CHAPTER SIX

Summary of Conclusions
Summary of Conclusions

The present study was initiated on the premise that the path to development of tribal communities is strewn with innumerable tribe-specific and region-specific difficulties. The approach of developmental planning that works in one situation may not necessarily work in another, since tribal societies are closely-knit and self-contained units. Their comparative physical and cultural isolation creates in them differential capacity to respond and react to various exogenous changes in different degrees. They are also characterised by traditional values and practices, where many of their behavioral patterns seems non-rational, and are incongruent with the values, technology and behavioral pattern of modern world.

Keeping in view these assumptions, the primary objective of the present study has been to assess the impact of developmental planning on the tribal communities of Arunachal Pradesh. In Arunachal Pradesh, the tribal communities exhibit heterogeneous beliefs, dialects, customary laws and practices, and economic pursuits. As per 1991 census, there were as many as 106 tribes and sub-tribes which were almost independent of one another. Constrained by a rigorous environmental setting, the tribal population of Arunachal Pradesh has suffered physical and cultural isolation of varying degree. Their prolonged isolation appears to have narrowed down their socio-cultural, political and economic pursuits to such an extent that they seem to prefer non-interference in their affairs. Apart from the problem of physical isolation, the problem of social and economic development has its own dimension in Arunachal Pradesh. Therefore, it is pertinent to address these problems vis-à-vis developmental measures, so as to see if these measures were tailored as per the needs of tribal people or not? How far have the developmental measures influenced the traditional fabrics of these communities? To what extent have they been transformed? Who are the main beneficiaries of these developmental schemes? In what way have the tribal people in rural areas benefited? How have tribal people responded to various institutional changes and if these changes have brought in a differential level of development within and across these tribal communities?

The present study is exploratory in nature, as a result, the hypothesis has not been formulated. Instead, a few propositions have been raised to facilitate the analysis of data in order to answer those research questions, which have been raised. Therefore an attempt has been made to study the traditional socio-economic structure of entire tribal
Four tribal communities have been selected for the present study. Selection of tribal groups was done on the basis of physical terrain, ecological set-up, economic pursuits, social set-up, dialect/language, settlement pattern, dress and food habits, and religious beliefs. Based on empirical methods, primary data was generated through field investigation in seven villages. Simple random sampling method was followed in the selection of sample households. Questionnaire was prepared to elicit information on; work status, occupational structure, land use classification, income, assets, consumption pattern, and in social sphere-education level, health-care and drinking water facilities. Besides, information on various developmental measures, nature of benefits received from government departments, their opinion and views were the major questions included in the questionnaire in order to study people's response and participation. Altogether 208 households in seven villages were surveyed. Impact assessment has been done in two crucial areas; the agrarian economy and literacy status. Inspite of the best of efforts put in the present study, it suffers from various limitations. Scarce research based literature on the land and people coupled with discrepancies in government records were one of major constraints all the way. In the absence of cadastral survey record of land and forest area of the sample villages the land area under cultivation, irrigation, etc. is more of estimation instead of being precise and absolute. Selection of villages was limited by distance and approachability factor. Besides, the library problem of language, suspicions on the intention of the queries, an indifferent attitude were some of the problems encountered.

The present study has been divided into six chapters. A brief summary of the main chapters is as follows.

Chapter Two examined the developmental planning processes in four phases from its inception in 1950-51.to the end of eighth five-year plan (1992-97). The profile of planning programmes and schemes for the state as a whole have been presented in brief to have an overall picture of the changes and the processes that have evolved till date. Special reference has been made to agriculture and rural development with the understanding that rapid development in agriculture and allied sectors is likely to improve the quality of life of rural people, which in turn may help in the process of skill formation and all round development. An attempt has been to present a sectoral analysis of socio-economic overheads.
Chapter Three dealt with the economic structure of the state as a whole with special reference to four selected tribal communities based on field investigation of sample households. This chapter looked into the traditional tribal economy as well as the present work status, workforce participation, occupational structure, income and assets, consumption expenditure and the nature of benefits received by the respondents from the government agencies. An attempt has been made in this chapter to study the dynamics of changes in tribal economy from subsistence to monetized.

