Chapter VIII

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE STUDY
Chapter - VIII
SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
OF THE STUDY

The summary of the findings and recommendations of the study presented in this chapter are based on the data collected during the course of the study. The contents of this chapter are:

a) Findings
b) Suggestion
c) Guideline for further research.

a. Findings

1. It was found that 4 out of the 5 selected hospitals did not have specialized Personnel department.

2. During the study it is revealed that the role of Personnel management is changing from traditional administrative role to a strategic role.

3. The average growth rate in both OPD patients and IPD patients was highest in Sainath hospital. It was 293.3% and 157.6% respectively. It can be attributed to lakhs of devotees who visit Shirdi from all over the world. Average growth rate was lowest in OPD in St.Luke (99.4%) While in case of IPD, it was lowest in Civil (88.4%).

4. The average growth rate in Laboratory was highest in PRH. It was 159.9%, the lowest was 100% in St.Luke. While the average growth rate in X-ray was highest in Sainath. It was 199.2% while the lowest was in St.Luke at 99.8%. 
5. The rising costs of hospital services and its maintenance have become quite expensive and has similar implications as that of rising production cost in industry. In view of high cost involved there is a need to examine the existing working methods and techniques to ensure optimum use of resources.
6. Data collection system for management purpose of all selected hospitals was not satisfactory and needs improvisation, use of computer can be useful.

**Manpower Planning**

7. Traditionally manpower planning is often viewed as a practice concerned with planning of future requirement of manpower, it should also be viewed as a practice concerned with effective utilization of human resource In most of the selected hospitals Manpower planning was not done on regular basis, which means that there was no system to monitor the future assessment and effective utilization.

8. Labour turnover in all selected hospitals in paramedical category i.e. lab, X-ray, pharmacy and nursing was very low. It was moderate in nursing section. It suggests that employees once recruited rarely changed job.

9. Promotion opportunities in all selected hospitals were low, one reason for it was low labour turnover. 10. There was no statistical evidence to prove collateral relations between manpower planning and recruitment. However there was a positive co-relation between successful manpower planning and recruitment
Recruitment and Selection

10. In all selected hospitals, Advertisement is observed to be the commonly preferred source of recruitment. There was no statistical evidence to prove varied preference in respect to the choice of leading newspaper and journal.

11. It is observed that technological development formed top ranking in determinants of recruitment in most of the selected hospitals. Technological factor was perceived, as most powerful and political factor was least powerful factor. There was no statistical evidence to prove the ranking.

12. The selection process in the sample hospitals varied moderately, but did not vary in functional areas.

13. All the sample hospitals had their own application forms. There is no statistical evidence to prove variance in the type of information sought from application form.

14. There was no statistical evidence to prove variance in the interview method practiced in the selected hospitals.

15. The absence of pre-employment tests gave selection process in selected hospitals a less objective, fact oriented and scientific outlook.

16. In all the selected hospitals medical fitness was preferred from within the hospital. This is a positive feature of the selection process as it reduced the chances of any malpractices.
17. There was no statistical evidence to prove substantial divergence with respect to practices of selecting the right candidate.

**Induction**

18. During the survey it is observed that 29.5% of the total respondents felt excited on the first day of job, 36.5% felt nervous, 11.5% had mixed feelings While 22.5% could not describe their feelings. The response of respondent was mixed indicating fluctuation in the response.

**Training**

19. Every human being requires time for assimilation, testing, acceptance and development of confidence. It was difficult to determine the impact of few training programmes on individual benefits and employee's ability for improvisation. Thus the tangible of training benefits were immeasurable.

20. During the survey it is observed that 53.5% of the total respondent felt that yoga and meditation can be included in training, Which is a positive sign indicating awareness of yoga and meditation amongst the hospital staff.

**Salary and wage**

21. There was similarity in Pay scale group of all selected hospitals.

22. The number of Pay scales were maximum in Civil (53) which indicated micro job classification. While in EBH and St. Luke they were minimum (13 each).
23. The total number of increment were less in the higher pay scale group and more in lower pay scale group.

24. There was no uniformity in DA rates in the beginning but over the years the selected hospitals have tried to achieve uniformity in DA.

