Chapter II

Review of literature

1.0 The problem of Text and the Context:

Though texts may not really define what the con-text is, yet its importance in representing that con-text cannot be ruled out. Most of the empiricist scholars believe that there is an objective reality of the RURAL, yet their perception is nothing but an interpretation of the world of TEXT. Therefore, the present study tries to combine both the text and the reality of the empirical world and thereby try to reorient the study on rural community. It means social science is not and has never been a neutral enquiry into human behavior and institutions. It is strongly implicated in the project of social control, whether by the state or other agencies that ultimately server the interests of dominant groups.

Michel Foucault observes, putting a new spin on the familiar saying' "Knowledge is power"4, that the citizens of modern democracies are controlled less by naked violence or the economic power of the boss and the landlord than by the pronouncements of expert study, organized in what he calls "regimes of truth - sets of understanding which legitimate particular social attitudes and practices. Evidently programmes of social scientific research have contributed to regimes of truth. In studying and presenting the facts of this phenomenon, they have both helped to construct particular people as targets for social control and influenced the form a the control itself will take. Hence, social science texts explains the relations

---

between researcher and the researched, and the kind of ethics that govern them. For if the experience of social actors is language and culture dependent, and if we grant that there are many languages and cultures, a number of problems for social science present at once. For instance, the existence of differing and shifting conceptual frameworks, and the difficulty of translating from one to another rises the question: can the researcher situate himself/herself within the conceptual framework of the researched and thereby understand what is going on? And can he or she give an account of this “otherness” for an audience of readers who can relate to his or her conceptual frameworks. But not the framework of his or her subjects? Keeping these questions, therefore, one has to arrive at a ‘meaningful construction of rural community’ so that a space for dialogue could be evolved. With these intentions let’s now review the literature below.

1.1 Review of Literature on Indian Rural Community:
Let us begin with the review of the Govt reports on The issue. The Fourth Evaluation Report of the Community Development Program\(^5\) identified a wide disparity in distribution of benefits as a serious weakness in the working of CD program. Within the blocks it pointed out disparities between accessible and remote villages and, within villages between cultivators and other classes. And among cultivators it found greater amount of benefits going to those with bigger land holdings and those with larger financial resources than those who are less privileged. It observed that the intention of the program was to make it a people's program with Government participation but in practice the roles had been reversed. One more intriguing aspect, which continues to be true even today is that these bodies are dominated by economically privileged sections of society and

have as such facilitated the emergence of oligarchic forces eating away benefits to weaker sections.

Secondly, an assessment of the Integrated Rural Development Program in Ramanathapuram and Dharmapuri Districts of Tamil Nadu (MIDS, 1980: 47) concluded that small farmers and marginal farmers were relatively favoured vis-a-vis the agricultural labourers in terms of program participation resulting in a marginal impact on poverty alleviation. Yet the people became objects rather than agents of their own contexts.

Thirdly, The Seventh Report of the Program Evaluation organization noted that the concept of community participation was not effectively incorporated in the Community Development Program. Since the fulfillment of targets had been a yardstick of success, there was, in many cases, a tendency to inflate the component of people's participation though in reality it was not effectively incorporated in the Program. An evaluation of the Small farmers, Marginal Farmers and Agricultural Labourers Programs concluded that, "Low participation rate in program was attributed to procedures laid down and non-suitability of facilities of the schemes.

Though the republic of Indian Govt. intended to involve rural communities in the path of development and progress, the above reports point out that these were forced on them and not really taking their consent in formulating and implementing the program.

---

6 For particulars, See, Hanovar et.al, 1984 & Mukhopadyay et.al, MIDS Research 1984. The studies in other states have also arrived at more or less similar conclusions. For particulars, See, Government of India, the seventh Evaluation report on community development and allied fields, Vol. I. New Delhi, PEO, Planning commission, 1960: 95 and 171

Though decentralization of democracy was conceived through Panchayath Raj system, yet as Ashok Mehta committee report on the Performance of PRIs\textsuperscript{9} has this to say: there has been a political factionalism that rendered developmental thrusts as warped or diluted. It also points that corruption, inefficiency, scant regard for procedures, political interference in day-to-day administration, parochial loyalties, motivated actions, power concentration instead of service consciousness have all seriously limited the utility of panchayath Raj for the average villager. Lack of awareness of development schemes was described as the reason for low participation of rural youth in development programs like Training of Rural Youth for Self Employment (TRYSEM) and non-formal education in a study\textsuperscript{10} conducted in four states.

The other researches on the rural community in India did critically look at the context, but failed strategically in evolving a methodology for people's participation. For instance, Shingi Prakash.M, Bluhm Louis.H.(1987) took up studies on 'People's Participation in Irrigation Projects: Changing Patterns in Northwestern India', gave a picture of various aspects of social interaction, trust, dependency and self interest, as they related to participation in development programs. Factors that promote or inhibit participatory behavior are identified as above and trust is shown to be a vital element in successful community participation. But how to translate this in the field, they are rather silent.

