Law and Policy Relating to Sex Selection in India

“A Critical Study of the Decided Cases”

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
JIWAJI UNIVERSITY, GWALIOR

FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
In
LAW

SUBMITTED BY
VINAY HASWANI

UNDER THE SUPERVISION OF
PROFESSOR (DR.) N K CHAUHAN
HOD, M.L.B GOVT. COLLEGE OF EXCELLENCE

M.L.B GOVT. COLLEGE OF EXCELLENCE GWALIOR
CONTENTS

Declaration
Certificate
Acknowledgement

Chapter 1: Introduction and Methodology 1-6
1.1 Introduction and Methodology 1
1.2 Myths and Social Reality 2
1.3 Arguments for and Against Sex Selection Technology 3
1.3.1 Moral and Ethical Arguments 3
1.3.2 Legal Arguments 3
1.3.3 Feminist Arguments 4
1.4 The Pre-Conception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques Act 4
1.5 Law and Policy Impacting Sex Selection 5

Chapter 2: The Pre-Conception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques Act, 1994 7-32
2.1 The Pre-Conception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques Act 7
2.2 A History of Legislation 8
2.2.1 The Seventies 8
2.2.2 The Eighties 9
2.2.3 The Nineties 12
2.2.4 The New Century 14
2.3 The Western World and Responses to Sex Selection 14
2.4 The Sex Selection Laws 15
2.4.1 The Maharashtra Act 15
2.5 The Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques Act, 1994 16
2.6 The C E H A T Petition 22
2.7 The Pre-Conception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques Act 25
2.8 Medical Ethics in the Context of Sex Selection, Sex Determination and Sex-Selective Abortion 26
2.9 Approaches to the Problem 28
2.9.1 Point of Prohibition Approach 28
2.9.2 Eggen’s Reproductive Regulation Approach –
   A Three Step Analysis 29
2.9.3 Judith Daar – Regulation in Reproductive Technology
   Approach 30

Chapter 3: Population 33-71
3.1 Population 33
3.2 Introduction 34
3.3 History of Ratio/Sex Ratio Studies: A Partial Reason
   for the Late Legal Response 35
3.4 Family Planning Policy and its Impact on the
   Sex Ratio/Sex Selection 40
3.5 China’s Population Policy:
   Lessons for Law and Policy in India 42
3.6 The Courts and the Two-Child Norm 54
3.7 Incentives and Disincentives 64
   3.7.1 The National Development Council Committee on
   Population (1992) 68
   3.7.2 The National Population Policy (2000) 69

Chapter 4: Infanticide 72-82
4.1 Infanticide 72
4.2 The Colonial Experience 73
4.3 The Chinese Experience 76
4.4 Female Infanticide and Abandonment 79

Chapter 5: Abortion and Sex Selection 83-106
5.1 Introduction 83
5.2 The Abortion Debate as a Feminist Focus 84
5.3 The Medical Profession and Abortion 88
5.4 International Standards on Abortion 95
5.5 Abortion and The Medical Termination of Pregnancy Act, 1971
5.6 Safeguarding Abortion and Preventing Sex Selective
   Abortion in the Future 101
Chapter 6: New Reproductive Technologies and Sex Selection

6.1 Introduction

6.2 Choice Rhetoric and sex Selective Abortions

6.3 Eugenics and New Reproductive Technologies

6.4 Sex Selection – Sex Determination Tests and Sex Selective Technologies

6.5 New Reproductive Technologies in India

6.6 Law and New Reproductive Technologies

6.7 The Way Forward

6.7.1 Amniocentesis

6.7.2 Chorionic Villus Biospy

6.7.3 Ultrasonography

6.8 Sex Selection Techniques

6.9 The Pre-implantation Genetic Diagnosis (PGD)

Chapter 7: Sex Selective Abortion and Violence Against Women

7.1 Sex Selective Abortion and Violence Against Women

Chapter 8: Madhya Pradesh

8.1 Madhya Pradesh

8.2 Sex Ratio in Madhya Pradesh

8.3 Sex Ratio of Madhya Pradesh and Neighbouring States

8.4 Sex Ratio in Districts of Madhya Pradesh

8.5 Child Sex Ratio in Madhya Pradesh

8.6 Child Sex Ratio of Madhya Pradesh and Neighbouring States

8.7 Ranking of Districts by Child Sex Ratio, Rural

8.8 Ranking of Districts by Child Sex Ratio, Urban

8.9 Top and Bottom Five Districts by Child Sex Ratio, Total, Rural and Urban

Chapter 9: Conclusion
9.1 Conclusion 151
9.1.1 Law Reform in Modern Sex Selection Law 153
9.1.2 Policy Changes 154
9.1.3 Implementation of Constitutional Guarantees 155
9.1.4 Creation of Implementation Mechanisms 156
9.1.5 Modification of Criminal Laws and a Relook at Criminalizing Policy 157
9.1.6 Making Medical Ethics Meaningful 158
9.1.7 Miscellaneous 158

Bibliography 161-183