CHAPTER 5

FINDINGS & RECOMMENDATIONS
 CHAPTER 5  
FINDINGS & RECOMMENDATIONS

We are at the very beginning of time for the human race. It is not unreasonable that we grapple with problems. But there are tens of thousands of years in the future. Our responsibility is to do what we can, learn what we can, improve the solutions, and pass them on. - Richard Feynman

This chapter illuminates the findings of the study. The limitations of the research are listed. Thereafter recommendations for the academic fraternity in terms of using literature as a teaching method for Management students as well as novels which could be used for different Management topics are listed out. Thereafter, suggestions for the future scope of research are discussed. The concluding section of this chapter sums up the study.

5.1 Brief Summary

Management education cannot be compared with studying other subject areas like chemistry, physics, mathematics or law etc. Management education can rather be compared with medicine. No doctor is allowed near a patient purely on the basis of theoretical knowledge. Doctors learn the professional skills by acquiring the practical knowledge that is taught by practicing doctors and hence they become experts in diagnosing the real physical condition of patients. In the similar way, in a business scenario also you have to do things, take decisions, take actions, and monitor results. One cannot operate any business by just planning what to do on paper. Planning is, though an important step in the process, there are many examples of businesses with excellent plans having failed because of non implementation of proper ideas. Thus Education in management has two aims: firstly, to increase the understanding of the factors which influence the conduct of organizations and secondly to provide students with the tools and techniques which they may use to influence organizational life. Each situation can be described as unique, requiring its own unique solution. To be able to do this, one should be able to analyze a situation, examine various alternatives and come out with solutions to solve the particular problem being faced or to achieve organizational goals. The ability to take an overview of business problem-solving and decision making processes is necessary for a successful career in business management and administration. Management courses focus on creating managers who can
develop new strategies, systems and tools to solve complex management problems in a rapidly changing environment to guide organizations to greater prosperity. The students taking the course lack experience in organizational endeavors. Hence they are unable to grasp strategic management concepts.

Using illustrations to elucidate theory is a well-respected academic tradition. Going back in history management competencies have been taught through stories. Machiavelli used stories of the kings in Ancient Greece to instruct his Florentine princes in strategic statesmanship. Ancient Greek write Aesop’s fables have been moral exemplars for thousands of years. Closer home, Jijamata used stories of exploits of famous personalities and trained her son Shivaji in leadership qualities. It is the standard practice in Business Schools all over the world to instruct by looking at what other people have done. Management students look at case studies of real businesses to determine the principles of organizational management. The protagonist and the situations of literary novels can offer candid and impressive lessons about management skills. As such, literature can be a useful Management teaching tool.

Dr Danzig (1999) has said that “one of the great advantages of reading fiction or history is it gives you the opportunity to understand the world from different vantage points and different time periods and different psychologies.” This study is based on the fundamental belief that there is a lot to be learned about management and leadership from literature. The use of fiction as a way into a greater understanding of organisations has enormous potential.

The purpose of this study was to explore whether student performance in the cognitive domain, and knowledge, comprehension and application level are influenced by teaching methodology using literature. This was done by creating a model for teaching using the novels Lord of the Flies by William Golding and The Devil and Miss Prym by Paulo Coelho. In a set of two experiments, two groups were taught the same topics from OB in the first experiment and business ethics and corporate governance in the second experiment. The experimental group was taught using the novel and the control group was taught using conventional methods. The impact of teaching methodology on student perception was also studied. The researcher was interested in finding out if the age, gender, social class, entry qualifications, CET scores and work experience moderate the relation between the independent variable (teaching method) and the dependent variable (performance). Twelve hypotheses were tested, and some significant
relationships were found.

5.2 Findings

5.2.1 Faculty Survey

The findings of the Management faculty survey are stated below:
Lecture, Case study and powerpoint presentations are widely used to teach Management in India. Co-operative and Constructive methods are also used to teach Management in India to some extent. Art and Literature are not widely used to teach Management in India. Novels are not used to teach Management in India.

