CHAPTER 6
FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

This is a final and concluding chapter. It presents the summary, findings, suggestions and scope for further study. This chapter consists of seven sections. Section 6.1 gives summary of all the chapters included in the study. Section 6.2 gives findings and conclusions of the study. These findings and conclusions are interpreted and explored from the data collected from primary and secondary sources. Section 6.3 provides achievements and failures of NWCMC in context of JNNURM. Section 6.4 provides summary of hypothesis testing. Section 6.5 gives some suggestions to overcome problems that have been identified during the study. Section 6.6 explains contribution to existing research and section 6.7 specifies the scope for further research.

6.1 SUMMARY OF CHAPTERS:
This section provides a very brief summary of each chapter included in the study. It is given as below:

CHAPTER 1:
Chapter one started with brief introduction of urbanization and policies related to urban development in India. There were no major policies for the urban development in 20th century. At the beginning of the 21st century, Government of India introduced JNNURM in 2005 keeping view of infrastructural development of the cities and basic services to urban poors. It has identified 65 mission cities for the implementation of two sub-missions namely UIG and BSUP. At the same time two more programmes were introduced namely UIDSSMT and IHSDP for all other urban centers in India. Present research has considered only two sub-missions UIG and BSUP for the study. JNNURM initially was scheduled for seven years starting from 2005 to 2012. But due to some reasons it was extended further up to 2014.

Present study is a case study of Nanded city in context of socio-economic impact of JNNURM. Nanded is the only city from the backward region of Marathwada among identified 5 mission cities under JNNURM from Maharashtra State. All other mission cities in Maharashtra are in better condition. Moreover, large cities/metropolitan cities
have their own capacities to cope up with such programmes and have huge funding, whereas small cities lack in that. Present study is an attempt in this direction to study the impact of JNNURM on small cities like Nanded.

This chapter further stated the objectives, hypothesis and research methodology used in the study. The present study is the combination of evaluative and explorative research design. This study makes an attempt to evaluate NWCMC performance in JNNURM and to explore the socio-economic impact of JNNURM on the urban poors of the Nanded city. Both primary and secondary sources are utilized to collect the data. Further, it gives the details of methods used in primary data collection, variables/parameters utilized in the study, sampling design, techniques utilized, processing and analysis of data, etc. At the end, chapter stated the organization and limitations of the study.

CHAPTER 2:

Chapter 2 has presented review of different studies carried out by different experts in the respective areas. As shown in table 6.1 this chapter reviewed studies on four different themes urbanization, urban services and governance, urban poors and JNNURM. In available literature, almost all the studies are focused on metropolitan cities or large cities only. Majority of studies have either discussed the infrastructure issue or urban poor issue. There is hardly any study on small urban centers and covering all the aspects of JNNURM. Therefore this study has been undertaken to bridge this research gap.

Table 6.1: Theme Wise Literature Reviewed in the Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.N.</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Author/Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
CHAPTER 3:

This chapter has provided detailed profile of Nanded city. Chapter is classified into three major sections. First section has given brief profile of Maharashtra state. Second section has given brief profile of Nanded district and final section has elaborated the profile of Nanded city. Nanded city is located at the backward region of Maharashtra State i.e. Marathwada. It is located at the boundary of Karnataka and Telangana States. Nanded city is well connected with railway, State highways and National highways. People from nearby States get migrated to Nanded city for work because of the less distance compared with the distance of any other big city in their respective states. Altogether people from small towns too come for different purposes in the Nanded city. Economy of the Nanded city is mainly dominated by the territory sector.

Nanded city is religious city where plenty of pilgrims visit Sachkhand Gurudwara located at the core part of the city, through out the year. Nanded city hosted tercentenary (300th Anniversary) Gur ta Gaddi festival of Sikh religion in October 2008. NWCMC had to ensure adequate infrastructure facilities and other
arrangements for the success of the programme. It was mere coincidence that the Nanded city got identified as a mission city under JNNURM in 2005 on the basis of its religious importance and city hosted tercentenary (300th Anniversary) Gur ta Gaddi festival in year 2008. Identification of the city under JNNURM has offered great opportunity to local bodies of Nanded to make appropriate development of the city for the success of the holy event and future development too.

Demographically, Nanded city is not huge city as compared with the other mission cities. This city is characterized by 50 percent share of the slum population as per the NWCMC data for the year 2011. JNNURM has two sub-missions, UIG with the objective to improve infrastructure in the city and BSUP with the objective to provide basic services to urban poor in the city. Nanded city is less experienced and youngest ULB as compare to other mission cities in Maharashtra like Mumbai, Pune, Nagpur and Nashik.

