Chapter 2

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

This chapter provides a detailed exposition of some of the prominent results of the earlier work on the emerging trends of media and dam related movements in India and abroad.

Yeshiwas Degu Belay (2014). Mass Media in Nile Politics: The Reporter Coverage of the Grand Ethiopian Renaissance Dam (GERD). Belay did a content analysis on the media coverage of the Grand Ethiopian Renaissance Dam on the river of Nile. He found that media frames according to the Ethiopian government dominant perspectives on Nile politics. He conducted a longitudinal qualitative content analysis of articles in thereporterethiopia.com during the period of 9th March 2012 to 15th March 2014 and found six dominant frames. They are:

1. Development frame: Media seemingly supporting the country’s major development project and also communicate to readers a sense of optimism. It portrays GERD as having the potential to meet the mounting developments needs of the nation in terms of providing energy supply for all different sectors of nation’s development projects.

2. National image frame: It portrays the dam as a demonstration to the other nations on how the people and the government work together cooperatively in accomplishing such a huge and seemingly impossible projects independently. It further portrays the nation in a more positive light economically and technologically.

3. Right frame: It represents about the Ethiopia having legitimate right to use Nile River and reveals the decisive reactions to Egyptian interest of exclusive pre-eminence over the Nile.

4. Victimhood frame: The truth is that those countries living in the downstream regions are the victim of the project. But, the media represent Ethiopia as a victim.
5. Mutual benefit frame: The dam is essentially depicted as water security and energy security maximizing project for both the downstream and upstream countries respectively and thus providing common benefit to all.

6. War frame: Since the beginning of the construction of this dam, media has been representing the struggle between Ethiopia and Egypt.

Yeshiwas Degu Belay found that many articles marginalized various important issues like ecological, environmental, communities livelihood and resettlement caused by the dam construction.

**Jubilee Goyal (2014). India mass media and its role in increasing environmental awareness leading to favourable consumer attitudes- a conceptual study.** In this conceptual study, Goyal discusses about the role of mass media in creating environmental awareness. The media considered here are newspapers, radio and television because of the fact that these are the most widely and frequently used modern mass media in India. He made an attempt to discuss how extensively; environmental issues are covered in the daily newspapers. According to him, the Times of India has abandoned its weekly column and none of India's daily newspapers has a regular space reserved for environmental news so that these are only addressed as government, ministry and legal news as well as in contexts of science or health. In an average it can be said that India's most important newspapers like Times of India, The Hindu, Hindustan Times or Indian Express have an article on environmental issues at least every second day, with Times of India doing the best job in terms of frequency. He found that the reason for this low growth is that environment coverage is competing with all the other issues covered in the newspaper whereby the most severe selection criterion is the news worthiness of an issue. Also, the interest of the reader as far as news on environment is concerned is supposed to be still fairly low by the editors. India's only environmental magazine “Down to Earth” can be mentioned for writing on environment and media, because it fills an important lack in Indian media and their coverage of environment. Even though it is cheap and have large number of accessible, the role of radio in creating environmental awareness cannot be considered an important one due to the fact that there are only very few regular environmental programs though there is an instruction by Supreme
Court for all media that programs on environment should be broadcast. Due to the high level of illiteracy in India, electronic media are in a key position. Furthermore, inquiries have shown that both radio and television are perceived as authoritative and friendly media by vast percentages of the population, compared to newspapers and radio. Television does a good job in covering environmental issues. He further recommended that environmental awareness can be increased by the supply of right product information and environmental information. The government; politician and lack of enforcement of laws are seen to be responsible much for the environmental problems. Lack of information provided to the people lead to poor awareness about the environmental issues. More information about environmental issues will therefore lead to better environmental awareness.

Kamal Kumar (2014). Environmental Movements in India: Re-Assessing Democracy. In this paper, Kumar seeks to interrogate the response of a democratic government in India and an authoritarian regime in China towards the environmental movements, specifically in the context of anti-dam movements which were mobilized against the Sardar Sarovar dam and the Three Gorges dam in these countries. He further interrogates the structural factors that drive a state’s response towards such movements in general and temporal factors specific to any particular context. However before doing so, based on the existing literatures, he made an assumption that in a democratic context, the government based upon the democratic political system has great competent of internalizing and representing the will of its general public within the governmental discourse and organizations where political power is exercised by the people. This system provides great opportunities to the people to participate in the decision-making procedures and such regimes are more receptive to the societal interests that are articulated through social movements including the anti-dam movements as compared to the authoritarian regime.

In a democratic political system, the collective mobilizations of people have much more autonomy to do their work since it is based upon the liberal philosophy. It does not view the functioning of the non-state actors as challenges to its authority, rather it encourages and even augments the strength of such actors to mobilize and organize people for a particular cause. But the states authorities in a non-democratic framework, like China, tends to discourage if not prohibit any collective and
organized societal actions since such actions are generally viewed to be linked with the political opposition and pose a threat to the prevailing political system.

In the study, Kumar has found that the democratic polity of India undoubtedly allowed people of the Narmada Valley to fully arrange them, seek popular support of the NGOs operating in an independent domain to launch a sustained campaign against the building of the Sardar Sarovar dam, unlike the situation in China. Where authoritarian exercised an iron hand in first of all closely controlling the process of registration of the numbers of NGOs that were allowed to operate in the domestic sphere especially those working in the environmental sector and then in using the might of the state to suppress the dissenting voices and even punishing those who tried to mobilize the people to take part in the anti-dam movement against the Three Gorges Project. The difference in the two states response towards the anti-dam movement ends here. Beyond this point, the state authorities in both India and China responded in a similar fashion to the both anti-dam movements. The democratic Indian state and its authorities failed to engage the protesters and the NBA in particular in any serious dialogue. On the contrary, the state used force and coercive methods to silence them. While popular participation in decision making is considered as one of the main pillars of a democratic state, the Indian state in the context of Sardar Sarovar Project had failed to provide any such opportunity to the oustees. Narmada Bachao Andolan underlined a major contradiction embedded in the democratic state of India which did not hesitate in taking authoritarian measures for safeguarding their own interests and that of their allies in the name of development for all.