Chapter Four looked at various aspects of social development among tribal communities. Education as an important indicator of social development was chosen to study the impact of developmental measures on tribal society, wherein literacy rate, educational level, enrolment rate was taken into account. An attempt has been made to see if there are links between economic betterment and level of education.

Chapter Five evaluated the impact of developmental planning on tribal communities based on the attitude and response toward developmental measures and changes it has brought to their traditional lifestyle. Based on field investigation, the subjective perception of the respondents on various socio-economic and developmental issues has been analysed. A special reference has been made to Panchayati Raj institutions in order to analyze their role in tribal society vis-à-vis the customary law of the local inhabitants with an aim to assess people's participation in decision-making processes.

A cursory glance at evolution and processes of planned developmental measures showed that there was a concerted effort made by the government to better the quality of life by channelising the primitive economy to modernity and to develop skills to provide a base to launch various socio-economic overheads. Although in practice it may have been a half-hearted effort, but at least in its goal and objectives, highlighted in every scheme, it is seen that there has been an initiation to bring in dynamism in the tribal economy. At the same time, an attempt was also made to build a favorable environment to educate people for ready adoption of planned measures. Thus, in the initial plan periods, the main emphases were on the development of social and economic infrastructure. As a result of this, the age-old isolation was broken, interior places were explored, roads got built, new institutions came up, new stream of people (administrators, government officials, construction workers etc.) started pouring in, and the tribal world got exposed to new exogenous forces.
The major findings of the present study are as follows:

1. Tribal economy of Arunachal Pradesh has witnessed a vast change from 'primitive' subsistence nature to monetized and diverse economy. Over the years the occupational structure of the tribal people has changed to a considerable extent and there is a shift toward non-farm activity. The level of productivity and cropping intensity has increased. Many jhum farmers have adopted settled farming and modern inputs for higher level of productivity. Quite a few non-agricultural enterprises have grown in recent years, giving employment and good dividends, although marginal. There has been considerable increase in income and wealth but at the same time the gap between rich and poor has widened in egalitarian tribal society.

2. The work participation rate of tribal population displays a considerable change. There has been a considerable decline in the percentage share of main workers from 57.65 percent to 45.22 percent in two decades time. The fall in S.T main workers was slightly higher than the non-S.T. population from 57.01 percent to 44.93 percent for the same time period. Acute fall was registered among the female main workers from 41.15 percent to 36.34 percent as against their male counterpart, which registered a rise from 59.85 percent to 63.66 percent. There is inter-tribal, inter-village and gender differentiation in the occupational composition among the selected tribal communities. About 85 percent of the total female workers for the entire tribal group were engaged in farm activity as against 70.0 percent of the male workers. In Siro village 90.0 percent of the female workers enumerated themselves as cultivators as against 72.0 percent in Manmow village and only 5.8 percent in Sanchu village, although it had a high percent of 73.53 main workers as agricultural laborer. It was 59.1 percent for male Sulungs. A higher percentage of workers in farm sector was recorded in the Apatani villages where above 80.0 percent were male workers and 85.0 percent female workers. And even within the Apatani villages the differences in the percentage share of workers was evident, where Reru-II recorded 14.29 percent of worker as agricultural labour which also had four landless households, while it was just 2.5 percent in Siro village. Lowest percentage of farm male workers was recorded amongst the Adis with 69.0 percent and highest percentage of (30.1) workers in non-farm sector. Most of those who were in the services were either schoolteachers or clerks or mechanics in government and private enterprises. Among the Sulungs they were either anganwadi workers or slaves doing the household chores for the masters.
3. The agrarian subsistence and indigenous economy of tribal Arunachal has moved toward surplus productive system. The net sown area under permanent cultivation has risen to 55.92 percent with the fall in shifting cultivation to 44.08 percent. More land has been brought under permanent cultivation, although only 25.08 percent of N.S.A. is irrigated. Although more area has been brought under HYV seeds, chemical fertilizers and other agricultural inputs, only an insignificant size of farming population is using it. The field study shows that the traditional jhum cultivators like the Adis are increasingly adopting settled farming which is more productive and gives them opportunity to engage themselves in other economic activity. The traditional wet rice cultivators like the Khamptis and the Apatanis while still active in farm activity have simultaneously diversified their economic activity to allied occupations like, horticulture, poultry, livestock, fisheries, etc. In case of the Khamptis the shift has been toward non-farm activities like services, trade and business etc.

