CHAPTER VIII

CONCLUSIONS

Thailand is an independent country of south-eastern Asia. Thailand means "land of the free people" or "free land". Thailand covers an area of 198,000 square miles. The well-defined seasons are the hot, rainy and cool seasons. There are four natural geographical regions in Thailand. Northern region is high steep mountains and hills and hence thickly forested. The forest is known for teak wood. Northeastern region is a high, dry plain where red sandy soils are not very fertile. The low rainfall here handicaps agriculture and hence people rear livestock. Central region is the great rice-producing area of Thailand and hence rice cultivation is the main occupation of the people in this region. Southern region is rich in minerals such as granite and lime stone.

The political organizations in Thailand throughout its history are unstable. The Thai society have been ruled by absolute Monarchy, armed forces and democratic forces. In the recent past the armed forces again took over the Government of the country into the hands of the military regime. The nature of political organization is clearly indicated by a government under constitutional monarchy with a democratic form of government.
The total population of Thailand is 52,545,529. The Bangkok's share in the population of the country is 10.36 per cent. The single city of Bangkok contributes major share in the nation's total population. The alarming growth of the population of Bangkok is a threat to the nation building activities.

The national language of Thailand is Thai. Although satisfactory for common use, the system of language is inadequate for coining new Thai words that can accurately convey western concepts or scientific terms. As a consequence, Thailand keeps pace with international trends and scientific developments. The emphasis on early schooling has resulted in high rate of literacy in Thailand.

The rice is the principal crop in Thailand. Thailand is one of the world's largest rice exporters. The other crops are rubber, maize, cotton, fiber, kenaf, jute, tobacco, sugarcane, coconut, oil seeds, etc. Teak, hardwood, resins, oils, charcoal, etc., are valuable forest products in Thailand. Tin, tungsten, fluorite lead, zinc, manganese are the minerals found in great variety in Thailand and are exported to other countries to strengthen the Thai economy. Tin contributes its valuable share in the country's economy. The gas and iron are found in the gulf of Thailand. Thailand is developing its natural resources to have self-sufficiency. Fisheries play a vital
role in the economy of Thailand.

Thailand's small-scale industries are mainly aimed at for processing rice, rubber and forest products and for manufacturing cement, gunny-bags, textiles, sugar and light consumer goods. In manufacturing Thailand is considered as backward because of lack of facilities.

The unit of currency is Baht. One Baht is equal to one Rupee of India.

While the people of Thailand are Buddhists, their religion is permeated with animism and Brahminism. The history of Thai has shown the close relationship between Buddhism and Thai nation. The manner and thinking of the people in Thailand have been shaped by Buddhism. Thus the Buddhism has become an integral part of Thai life and forms the foundation of most attitudes.

The vertical social relationships over others is an interesting characteristics of Thai society in both rural and urban areas. The vertical social relationships are based on the status of inequalities within the family in terms of age, wealth, power, knowledge and religions or governmental role. Many rural social values have been observed in the city in respect of regard for religion, personal habits, and respect for superiors and elders.
The Thai rural society is largely peasant-oriented. However, a middle class style of life is observed in Bangkok. The urban family organization reflects a separation of family and occupation and this has caused differentiation in sex roles. Marriage is a personal agreement involving social sanctions. The men and women have more freedom for social interaction. Marriages are almost monogamous in rural Thailand. Polygyny has been known to occur chiefly in urban areas. Its extent is small.

In Thai language "Bangkok" is meant as the city of Angels. It's a fast growing city and acts as a magnet for all Thais from all corners of the country.

The population of this fast growing city is increased from 600 in 1900 to 5.4 million in 1986. It also spatially expanded from mere 13.3 sq.kms. in 1900 to 220.7 sq.kms., in 1977 and eventhereafter the outlying residential areas continue to expand to accommodate the waves of migrants coming to Bangkok.

According to survey of 1985, there are 1020 slums and squatter settlements in Bangkok. The growth of the slums and their population showed an increasing trend since 1940.

