SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The present study was conducted in the Gandiwind block of Tarn Taran district which is among the nineteen border blocks in Punjab. It covered four villages of the block which are situated within radius of two kilometres from the international border of India and Pakistan. It aimed to look into the exclusion being faced by the people of border areas due to their location near border. Inductively the study aims to provide insights into rural geographical locations and exclusion being faced by people. Exclusion of border areas itself started with the demarcation of international boundary between India and newly formed Pakistan in 1947 with the controversial Radcliffe award that demarcated the boundary between India and Pakistan. Both the nations did not formally agree on the boundary between both the nations. It has led to the wars, aggravating security threats in the form of militancy, rising smuggling and terrorism. With India’s decision to erect fencing after 1986 there emerged a plethora of problems for the farmers. There was enhancement of security through increased presence of military forces but there was hardly any improvement in the lives of the people of borderbelt.

Borders are generally regarded as spaces of exclusion whether they are volatile, or non volatile but intensity of exclusion may vary from border to border. Deprivation was understood as exclusion faced by the border area residents in comparison to reference groups residing in the other mainstream areas. For the study a sample of two hundred and forty respondents was taken and study was largely dependent on primary sources. As mentioned earlier also that study was conducted in the villages which are within the radius of two kilometre from the zero line. Sixty respondents were selected from each village with the help of simple random sampling technique and their responses were quoted on the interview schedule being prepared. This gave a view of different aspects of exclusion faced by the people living in border areas. Some of the key findings have been given below. The findings also indicate areas which require attention of government agencies and policies so as to reduce the exclusions experienced by the border people. This is addressed in a separate section that follows the summary of key findings.
Summary of Findings:

Socio-Economic Profile and Impact of Border

Most of the respondents are male and belong to Sikh religion having mean and median age around 45 (forty five) years approximately with standard deviation of 13.06 years. The number of educated people in the border villages of Punjab is very less. Jats and Mazbi caste communities dominate in these border areas of Punjab numerically with minimal presence of Other Backward Classes (OBC’s). There is lack of occupational diversification due to agrarian set up of these villages and it was found that Jats are associated with farming and around 96.58 percent among daily wagers are Mazbi’s. There was no significant relation between the education and family type as it was clear that around 56.41 percent among the illiterate respondents prefer nuclear families. Women were the worst sufferers when it comes to the income in the border areas as comparison to men as they reported to be having lowest income in the border areas though overall income scenario is also not appreciating in the border areas. It was also found that land ownership is directly influencing the type of house as majority of the landowners reported to be living in Pucca houses as comparison to landless those who reside in semi Pucca houses. Around 61.25 percent of the families have only one earner in the family which affects their income. Various latest technological gadgets were found less in these border areas of Punjab.

Coming to the impact of border on the lives of border residents, it was found that most of the respondents respond that they had to leave homes in wars or war like situation like that of Kargil, which is unique and only applicable to border area residents. All those who can recapitulate war times consider it as their bad memories. Nearly 84 percent recalled that they spent around one to six months while staying out and took along with them livestock and other moveable articles from their house. Around 87.50 percent of them replied that they were not compensated for their loss during these types of situations. There was difficulty in finding marriage partners for the people of border residents and there was great difficulty in finding or forging alliance for their sons. Smuggling is a historical border issue and it does effects the life of border area residents.
**Education and Health Issues**

A look into the education and health variables in the borderbelt found that 68.09 percent among those who prefer village school were Mazbi respondents as they prefer their children to get education in the village schools that is governmental oriented schools and moreover 28.36 percent, those who prefer village school were Jats. But those who prefer cities were mainly from the Jat community. More than fifty percent of the respondents consider quality of education in border schools as bad and felt that various needs like lack of teachers and lack of up gradation of schools from time to time are among the problems that need to be addressed to improve education in border areas. Respondents who feel that there is difference between border and non-border school education felt that major cause is lack of teachers in the border schools. It is widely known that children of well to do families mostly study outside the village. The reason behind it is to get quality education and avoid bad habits of addiction which are common in these areas. There are respondents who think that lack of facilities is the root cause of non willingness of the teachers to work in the border schools. Around 74 percent of the respondents felt that the number of educated people in these areas of Punjab is very less and lack of getting quota in higher education institutions might be the reason behind less educated people in these areas as 77.92 percent of the respondents did not get any reservation benefit in higher education. Surprisingly, 22.08 percent did not know about the reservation.

More than 60 percent of the respondents felt that the quality of water is bad and it is responsible for the various health problems in the border areas of Punjab. Nearly 82.50 percent of the respondents or head of the household replied that for treating minor ailments they prefer local medical practitioners and more than 50 percent prefer taking treatment of accidents and serious ailments in nearby towns. The respondents those who prefer village for vaccination(17.50) of the total respondents, among them 73.81 percent are illiterate which implies that villages need better health care coverage. The respondents (15.33) percent are those who prefer till date home deliveries and there is no surprise to see that among them 86.84 percent are Mazbi respondents. It clearly shows that caste do effect the place of deliveries.

A large number of respondents constituting 96.25 percent believe that doctors are not willing to work in these remote villages along Indo-Pak border. Around 42.43 percent
of the respondents believe that reason behind the doctor’s unwillingness to work in border areas is that they were unable to earn desired amount of money in border areas. While 68.75 percent of the respondents did not know about health schemes of government at all, nobody was found enrolled in any health scheme.

**Substance Abuse and Health**

It is found that respondents believe that liquor is most common among the intoxicants followed by drugs. Among the type of liquor, desi liquor is being reported to be consumed by the people of border areas. Among drugs around 47.62 percent of the respondents believe that synthetic pills were used as stimulus followed by smack. 25.95 percent of the respondents believe that smack is prevalent in border areas. Around 43.33 percent of the respondents believe that extent of addiction in percentage is around 75 percent excluding women and children and around 33 percent believe that extent is around 50 percent in the border villages of Punjab. Most of the border residents did not seem to be satisfied with the role of police in the border areas. Around 80 percent of the respondents who believed that the prevalence of intoxicants is more in these border villages felt that proximity of the border and easy availability might be reasons behind it. There might be various reasons for addiction, but as found in the study enhancing sexuality is also one of the causes of addiction which crosses all the class boundaries. It has been substantiated with the help of case studies mentioned in the fourth chapter of the thesis.