Non conventional teaching methods like co-operative, constructive and art and literature methods vary depending on location and teaching experience. It seems that experienced faculty is more inclined towards non conventional methods. The perception of using novels as a Management teaching tool varies with the experience of teaching faculty.

Use of Co-operative and constructive methods vary according to subject wise faculty. Finance, Systems and Marketing faculty seem to show similar trends in use of teaching methods. The HR faculty has a different style of teaching. HR faculty uses Constructive methods extensively while Systems faculty are restrained in the use of these methods.

The perception of using novels as a Management teaching tool varies with the faculty of different streams. HR faculty seems more inclined to use novels as method to teach Management. Finance and Marketing faculty are undecided while some are not interested, others seem willing to try it. Systems faculty is neutral about using novels.

5.2.2 Experimental Study

This study compared the effectiveness of literature based teaching and traditional instructional approaches in developing selected Management concepts among Management students and examined whether literature based teaching was differentially effective with students of different ages, gender, social class, students with work experience, students with different CET scores and entry qualifications.

Using Literature as a Management Teaching Tool
While the connection between teaching style and student performance has been studied in the field of teaching research, this paper makes some unique contributions specifically in regard to the impact of using literature as a Management teaching tool on student performance in the cognitive domain with specific focus on the knowledge, comprehension and application level. These findings may provide new insight into the ways in which teaching Management using literature is a factor for how students perform.

Six findings stood out as interesting.

First, overall, literature based teaching was found to be a more effective instructional approach for teaching selected Management concepts than traditional lecture–presentation-case study. Additional analysis provided evidence that literature based teaching was more effective than traditional instruction for knowledge level, comprehension level and application level within the cognitive domain.

Secondly, the results suggest that students perceive using literature as a Management teaching tool as better than the conventional methods of teaching. Further, it is observed that students perceive using literature as a Management teaching tool to have better content and more clarity. In terms of connect and confidence perception, there was no significant difference between the experiment and control groups.

Thirdly CET scores may moderate the relationship between the independent variable (teaching method) and dependent variable (performance scores) at the knowledge level of the cognitive domain in the initial phase but this may get offset over a period of time with various interactions with the peers, faculty and the enriched academic environment whereby the group becomes homogenous.

Fourthly, Commerce and Management graduates performed better at the knowledge level of the cognitive domain which is not surprising considering that they may have had previous knowledge in the subject. In the second experiment, the topic business ethics and corporate governance was new to all the students. Hence this difference in performance was not observed in the second experiment.

It was found that a majority of Science and engineering graduates had higher CET scores. It is felt that the choice of an HR subject deterred these students from being impacted by the use of
literature as a Management teaching tool. This difference did not show in the second experiment. This was possibly due to the fact that a universally applicable topic ethics and corporate governance was selected.

Fifthly, in case of work experience there was no impact in the first experiment. During the second experiment, freshers were more impacted by the experimental method in terms of the knowledge level of the cognitive domain. Students with prior work experience would have been familiar with ethical practices. For the freshers, the topic would be a new area and they would possibly have gained more from the interaction.

Lastly, Age, Gender and Social Class do not moderate the relationship between the independent variable (teaching method) and dependent variable (performance scores). Therefore it can be concluded that the teaching method using literature is equally applicable to all students: all the students, irrespective of their age; gender: male or female; freshers or students with work experience; General, OBC and SC/ST/NT.

5.2.3 Retention Analysis

The impact of using literature as a Management teaching tool was also tested for retention analysis.

In the first experiment, knowledge retention did not vary significantly between literature based teaching and traditional lecture–presentation-case study groups. Additional analysis provided evidence that the specialization taken by the student may have impacted the subject taught.