Mira K. Desai and Putul Sathe (2013). Narmada Bachao Andolan Online: Exploring Discourses of Representation and Resistance. Desai and Sathe examines Internet as a site of struggle by people's movement like Narmada Bachao Andolan (NBA) using two specific websites as binary constructs of pro-movement and pro-dam locations and one web log stream. Looking from the perspectives cultural studies, they did content analysis and textual analysis method in order to explores meanings of ‘people’, 'struggle', 'society' as posed by pro-NBA, pro-dam groups and group of audiences (blogger and the respondents to the web log) as producers of their own texts. The study examines movement as a site for multiple discourses and
website as representation and resistance. The idea is to explore the intersections of Movement, State, People, Internet technology and users of that technology. The websites chosen for the purpose of analysis are: www.narmada.org, friends of river Narmada (pro-movement site) and www.supportnarmadadam.org (pro-dam site) and the web log chosen is http://prajatantra.blogspot.com which claimed itself as space "reflecting the hopes, expectations, fears and frustrations of the common man, the centrepiece in a democracy, who is forgotten more often than not". The study founds Internet websites as postmodern spaces, reflecting multiple voices and representations, wherein audiences/blogger spaces still indicate 'conformity' with the 'hegemonic' pro-state voices. One of the interesting things to note is the diversity of presentation in pro-movement versus pro-dam websites.

**Bharvi Dutt, K.C. Garg and Archita Bhatta (2013). A quantitative assessment of the articles on environmental issues published in English-language India dailies.** Dutt, Garg and Bhatta did research on the coverage of environmental-related issues published in 31 prominent English-language Indian newspapers in terms of their quantitative and thematic representation. The objectives of their study are:

1. To quantify the number of items pertaining to environmental issues and to identify newspapers that gave emphasis of these issues;
2. To analyze the prominence of the reported items and space devoted to them;
3. To codify the identified items into global warming, climate change and other environmental related issues; and
4. To identify themes, issues and concerns reflected in items pertaining to climate change and global warming.

The study was conducted during the period April 1, 2008 to September 30, 2008. In their study they found that among all the topics discussed under environment, climate change and global warming got the highest priority with 75% items which constituted more than two third of the total space occupied by environmental issues. Of these, highest number of items was on adverse impacts of the global warming/climate change followed by those on mitigation. They further found that among all the newspapers, The Times of India allocated the maximum space to the environmental-related issues.
Arun Lucas (2013). Print Media’s Coverage on Environmental Issues in India.

Lucas made a study on print media coverage on environmental issues in India, focusing on the way the newspaper covers the environment related news and found that environmental-related are underreported. The content analysis of two national dailies, The Times of India and The Hindu, are done with the objectives;

- To find out how much print media gives importance to environmental issues other than the time when there is no disaster or problem
- To analyze various categories of environment related news that has been addressed by the newspapers
- To study the newspapers’ approach in bringing awareness to people when there is frequent natural calamities

His analysis reveals that The Times of India does not seem to make much impression among the readers by its lack of fair coverage, whereas The Hindu has been fair in its approach to environmental-related issues. The analysis is done by categorizing the news that is covered by the two national dailies into four categories: Wildlife, Pollution and Programs/Events as first category; National, Regional, Urban and Rural as second category; Interviews, News, Editorial and Ads as third category and finally Protection Laws, Awareness Programs and Letter to the Editor as the last category. He found that both the papers are not giving sufficient coverage to all the categories of news like protection laws, pollution, editorial, letter to editor, etc.

Vimal Bhai and Madhuresh Kumar (2013). Resisting the Mythical Pursuit of Development: Anti-dam movements in India. Bhai and Kumar made a study on the active resistance to dam projects in the Narmada Valley, Brahmaputra Valley in North East, in Andhra Pradesh against the Polavaram dam, various dams on Ganges in Uttarakhand, Damodar Valley and in other river valleys across the country. These protests are not only against people’s displacements, but also for preserving India’s larger cultural identity. They found that people’s movements gain victories by forcing some dam projects to be cancelled, or halted or delayed. As a result of the protests the Central and the State governments and dam building companies can no longer proceed without scrutiny. Even the Ministry of Environment the Ministry of
Environment and Forests (MoEF) and environmental impact assessment committees were established in India. Governments, dam building companies, financial institutions and others have been forced to follow environmental and resettlement and rehabilitation policies, guidelines and laws which have emerged out of people's struggles over the years. At public hearings, people have challenged the exaggerated benefit claims for dams and challenged cancellations and disruptions of these public hearings. The government is now forced to publicly deliver all of the project-related documents. It can no longer hide behind the rhetoric of “dams means development” and silence critics. The myth of dams being synonymous with progressive development stands exposed today, even as the pro-dam lobby of politicians, companies, contractors and middleman who benefit financially from dam construction continue to push them as “green energy.” In their view, the resulting environmental and resettlement and rehabilitation problems are minor issues compared to the larger “benefits” of building dams. The proclaimed development “benefits” of big dams have been completely exposed by the anti-dam movements.