The major characteristics of Bangkok's slums are as follows: (1) There are slums and squatter settlements from as few as 15 household up to 7,390 in Klong Toey slum as a whole. The average number of households per settlement is
is 189.3. (2) The average age of all the settlement is 25.3 years. (3) Fifty per cent of the settlements are located within 6.5 kms., radius from the center of the city. (4) The majority of the slums are located on private land. These slums have a legal tenureship as they pay rent for the land they occupied. However, the squatter settlement pay no rent and have no legal tenureship. This is because their occupancy of land is illegal. (5) Very few slum areas have been upgraded. In some of the slums the community committees are appointed to aid the slum-dwellers to improve themselves in the development process. The upgrading programmes are not extended to the squatter settlements because their status is illegal.

The failure of the government organizations to protect their lands from encroachment and delay in the use of lands gave an opportunity to the homeless people to encroach on these land. But private landlords were more careful to protect their land from encroachment. Because of the above reasons, the extent of encroachment on government lands is more than the private lands.

The locational pattern of the slums in the city shows that the existence of the slums and squatter settlements is related to the economic concentration in the city suburbs of Bangkok. The slums appear in any area in the city where economic activities have been firmly developed. The rise
and fall of slums are related to the changes in the economic activities in the surrounding area. The eviction of the slums is not the general rule. The centrality, accessibility, land use and land value are the four interrelated locational factors affect eviction. The eviction pressure is greater near the city center and from the center, the eviction pressure diminishes towards the periphery. The eviction brings with it financial loss, loss of social contacts, feeling of humiliation and powerlessness and deteriorating housing conditions at the new place. Thus the eviction process brings with it economic, social and psychological losses to the evicted families.

There are government and the private agencies which work for alleviating the urban poverty and for improving living conditions of the urban poor. The National Housing Authority (NHA) which work for the urban poor had to cancel its development plans and had to prepare new one from time to time because of financial constraints. Therefore, the NHA could not do much for the urban poor. The Bangkok Metropolitan Administration (BMA) in Co-operation with the NHA provides medical health centres, mobile health visits, family planning services, primary education etc., to the designated slums. The BMA has also its own limits and hence it could not be able to provide amenities to the slum-dwellers adequately. The NGOs/PVs's work without seeking profits. They shoulder responsibility of all
aspects of slum development. These organizations look at the slum problems from different perspectives. Although these organizations possess potentiality in working, they are also faced with many constraints. The most important constraint is the financial crisis.

The emergence and the development of the Klong Toey slum was studied by using three variables such as historical, spatial and economic.

The initial emergence of Klong Toey slums and its further growth was related to the development of the harbour in Bangkok from time to time. The small harbour was damaged during the world war. The Port Authority was established and the construction of Port was entrusted to it. The heavy demand for work in the harbour caused rapid influx of the people in the harbour area. Because of this, the first slum in the Port area came into existence. Secondly, to make available the space for other buildings in the city, the evicted slum residents arrived in the Klong Toey or they found their way to new slum areas. The Klong Toey began to grow since 1962 and this growth further continued. The eviction and re-eviction of the slums took place in the Klong Toey area because of the implementation of 1962 Land Use Plan, the space required for Klong Toey market in 1963, the eviction of slums near the slaughter house and the Phrakanong Canal in 1966, the building of Super Highway in 1979, setting up of new container terminal and private
godowns in 1982. Thus the expansion of the developmental activities in the harbour and in the city gave rise to slums in the Klong Toey area.

The spatial variable has shown that the location and the relocation of slums in Bangkok is governed by possibility of increasing land value and a desire to profit from the same. The same is happened in case of the Klong Toey slum and the residents of this slum are pushed to the undeveloped areas where land value was low.

The economic variable invariably has connected the Klong Toey slum to the city's economy through its labour power, as a client of consumption and other necessities and through the petty traders and vendors who buy the goods in the city market and sale the same in the slum area, Port area and in the vicinity.

According to 1973 survey, the Klong Toey slum was a homogeneous community in terms of ethnic and religious background and in their beliefs and language. The family structure was predominantly that of the nuclear family. The birth rate and the migration have contributed to the alarming fast growth of this slum. The vast majority of the children who were of school going age were not going to school. The main reason for their not attending school was poverty. They were employed by their families for earning for the families.
The occupational pattern of this slum showed that most of the heads of families were labourers and workers as well as mechanics, craftsmen and traders. A small number of the family heads were 'in between jobs' as they were unemployed.