25. There was no overtime practice in selected hospitals. In civil the practice was limited to drivers only. 37% of the sample employees did not favour OT practice because they felt that physical efficiencies should not be stretched over 8 hours considering the stressful nature of hospital work.

26. There was no bonus practice in selected hospitals.

**Employee – Management relations**

27. There was no health committee in any of the selected hospitals

28. Annual medical check-up of employees in all selected hospitals was not a regular feature of health programme.

29. The health programme of all the selected hospitals lacked emphasis on mental diseases like depression, anxiety, stress etc.

30. Medical facility was provided by all selected hospitals to its employees although there was difference in quantity and quality. The facility provided in PRH was better as compared to other selected Hospitals.
31. There was no Safety committee in any selected hospitals.

32. The safety record maintenance system was poor in all the selected hospitals.

33. There was no canteen committee in any of the selected hospitals, which meant that there was less official control over the functioning of canteen.

34. The housing facility in most of the selected hospitals was satisfactory. In Sainath, 73% of the total employees were provided housing facility.

35. Rest room facility was best in EBH and St.Luke. There was no such facility in Civil and Sainath.

36. The concept of suggestion box was poorly practiced in all the selected hospitals. During the course of the study, it is observed that the concept lacked efforts and encouragement on the part of management.

37. Among the selected hospitals EBH paid the maximum number of allowances as compared to other selected hospitals.

38. The unique feature of labour welfare activity in all the selected hospitals was that employees collected some amount from amongst themselves to support the funeral expense in event of employees or his close relative. This was classic symbol of sympathy and brotherhood.
39. Recreational facility was best in EBH as compared to other selected hospitals.

40. Employees participation in management was below moderate in all selected hospitals and there is vast scope for improvement in this area.

41. In general it is observed that in all selected hospitals the cases of discharge and dismissals in terms of punishment were very low.

42. Disciplinary action in all the selected hospitals was negligible.

43. It is observed that use of Marathi is increasing in all the selected hospitals in day-to-day business. PRH and Sainath were ahead in this area. In EBH and St.Luke, there is scope for improvement. This is better for effective communication with rural patients.

b. Recommendations

1. Every hospital employing 100 or more employees should have a specialized Personnel department. It will ensure that Personnel management practices are practiced in highly professional and systematic manner the benefit of which can be seen in management of hospital.

2. To have sound hospital management system, it is to be coupled with appropriate supporting systems. Input data system is one of the important support system that can provide valuable inputs for decision-making process. simple techniques like
questionnaires, interviews, observations etc. can be useful in data collection. Personnel department can shoulder the task of data collections and data recording. The use of computers should be encouraged.

**For effective utilization of human resource to improve Quality and Quantity of work**

3. Volume of work should be evenly distributed without any unfair and impartial practice. It will reduce the grievances associated with workload.

4. The scheduling of duties should be flexible and impartial; it will reduce any grievances associated with duty scheduling. It will also help employee to provide sufficient time towards his or her family and other personal work.

5. There should not be frequent changes in job assignments unless it is absolutely necessary. It will help to reduce frequent adjustments at work, save time and assure smooth functioning of the department.

6. In every department there should be an instruction and guideline board written creatively using colour ink. Thus the norms to be followed while performing duty will always are before the eyes of the employee.

7. There should be charts in every department depicting the level of delegation of responsibility. It is useful in preventing the confusion about the orders and reporting.
8. Every department in hospital should be connected with other department within the hospital through well-connected telephone system. It will help to improve communication, save time and efforts of employee, which is very precious in hospital.

9. Every department in hospital should be connected to generator in the event of electricity failure it helps to prevent work stoppage, avoids confusion in emergency and ensures smooth workflow.

10. Every department should have adequate support staff to perform supplementary work. It will ensure that technically skilled staff can concentrate on technical aspects of work.

11. There should be sufficient number of staffs in department during the peak working hours. Lunch and tea breaks should be planned to ensure that there are sufficient staff to continue flow of work. It is suggested that there should be a wall clock in every department and staff should match their clock with it.

12. There should be control on unofficial breaks during the working hours. Friends, Personal telephones, Gossiping etc. should be strictly not allowed. Each department should have water pot and toilet. It saves coming and going time. In extreme cases punching system can be introduced for tea breaks.