Claudia Campero-Arena (2013). The struggles against dams and for rivers in Mexico. Arena made a case study on people’s movements against construction of dams in Mexico. Mexico has more than 4,462 dams, 667 of these are considered large dams. The purposes of these dams vary and include hydroelectricity, irrigation, water provision for cities and flooding control. For the last 60 years, policies of the Mexican federal government regarding many issues have changed and varied, but one has remained constant: dams are perceived by the political elite as an important component of development. They are also a way to justify spending millions of pesos, some of which frequently get lost in the process. Indeed, corruption and lack of transparency in the budget spending are more rules than exceptions. However, there is a growing movement that started in Mexico in 2004 to oppose these projects and defend rivers. In the case study, Arena found that the movements of people affected by dams and defending rivers has managed to support struggles around the country, including the struggle against El Zapotillo Dam in Temacapulín, Jalisco, La Parota Dam in Guerrero and many others. It has managed to support community-based struggles for many dam projects in Mexico. This movement has created awareness among the population to counter the official discourse that “dams are development.” It has facilitated dialogue between academics, experts and human
rights activists to strengthen arguments that demonstrate that dams actually create more social and environmental problems than benefits.

Meera Karunananthan (2013). The Walls of Colonization: Hydroelectric dams and Indigenous communities in Canada. Karunananthan made a case study examining about the colonial legacy of Canadian dams through the examples of Quebec’s Plan Nord, Hydro Manitoba’s ever-expanding dam development pursuits, and the Muskrat Falls project in Labrador. She found that dam projects in Canada highlight the federal government’s failure to uphold its obligations to indigenous communities, rather intended to produce electricity solely for export to the United States. The case study demonstrates the historical and ongoing struggles of indigenous communities to defend their land and water against big dam projects in Canada. This occurs in a context where there is growing opposition to big dams around the world, and increasing evidence that they are the wrong solution for the world’s energy and water needs. Despite the tremendous resistance to dams by indigenous communities, there has been very little research by the federal and provincial governments on the long-term cumulative effects of the environmental and social costs of dams on affected communities and ecosystems. Among other concerns, while community-based and independent research has pointed to high levels of mercury contamination particularly in indigenous populations whose food sources are impacted by dam projects, Statistics Canada data on mercury contamination exclude people living on reserves, crown land and remote regions and further undermine the rights of indigenous communities fighting hydroelectric dams. First Nations groups have decried the gutting of the federal laws aimed at protecting fish habitat and navigation rights, which will allow for the development of industries that harm freshwater sources with fewer restrictions. Given navigation and the protection of fisheries are intimately linked to the traditions, food security and livelihoods of Indigenous peoples, the impacts of these policies will further exacerbate the environmental racism experienced by frontline communities.

Jhimli Bhattacharjee (2013). Dams and environmental movements: the cases from India’s North East. Bhattacharjee did a case study to understand the nature of movements against construction of Lower Subansiri dam, Tipaimukh dam
and Pagladia dam in Northeast India. He found that the movements do not provide a clear picture in order to make a final remark on its success or failure, but a major concern that dominates these movements is the issue of compensation and the unjust and inadequate Resettlement and Rehabilitation (R&R) package proposal which in turn criticizes state’s attitudes towards its subjects. According to him, the state is not able to give a final verdict against dam construction in the region despite the continuous protests. In case of Lower Subansiri it is found that despite the protest the project does not get a halt, but positive to construct the dam and the implementing agency NHPC claims to complete it by 2012. In case of Tipaimukh dam though the Indian government says no Tipaimukh move before informing Dhaka, the Manipur government is hopeful and still continues with its move for the dam which shows the will of the state is of more vigour than the protesters against the dam. Yet from analytical point of view the movement shows different levels of success of the movements against the dams. The region being in the remote corner does not find much handicap for communicating to different groups to campaign against the dam. Very often combined efforts are made to protest against the movement by networking at local, regional, national and international level. In many cases it brought partial success which is highly observed in case of Tipaimukh dam that the Indian government has to give a second thought over the issue of construction of dam in Tipaimukh. The case of protest against Lower Subansiri also shows success in so far as the protest is concerned. Because of the protest the Assam Legislative Assembly had to set up a multi-party panel to look into the impact of the dams on Assam. The movement against Pagladia dam equally registers success as the protesters are continuously driving away the move of the Brahmaputra board to initiate any step for the construction of the dam.

Kazi Rabeya Khatun (2013). Political Structure and Anti-dam Protest Movements: Comparing Cases of India and China. Khatun found that political structures have significant impact on anti-dam protest mobilization and citizens in a democratic political system enjoy more freedom in anti-dam protest mobilization than those in authoritarian regime. There are many similarities and differences among anti-dam protest mobilizations in India and China. But comparing the protest experiences of Sardar Sarovar Dam and Three Gorges Dam prove the fact that in anti-dam protest
mobilization, people of democratic regimes enjoy more favourable condition than their non-democratic counterpart. By showing their opposition to particular policies of a government, people in democracy takes part in government decision making. Democratic citizens are also guarded by the basic democratic rights and rule of law which enhances their possibilities of protest. That is why protests in democracy are mostly less violent. On the other hand, authoritarian regimes consider protests as an obstruction to development and suppress it in a coercive manner. Because of government’s unresponsive and suppressive attitude, protests in authoritarianism do not flourish in large scale but if it ever breaks out it can be very violent. While democracy faces higher number of protests than other political systems, protests in democracy also receives more positive outcomes and have higher possibilities for sustainable development. Country citizens of the democratic political structure have the opportunity of equal participation, human rights, freedom of speech and rule of law. It is democracy which embraces these qualities and provides opportunity for people to have their say in the policy planning and implementation which helps to promote sustainable development. In contrast to India, small scale protests over Three Gorges Dam did not yet turn into a large social protest and failed to stop the construction but it made Chinese people more aware than before and established foundation for future anti-dam movements.