CHAPTER 4:
Chapter four comprehended the configuration of JNNURM, its objectives, allocation of funds and status of Nanded city in JNNURM. This chapter is classified into four major sections. First section emphasized on the policy background of Indian planning in the context of urban development plans. It analyzed major policies prepared by planning commission for the issues related to urban development in different five year plans. Second section described the origin of JNNURM, its objectives, coverage, monitoring system and process of projects submission and funding under JNNURM. Third section of the chapter interpreted the allocation of projects, approved cost and other details of projects among different states in India. Finally, this section has analyzed the city wise details of UIG and BSUP projects. Further, it also interpreted the secondary data to find out the status of Nanded city in JNNURM.

JNNURM became popular mainly because of its seven year scheduled proposed investment plan in identified 65 mission cities through two sub-missions namely UIG and BSUP. JNNURM found inclined towards the sub-mission UIG than BSUP. It is also observed that the North Eastern States got very less number of projects and less approved costs as compared with other states. At the same time it seems that the developed states have received good number of projects and cost than the less
developed states. So far mission cities are concerned, large cities received huge funding than the small cities. Per capita approved cost and per capita expenditure to small cities like Bodhgaya, Kohima, Nanded, Guwahati, Itanagar and Mysore are counted significantly more than the large cities. Small cities have their own benefit of less population and high per capita cost and expenditure.

Though Nanded is a small city, it could able to fetch 11 projects under sub-mission UIG and BSUP each. It seems that Nanded city too is inclined towards the infrastructure projects under JNNURM. Nanded city recorded highest per capita expenditure than any other mission city under UIG with first position but it stands at fourth position for per capita expenditure under BSUP. Per capita expenditure is significantly good in both the sub-missions for Nanded, than other major mission cities. The present study found that a small ULB like NWCMC performed better than other ULB’s of mission cities with all its available capacity, resources and experience during the implementation of JNNURM.

CHAPTER 5:
This chapter dealt with the quantitative analysis of the data collected through interview schedule, in light of secondary data, in context of Nanded city. This Chapter explored the impact of JNNURM on socio-economic conditions of urban poor in Nanded city. Further it took note of the changes in the infrastructural facilities of Nanded-Waghala City Municipal Corporation (NWCMC) area. Objective of the chapter was to explore the socio-economic impact of JNNURM on urban poors of the city and to take note of changes in governance and infrastructural image of the Nanded city. This chapter has tested the hypothesis using dependent (paired) t-test and ANOVA test.

It is found that there is significant difference in the socio-economic circumstances of urban poors before and after the implementation of the JNNURM. It is further found that there is significant difference in the socio-economic impact among poors staying in Relocation slums and poors staying in In-Situ slums. All slums observed with better life conditions after the implementation of JNNURM. Relocation slum Gautam Nagar found with sort of negative impact of JNNURM in context of long distance to market, workplace, schools and health facilities.
So far the infrastructure of city is concern, the completion of many projects have changed infrastructural image of Nanded city completely. Addition to this, NWCMC now provided many services online to save time and cost of the public. There are many changes in the governance of NWCMC too. After seven years of JNNURM, Nanded city has many plus and few minus sides. The infrastructural image of the city has changed significantly after the implementation of JNNURM. It could have taken many years to develop such type of infrastructure, if the responsibility might have shouldered to NWCMC only. Big Push to Nanded city resulted in improvement in infrastructure of the city and improvement in the living standard of the poors. Real benefits of such infrastructure development and slum improvement policy can be seen in near future too.

6.2 MAJOR FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:
Major findings and conclusions of the study are stated here with the reference to the objectives of the present study. Findings and conclusions in this section are classified in four sub-sections 6.2.1) General findings and conclusions 6.2.2) Findings and Conclusions in the context to First Objective, 6.2.3) Findings and conclusions in the context to Second Objective and 6.2.4) Findings and conclusions in the context to Third Objective. Finally the achievements and failures of NWCMC in context of JNNURM are stated. Major findings and conclusions of the study are stated as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6.2.1 GENERAL FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
1. JNNURM identified more cities from the states which have their own capacity of urban development. The smaller states could be able to take little advantage of the mission because of their comparatively less capacity and more necessity of urban development.
2. It finds that the more developed states got more number of projects whereas less developed states received less number of projects. North eastern states got very less number of projects. Data of total number of projects sanctioned is little skewed (1.689) so that the distribution of projects is not equally
distributed across the state. There find very low degree positive correlation (correlation value is 0.093 only) between urban population of the states/UTs and total number of projects sanctioned but finds significant positive correlation (correlation value is 0.677) between the number of identified mission cities and total number of sanctioned projects.

3. Approved cost under UIG and BSUP are positively skewed (near to 2 in both the cases). It indicates that the approved cost in both the sub-missions is in favor of few states/UTs.

4. Mean approved projects (mean projects 8) under UIG found more than the mean approved projects (mean projects 5.77) under BSUP. Range for approved projects under UIG found very huge i.e. 42 projects whereas range for approved projects under BSUP found just 16 projects. Data of approved cost under UIG is largely dispersed (standard deviation 9.43) than the data of approved cost under BSUP (standard deviation 4.75). It indicates uneven approved cost among mission cities under UIG than in BSUP. All it reflects is that the Mission cities are inclined towards the projects under UIG than projects under BSUP.

