CHAPTER 6
DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

6.1. DISCUSSION

The students’ awareness of different terms is discussed under three different areas:

i. As the study primarily focuses on ‘human rights’, the awareness of the term ‘human rights’ is discussed initially.

ii. Secondarily, the discussion on awareness widens to the students’ further knowledge about the other human rights related terms- such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Convention on the Rights of the Child, Fundamental Rights, United Nations, National Human Rights Commission and the Naga People’s Movement for Human Rights. The first three fall under the category ‘Human Rights Instruments’ and the following three under ‘Human Rights Institutions’.

iii. Environment related rights are being considered as human rights recently; therefore, finally awareness of environment, in spite of being discussed under a separate section, is also discussed under this section.
iv. Finally, the relationship between the students awareness and the other factors are discussed.

6.1.1. Students’ Awareness

a. Human Rights

The higher secondary students in Nagaland had shown an overwhelming awareness of the term ‘human rights’ which is much closer to cent percent (99.26%) and that is comparably higher than the level of awareness of human rights under any other studies conducted and mentioned here. Here, the students’ awareness level was surpassing the teachers’ awareness level but insignificantly less than that of the principals’ as 100% principals had heard of the term (Students’ sample is too large as compared to the principals as principals’ sample are of purposive in nature). A similar study conducted in the ¹Philippines, among the secondary students reveals that 96% students had heard the term ‘human rights’. Several studies were conducted in the ²Philippines, ³Malaysia, ³Cambodia... to assess the impact of human rights education after the introduction of Human Rights Education in schools or to test the effect of vigorous campaigns for the promotion of human rights and the level of awareness of students was found less than the present study. But it is remarkable here to note that the students had high percentage of awareness of the term ‘human rights’ in spite of human rights not included in the curriculum either directly or in terms of Universal
Declaration of Human Rights or in any other form of international human rights documents or instruments except that human rights enshrined in Indian Constitution were part of school syllabus. Congruent result was found in a four country survey\textsuperscript{4} inclusive of India and the finding was stated as this: “In spite of awareness programmes or campaign on human rights hardly being conducted till the collection of the data, the students had a very high awareness level that is overwhelming.”

b. Human Rights Instruments and Institutions

In this study the students were found much more aware of the term human rights than the human rights instruments and institutions, such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Convention on the Rights of the Child, Fundamental Rights, United Nations, National Human Rights Commission and Nagaland People’s Movement for Human Rights. In spite of Fundamental Rights found in the text books prescribed for the elementary level till the higher secondary level, the awareness of Fundamental Rights was found less than that of human rights.

Similar to the term ‘human rights’, the students were found highly familiar with the other related terms such as, the ‘United Nations’ (UN), ‘Fundamental Rights’ and ‘Universal Declaration of Human Rights’ (UDHR). The term ‘Convention on the Rights of Child’ (CRC) was less familiar to the students and
the least of ‘Naga People’s Movement for Human Rights’ (NPMHR) in this study. The Convention on the Rights of Child’ was a part of secondary school curriculum in many countries but the term ‘Convention on the Rights of Child’ was no where found in the core subject text books of class: 8-12 even though rights of children were mentioned briefly at the higher secondary level Environmental Education text book. In the present study students’ awareness of the term ‘Convention on the Rights of the Child’ (CRC) was less than that of ‘Universal Declaration of Human Rights’ but in a Philippines’ study ‘CRC’ was heard by more number of students than ‘UDHR’ as CRC was given priority in the curriculum at the secondary level in the Philippines. In spite of CRC’s presence in the curriculum the students heard about the term CRC in the Philippines is much more less than the percentage of the students under this study.

In a Malaysian study too the percentage of students’ awareness of CRC was found less and that less awareness was achieved after many awareness campaigns on child rights like ‘Say Yes for Children’ and the children’s participation in the United Nations Special Assembly for children and so on. Therefore, the students under this study had acquired greater awareness even though they had less or no information from the text book contents than the other students and also without much sensitizing programmes.

The similar result was found while comparing the students’ awareness about the term ‘National Human Rights Commission’ of India like that of
Malaysia. Under this study, 77.68% students were aware of the NHRC which is higher than that of awareness level of Malaysian students about Malaysian Human Rights Commission (73%). But, the Malaysian students achieved this awareness in spite of the logo, essay and art competitions organized and the numerous news reports about or press statements by SUHAKAM in the print and electronic media.

c. Environment

Students exhibited a very high awareness about the two terms listed under this study such as World Environment Day (91.37%) and Global Warming (91.68%). This could be explained due to the presence of text books contents at all the three levels (elementary, secondary and higher secondary) and rampant awareness programmes conducted and this further would be explained under another section. The students showed more knowledge about World Environment Day and Global Warming than the other terms discussed above under the caption ‘Human Rights Instruments & Institutions’.

Therefore, it could be concluded that in this study the higher secondary students’ awareness of the term human rights was found much higher than that of teachers but less than that of the principals though the difference is negligible. In spite of human rights contents not being found in curriculum in terms of international human rights instruments and awareness programmes or campaign on human rights hardly being conducted, the very high percentage students’ human
rights awareness exhibited in this study is overwhelming. Similar to the term ‘human rights’ the students exhibited high awareness of different terms such as the World Environment Day, Global Warming, Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Fundamental Rights, United Nations, National Human Rights Commission, and the Convention on the Rights of the Child but comparatively less awareness on the local NGO, an apex body involved in the promotion and protection of human rights, the Naga People’s Movement for Human Rights.

e. Awareness Across the Variables ‘Gender’ and Nature of Institution

The number of female students (481) participated in this study is little higher than that of the male students (469). In a similar study conducted in the Philippines, along the variable the female students (98%) had shown better awareness than the male students (96%) but the present study shows a contrary finding in which the male students (99.57%) showed higher awareness of human rights than the female students (98.96%). Similarly, male students exhibited higher awareness of the different human rights instruments and institutions, such as the United Nations, National Human Rights Commission, Naga People’s Movement for Human Rights, Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Fundamental Rights than the female students.

