11. CONCLUSIONS, SUGGESTIONS AND TOPICS FOR
FURTHER STUDY

11.01 From the analysis and discussion made in the previous chapter some conclusions are naturally arrived at regarding the Music provided now a days for Bharatanatya. These conclusions are mainly arrived at on the basis of the answers received for the questions of the questionnaire and the relevant materials the investigator has come across while preparing this thesis. So these conclusions are cent percent objective and no subjective element is involved. While suggesting some remedies for the maladies of dance music the investigator has copiously resorted to the suggestions made by famous writers on Music and Bharatanatyam as well as the answers furnished by the respondents of the questionnaire. But where such dependable suggestions are not available she has dared to advance her views for the approval of the learned and only to this extent there is subjective element in this study.

11.02 The conclusions and suggestions are limited to the aspects namely, the dearth of skilled singers for Bharatanatya and the remedies for the maladies, dwindling group of Nattuvanars and its replenishment, necessity for intensive training for singers of dance music, establishment of departments of music in universities with facility to learn dance music, the nature
and role of accompaniments used in Bharatanatyam music, the qualifications of the accompanying artists, the dearth of instructional materials and their production, the reciprocal importance of music and dance, the use of recorded music for dance performance, perfecting the dance music, and list of suggested topics for further study and research.

11.03 Bharatanatyam and the music provided for it are the legacies of Indian culture, transmitted by tradition from pre-historic times. Music and Dance have a fraternal affinity and this has been proved from the study of the origin of Dance and Music and their evolution independently and jointly. The fact cannot be denied that the relation existence and development of dance and music are reciprocal whether it is African, American, Hellenic or Chinese. The picture of Indian Dance and Music also is not different. In both the primitive and developed forms Dance and Music get interconnected and inter-supplemented.

In Carnatic Music and Bharatanatyam also this reciprocal inter-dependent and inter-disciplinary bond has been established. Though it is not possible to pinpoint the date of their blending, the relation is as ancient as the two arts are ancient in themselves. Actually these two are not separate entities at all. Dance is visual music and music is audible dance. To put this more precisely the artistic contents of both is the same but only the medium of perception changes.
11.04 The genius is really prodigious which combined these two great forms together and gave birth to the Natyasangeetha (dance music). At the time of blending, these two arts might be in the highest pedestal of their glory though for logical reasoning it might seem unnatural. The wonderful idea behind this is that whatever be the nuance and nicety of music and rhythm if the musician is able to express it through the medium of NADA, then the dancer also must be able to express it equally well, if not more, through gestures and movements. Both the dance musician and the dancer worked with this aspect in mind and, as a result, we today have an unbroken history of the reciprocity of these two arts.

11.05 The present condition of dance music as it is provided in Bharatanatyam concerts requires a lot of improvement; it has deviated much from the traditional order; deterioration has taken place in its contents and constituents; it has been very badly influenced and mutilated by the onslaught of films; it has lost its serenity at the hands of commercially motivated people; now people use it as a means to earn their bread; dedication, devotion, sense of purpose etc. on the part of the singers have become a very rare commodity; disciples are being exploited; the grant-in-aid is being misused; politicians and influential quacks decide its fate; not even a handful of dance music artistes worth the name are there to serve the art; custodians themselves have turned to be the exploiters; the innocent public is carried away by the pomp
and show of the 'pop'; in short, all the symptoms of decline and unhealthiness are visible in Natya Music. The investigator wants to elucidate all the above aspects and to suggest some remedies for the malady.

11.06 The Natyasangitha or the Carnatic Music provided to accompany Bharatanatya recital has undergone many deviations and we have it to day in a deteriorated and polluted form. Its constituents viz. the Singer, the Song, the Forms, the Ways of Singing, lyrics of the song, the Items presented, the Accompanyists, the Nattuvanars, the Choreographers, the Organisers, the Patrons, the Public all have undergone many changes, resulting in the deviation and deterioration of this art, from its traditional path of glory.

