CONCLUSION
CONCLUSION

Human rights education declares a commitment to those human rights expressed in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in 1948, U.N Covenants and various instruments at the international, regional and national levels aimed at, promoting, and protecting the rights of all people.

Human rights education promotes democratic principles. It facilitates the examination of human rights issues without bias and from diverse perspectives though a variety of education practices and helps development of communication skills, values, and critical thinking essential to democracy. It provides multicultural and historical perspectives on the universal struggle for justice and dignity.

Human rights education engages the heart as well as mind. It affirms the interdependence of the human family and acts as a precondition for sustainable development, the civil, and social and democracy. It has been accepted that human rights education provides protection from discrimination, unfair treatment, undemocratic attitude, and deterioration of cultural values, exploitation, bondage, human rights illiteracy, abuses of human rights at any level.

Many States consider human rights education as an almost exclusive concern of the formal education system. It is provided through the inclusion of human rights topics in curricula and the revision of text books in school, in the organisation of university courses and conferences, and in other more participatory activities. States have initiated various efforts for development of
human rights education. The right to education has found mention in the Constitution of India.

Considering the significant impact of human rights education on the development of the country in diverse aspects the investigator has taken up this investigation to analyse the status of human rights education in India within the parameters of the Constitution and the law.

The investigator has divided his analysis under nine chapters inclusive of the introductory and the concluding chapters.

In the introductory chapter an attempt has been made to examine the significance of human rights and human rights education in promoting democratic principles in the context of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

In course of the investigation the aims and objectives of the study have been elaborated upon. The following aims of human rights education have been indicated:

- to strengthen respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms,
- to develop fully the human personality and the sense of human dignity,
- to develop attitude and behaviour to promote the respect for others,
- to promote understanding and tolerance among diverse national, ethnic, religious, and linguistic groups.
- to empower people to participate actively in social activities.

The concept of human rights education has been analysed taking into account the movements leading towards the establishment of a culture of human rights. In the course of the study the relevance to democracy and the
role of the UNESCO has been considered, besides touching upon the various bodies and agencies associated with the promotion of human rights education in the country.

In chapter two, the evolution of human rights has been traced since the ancient times. Apart from discussing the views of the philosophers, the developments during the middle ages leading to the current developments in the form of the adoption of various instruments relating to human rights by the United Nations, subsidiary bodies, regional organizations as well as specialised agencies like the UNESCO has been considered in depth.

The contribution of the Indian National Congress, the Constituent Assembly leading to the adoption of the Constitution of India as well has been analysed at length for a proper understanding of the role of the Indian leaders both prior to and after independence.

The following chapter attempts an in-depth analysis of the role of the United Nations. The investigator has considered the role of the General Assembly in providing for human rights education through the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, apart from the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. The emphasis of the Vienna conference on human rights education as well as that of the United Nations decade on human rights education in the implementation of human rights education in India has been considered at length.

A significant effort towards the development of human rights education adopted by the United Nations is the creation of the office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights. However, it may be mentioned that at the time of adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in 1948, Rene
Cassin, the French representative first launched the idea of Attorney General who would be responsible to the Government for the safeguard of rights of man. In 1950 Uruguay submitted to the General Assembly a proposal for establishment of a permanent organ of The United Nations, namely, a High Commissioner or an Attorney General. Again in 1965 Costa Rica submitted at the 28th session of the General Assembly a draft resolution entitled, “Election of the United Nations High Commissioner”. But no official voice was found for the establishment of a High Commissioner for Human Rights. During 1990s the international climate became congenial for the implementation of the proposal and on 31st January 1994 the Secretary General appointed Jose Aya La Lasso of Ecuador as the first United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. Further UNESCO has made several efforts in promoting human rights education through different instruments.

Chapter four analyses the role of the non-governmental organization in the spread of human rights education. Human rights and duties have assumed global dimension since it concerns the world community at large. It is important to think of human rights education as a partnership between government, civil society and other stakeholders. People need to be more effective in influencing their societies that human rights education can produce better citizens. But the task cannot be left to formal educators alone since a large majority of people is outside the reach of formal education. Herein lies the crucial role to be played by the NGOs in making human rights education accessible to these segments.

