CHAPTER - SIX

COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES AND SITUATIONS IN THE TWO PERIODS

The present chapter is intended for a discussion on the different strategies and achievements of the periods between 1942 - 1951 and after i.e., between Prof. Haimendorf's experiment of the erstwhile Hyderabad State and planning era of post independence period in the light of the details given in Chapters IV and V.
The former was actually initiated under circumstances similar to the starting of the Girijan Development Agency of Srikakulam district, (started during the IV Plan period) after a minor uprising by the tribals of Adilabad in 1940. However, the situation in which these two programmes were started vastly differs. The Gond Education scheme and other economic development programmes were started at Zero Point of development i.e., in a pre-literate and pre-development society that too when systematic or planned development was un-heard of. On the other hand for the planning started after 1950's, the post war experimental and reconstruction programmes like 'Grow More Food Campaign, Firka Development Programme etc.', as discussed in the beginning of Chapter V provided the base to start with.

The Adilabad experiment of Prof. Haimendorf was introduced at a time when the whole society was riddled with feudalism and bureaucratic administration to whom spending money for amelioration of the sufferings of the weaker sections was unpalatable and welfare approach unknown as fatalistic philosophy or 'Karma Siddhanta' was reigning supreme in the minds of both rulers and the ruled. However, the higher echelons of administration where policy decisions were taken were
mostly occupied by eminent and enlightened British administrators like Grigson, who also had a grounding in anthropology like many of the British administrators of the time. They not only encouraged ethnographers and anthropologists to undertake studies on various caste groups and tribes of the region or state in which they were working, but also endeavored to impress upon the local Rajahs or Nawabs the need for introducing certain benevolent measures for alleviating the suffering of the down trodden, especially when they became restive. Grigson, the then Member Board of Revenue in Nizam's time was instrumental in encouraging Prof. Haimendorf to undertake studies on some of the primitive tribes like Chenchus, Konda Reddies and Raj Gonds besides entrusting him with the responsibility of evolving and implementing welfare programmes for these and similar groups in view of his anthropological expertise and knowledge gained about the living conditions of these groups.

In contrast the post independence approach was initiated by democratically elected Government committed to wipe out social and economic inequalities through the instrumentality of planning i.e., community development. It is a Government committed for the welfare and upliftment of the weaker sections that has initiated tribal development by providing additive funds. Tribal development policy
does not owe its evolution to the benevolent attitude of a few enlightened officers at higher rungs of administration or the charitable disposition of individual rulers but to the commitment of a whole system fully supported by sufficient and far-reaching constitutional guarantees.

The Indian constitution lays down specifically that the state should promote with special interest the educational and economic interests of the Scheduled Tribes (Article 46) besides guaranteeing many educational, political and economic concessions and reservation of seats in educational institutions, Government services, democratic policy making elective bodies starting from the highest Lok Sabha to the lowest village Panchayat etc. Article 275 provides for allocating special funds for the development of Scheduled Tribes and it has been under this article that Ministry of Home Affairs gave additive funds to the tune of 15 lakhs to Multipurpose projects in II Five Year Plan, 12 lakhs to Stage I T.D. Blocks during III Five Year Plan, Special Central Assistance of Rs.200 crores to various State sub-plans in the country of which 7 crores were allocated for Sub-Plan in Andhra Pradesh during V Plan period.

Such concessions, privileges and financial guarantees were not provided till the attention of the rulers was drawn to the need for protection by
anthropologists. Even the Tribal Areas Regulation 1949, though mooted originally as Dastur-ul-Aaal before the integration of H.E.H. Nizam's Dominions in the Indian Union, could only be enacted after the accession which happened in 1948.

The Tribal Areas Regulation 1949, which, though drew inspiration from the existing protective regulations like Madras Interest and Land Transfer Regulation, 1917, Scheduled Districts Act, 1874 and Excluded and partially Excluded Areas of 1935 Act enacted during the British regime and in force in the then Madras Presidency, however differed in many respects from those regulations.