11.07 In Natya Music the main singer is the most important next to dancer and Nattuvanar. Now-a-days good singers who are able to provide dance music are very rarely obtained. Many of the singers we get today lack art of the essential qualities a singer should possess; they don't have the control over voice which also lacks clarity; they are not trained in good pronunciation and proper accent; many also lack the essential qualities expected of a dance music performer, viz. melody, modulation, articulation, clarity in pronunciation, audible voice having many ranges, pleasing appearance, absence of mannerisms etc.
11.08 Further, many of the singers do not love the profession. They take to it only for mercenary considerations with the result that they cannot have any dedication, devotion and sense of involvement. This makes the performance lifeless and mechanical. They fail to establish a rapport with the dancer, with the co-singer, with the accompanyists in the stage and with the audience in the auditorium. The music remains as a mere aimless exercise of vocal organs. The whole beauty of the programme is lost.

11.09 At times such misfit singers do not properly rehearse, and without learning the lyrics by heart, peep into the book or paper off and on during the recital. This is the catastrophe of the programme. When the script is not learnt by heart the singer cannot have the self-confidence and she loses the grip over her voice. She is often compelled to look into the chit, her concentration weakens, her voice dips down and the mouth deviates from the direction of the microphone and the volume is lessened. Though the singer may not feel these changes the audience on the other side and the accompanying artists on both sides and the dancer in front feel it as a very gruesome experience. The result is utter chaos in the programme.

11.10 In these days of electronics the knowledge of the basic principles of microphones, air conditioning, theatrical acoustics, echo etc., is essential and inevitable for the dance music performer because then only she can adjust her voice to
these systems. Many of the present day singers are not educated in this line and their performance turns very miserable. Either they may be jarring through the microphone or they are not at all audible. At times when two or more singers are employed it also happens that their 'Sruti' differ and they might not have had proper joint rehearsals also. This strikes a discordant note on all partners, the dancer becomes unable to adjust her rhythmic movements, the Mridangist and violinist get perplexed and the audience raise their eyebrows. Such pandemoniac situations are not imaginary or exaggerated. They are the realities.

11.11 Singers exhibit all sorts of mannerisms also as if they are in a music concert. Their bad accent of an unknown language will hurt the feelings and court the displeasure of those among the audience that speak that language. A Tamilian singing a Hindi or Malayalam song and a Malayali singing a Tamil or Telugu song often looks funny and this tells upon the beauty of the whole programme.

11.12 This pathetic condition can be remedied only by dedicated devoted and conscientious singers. Only talented and dedicated singers with aptitude and sense of purpose should opt for this line. They should put as many rehearsals as possible with the dancer, co-singer and the accompanists. They should learn the basic principles of voice culture, microphone, theatrical acoustics and listener's psychology. They must learn
at least the meaning of the lyrics to be sung and if the language is different from the mother tongue, try to hear it sung by some who has good grasp and rendering of the language. They must avoid all mannerisms also by hearing their own voice in tape recorders and singing before mirrors, where the number of singers is more they must adjust while rehearsing and sing in solo, duet or chorus alternately or by turn as time warrants and necessity demands. They must avoid overlappings, encroachments, hisses and unwarranted pauses. If their Bruthids differ one must sing in bass octave and the other in the higher octave. Only such singers can do justice to their job and elevate the beauty of the art.

11.13 Now the question remains as to how such singers are produced. To produce such accomplished dance music singers is really a difficult task, but of course not impossible.

11.14 Ideal or qualified dance music singers could be produced only when proper arrangements are made for their instruction, training and practical experience. All professional disciplines, are having permanent and continuous training system which equips the persons in profession to face any eventualities. While the practising doctors, consulting engineers etc., are having a sound instructional system, the dance musicians lack it with the result that their existence is in peril.

11.15 In music colleges or in University Departments of
Music, dance music should be made an optional subject where expert and experienced singers should instruct as visiting professors. Quite different from ordinary music, special stress should be made on Laya, Bhava and Rhythm. In the libraries enough phono-recordings and discs of dance compositions should be collected and stacked for reference. Talented students may be admitted to these courses and studentships may be instituted. Reputed dancers should make it a point to utilise the services of these students for their performances.