In view of the above circumstances United Nations and its subsidiary bodies have recognised the role of NGOs in promoting human rights
education. The NGOs pervade and constitute a vital part of the overall human rights regime. They contribute in the standard setting as well as to the promotion, implementation and enforcement of human rights. The NGOs operate on the basis of different mandates. Each NGO respond to its own priorities and methods of action bringing a range of viewpoints to human rights movements. The NGOs have been involved in a significant way both at the global level as well as within the country, particularly with respect to out of school children. The NGOs have to a large extent been able to shoulder the responsibility thrust upon them by the United Nations in the spread of human rights education. Apart from their involvement in schools they have also been collaborating with the government in providing human rights education to the police and para-military and other in-service personnel. The success stories of NGOs in India have been analysed in detail.

NGOs in India have been playing a very important role in promoting knowledge of human rights, identifying problems in the protection and enjoyment of human rights and seek changes in legislation and practice that further their protection and enjoyment. The collaborative efforts of the NGOs with the government as well as the Human Rights Commissions have also been considered.

Chapter five highlights the important role human rights education can play in the development of democratic institutions. Poverty poses a big challenge to a nation like India in the form of providing education and through it human rights education towards creating awareness, knowledge and inculcation of values. Therefore the investigator has also traced the
developments of human rights and human rights education in India through the spectrum of democracy in this chapter.

Human rights are the most important ingredients of democracy and it can be realised only through proper inculcation of values through education. The concept of democracy embraces human rights as its basis. Without human rights democracy cannot survive. To sustain democracy, liberty, freedom of dissent, rule of law and all other rights that constitute it, the ingredients of human rights have to be practiced. The experience shows that the term democracy is used in different senses. Not only two different individuals and groups interpret it in divergent ways, often the same person or group uses the term differently in different times. However, the definitions of democracy may be grouped into two major schools of thought – one holds the view that Democracy means simply a particular form of government, a form in which the people exercise political control. According to the other school of thought democracy is much more than a mere form of government. It is a philosophy of human society, a way of life, a set of ideals and attitudes motivating and guiding the behaviour of members of a society toward one another, not only in their political affairs, but in their economic, social and cultural relationships as well.

This has been followed by a detailed analysis of the legal and constitutional position in India. Education cultivates the mind and promotes ideals and values, if any nation aspires to progress then the citizens have to be educated. It is preparation for a living and for a life. Education for human rights is available only when it is firmly rooted in the social process. This has been facilitated through the Constitution and the laws. It is significant to
observe that the Constitution of India is a rich document in human rights jurisprudence. The legislators are under a duty to provide for the human rights education of the children in particular and in turn wean them away from the labour force. The constitutional status has been accorded to it because one of the reason that true democracy is one where education is universal, where the people understand what is good for them and the nation and to know how to govern themselves. The investigator has also analysed some of the important judgments of the Supreme Court. In fact some of these judgments have been enacted into law by the legislature as well. It is precisely some of these judgments that the constitution amendment was effected to introduce Article 21 A into the Constitution. An important piece of legislation has been the Protection of Human Rights Act of 1993 that paved the way for the constitution of the National Human Rights Commission. Though it was brought into existence by way of an ordinance, the Commission has been performing a very effective role in the protection and promotion of human rights education in particular. The role of the National Human Rights Commission in the spread of human rights education has been considered in detail. India is one of the world’s biggest laboratories of human rights education and this can be positively shaped and made productive through proper legislative means and judicial interventions. Similarly the legislations in