13. Routine and emergency lab tests, X-ray procedures should be scheduled for morning while specialized tests/procedures should be scheduled for afternoon as the workload is less in afternoon. There should be a clerk in lab, x-ray for looking after paper work. In pharmacy the clerk can be useful for collecting
cash and making receipts. This will allow the technical staff to fully concentrate on technical aspect of the job, which will help to increase the output.

14. Regular pharmacy audit should be conducted by the department with objective to evaluate variation in the number of prescriptions, use and misuse of drugs, doctors preference for certain line of treatment, irrational drug prescription etc.

15. There are no rules and laws to recognize and authorize laboratory. The only relevant way can be to have ISO certification from appropriate certification body.

16. The best use of nurse time can be made if the patient assigned to nurse is geographically close. This will help in saving time caused due to frequent visits, help in close observations and make notes on changing conditions.

17. Assignments of separate nurse for paper work associated with admission, discharge and enquiry will help other nurses in ward to fully concentrate on nursing care.

18. Every nurse should be trained in imparting health education to both patients and their relatives. It will help to reduce their queries and provide patients an opportunity to be involved in his treatment process.

19. The names of the nurses should be recommended on regular basis for award given by Maharashtra nursing council, Central and State government, Indian medical council and other voluntary organizations.
Recruitment

20. During the study it is observed that advertisement in newspaper was popular and most commonly used source of recruitment. Advertisement should be well designed using catchy slogans along with different sizes and types of prints. It should further provide brief information about the hospital and benefits it offers. Repetitions of advertisement should be avoided.

21. The system of Promotion should be in accordance with the basic principle that a person from the lowest rank of service can rise to the top, if he or she has acquired the necessary qualification, skill and his performance on job is outstanding. Promotion should be need based and not time based. 23. Recruitment can be costly affair, if the hospital is not in position to meet the costs. Following can be considered as alternatives in this regard

- Overtime – Short term fluctuation in work volume can be tackled with overtime.
- Sub contracting – If there is sudden increase in workload, specialists can be allowed to undertake part of work outside through subcontracting.
- Temporary employee – Employees can be hired from various recruitment agencies for limited time period.
- Employee leasing – A permanent employee of other organization who possess certain specialized skills can be hired on basis of lease to meet the short term requirement.
Selection

22. Bold discussions are needed on the part of management to come out of traditional pattern of selection. Suggestion in this regard can be as follows:

- Inclusion of additional steps in selection process.
- Inclusion of various advanced pre-employment tests in selection.
- There should be different application forms for different categories.
- Reference checking practice should be given preference in selection.

23. Interview in selection process should be devised in multilingual manner with English as prominent language, as all the reports and prescriptions are written in English.

24. Handwriting is an important mean of communication it reflects the personality traits of person. Selection committee should include handwriting analyst. In hospital for prescription writing and other medical reports writing, handwriting has to be clear and easily understandable.

Induction

25. A copy of hospital handbook containing hospital map, history, services provided, rules etc. should be made available at personnel department for employees information. Hospital should publish every year, annuals communicating hospitals achievements.
Training

26. Training should be organized in a manner that every employee undergo training at all stages in his career i.e. Initial, middle and later stage of employment.

27. Lack of interest can lead an employee to complacency where training can make a difference, to make training more attractive and extend its benefits to both personal and professional life of an employee. Efforts should be made to include unconventional topics for training like

- Civics sense – It will be helpful not only to inspire keeping the surrounding clean but also help to demolish ego and inspire sense of responsibility helping employee to be responsible citizen.

- Budgeting – Every employee must spend his income sensibly, this can affect the quality of his life. The most common mistake an employee makes is to start saving late. Saving habit depends upon individual approach, source of income, life style etc. Training in this context can be useful to employee to improve quality of his life, will teach employee about money management, Savings, Insurance and Stock market making him financial literate.

- Retirement – Employee on the verge of retirement should be enlightened with various issues associated with it like, How to adjust to this new phase of life? How to use spare time? How to maintain health etc.
Salary and Wage

28. Out of the 5 selected hospitals 4 were owned by charitable trusts. There was no diversity in pay scale. The principle of equal pay for equal work should be implemented by all selected hospitals.

29. The rate of dearness allowance should be paid at uniform rate in all selected hospitals as inflation is a common problem.

30. The practice of paying over time in selected hospitals was not in existence. The practice of overtime can adversely affect the efficiency and regularity of operation in organization like hospital.