5. Study finds that the overall allocation of projects is almost equal to Sub-mission UIG and Sub-mission BSUP each. But two third of the approved cost committed to UIG projects is less than one third of the approved cost committed to BSUP projects. It brings our attention towards the inclined nature of JNNURM for urban infrastructure.

6. Only thirteen cities counted more than ten projects under UIG. Nanded is one amongst them with least population of only 4.3 lakhs as per Census, 2001. There are many cities including State capitals having more population than Nanded city, but they hold less UIG projects under JNNURM. For example: Jaipur (population 23.3 lakhs and UIG approved projects - 9), Lucknow (population 22.5 lakhs and UIG approved projects - 7), Thiruvananthapuram

---

**6.2.2) FINDING AND CONCLUSIONS IN CONTEXT OF FIRST OBJECTIVE:**

*‘To study and find the current status of Nanded city under JNNURM’.*

---

247
(population 8.9 lakhs and UIG approved projects - 5), Patna (population 17 lakh and UIG approved projects - 6), Bhopal (population 14.6 lakhs and UIG approved projects - 7) and many more.

7. Approved cost of UIG projects for Nanded city is counted Rs. 732.8 crores. UIG approved cost for Nanded city is greater than the approved cost of 43 other mission cities including few state capitals and large cities like Patna (Rs. 582.3 Crores), Jaipur (Rs. 723.43 crores), Allahabad (Rs. 638.4 crores), Thiruvananthapuram (Rs. 488.67 crores), Ranchi (339.78 crores), Guwahati (Rs. 316.1 crores), Ludhiana (Rs. 241.1 crores) and many more.

8. In case of BSUP, only 16 cities counted more than 10 projects and remaining 49 mission cities counted less than 10 projects under BSUP. Nanded city has obtained 11 projects approved under BSUP. So far approved cost is concerned, only six mission cities counted more than Rs. 1000 crores as approved cost under BSUP. They are Mumbai (Rs. 2870 crores), Delhi (Rs. 1814.4 crores) Hyderabad (Rs. 1620.8 crore), Chennai (Rs. 1272.4 crore), Guwahati (Rs. 1084.4 crore) and Nanded (Rs. 1001.6 crore). Remaining 59 mission cities counted less than Rs. 1000 crores of approved cost under BSUP.

9. Nanded city is in better situation in case of Centre release than other mission cities of same demographic profile. Centre release counted almost two times more (Rs. 403.72 Crores) for Nanded city than average centre release of Rs. 200.65 crores to mission cities. It is four times more than the median centre release of Rs. 114.66 crores. Only 8 mission cities counted more than Rs. 400 crores of central release. They are Mumbai (Rs. 1102 croers ), Kolkata (Rs. 581.98 crores), Ahmedabad (Rs. 536.22 crores), Pune (Rs. 511.12 crores), Chennai (Rs.485.51 crores), Hyderabad (Rs. 451.12 crores), Lucknow (Rs. 446.73 crores) and Nanded (Rs. 403.72 crores).

10. Though the NWCMC seems as a tiny ULB, it could be able to release Rs. 141.46 crore from own sources under UIG. Release by NWCMC to itself was comparatively more than the State release of Rs. 50.46 crores to Nanded city. Demographically large cities/UTs with capable ULB’s like Bhubaneswar, Thiruvananthapuram, Patna, Jaipur, Raipur, Ranchi and many others, all together 30 cities recorded a smaller amount of ULB released compared to ULB release of NWCMC under UIG. The amount released by NWCMC under BSUP projects is comparatively less i.e. Rs. 5.67 crores only.
11. It seems very paradoxical that Nanded recorded highest total release of fund (81.29% of approved cost) under UIG. Hence, Nanded stands at first position and very less release of fund (15.76% of approved cost) under BSUP. Therefore, it stands amongst the least release obtained cities under BSUP.

12. Per capita approved cost of Nanded city counted Rs. 9202.53 crores which is significantly more than the mean per capita approved cost of Rs. 6712.90 crores. Per capita approved cost of many large cities like Vishakhapatnam, Kolkata, Hyderabad, Pune, Lucknow, Bhopal, Delhi and many more recorded less than the per capita approved cost of Nanded city.

13. Nanded city acquired highest per capita expenditure (Rs. 7112.91) than any other mission city under UIG with first position but stands at fourth position (with per capita expenditure Rs. 1509.92) under BSUP. Per capita expenditure is significantly good in both the sub-missions for Nanded city than the other mission cities.