Sundaram D and Jayalakshmi D (1986) focus on the policy issues of participatory management of the water use and how over a period of time, water was transformed from a public good/commodity into a private

\textsuperscript{9} Ashoka Mehta Committee, Government of India, 1978: 67.

\textsuperscript{10} The study was conducted by the program evaluation organization of the planning commission as part of the study 21 small farmers development agencies & 17 Marginal farmers & agriculture laborers organization in 17 states of the Country were covered. The NREP & RLEGP were replaced by JRY in 1987. for further reading see (Mathur et. al., 1982: 248).
good/commodity with consequent deconstruction of the traditional participatory system. It is seen that greater the commoditization of inputs in the present activities in rural society, greater the deconstruction of tradition. When this study takes tradition vs. modernity debate, concludes that modernity is not good for the rural people. The study fails to see the politics of tradition in the present context.

The national Institute of Advanced studies, Bangalore, has done a study on the status of rural women in Karnataka. The study points out that the rural development has been gender blind. Hence, it becomes important to be gender sensitive and initiate such programmes that enhances women’s active participation in formulation and implantation of the programs – specially the girl child and women’s health programs. The actual existing conditions in Karnataka either in the assets holdings or the literacy levels when it comes to women are deplorable. Therefore, any meaningful people’s participation should consciously be aware of the categories of class, caste and gender and their actual impact on communities that weak.

Aziz (1993) Decentralization – Mandal Panchayath System in Karnataka, tries to understand the pattern of decentralization prevailing in some selected parts of Karnataka. It records the contours of decentralized governance in Karnataka. Electoral Process, composition of decentralized govt. and power structure, finance, planning and implementation and people’s participation, relations of officials and non-officials, awareness among mebers and general public about the system are some of the important aspects studied in the work. But the same time it identifies the caste and class domination that thwarts the decentralized processes.

1.2 Review of studies done in other countries:

11 For details see, Srilatha Batliwala & co, Status of Rural women in Karnataka, NIAS, 1998, pp.138 to 151.
Johan van zyl, Tulio Barbosa, Andrew N. Parker, and Loretta Sonn (August 1995) have made a case study from Northeast Brazil on 'Decentralized Rural development and Enhanced community Participation'. The study revealed that, the rapid progress could be made if community participation is enhanced and decision-making authority is decentralized to lower levels of government and other institutions. Expansion of the existing community based approach into a local program assign responsibility for the management of physical resources and project implementation for communities, further promoting decentralization of decision making and encouraging greater cost sharing on projects by the people.

Kaseje-Dan-C.-Omino, Sempebwa-Esther-K.-N.(1989) have made study on Integrated Rural Health Project in Saradidi, Kenya. Created in 1979 in a rural community the SHDP was initiated by people from the area with material assistance from within and outside Saradidi, as the community's response to its own problems. The community was involved in the planning, organization, setting of priorities and objectives, implementation, and evaluation of the program. Ten years after its initiation, the SHDP still runs more or less on its own, providing an example for other projects and initiators.

Sokoken,-Darwin-C.(1984) have made study on "Community Participation and Its Role in Rural Development: The Bontoc Case". This study revealed that during the planning & implementation of a rural road project, local government officials ignored the villagers & their traditional institution, the ator, in the planning and initial construction of the road. The participation of the people was on the level of tokenism and placation to appease a populace who violently opposed the project. It is concluded that the local government was ineffective as an instrument of rural development
because the people did not recognize its authority. The Case of a Health Project in the Guatemalan Community of San Pedro la Laguna” was studied by Paul,-Benjamin-D.; Demarest,-William-J.(1984). The community received a three-year grant to build a health clinic and hire a MD. A US health educator, who attempted to organize a representative community committee to enhance community involvement in policy decisions, directed the project. But intriguingly it resulted in an actual decline of community involvement. From the findings four implications for health educators operating in Third World improvement projects are advanced: (1) Do not impose an alternate form of representation if competent leadership is already established. (2) Consider the amenability of local political forces to a community-wide committee. (3) Do not attempt to interfere with decisions once a committee is established. & (4) Attempt to conform the planning scheme to local organization.

LaForgia,-Gerard-M.(1985) made a study on fifteen Years of Community Organization for Health in Panama. “Since the late 1970s, the World Health Organization and other international agencies have emphasized community participation to improve preventive health services and facilities in rural areas. Panama's fifteen years of experience in "community health" provides insight into the constraints to program continuity at the national level and to maintenance of participatory mechanisms (health committees) at the village level. In some areas the program thrives, and the health committees are active; but in most areas, the program functions at a minimal level, and most health committees are inactive. Several factors are identified that affect program success: degree of support from medical directors of district and regional health centers, existence of "federations of health committees," extent of political interference, presence of a functional "technical health team," and degree
of community confidence in health committee officers," the study concluded.