The survey of 1973 had reported that the traditional materials such as wood, bamboo, and nipa palm branches were used for house construction, as these materials were available in plenty. The modest house structure had walls and floors of wooden planks and iron sheets and roofs of iron sheets. Some of the houses were built on the raised platforms above the swampy ground. The photographs displayed in this study gave an evidence about the deteriorating housing conditions and unhygienic environment. The houses were dirty and ugly in look.

The researcher of this present study has also surveyed the Klong Toey slum in 1988-89 and took photographs of some of the houses. The housing conditions and environment continued to deteriorate.

Inspite of the adverse housing conditions and bad environment, the people continue to live in the slum. This seems to be an adjustment to the pathological condition. They get accustomed to the pathological conditions as they find themselves helpless and powerless in all respects.
Among the basic necessities of life, the housing occupies an important place from the point of view of family welfare. With this in view, the housing conditions and environment, household amenities, public utilities and facilities, etc., of the slum under study were studied. It has been found that most of the houses belonged to those who live in them. A small number of families live in rented houses. The slum-dwellers do not own the land on which their houses are located. They do not pay any rent for the land and hence they do not have legal right to the lands. The land legally belongs to the Port Authority. The slum dwellers, therefore, are under constant threat of eviction.

So far as the material used for house construction is concerned, it has been reported that the ramshackle type, shabby wooden houses with roofs of rusty iron sheets and/or nipa palm branches are crudely built along small, narrow wooden walkways erected on the swamp ground. The walkways get muddy and slippery in the rainy season and dusty in the summer season. In the rainy season, it is risky to walk over these wooden walkways. Some of the houses built on the earth have been built by using wooden planks for walls, corrugated iron sheets for roofs. Most of the houses in this slum are built by using substandard housing materials. These houses are fire-prone. In case of fire, these houses may cause damage to the life and property of the residents.
These houses are also ugly in look. The surrounding environment of the substandard houses is unhealthy and unfit for human living. In case of houses which stand on the raised wooden platforms on the swampy ground, the dirty water gets stagnated beneath the houses. The houses gave rise to mosquittos and gives bad smell. This is unhealthy. The slum residents live in a dehumanized conditions. This seems to be an adjustment of the slum-dwellers to the pathological situation. The dwellers being poor, powerless, and helpless do not mind dirt around them as they are accustomed to it and finding no alternative continue to live where they are at present put up. The housing conditions surveyed in 1973 and the present housing conditions in the slum under study showed that the housing conditions and the environment remained poor. This highlights that the development activities undertaken in Bangkok have largely failed in bettering the life of the slum-dwellers. The slum may be the geographical reflection of the social failure.

Regarding types of dwellings, it has been found that in the slum under study, there are single family detached houses, shop-houses and row houses. The shop houses reflected the combined commercial and residential importance of these houses. Whereas, the area in which row houses are built is mostly a residential area. Further row houses are mostly limited to one or two storey wooden structures. The
single family detached houses are moderate structure good in design and look and the quality of materials used for construction. But these house are limited in number.

Regarding the age of the houses, it has been noted that most of the houses are constructed more than 15 years ago.

The number of rooms per dwelling unit was studied with a view to understand whether there is over crowing in these dwellings. It has been observed that most of the families live in dwelling units either of one or two rooms. Further, the number of sleeping rooms per dwelling when compared to the actual size of the family or the average size of the family may also give an idea regarding overcrowding. Approximately, less than half of the families (45.0 per cent) live in a single room dwelling units. This shows that these are the multipurpose dwelling units. All the family activities (sitting, dining, sleeping, etc.) take place one after the other in a single room. As such as 38.5 per cent families live in dwelling units of two rooms. If the average size of the family is taken into consideration, the single-room dwelling units clearly show that these dwelling units are overcrowded. Likewise, the two-room dwelling units may also show overcrowding in these houses even assuming that small families of 2-4 members live in them.
The slum under study lacks the facilities, viz., good internal roads, play ground, park, and re-creational areas. The other facilities such as health, water supply, sanitation, garbage disposal, fire protection are in adequate and unsatisfactory. The slum community faces the social problems in milder forms such as juvenile delinquency, drug abuse, alcoholism and unemployment. Thus the socio-cultural, spatial and environmental problems speak about the low quality of living of the slum-dwellers. This necessitates that the slum improvement programme should provide for continuous upgrading of house structures, environmental standards, and overall improving of socio-cultural conditions for healthy community life. The other facilities (education, re-reation, parks, etc.,) are not made available in the slum, but located at the distant places in the city. The slum-dwellers may have access to these facilities. These facilities mostly are beyond the reach of the slum-dwellers taking into consideration the cost of transportation involved in availing these facilities. The time element was another factor in the availment of these facilities. The degree of access to the facilities, thus appear to depend more on economic consideration and time element. This necessitates the location of these facilities either in the slum or in its vicinity.