1 Francis Mullin v Administrator, Union Territory of Delhi (1981) 1 SCC, 608
Ram Chandra Tandi v State AIR 1994 Raj. 27
Rangabahu v State of J&K AIR 1984 SC 177
Rameshwar v State of J&K AIR 1984 SC 177
Mohini Jain V State of Karnataka AIR 1992 SC 1858
Mch Mehta V State of Tamil Nadu AIR 1991 SC 417
Sheela Brase v Union of India AIR 1986 SC 1773
State of Madhya Pradesh v Promod Bharatiya 1975 (2) SCC 148
Unni Krishnan V State of Andhra Pradesh AIR 1993 SC 2178
Vardhan chandel V University of Delhi AIR 1996 SC 1051
Chameli Singh V State of Uttar Pradesh AIR 1993 SC 47
the field of children are many. Laws in the sphere of labour regulation and disability have been considered in detail in the course of the investigation and hence not repeated here. All these go to show that attempts have been made to promote literacy and inculcate values through legislation. But the vital aspect is that laws on the statute book continue to remain on paper unless they are translated into action. This has clearly been expressed by the National Human Rights Commission and has been the subject of investigation in the current chapter as well as the following on the status of human rights.

The investigator feels that the Constitution has a very solid foundation in human rights jurisprudence, yet people had to depend on the judiciary to a large extent for asserting their right to education. The incorporation of education as a fundamental right is of great significance, only time will reveal to what extent the same is translated into action and made really meaningful and effective. The apex judiciary in particular may have to continue to play a stellar role in promoting human rights education in the absence of an effective legal mechanism in the sphere of human rights education. Though concerted efforts have been witnessed in promoting human rights education the need of the hour is to provide for an effective legal regime in order to make it obligatory on the part of the policy makers and educational institutions as well as the non formal and informal sectors to involve themselves in concrete terms to usher in a society based on human rights and duties. This is not a bureaucratic task or one that can be left to a handful of national commissions, however well intentioned or industrious. All thinking elements of civil society must be involved.
As a corollary to the legal regime concerning human rights education, the investigator in chapter seven considered the status of human rights education. After deducing the constitutional and legal provisions it has considered the role of the University Grants Commission, the Bar Council of India, the National Council of Educational Research and Training as well as the state counterpart. For the country to progress in tune with the leading nations as well as to provide adequate knowledge of human rights and to build a vibrant nation, human rights education is a sine qua non. Human rights education has therefore been made a part of the in service training component in many organizations. Public sector undertakings need much more to do in this regard. However, it has to be admitted that the country has not been able to keep tune with the international efforts in the spread of human rights education when judged in the light of the decade for human rights education.

The ultimate goal of education is the creation of a culture of human rights based on adherence to ideals of human rights, creation of behavioural patterns and skills and involvement of the people in their implementation and respect. The implementation of human rights education has to be measured in the yardstick of the human rights and literacy among women and children, those belonging to the minority communities, the disabled and those working in the unorganised workforce as well. The role of the executive, particularly the bureaucracy and the policy makers are considered important since they are the people expected to frame and implement policies. As has been observed by the National Human Rights Commission, the slackness of the progress in preparing the national plan of action for the human rights decade
leaves much to be desired. Whereas in other countries the plans have been executed, in India towards the fag end of the decade only the policy was under the consideration of the government and people did not have much information on it. The fact that the judiciary has had to intervene in a number of issues concerning the right to education reflects in great measure that all is not well so far on the implementation front. Since these have been elaborated upon in the course of the investigation the same are only mentioned briefly.

Apart from obligation to educate the general public on human rights some international instruments impose an obligation on States to undertake special steps to develop specific programmes, training and information aimed at addressing specific and vulnerable groups.

It may, therefore, be stated that though there has been some progress in the spread of human rights education much remain to be done. There are many challenges ahead in meeting the obligation of various instruments adopted by the United Nations, UNESCO, and International Labour Organisation to which the country is mandated.

The investigation of the problem shows that attempts have been made for the spread of human rights education by the government and non-governmental agencies to -

- mobilize the educational system with an ever increasing insistence that Article 45 of the Constitution be fulfilled and the right to free and compulsory education up to the age of 14 years implemented, with an appropriate reordering of national priorities;

- work with the Ministry of Human Resource Development, the NCERT and NCTE to review text-books, prepare a Source Book of Human Rights, prepare modules for teacher training and other key personnel.