The Hyderabad Tribal Areas Regulation provided for constitution of Panchayats composed of nominated traditional tribal elders for deciding cases of small social disputes and petty economic offences pertaining to land, Forest etc., arising in between tribal families and groups that may arise in course of their livelihood activities. The Panchayat used to meet on every full moon day and the Panchayat Constituted for a group of tribal villages used to dispense justice under the guidance of an Officer from Social Services Department. Further, the Regulation removed certain degrees of criminal suits from the purview of normal courts, whenever a tribal was involved as a party. In case of civil suits appeal was
from Panchayat to Asst. Agent (District Social Services Officer), Asst. Agent to Agent and from Agent (District Collector) to Minister. Even revenue cases in which tribal was involved as a party were also decided by village Panchayats, Asst. Agents, Agents, the final authority being Member, Board of Revenue.

In contrast, none of the Acts and Regulations either of the former British regime or existing Scheduled Areas Land Transfer Regulation, Money Lender Regulation etc., are having such tribal oriented provision. But one major lacuna of the Hyderabad Tribal Areas Regulation was that nowhere it contained any specific provision prohibiting transfer of land from tribal to non-tribal in notified villages whereas the Land Transfer Regulation as amended in 1970 imposes absolute prohibition on transfer of land not only from tribal to non-tribal but also from non-tribal to non-tribal except by devolution through succession or partition. However, Laoni Khas rules specifically mention that lands assigned under Laoni Khas were inalienable. Even the spirit of the whole of Hyderabad Tribal Areas Regulation, 1949 was to safeguard the interests of tribals in land and forests including land grabbing by non-tribals. Realising this spirit, the social services department officers used to save tribal from land alienation and restore all alienated lands to
tribals whenever disputes arising out of land alienation came to their official courts. With the enactment of the Hyderabad Tribal Areas Regulation, 1949, the Officers of the Social Services Department were empowered to implement the provisions of the Regulation.

Special official machinery was not fabricated to implement the provisions of the protective Regulations enacted since the British time upto 1970 amendment to the Land Transfer and Money Lenders Regulations and the enactment of debt Relief Regulation. It was only in 1970's that special machinery was fabricated to implement the provisions of the various protective Regulations.

Further, after the formation of Andhra Pradesh, the protective Regulations in operation in the Scheduled areas of Andhra region were extended to the Scheduled areas in Telangana region also repealing the existing Hyderabad Tribal Areas Regulation in 1963. Consequently the Officers of the Social Services Department were automatically stripped of the former powers of the Asst. Agent in which capacity they were clothed with judicial and executive powers to implement the provisions of the Hyderabad Tribal Areas Regulation as the extended Regulations were implemented by the normal Revenue Department Officials as part of their other official duties. It was only in 1970's that Special Deputy Collectors (Tribal Welfare), Tahasildars and Deputy Tahasildars have been
exclusively posted for implementing the provisions of protective regulation in Adilabad, Srikakulam, Khammam, and Warangal district tribal areas. This arrangement resulted in vesting different functionaries with protective and productive duties resulting in lack of coordination between protective and productive programmes. The former Hyderabad Regulation in contrast provided for integration of productive and protective functions in one official at appropriate level i.e., Social Services Officer.

None of the Regulations of the British regime or the post independence period removed the cases arising out of the process of implementing protective regulation from the jurisdiction of normal courts. The cases decided by the Revenue Officials could be challenged in any court of law unlike the Hyderabad tribal areas regulation which removed from the purview of normal courts. Consequently, the implementing authorities could not proceed with the cases booked under Land Transfer Regulation, Money Lender Regulation as most of the decisions given in favour of tribals have been challenged in courts of law which sanctioned stay on executive action such as restoring of alienated tribal land to the original owner or scaling down of debt etc. Even the provision of some of these Acts were challenged in court which struck down some of
the clauses of important Regulations like land Transfer Regulation such as the rule of presumption which threw the burden of proof on the non-tribal to prove that the property he owns is legally acquired.

Consequently, as long as the Hyderabad Tribal Areas Regulation was in force, tribal land alienation could be kept at its barest minimum because of constant preventive action and immediate restoration of alienated land by social service officers. On the other hand the repealing of the Hyderabad Tribal Areas Regulation in 1963 by the Andhra Pradesh land Transfer Regulation, 1959 resulted in vast chunks of tribal lands, both in Asifabad and Utnoor high lands, passing into the lands of non-tribals as the repealing Regulation stripped off the Social Service Officer of his protective functions and assigned them to normal revenue Department functionaries who were always too busy with their other departmental revenue work to look after the interests of tribal in land. It was only after the appointment of Special Deputy Collectors (Tribal Welfare) that cases of land alienation could be detected and land restored to tribals.