There was no much significant difference found between the awareness level of male and female students on the World Environment Day (though the
level of awareness of male was slightly higher than the female) but female showed higher awareness in only one term that was ‘Global Warming’.

Where there are more human rights violations there the awareness is found less similar is the case here that there are so many rights related to women are violated in Nagaland in social, cultural and political arena and more the women become aware the more they could avoid any discriminations and violations. It is a new trend that realization and silent resistance to violations of women rights is felt by the creamy layer of women and awareness programmes are already on the move yet slow. Therefore, students need to be sensitized more. That needs to be kick-started from the school and inclusion of International Instruments on human rights is very crucial.

In general, it could be concluded that the male students showed higher awareness than the female students in the different terms such as human rights, Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Convention on the Rights of the Child, Fundamental Rights, United Nations, National Human Rights Commission, Naga People’s Movement for Human Rights and World Environment Day with only an exception to the term ‘Global Warming’ for which the female students showed more awareness than the male students. But generally speaking, the male students’ awareness was found higher than the female similarly, the government school/college students’ awareness was higher than that of their private school/college counterparts.
6.1.2. Students’ Knowledge and Understanding

a. Human Rights Concepts and Principles

Despite a very high percentage of students had heard of human rights, the concept was not well understood as they had not understood the meaning and nature of human rights. Despite there were fluctuation regarding their understanding of human rights concepts and principles, students did not show much disparity on gender, age, economic status, disability due to sickness, etc., irrespective of a fact that many of them understood women were subordinate to men. But in other areas of women’s status, capacity, capability, etc. the women were not put at stake as equality of women was well upheld by a very high number students. Women were felt subordinate not only by male students but equal number of female students also expressed in this way. This could have been resulted from the social, religious and cultural stereotyping of women. The stereotyping was found in the text books too and that requires correction. Similarly, though equality principle was upheld by many students still one fourth of them felt that richness would fetch more rights. There were high fluctuations in their level of understanding the concept. This indicates that the students understood some areas clearly well for which the expertise or technical knowledge had not been required but some areas, which require priori knowledge of
international/national human rights documents, were poorly understood. Moreover, unconscious imposition of conventional stereotyping of women had been silently and unquestionably accepted by women. This mindset should be changed that requires the change in entire arena of education such as curriculum, text books, co curricular activities, teacher awareness, teacher preparation including in service teacher preparation, school ethos, etc. As there were no human rights instruments found in the text book contents the students were lacking the conceptual clarity. Further, the nature of human rights was not understood as nearly one third of them thought that human rights were given by the government. This gap of knowledge must be due the absence of human rights documents..

b. Basic /Fundamental Rights

In general the students showed a good understanding (71.95%) about basic/fundamental rights like other sections here too there were conflicting responses found. This could be collated with the other responses of the students too. On one side the students had a strong understanding that ‘wars and killing should effectively be stopped’ but on the other side they showed a fatalistic attitude that these are natural and our interference in these matters would never bring any change. Similar result was found in a Cambodian study where 15% showed fatalistic attitude towards killing. Again in matters regarding to Right to Free Expression and Thought students showed poor understanding. The above findings related to life, war and free expression reflects the ground situation where killing
had been a normal occurrence and common man had no security for life. There were fears from organized and unorganized armed groups directly and in some cases common people were victimized in between the group conflicts. There was fear to express one’s ideas and thoughts. This must have been reflected in the studies. Violation to ‘Right to Marry’ and find a partner was objected by majority of the students and here the objection was found stronger for the male than the female. Therefore, this shows that though the students understood ‘what were human rights violations?’ and strongly desired that ‘there should be no such violations’ they were sandwiched with the ‘fatalistic and pessimistic attitude’ that these are common and human interference would not bring any effect. This requires a change from the fatalistic attitude to optimistic attitude.

c. Child Rights

Children working as domestic servants are found very common in Nagaland. Nearly two third of the students (54.89%), under this study, were found with proper ‘Knowledge and Understanding’ about child rights but here too there were fluctuations. The concept of child labour was not well understood by the students. This is further supported by the students’ value judgments on child labour where the awareness level was found comparatively much lower. The judgment of students is assumed to be on the social outlook about child labour. The social value about child labour in Nagaland is nothing negative as it is being practiced in many homes and even by well educated people. Therefore, the
students must have been put in a conflict between macro (societal) value and micro (personal) value system and some social happenings were unquestionably and unconsciously accepted and internalized as right. It is felt people hold their ancient values till now.