Arup Jyoti Das (2012). Reporting dams and development: Strengthening media’s capacity to report research in Northeast India. Arup Jyoti Das did a case study on a Relay project undertaken by Panos South Asia in 2011-2012. The project was implemented in order to strengthen media capacity reporting on dam and development issues base on research findings. In the study conducted by Panos Asia found that despite the potential for many research findings to inform a more nuanced and critical debate on the issue of mega dams in Northeast India, the media contents found little mention of the research findings. The problems of the media houses found by the Panos Asia are:

1. Journalists’ lack of information resources,
2. Journalists’ lack of knowledge of wider issues and their context (focus on individual events),
3. Journalists’ lack training and lack of opportunities to specialize,
4. Journalists’ lack of resources including times to read and research and funds to travel to the sites,
5. Journalists’ receiving limited support from editors for the above,
6. The lack of communication between journalists and researchers,
7. Researchers’ limited experience in communicating research more widely (e.g. writing op-eds, holding press conferences).

But after the project, journalists were found to be more effective in the coverage of mega dams issue in cooperation with the research findings. They further suggested that the issue of mega dams should be given more attention focusing on its various impacts to the lives of indigenous people and to the animals and nature. And there should be cooperation between the journalists and researchers for providing the virtual sphere for larger public debate, for awareness through stakeholder meetings, and strategies to raise the issue at global level.

Anna Hurlimann and Sara Dolnicar (2012). Newspaper coverage of water issues in Australia. Anna Hurlimann and Sara Dolnicar did a research on media coverage of water-related issues caused by dams or water-recycling plants in Australia. They found that reports on water-related issues are characterised by lack of inclusion of views held by various stakeholders, a low level of support of statements with scientific evidence, a low level of impartiality in the sense of reporting on opposing views and a relatively high level of hedging, meaning that the author signals that there is some uncertainly about the reported information which is resulted from a content analysis of 1253 newspaper articles published in Australia in 2008.. Evidence from the study also indicates influence of editorial and journalistic decisions on the topics covered. Interesting is also the observation that researchers or scientists are very rarely quoted. Rather the primary group of people quoted in the context of water-related articles is politicians.

Hemanta Saikia (2012). Political economy of big Dam in North East India. In this paper Saikia made an attempt to identify the political and economic contradictions arising from big dams like the Lower Subansiri project and the Tipaimukh dam in North Eastern Region of India and found that the benefits from
dams are not equitably distributed. As a result conflicts come up from the indigenous people, local organizations towards the Government and National Hydroelectric Power Corporation (NHPC). Construction of huge power projects may not only distress the ecological balance of the region but also result in debacle like flood and forceful displacement of human inhabitants from their homelands. The protesters and organizations argue that big dams built for power have become a lightning rod for challenges to the development as something planned by elites with inadequate regard for environmental and social consequences—especially for the populations that are displaced. Being geologically and seismologically sensitive region, comprehensive environmental risk assessment assumes great significance to decide the viability of mega dams in the region. The Lower Subansiri Expert Committee report has revealed many issues related to earthquakes and their impacts in the region. One of the most serious impacts of the dams on rivers is the ecological degradation suffered by the river and the riparian land in downstream areas. Since in all operational dams norms of environmental flows are not maintained, the storage and release pattern is anomalous and erratic. In this juncture, the Government is not seemed to be given importance on the views and doubt in the mind of local people rather represents them as anti-development. Development is definitely the pre-requisite for the people of NER. However, development that harm some people cannot be welcomed if general welfare is chief concerned for the Government.

Maitreyee Mishra (2011). Environmental Communication in India: Lessons from Orissa. In this paper, Mishra takes a discursive and conceptual approach, using past research and case studies, to understand and analyse the various environmental discourses that have risen in the state’s media. Orissa has a considerable media presence with several newspapers; television and radio channels. She observes that the mass media of the state have been largely echoing views on industrialisation and private investment as laid out by the state government. There has been a widespread support, in the media, of industrial activities in ecologically fragile areas. This places the mass media of the state in a position of failing to provide adequate information about environmental problems witnessed in the state. There has been a gross absence of environment-related stories in the state’s print and electronic media, and where information is available; there is a reliance on information from
government sources. Mainstream media showed lack of interest in environmental reporting and also pointed towards a dependency on government sources of information on environmental concerns. She said that this may be due to two reasons—one, a lack of interest, and secondly, a lack of knowledge of environmental issues. Newspapers in the state do not generally have a section on environment, so environmental stories are issue or event-dependent. Furthermore, alternative sources of information are not usually sought out. Official sources become primary definers of the issue. Studies on the media in Orissa for coverage of environment-related stories were rare and hardly made it to the front page. Most coverage would be related to general issues around global warming or climate change, with focus on information from experts. She also observed that most coverage was limited to scientific expertise, extension, agricultural policy information and innovations demonstrating a rather top-down approach to information on environmental issues. But when the advocacy provided by international organizations like Survival International, Amnesty International, and other organizations and also celebrities stepped it to support the tribe then only media paid great attention. She found alternative media to be more effective than the mainstream media.

Shekar Dattatri (2011). Silent Valley – A People’s Movement That Saved A Forest. In this article Dattatri discusses about a remarkable people’s movement and the contribution of media to it that stopped a hydroelectric project across the Kunthipuzha River and saved a pristine evergreen forest in Kerala. He observes that media marks a distinct curve in this movement. According to him, the leading Malayalam newspapers first carry positive columns on the hydroelectric project. Continuously four years, after the project is approved and environmentalists begin their opposition to it, the newspapers still largely carry only news of the government’s efforts to start the project. Editorial opinion strongly supports the project and development. In 1979, a slight shift in newspaper reportage was noticeable. The Express, a local daily, is an exception. It carries editorials that constitute a deliberate and strong tilt towards saving Silent Valley; it also carries a feature with a measured argument explaining the importance of rainforests in layman’s terms. Along with support for the project, some newspapers raised concern for the ecological consequences of destroying the rainforest. Malayalam Manorama, a popular magazine, although inclined to view the project favourably, opens up its letters and
features columns to environmental opinions. Initially few national newspapers consider the environment a particularly interesting subject, and the Silent Valley battles that are raging in Kerala may well be in another continent. The political push and shove that the project endures eventually gets the newspapers to cover the opposition to the project. The Indian Express was ideally placed to pick up the issue on Silent Valley and its concerns. The Hindu regularly features editorials on the subject. In August 1979, the paper carries a full-page report on the flora and fauna of Silent Valley. The letters section of the paper attracts several eminent people, among them Rom Whitaker, M.K. Prasad, Madhav Gadgil.