The magnitude of the alienation and restoration to be done could be understood from the report of the Special Deputy Collector on land alienation situation in the Scheduled Areas of Integrated Tribal Development Agency, Adilabad district. According to the report 237
cases of alienation were identified up to the beginning of April, 1977 involving an area of 2133.01 acres. By the end of September 1977 the problem to be tackled increased to 399 cases involving 2838.22 acres thus showing sizable increase in the fresh cases identified (162) and the consequent increase in acreage (705.21) detected as alienated within a six months period.

In the former Hyderabad experiment, from the beginning it was recognised that it is imperative to have a team of social services officers who are well versed in human behaviour, culture, social structure and human implications of technological change so that the programmes of development are implemented smoothly by taking advantage of the carrier factors while avoiding the barrier factors of culture. Consequently, Prof. Haimendorf, who was already Advisor to His Highness the Nizam's Government on Tribes and Backward Classes had started a department of Anthropology and Sociology with himself as professor and many of the Officers of Social Services Department were products of this department. Consequently, many of the Officers were equipped with the necessary human engineering skills and knowledge to work amidst tribals and push through programmes of development without any friction.

The concept of human engineer as an expert in human development has been completely ignored in the
programme implementation process of the planning era. The revenue official and subject matter specialist constitute the cream of the development administration with the 'Mr Know All' I.A.S. Officer playing a key role in policy making, programme evolving and executive action. Consequently, the programme implementation process was devoid of human character and almost became a mechanical process of target fixing and target achieving and pushing through with the programmes unmindful of the utility or acceptance or rejection by the group. This is specially true in the context of tribal development.

This matter of fact and statistics conscious approach defeated the very cardinal principles laid in I Five Year Plan and oft repeated in subsequent plan documents that results should be judged not by the statistics reported but by the quality of human life evolved and that development should be on the lines of tribal genius. Even Elwin Committee and Dhebar Commission had stressed the need for giving tribal bias to the programmes. To achieve this end, human engineering with anthropologists at key positions of evolving and implementing plan programmes has to be given its due place.

What Elwin repeatedly pleaded for in his report on Multipurpose projects (for giving tribal bias to the programme) had already been successfully experimented.
in the Gond Education Scheme implemented in Adilabad district. The Marlavai training Centre which was the hub of Gond Education Scheme first introduced an adult Gond or Kolam or other tribal to the 3 Rs of education upto a particular level such as 3rd, 5th, 7th in terms of proficiency in Gondi or other regional languages and then prepared them through training to become a forest guard, village officer, clerk in coop. society, school teacher, etc. The programme also included practical training in improved agricultural practices, health and sanitation, forestry etc., so that the trainees could become functional leaders of these villages and disseminate knowledge of the improved practices among other tribal villagers. A teacher trained in Marlavai centre was asked to usually open a new school in one of the centrally situated villages. The process thus involved not only contributed for improving the quality of the tribal but also provided ample opportunity to utilise the skills so acquired in the service of his people.

Another important step taken was to introduce the regional tribal dialect, Gondi, understood and spoken by all tribal groups and even by many non-tribals living amidst them, as medium of instruction at primary level. As Gondi has no script, Devanagari was adopted with minor changes to suit the pronunciation of this
Dravidian dialect. Even Primers were prepared in Gondi with Devanagari script and many features of present day functional education were incorporated in the subject matter of these primers. Stories from Gond mythology were incorporated in the primers. Familiar objects of tribal material culture and natural phenomena, such as hill streams, sun, moon etc. formed contents of the lessons; so that the tribal readily grasped the meaning of the words because of his familiarity with the objects described in the lessons. Moreover, the inclusion of Gond mythology in the lessons inculcated the necessary interest in the lesson as it pertained to their past glory and exploits of their cultural heroes, the knowledge of which in turn gave them sentimental satisfaction as it reveals their rich cultural heritage about which they can feel proud of. This again gave rise to a sense of self respect.