**Economic Exclusion**

Looking into the employment scenario it was found in the study that around 47 percent of the respondents think that agriculture is sole source of employment. Exactly 40 percent think that daily wage labour is main employment activity in the border areas of Punjab. As when it comes to the wage rates, about 65.84 percent think wage rates were not similar to the non border villages. But as all the crops grown here have MSP (Minimum Support Price) farmers or agriculturists are able to get same selling rate as compared to other areas. More than 80 percent of the respondents are not getting any benefit or are not aware of employment schemes and that is why they are unable to get benefit of these schemes. Nearly equal percentage (50 percent) of the respondents either thinks of less development and states their dependence on agriculture activities as the reasons for unemployment in the border areas.
As discussed prior also that fencing exaggerated certain problems though it upgraded national security. Nearly 40 percent of the respondents think that less land value is the biggest problem of the farmers having land beyond fencing. Other problems like less entry gates, lack of crop choices and no credit facility are other non ignorable problems in the border areas. It was found that around 72.92 percent of the respondents believe that men dominate in the labour composition beyond fencing. When political awareness was assessed it was found that more than 50 percent of the respondents failed to even answer the name of their elected representative at the centre and at the state level. Exactly 60 percent of the respondents believe that government policies lack proper implementation in the border areas. Around 88.75 percent of the respondents think that living near border is surely a disadvantage. Around 43.67 percent of the respondents believe that facilities should reach the ground level, followed by 34.67 percent of the respondents who believe that they should be duly compensated for their disadvantageous position. Respondents also felt the need of special quota, special package and cooperation with military facilities to improve the situation. More than 83 percent of the respondents lay stress on honesty and hard work along with role of increasing awareness among border areas by administrative officials in border areas as a way to ease the difficulty of life in border areas.

Around 86.67 percent of the respondents believe that officials are not bothered at all to increase the awareness among border area residents regarding government initiatives. There is absence of international agencies to address the problems of border as around 78.33 percent of the respondents did not know about any international agency or the remaining 21.67 percent failed to answer as they did not know about these type of agencies at all. More than 80 percent of the respondents believed that the employment scenario prevailing in border areas of Punjab had gone from bad to worse. Around 36.75 percent of the respondents believe that smuggling is the main law and order problem followed by 27.56 percent of the respondents who believed that drug addiction is the main problem. Fights and thefts were also reported. Behaviour of police is not appreciated by around 62 percent of the respondents and more than 50 percent of the respondents felt that police is not effective in checking drug smuggling in these areas. Exactly 86.67 percent of the respondents believe that problems in border areas are different from the non border villages therefore they
need a different approach to counter these problems. This also draws attention to renew government policies and approaches to issues in border areas.

Various restrictions established in these areas by security forces range from not going near to fencing at night, to keep away from fencing and carrying identity cards while roaming in these areas. While talking about specific problems being faced by the border area residents around 26.89 percent of the respondents replied that lack of employment is a border specific problem. 21.06 percent of the respondents believed that network problem in communication are also a unique specific problem in these areas. Exactly 19.47 percent of the respondents believe that infrastructure problems are also specific to these areas; around 15 percent believe that public as well as private transport is also found lacking in these areas and exactly 12.98 percent talk about lack of clean water as a unique problem in these areas. While it could be argued that many of these problems are a part of rural areas, the study argues that they are perceptibly more acute in border areas. Therefore, there is a need for a multidimensional approach to increase inclusiveness in the border, as demonstrated in the figure below:
Border issues and strategies or Policies and Suggestions and Implementation

Before discussing policies and strategies to tackle exclusion in the land borders of India along Pakistan it is imperative to look into the role of Border Area Development Programmes (BADP) already in place. Many of these suggestions given in the report have been directed by the central government and have been adopted by various state governments ranging from those who share international borders in the North-West
regions of India to those in the North-East. As per Punjab Government’s Planning schemes given in various reports (http://www.pbplanning.gov.in/schemes.htm), Border Area Development Programme has been started with the twin objectives of balanced development of sensitive border areas through adequate provision of infrastructure facilities and promotion of sense of security amongst the local population. This programme was started in the year 1986-87 ‘for balanced development of areas bordering Pakistan namely Jammu & Kashmir, Punjab, Gujarat and Rajasthan’ and is stated in many reports by different states that have adopted these development programmes. The programme was changed from time to time and its coverage was extended to all the areas of States of Indian union sharing international border.

The Border Area Development Programmes (BADP), states that it is a ‘100 per cent centrally funded programme. Special Central Assistance (SCA) is provided for execution of approved schemes. The block is the basic unit for the programme. The schemes to be taken up under the programme are prepared by the concerned departments in the State and submitted to the nodal department for approval by the State level Screening Committee. The Empowered Committee at Central level deals with the policy matters relating to the scope of the programme, prescription of the geographical limits of the areas in the States and allocation of funds to the States’(BADP,2012).

As the Punjab government’s reports and the BADP Report (2012) developed by the Planning commission states that the schemes selected by the, ‘State Governments under the Programme are generally from sectors such as education, health, roads and bridges, water supply, etc.’ The report also highlights the need to improve and strengthen the social and physical infrastructure of the border areas so that it can meet the immediate and most basic needs of the people who reside there. It has been observed that some of the state governments undertake ‘construction of play grounds, community halls, etc. so that the people, particularly, unemployed youth can spend their leisure time in constructive and creative activities’. In brief the various problems that this programme identified as specific to border areas of Punjab are mentioned as below and given in the report by the Punjab government’s Annual Plan 2012 (www.pbPlanning.gov.in/schemes.htm) are:
a) The Border districts have suffered a lot and lagged behind due to their proximity to the border, three wars with Pakistan and long spell of cross border terrorism.

b) Farmers living in Border areas face acute hardships as they cannot cultivate tall crops. The problems are compounded by inadequate access after the erection of fencing along with International border which makes farming difficult.

c) Rivers Ravi and Satluj and number of seasonal brooks and distributaries are passing through the border Districts of Gurdaspur and Ferozepur respectively causing damage to the crops during the rainy season.

d) Border areas lack basic amenities of Education, Health, Sanitation, Transportation, Roads etc. The lack of environment for development of Industries and Marketing infrastructure have further accentuated the problems of the local population (ibid).