The land tenure insecurity, inadequate amenities and overcrowding in the houses are the chief causes of the
creation of the stresses, strains and tensions among the respondents. The other causes of unrest are the location of the slum is not convenient and every poor housing conditions.

So far as the implications of the eviction are concerned the respondents reported that the process of eviction has brought to them instability in their life and a feeling of humiliation. The other losses reported by them are financial loss and the loss of social contacts. Thus the eviction process has brought with it the social, economic and psychological stresses, strains and tensions to the respondents.

So far as the improvement of slums in Thailand is concerned:

The views of slum-dwellers were ascertained for finding out the way of relieving them from the miserable way of life. Their foremost demand is that their slum may be given legal status so that they can be benefitted from the slum improvement programmes. The minimum basic amenities also needs to be given to them adequately. Their suggestion (demand) is that they may be absorbed in the employment needed for developmental activities or they may be extended such opportunities so that they can be self-dependent.

As a researcher, I think that the other side of the coin is also equally important. Those who are responsible for the improvement of slums should develop positive attitude and recognise the contribution of the slum-dwellers
to the city's economy. The slum is an integral part of
the urban economy. If this is recognised, something
concrete can be done to improve the life of the slum-dwellers.

In short, the cultivation of the attitude of self-
dependence on the part of the slum-dwellers and a allocation
of enough financial resources and the development of the
positive attitude about the slum as an integral part of
city's economy on the part of the government and other
agencies, it is hoped that a way can be find out for improving
the life of the slum-dwellers.

Emphasizing the importance of the family as a basic
unit of the society, this study has discussed some of the
definitions of the family and for the purpose of this study
defined family as 'the group of members united by ties of
blood, marriage, or adoption and having common residence
and/or adjacent residence, common purse, common property and
common hearth. While defining family care has been taken
to see that the definition will be applicable to the families
in Thailand.

It may be noted that the Thai rural family rule of
residence is that the families of two offsprings of the same
household do not live in a single house under a single roof,
but live in an adjacent dwelling. To live together is
thought unlucky. This rule of residence is not seen to
have been followed by the slum families under study. This
seems to be a significant change in the sense that slum families are moving away from practicing the traditional rule of family residence. This is because of the acute housing shortage in the slum under study.

The average size of the slum family comes to 5.3. The medium size families having 4-6 members predominate in the slum. Likewise, there is also predominance of the nuclear families in the slum. If the family size and types are considered together it has been found that the nuclear families were mostly of medium size and the joint families mostly belonged to large and very large family size. Thus generally the family size and type go together.

As for the age of the respondents is concerned, a little more than half of the respondents belonged to the young age group upto 40 years and the rest of them were above this age. All the respondents belonged to the Buddhist religion.

The rate of literacy is high among the respondents. This may be because the primary education is compulsory in Thailand. Most of the respondents have studied upto the primary level of education and very few of them could take secondary and University level of education.

The accomplishments of high and low levels of education may not be regarded solely as a function of intrinsic individual qualities. It is also dependent upon the family
background. In the light of this, intergenerational educational mobility was studied. On the whole, a trend of intergenerational educational upgrading is seen. A relationship exists between the educational attainments of the respondents and their fathers. Thus, it is clear that intergenerational educational upgrading is a process in which the pre-existing educational level of the fathers played an important role. Though the respondents seemed to have been improved their level of educational attainments compared to their fathers, but it may be noted that on the whole respondents educational attainments are low.

The norms of the status positions of individuals in the families are generally followed in the slum families. The children in the family are taught to give respect to the elders in the family. The younger sibling while calling the old sibling use the term Phi before his name and the older sibling while calling the younger sibling use the term Non before the name of the younger sibling.