The above mentioned conflict between values, gave reluctance to accept the Universal Declaration of Human Rights by all the nations and that gave birth to ICESCR (International Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights) and ICCPR (International Convention on Civil and Political Rights). Here, it could be argued that there was a conflict between moral and legal values. Children living in homes, where there is no proper food, shelter, security, etc., are given food, shelter, clothes and in many cases education. In spite spree incidents of harassment, the child laborers are well treated by their masters. It has been also found as one of the inherent social values from ancient days in Naga society (slaves). Many employers of these domestic child servants treated the employees as children and much better than their biological parents. By law it is unlawful to have domestic child workers but comparing hungry children, the conditions of these children are found better in the area where study was conducted (It is a common observation). As Marlow propounds his theory on needs, children without fulfilling their biological and basic needs could not go up to the higher needs. Many policies like The Right to Education Act, Mid-day Meal Schemes, Child trafficking laws … are there in force but still effective implementation is not
found and for countries like India it would be difficult to implement unless alternative arrangements made for the welfare of those children. The knowledge about Free and Compulsory education was found less even though at class: 8 level there was a briefing about RTEA and Universalization of Primary Education at the higher secondary level. As elsewhere mentioned, CRC was a part of school curriculum in many countries though the related Convention on the Right of Child had been ratified by our country the level of awareness of CRC was found to be second to the least in this study. Therefore, child related rights with an introduction to related International Instruments should be included in the curriculum from the secondary level. With regards to corporal punishment the students showed less awareness. The result shows that less than half of the total students were aware of corporal punishment as a violation of children’s rights. But here too there is crisis between moral and legal rights. ‘Even in advanced societies there are sanctions; school is a micro society and therefore sanctions are unavoidable’ a principal’s reply goes as mentioned. The investigator also put him in dilemma in making moral and legal judgment about the justification of corporal punishment. Regarding corporal punishment more than half of the students made it justified and this is congruent with Malaysian report giving the attitude of teachers and educators: “many educators defend it as a way to stem rising violence in schools”; “Teachers who are fed up with the rising cases of indiscipline in schools say caning is justified” Therefore, the students’ awareness is justified in spite of them having moderate legal awareness.
Conclusion

Under this section it could be concluded that more than 65% students were (and it could have been higher, if moral judgment is valued more than legal judgment) able to understand child rights in general but the awareness related to Child education, domestic child labour and corporal punishment were found less. It is notable here that their legal awareness as per the data about domestic child workers, compulsory education and corporal punishment in schools was found less or the moral awareness supersedes the legal awareness. There are so many laws related to child labour, abuse, right to education, child trafficking, etc. but researches confirm that implementation had been found weak.

6.1.3. Naga Customary Rights Practices Violating Women’s Rights

In spite of ancient Naga political system left no place for women in the village administration nor in judiciary, did the students not put women’s capability or participation in prejudices and jeopardy. But comparing many other parts of India, Naga women don’t suffer much from social stigmas and taboos. Discrimination or social stigma on the basis of caste, gender, economic conditions, widowhood, remarriage, barren women, living as spinster, etc. was not much found in Nagaland while comparing the other parts of India. Women were neither under estimated on the basis of equal rights, capability and capacity nor were many
restrictions on women and not many visible inequalities found but still about one third of the students (59.26%) under section 4.1.12 thought that the women were subordinate to men and this concept was found more among the male students, howsoever insignificant, and more among the rural students with a significantly high difference. This kind of understanding/feeling/mindset was found under different sections in this study.

In matters related to customary adjudication violating women’s human rights there found the least difference between male and female. Regarding property rights the awareness was found less and this was further confirmed by the interview conducted to some local populace. All interviewees in spite of being accepted that the Naga customs were biased in law related to inheritance, delineation of ancestral property to the male descendents was highly valued with proper supporting reasons to justify. Similar is the case about customary practices related to adjudication as many of the customary practices related to adjudication were found good and adopting a foreign law was not much encouraged. But where there are flaws modifications sought. Nagaland State Women’s Commission at present is engaged in the modification of customary practices violating women and children’s rights and codification of customary laws are expected to be enacted in future. (In general, reactions to customary violation of women rights were found reacted by more female students). In general, it was found that the female students
were found more submissive to customary and current practices or conventions that violate human rights especially women’s rights.

Quite a good number of male students’ equivalent to female students objected and showed their awareness about violation of women’s human rights in the form of customs and current practices. In a study on Domestic violence against in Ankara, Turkey, it was found that educated women took recourse to the legal measures for remedies which was not done by poorly educated women, here too it is expected that through human rights teaching more educated women should be able to take recourse of the law for the protection, prevention of women’s human rights and redress for violations.

6.1.4. Students’ Knowledge & Understanding of Environment Issues/Problems

The students’ knowledge on the two terms, such as World Environment Day and Global Warming was found higher than their knowledge about the six human rights institutions and instruments discussed in the previous section but less than that of the term ‘human rights’. But their knowledge and understanding level of environment was much higher (80.34%) than every other area of analysis clustered in this study such as human rights concepts, principles, basic/fundamental rights, child rights, customary practices, etc. In every other section, students exhibited knowledge but the understanding level was comparatively found less than that of the knowledge level. Under this section,
students showed a higher understanding of environment too. This high knowledge and understanding must have been achieved due to the presence of adequate contents in the text books as well as co curricular activities being held in the schools and colleges. The role of media also had given due impact on the level of awareness about World Environment Day and Global Warming. The contents were found at the same level of schooling in different subjects with a special emphasis by offering environment education as an optional/ sixth subject too. In some cases, the different subject text books had similar and overlapping contents at the same level and in some cases at different levels of schooling. This shows lack of coordination among the different boards that needs to be corrected. Therefore, adequate contents had given an impact on the awareness level of students.