As mentioned in the first chapter, Punjab has approximately 553 kms long International border with Pakistan with six districts of Amritsar, Ferozepur, Gurdaspur, Fazilka, Pathankot and Tarn Taran that shares the boundary with the International border. There are 19 blocks with area of 6369.82 Sq.km which are covered under Border Area Development Programme. Gandiwind block of Tarn Taran district which was selected for this study is among these blocks.

The Border Area Development Programme provided to the States, which is funded centrally though Special Central Assistance grant, is allocated amongst the seventeen beneficiary States on the basis of the length of international border (ii) population of border blocks and (iii) area of border blocks. Each of these criteria is given equal weightage. The border block is the spatial unit for the programme and all schemes are implemented within the border blocks only. The funds received from Govt. of India are allocated among the six border districts of Amritsar, Gurdaspur, Pathankot, Fazilka, Tarn Taran and Ferozepur on the basis of criteria adopted by Govt. of India for distribution of funds amongst border states (Border Areas Development Report). It is clear from the chapter five that people are not aware about this scheme in border areas there is need to look into the anomalies existing in the scheme. This scheme has
also not fulfilled its desired goal. The findings also suggest strategies to tackle the problems existing in these areas and ways to ensure their implementation.

In general, individuals, groups or communities are agents of exclusion and state acts as an intervening agency to stop it. But in border areas the situation is very peculiar, because state acts as instrument of exclusion. Before giving suggestions on policy implementation there is need to look into the writings which already exist to deal with exclusion. There is no dearth of writers who talked about exclusion and ways to overcome exclusion that is to overcome illiteracy, restoration of democratic rights through the involvement of social movements, associations, international agencies, integrating actions, affirmative action’s of the state, social work, NGOs and SHGs (Self Help Groups) and political mobilisation (Sen 2000, Estivill 2003, Gough 2006, Sheppard 2006, Klasing 2007, Hasan 2009, Pearson 2010, Judge 2014). The above mentioned ways can be used to tackle wide varieties of exclusion whether it is on the basis of class, caste, religion, gender, race, geographical spaces etc. Apart from these, there could be special strategies to tackle exclusion of the border areas as discussed and presented in the suggestions below.

First of all the sole action or decision which require urgent attention is to re-define border areas. Under the existing parameters border areas are those areas which are situated within sixteen kilometres from the zero line. The definition itself defies the purpose of defining border areas. The reason is when we cover 16 kilometres from the zero line then many developed towns also come within this prescribed distance and with this they also become part of border areas. Secondly the real sufferers along the border are not able to get their desired share of development from the authorities due to the large geographical inhabitant area which came into the purview of border areas and funds meant for these areas which are being diverted to large population. Based on my findings certain measures could be developed as follows to sort out this problem to a large extent:

- If it is possible to redefine the border areas by reducing the within 16 kilometre provision to a single digit or even within five (5) kilometres, it should be done.
- If it is not considered viable due to some political obligations, then there should be categorisation of the areas according to their distance from the
international border. For instance areas within one kilometre distance from international border.

- New categorisation can be drawn about areas within two kilometre distance from international border, areas within four kilometres distance from international border and so on up to sixteen kilometres.

- With the help of this categorisation we can use the development grants and the other development projects on priority basis by covering areas which are close to the international border and direct victims of the border situations.

- Funds meant for development of border areas should be provided in the descending order inversely proportional to the distance from border. In other words in allocating funds, priority should be given to areas close to the border. These areas should be given special status approach because of their long suffering.

- There should be establishment of independent ministry or chair at the centre as well as at the state level to look comprehensively into the problems of border areas so as to take special actions to overcome those problems. If we can have a minister in charge of cows then there should not be any hesitation in having a separate ministry for the development of the border areas. There should be separate constituencies for the border areas in which there should be reservations of the electorates who themselves belong to the border areas. Because the person representing these areas must know the ground root realities of these areas and take forward steps to improve the situation. Adopting of border villages by the member of legislative assemblies (MLA’s) or by the member parliament’s (MP’s) can also be looked into.

- Establishment of permanent chairs in the universities for research into the development of border areas and contribute towards policies or renewal of the old ones could be another step. At present also there is an urgent need to set up a commission to look into the problems of border areas and suggest policies to make these vulnerable areas of the country more inclusive part of the development. These are addressed below:
Agriculture Issues and Policy Suggestions

Various types of policies are the need of hour in the border areas. Agricultural land beyond fencing needs immediate concern. Sekhon (2014) finds that there is communication gap between the farmers and those who can come to their rescue in the border areas. As price of land is very low beyond fencing it is the need of the hour to increase it on par with government price of land across fencing. Market price has nothing to do with land beyond fencing as nobody is interested in buying land beyond fencing. People of this area who have land beyond fencing are not able to sell it because of less or non availability of buyers. Even if they succeed in selling they are only able to buy land not more than half of their land or even less than that because of the steep difference in land prices in other areas. Even the public as well as the private banks and other formal financial institutions are not providing any type of loan on agrarian land beyond fencing on subsidized credit limit which is a provision of the government to provide loan to the farmers on less interest rates. In this way agriculturists of border area who have land beyond fencing are deprived in each and every aspect of the land concerns. There should be provision of providing subsidized credit limit to farmers in border areas. There is a provision to provide electricity connections to the land owners in the fencing areas on the priority basis but cost of the connection is to be incurred by applicant which is considered to be unaffordable for the marginal farmers as they are costing nearly one lakh. It is too much for the person to pay who is having only agriculture as a source of income. So, there should be provision to provide tube well connections with whole cost incurred by the government.

It is the rule described by the security forces that people having land beyond fencing or near fencing are not allowed to grow crops which grow more that 3 to 3.5 feet height. This is also a type of exclusion faced by the landowners. It is acceptable that due to security reasons and also army personnel’s felt hindrances in vision due to height of crops. But such restrictions should be accompanied by certain compensations. Compensation which is provided to owners of the land was 4000 rupees per acre and till recently it has been increased to 6000 rupees per acre but it need to be further increased because it is far less than the rent of the land which is across fencing. In fact it is 7 to 8 times less than the rent of the land across fencing. It means that there is lack of rationalisation in providing compensation to the land
owners. Compensation should be increased up to the level that it can justify the losses incurred in the production of the crops by the land holders. Also due to the restrictions of the crops due to height factor, farmers are bound to grow same crops that are (wheat and paddy) again and again. Due to limited choice of crops they are not able to diversify which means health of the soil is getting affected and deteriorated and they are also not able to go for horticulture, floriculture etc. It means that borders are playing an important role in restricting the people to grow same crops again and again. In this way this factor is playing a great role in deteriorating soil health, decreasing ground water table and lack of choice in agricultural diversifications which are all the keys to solve all the problems related to farmers in Punjab. Diversification plans should be adopted in border areas with active initiatives of the government.