During the second experiment, the different pedagogies have impacted retention. This may be due to the fact the students have matured. They derive meanings and are able to apply Management concepts better. Additional analysis provided evidence that the specialization taken by the student may have impacted the subject taught. The choice of topic for this experiment, could also be a contributing factor as business ethics and corporate governance are universally applicable to all students. Hence the interest level of all students was common. Moreover, Finance and Marketing is more impacted by ethics and corporate governance with the legal implications and mandatory disclosures as they deal with the external world while HR practices within the organization.
5.3 Limitations

Generalizability of the results is dependent on the possible delimitations set by how the study was conducted. Delimitations are put by the researcher. Limitations are a consequence of delimitations.

The limitations of this study are:

1. The sample consisted of 120 Management students only.
2. The experiments were conducted in one B-school in Mumbai.
3. The model had been designed for Organizational behaviour concepts, Ethics and Corporate Governance only.
4. The novel is the only form of literature used.
5. The novels *Lord of the Flies* and *The Devil and Miss Prym* were the only novels used.
6. The performance scores are on the basis of the question paper set.
7. The perception is considered on the basis of the feedback form used by the institution.
8. Retention is on the basis of the examination administered to the students.

The results of this study will be generalizable only to samples and subjects similar to those used in this particular study.

5.4 Recommendations

The function of this study is to help educationist visualise and conceptualise their training design. The researcher would like to make the following recommendations:

1. Management concepts should be taught in an interesting manner using various art and literary forms like novels, drama and films.
2. The technique of using literature as a Management teaching tool should be introduced in B-schools.
3. The current generation of students whose attention span is on a diminishing trend may find it easier to tackle short case studies as compared to long novels. Short stories, one act plays could be used to teach Management concepts.
4. Training programs to train faculty in this technique should be conducted.
5. B-schools could procure well-structured case studies based on novels which are available from institutions such as The Hartwick Humanities in Management Institute and Harvard Business School.

6. Universities can introduce a novel for analysis similar to the rapid reader concept in schools.

7. Student’s perceptions could be studied at regular intervals in order to tailor courses that meet the needs of the students and reach an acceptable standards.

8. A combination of novels could be used to teach a subject.

Some novels are listed for various in topics in Table 5.1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Novel</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Character(s) to study</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Year of Publication</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Dead Famous</td>
<td>Ben Elton</td>
<td>David, Inspector Coleridge</td>
<td>Bantam</td>
<td>2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behaviour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Animal Farm</td>
<td>George Orwell</td>
<td>Napolean, Snowball, Boxer, Squealer</td>
<td>Penguin</td>
<td>2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership</td>
<td>All the King’s Men</td>
<td>Robert Penn</td>
<td>Willie Stark</td>
<td>Houghton Mifflin</td>
<td>1946</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Beach</td>
<td>Alex Garland</td>
<td></td>
<td>Penguin</td>
<td>1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harry Potter and the Goblet of Fire</td>
<td>J K Rowling</td>
<td>Harry Potter, Dumbledore</td>
<td>Bloomsbury</td>
<td>2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization Change</td>
<td>Power</td>
<td>Nick Dear</td>
<td>Faber and Faber</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Something Dangerous</td>
<td>Penny Vincenzi</td>
<td>Orion</td>
<td>2002</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resource Management</td>
<td>Bridget Jones Diary</td>
<td>Helen Fielding</td>
<td>Picador</td>
<td>1997</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Grass is Singing</td>
<td>Doris Lessing</td>
<td>Flamingo</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>Talking it Over</td>
<td>Julian Barnes</td>
<td>Picador</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personality</td>
<td>The Adventures of Huckleberry Finn</td>
<td>Mark Twain</td>
<td>Dover</td>
<td>1994</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Great Gatsby</td>
<td>F.S. Fitzgerald</td>
<td>Scribner</td>
<td>1925</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>One Flew Over the Cuckoo’s Nest</td>
<td>Ken Kesey</td>
<td>Penguin</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pride and Prejudice</td>
<td>Jane Austen</td>
<td>Thomas Egerton</td>
<td>1813</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 5.1 NOVELS TO TEACH MANAGEMENT
5.5 Future Scope of Research

Additional experiments are being designed to provide more information, new insights, and new direction for future research. Future experiments could focus on the following:

1. The current generation of students in India prefer to read Rowling’s Harry Potter series or Chetan Bhagat’s novels as compared to classic literature like Shakespeare, Jane Austen etc. Research could be done to find whether the impact of contemporary novels would be different from classic literature?