6.1.5. Most Useful Sources

a. School

In spite of not being placed in the curriculum and being found less awareness programmes, the students under this study showed high awareness of human rights, NHRC, CRC and UDHR and which was more than the awareness level found in some other studies reviewed here. In spite of the related contents being absent in the text books more than half the number of students found school as the most useful source and the school had made a good impact on the awareness
level of students. Irrespective of so many flaws of Indian education system, still school education is found more effective in Nagaland as many other National studies’ findings suggest about Indian Education System. School was found the most useful source for more number of students than the other two sources for every item listed in this study except for the Naga People’s Movement for Human Rights for which media was found the most useful source for more number of students. This reiterates the NCTE (1998)’s remark on the importance of teachers in ‘Quality Concerns in Secondary Teacher Education’, “The teacher is the most important element in any educational programme. It is the teacher who is mainly responsible for implementation of the educational process at any stage”

b. Media

Media’s contribution to the knowledge transformation to the students is pertinent. After the school as the most useful source, media comes to the next level in creating awareness. Advancing technologies with satellite television, cell phones and internet have become a great boon for the people in giving information and entertainment. Here too, a considerable number of students found media as the most useful source in gaining awareness of different terms and related information. Media was found the most useful source for more number of male students than the female students in hearing about each and every term related to human rights. There may be several reasons associated with poor access to media for female students:
Less access to media might be due to inadequate time as the female students, contrary to the contemporary female students, mostly engaged in conventional roles such as domestic works, taking care of younger siblings and elders… Passive stereotyping in the text books and in communities could suppress the women from getting wide access to media for gaining information. This was found in an Indian study (Sheela Barse) where there were stereotyping of women in the text books. This along with the society’s conscious and unconscious imposition of conventional roles on women might have not changed the attitude of the female students.

The students’ knowledge about World Environment Day (73.89%) was found higher than that of Human Rights Day (64.84%). As the environment related contents are widely found at different levels of school education and the World Environment Day celebration is made mandatory for the schools to celebrate, the former’s awareness must have been higher. But without such vigorous programs in the school/college level (% of teachers and principals about celebrating HRD) on Human Rights Day, the awareness level was found better though less than that of World Environment Day. This could have been gained through a wide publicity by NHRC on cell phones and other electronic media during the period of this study. Therefore, media, the new electric gadgets like cell phones, televisions and computers had given an impact on the students’ awareness.
6.1.6. School/College Environment

i. Human Relationship

Human rights education is “all learning that develops the knowledge, skills and values of human rights”. Placing of human rights or its presence in the curriculum is not sufficient but there should be human rights practices in the institutions. The schools/colleges should provide mechanisms to let the students exercise their rights. Here, many institutions under this study were found not with students’ associations. It is the responsibility of the teachers and administrators to guide and advise the students to form the associations to exercise their collective and individual rights and duties.’ There were different kinds of students’ association found in one institution on different sub-tribal line. Instead of having students’ unions formed after every tribe, they could be of general nature and equal participation shall be ensured. The attitude of some teachers towards formation of students’ associations was negative that needs to be changed. About 50% of the institutions were found with active participating students’ associations therefore, there should be animation of associations with their active participation. The institutional set up should be made in such a way that the atmosphere is so congenial for the students to exercise their rights freely without infringing others rights. The relation between the teachers and students; the students and principals
and teachers and principals were found very cordial. This shows a warm human relationship among the school/college personnel and not an authoritarian atmosphere. The students were able to approach the principals and teachers freely and express their problems and grievances. But only difference, in sharing the students’ problems between teachers and principal, was that students shared more academic related problems to the teachers rather than the principals. Extracurricular activities such as observation and celebration of international days were done by an average of only 5% institutions and which activities are considered as one of the finest ways to create awareness among the members of schools/colleges. These programs need to be listed in the calendar of events as done in the World Environment Day in the NBSE school yearly calendar and there should be some checks and measures to monitor the school/college about the observation.

ii. Effectiveness of Human Rights Education

Effective implementation of human rights practices depend on the school administrators and the teachers. ‘Human rights’ had been in the higher secondary curriculum for about 10 years (2000-2009) and the assessment of students’ performance was done internally by the schools. A great responsibility was placed on the schools/colleges for the effective implementation of internally assessed areas. The misery is that less than an average of 50% of the teachers and principals were aware of human rights’ presence in the curriculum in the recent past 10 years
and some extracurricular activities were also expected to be undertaken as a part of co-curricular activity. This could be explained that as human rights education was to be assessed internally by the institutions and less seriousness in taking the subject must have been shown as the human rights education was not effectively implemented in many institutions if not so, the presence of human rights in the curriculum should have been known to the teachers and the principals. Had it been true that the subject seriously taken then that had been taken for imparting the knowledge and not for further skills of learning? If the schools had desired to implement human rights education, they should have created the proper atmosphere, like forming of associations, observation of International Days, etc. but many schools lack this. And the text books provided had a bare draft (Plain Draft) of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and a teacher without expertise knowledge would not have been able to explain well. But unlike the previous text book, the present environmental text book contains relevant and comprehensive information given in a beautiful way and the instructions given by the NBSE to have two project reports added special effects on the probable effective implementation of Environmental Education. In spite of being the text book being titled Environmental Education it goes beyond that and that could be called as Education for Sustainable Development (ESD). But there were some checks and measures needed to the proper implementation. It is believed that the effectiveness of implementation might give more desirable effects. This gives a speculation as found in a four country survey that includes India, \(^{10}\)While policies
supporting human rights education are in place, there is generally weak implementation at the school level”. It is very difficult for the NBSE alone to find measures to check the effective implementation of internally assessed subjects in the school due to limited number of staff as well as the geographical location of the state therefore, the DIS, SIS and other concerned officers of the Department of School Education should be given the responsibilities for effective implementation. Interschool assessment could be suggested also one of the ways for effective implementation of the areas which could not be effectively checked by the NBSE. Teachers’ and principals’ indifferent attitude towards new arenas’ of education needs a change and they should be the flowing water of knowledge where many who could quench their thirsting souls in acquiring all the skills of learning and bring a desirable change.