In Thai family husband has a ritual superiority mostly derived from Therwada Buddhism. The wife shows respect to her husband and generally shows no superiority of her own. The women folks in the slum families are reported to have been engaged mostly in the household tasks and the rearing of children. The girls of the family are trained since their early age for the housewife role they will be required
to perform in the future. The husband in the family sometimes help his wife in the household taking including cooking. Thus the husband-wife relationship reflects a division of labour of convenience. The children and the aged persons perform lighter tasks suiting to their ages. On the whole the division of labour in the family largely is based on age and sex of the family members.

So far as the household possessions are concerned, it has been reported that the slum families possessed selected household articles such as televisions, radios, rice cookers and clocks/watches. The pervasiveness of televisions and radios was truely impressive and underscores their potential as a medium for diffusion of information and recreation in the slum families. The possession of television and radio, and motor-cycle and refrigerator are thought by the slum families as the prestige items/means.

Marriages are almost monogamous in Thai society. Polygyny which was practiced in ancient items is now practical by well-to-do class in the city. But the extent of polygyny among them is small because a movement was launched during the present century to oppose polygyny. The marriages in the slum under study are monogamous and there is no incidence of polygyny.

All the marriages in the slum are arranged marriages. This is because the senior members in the family have taken
care to seek marital relations for the young unmarried man and women of the family.

Regarding the criteria used for the selection of spouses by the slum families, it has been found that the financial status, family reputation and the bride price received first, second and third priority respectively.

The marriage ceremony is brahmanic in origin. The marriages in the slum families are performed according to the Thai tradition.

Regarding age at marriage in Thailand, a girl is considered marriageable at sixteen and a boy at twenty. In the slum under study, the extent of marriages at the customary age is more than the late marriage. This shows that the customary age at marriage is followed to the large extent. The reasons regarding late marriage reported were no regular employment, ill health and poor income of the family.

The fertility in general has declined in Thailand considerably. In the slum under study a little more than forty per cent families adopt family planning measures. The popular techniques among the slum families in order of rank are female sterilization, oral pills and IUD. The health services and hospitals of the government and the Bangkok Metropolitan Administration and the mass media particularly television were found to be the popular sources of family planning knowledge among the slum families.
The slum families reporting non-adoption of the family planning techniques include those respondents who said that they are just married and/or having one child only, those who said that the time is yet to come for the adoption of family planning may be taken as the potential users of the family planning measures. Those respondents who are old and those who belonged to broken families, in both of these cases the question of the adoption of family planning does not arise.

Only those who held the view that more number of children means more number of earning hands and those who are ignorant about the good and bad effects of the family planning need to be taken as the target groups for convincing them the importance of family planning. Barring these, on the whole, the idea of family planning seems to have been accepted by the slum families.

A slum under study is not a collection of individuals or households living side by side in isolation. The individuals and households are integrated to a different degree in the socio-economic network of Bangkok city. So far as the economic relations between slum and city, it can be said that it is based on the use of labour power of the slum-dwellers in the urban labour market and hence slum is an integral part of the economy of the city of Bangkok through its labour power. Again slum is also an integral part of Bangkok city through purchase and sale of consumer goods in
the slum, its vicinity and the city. The trade in this slum has to be seen as an extension of the urban consumer goods market into the slum and small commodity production as an extension of the consumer goods market into the city. Thus slum and the city of Bangkok have bound together by the economic network.

So far as the social organization in the slum is concerned it has been found that the respondents have listed the names of five organizations/associations. Of these, only two associations (funeral and religious) are mainly consisted of slum residents. The other associations are not exclusively made up of slum residents. However, the activities of these associations are more diffuse and more dispersed and diluted in the city of Bangkok and hence less associated with a particular community or a geographical area.

The respondents reported that the event like house warming, funeral, ordination, bethrothal, marriage, top-knot have an important religious character or are festivals for the families involved. These events, according to them are celebrated by seeking help from the religious organization.

In case of a death in the family, the assistance of the Funeral Association is sought.

The labour association came into existence in the city of Bangkok to protect the interest of labour class. The unemployed or the persons in between jobs seek help from
this association for employment and to gain security in employment.

The voluntary organizations which assist the poor without seeking profits, could not do much for the slum community expecting to motivate people for the adoption of family planning. This is because, these organization suffer from financial crisis.

The short-term association removes garbage and drain low lying areas in the slum by seeking mutual assistance from the slum residents. But this association mostly remains dormant. This is because it fails in seeking active mutual assistance from slum residents.