- work with the UGC to start post-graduate courses in Universities--progress has been made in a number of universities toward this end;
- rewrite the training courses for police personnel at all levels in the country and participating in the instruction:
- introduce increasingly, human rights education for para–military and armed forces personnel and speaking to all ranks of them:
- interacting with political parties—particularly before general elections—and urging them to respect the human rights priorities of good governance and good electoral practice:
- organize platforms for the exchange of views of high quality on various aspects of human rights education, with the active participation of leading NGOs, the legal profession, jurists, academics, civil liberties groups and others:
- encourage and take practical steps to further human rights education for professional groups such as lawyers, doctors, judicial officers, bureaucrats, trade unionists, religious groups and others;
- highlight issues that relate to the rights of the most vulnerable sections of society, in economic and social terms, and also the rights of groups such as the disabled (particularly those facing mental health problems).

Nobody can deny that a ‘teacher’s role’ in human rights education actually gets recast as one of a ‘strategist’ with an aim to empower ‘learners’ through making about their rights and duties in society. Accordingly, a human rights education package should seek to address the following four focuses for learning:

- Knowledge about human rights education;
- A comprehensive curriculum;
- Practice-based learning for sensitization and change of attitudes
- Public dissemination of human rights information.

These sectors of learning have been highlighted by Jose Ayala Lasso, the first UN High Commissioner for Human Rights in his address given to mark the launching of the UN Decade for Human Rights Education and as
such, reflect the spirit of consensus globally reached at Vienna World Congress on Human Rights in 1993. Therefore, in the absence of an explicitly defined limitation of the exercise, any human rights education package (and unfortunately, they are far too many proliferating in the country falls short of consensual international standards), should take the UN Plan of Action as the guideline.

Respect and realisation of human rights requires evolving a culture that is more sensitive to the basic needs of every human being. It respects the need for ensuring to everyone, social, economic, and political justice and provides fair and equal opportunities for growth and development to every individual and group of people. Unfortunately, despite more than five decades of its operation, the goal of ushering in human rights culture has still remained a distant reality. Due to lack of recognising the significance and importance of education as a key instrument for bringing changes in social and cultural attitudes and that too in a history of feudal and colonial past where impoverishment ignorance and illiteracy pervade all around, it is only in the last few years that the importance of education in relation to human rights has attracted the attention of national policy-makers, educationalists and education planners.

In the introduction to this investigation it was stated that a number of questionnaires were distributed for eliciting opinion of every section of the community on the status of human rights education. The people approached and interviewed belongs to different strata of society though not many, reflects a diverse section of society either involved with education, NGOs or associated with planning and policy making. Since all could not be reached
personally several questionnaires were distributed. Unfortunately, though many of these were sent to academics, members of the human rights commissions, senior educationalists, heads of academic institutions, advocates, social workers and senior civil servants, most remained unanswered and therefore remained unresponded, despite several requests for which proper analysis could not be undertaken. Nonetheless the response received suggested inclusion of human rights in syllabus of social studies at the school level. However, there were differences of opinion on whether they should be included at the secondary level. This may be attributed to the fact that many were not aware of the activities under the United Nations decade for human rights education. Those who recommended introduction at the tertiary level also suggested that human rights education should be included as an integrated subject at the primary level and more emphasis should be given at inculcating the values of rights and duties that knowledge and communication skills in human rights education should be left to a later stage. Another notable observation related to the need for orientation of the teachers and their reorientation from time to time. While there were some suggestions that human rights education should be included as a separate subject at the Degree and Post Graduate level others were of the view that it should be integrated into other subjects in the social stream. Many were of the opinion that there is an acute need to emphasis on the constitutional principles and the statutory framework along with adequate exposure to the aspect of legal remedies in view of the non-viability of existing infrastructure. They further felt that the National Human Rights Commission as well as the State counterparts have a very important responsibility to shoulder in the spread of human rights
There was agreement with the view that the non-governmental sector has a very significant role to perform since currently a large segment of children remain outside the formal education system and it is incumbent upon the society to shoulder the responsibility towards inculcating value-based education in them. The need to sensitize the youth and the rural masses of human rights education has been stressed by many and suggestions included the use of print and electronic media besides role plays, nat, bhaona (display of hoardings) besides seminars and workshops.