4. Rice was the staple crop of the people, which occupied 76.0 percent of total crop cropped area in the sample villages. There has been considerable rise in area as well as production of fruits, vegetables and oilseeds. The sample survey villages amply showed the growing awareness of the rural people toward surplus generating economic practices. The daily market items also comprised of jhum crops like, local variety vegetables, spices, tuber crops, and rice etc. As a result of growing realization of landed property, the tendency to acquire private land has increased, because of which the unequal distribution of landholding among the tribal groups was evident, and was more pronounced among the Khamptis.

5. Industrial development was still in its embryonic stage. Although, most of the ladies in sample households wove their traditional apparel and men practice cane and bamboo work, it was still produced at household level. Only a small percentage (2.0) of main workers registered themselves as engaged in household industries. Inspite of various changes and introduction of monetary system there was still a low level of technical development and lack of economic specialization.

6. In the service sector, limited post and vacancies in government department has not been able to accommodate the educated unemployed and underemployed youth. Most of the persons working in manufacturing, retail trade, and community and personal services
belong to the non-S.T. population which have a high percentage of its workers as casually hired. The local youths were yet to build themselves to various enterprising works.

7. As a result of low productivity in farm sector and limited scope in service sector a considerable number of households were still below poverty line, specially those households that consisted of landless agricultural labourer, those having marginal and small size landholding, and practice household industries. Households that were engaged in trade and business, contract and supply work, and large landholding farmers belonged to high per capita income group, while those in services and medium landholding farmers belonged to middle class range. However there were exceptions for instance in the Adi villages of Jirdin and Pobdi-I the landless households were the nuclear household units employed in government services. The Apatanis were more egalitarian in terms of the possession of landholdings, income and assets, where as the Khamptis and the Adis presented a considerable disparity in all these aspects. In spite of the variation in household per capita income many households in sample villages possessed assets worth Rs. 10,000 to 25,000 per family on an average, which were mostly purchased items. The inherited items consist of traditional jewellery, ornaments and brassware made of beads, bronze, silver, gold etc., while the purchased items ranged from wrist-watch, bicycle, transistor, to T.V., refrigerator, rice-hueller, scooter/ motor-cycle, car, jeep, truck etc. Rich business class owned most of the luxury items. The distribution of household assets in the Manmow and C. Grazing were glaring. Increase in income levels had also led to higher expenditures on education and other consumer items, although a considerable portion of their income was still spent on food items followed by social and community feasts and ceremonies. But this trend was lesser among those who had higher education levels. For instance, the Khamptis spent a considerable amount of their income on education, clothing and other luxurious items.

8. The Adis showed keen interest in using tractor and power tillers in their field although handicapped by the physical terrain and the resource to hire tractors in their field. A considerable number of farmers hired power tiller to plough their land, though the number of households using oxen had increased. In Pobdi-I village one household reported of having received a pair of oxen with 50 percent subsidy under IRDP programme. Some households kept Nepali, Bodo and Assamese share-croppers. Most of the villagers in the sample village showed their aversion for using HYV seeds and
fertilizers. However, a considerable percentage of the beneficiaries availed insecticides and pesticides, which were used to check against pest and insects-a very common phenomenon in Arunachal Pradesh due to its humid climatic condition. However, there were farmers among the Adis and the Khamptis who also use HYV seeds and chemical fertilizers in their field for horticultural crop.

9. The maximum number of benefits availed by the beneficiaries from governmental departments were insecticides and pesticides, free ration, subsidies, wage employment, fish-cum-paddy and building material, however, they vary from one region to another. For instance, more than sixty percent of assistance as received in Jirdin and Pobdi-I village were of insecticides and pesticides, subsidies/bank loan and free rations. While a higher percentage of the Khamptis also availed insecticides and pesticides, bank loan and free rations. Amongst the Apatanis the maximum assistance received were on paddy-cum-fish cultivation, free ration by all the thirty households, and wage employment. In case of Sulungs, they received only three items, free ration to all the thirty household, building material to all the 18 residential houses and wage employment to six households under EAS programme.