In short, the organization of the community life of the slum through the informal social organizations is loosely organised. This is because the activities of the most of this associations are more diffused or dispersed in the city of Bangkok. It is but natural that these organization might not concentrate fully on a particular slum community.

The occupational pattern showed that although employment is high for the heads of families i.e., respondents, the occupations of most of the respondents are generally lower in status and skill and low-paying as most among them are labourers. The acceptance of job or the decision regarding acceptance of job is mostly based on two considerations, i.e., (1) income and (2) regularity of job. If the job, even with
a low salary is regular the slum-dwellers show their willingness to do it.

The discussion on the occupation background of the respondents (i.e., the occupations of the respondents' fathers) revealed that most of the respondents have a background of manual work in the sense that their fathers were manual workers. The most of the respondents' occupations are also manual in nature. Thus inter-generational occupational movement, by and large, is from manual to manual stratum. In this case, continuity rather than mobility is noticed.

So far as income of the households are concerned most of the households belonged to low income category. Most of the households fall below the income of 3,000 Bahts per month. Because of inadequate income the household members try to engage themselves in income generating activities for securing sustenance. A study of the number of earning members in the households showed that in most of the households there were two earning members in each household. The households having more than two earning members belonged to large size. There are large number of dependents in the slum household. The lack of assured and regular income and large number of dependents have put most of the households in a typical economic situation and hence the households found difficult to make both the ends meet.
In the absence of adequate income from a single source, the slum households adopt the strategies of survival. There are three such strategies of survival, viz; (1) the strategy of specialization, (2) the strategy of flexibility and (3) the combination of strategy (specialization + flexibility). Of these strategies, the most workable strategy for most of the slum households under study is the strategy of flexibility. This is because it provides many income sources in one strategy. A large number of the slum households have reported regarding the adoption of this strategy. This strategy has provided a scope for household member(s) to engage in many different income generating activities. Any job is taken even if the income of this job is low. Rather than high or low income, the regularity of income from the job is considered. The advantage of this strategy is that unemployment of one household member or irregularity of one income source can be compensated through using another income source. More than one income generating activities are combined under this strategy.

A few number of households have adopted the strategy of specialization. The households adopting this strategy included households of the civil servants (clerks/typists), owners of shops and stalls at the city market, owners of taxis, and some mechanics.

The strategy of combination is not reported to have been followed in the slum.
The rural-urban origin of the respondents and/or their parental family is studied with a view to understand whether urban origin places the families to an advantageous position than families of rural origin. This study showed that the urban origin has placed some of the families in a comparatively better position. This is because some of the households belonging to the occupational categories such as trading, transport and communication, mechanics, artisan and professionals and civil servants have urban background. But most of the labouring class has rural background, i.e., rural origin.

From the trend of migration, it has been noticed that more number of respondents have preferred to migrate within region; i.e., Central Region. The extent of migration to Bangkok from the Central Region is high. The city of Bangkok is situated in the Central Region.

The movement of people in the city is not haphazard. There may be some specific reasons behind their movement. This study observes that it is not the economic advantage alone that attracted the slum-dwellers to Bangkok. But the support network of acquaintances inspired them to move to Bangkok for economic advantages or for employment. The support of network of acquaintances gave them the strength and courage to move in Bangkok city. Hence in case of these respondents or their parental families though their
migration to Bangkok was for economic advantages or employment but it was actualized because of the availability of support network of acquaintances in Bangkok.

The success of the earlier migrants to Bangkok in getting employment or other economic advantages set the examples of success before some of the respondents or their families and their examples acted as a stimuli to them to migrate to Bangkok.

Some of the respondents have migrated to the city of Bangkok for some other reasons. These reasons are - (1) meagre income of the family, (2) attraction of the city and (3) for education of children. But the strength of these is small.

Whatever may be the basis for migration to Bangkok it may be noted that the push factors from rural areas are important. The most important push factors are the lack of employment opportunities in rural areas due to lack of arable land or adverse weathers. The second factor is the monsoon seasonal changes. The population pressure on the land in recent years in terms of tenancy or fragmentation of land is cited as the reason for migration.

The slum is socially differentiated area like any other areas in the city is noted from the social prestige of occupations rated by the respondents on the basis of the
household income and the housing conditions. The view of slum as homogeneous poverty held by some others is contradicted by the existence of social differentiation based on different indicators as stated above.