6.1.7. Status of Teachers

a. Teacher’s/Principal’s Awareness

Teachers working for children and adolescents have an opportunity to shape the future of democracy and plant seeds in the minds of their students, who, in a few years, will have the right to vote and be members of political parties, civil servants, activists of civil society organizations, active citizens and decision makers. To provide them with a comprehensive education, we need teachers with good knowledge and attitude. An Indian study (11S. Pandey) reveals that 38.5% of
the teachers including primary and secondary teacher educators showed human rights awareness. In this present study, 87.2% teachers had heard of the term ‘human rights’ but only 63.83% could show more knowledge about human rights as they could list many human rights. In general, under this study the principals’ awareness level is found higher than that of the teachers’/lecturers and also the knowledge and understanding level of principals’ about ‘human rights’ is found higher than that of the teachers. But, in general, both teachers and principals had heard of different terms and superficial knowledge and many lack further understanding of human rights and the related issues. Many teachers were found having vague idea of human rights and conceptual clarity which would help them to clearly and unambiguously explain human rights. Their awareness was found on the surface level but deeper knowledge and understanding was found among 67% of the principals and 55% of the teachers. The teachers irrespective of teaching human rights needs more acquisition of knowledge than as they had at the time of this study. Why is there poor knowledge and understanding? This study shows that their poor knowledge about human rights is due to lack of opportunity to have studied during their pre service period as about less than 50% teachers had studied human rights during their pre service period and the condition is further aggravated by no opportunity for training or any condition that pertain human rights exposure. Their knowledge should have been enhanced by in-service trainings/programs or courses. Nagaland University, as now offering human rights courses, should offer through distant mode also. There should be policies
supporting in service training and motivation for the teachers. Teachers should be like flowing water and not stagnant in their knowledge such teachers should be highly motivated. As a study conducted in Sri Lanka reveals that the teachers who underwent some training on human rights were not encouraged by any means. The policies should be made to encourage sincere, efficient and knowledgeable teachers thereby bring change upon the behaviour of students.

b. Teacher/Principal Attitude

A teacher’s reply to a question related to students’ association goes as this, “We don’t encourage formation of any students’ union” and to another question related to their awareness “I am not aware of human rights since we don’t have the subject”. These responses indicate that their attitude hinders the acquisition of knowledge in other way their poor knowledge brings negative attitude. Similar kind of attitude was received in a matter related to celebration of Human Rights Day in their school as the teacher replied “We don’t celebrate as it is not listed in the academic calendar of either the Board or the University”. It was found in similar studies conducted in other countries that teachers’ poor knowledge leads into poor attitude towards human rights education. In the present study too, an average of 61.2% teachers and principals had understood human rights and 66.4% of them showed positive attitude towards human rights education. Whereas, in a study conducted in Nueva Ecija cent per cent teachers had opined that HRE should be included in schools. Again when they were found with knowledge and
proper attitude and interest towards human rights they were fusing human rights in class room teaching irrespective of the subjects they teach.

About 5% of the schools/colleges observed Human Rights Day in their institutions. Many responses show that unless clear instructions are given many schools/teachers do not conduct any activities and never go beyond what are instructed or listed as in a 16HURIGHTS OSAKA, 2000 “Some teachers taught only after directives given by the superiors but some others on their own initiative”. This is true in the case of Observation of World Environment Day which was celebrated by many schools as this was listed in the NBSE calendar of events and it was made mandatory for the schools to celebrate failing which administrative and disciplinary actions would be taken against the school. Quite a good number of principals, nearly three fourth, were found positive towards the need of human rights education at the higher secondary level but the teachers
showing their positive attitude was found less. The reasons given for their support of non-inclusion indicated their poor understanding and also attitude towards human rights. In some other studies too the teachers equated human rights with activism and some others expressed fear that human rights education would restrict them from disciplining the students. A reply from a science teacher goes as this: “Science and technology is only beneficial for our life” and another as: “The students at this stage are not matured enough to understand the human rights issues”. Some others expressed that human rights education would burden the overburdened syllabus. The reasons given by them are not knowledgeable as while analyzing the contents of the text books, there were so many areas where overlapping of contents found. By making researches this would be possible to include human rights in the syllabus without overburdening the syllabus. In every subject human rights could be integrated as a study (Vaidya D.S. 1991) showed that values could be integrated in science subjects also. Concluding finding from here is that only 59.6% teachers and 73.3% of the principals showed their positive attitude towards human rights education. This seems to be correlated to their awareness level as 55.7% of the teachers and 66.65% of the principals showed better knowledge and understanding of human rights. Therefore, teachers should be made acquaintance with awareness and attitude and these two should lead them to action.
c. Causes of Awareness

The following is founded on well reasoning and needed scientific study for further support.