14. Total expenditure incurred by NWCMC is far better than the mean expenditure (Rs. 416.54 crores) of the mission cities under UIG. NWCMC is the only ULB which could spend 77.29% of expenditure out of total approved cost to it under UIG. There is no other mission city (including metropolitan cities) that could be able to spend more than or equivalent to percentage expenditure of approved cost by NWCMC. In case of BSUP, total expenditure (Rs. 120.23 crores) of Nanded city is more than the large cities like Pune (Rs. 111.38 crores), Lucknow (Rs. 105.5 crores), Thiruvananthapuram (Rs. 68.83 crores), Kolkata (Rs. 44.27 crores) and many more. Total expenditure incurred by NWCMC under BSUP is not that efficient as in UIG.

15. For NWCMC, total expenditure (UIG: Rs. 566.3 crores and BSUP: Rs. 120.23 crores) out of total release of fund (UIG: Rs. 595.6 crores and BSUP: Rs. 157.82 crores) is proportionately better in both the sub-missions. But the amount spent under UIG seems to be four times larger than the amount spent under BSUP where the approved cost for UIG projects (Rs. 732.77 crores) is less than the approved cost of BSUP projects (Rs. 1001.6 crores). Expenditure incurred (77.29%) under UIG is more than the expenditure (12%) incurred under BSUP by NWCMC.

16. Per capita approved cost (Rs. 9202.53) under UIG counted less as compared with per capita approved cost (Rs. 12578.77) under BSUP for Nanded city. But
per capita expenditure under UIG seems huge (Rs. 7112.91) than the per capita expenditure under BSUP (Rs.1509.92) for Nanded city. It indicates, though the approved cost for BSUP is more, the expenditure performance by NWCMC is better for UIG projects only.

17. Nanded city stands amongst the cities having low difference in per capita approved cost and expenditure. There are many large cities like Hyderabad (difference of Rs. 3279.42 crores), Lucknow (difference of Rs. 3492.47 crores), Delhi (difference of Rs.3215.8 crores), Kolkata (difference of Rs. 4989.15 crores), Pune (difference of Rs. 4526.91 crores), Bhopal (difference of Rs. 3715.2 crores) and many more having huge difference between per capita approved cost and per capita expenditure. It represents the inefficiency of the respective ULB’s to spend amount as per the approved cost.

6.2.3) FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS IN CONTEXT OF SECOND OBJECTIVE:

‘To review and understand the Impact of JNNURM on the urban infrastructure facilities of small city like Nanded’.

18. Study finds that though, approved cost for BSUP projects is more than the UIG projects in Nanded city, NWCMC utilized more funds under UIG than BSUP. It could be so because of the need and pressure on NWCMC to provide infrastructure facilities for the grand celebration of Gur ta Gaddi tercentenary festival hosted by the city in 2008. Hence, the priority was given to infrastructure projects and utilization of the funds received under it.

19. Completion of projects like widening and reconfiguring 38 different roads of 47.14 km, construction of 2 Bridges (one across Godavari river and other at Hingoli gate railway crossing), Water Treatment Plant of 35 MLD capacity each for North and South Nanded (addition to two WTP of 87 MLD in north and 12 MLD in south Nanded), 18 Elevated Storage Reservoirs with 34.5ml capacity (previously 18.35 ml in 12 ESR), 3 new Sewerage Pumping Stations in north Nanded and 1 in south Nanded, Sewerage Treatment Plants (STP) of 87 MLD in north and 30 MLD in south Nanded (previous STP of 27 MLD in north and 6 MLD in south), 10 semi low floor buses and 20 mini buses for
local transportation, construction of 125 km of road side drainages, etc. has changed infrastructural image of Nanded city considerably. After the implementation of JNNURM, there is a huge change in the infrastructure facilities available in the city. All the infrastructure facilities are not in use with their full potential as these have been constructed in advance with a future vision. It is observed that, NWCMC developed few infrastructural facilities in some of the ‘No Men’s Land’.

20. Seven years (plus extended 2 year) of JNNURM has made many changes in the infrastructural facilities in Nanded city. Need and completion of the infrastructure project, use of the infrastructure and maintenance of the infrastructure are the key issues at ULB level. It is observed that, roads in Nanded are designed in a very pleasant manner including, walking path, cycle path, parking lots, etc. It is found that though the infrastructure is complete, the use of this infrastructure is still not known to the people/residents for whom it is been constructed. It is observed that the huge traffic congestions exists even today in the core area of Nanded city like Juna Mondha, Vazirabad, Shivaji Nagar, ITI Corner, Workshop Corner, Taroda Naka, etc. There is need to give guidance and information/counseling to the people/residents for the use of constructed infrastructure and it’s maintenance. Different NGO’s might help it out here in this context. Then only the tourist and religious importance of Nanded being identified under JNNURM can be justified.

21. Only 7 projects have been sanctioned for the development of heritage area under JNNURM among all mission cities. Nanded city received one of them. Though Nanded city is identified on the basis of religious and tourism importance, the total amount sanctioned to heritage project is least (Rs. 43.13 crores) among the amount sanctioned to different projects in Nanded. Only two heritage projects are completed from total 7 projects in all mission cities. Heritage project of Nanded is one amongst other than the completed two heritage projects in JNNURM.