31. Incentive schemes if followed in right manner can promote optimum use of resources like capital, machinery and time. Practice of incentive scheme should be in accordance with the hospitals philosophy.

Employee – Management relations

32. Hospital campus and surroundings should be clean and eco friendly. It makes the environment cheerful for both patients and employees of the hospital.

33. The practice of annual medical check up of employees was not a regular feature, efforts should be made to make it compulsory and record of it should be maintained.

34. Health day should be observed once in a year (April 7th World Health Day).
35. Stress, Depression, Blood pressure are some of the diseases which have direct relationship to working conditions. Different studies and research has shown that Yoga and Meditation can be useful in this regards if included in health programme.

36. Many a time doctors in hospitals do private practice and due to misunderstanding employee feel private practice is better. Management should make efforts to create awareness in this context.

37. There should be joint employee management committee to ensure regular implementation of safety programme. Employee’s participation must be made strict. As safety of employee is Personnel management function, Personnel department should maintain liaison with local fire department, Civil surgeon, Police station, Government Public health offices etc.

Canteen

38. During the study it is observed that there was a need for canteen committee comprising of representatives of management and employees in all selected hospitals to ensure its systematic functioning. Following suggestion can be useful to make canteen service more professional:

- There should be variety of items on menu list with special dish for selected day in a week.
- At least two balanced meals should be provided at the subsidized rate.
• Once in a year a food festival must be organized where employee can be educated about the importance of balanced diet, while at the same time acquaint them with the latest in the cuisine world.
• Light music, pleasant to ear should be played to make environment more lively.

Housing

39. Employees should be encouraged to come together for cooperative housing society schemes and build their own separate colonies and hospital management should provide guidance and help in this regard by arranging seminars, inviting bank loan officers, Estate agents, engineers etc.

Uniform

40. Uniform creates sense of pride and respect in the minds of employee. Cleanliness in hospital is must and every employee should be neatly dressed keeping in mind the value of cleanliness Following suggestion can be useful in this regard.

• Efforts should be made by hospital to provide washing allowance to ensure that employee come in neat and clean uniforms.
• Each department should provide aprons wherever required.
• Each department should have hand washing basin with mirror to maintain cleanliness, and neatness.
Restroom

41. The objective of restroom should be to provide rest and peaceful environment for relaxation. Following suggestions can be useful in this context:
   - The surroundings around the restroom should be clean and eco-friendly. Maximum trees should be planted in the vicinity of restroom
   - Each room should have photographs of natural scenario and meaningful thoughts.
   - There should be facility for prayer room in the nearby vicinity.
   - There should be facility for providing newspapers in restrooms if possible there should also be small library in the room

Suggestion box

42. To promote effective communication between employee and management suggestion box scheme has vital role to play because many a time’s employees may not be bold enough to express their suggestions openly.

Following are some of the suggestions in this regard for improvement:
   - The suggestion box scheme should be practiced with Procedure.
   - There should be printed suggestions slips made available at Personnel department.
   - There should be sufficient space for suggestions with option for language preference.
   - Confidentiality should be maintained.
   - Best suggestions should be rewarded and placed on notice board so that others are inspired.
Best worker
43. In order to create healthy competition and publicly acknowledge sincere efforts of employee, the hospital should encourage the practice of awarding best worker award based on criteria like attendance, inter-personal relations within, efficiency, individual behaviour, outstanding achievements etc.

Educational facility for employee's children
44. Efforts should be made by hospital management to provide career guidance to employee's children by inviting a career counselor after X, XII th

Transport facilities
45. Hospital should provide loans for purchase of bicycles and two wheelers. There should also be facility for adequate parking with the area marked "only for staff" and appropriately shaded.

Natural calamity
46. In the event of natural calamity, hospital should encourage its employees to contribute to prime relief fund and other voluntary organization. This will help to develop a sense of national integration, brotherhood and helpful attitude, which will contribute to strengthening employee management relations.