There is a need to pay attention or lay focus on how to save the people of border area from being the victims of all these type of hindrances which they are facing in border areas. There are other problems related to agriculture beyond fencing like time entry, intensive checking, less provision of gates for entry etc. Taking into consideration ‘time entry’ it is being observed that there is time entry period and there is time prior to which people are again supposed to come out of the fenced area. Officially it is from 9am to 5pm but hardly the owners and workers have access exactly at the stipulated time. They can stay hardly up to 5 o’clock because they are forced to come before the official time. Proper policy provisions should be there to allow the farmers to have access of their crops or agriculture fields.

Intensive body checks by security forces is also a type of problem being faced by the land owners. Though it is done for security purposes, but there should be avoidance of sacrificing someone’s interests for the interest of others. It is found that lot of time is wasted in checking landowners, labourers and agricultural machine tools which in turn leave less time for the owners at their disposal to perform various agriculture related works in the fields. Checking should be done prior to the entry time and also after the stipulated time meant for land owners (i.e. that is in the evening after 5 pm). In this way time loss can be saved. Another point can be raised over here is that if army personnel also accompany people inside the fencing then what is the need of wasting so much time in checking. If they are invigilating the activities of the workers inside fencing and having continuous check upon them, there is no need of intensive checking. Another important problem is provision of entry gates and it is observed
that there is uneven distribution in the availability of gates. Somewhere they are within the distance of 1km and somewhere they are not available for a long distance. It means there are no established parameters for the provision of entry gates within a particular distance. Land owners have to travel lot of distance towards entry gates and then toward their fields. It means again there is loss of time and resources like diesel etc. This all can be saved by the formulation of proper policy for the provision of gates within a stipulated distance.

I have already discussed that the agriculture is the sole activity on which the majority of the population in border areas is dependent apart from other agriculture related activities. If problems in agriculture are not addressed properly and within a short span of time then there will be further deterioration in the deprivation being faced by the people of border areas. Nobody in this country excluding people of border should be feeling the sense of being alien in their own land and property. It is a peculiar situation for the people of border area that they are being checked and kept under invigilation within their own land property over which they have possession rights within their own country. This is extreme level of exclusion which the people of border area are facing. It needs a permanent solution to this situation otherwise their feeling of alienation will increase and will lead to unexpected consequences.

Health Issues and Policy Suggestions

Health is an important parameter which also needs due attention in the border areas of Punjab. The point of highlighting the negligible role of private players in health in border areas is only aimed to reiterate the role of public sector in a neglected field in the border areas. Dhillon and Singh (2006) talked about health awareness programmes, proper supervision of the health centres, efficiencies in using funds related to health and allocation of more fund to improve health infrastructure in the border areas. Sekhon (2014) while talking about the demands of Border Area Sangarsh Committee (BASC) lays stress on the detailed plan to address the problems related to health and education. It can be seen in the findings that cases of Hepatitis C are reported in the border areas including other liver related diseases. It is observed that hepatitis is fatal in these areas as people are less aware about it and those who are affected are unaware about it or are not able to afford expenses in curing this disease. When this data was collected it is found that one injection which is meant for one
week costs around 13000 to 14000 rupees per dose which is very much high. Person infected with hepatitis C virus (HCV) had to go for minimum of twelve injections or more than that and might be up to 48 injections. As is it is known medically that HCV is communicable it means there is also a need to raise awareness regarding hepatitis C virus. Till recently government in newspapers announced subsidised injections for treatment of this disease but there is lot of difference between theory and practise. Here I want to highlight the fact that till date government has not been able to find out the exact areas which are having more HCV infected persons. So it is pertinent for the government to look into these areas of Punjab for finding or numbering the areas affected by the Hepatitis C virus.

Drug addiction is also very rampant in these areas of Punjab. As these areas are the part of wider drug trade that is drug crescent (including Pakistan, Afghanistan, Punjab) it means drugs passes through these areas of Punjab for wider purpose. But people of these areas are also becoming addicts while acting as Pandhi (local name of couriers or mules who transport drugs from one part to another part of the country or the world). This study clearly depicts the perception of the people of these areas regarding the extent of drug addicts in these areas. From this it is clear that this problem is aggravating. Despite the high cost of smuggled drugs even then also people from scheduled caste population are becoming habitual of these drugs. While acting as couriers or transporters they have some out of it or also with the money earned through transporting they are consuming drugs. One could argue that due to deprivation in economic development, smuggling is taking place and due to smuggling, addiction is taking place leading to various health problems. If we want to take preventive measures it means we have to address the economic deprivation and if we want to take curative measures then there should be proper availability of health centres and rehabilitation centres at the village level in the border areas of Punjab.

Actually from my perception the relative economic deprivation is the root cause of all the problems related to smuggling of drugs and addiction. Smuggling of drugs is at present considered to be the most lucrative way of achieving economic success by the deprived masses of border areas. In fact economy and smuggling are so much intermingled with each other that we cannot think of separating them off. It also leads corrupt law enforcement authorities to turn a blind eye to this phenomenon. So there is need of comprehensive plan to address the economic deprivation of the people of
border areas and by doing this we will be able to tackle most of the problems in the border areas. As described in the fourth chapter there are various causes of addiction like the relation of enhancing sexuality with substance abuse. So, there is need to look into the causes of addiction from various dimensions and not just in terms of economic point of view. This reason as described might cross all the class boundaries of addiction. This can be inductively applied to all the strata of addicts.

There is also an urgent need to establish rehabilitation centres especially in the border villages of Punjab because without proper counselling and medical treatment it is very tough for the addicts to shun the habit of drug addiction. Due to addiction there is also rise in the theft activities like drawing out copper wires from the transformers installed on the government approved tube wells in the field of the farmers etc. Reason behind the correlation of theft and addiction emerges from the fact that to purchase drugs the person or the individual needs to have money due to high cost of the drugs. People who on the basis of their own economic standing are not able to buy drugs opted for other means (that is theft and snatching etc) to have money. With the money earned from these activities they buy drugs.