Many respondents also emphasized the urgent need to reorient and sensitize the police, para military forces as well as the army through human rights education.

In the academic sphere it needs to be reiterated that much emphasis has been laid on the need for human rights education through the formal, non-formal as well as the informal sectors. However, concrete suggestions on how that could be brought about seemed to be lacking though many of the respondents foresaw a significant role for the National Human Rights Commission. They also expressed concern at the lack of budgetary support for meeting the infrastructure requirements. Though educationalists and academics were aware of some efforts by the University Grants Commission, educational institutions were not very forthcoming on seeking resources. However, some of the academics felt it to be the responsibility of the affiliating universities rather than of the colleges to introduce or facilitate the introduction of human rights education.

Some of the respondents expressed the opinion that human rights or human rights education though not very essential in their day to day
functioning were helpful in the formulation of policies and programmes. There were divergent views expressed by the administrators on the status of human right in India. While some considered the situation to be good, others were of the view that human rights situation was not very congenial in India but they did not have any solutions to offer by way of suggestions. A few realised that lack of understanding of human rights came in the way of effective implementation of government policies, particularly in prisons and jails. Surprisingly a good number of administrators were not aware of the developments undertaken to promote human rights education, though they were of the opinion that human rights education would eventually lead to a law abiding society. Some among the respondents felt that human rights education is the concern of law students and the legal profession only. This highlights the need for orientation courses to be undertaken to make the officials realize the need for human rights in their day-to-day activities.

The NGOs seem to be more aware of their responsibilities in the sphere of human rights education. They stressed upon the need for trainers training to work more effectively among the out of school children. Many of the NGOs have undertaken surveys on this front and felt the need for effective cooperation and collaboration. In fact according to them proper networking can achieve wonders in the field of human right education. Most of the NGOs were of the opinion that their work with human rights education remained outside their area of priority. A good number of NGOs were of the opinion that sufficient measures were not there in the field of human rights education and even whatever existed it suffered due to lack of implementation. Some of the NGOs expressed the opinion that human rights education courses should be
flexible for them to obtain exposure. The need for proper documentation has also been stressed upon. Some of the experts interviewed stressed upon the need to involve the human rights activists since they have a commitment and can produce results.

The goal of evolving human rights culture requires operating at various levels such as (a) spreading awareness amongst masses, of and about these rights and also their duty for respecting the rights of others, (b) not only creating awareness amongst masses particularly amongst weaker, poor and vulnerable groups but also imparting capacities and confidence in them to stand for protection and preservation of their rights, (c) requiring many to shed away some of their prejudice and reform some of the attitudes which are derogatory to others’ dignity, (d) creating different kind of knowledge, innovating or reforming structures, methodologies and normative regimes, and imparting new skills and competencies so that policy making, its enforcement and realization become more sensitive to the demands of human rights culture and (e) establishing new structures of accountability more effective so that the State, its agencies and its personnel can be easily, effectively and meaningfully made responsible for human rights violation on one hand and can be made to internalise respect for these rights on the other.

It hardly needs stressing that the activity called ‘education’- and exercise in assimilating, creating and disseminating knowledge is a powerful means of influencing and bringing attitudinal change in the citizens in general as well as professional groups in particular. Being a tool to spread awareness, information and knowledge amongst its recipients, education can play a crucial role at each of the levels mentioned above for the promotion of human
rights culture. But, unfortunately, the education system and more so the higher education system in India, except in the last few years, has hardly shown any credible signs of being a partner in the efforts of evolving human rights culture in the country.

Without education, one cannot see beyond their narrow surroundings to the reality of global interdependence. Without education, one cannot realise how people of other races and religions share the same dreams and the same hopes. Without education, one cannot recognise the universality of human aims and aspirations.

There are three dimensions to the promotion of human rights through education:

- **Knowledge**: providing information about human rights and the mechanisms that exist to protect those rights;

- **Values**: beliefs and attitudes promoting a human rights culture through the development of these processes; and

- **Action**: encouraging people to defend human rights and prevent human rights abuses.