11.16 The famous musicians also should contribute their share in the proper preservation and propagation of this traditional art. It is often experienced that top singers and accompanyists do not sing for dancers. There can be many reasons for this reluctance. But by singing to dances they can surely ward off the inferiority complex from the minds of dance music singers. When Smt. M.S. Subbalakshmi and Smt. M.L.Vasantakumari the topmost lady singers of the day provide background music for their daughters the status of the dance music singer is really elevated. This is the surest way of mitigating the shortage of expert singers for Bharatanatyam.

11.17 The Nattwanar in a dance programme is the counterpart of Suthradhara in a drama or a producer-cum-director in a cinema. He combines in him the stage director, choreographer, music director, dance director, and a conductor of orchestra.
And to fulfill the above roles he must be a good singer, educator, coach, musicologist and above all a good teacher. One cannot think or even imagine about a Bharatanātya performance without a Nattuvanar. He is the person who actually produces, organizes, arranges, and conducts the show. He is the hub of all the dance activities.

11.18 But now a sad plight has befallen this section of teachers. Due to various reasons and partly due to their own faults and shortsighted actions this community is dwindling. They have lost their scholarship and glory. The Nattuvanars worth the name and expertise can be counted on fingers. As one scholar has pointed out there are no 'Nattuvanars' now a days, there are only conductors.

11.19 This shortage of Nattuvanars has affected the dance music also, because it is the Nattuvanars who choreograph the whole dance programme, instructs the singer and directs the dancer. Since this is a traditional skill and since the community does not teach others this skill, their art is nearing the verge of extinction. The expertise is kept by them as a top secret and treated as a non-transmittable commodity. Even reputed professionals find them expensive and difficult to handle. This is clear from the fact that dancers of international repute like Smt. Vaijayantimala Bali have stopped engaging 'Nattuvanars' and are satisfied with 'Nattuvangam' by ladies. Novices have to relate painful stories about their bitter
experiences.

11.20 The tendency to do away with 'Nattuvangam' is suicidal and detrimental to the art of Bharatanatyam and Natya music as a whole. It is high time that the Nattuvanars showed the gesture of coming forward and teaching the yearning students all the things they know in Bharatanatyam especially the art of uttering 'CHOLKATTUK' 'THATTAKARAMS' and playing JALAM. Otherwise they will be wasting their legacy like the prodigal son. They being the trusted custodians of a traditional art, should not push it to oblivion by their sheer indifference ego and short sightedness.

11.21 Universities and cultural societies should come forward, appoint expert Nattuvanars as visiting professors, pay them decently and provide congenial conditions for the systematic study teaching and revival of this beautiful art that had been once the pride of the country.

11.22 Singing for dance is a unique art and as such requires special training and special skill. There is a notion that any musician with good voice can sing for dance. It is true that some popular musicians like Smt. M.S.Subbalakshmi and Smt. ML. Vasanthakumari are singing for their daughter-dancers, and their lines are worth emulating. Actually Dance music is something more than ordinary music. Here more stress is necessary on laya and expression of Bhavas. The singer should make precise calculations about rhythm. A slight error makes
the whole show a mess. In a music concert a slight error will not be conspicuous and the Mridangist and Violinist will cope with that. But in a dance the dancer cannot adjust herself with such errors. The singer will have to adjust her speed to that of the dancer. There is not much flexibility and freedom for the singer. She has to sing under some restrictions and control. Her slip or omission will be causing great strain to the dancer.

11.23 So a well-designed and systematic methodology to teach dance music is to be evolved and on this basis dance music singers are to be trained. Only Universities or Academies can make such arrangements. If such arrangements are not made dance music will lose its peculiarities and style and concert singers will have to sing in the concert style without any consideration or care for the dance. And the result will be the feeling of witnessing two independent, unconnected, simultaneous programmes in the same stage - a dance and a music concert.