Carla Steiger (2010). Dams and the damned: Draining the bucket dry. Carla Steiger made an investigation on media attention in the movement against the construction of the Sardar Sarovar Dam in India. She found that mainstream as well as alternative media contribute huge degree in the favour of the movement. According to her findings, media provide platform for the activists in conveying their voices against the construction of destructive dams. It helps in cessation of building destructive dams. For instance, the author Arundhati Roy, who is known for her prize-winning book, The God of Small Things, took up the cause of the movements and published a lengthy essay called The Greater Common Good, in two Indian weekly magazines, Outlook and Frontline. The piece also appeared in excerpted form in The Guardian, a British newspaper. Her article detailing the history of the resistance movement against the Sardar Sarovar Dam Project defined large dams as weapons of mass destruction, along the same lines as nuclear arms.

Rebecca Dixon (2010). Social Movements, Development Projects and the Corporate Media. In this article, Dixon examine how the Narmada Bachao Andolan (NBA) has successfully built a functional partnership with the news media that has led not only to attention to their cause, but to wider debate on the meaning of development. She looks into the articles’ headlines, the sources quoted in the articles, and the mix of positive and negative language used to describe the situation. She observes that media is often interested in the event-based nature of movements and a demonstration with no media coverage at all is a non-event. For instance, the NBA’s hunger strike, although eventually unsuccessful in its ultimate goal, succeeded in one
of its subgoals of publicity for the cause. It was covered extensively by the media. As the mass media has its autonomous interests, so the meaning represented varies. Much of the coverage was made immediately after construction work resumed on October 31 2000 but focus on the violent nature of the protests that occurred. This was a clever and effective twist to the media report that promoted their cause as just. More sympathetic coverage dominated when protests were peaceful. Most of the papers who are covering, covered the situation by using the Narmada case to generalize about the human cost of big dams. The attention of media outlets from around the globe has brought the case of the NBA to a huge number of people who might have otherwise been ignorant, or not considered these larger questions of public good ownership. The NBA attracts media attention through their dramatic forms of opposition; from hunger strikes to legal action, their actions are significant enough to merit attention. The NBA gains legitimacy through the press coverage that treats the movement and its leaders as recognizable actors who are consulted as regular sources on the issue of the dams on the Narmada River. Through media coverage they are able to spread word of their passion and of their resistant actions to more people, and to recruit new supporters. They were even able to create discussion to the point of changing meaning

Adam Payne (2010). Rivers of power, forests of beauty: Neo-liberalism, conservation and the governmental use of terror in struggles over natural resources. In this paper Payne discusses the relationship between conservation, neo-liberalism and government in the opposition to hydro-electric dams on the Tirthan River, Himachal Pradesh, India. Based on a series of discussions with activists involved in the opposition to hydro-electric dams in the areas surrounding the Great Himalayan National Park, he found that both conservation and neo-liberalism correspond in their exclusion of local communities from natural resources. He had explained his finding in three points. The first point he made was drawn from the relationship between conservation and neo-liberal development. From the perspective of activists, he found that conservation and neo-liberalism share a fundamental agreement about the exclusion of people from areas of rich natural resources and see natural resources as separated from human use and construct resources as either semi-mythic in conservation or open to exploitation as potential capital in neo-liberalism.
The second point concerns aspects of the relationships between the state and the companies building the dams and found contradiction to the majority of theoretical accounts of neo-liberalism which conceptualize it as a situation in which the state withdraws to a regulative and administrative position, leaving people to interact directly with the forces of the market. From the activists’ positions it was clear that the Indian state plays an enormous role as the producer and distributor of legitimizing ideas about the benefits of neo-liberalism, as the creator and director of legislative authority, and as a force of coercive discipline with which resistance movements must engage. He argued that by categorizing certain projects as ‘development’ in the service of the public good, and inscribing activists as anti-national, left wing extremists, the Indian government has created a space for the use of legally sanctioned violence in which opposition to projects can be publicly destroyed.

Finally, the violence of the state of exception is not local to India but is engaged with, directed and sustained by ideas that flow throughout the world. The processes of damming rivers are funded and supported by international companies that present themselves as ecologically conscious green businesses to customers in the West and the cities of India. For many customers, ecological responsibility has become the new morality of capitalism, and the two are no longer seen as antithetical ideologies. The effect of this movement has been to create an international idea of environmentalism, which tends not to see the environment as a political-economic issue but rather as one of abstract ecology.

Anna Roosvall and Matthew Tegelberg (2009). *Framing climate change and indigenous peoples: Intermediaries of urgency, spirituality and de-nationalization.* Anna Roosvall and Matthew Tegelberg made an analysis on how indigenous peoples were represented and positioned in the mainstream media coverage of climate change during COP15 and examine the appearance of these indigenous peoples in relation to a nature-cultures-politics nexus. COP15 is the UN climate summit, the event which took place in Copenhagen from 7 December to 18 December 2009. The data for this study were collected during a three-week period from 1 December – 22 December 2009, covering the Copenhagen climate summit,
from elite newspaper and popular newspaper of Sweden and Canada. All together 419 articles from both the Swedish and Canadian newspapers were examined.