22. NWCMC achieved mandatory reforms asked by the Government like E-Governance set up, Property tax (with 85% coverage and 90% collection efficiency) and provision of basic services to urban poor after the completion of seven years of JNNURM. Mandatory reforms like shift to accrual based
double entry accounting, 100% cost recovery (Water Supply and Solid Waste) are in significant progress stage at NWCMC.

23. CAG report highlighted (in Chapter 4) that, ‘...Seven years of implementation of JNNURM have exposed major lacunae within ULBs in terms of capacity and resources, which are highly inadequate to implement urban reforms…’. However, the present study finds that, a small ULB like NWCMC performed better than other mission cities with all available capacity and resources during the implementation of JNNURM.

| 6.2.4) FINDING AND CONCLUSIONS IN CONTEXT OF THIRD OBJECTIVE: |
| 'To study the possible socio-economic impact of JNNURM on the urban poor of Nanded city'. |

24. The field survey conducted in different nine slums finds that, modal category of resident (beneficiaries) household (HH) is Scheduled Caste with 263 samples (80.2%) followed by minority category with 48 HH (14.6% of total sample). Data is positively skewed (skewness=1.803) because the majority (93.99%) of respondent belongs to either SC or minority category.

25. Only 3 respondents found to be of ST category, that too from relocation slums. Minority is the second largest category among the respondent of which 94 percent (45 out of 48) minority respondent belongs to relocation slum. This is because the calculated significance level is less than the level of significance of 0.05. It implies that the significant difference in the different categories of the respondents staying in different type of slums i.e. In-Situ and Relocation slums.

26. Only 7 percent respondents (22 respondents) found made a complete payment of Beneficiary amount to NWCMC. Majority of the poors are the residents of Relocation slums who paid the complete beneficiary amount.

27. It is found that the poors had borrowed money for the payment of beneficiary amount to NWCMC. Majority of the poors borrowed from the private lenders than any other source like bank or SHG.
28. All poor s had to stay outside the house for more than 1 and half year during the construction of the DU’s. 73 percent of the poor s stayed on open land without any basic service to them and 27 percent of the respondents stayed on rent. It is observed that the constructions of DU’s were delayed for more than one and half year. It affected poor s’ life badly during the period.

29. The study finds that previously 98% of the respondents were staying in kuccha houses and only 2% in either half pucca or complete kuccha houses (without any ownership). They all are now staying in pucca houses (with self ownership) after the implementation of JNNURM.

30. The survey finds that the poor are staying in unique size houses after the implementation of JNNURM instead of much dispersed/skewed size houses, they were staying before. Average size of houses seems reduced (497 sq. ft. was the mean size before, it reduced to 355 sq. ft. now) after the implementation of JNNURM. But the values of dispersion, skewness and range in the context of area of houses too reduced as compared to previous condition. Standard deviation fell down to 72 sq. ft. now than standard deviation of 514 sq. ft. before. Skewness counted 2.523 due to some extreme values before (Maximum value was 3200 sq ft). It also fell down to only 0.546 after the implementation of JNNURM. Value of range also declined to 150 sq. ft. from 3120 sq. ft. This resulted into the equality in the size of houses.

31. The mean per person floor space (PPFS) found reduced after the implementation of JNNURM. PPFS was 91.11 sq ft before JNNURM which fell down to 79.44 sq ft. The median and mode values for PPFS have increased (median from 58.57 sq ft to 75 sq ft and mode from 40 sq ft to 75 sq ft). Standard deviation declined from 95.717 to 43.03 sq ft, addition to this, range along with minimum and maximum values also declined. All it indicates is that, the more equality in the PPFS is available now than previous.

32. Study finds that the poor s from In-Situ slums had larger PPFS as compare to Relocation slums, before JNNURM. After the JNNURM, poor s residing in Relocation slums acquire larger PPFS than the poor s residing in In-Situ slums. Study finds that the significant association between the PPFS and type of slums because the p-value is less than the significance level of 5%.

33. Though the drainage lines are available, 19 percent of the drainage lines are not functional because of incomplete work. Importantly, all such drainage
lines are found in the In-Situ slums only. They exist in the slums but outlet is not given properly or drainage left open on particular distance of 50 to 60 feet from the slum. All the drainage lines in Relocation slums are properly functioning.