Lackey,-Alvin-S.; Burke,-Judith-L.(1984) have made a study on "Women in Community Development 1970-1980: A Decade of Change". This study examines women's participation in the Community Development Society (CDS) as of 1980-81, specifically investigating total Female membership and the proportion of Female members who serve on the board of directors, hold offices, publish articles in the CDS Journal, and make presentations at annual meetings. Questionnaire responses of Female members showed that although their membership increased (to 125) between 1970 and 1980, their participation in CDS activities remained low, apparently reflecting low interest.

Mora-Ramirez,-Jaime, Salazar-Duque,-Alfredo's study on "A Community-Initiated Water Supply Project in Colombia" (1979) is the experience of a Colombian village, Juanambu, which participated in a government-sponsored water supply and sanitation program. Colombia's National Institute of Health has viewed community participation as a key element in this project, with important planning & implementation responsibilities delegated to regional and local levels-with regard to financing as well as in construction of water systems.

Edwards,-Robert-T.(1971) of Northern Illinois, Gas Co, Aurora have made study on the topic of "Working with Bureaucracy at Community or Village Level" during, and this revealed that, A program developed by Northern Illinois Gas Co emphasized on community participation and helping
communities to help themselves had 3 objectives: (1) to plan and execute improvement projects in attempting to make the communities served more attractive places in which to live & work; (2) assisting businesses, planners and developers in their development and expansion to fulfill community needs; and (3) to help develop a plan for any community requesting assistance in attracting additional retail services and professional people to their community and that the communities, in order to meet the challenges of the '70's, must experience a form of basic education along with lots of hard work and sometimes little appreciation, If they are ever going to stem the tide of deterioration and decay.

Paterno-Vicenta-T's (1989) in their study on 'perspectives on rural development', in the Philippines showed that as far back as the colonial era, the government has been over centralized. While strong central government was effective in times of abundance of land, the rapid Philippine population growth since 1960 has made land scarce, life hard, and central government ineffective. It is suggested that for rural development to succeed, government decentralization must occur. Approaches to rural development must focus on training in farm and non-form skills, social preparation of rural communities (particularly for community organization and cooperatives), and community participation in the delivery of basic services and in building rural infrastructures.

Morgan-Lynn-M. (1990) have made a study on 'international politics and primary health care' in Costa Rica of United States. He analyzed Costa Rica's primary health care service delivery, focusing on the reasons behind the lack of community participation in this otherwise successful program. When the Alma-Ata conference in 1978 specified the principles of rural health care programs, Costa Rica already had an infrastructure in place. However, community involvement had been discouraged. Partisan political
conflict, national elites' fears for political stability, economic recession (especially in 1980), international agency policy shifts, and lack of grassroots efforts, all contributed to the failure of community participation. It is argued that the attitudes of most health workers and community leaders to the causes of ill health are products of class aspirations, and are often different from those of the poor and unhealthy, a situation that impedes the development of true community participation in health care programs. An international "PHC implementation race," which ignores the more difficult goals; inadequate intra-national programs; tactical difficulties in achieving community participation; poor selection, training, and deployment of PHC workers have been found to be possible reasons. Korten (1981:1) made a pointed reference to imposition of central designs regardless of local scenario inhibiting participation in rural areas.

Hoque,- Bilqis-Amin; Hoque,- Mohammed- Moazzam (1994) have made a study on 'partnership in rural water supply and sanitation in Bangladesh'. The effectiveness of multi-agency approach in providing technologies to an un-served population in an efficient way was demonstrated. It presents results from a two year rural water supply and sanitation projects in rural Bangladesh implemented by non-governmental organizations. The project was intended to provide low cost technology for water and sanitation, achieve better collaboration between agencies in water and sanitation services and raise community consciousness of the importance of safe water use and hygiene. Hand pumps, latrines, and hygiene education were provided to rural people through NGO partner. Data obtained during field visits revealed lack of community participation, personal hygienic practices and in effective use and maintenance of the water supply and sanitation provision.

Bah,-O.-M. who conducted a study on 'community participation and rural
water supply development during 1992 in Sierra Leone found that the ineffective use of infrastructure developed was due to ill-conceived community self-help development strategy, and the fact that villager motivation for meeting part of the cost of this program was largely determined by the benefits of an integrated package of services. A case study of the village of Gbonombu, in which a successful water supply strategy was developed, on the other hand, demonstrated the effectiveness of community self-help in promoting development.

Lacky,-Alvin-S.; Dershem,-Larry from Columbia made a study during 1992 entitled "the process is Pedagogy; what does community participation teach?". The study revealed that the identified areas of gain were knowledge of human behavior and of government procedures. Knowledge and skills were closely associated with the participant's level of involvement.