2. This study leads us to question whether there are other entry level factors like CET scores and entry qualifications tend to have an impact on student performance as demonstrated in this study.

3. Research could also be done on other factors which could moderate the impact of the teaching method like culture, religion, family income, urban / rural background.

4. Effectiveness of the use of literature as Management teaching tool compared with other teaching andragogy like simulation, role play, case study, films could be assessed.

5. The current generation of students whose attention span is on a diminishing trend may find it easier to tackle short case studies as compared to long novels. Effectiveness of a short story as compared to a novel in generating interest and motivating students could be studied.

6. Functional novels can be identified for Finance, Marketing, Systems and its effects on achievements can be studied for students who have taken up that specialization.

5.6 Researcher’s Learning

Experimental research in this area is essential. However, the researcher finds it difficult as there is not much of research culture in the institutes. The faculty is more keen to complete the syllabus rather than trying out different methods of teaching.

Students generally enjoy novelty in teaching. Inter-disciplinary approaches to teaching like using different forms of literature and Management should be tried out.

Students seem to relate better to contemporary novels which they are familiar with, rather than old classics.
Much depends on the initiatives taken by the faculty.

This method may be more conducive to topics which are related to human beings and are difficult to explain in terms of theoretical con

5.7 Conclusion

A variety of sources (e.g., Behrman & Levin, 1984; Porter & McKibbin, 1988) have espoused the need for reform in contemporary management curricula. Critics charge that management education lacks adequate integration across disciplines (Behrman & Levin, 1984) and functions (Harrigan, 1990). According to McKinney and Yoos (1998), “Artificially isolated, functionally oriented, teacher-centered courses tend to reinforce isolated, functionally oriented, passive thinking in students” (p. 618).

Many of the topics taught in Management are inexact, filled with contradictions and inconsistencies (Harrington & Griffin, 1990) because concepts of what good management means are continually evolving. Issues and ideas surrounding the quality of life, leadership, motivation, morality for example, invite treatment from broad and various perspectives. Consequently there is a need to develop in students the ability to sort through issues that resist discrete, pre-formulated solutions.

Hence the researcher advocates the use of literature to teach Management. Literature can help develop business judgement. Beyond their recognized entertainment value, they activate critical processes which are not bound by plain logical reasoning. Fiction works on the similar lines of a case study whereby the students put on the shoes of the decision maker. But whereas case studies tend to focus on the judgement that lead directly to action (Clawson & Frey 1986), literature goes a step further by letting the students explore the situations which led to the judgement.

Students engaged in the traditional course content including case studies study it from a purely managerial perspective. In the real world, the human factor plays an important role, and literature encourages student to broaden their thinking horizon. Ruth Herman (2004) explains that while case studies often provide extensive evidence of profit and loss accounts and of strategic decisions rightly or wrongly made, they rarely indicate the personal conflicts or the emotional engagement of senior management. They also rarely show how ethical considerations can
influence decisions from a viewpoint that comes from the ideological, religious or moral stance of the participants. They show how organizations have reacted to market or other external forces but they do not illustrate the interior forces that are inevitably at work.

The study was important in the sense that it has checked the effect of an experimental teaching method on performance and retention in the cognitive domain. Such types of studies are very rare in India where the students' performance and retention have been investigated. The study adds, in a small way, to our existing deficient knowledge of the real experience of students. More particularly, literature as a teaching tool is used extensively, internationally. In India, it is a rare occurrence. Recently, there have been reports of IIM using this andragogy.

The analysis of the approach adopted in this study provides a sound basis for re-thinking Management education, especially in India.