11.24 The promoters and lovers of Bharatanatyam and its music have expressed a view that only resorting to Gurukula system of study the past glory of these two arts can be revived. Though the Gurukula system has many advantages it is beyond the possibility of introduction during these days. The reasons are many. To enumerate a few,

1. Both the Guru and would be 'Sishya' have many
pre-occupations that they may not find time to be full time 'Gurus' and full time 'Sishyas'.

2. Today we lack Gurus having encyclopaedic knowledge about everything in dance and who possess stuff to teach an inquisitive average student for a full period of two or three years.

3. In the absence of such an expertise and erudition the 'Gurukulavasa' will turn to be a mockery and waste of energy, time and money.

4. Due to political influence men of lesser merit are elevated to the post of 'Gurus' and they avoid Sishyas from approaching them, under various pretenses.

5. A few greedy Gurus take as a right the lion's share as GURUDAKSHINA from the subsistance allowance given to the trainee and, teach them precious little. (This is not an exaggeration. The investigator has come across a case of scholarship where the Guru used to retain for him as fee 50% of the subsistance allowance of (Rs.7,200) given to the student and did not teach the student even for five days).

6. 'Gurus' who usually happen to be busily engaged professional performers cannot do justice with the trainees.

11.25 So it is better to have full time departments to study in dance and music in institutions where the Natuvanars can be appointed as visiting professors under whom the trainees can
learn the subject. This is the only solution to tackle this problem.

11.26 Though the usefulness of accompaniments in music for Bharatanatyam is endorsed by everybody, regarding the number and nature of such accompaniments naturally opinions differ. While Acharya Bharata has suggested the use of Veena, Venu and Mrudanga, today in actual use all sorts of instruments are employed. Answering the questionnaire in this regard different respondents have recommended different instruments and totally all the present day instruments get their sanction in one way or other. The list of employable musical instruments includes the names of Mridangam, Chenda, Dolak, Kanchira, Suchamandalam, Maddalam, Brahmathalam, Nathalam, Jalar, Mukku,Tabla, Cymbals, Mukhaveena, Veena, Violin, Viola, Flute, Nadaswaram, Clarinet and Harmonium.

11.27 The investigator does not make any suggestion in this regard. It is for the experts to decide as to which instruments suit the occasion most. The purpose of employing an instrument is to create a musical atmosphere, heighten the musicality of the performance, elicit the best out of the artist, and make the performance more entertaining and enjoyable.

While deciding the propriety of an instrument the above purposes of using accompaniments must not be lost sight of. Still, broadly speaking, Veena, Flute, Mridanga, Jalar, Clarinet and Tabala seem to be suitable accompaniments.
The study of accompaniments will be incomplete without a reference to the accompanying artists. It is often seen that the organisers do not give much importance to accompaniments in dance and many of them are seated on the stage simply to fulfil the role. There are usually Mridangist, Flutist, Violinists, and Harmonists and at times Vainika (Veena Player) also. Usually average and below average artists are selected for this purpose. They are not masters in the profession and often happen to be semi trained. Except Mridangist they are not expected to have intensive rehearsals. Throughout the programme many remain without involvement. There is no norm or code of conduct or self-imposed discipline for these accompanists. The violinist and Harmonist take the mike very near to them and eclipse the music. The audience will be complaining about the jarring violin and boisterous and bellowing Harmonium. Without any understanding and consideration each artist vies with the other to dominate the stage.

It need not be said that this is not the way of providing accompaniment music to a dance concert. Joint rehearsals as many as possible are to be attended by the artistes. They should evolve a code of conduct and behave understandingly. They should develop a team spirit and perform with involvement. It is the accompanying artists who largely contribute to make the programme a success or failure.
11.30 Formerly the education in the field of dance and music was formal. Still the teacher and the taught pursued their study with a sense of duty. The learning and teaching were aimed at attaining Noksha. The pupils regarded their teacher as the incarnation of God and took his words as sermon. The teacher also considered teaching as his life-mission and as the only path for attaining salvation. It was the firm belief that unless the teacher performs his duty well, he will be detained in hell. On the other side the justice of the Ruler also was administered ruthlessly if the teacher does not come up to the standard. The rulers wanted their court-artistes to be the top in the field. Mediocres were not allowed to exist. So the fear from the ruthless ruler, the thought of the other world, the sense of duty and missionary zeal on the part of the teacher, and the loyalty towards elders and Gurus and the ambition for recognition on the part of the pupil made the foundation of the education very strong on which the teacher-pupil bond became stronger and stronger. Though the system of education was formal, oral, voluntary and traditional, it produced very good results.