The discussion under the previous section shows that the students had gained awareness from the school about human rights despite the related contents had not been found in the text books. In hearing about the term ‘human rights’ which was neither found in the text books nor adequate awareness programs/activities were held in the schools/colleges but more than half the number of students found school as the most useful source and the percentage of students’ awareness was considerably good. This implies that the teachers (including the principals) are the transmitters of information about human rights and the related terms to the students. It could be assumed that the teachers fused human rights knowledge when they teach contents related to human rights. Here, as there are adequate contents on Fundamental Rights found at the different levels of schooling, the teachers’ knowledge on human rights might have been carried out to the students. (Fig: 6.1)
More than 90% students found school as the most useful source in hearing about the term ‘Fundamental Rights’ and the contents were found at all the three levels under the elementary and secondary level of Social Sciences text books. Every teachers and principals must have knowledge about Fundamental Rights as
they had studied them from the school level. This shows that the content’s presence has overwhelmingly given an impact upon the students’ awareness along with the teachers’ knowledge. (Fig: 6.2)
Further the above finding is supported by analyzing the percentage of
students’ most useful sources in hearing about the terms World Environment
Day(WED) and Global Warming (GW), for which 66% and 54% students found
school/college as the most useful source. Here, the environment related contents were found at all levels of text books in science and social science subjects. It was also found as an additional and optional subject at class: 9 and 10 level and a core subject for the higher secondary students. The World Environment Day (WED) celebration was/is mandatory for all the schools and the report needed/needs to be submitted to the NBSE and failing which administrative actions were/are taken against the schools not complied with. This is also listed in the school calendar of events provided by the NBSE. But here the percentage of school as the most useful source in hearing about the terms WED and GW was comparatively much more less than that of Fundamental Rights even though the percentage of students’ awareness was high. With all these advantages school could have been found the most useful source for more number of students but that had not been found so and the percentage of school as the most useful source is much less than that of Fundamental Rights. Why? This could be explained in this way:
1. Many older teachers had poor knowledge about environmental issues (42.6% understood environment issues are related to human rights) as older teachers had not studied during their pre service period but they must have studied Fundamental Rights as it has been a part of school syllabus.

2. Many teachers had felt that the environment is related to science therefore poor interest in teaching or neglecting the units or not giving enough effort in knowledge transmission

3. Many teachers would never show any interest in updating their knowledge.

But in case of Fundamental Rights every teacher must have studied and possessed adequate knowledge as it was a part of school curriculum from the primary level of schooling in India. This might be also a reason for less percentage of students finding school as the most useful source in hearing about the environmental related issues than that of Fundamental Rights. This is further to be noted that the awareness level of students regarding the WED and GW is quite high but the percentage of school as the most useful source is much more less than that of Fundamental Rights in spite of being given at different levels and different subjects such as science, social science, environment science (Optional at classes: 9 and 10) and Environment Education (at classes: 11 and 12) the students who found school as the most useful source is much more less than that of FR.
This shows that the teachers’ knowledge together with their positive attitude gives a positive impact on the students’ awareness irrespective of adequate contents’ placement in the curriculum. But, there should be opportunities, in the form of related contents in the curriculum, for the teacher to fuse the subject matter in the daily classroom teaching. This kind of situation, irrespective of the placement of related contents, makes school as the most useful source for many students.

The school had its impact on the students’ awareness irrespective of the presence of contents in the text books. For example, ‘human rights’ was not given anywhere in the syllabus as a topic, under a title or sub-title or a paragraph. But human rights, which were enshrined as Part III and IV of Indian Constitution, were given at different levels at the elementary and secondary levels. In spite of not being found in the curriculum more than 50% students found school as the most useful source and more than 99% students were aware of the term human rights. This shows that whenever there are relevant topics to human rights the teacher with knowledge and positive attitude about human rights will fuse that into his classroom teaching. As the rights and duties enshrined in Indian Constitution are the adoption of human rights found in Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the teacher must have fused into his teaching and that resulted more than fifty percentage of students found school as the most useful source in hearing about the term ‘human rights’. Nearly, two third of the teachers and principals admitted that
they would talk about human rights irrespective of their subjects. Therefore, teachers’ knowledge is directly proportional to the fusion of human rights. Similarly, teachers’ attitude has a positive impact on the fusion of human rights here. The teachers’ knowledge and attitude along with the presence of contents gave a very high percentage of effect on students as it was found that school was found the most useful source for more than 90% students in hearing about Fundamental Rights’. This must have made more than 50% students’ awareness about the term ‘human rights’.

The study further shows, that the presence of adequate contents, without teachers’ adequate knowledge, interest and attitude, do not bring any greater percentage of awareness through his teaching. The students might have taken extra efforts by constant and continuous reading and understanding or memorizing without any understanding of the concepts. This agrees with the report of Education Commission (1964-66) “of all the different factors which influence the quality of education and its contribution to national development, the quality, competence and character of teachers are undoubtedly the most significant”. Further it is strengthened by the following quote of S. Pandey “Teachers continue to occupy the central role in the context of generating human rights awareness among students, though their role has been significantly transformed from mere transmitter of knowledge to facilitator of conditions that promote the process of knowledge construction”.
“Education is recognized by the International Commission on Education for the 21st Century as a principal means to foster deeper and more harmonious human relations and, thereby, to reduce poverty, exclusion, ignorance, oppression, and war.”