To control thefts there is need of proper policing of these areas. Police stations in these areas need to upgrade both infrastructure and equipments wise also. Patrolling vehicles should be provided to the police in these areas and there is a need of initiating night patrolling in the border villages of Punjab. With the help of night patrolling activities like theft and smuggling will get discouraged. Accountability of the police should be there to enhance the proper functioning of this law enforcing agency to stop this institution from becoming exploitative. In the villages where drug addiction and smuggling is rampant police need to perform active role. Instead of harassing and committing atrocities on people they should adopt restitutive laws in place of using repressive laws. By using restitutive laws against repressive laws police can help in integrating the border society with the other mainstream population and can play an important role in eradicating the feeling of alienation from the minds of the people residing in these deprived areas.

Separate health policies should be implemented for the people of border areas. Another practically possible solution is to integrate the treatment of people of border area with those of the defence forces in getting various health facilities. In general all
the health incentives on par with military personnel’s should be granted to the people of border areas.

**Communication Issues and Policy Recommendations**

Communication problem is a unique problem being faced by border area residents. Weak network coverage and sometimes totally dismissive network coverage is very prominent in these parts of Punjab. People of these areas have to own sim cards of various mobile telephone network providers because they are not able to know the reason why sometimes the network of one service provider fades away and while others are working and vice-versa. This is a great hindrance in the communication. In this way we can say that people of border area are facing communication exclusion. Communication is considered to be an important way for integration of the excluded masses with the mainstream population so due to this reason there is need to promote proper availability of various communication technologies in the borderlands of Punjab. People of border are relatively deprived from other areas in accessing or having full advantage of various communication technologies. Today we are talking about Wi-Fi facilities in all over Punjab but it is like a dream in border areas of Punjab as till date they are struggling for mobile network coverage. So there is need to formulate a comprehensive policy to address the communication hindrances in the border areas. Network jammers can be installed in the sensitive areas to discourage the misuse of the communication technology (for example near the fenced area) but network should be there in the villages as it can play an important role in the integration of the border masses. In this technology laden world it is impossible to think of integration of the masses without making them to harness various technological gadgets available in the market. Here again it is important to consider that public communication network providers should be assigned the duty to solve network problem in these areas as no private player will be interested in investing in border areas.

**Employment Issues and Policy Recommendations**

As discussed in the fifth chapter it is clear that employment scenario is very grim in the border areas of Punjab. As it is clear from the second chapter up to fifth chapter that solely it is agriculture which is playing the purpose of generating employment in these areas. All the other sectors which are considered to be vital in creating
employment are totally missing. As observed in the fifth chapter neither the private nor the public players are interested in the investment in border areas and even public private partnership is also missing from these areas of Punjab. This is because nobody wants to invest because of the volatility of the border. Kaur (2014) talked about the existence of peaceful borders to address the problems of unemployment and lack of prosperity in the border areas. Now, the question arises whether the plight of the people of these areas will remain of deprived in future or can something be done to reprieve them from their deprivation or they will be paying the price of their spatial location in future also. I want to argue that if the government is really interested in addressing the sufferings of the border areas then it is taken for granted that they have to adopt non-profit approach to develop border areas and generate employment in these areas. Particularly in these areas government had to adopt socialistic approach in the real sense. As Singh (1999) gave certain policy recommendations for rural development similarly on par with those guidelines border areas can be developed as follows:

- By financing border area development
- Through Integrated border area development programmes on par with integrated rural development programmes (IRDP).
- Border development programmes that are on par with community development programmes (CDP).
- Through proper planning and implementation of border area development programmes.
- Specific border area programmes.
- In the end to increase the accountability of all the above said programmes we have to follow three dimensional structures as discussed by Singh (1999) and Estivill (2003) which comprised of:
  - Planning and Implementation
  - Monitoring
  - Evaluation

Mathews (2006:145) describes the emergence of ‘trade, hotel and restaurant’ as source of employment for all the segments, males or females and rural as well urban areas’. But sadly this trio is totally missing from border areas making them more vulnerable to unemployment. He writes that casualisation of employment can be
eradicated from the rural masses with the help of education (ibid.) and the same can be applied to border areas as the casualisation of employment is very much high in these areas. Mishra (1978:59) talk about various steps like proper planning to attain growth through social and distributive justice, implementation of schemes to relieve the weaker section from the burden culminated through usury, diversification plans to develop agriculture, small scale and village industries, dairy etc and minimum need based programmes to uplift weaker section. These above mentioned steps can be taken in the border areas to address their grievances regarding employment. Klasing (2007) put stress on primary education, vocational training and cheap credit along with promotion of self employment among the people with disabilities to overcome exclusion. Similar type of footsteps can be followed in the borderbelt as a whole because people over there are suffering even to earn their livelihood. By taking these initiatives we can improve the conditions of the border areas.

It was discussed in the fifth chapter that cheap credit should be provided to the farming community residing in the border areas because the farmers having land beyond fencing are not considered for loan by the formal institutions but if we want whole heartedly development of border communities than cheap loan should be provided on the priority basis to the border residents as a whole. Provision of cheap loan can play a vital role in the integration of the people residing near border. This provision of cheap loan should be for all those residing in border areas. Social entrepreneurship should be promoted in the border belt. Non Governmental Organisation (NGOs), Self Help Groups (SHGs), Civil Society can play an active role in promoting the livelihood pattern of the border masses. Allied activities like livestock, pig farming, poultry, bee keeping etc should be promoted in the border areas with the active involvement of the government to encourage the border residents to adopt these types of activities by providing them subsidises. Without subsidises it will not be viable for the much deprived masses to adopt these allied activities. Transportation and marketing facilities should be there to further encourage farmers to these allied activities without hesitation. Government oriented marketing place should be there in the border areas round the year to purchase the perishable goods, chiefly agricultural products. Food processing units can be a viable initiative if they get established in nearby towns. Small Scale Industries (SSI) in the vicinity of the border areas can also be initiated with the help of the government.
Importantly if above suggestions are not viable then the only way to improve the dismal employment scenario in the border belt, as observed in the fifth chapter, is through employment in the military services through reservation to pull out the people of border belt from the clutches of the dark devil of unemployment which exaggerates the problems of border residents.