34. From this study, it is found that, 290 (88%) respondents had no separate kitchens previously, now all (328 HH) of them have kitchens available in DU’s. Only 38 HH (12%) had access to cooking Gas, which has increased to 172 HH (52%) now. 80% of the HH had no authorized MSEB electricity connection or access before, now all 328 HH do have authorized electricity connections. 287 HH (88%) did not have toilet provisions in houses before, now all 328 HH have toilets. 209 HH (64%) commented that they had no drainage line aside the house, now there is drainage lines for each lane. Only 12 HH (3.7%) had access to inner pucca roads before and now 197 HH (60%) have access to pucca inner roads. Factually, 2 HH were staying in pucca houses (that too unauthorized), now all 328 HH are staying in pucca houses (that too authorized with minimum cost). 226 (90%) HH feel that they do stay in clean surroundings and 233 (71%) HH feel that there is positive change in the social status because of pucca houses they are staying in. These are some of the positive aspects of impact of JNNURM on urban poor in Nanded city.

35. The survey finds some paradoxical negative facets too like all 328 HH do have toilets in the houses but still 42% (139 HH) do not use toilets. Majority of them give reason of incompletion of drainage connections. Drainage lines are available but around one fourth of it are not functioning or not connected or outlet not given. There are still some slums where waste water is running on roads in front of houses though on the back-side of house, drainage exists. Majority of respondents think that the MSEB bill is an extra financial burden on them (previously majority used to steal electricity from main lines). Even today almost one fourth of the sample HH steals electricity. There is no as such positive change in the economic status though 71% HH feel that there is improvement in their social status.

36. Most of the poors are engaged in informal sector. They all are not capable to spend money on traveling to reach to workplace/occupation. Most of them search jobs nearby the residence of their own. JNNURM has dislocated some poors far from the market place. They used to stay near the market previously
and had easy access to market and informal jobs. After the implementation of JNNURM majority of the poors from Relocation Slums have to spend money on traveling to reach the workplace/occupation. It brought extra burden on the economic condition of urban poors.

37. All In-situ slums are renewed on the land where they were already staying. There are definite benefits of new DU’s for the residents of In-situ slums, except unique size of houses (exception for them who had large size houses before). Major concern of impact is with the relocated residents. Almost all urban poor of relocated slums were resident of area nearby the main market like Shivaji Nagar, Railway Station or Bus Stand of Nanded city. For different infrastructure development projects, they are relocated from their previous places.

38. Present study found Relocation slum- Gautam Nagar as a vulnerable slum than other slums. Market/workplace distance, employment opportunity, School distance, PHC access, etc. are the major concern for the residents of Gautam Nagar. Relocation of slums has left negative impact on the market access and employment opportunity of the residents of Gautam nagar. It raises a question that whether such relocation was to enhance the standard of living of the urban poor by providing basic services to them or was it to relocate them because they were the main obstacles in the urban infrastructure development projects like bridges, roads, etc.

After seven years of JNNURM, Nanded city has many positive and few negative sides. The infrastructural image of the city has changed significantly after the implementation of JNNURM. It could either get many years to develop such type of infrastructure at NWCMC own. Big Push to Nanded city resulted into improvement in infrastructure of the city and improvement in the living standard of the poors.

6.3 ACHIEVEMENTS AND FAILURES OF NWCMC IN CONTEXT OF JNNURM:

Urban local bodies of the mission cities had to play major role in the implementation of JNNURM. This section of the chapter states major achievements and failures of NWCMC in context of JNNURM. These stated achievements and failures are interpreted from the collected data and observations. Sub section 6.3.1 gives
achievement side of NWCMC in context of JNNURM and sub section 6.3.2 gives failure side of NWCMC in context of JNNURM.

6.3.1 ACHIEVEMENTS OF NWCMC IN CONTEXT OF JNNURM:

1) NWCMC found succeeded in getting and completing the projects more efficiently and effectively with limited institutional and technical capacity. NWCMC got appreciated for their efficiency and performance in the final appraisal of JNNURM stating that, ‘Nanded has emerged a front runner as a city which has utilized the JNNURM funds in the best possible manner with development in almost all the sectors in terms of infrastructure as well as compliance with significant progress in terms of the reforms prescribed under the mission’. (Grant Thornton, 2011)

2) Though NWCMC is a small ULB, it could able to receive 11 projects under UIG and BSUP each. Many large mission cities have fewer projects sanctioned under sub-mission I: UIG and sub-mission II: BSUP to them as compared with Nanded city. NWCMC is among the few ULBs which could be able to follow all procedures to get projects, funds and utilization of the same. There are many cities which found trouble following the procedures asked by JNNURM so that it has received less projects and funds.

3) NWCMC recorded highest release of fund out of approved cost under UIG. All other mission cities (including metropolitan cities) are featuring less percentage of release of fund than Nanded city.

4) Fund release by NWCMC seems extraordinary as compare to its size. Release by NWCMC was comparatively more than the State release to Nanded city itself.

5) NWCMC has highest per capita expenditure than any other mission city under UIG with first position but stands at fourth position under BSUP.