The teachers’ knowledge, positive attitude and interest along with the presence of contents should give a greater impact and cause greater awareness upon the students. In contrast when the teacher does not know the subject matter, in spite of that being included in the syllabus and in the contents, very few with less positive attitude, goes for updating and many avoid or show their disinterest in it and that affects the school as the students’ most useful source. Interestingly more female students found school as the most useful source than the female students.

iv. Teacher Empowerment

Knowledge is dynamic and proliferating every now and then but as per the change teachers need to update their knowledge. Enthusiasm shown before joining the service withers away after being placed in service. Teachers have eligibility tests to make them eligible for teaching but if the in-service eligibility test needs to be conducted time to time many teachers may not be qualified further. In this study, nearly half of the participant teachers had not undergone any course on human rights nor a subject on human rights studied during their pre service period.
As ‘human rights’ is a new vista of education older teachers had very limited chances to having been trained. The participant teachers in this study had little opportunities to have an exposure to human rights by attending seminars, workshops, etc. but those who underwent this exposure programmes were from those who had pre service exposure to human rights. Very few awareness programmes were conducted in the past but awareness programs sponsored by the UGC, NSWC, Naga Women’s Network, etc. are recently on the move. Clear instructions are given for the school teachers to have B.Ed as the essential qualification for teaching but many teachers are still untrained especially the teachers working in the private institutions. There are 111 schools and colleges, offering higher secondary level of education, are registered with the Government of Nagaland. Out of those, 83 institutions were run by private enterprises. Further teachers working in the colleges find B. Ed., or M.Ed. a non – requirement as the colleges have degree level classes along with the higher secondary classes. Adequate number of training institutions is not found in the state to train the existing teacher demand and in-service teachers. There is no certificate, diploma, degree, masters’ degree level courses offering human rights available in Nagaland University. (Now Nagaland University has notified for Diploma level courses for the academic session -2012). ‘Human rights’ as a paper or subject is found in LLB, B. Ed. and some other degree courses. Therefore, the experienced teachers who had been working for quite some years had been had no exposure to human rights education with an exception to those who involved in self-directed learning.
as they had not studied during their study period or had an opportunity to take pre
service exposure to human rights education. Therefore, teachers’ empowerment is
crucial.

6.1.8. Text Book Contents

The human rights contents were found integrated in social sciences as
found in 20Sri Lanka and many other countries and science subjects. But the
environment related matters were integrated in science and social sciences subjects
and in which adequate contents about environment rights were fused. But the
contents given were not those given in UDHR but the rights enshrined in the
Indian Constitution. A similar finding, arrived at from a multi country survey done
by HUURIGTS OSAKA, 2005, which includes India, is given here: “Most
schools rely on the already prescribed teaching of constitutional rights, and do not
cover international human rights instruments”

In many units, overlapping and repetition of contents were found at the
same level and also at different levels in different text books. It was assumed
before undertaking the research that replacement of human rights from the higher
secondary curriculum and placing environmental education seemed to be
unjustified. But the presumption became wrong as though the text book was titled
Environmental Education, the scope went beyond environment education and the
book covers different areas of human rights too. The only negative aspect found
was that there were no international instruments neither listed nor briefed. The book was beautifully designed with adequate contents but many of the contents were the repetitions from the elementary and secondary level social sciences and science text books. As different boards of school education for elementary and secondary education take measures to design text books (including higher secondary) there lacked coordination between the boards as well as within the board on different subjects at different levels. In the elementary and secondary level text books there were found contents with no gender equity in contents and also in illustrations. Similar finding was noted in an Indian and other studies conducted abroad (Sheela Barse, Sunderland, Ikuko,..). Contents related to human rights with specifications about the international instruments could be done with proper coordination and without burdening the existing syllabus.

6.2. CONCLUSIONS

The following conclusions have been arrived at from the study conducted, analyzed and discussed:

i. Students’ Awareness

The students were found with a very high awareness of the term ‘human rights’ (99.26%) but this awareness the students had achieved without being the contents found in the text books and the negligible number of extra-curricular activities on human rights. The students’ awareness level was found higher than
the awareness level of teachers under this study and awareness level assessed in other studies mentioned here but insignificantly less than that of the awareness level of the principals under this study.

Students exhibited a high level of awareness of different human rights institutions and instruments listed in this study but while analyzing individually, the highest percentage of students were found aware of the term ‘the United Nations’ and the lowest ‘the Naga People’s Movement for Human Rights’. Students’ knowledge was found high irrespective of the presence of related contents as in the case of the term ‘human rights’.

The students’ awareness level of environment related terms was found very high but comparatively less than the term ‘human rights’ but higher than the other terms. More than adequate contents were found on environment at the primary, secondary and higher secondary level core subject text books and in some cases overlapping of contents related environment was found.

In general, the male students exhibited higher awareness than the female students in the different terms such as human rights and human rights instruments and institutions but not as the case of environment related terms. But the awareness of the government school/college students was found higher than that of the private students under every section.

ii. Most Useful Sources
The school/college was found the most useful source for a majority of students irrespective of the presence of contents in the text books followed by ‘media’ and ‘family’. Media was found the most useful source for more male students than the female and more private school/college students than the government school/college students.

iii. Knowledge about Concepts, Principles and Child Rights

The students exhibited high ‘Knowledge and Understanding’ about human rights under different areas such as child rights, women’s rights, environment, etc. but this was found less than the number of students who had heard of different terms related to human rights. But the concepts and principles were not well understood as this requires technical knowledge about various documents. This gives a conclusion that ‘While the students generally know or have heard of human rights, they do not seem to understand the concepts and principles well’.

While analyzing the students’ understanding under different sections it was found that the students’ had the least understanding on ‘child rights’.