11.31 With the dawn of the so-called modern English education the traditional training systems especially of performing arts including dance and music vanished and the modern techniques could not replace it. The continuity of the tradition is lost
and today the irreparable and uncompensatable dearth of expert 'Nattuvanars' and singers is badly felt. The aspiring students knock the doors of quacks and return disappointed. It is high time that an earnest attempt is made to remedy this dearth of good educators and education of dance-music.

11.33 As for other disciplines the instructional materials for music also comprises written or printed literature oral instruction and audiovisual aids including books and periodicals and phonorecordings, discs, filmstrips etc. By oral instruction the verbal teaching is meant. The most important in the study of music are the demonstration by the teacher, the imitation by the pupil and reinforcement of the acquired skill by regular practice under the guidance and supervision of the teacher. This sort of systematic study pursued for a pretty long period with devotion and dedication brings out the best of the learner and after acquiring sufficient skill and with the permission of the Guru the Sishya enters the world of art as a performer.

11.33 On a closer study in the field of present day music education, one can feel the paucity of instructional materials of the above nature. We don't have enough reading materials in the form of books or periodicals; No book exclusively written on dance music is available. Dance music only partly finds a place in a chapter or a part of a chapter in treatises on music. There is no separate journal or
periodical exclusively devoted for the cause of dance music. It is true that in Journals like Journal of Music Academy, SANGEETA NATAK of Sangeetha Nataka Academy, at times, some articles on this subject do appear.

11.34 Indian Libraries have not yet realised the usefulness of audiovisual aids for music. While in American and French Libraries phono-recordings of even the Bharatanatyam music are available in India—the land of dance—even the music colleges have not started procuring phono-recordings. Of course the different stations of All India Radio do possess such recordings, but the learner has no access to them and as such they have no use as reference and instructional tools.

11.35 In almost all subjects periodical seminars are conducted by learned societies where specialists in the field present papers incorporating the knowledge available up to date. But dance music seems to be an exception. Even the attendance in the very rare seminars on music and dance is very poor. The investigator attended such a seminar where the eight speakers who were authority in their fields excelled, in number, the listeners.

11.36 When this is the pitiable condition of general instructional materials, the materials useful for higher and advanced study are next to nothing. In the whole of Kerala there is not a singer 'Nattwanar' or Dance Music
singer who has got all India recognition and reputation. There is no library in Kerala where some earnest attempt is being made to procure and preserve under one roof all materials hitherto published on music and dance.

11.37 The investigator can only draw the attention of the serious-minded Rasikas and cultural organisations and government authorities to this deplorable condition and request that some speedier, effective steps may be taken so that this art may not be pushed to oblivion for want of instructional materials.

11.38 Bharatanatya and the music provided for it are the two sides of the same art form. To put it figuratively, they are the two sides of the same coin. Both are interdependent, interlinked and complementary to each other. As is said elsewhere in this study, dance is visual music and music is audible dance. The singer seeks the medium of NADA and the dancer the medium of GATI. One appeases the ATMAN through Shruti and the other through sight. Both cause ripples of bliss (ANANDALAHARI) in the ocean of mind.

11.39 Music also is equally important as dance in a dance performance. To underestimate the importance of background music in a dance performance is ignorance. It is often seen that the organisers do not attach much importance to the singer of dance music. They hold the view that any singer with good voice can provide music for Bharatanatyam. The opinion of a scholar is already quoted in this thesis itself that if the
music is good it may eclipse the dance. So dance music need be only average.