The hypothesis adopted for the investigation, namely, "lack of human rights education is a serious challenge to the modern democracy" in the opinion of the investigator has been established. In order for the country to develop and move ahead in league with leading democracies it is essential that people of the country are aware of their basic human rights and inculcate and imbibe a culture and spirit of human rights in their actions and deeds.
The objectives of the study to:

(a) highlight the views in conceptualization of the topic and its relevance in the modern democracy, (b) review the role of UN and educational institution towards spread of human rights education. (c) Identify the target groups for imparting education on human rights and human rights education have been considered at length in the course of this investigation.

Findings

To recapitulate some of the findings are as follows

- People in general are not aware about human rights and human right education resulting in denial of rights.
- National efforts in the sphere of human rights education have not matched with the international efforts. Consequently the country is lagging behind many other countries.
- State governments have failed to provide human rights education to the required degree at all levels.
- The National Human Rights Commission and the State Human Rights Commissions have not been able to fulfill their statutory mandate in the spread of human rights awareness.
- Government policy and programme in formulating the Plan of Action under the UN decade remains to be implemented.
- NGOs have started intervention and are working among the schools children and out of school children as well, but their numbers are inadequate.
• The civil society by and large is not aware of its role in the promotion of human rights education.
• There is lack of sufficient teaching materials to spread human rights literacy
• Customary practices and religious views have posed a barrier in the spread of human rights education

Suggestions and recommendations

Some of the suggestions and recommendations in brief are:

• The need to implement Article 21 A of the Constitution of India in letter and spirit.
• To initiate steps to provide for human rights education at the state level in all educational institution. At the primary level values of human rights education should be taught compulsorily and then at the secondary and tertiary levels, knowledge and communication skills should be imparted.
• To create cells for education for human rights which shall be responsible for promoting and consolidating education for human rights in order to promote understanding and respect for all peoples their cultures, civilizations, values and ways of life.
• To implement Plan of Action on human rights education in conformity to the international standards with variations to meet local requirements.
• To provide for separate budgetary allocation for human rights education, both at formal, non-formal and informal levels to
satisfy the needs related to the promotion of education for human rights.

- To initiate steps for translating all international documents and success stories into local language and also to provide for audio visual and pictorial depictions.
- To develop close collaboration with NGOs through building of new partnerships.
- To incorporate the UNESCO Convention into the domestic legal system.
- To incorporate various judgments concerning human rights education in the legal system.
- To conduct regular refresher courses for teachers for updating them on current developments concerning human rights education.
- To include components of human rights education in in-service training programmes in order to ensure respect for human rights for all.
- To establish human rights desks in all government offices and public undertakings.
- To bring about proper coordination among bodies entrusted with curriculum formulation and implementation such as the UGC, NCERT, CBSE, SCERT and the like.
- To make it a part of the core curricula at the university level and to set up chairs at various Universities under the UGC.
- To provide for research fellowships on human rights education.
• To provide annual grants to universities and colleges offering human rights education for holding of seminars and workshops and for dissemination programmes.

• To appoint four national zonal officers to supervise implementation of human rights education and make a provision for reporting to a separate national monitoring cell.

• To celebrate annually human rights education day in all educational institutions.

• At the international level a special rapporteur should be appointed to oversee and report to the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights the status of human rights education.

• To convene a special session of the United Nations General Assembly to deliberate upon the status of human rights education and evolve ways to offer international cooperation towards proper implementation of programmes based on education for human rights.

By way of conclusion the investigator has come to the view that though there has been some progress in the realisation of human rights education, much remains to be done. In order to make human rights education meaningful the investigator feels that it is necessary to modify the content of education manuals that promote discriminatory ideas and perpetuate inequities. It is necessary to establish equal relationships between students and teachers and in teaching it is
necessary to introduce new teaching methodologies that are student centered. Emphasis has also to be placed on the young girls. In the sphere of higher education analysis of international, regional and national instruments should be undertaken to bring about effective changes at the country level through adequate need based programmes.