6) NWCMC achieved mandatory reforms asked by the Government like E-Governance set up, Property tax (with 85% coverage and 90% collection efficiency) and provision of basic services to urban poor after the seven years of JNNURM. NWCMC now provides services like birth certificate, death certificate, marriage certificate, details of property tax, e-tendering and many more through their website online. It has substantially cut down the time and cost to provide such services.
7) Property tax coverage in NWCMC has improved after the implementation of JNNURM. GIS based property taxation has been implemented in NWCMC. Nanded is among the 20 mission cities which acquired 85 percent of the property tax coverage and also stands among 16 mission cities in the 90 percent collection efficiency of property tax.

8) Only two heritage projects are completed from total 7 projects from all 65 mission cities. Heritage project of Nanded is one amongst the completed two heritage projects under JNNURM. It is one of the major achievements by NWCMC.

9) After the implementation of JNNURM, there are huge changes in the infrastructure facilities available in the city. Nanded city hosted Gur-ta-Gaddi Tercentenary programme in year 2008. NWCMC could be able to provide all necessary infrastructures for the success of the programme.

10) One of the major achievements of NWCMC is that the urban poor in the city received pucca houses along with other basic services to them. It resulted into the improvement of the living standard of the poor. Renewal of these slums has improved the image of the Nanded city.

6.3.2 FAILURES OF NWCMC IN CONTEXT OF JNNURM

1) Though approved cost for BSUP projects is more than the UIG projects for Nanded city, NWCMC utilized more funds for UIG than BSUP. It could be so because of the need and pressure on NWCMC to provide infrastructure facilities for the grand celebration of Gur-ta-Gaddi tercentenary festival hosted by the city in 2008. Hence, the priority was given to infrastructure projects and utilization of the funds received under UIG. It resulted into little negligence towards BSUP projects by NWCMC.

2) Nanded has recorded only 15.76% of total release of fund out of approved cost under BSUP because of that Nanded stands among the cities with the lowest release of funds under BSUP. It seems that no special initiative has been taken by NWCMC to fetch the funds which are already approved.

3) NWCMC could not be able to achieve mandatory reforms like shift to accrual based double entry accounting and 100% cost recovery (Water Supply and Solid Waste).
4) It is observed that, even today most of the people prefer manual procedures in NWCMC. There is less awareness among the people in context of e-Governance facilities provided by NWCMC.

5) All the infrastructure facilities created under JNNURM are not in use with their full potential as that has been constructed in advance with a future vision. There are areas where the complete infrastructures like roads, walking path, drainage lines, etc. are ready but no people nearby to use it. It is observed in some places that, NWCMC developed infrastructural facilities for ‘No Men’s Land’.

6) JNNURM started its implementation from the year 2005. During 2005-06 to 2008-09, there was no such big difference in the number of slums in the Nanded city. But after 2009-10 numbers of slums have increased significantly. NWCMC has to consider this as an important problem. Almost 50 percent of the Nanded population recorded staying in slums as per the slum data of 2011.

7) Initially it was decided by NWCMC to redevelop new layout comprising of a cluster of medium rise flats for all the slums. But due to beneficiary opposition, NWCMC shifted to In-Situ redevelopment on the same footprint. NWCMC differentiated between the Relocation slums and In-Situ slums for the size and type of DU’s.

8) Although vast numbers of poors have not been relocated in Nanded city, many amongst the relocated poors mentioned difficulties in accessing their places of work.

9) Issues of livelihood need to be addressed since housing and livelihood are inter-dependent. Without livelihood, the urban poor often find it difficult to sustain housing improvements.

10) Study finds some un-allotted DU’s in the Relocation slums. Some poors are not willing to stay in Relocation slums is other issue. Relocation Slum sites at Govardhan Ghat, NTM sector are under construction even after the completion of JNNURM period. It is observed that, all committed work towards urban poors is not completed. Many works are left incomplete. In some places work has been observed with low quality
6.4 SUMMARY OF HYPOTHESIS TESTING:

Present study stated two null hypotheses (H$_0$). First stated null hypothesis, H$_0$(1) is; ‘there is no significant difference in the socio-economic circumstances of urban poor’s in Nanded city after the implementation of JNNURM’. Other stated null hypothesis, H$_0$(2) is; ‘there is no significant difference in the socio-economic impact on urban poor staying in Relocation and In-Situ slums of the Nanded city’. Though sample size is 328, study utilized dependent (paired) sample t-test and One Way ANOVA for the testing the stated two hypothesis. Reason behind using t-test is, as sample size increases t distribution behaves as a normal distribution. Results of the hypothesis testing are stated in table 6.1.

