the Rājatarangini of Srivara. They may be speaking Persian or Urdu or Kashmiri. Whatever may be their religion or language or status in society, they cannot remain indifferent to the indigenous traditions of the past and to the inspiration that they derive constantly from beautiful natural surroundings. Even in the songs and verses of modern poets of Kashmir can be seen the reflections of the patriotic feelings in which the beautiful poetry of Bilhana is abounding. "Bilhana", says Dr. Kaumudi, "represents a link in that chain of scholars and missionaries who found patronage and refuge in this 'Land of Milk and Honey' and spread enlightenment to unknown destinations far away beyond the borders."2

The various literary influences and powerful movements that in-

---

1) P. 7 of The Hindu of the 27th December 1957.
2) P. 206 of Kashmir Its Cultural Heritage
influenced Kashmir's cultural and literary past are clearly visible in every line of their poetry. From the point of view of culture and literature, therefore, the interests of Kashmir are completely knit with those of India. Apart from indicating the huge contribution that Kashmir has made to Sanskrit Literature from the earliest times, this thesis helps us also to conclude that Kashmir is a part and parcel of India culturally and socially. It is impossible to think of India and Indian History without Kashmir and its vast and valuable contribution to Sanskrit Literature and thereby to the development of knowledge. An attempt has been made in this thesis to collect together all the contributions of Kashmir to the various branches of literature in Sanskrit with the material that is available at present. What has been done in this thesis looks so small when compared to what yet remains to be done. Therefore a frantic effort must be made to unearth and publish all the works that are still there in manuscript form. It is high time that the revival of Sanskrit learning is put into effect in all its implications in India so that Kashmir, ere long, once again occupies the unrivalled position that it occupied in the past as a centre of learning and the seat of Sarada Devi, the Goddess of Learning, so that it may continue to be the Light House guiding many a literary ship in the ocean of learning as it did for centuries in the glorious past.

-----oo00oo-----