Nturibi,-Daudi-N, Kenya has made a study on "Training of Community Development Agents for Popular Participation" (1982) This study suggested that meaningful community participation in local development requires carefully trained and sensitive staff who can inspire self-reliance and impart necessary skills. A synthesis of plans and strategies for training the trainers of community development extension staff is also needed. These studies focussed on an examination of specific rural development programs.

In an analysis of the delivery system for rural development, Harvey et al.12 (1979: 88) suggested that access to inputs and technological packing of programs were major determinants of participation.

12 Harvey et al. Rural Employment and administration in the third world , Hants, Teakfield Limited, 1979: 88
Tumwine,-James-K. Zimbabwe, have made study entitled ‘Community Participation as Myth or Reality’ during the year 1989. It is argued that the attitudes of most health workers and community leaders to the causes of ill health are products of class aspirations, and are often different from those of the poor and unhealthy, a situation that impedes the development of true community participation in health care programs. Promotion of community participation is time consuming and requires patience, tact, and concern for the communities served the survey found.

Muhondwa,-E.-P.-Y's(1986) study on 'Rural Development and Primary Health Care in Less Developed Countries' highlighted some of the issues that seem to militate against the establishment of primary health care (PHC). It was observed that tendencies in the implementation of PHC in less developed countries lean toward limiting the range of activities to preventive and curative personal health services, neglecting community development aspects.

The question “Building Rural Community Participation in the Planning Process: Is It Possible?” was examined by Dunbar,-Ellen-Russell; Morris,-Lynne-Clemmons during the year 1982. They found that contemporary planning models have been characterized as systems that promote the development of societies controlled by powerful technocratic elite. Rural communities, in particular, have undergone disruptive changes that were the result of decisions made by planners or corporate decision makers in distant metropolitan areas. These criticisms suggest the need for examination of the role of planning within the community organization practice and the possibilities for strengthening citizens' participation in the activities of planning organization in rural areas.
1.3 Classification of the Reviewed Literature:

As we have seen in the above texts that have been reviewed could be broadly classified keeping in the following aspects:

i) Community Development and its limitations in terms of Community participation.

ii) Various Aspects of Community Participation in Community Development.

iii) And what space is given for community participation in community development.

Keeping these aspects when we look at the texts we see that:

i) Most of the texts critically tries to understand the limitations of the govt. projects that aimed community development.

ii) Though some texts do comment on the community participation yet they largely remain at the superficial level.

iii) Some texts only tries to justify NGOs role in development but not a collaborated approach to see the interdependent aspects of policy makers and the people.

iv) A few texts though speak of community development but not much to the present study in specific area concerned.

Hence, when we try to conceptualize the three areas of the present study namely, Community, Government and NGOs in the field of development the above reviewed literature give certain direction to move towards in critical understanding of the various terms in the developmental field.

1.3.1 A Critical Assessment of the above literature:

The above review of third world countries perspectives on rural development shows that their experience of development was the outcome...
colonial experience both colonization and modernity. To overcome the limitations of capitalist modernity various efforts in the field were made and thus peoples’ participation was conceived as the method for emancipation of their situation.

Whereas in India with its own colonial experience, evolved a paradigm of development based on mixed economy, it failed to critically understand the western notion of development. Again the efforts are rather less in the reflection and formulating a people’s perspective on developmental issues. Most of the studies were evaluative in nature. These studies, by and large, looked at structural dimensions or communication aspects of relevant development problems. They identified Participation as a problem. In a descriptive framework of rural development, Cohen and Uphoff (1977:8) examined participation in terms of decision making, implementation, benefits and evaluation. Based on an exhaustive review of research, Haldipur (1974:85) found that investigation of how people belonging to different classes responded to various programs, and whether social stratification has anything to do with the nature of program and the degree of participation was a major research gap in the arena of rural development. Buttressing this need, Checkway and Til (1970: 35) in a selective review of research about community participation pointed out that the previous studies have focussed on the desirability of participation, or on the right, or on competence of community to participate, but few studies examined participation as ‘practice’.

A review of literature in the area of community participation shows that there is not much of research done in this area, especially in India comparing government and non government organizations, between the districts with special reference to rural drinking water supply, sanitation and health promotional programs. As a result there is dearth of literature in
the field of community participation in rural development with multi
dimensional aspects focusing specially on rural water supply sector and
sanitation sector.

This study attempts to fill the gap through document based on an empirical
evaluation study undertaken in 2 districts of Karnataka State selected on a
pattern conducive for critical analysis. It also tries to build a relationship
between Urban dwelling and the rural habitat which were most often
represented as oppositions. At the same time there is also a division
between people and the state. To bridge these gaps learning from various
experiences of people, a democratic institutionalization of the participatory
approach will be taken for further discussion in the following chapters.