11.40 Dance music plays for the dancer the role of the rope for a mountain climber. As a mountain climber is fully dependant on the rope so the dancer fully relies upon the music and it is the rope of music which props and prompts him up and up. The dancer explores the ecstatic spheres because of the support provided by music. Where the music loses its quality and fails to serve the purpose, the dance loses the grip and swerves. Their subscription is reciprocal. The effect produced by their intelligent blend is entirely different from what is produced by them as individual artforms. The blissful experience is three dimensional and is beyond the explanation of words - VACHAMAGOCHARAN.

11.41 Due to the dearth of good singers and the difficulty of getting a singer now some dancers are dancing to the tape recorded songs. This has become inevitable particularly for those who go abroad and present the dance before small assemblies. But this arrangement has its inherent disadvantages also. The first and foremost is the mechanical defect of the recorder which may arise at any time. The second is the lifelessness of the music. The third is the difficulty of adjustment. So it is suggested that only during practice or in small groups the recorded music may be resorted to as a stop-gap arrangement. But in major performances before an
enlightened audience the recorder should not be employed.

11.42 Perfection in dance music is badly needed today. Many pitfalls and shortcomings can be observed during the performance of expert singers. These shortcomings can be overcome only when a systematic methodology to teach the rendering of dance music is evolved. In this age of specialisation every discipline requires serious and systematic study and the art of dance music cannot be and need not be an exception. Earnest efforts from all corners concerned are solicited to revive, stabilize and popularise this art form and to give a scientific and solid base for its advanced study and research.

11.43 In the course of the present study the investigator has come across many reference materials which could be made use of in the study of various other subjects also allied with dance and dance music. Since the investigator has to limit the present study to the music in Bharatanatyam alone she did not divert her attention to other aspects. Research in many more topics allied to Bharatanatyam and its music is a desideratum. A list of a few topics on which further research could be conducted is given below.

1. THE ABHINAYA IN DANCE
2. THE IMPORTANCE OF BHAVAS IN DANCE,
3. COMPARATIVE STUDY OF BHARATANATYA AND OTHER INDIAN CLASSICAL DANCE FORMS.
4. NATYA SA STRA.
5. EMOTIONS AND RAGAS.
6. MYSTICISM AND DANCE MUDRAS.
7. KARANAS AND MUDRAS IN DIFFERENT INDIAN CLASSICAL DANCES.
8. VARANAS IN DANCE.
9. ADAPTATION OF SONGS BY TRINITY TO BHARATANATYA.
10. DANCE DRAMA AND BHARATANATYA.
11. THE TRADITIONAL ELEMENTS IN BHARATANATYA AND ITS MUSIC.
12. BHARATANATYA FROM DEVADASI TO DULIAS.
13. PADA COMPOSITIONS OF KSHETRAGNA.
14. MODERN COMPOSERS OF BHARATANATYA MUSIC.
15. PADAM IN BHARATANATYA.
16. EVOLUTION OF INDIAN DANCE THROUGH CENTURIES.
17. RANGA SAJJA(STAGE ARRANGEMENTS) FOR BHARATANATYA.
18. TRADITIONAL DRESS ASHINAYA IN BHARATANATYA.
19. NOTATION FOR DANCE.
20. EVOLUTION OF DANCE MUSIC IN INDIA.
21. THE 'NATTUVANARS' AND THEIR ROLE IN BHARATANATYA.
22. DANCE COMPOSITIONS OF THE TANJORE QUARTETTE.
23. THE CONTRIBUTION OF TANJORE QUARTETTE TO DANCE.
24. THE CONTRIBUTION OF SRI SWATI THIRUNAL TO DANCE MUSIC.
25. THE CONTRIBUTION OF MAHARAJA SERPOREE TO BHARATANATYA AND ITS MUSIC.
26. DIFFERENT STYLES OF BHARATANATYA.
27. SHELKEETUS AND ADAVUS.
28. TECHNIQUES OF TEACHING DANCE MUSIC.
29. DANCE MUSIC VERSUS CONCERT MUSIC.
There is no doubt that persistent and enduring studies in the above subjects will surely enrich the glorious treasure of Bharatanatya and its music.