Welfare fund
47. For all welfare activities funds are essential which can be generated with joint contributions by employee and management. These funds can be used for super specialty treatment of employees, higher educations and other welfare purposes. Fund raiser programmes like musical shows, theatre shows should be organized to raise such funds.
Workers Participation in management

48. Modern day employees are becoming too individualistic due to absence of communication system leading to increase in stress and gap between employee and management. Here the concept of workers participation in management becomes important. Following are some suggestions for improvement:

- Different committees should be organized at different levels so that there is clear communication and effective monitoring of the activities like health, safety, welfare provisions etc.
- Apart from work related committees, there should be committees on social aspects of life like eco friendly environment, art and culture, hobbies of employees etc.
- Programmes like Quality circles, consultative management, TQM can be useful in this regard.

Discipline/Superior – Subordinate relations/Grievances.

49. It is observed during the study that the work culture developed in the selected hospitals was not ideal. The employees must decide that they are supposed to put in their best efforts independently and collectively. It is collective responsibility of employees to propagate this idea. Every individual employee should try and put his best efforts. Habits like absenteeism, unofficial breaks, careless in work are harmful to him as well as interest of the hospital.

50. In case of major or minor conflicts dialogues should be acceptable solution. Employees and management should not
look upon each others as rivals or enemies as such feelings and attitude can harm the relationships.

51. Both employees and management should realize that dissatisfaction is due to factors which are beyond control. It is better to solve such problem through adjustment and dialogue instead of showing strength and attitude.

**Miscellaneous suggestions**

52. A section of notice board should be reserved for thoughtful thoughts and spiritual messages which can provide not only guidance but also ensure spiritual growth.

53. The Hospital should develop practices of sending birthday cards to employees on their birthday. This will help to develop closeness and respect for hospital in mind of its employee. This task can be looked after by Personnel department.

54. There should be a small Museum in hospitals. Museums have their own values as a perfect tool of knowledge that help the society to visualize social changes of past.

55. There should be a small library section in every department for reference purpose; it should contain books, case reports, magazines, journals etc. It will help to develop a habit of reading, reference and research.

56. Personnel management practices like Manpower planning, Recruitment, Selection, Training, Salary and wage, Employee management relations etc should be practiced in highly
professional and systematic manner the impact of which should have direct influence on efficient management of hospital

57. In Ahmednagar district out of the five selected hospitals two are superspeciality (PRH and Sainath) hospitals. While other three have capability to be the same in future. This can open avenue for advancement of medical tourism in Ahmednagar district as medical tourism is a fast emerging sector having potential of creating jobs and can be a large foreign exchange earner. It is expected that medical tourism would generate about Rs 100 billion of revenue for India by 2012, if Indian economy grows by Rs 100 billion that can generate a tax base giving government enough room to raise more revenue and invest it in Public health. Ahmednagar district has historical and spiritual background (Shirdi). By focusing on medical tourism the government will be able to push the Ahmednagar district as one of the medical tourist destination. 60. India is facing problem of brain drain of healthcare personnels previously the arab countries were literally snatching our trained personnels now it is USA, UK and Canada who have started attracting them by offering attractive salaries. Personnel management can ensures enhanced job satisfaction making job attractive for personnels to remain in India.

c. Guideline for further Research

In modern times the term “Personnel Management” is replaced by the term “Human Resource Management”. The researcher observed that the original term “Personnel Management” was used in different areas of employment but with passage of time and change in perspective “Human Resource Management” replaced it, this term is refined in
nature. As far as hospital is concerned the application of Personnel management is still in its initial stage and to apply a refined term of HRM will be illogical. So this study is done based on the concept of the term Personnel Management in a hope that some researcher would use it as a base to work on Human Resource Management in hospital in future. It was observed during the course of this research study that the literature related to hospital management in general and hospital personnel management in particular was very limited both in terms of books available and research work done in the past. Based on his experience during the above study the researcher has envisaged following guidelines for further research studies

- A study could be undertaken to analyze the effective utilization of human resource in hospital with special emphasis on manpower planning.
- A comparative study can be taken on labour market situation with respect to recruitment in hospitals at district, state, and national level.
- A study based on performance appraisal, labour turnover, absenteeism in hospital can also be researched.
- A study related to the role of training in hospitals with respect to changing job requirements, advancement of technology, latest research in medical field and its correlated objectives of individual and organizational growth is worth a research.
- Also an inquiry could be undertaken to find out if there is variation in the cause that led to improvement or deterioration of the concept of employee – management relations, job satisfaction, human relations, morale of employees etc in hospitals.