Other than this existing schemes of government need proper implementation in these areas to address the unemployment problem. From the existing employment schemes Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (MGNREGA) should be properly implemented on par with other states like that of Rajasthan, Andhra Pradesh etc. As it was discussed earlier also any scheme which is there in the border areas should follow three steps that are proper implementation and monitoring and then its evaluation by looking into the target population whether it has been successful in bringing desired changes or not whether if it is continued it can prove to be beneficial further. As it was clear from the finding in the fifth chapter that people are not able to get benefit of these schemes due to lack of awareness and lack of emphatic attitude of the government officials. Accountability of the government officials should be prioritised to make these schemes successful in achieving their desired goal. As people in the border areas are lacking employment in general but scheduled caste population is much more deprived because of their landlessness.

MGNREGA is little bit successful in generating employment for the scheduled castes or deprived sections of the society but there is urgent need to enhance the working days in the existing scheme to reduce further vulnerability of the unemployed masses in the border belt. By increasing the maximum number of days of employment the problem of underemployment and seasonal unemployment can also be solved. To make it more inclusive women labour force should be encouraged to get employment under this scheme which will prove to be step further to promote gender equality. Women are missing from all the main employment activities in the border areas and work meant for women is only in those activities which are not preferred or abandoned by the men workforce for example cleaning the floor of the animals, cleaning work in the houses etc. In this way there is gendered division of labour in the border belt. So if it is made mandatory in the MGNREGA to employ certain percentage of women under the scheme it will prove to be beneficial toward achieving
inclusion on the basis of gender. If women start earning through MGNREGA then there will be more chances in the improvement of the household conditions because women did not spend anything to stimulate their body but men counterparts spent large percentage of earnings in buying tobacco, bidi (local cigarette), desi liquor, drugs, pills etc which automatically affects the household budget. In this way my argument augments towards the more inclusionary and welfare employment scheme in the border areas. To sum up the employment suggestions in the border areas it can be said that all the suggestions which are mentioned and intended to improve the employment scenario should only be able to move towards the desired end if proper government commitment is there to promote employment in the border areas because from time to time it is being stressed in the previous chapters that there is need of government initiatives because border belt areas are not the areas where profit orientation can be sorted out due to their spatial location near the international India-Pakistan border.

**Political Issues and Policy Suggestions**

Political consciousness of the individuals or the groups is the prerequisite of the inclusionary development. It can be achieved in myriad ways like political participation, political representation, political socialisation etc. It is worthy to be politically active and thrive for change in the desired direction otherwise if we did not thrive for change, then what Moore (1981) says “Democracy could not grow and flourish under the shadow of prospective plunder and pillage by marauding barons” will proved to be right. To bring change political participation is very much important. As it is clear from the findings in the fifth chapter that majority of the border area respondents are not politically aware as they fail to answer the name of the political representative of their constituency at the parliament and at the legislative assembly. There is an urgent need to increase the awareness among the people of border area about the importance of political aspect in their lives. Due to the lexical attitude of the people the representative of their area are not looked keen to address their grievances. Political participation is vital to bring sea of changes in the people of border areas. Collective consciousness regarding their suffering of being living in the border areas need revitalisation. Now the question arises how we can raise political
awareness and hence increase political participation among the masses residing in the border belt.

First step which will bring multitude of changes in the political aspect is that we can delineate border area constituencies by forming constituencies of those areas which are near the border. By doing this it will be easy for the people to send representatives those who represent only border areas. Reservation should be there for the border residents to represent these constituencies. Only those individuals can be eligible to file nomination those who belong to border areas and currently residing in the area. In this way proper political inclusiveness and representation of the border masses can be achieved. By ignoring the demarcation of separate constituencies the government is excluding further excluded. Reason behind advocating reservation in the border constituencies is only that nobody better than the residents of these areas can understand the problems existing in these areas and their remedial measures. By doing this we can achieve the face being recognised as the representative of the border areas. Majority of the political flaws can be removed by adopting this specific policy recommendation and getting it applied in the real sense.

As the role of Self Help Groups (SHGs) being advocated by Klasing (2007) towards the political activism of the disables same can be applied to the border area people. They should have to form SHGs (Self Help Groups) at the village level, inter village level, block level, tehsil level, and further at the district level and so on. These SHGs can work collectively under the federation of self help groups of border areas and bring social movement for attaining desired changes. In the democratic set up only number works and as the number of members will go on increasing under the umbrella of federation it will be taken for granted that they will bring the breeze of changes which will ultimately transform the scenario of the border areas. It is important to discuss that there is political association of the border people under the name of Border Area Sangarsh Committee (BASC) which is working exhaustively towards raising the voice of demands of the people residing in these areas at the state level and at the central level. It is learnt that this committee due to having left ideology did not able to work properly due to political hindrances being generated by the ruling political parties. Demands are there but nobody is available to raise the voice or represent the people of these areas. Political representation is the need of the time and it can only be achieved through reservation and commitment of the
individuals who represent these areas to bring change. One important thing is that there are BOP’s (Border Outposts) of the security personnel’s or of BSF in the border areas. And this BOP’s represent and have certain border area under their control. To check the autocratic role of the security forces there should be committees being formed having membership of each and every border village. To act in or against the border people should be granted after the approval of this committee in a particular area represented by it. In this way by forming these types of committees the autocratic rule and regulations of the security forces can be checked. It is a fact as described in the chapter five that even police hesitate to challenge the actions of the security forces in the borderbelt.

Educational Issues and Policy Suggestions

Education is vital for the overall development of the individuals or groups. Education contributes positively into the life in myriad of ways. It is the right of the person to get education under the Right to Education Act (RTE). Intellectuals are always in full cry to promote the importance of educating the masses. It is mere a utopia to achieve inclusion of the masses without providing education. Pattanaik and Agnihotri (2010) also laid emphasis on school education to tackle myriad problems of illiteracy, crime, drugs, domestic violence and employment in the border areas of Punjab. Dhillon and Singh (2006) also stressed on improving education system in the borderbelt. From time to time during policy recommendations it was talked about the mandatory role of the government or the public initiatives in the border belt. Reason being that it is written on the wall that no private player or institution or multinational companies are going to invest in border belt because it is against the capitalistic approach.