Table 6.1: Summary of Hypothesis Testing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>H$_0$</th>
<th>Statement of Hypothesis</th>
<th>Test Applied</th>
<th>Output</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H$_0$(1)</td>
<td>There is no significant difference in the socio-economic circumstances of urban poor’s in Nanded city after the implementation of JNNURM.</td>
<td>Dependent (Paired) Samples t Test</td>
<td>The two tailed p values of all parameters are less than the 5% level of significance. Therefore the Null hypothesis rejected at 5% significance level concluding that there is significant difference in the socio-economic circumstances of urban poor’s in Nanded city after the implementation of JNNURM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H$_0$(2)</td>
<td>There is no significant difference in the socio-economic impact on urban poor staying in Relocation and In-Situ slums of the Nanded city.</td>
<td>One Way ANOVA</td>
<td>Except two (Solid Waste and Safety/Security), corresponding p values of all other parameters found less than the level of significance (0.05). Therefore the study can reject null hypothesis and conclude that there exists significant difference in the socio-economic impact occurred on the poor’s staying in Relocation slums and In-Situ slums</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Testing of Hypothesis as in Chapter 5.
Dependent (Paired) Sample $t$-test and One Way ANOVA are utilized to test two different hypotheses in the study. Dependent (paired) sample $t$-test rejects the stated null hypothesis $H_{0(1)}$ and accept the alternative hypothesis $H_{a(1)}$ that there is significant difference in the socio-economic circumstances of the urban poor’s in the Nanded city after the implementation of JNNURM. On other side, One Way ANOVA also rejects the stated null hypothesis $H_{0(2)}$ and accept the alternative hypothesis $H_{a(2)}$ that there is significant difference in the socio-economic impact on the poor’s staying in Relocation and In-Situ slums, after the implementation of JNNURM.

6.5: SUGGESTIONS:

a) Though a big push to Nanded city resulted into infrastructure development, it still requires a policy/strategy to utilize this infrastructure properly and preserve the same.

b) It is observed that the facilities provided under the JNNURM are good enough but because of no proper guidance on how to use/utilize these, many facilities are broken or lying unutilized. Hence, awareness programme by NWCMC or Non-Government Organizations (NGO’s) should be carried out for the urban poors staying in the renewed slums.

c) There is no unique definition of urban slum or urban poor, as such at national level in India. So there is need to determine proper definition of slums. Criteriaon for identification of slums for the development under BSUP was unclear among different mission cities. It was needed to give unique guidelines to identify slums for the development under JNNURM.

d) Many projects are still under progress after the completion of seven years. The mission was scheduled for seven years (initially up to 2012 and later extended up to 2014), but it has taken initial 3-4 years to make ULB understand the process of the mission. Some ULBs trained their officers and members by sending them to different training institutions like YASHADA. Much time was spent on the formal process like CDP preparation, submission of DPRs, release of fund, etc. By August 2014, only 233 (39%) projects were completed out of 599 projects sanctioned in different sectors under UIG for all mission cities. It is needed to follow the work and accomplish it as early as possible to realize its real outcomes.
There is no updated reappraisal report available after the audit report of Grant Thornton (2011) and CAG Report (2012-13) on JNNURM. It is required to have reappraisal reports of all mission cities after 2014 to understand and correctly assess the status of different mission cities under JNNURM.

6.6 CONTRIBUTION TO THE EXISTING RESEARCH:
There is a lack of studies based on the small cities. There are very few studies done in the context of JNNURM and its impact on the urban India. Present study is a case study of Nanded city comprising socio-economic impact of JNNURM on the city infrastructure and poors in the city. It is found from the study that, NWCMC performed well in the implementation of JNNURM. Nanded stood at first position with highest expenditure out of the approved cost. NWCMC could be able to get Rs. 141.46 crore from its own sources under UIG. Release of fund by NWCMC to itself was comparatively more than the State release of Rs. 50.46 crores to Nanded city. There are many large cities lacking in many aspects under JNNURM. CAG criticized on the large cities considering failures by them in many aspects. Final appraisal of JNNURM by Grant Thornton appreciated the performance of NWCMC in its report.

This study is an attempt to provide socio-economic impact of JNNURM on small city like Nanded. Though it is a case of Nanded city, it can help doing research for other mission cities too. There is dearth of literature available on JNNURM in context of small cities. Whatever literature is available is in the context of metropolitan cities and most of them conducted before the completion of the JNNURM. Present study is confined to both before and after situation of JNNURM. Results of present study are drawn after the completion of JNNURM period. It is definitely useful for other researchers to get the direction in such kind of further studies.

6.7 SCOPE FOR FURTHER STUDY:
Urban issues and problems are dominantly considered /used as common issue of metropolitan cities or large cities. There are several studies done on metropolitan cities in the context of urban issues, problems, etc. Small cities/ towns too are increasing by every census, which offers new opportunities for future studies. Such
studies will also provide insights to small cities for their growth and development in a much planned manner and further contributing to economic development effectively.

The urban poor have distinct features than rural poor. There are many studies existing on rural poor and poverty in India. There is a huge scope to study the issues of urban poor from different dimensions. With growing urbanisation in India, these studies can provide insight to grow urban centers in a much planned manner and to face or to solve the problem of urban slums inclusively.