10. Although governmental provision had been made for the farmers to adopt settled cultivation from shifting and various other provisions for surplus production, there seemed to be little that was done to address peoples requirement. People were not responsive to HYV seeds because it was not in accordance to their taste, similarly chemical fertilizers were considered unsuitable for the fact that it hardened the soil, and made the soil infertile after sometime. While the villagers responded very well to the irrigation schemes and also plant protection programme, they were not averse to fish cultivation, horticultural crop, plantation and animal husbandry. But the nature of assistance as taken by the beneficiary whether large or small or semi-medium farmers, did not reflect much aid to the people in augmenting their productivity level.

11. The Rural Development Program such as IRDP, DWCRA, TRYSEM, JRY, EAS, MWS, IAY, etc. implemented in one or the other villages were mainly profited by the well-off section of society, who belonged to the middle class. The daily wage-employment programmes went to those who were landless, marginal and small farmers. These short-term programmes could not benefit the poor in any appreciable way since these programmes were not designed to benefit its recipient for self-sustaining employment. Even the government assistance through subsidies, bank loan etc. was meant for those who had
assets and means to support themselves. The BPL scheme of one year free ration were
given to those who were not deserving, at the same time those who were deserving
voluntarily did not make use of the scheme because of the fear of social stigma of being
recognized as nyima. Moreover, the distributing agent misappropriated distribution of free
ration items

12. The economic transformation of the pre-literate tribal society of Arunachal Pradesh
has witnessed a considerable growth in education level in a few decades time. The
general awareness among the tribal population has also gone up. As a result of the Social
and Community planning programmes, schools were established, health clinics were run
by government and non-governmental organization, drinking water, road and
transportation facilities etc. came up in the rural areas of Arunachal Pradesh.

13. Although the literacy rate in Arunachal is still one of the lowest in the country, it
went up from 7.2 percent (1961) to 41.6 percent in 1991. However, a high growth rate
was registered especially among the tribal segment of population in the state for both
male and female. The level of education also registered a considerable rise in the state.
Although overall growth has been appreciable, the achievement is far from satisfactory
when compared to other states of north-east region.
The level of education was still very low, with a high percentage of dropout rate and low
net enrolment rate, especially at the higher level. Nevertheless, the general awareness of
the benefits of education was reasonably good in the rural areas. In the sample villages
with exception to Sanchu village, the level of education among the total literate was
higher than the state average, which was probably because of the influence of urban life
and its closer proximity. Almost all the survey villages had primary to middle level
school within the reach of village locality. The gross enrolment of students at primary
level was much higher than the middle level. The girls also had a slightly higher gross
enrolment rate, but the net enrolment rate was much lower than the boys. The gross
enrolment rate at the middle level was less than 60 percent among all the sample villages
for both the genders with exception to Siro village. The low level of net enrolment rate
could be due to late admission of children and high retention rate at various levels.

14. The overall health and sanitation of the tribal people in Arunachal Pradesh could be
termed as below average. Although, there was more awareness among the people, where
some section of society responded to the modern health care system, the people in the interior places like the Sulungs still showed their preferences to local remedies. Nevertheless, wherever the medical facility was available, people responded by availing themselves of all the possible help. Many respondents preferred the modern medicine, as it was less expensive than the traditional remedy, where they had to sacrifice fowls, brew home-made liquor, pay fee to the priest/medicineman/shaman, and observe taboos, which restrict their movement and work. Some of the tribal groups like Adi, Apatani and Khampti showed their preference for the modern healing system under the influence of education and also because of economic compulsions. But, whenever there was a major ailment, which could not be cured through medical treatment, they took the help of local treatment, which was in fact still popular among the older generations. Because of available means of medical facilities the death rate has come down considerably for the infants, the pregnant women and the old age persons. Although, over the years health care services have been extended to the people even in interior places through wide network of health and medical institutional facilities, the health centres were still ill equipped, malfunctioned and under-staffed. Even the mobile services did not visit the interior places regularly.