Talked about previously in the chapters and here again it being stressed on the demand that if any country in the world want to be prosperous than it had to provide social security to its citizens what it might cost as similar was also advocated by Gough and others (2006) that is state ownership of public services to tackle exclusion. It covers health and education facilities to all the citizens of the country. Findings in the chapter three clearly highlight the situation of education in the border belt of Punjab. It is clear in the findings that most of the scheduled caste people prefer their children to get education from the village school and from the schools in the nearby villages. Only the well to do families makes their children to get education in towns.
and cities. By looking into this it is considered very much important to look into the educational scenario of the border schools. There is no hesitation to say that the blithe attitude of the government towards the education in the border areas is responsible for the present dismal picture. Deprivation in the border areas is touching every peak and it need some permanent solution to the problems of the border masses. It was clear in the findings in the chapter three that the number of highly educated people is very marginal in the border areas which points towards the rise in the number of unskilled and semiskilled labourers in the border areas. It was also found that the schools in these areas lack basic facilities to be available in the schools. Infrastructure is not up to the level; teacher student ratio is high and unwillingness of the teachers to stay for long in these areas of Punjab due to lack of transportation and other facilities. There is no need of the dragon eye to look into the problems relating to education in the border belt of Punjab because everything is crystal clear in these deprived areas.

Inclusion initiated in other sectors should be parallely complimented by the promotion of education with whole heartedly effort in the border areas. Now, coming to the policy recommendations which should be implemented to attain the education inclusion of the border areas. Prerequisite of every school is teachers, students and essential infrastructure which should be prioritised in the promotion of education. There is need to encourage teachers to work in the border belt for some stipulated time (for example for five years) and before that there should be no transfer from these areas. With the desire to get transfer from these areas majority of the teachers did not concentrate on the teaching which results in the lack of quality education. No doubt teachers recruited in the government schools now days are very much capable of producing good result but they lack proper interest.

Most of the hardworking teachers and good quality teachers prefer to join government schools, reason being good pay scale and other benefits being associated with the job. So, teaching calibre is there but it needs to be used in a manner that the students from the government schools excel not in India but in abroad also. Attitudinal change in the teachers is must to promote quality education in these parts of Punjab. Teachers who are interested to serve in the border areas should be given extra incentives for their travelling and extra expenses which they have to bear in the border belt. In this way we can encourage the teachers not to strive for transfer from these parts of Punjab. Local eligible teachers should be prioritised for serving in these areas then chances for
the teachers to strive for transfer got lessened. Other way of getting out of this problem is that there can be separate advertisement for the post in the border areas and recruitment on this basis and make the teachers to work only in these areas. It should be given due importance that teachers in the border schools are complemented with the student strength. For instance as per the recommendations by the Punjab school education board teacher pupil ratio should be 1:40. This recommendation should be strictly followed in the border belt. If there are teachers, then to promote quality and accountability we need a special committee to be formed which will conduct surprise checking in the border schools and promote accountability of the teachers in these areas. Committee to be formed should have members from multidiscipline’s like one government representative, professor from the nearby university, local area educated person etc those who can look the school teaching from the multidimensional way and make the teachers more and more accountable. Biometric attendance or E-attendance should be promoted to increase the accountability of the teachers in these areas. Quality enhancement programmes should be initiated to make the teaching refined from time to time. Value education and practical education should be provided in spite of stressing on the theoretical aspects of the syllabus provided by the education department. Co-curricular activities should be promoted along with school education for the overall development of the children personality to address their long sufferings. On the government part it should be given due stress that teachers should not be indulged in the clerical works which also effects the teaching in the negative sense.

Largely teachers in the schools are always busy in assessing or calculating mid-day meal expenditures, arranging fuel for cooking, managing grants of the school and village as a whole. There are numerous works like the above mentioned which are to be performed by the teachers but did not came into the eyes of the authorities and in this way teachers lack proper time to concentrate on the education of the students. There should be relief of the teachers from these formal or informal clerical works which halt the achievement of educational goals of the government schools. Various teaching aids should be made available in the border belt schools to improve the quality of teaching and education as a whole. Teachers are the inevitable part of the education system and to improve the education in a particular area there is need to address all the teachers associated problems being faced by the particular border areas
of Punjab. Going further it is needed to check the enrolment of the students in the schools along with having check on the drop outs. As always it is found that getting enrolled and then dropping out is also halting the growth of education in the border areas of Punjab. Only providing mid-day meals did not help in attaining the desired set of goals in the education system. With mid-day meals we can make the children to sit in the schools but not able to bring enthusiasm to get education. There is need of establishing village level committees in the border villages to increase the awareness among the masses regarding the importance of education in making the future prospect bright of the children. Comprehensive Complete Evaluation (CCE) should be done to encourage the overall development of the children of border areas. To discourage the children from skipping school there should be proper invigilation from time to time. Good performing children in the school should be rewarded with some distinction or reward to increase the encouragement level among the students to work hard.

Coming towards the infrastructure provisions it is mandatory for the government to build a spacious school in the border areas. Government is focussing on the opening of Meritorious Schools, Navodhaya Vidhalayas etc. Then what will be the plight of the government oriented schools existing prior to these newly formed institutions. Rather of opening new schools, government should invest in the schools which are there in the villages all over the Punjab and specially in the borderbelt of Punjab. Then only it is possible to retain the belief of the people to make their children to get education from government schools. Schools are there but they need proper attention. Proper buildings as per the availability of the students should be there to accommodate the students. Classrooms with proper aids that are chalkboard, desks etc should be there to improve the quality education in these areas of Punjab. Proper architectural designed building with proper ventilation should be built to make the environment of getting education more congenial. Proper facilities for the co-curricular activities like the availability of playground should be made available in each and every school.

It is the duty of the government to arrange or make the transportation feasible for the students especially for the girls travelling from one place to another for basic education. It is seen and being learnt from the locals that children have to go long distance by walking due to total absence of transportation facilities. Special
transportation facilities should be initiated by the government for the sake of those children who have to cover long distance for getting higher education. Public transportation is a viable option for the students to travel from one area to another. There is need to initiate a public bus transport service for the students in these areas which can help them to get education from the higher education institutions from the colleges and universities situated in the nearby towns and cities. Separate toilets should be made for the girl students in the schools because with the availability of single toilet the purpose of encouraging girls to the schools is not fulfilled. Clean drinking water should be made available to the students keeping in mind the old saying that “healthy mind resides in a healthy body”. Where ever there is need schools should be upgraded further without any hesitation or without much delay. To make the secondary and higher secondary schools accessible for the children coming from the border areas there should be provision to provide bicycles etc to the children. Vocational educational training should be provided side by side for the enhancement of the skills among the border masses. Adult education classes should be conducted with the help of non governmental organisations etc in the borderbelt of Punjab. It is found that most of the adults are uneducated in the border areas. Along with that there should also be programmes initiated for the women education. It is long believe that if you get the women of the household educated then whole of the household got educated. Border areas are lacking higher educational institutions and other vocational training institutes. If it is possible and government really want to improve the plight of the border masses then higher education institutions should be set up in these areas. Education is that spark which can lit the life of thousands residing in the borderbelt of Punjab. Problems related to education need iron hand dealing in the border areas of Punjab.