Indigenous peoples mostly affected by the extreme climate change are the Inuit and Sami. Canada and Sweden are both home to these two indigenous peoples. They have close relation to the nature culturally and spiritually.

They found that in the coverage of the Copenhagen summit, indigenous peoples appear on the margins of Sweden and Canadian media. Both the press framed indigenous peoples differently in relations to other citizens and the notion of political citizenship, connecting to the cultural in what can be conceptualized as cultural citizenship. Indigenous peoples are made generalized as a nation, e.g. headlines did not position the Sami but Sweden as affected. Indigenous peoples were framed as a means for urgency and spirituality. When indigenous voices emerged, they appeared as a victim-heroes and important intermediaries of urgency and spirituality for the nation as a whole. They also appeared as intermediaries of de-nationalization, but they were misframed politically, recognized in terms of their culture rather than represented in terms of their status.

Maxwell T. Boykoff (2009). *We Speak for the Trees: Media Reporting on the Environment*. In his review article surveys on the role of the media in communicating environmental issues, Baykoff asserted that mass media plays an important role in the process of communication between science, policy, and the public and thus shaping many perceptions of environment problems and considerations for environmental governance. Drawing from various examples of media covering environmental issues, he found that many complex factors are contributing to media representation practices. He divided the factors into external and internal. External factor such as political economic challenges associated with corporate media consolidation and internal influences such as contributions from the deployment of journalistic norms, frame media representations. According to him, mass media put together formal environmental science and policy negotiations to the cultural politics of the everyday and constructs meaning of the environmental issues in particular ways. A persistent challenge in media portrayals of the environment has
been the propensity to treat many distinct environmental processes as one, and this highlights conflicts and debates in places where complexities and convergent agreement in science and policy may actually reside. Fairness, accuracy, and precision in media reporting remain critical due to the factors affecting in its production and thus efforts have fallen short leading to critical misperceptions, misleading debates, and divergent understandings, which are detrimental to efforts that seek to enlarge rather than constrict the spectrum of possibility for appropriate responses to various environmental challenges.

Padam Nepal (2009). How Movements Move? Evaluating the Role of Ideology and Leadership in Environmental Movement Dynamics in India with Special Reference to the Narmada Bachao Andolan. Nepal did a case study on how the movements of Narmada Bachao Andolan move. He made an evaluation on two variables, i.e. Ideology and leadership, in the movement and found that they are rather dynamic and get changed and transformed in the course of the movement. In course of its evolution and development, the movement has undergone transformations several times, with changes in its thematic orientations, changes in strategies, changes in support bases, and finally changes in the structure of the movement, from a local movement to a national one, and finally becoming a movement of global significance. These transformations are brought about by the interaction of movement variables, including the ideology of Gandhian idea of non-violent direct action, and the nature of the leadership. The simple application of the Gandhian ideology has led to the dynamism in the movement in the form of discursive and dialogic practices. Moreover, the ideology being non-comprehensive and undefined, the movement has not given opportunities for manifest ideological differences on ideological premises. This has also produced internal contradictions in the movement for want of a comprehensive ideological premise. The nature and course of the movement and the movement strategies are also affected by the fact that there is an acute awareness in the movement regarding the need for a more inclusive, comprehensive and well defined ideology.

With regard to the leadership, it was found that there was a leadership clash between the urban educated middle-class leadership of the movement coming from
outside and the aspiring tribal leadership who have not been given their legitimate share in the movement leadership. This has resulted in the dwindling of the support base of the movement in places where the activists have chosen to accept the rehabilitation package of the government than to toe the leadership of the movement that undermines their role in the movement. Thus, the leadership and conflicts within the movement leadership has become an important factor unleashing dynamics in a movement and impacting on its nature and course.

Smita Narula (2008). The Story of Narmada Bachao Andolan: Human Rights in the Global Economy and the Struggle Against the World Bank. Narula did a case study on Narmada Bachao Andolan (NBA) campaign against the construction of dams on the Narmada River. She found that the campaign has become as a symbol of a global struggle for social and environmental justice, at the same time a hope for people’s movements all over the world that are fighting for just, equitable, and participatory development. Though the NBA has yet to achieve the goals for which it has so tirelessly fought, its victories in the face of seemingly insurmountable odds have earned it the reputation of being one of the most dynamic social movements of our time and one that the government continues to expend considerable resources to fight against it. The campaigns were complemented by international interventions abroad. As protests intensified, so too did the backlash from the state; international human rights NGOs began documenting abuses against NBA activists. In response to a tide of mounting pressure, the World Bank and its donor’s countries were unhappy with the developing image of the Bank as a human rights violator and thus withdraw funding of the project.

The NBA put the issues of displacement on the agenda in India and at the global level. Specifically, it forced consideration of the ecological viability and social impacts of large-scale projects. There is little doubt that the NBA failed in its immediate objectives but the movement has left a strong legacy which is evident in the manner in which issues initially raised by the NBA have surfaced in other anti-dam struggles. But its greatest domestic achievement was to put the costs of the development agenda under the microscope in a manner that will continue to have a major impact on public culture. Ultimately, the Sardar Sarovar dam is symbolic of a
larger struggle over the discourse of human rights and development in India. The groundwork laid by the movement has created an uncontestable space for the voices of India’s faceless and nameless displaced—voices that will continue to influence the course of India’s paramount task of achieving equitable development alongside economic growth. In addition to ensuring greater transparency and accountability in World Bank projects, the NBA has contributed to an awareness of the need to approach environmental and human rights issues in tandem—a lesson long known to Indian activists and one that is increasingly apparent to actors on the international scene who urgently battle environmental degradation and its acute impact on marginalized populations.