In spite of students having high ‘Knowledge and Understanding’ of human rights and related terms and ardent desire to avoid human rights violations they were found with fatalistic and pessimistic attitude towards those violations. The students’ attitude needs to have a change.

iv. KNOWLEDGE ABOUT CUSTOMARY PRACTICES
Violation of women’s rights by the customary practices were understood by both the gender of the students but submissiveness to customary practices by the female was more than the male and similarly more by the government school students than the private school students.

Government school/college students and female students were found more submissive to customary and current practices that violate human rights especially women’s human rights than the urban and male students.

v. KNOWLEDGE ABOUT ENVIRONMENT

Students showed the highest level of ‘Knowledge and Understanding’ on Environment related issues and the lowest on Child Rights while assessing under different areas of human rights. But, without any contents and non exposure to campaigns, students had gained exhibited more knowledge on child rights than the other studies conducted to know the impact of child rights campaigns and effect of inclusion of child rights in the curriculum on the students’ awareness.

Adequate contents, teachers’ knowledge and attitude, extracurricular activities related to environment and campaign did not go in vain as the highest number of students had shown environmental knowledge and understanding.

vi. TEACHERS/PRINCIPALS
Teachers’/principals’ pre-service and in-service exposure to human rights education was found less and very minimal in-service programmes were conducted. As such the human rights understanding level of teachers was found not satisfactory.

Though many teachers/principals exhibited a positive attitude towards human rights education at the higher secondary level, about one third of the teachers showed negative attitude towards human rights education and formation of students’ associations and this was found associated with their poor knowledge about human rights. Many who did not support human rights education equated human rights with activism. This was found in other studies too.

In spite direct contents on human rights not found, Teachers’ knowledge and attitude along with related topics (though not relevant) had prompted the teachers to fuse human rights and that had brought high students’ awareness about human rights.

Presence of related contents was correlated with students finding school as the most useful source but teachers’ knowledge, their positive attitude and the related contents (though not direct contents) had increased the usefulness of school as the most useful source.

vii. SCHOOL ENVIRONMENT
The school environment was not found congenial for practicing human rights. Many schools neither created an atmosphere to exercise the students’ rights nor conducting extracurricular activities which would bring awareness. Many institutions were found no students’ associations but where there were associations, equal representations of students from different communities was not found but on different tribal line different associations were found in one institution. Despite there was a very good human relationship, free expression and respect for human dignity upheld.

Unless directives from the higher authorities given, the school made less initiative to conduct extracurricular activities in the form of observation of International Days that would create awareness. Therefore, it could be said, ‘While education policies supporting human rights are in place in our country, there is weak implementation at the school level. Most schools rely on the already prescribed teaching of constitutional rights, and do not cover international instruments.’

viii. CONTENTS RELATED TO HUMAN RIGHTS

Effective implementation of human rights education which was included in the curriculum from 2000 – 2009 was not successful. The contents in the text books were inadequate and less explanatory. Neither teachers nor students could understand well without further references. This reason along with the internal
assessment system without much checks and balances from the higher authorities might have led this to a failure of implementation.

Adequate contents related to human rights were found in the curriculum from the elementary, secondary and higher secondary level core subject books but given in the form of rights and duties enshrined in the Indian Constitution environmental rights but hardly any internationally acclaimed documents were mentioned or described.

The contents related to environment in the text books were overlapping and repeated at different levels and this showed the lack of coordination while making the text books or designing the syllabus. There found enough space to include human rights in the text books without increasing the burden of contents, teachers and students.

In the elementary and secondary level integrated approach had been followed where the contents were mostly integrated in the social sciences text and integrated science text books but at the higher secondary level environmental education was given as a separate subject. But though it was titled Environment Education it was comprehensive and covered areas beyond environment and includes many human rights. The book is beautifully and meticulously designed. But no international instruments were neither mentioned nor adequate human rights issues related socio, political, economic and cultural aspects.
Gender inequity was found in the contents and invisibility of females in illustrations. In many text books local names were not found rather the names from other states of our country and of other nations. Familiar contents to the local context should be included.

The book ‘Environment Education’ prescribed for the higher secondary level was not limited to environment but its scope widens beyond environment related issues and covers human rights issues.

References


3 Ibid., Laksiri Fernando (1999)

5. HURIGHTS OSAKA (2005), “knowledge and Practice of Human Rights in Secondary Schools’
http://www.hurights.or.jp/archives/human_rights_education_in_asian_schools/

http://www.hurights.or.jp/pub/hreas/8/14MalaysianSchool.htm

http://www.hurights.or.jp/pub/hreas/10_02/16HR%20Awareness%20of%20Teachers%20and%20Teacher%20Educators.pdf

http://www.hurights.or.jp/pub/hreas/3/10barse.htm

http://nhrc.nic.in/Documents/ReportonTrafficking.pdf

10. Sadhika Hameed et al. (2010), Human Trafficking in India: Dynamics, Current Efforts, and Intervention Opportunities for The Asia Foundation
http://asiafoundation.org/publications/pdf/718


15 Ibid., Osaka: HURIGHTS OSAKA(2005)

16 Ibid., Laksiri Fernando(1999)

17 Ibid., Osaka: HURIGHTS OSAKA(2005)

18 Ibid., Lolita H. Nava(1998)

19 Ibid., Osaka: HURIGHTS OSAKA(2005)


21 Ibid., Pandey S(2005)

22 Ibid., Laksiri Fernando Colombo (1998)

23 Ibid., Osaka HURIGHTS OSAKA(2005)