While discussing educational shortcomings which needs to be eradicated from the border areas there is one most important point to be discussed which also need immediate attention of the authorities. As in previous chapters and in the starting of this chapter it was discussed that borderbelt is that which covers 16 kilometres from the zero line. Now, the various regions which are very much developed also taking the advantage of the border area reservation in the education. In fact the large chuck of the benefit is going or being taken by the residents who in the real terms are not the direct victims of the border. They did not even leave their homes during tense
situation and did not have any fear regarding the imminent danger of the border. So, as discussed earlier also that border areas need redefined or there should be categories of border areas according to the distance from the exact zero line.

There are certain miscellaneous issues which also need attention and policy recommendations. Among them drug smuggling and drug addiction are very much common to be discussed. First of all it is imperative to say that from my perception these issues are very much related to the deprivation being faced by the people of border areas in various aspects like economic, health, agriculture, education etc. Similarly a well educated person did not dare to go or adopt the path of smuggling or become addict because he knows the pros and cons of these types of activities. From here inference can be drawn that deprivation in other aspects is making the border residents to adopt for smuggling and become addicts. If it is made possible to solve all the deprivations being faced by the border area residents then there is very much probability that the rising number of smugglers and addicts can be checked in the borderbelt of Punjab. As previously also it was described that smuggling is only for economic gains and people are indulged in smuggling only to excel economically and get out of the deprivation being faced by them relatively to their counterparts (taken as reference groups) those who are residing in other areas of Punjab.

Other measures which can also be adopted to halt smuggling is that the repressive laws which are being followed by the various law enforcing agencies and various other secret agencies which are active in border areas of Punjab. This approach of repressive laws is increasing the alienation and anomic conditions in the borderbelt. Restitutive laws can prove to be more helpful in producing more positive results along with the initiatives to develop these areas economically. Nexus between the politicians, police, smugglers etc is taken for granted and inevitable part of these types of activities due to economic gains as it very much corresponds to the old saying that \textit{rupia sab da bhanvia} (means that money is brother in law of all).

\textbf{Role of Media}

Media is an important source in raising the awareness among the deprived masses and in putting the right type of issues with casual connections in front of the authorities. In the border areas as well there is need of the positive feedback from the media and enlightening the border masses. Media is considered to be the fourth pillar of the
democracy. Now it becomes more or less imperative for the media to bring forth the social issues concerning the Indian society in general and border areas in particular.

**Role of Non Governmental Organisations (NGOs), International Organisations, Civil Society**

In every field whether it is education, health etc the NGOs are playing an active role in various ways towards achieving the better and just society. In India as a whole thousands of NGOs whether national or international are working. But as found in the study it is very surprising that there is total absence of NGOs in the border areas of Punjab. As Non Government Organisations like ‘Bhaccha Bacaho Andolan’ founded by Kailash Sathyarthi are working very exhaustively to fulfil their motive of foundation. There is need of the NGOs working in the various streams for example education, health, employment etc to work in these areas as these areas need their helping hand to come out of the deprivations being faced by the residents of these areas. It was found in the works that NGOs can play an important role in the uplifting of the excluded (Klasing 2007, Maitra and Saxena 2008). In this way same can be applied to the borderbelt that if the NGOs start working to uplift the people of these areas then they can do a lot to improve the situation in these parts of Punjab. The NGOs can work to a great deal to eradicate the drug menace from these areas of Punjab and can help the youth to ameliorate these habits and transform their energy towards the constructive works. In fact NGOs can help in multivariate ways in these areas to address the sufferings of the masses.

**Role of Civil Society**

The 21st century is known to be the century of knowledge. Individuals are getting knowledge which in turn making them more aware. With awareness the zeal towards addressing the human sufferings got sparked in the individuals. Any news is click away from the humans and there are so many channels like newspapers, journals, books, social media, television etc through which you can share your views regarding national as well international issues like global terrorism, climate change, corruption, addiction, education, employment etc. The role of civil society is undeniable in trade unions, social movements etc and their thrust to bring desired changes. By raising their voice they can spark the light into the mind of masses for change and also bring in front of the various authorities the existing of worse conditions in the border areas.
Civil society can work to initiate the chain of changes which are utmost desired to bring change in the conditions of the border masses.

Other than this the formation of Self Help Groups (SHGs) and further their organisations at the block, tehsil, district, state and at the country level can help in sorting out or putting their demands into the deaf ears of the government. It was rightly to the tune of Gough & others (2006) who talked about socialist strategies to tackle exclusion stressed ‘on building collectivities amongst working class population in projects for societal provisions along with social and political organisation, extendable to different territories of different scales’. At present the number game is playing an important role towards the implementation of various schemes. If the border area residents are able to come under one umbrella and then put their demands by showing their strength in numbers then the chances of them being heard increases many folds. Reason being very much clear that if you have numbers then there is possibility that you can prove to be game changer in the elections at the central or at the state level etc. In India at present democracy is deduced to mere a number game as its actual purpose got vanished away. Various political parties are interested in making those masses happy who have good numerical strength. In border areas it can be achieved only if all the deprived masses in the border areas become members of one organisation whether it will be of the existing that is Border Area Sangharsh Committee (BASC) or whether they want to form a new committee which can easily accommodate all the masses residing in borderbelt under one umbrella. Judge (2014) also talked about the importance of movements in overcoming exclusion. It is political consciousness of the border masses which can reprieve them from the sufferings being faced by them especially in post partition period. Government need serious outlook to solve the problems of border areas otherwise consequences are clear that is ‘Defiance of authority by adopting smuggling and psychological outlet of being deprived might be signalling towards the revolutions as these were mentioned among certain words attached to revolution’ (Calvert 1970). In the end it can be concluded with the words of Guevara (2003), “the principle upon which the fight against disease should be based is the creation of a robust body; but not the creation of a robust body by the artistic work of a doctor upon a weak organism; rather, the creation of a robust body with the work of the whole collectivity upon the entire social collectivity”.

184