15. The eighty- percent coverage of villages with drinking water facilities was only a huge figure without due regards to the quality aspects. The quality of water was very poor in Arunachal since it was directly tapped from rivers without any filtration, which was the main carrier of various diseases. The local people lacked awareness about maintenance of personal hygiene. Although construction of low cost latrine, garbage clearance etc. was introduced it was confined only to few selected towns and villages. Moreover, the construction of low cost latrine could not make any appreciable dent on the sanitation environment, as the people at large did not accept the programme. The sanitation condition in the Khampti villages was much better than the other tribal group, almost all the rich and poor houses had a good awareness of health and hygiene. The Sulungs and Apatanis on the other hand had a pathetic sanitation condition, which was also because of their house structure, which was compact and congested. The tribal people at large have to be educated in various aspects of health and sanitation, and a balanced diet for a healthier and higher level of living has to be introduced.

16. Thus, it is evident that, over a period of two decades more people withdrew from farm sector, which could be due to increase in income and relatively high level of productivity. The per capita income of people in general increased as a result of
economic diversification. The shift was towards non-farm sector with a greater accent on service sector. Simultaneously, growth in education level made it possible for educated youth to opt for salaried job in service sector. The need is to build secondary sector, which would provide self-generating employment activity to the rural masses. However, this is still at an embryonic stage. In order to provide a support base for the rural masses to absorb the growing population in the absence of further expansion in the farm sector, all those possible areas where the scope of developing cottage industry at household level, small industry at village level and medium industry at district level is feasible, have to be identified.

17. As per the response of people, the changes that took place in their social milieu showed both the positive and negative aspects. About twenty percent of individual felt that the community and social ethos of village life had been eroded to some extent as a result of income disparity and political influence that had led to lesser social interaction and brought in more individualist outlook among those who were well-off and influential. Such perception was more predominant amongst the Adis and the Apatanis despite the fact that their community bond was still strong especially among the Apatanis. Many villagers also viewed the positive aspect of change in terms of more economic opportunity and more awareness as a result of higher literacy rate. Some felt that infrastructural changes in the village, brought in schools, roads, drinking water, health care facilities, consumer goods in the nearest urban or semi urban places, transportation through bus services and political awareness. Such view and opinion were mostly expressed by those who were economically sound and in government jobs, and they also welcomed the change that was taking place in the village. However, they also admitted that as a result of party affiliation to different political body the village community life had been affected to a great extent, which led to groupism and individualism. The middle class literate groups in all the villages expressed such views with exception to Sanchu village where the ascent of development and change was little. Sixty percent of the Sulung respondents did not see any change in their present condition, as it was twenty years before when they were resettled in Sanchu in 1975. Another twenty percent respondents were not sure if any change had taken place in either their village life or in their community. In fact they were confused to admit or not to admit since nothing had changed in their economic and social condition, although to some extent they could see the changes taking place in their surrounding.
18. From the pattern of response it can be deduced that although definite change and some development had taken place in these tribal villages and in their lifestyle it had not been uniform. Those who could gain from developmental benefits they welcomed the change and showed the positive side of it, while those who were left behind and were deprived of aid meant for them were passive in their outlook. For instance the villagers in Manmow and Chowkham-Grazing and in Siro village complained of the site of drinking water tap, irrigation canal which were installed and connected to those place who could influence the government officials to their favor. Irrespective of some adverse impact on some section of the community, the majority of the villagers (50.0 percent) welcomed the change and development that was taking place in their village life. Those who could not benefit were not very happy with the change and they feared the erosion of traditional customs and social values. About thirty-four percent of the respondents appeared to be confused for they were not sure of what was good and what was bad, since they did show the good in economic front, but also feared that emerging trend of elite class and groupism would erode their cultural ethos. They were not sure to say if they welcome the change or not. This section of respondents mostly belonged to the older generation, and those who could derive sufficient or any benefit from the ongoing change and development. However, those who belonged to the younger generation did not think that it had made any adverse impact on their social and cultural tradition. Moreover they agreed that even if some adverse impact had taken place in some areas of their culture and social life it was inevitable since good income and education was necessary for a better living. At the same time they also felt that it was because of politicization of community matter that the hold of traditional customary law and body was losing its significance.