Jane Chapman (2007). India’s Narmada dam controversy: Interdisciplinary examples of global media. In his study, Jane Chapman found that radical alternative media is more effective in making continuities, change and awareness of audience on Narmada dam movements than the mainstream media. He made an assessment on the nature of two documentary films: Anand Patwardhan’s A Narmada Diary (1997) and Franny Armstrong’s Drowned Out (2004) and the writings of Arundhati Roy and found that these media communication popularized the Narmada conflict internationally. Through their narratives and style, this three works represent interdisciplinary examples which have brought an extended creative and political repertoire of engaged journalism on development issues. By applying Downing’s four characteristics of radical media, he has tested in the case of Narmada communications. According to him these radical alternative media are more effective because: a. it break all the golden rules of conventional professionalism and reflects the reality, b. it is more democratic method by connecting the affected people, c. it is a combined lateral and vertical purposes by drawing the attention of those in power to the need for change at the same time galvanizing ordinary people into further political awareness and d. attack from authority for reflecting the reality and thus making more media attention. He further said that mainstream media operate mostly from the existing power structure and ignore the minority voice. His work is focused on the effective of radical alternative media on Narmada dam issue, but he limited on the functioning on media under power structure.
Tim Forsyth (2007). Are environmental social movements socially exclusive? A historical study from Thailand. In this study Forsyth analyzed nearly 5,000 newspaper reports between 1968-2000 in Thailand about social movements and democratization by assessing the relationship between the social composition and political values of environmentalism, particularly to indicate the participation of middle and lower classes, and their association with conservationist and livelihoods-oriented environmental values with reference to Nam Choan dam dispute. Many discussions of environmentalism and democratization in developing countries have suggested that environmentalism tends to be dominated by the middle classes, and that environmental norms of social movements tend to reflect the “green” rather than “red-green” agenda. He found that environmentalism in Thailand has been dominated by middle-class “green” activism, especially concerning forests. Yet, the presence of lower-class activists has increased significantly since the 1990s, and environmentalism has increasingly considered “red-green”, especially concerning livelihood, topics too. At the surface level, newspapers have portrayed environmentalism with democratization, or the criticism of the state and belief in community action. It would therefore appear that environmentalism in Thailand has been a democratizing force, both by forming an arena to criticize the state, and by becoming more diverse and socially inclusive itself. However, portray all environmentalism as democratization, suggesting that the possible exclusiveness of some environmental norms is unacknowledged.

Rakesh Kalshian (2005). Mainstream News Reporting Ignores Critical Water Issues In India, ‘reportage on this complex subject has regressed to its earlier character—unsophisticated and immature.’ In this article Kalshian discusses about the mainstream media ignoring reporting of critical water issues in India cause by development project like Narmada dam. Pollution and excessive extraction apart, inequitable access to this most fundamental resource makes the problem especially egregious. He asserted that market forces have forced the media to concentrate more on economic aspects than social good. With the increasing competition from TV, newspapers have become increasingly intolerant of long analytical narratives on water issues. Reporters no longer travel to the problems site rather are expected to file short snippety stories sitting in their newspaper offices. As corporate own the media houses, relevant and meaningful news has almost become
part and parcel of the corporate social responsibility. However, even as environment reporting is languishing, water continues to enjoy media’s indulgence, not because rural India is dying of thirst but because the urban middle class is facing an acute water crisis. Even in cities, the water needs of the poor are rarely reported. Indeed, water makes it to the front page only in the summer months, when people in Indian cities start crying hoarse for water. The news media have tended to be less critical of market based solutions to environmental crises while overlooking insightful grassroots critiques of water management. Besides the economic interest of media another major reason for the lacking of clarity is that journalists’ understanding of water issues remains piecemeal. The mainstream media have failed to highlight the fact that economic globalization has led to more unsustainable consumption of water by forcing farmers to grow water-intensive cash crops and by promoting water-intensive industries like mining.

Sanjay Kak (2004). Politics in the Pictures: Witnessing Environmental crises in the Media. Sanjay Kak has witnessed environmental crises in the media, particularly in the coverage of Narmada Bachao Andolan (NBA) movement. According to him what is happening in the Narmada valley is a story with enormous implications: economic, social, scientific, political, even philosophical, moral and ethical. As a mass movement, the visibility of NBA has developed over long periods of time. There are endless issues in the movements. But he found that the movement is fixed and static in the imagination of media. As if the implication of the movements have been doing and saying the same thing for over a period of time. Media paid attention to the issue only when there is an event of movement. But media coverage balks when the event gets over. Even during the coverage, it has consistently scorned the movements and its supporters but editorially spoken in favour of big dams.

R.C. de Loë (1999). Dam the news: Newspapers and the Oldman River Dam project in Alberta. Loe did a research on newspaper coverage of the Oldman River Dam story in two Alberta papers, the Calgary Herald and the Edmonton Journal, during the years 1975 and 1992. The Oldman river dam in Alberta, Canada is a major water control structure built by the Government of Alberta to regulate the flow of the Oldman River. Completed in 1992, the dam has become the subject of
intensive media coverage in Alberta, Canada. Since the media played an important role in making public awareness of the dam project, in the study Loe found that media influence on Government policy was mixed. In the early years of the case (1975–1980), there is evidence that the provincial Government changed its plans in response to public protests documented in media such as the Herald and the Journal. However, after 1987, the Government came to see the media as biased, and not representative of public opinion. Consequently, their influence on policy makers was negligible. The analysis look into the patterns in coverage of both papers, which include wild swings from year-to-year in the number, emphasis and tone of items, with reference to inherent characteristics of the media. These include: an inability on the part of the papers to consider positive and negative aspects of issues simultaneously for any length of time, and a consequent tendency to provide either a positive or a negative stance; simplification of very complex issues in an attempt to create accessible, newsworthy stories; rapid shifts in the tone of coverage, as attention focused on different dimensions of the issue, rather than because of new information; a focus on conflict and other sensational aspects of stories; and a tendency towards a rapid loss of interest in a story once journalistic attention shifts elsewhere.

Madhav Gadgil and Ramachandra Guha (1994). Ecological conflicts and the Environmental Movement in India. In this article, Gadgil and Guha asserted that nature-based conflicts have increased in frequency and intensify in India. For instance, Narmada Bachao Andolan has generated a new movement struggling for the right of victims of ecological degradation. This movement has added a new dimension to Indian democracy and civil society. It has also poses an ideological challenge to the dominant notions of the meaning, content and patterns of development. This movement has emerged criticism from two perspectives which have considerable force and yet it is the social implications of dam construction that have evoked a major popular response. From the economic perspective, it is argued that the cost-benefit ratios derived by the government to justify various dams invariably overvalue benefits and undervalue costs. From the ecological perspective, the high incidence of water logging and the wholesale submergence of forests and wildlife have been presented as example of the unacceptable costs of dam building.
According to them, the variety and range of nature-based conflicts notwithstanding, two particular movements stand out for their symbolic importance to the Indian environmental debate. These are the Chipko and the Narmada valley projects movements. As paradigms of the conflict between the low and the mighty, both have relied on non-violent forms of protest. In each case, folk knowledge and anguish have forced ecologists and economists to reconsider the efficacy of dominant forms of resource use widely justified as scientific. These two movements have helped generate a far reaching debate on the direction of economic development in India and the kind of society most appropriate to the needs of its culturally diverse, yet sharply fragmented population.

In analyzing the movements, they have distinguished between its material, political and ideological expressions. The material context is provided by the wide-ranging struggles over natural resources as it diverted to produce energy and commodities for the rich while the poor are made to bear the social and environmental costs of economic development. The political expression has been the organization by social action groups have embarked upon three distinct sets of initiatives. Firstly, through the process of organization and struggle they have tried to prevent ecologically destructive economic practices. Secondly, they have promoted the environmental message through skillful use of the media and more innovative means such as walking tours and eco-development camps. Finally, they have taken up programmes of environmental rehabilitation, restoring degraded village ecosystem and thereby enhancing the quality of life of the inhabitants.

Through the process of struggle, the spreading of consciousness, and constructive work, action groups in the environmental field have come to develop an incisive critique of the development process itself. Responding to the conflicts over nature resources that have become sharp in recent years, environmental activists and intellectuals sympathetic to their work have raised major questions about the orientation of economic planning in India, its in-built bearer in favour of the commercial-industrial sector, and its neglect of ecological considerations. More hesitantly, they have tried to outline an alternative framework for development which they argue would be both ecologically sustainable and socially just. Although perspectives within the movement are themselves quite varied, in it’s totally this
fostering of a public debate on development options constitutes the ideological expression of the environmental movement like rejection of the modern way of life on the moral/religion ground and the unequal access to the natural resources where the rich destroy nature in the pursuit of profit while the poor are made to surrender simply to survive.

Rajasekhar Ramakrishnan (1991). How Gujarat Media Covered Narmada Bachao Andolan Yatra. Ramakrishnan conducted a study on the Gujarat press during the five-week-long Jan Vikas Sangharsh Yatra (Dec. 25, '90 to Jan. 31, '91), a people’s movement against the construction of Sardar Sarovar Project in Gujarat fighting for their right to life and livelihood, in the Narmada Valley. He found that blatant acts of distortion, half-truths were practiced by the Gujarati press and myth built up by the Gujarati politicians and media over the last few years. The national press (English and Hindi) was, with some notable exceptions, balanced in its reporting, but the local media buried objectivity and bent over backwards in trying to denigrate (less important) the Yatra and its organiser, the Narmada Bachao Andolan, revealing a clear nexus (connection) between itself and the state government. The Gujarati press distorted the aims and objectives of the movement and portrayed their peaceful movement as a violent move. Allegations were appeared that the marchers were carrying bombs as if the Gujarat's peaceful citizenry would be attacked with bows and arrows, spears, sticks, scythes and other weapons. The Gujarati press also started creating imaginary divides between Baba Amte and the rest of the Andolan leaders. Another favourite theme of the Gujarati media about the movement was the allegation of foreign link saying that the movement was incited and funded by outsiders who did not want India to develop. The daily press releases issued from the Sangharsh Yatra camp were ignored. A number of events were completely blacked out or given an inconspicuous space in the papers.

The main conclusions from the earlier work shows that media’s role on the coverage of dam related issues seems to be contradictory. But the movement shows great effect and contributes in bringing some changes to the political system both in democratic and authoritarian regimes. Many studies have shown that media frames according to the government dominant perspectives and its spaces indicate conformity
with the hegemonic pro-state voices. While reporting dam related issues, media is characterized by lack of inclusion of views held by various stakeholders, exclusion of local communities from natural resources, framing indigenous peoples generalized as a nation; rather concentrate more on economic aspects than social good and echoing views on industrialization and private investment as laid out by the state government. It constructs meaning of the dam related issues in particular ways. On the other hand, studies shows that people's movements gain victories by forcing some dam projects to be cancelled, or halted or delayed. Though the movements do not provide a clear picture in order to make a final remark on its success or failure, but a major concern that dominates these movements is the issue of compensation and the unjust and inadequate Resettlement and Rehabilitation (R&R) package proposal which in turn criticizes state’s attitudes towards its subjects. None of the studies look media texts from the perspectives of neo-Marxists media theory. Therefore, the present study differs from the rest in terms of qualitative documentation of anti-dam movement in Northeast India. The present study investigates media construction of ideological commonsense.

References