19. The growing realization among all the tribal communities of the significance of education and higher living standards in themselves was a positive impact of development and change on the people. Although limited by various physical, economic and social constraints, their response to change and development was remarkable. However there was inter-tribal and intra-tribal differentiation, most of which was determined by locational factors. Moreover, the institutional set-up can also be held responsible to some extent since, those who already had some infrastructural base could gain profit from development measures using all possible means at their disposal, while those who had little and at marginal level failed to gain. Short-term wage employment
programmes like JRY, EAS, MWS, GKY, etc. meant for those below poverty line failed to create a base for the poor to bring them at a level of self-employment generation. Instead, these aids went to those who already had some means or other to support themselves.

20. The scope of developing allied sector in Arunachal Pradesh is immense as is evident from the field survey, where tribal communities like the Apatanis displayed a judicious use of cultivable land and irrigation sources, and responded to the changes taking place in their surroundings. They showed remarkable response to economic and social change by adopting all possible means to earn cash through intensive farm and allied activity as well as in non-farm sector as analysed in Siro and Reru-II village. The literacy rate and level of education among the Apatanis was also encouraging.

The Khamptis on the other hand with a background of comparative better economic and cultural attainment showed a higher standard of living. Though the inter-village differentiation was insignificant, intra-village differentiation was very pronounced along the income group. The well-off section of the Khampti community who belonged to large land holding and business classes had very high living standard, and also a higher education level. Those who belonged to middle income group mostly profited from various welfare measures.

The Sulungs were still the least developed among the selected group, due to inherent factors around which they were surrounded. Being nomadic in character they have least profited from the social and economic developmental plan measures. Being socially and economically attached to overlords the freedom to take their decision for their welfare and development was checked to a great extent.

21. Thus it can be concluded that as a whole the people were for change to come through various developmental activities. Although the impact of developmental processes was not the same, and showed variation across the tribal communities and even within the tribal group, the response from the people showed that they wanted overall development of individual as well as the entire village community.

The economic activity of the people was certainly heading toward diverse practice of farm and non-farm activities. The tradition shifting cultivators like the Adis were increasingly going for settled permanent cultivation. In the farm and its allied sector; horticulture, livestock, pisciculture, plantation were being practised by some households for cash money, although its percentage was relatively less. Those who practised permanent
cultivation responded to the system of irrigation, use of plough with cattle and power tiller and tractor, and plant protection scheme of insecticides and pesticides. The traditional wet rice cultivators like the Apatani and the Khampti, along with the Adi community were shifting toward trade and business, wage employment and government services as a result of increase in population, land fragmentation and increasing need of case money to meet various necessities. Although, there was hardly any change in the economic condition of the Sulungs, the shift was toward manual wage labour from hunting and food gathering.

Education was another area where a considerable change had taken place among all the tribes though the degree and intensity varied from one tribe to another. The response of people toward education was appreciable. Most of the households reported of higher expenditure on education. They were also desirous of higher education for their children to gain knowledge and a government job for better living.

The political influence could be seen in the disbursement of the developmental benefits to those who could garner the benefit for themselves. As a result of income disparity and party affiliation, which brought in economic and social rift, the social interaction among the village community has lessened, and instead groupism and individualism is emerging. The role of Panchayati body was also strewn with money and muscle power. Although, the traditional bodies still existed and exerted their influence in various decision making, their influence was diminishing and was more or less confined to social and cultural activity as among the Khamptis and to some extent among the Adis.

Due to various developmental activities and infrastructural changes taking place in the tribal world, the awareness and response among people greatly increased, especially among those who were in locationally advantaged places. However, those in the interior places were deprived of those benefits because of either non implementation of the developmental measures or because of the socio-economic set up of the traditional society, as seen among the Sulungs, where the impact of developmental planning was minimal.

There is no doubt that change and development has come in the lives of tribal people and developmental departments have disbursed welfare measures to the people by targeting those below poverty line. Assistance was given to the farmers in order to augment their productivity and surplus production for higher returns. Nevertheless, the impact of developmental measures has not benefited those who deserved it the most. The implementation of schemes and response of the tribal people have not been uniform.