Regional and sub-regional variations in language and culture were also taken into consideration while evolving programmes of development. Marathi was the medium of instruction at Marlavai Centre whereas Telugu was the medium of instruction at Ginnedhari Training Centre. Even though both the centres are located in Gond country, the sub-regional variations in language necessitated having different medium of instruction at the two centres.
Depending upon the nature of local problems to be tackled and livelihood patterns of the tribal group to be benefitted the general frame of schemes was given the local bias. As was already discussed in Chapter V assignment of land, establishment of training centres and organisation of cooperatives constituted the basic frame of the development programmes. But special emphasis was laid on a particular sector or specific schemes in a sector in tune with the local needs. For example, the development programmes in Adilabad district tribal areas veered round Gond Education programme with land assignment constituting the necessary infrastructure as it suited the sedentary Gond cultivators. But, for the hill and forest dwelling Koya and Konda Reddis of Khammam district, who were mostly exploited as forest labourers by private contractors from outside, the programme of development centered round a cooperative institution called Godavari Valley Co-Operative Rural Development Society with Koida as the hub of all activities. This was registered under cooperative Regulations in 1947. It had all the activities of the present day Girijan Cooperative Corporation such as selling daily requirements to tribals at fair prices and purchasing agricultural and hill produce from tribals at reasonable prices, the most important activity being taking contracts from Government for undertaking forest coupe operations for the benefit
of tribal members of the society so that the exploitative contractor is altogether eliminated.

To provide improved economic base by diffusing innovations, a rural upliftment programme was implemented with Koida as the Centre. Technical personnel imparted instruction in improved agricultural practices, rearing of livestock besides providing modern medical and health facilities and opening of schools for the benefit of tribals.

Again the Chenchu development programme forming part of the Amarabad Rural Welfare Scheme with Mannanur as the Centre had its own distinct personality. For introducing the food gathering and forest dwelling Chenchu, most of whom even to this day cannot adopt themselves to settled agriculture, an agriculture farm was started and Mannanur was converted into a model village with facilities necessary for agriculturists. Further, demonstration plots were established under the supervision of a Fieldman.

Animal Husbandry programmes were given special emphasis as it suited their shifting family life. Further, the Banjaras living in their midst also provided the stereotype of successful cattle breeders to the Chenchus. Taking all these carrier factors into consideration distribution of milch cattle and upgrading of local
livestock through breeding, improved livestock management etc., were initiated.

A Chenchu reserve was created as far back as 1942 by notifying 75,000 acres in Amarsabad Plateau to save them from outside exploitation. This Chenchu Reserve comprises of an upper plateau and a lower plateau and the Chenchus living in the two plateaux are at different levels of development i.e., food gatherers of the upper plateau and settled cultivators of the lower plateau. Consequently, this sub regional variation in levels of development was recognised and distinct agricultural programmes were evolved to suit the changing local situation. For the sedentary cultivator Chenchus of the lower plateau, the programme aimed at improving their methods of cultivation and better cattle breeding. The food gathering Chenchu of upper plateau were prepared to take up settled cultivation by teaching them the art of cultivation starting with small garden plots besides introducing improved management of cattle they already possessed.

Cooperative sector was also introduced both for commercialisation of minor forest produce procured by Chenchus and for introducing them to collective farming. A collective agricultural farm which started with 14
Chenchu families and 100 acres of 'Porampoke' land in 1945 was expanded further to 24 Chenchu families and 250 acres of land in the subsequent year. Similar to the Chenchu, a collective Stock Breeding Farm was also organised for the benefit of traditional cattle rearing Lambadas.

It is thus clear that regional, sub-regional, and inter-tribal variations in levels of development and livelihood patterns have been clearly reflected in the programme formulation of the Rural Rehabilitation programmes of the erstwhile Hyderabad whereas these have been altogether lost sight of in the formulation of plans of the present day. It was only with the beginning of V Five Year Plan, that two in planning for tribal areas that regional and ethnic variations have been taken into account and the programmes are given regional and ethnic orientation as the undulations in development have come too glaring to ignore attention.

In monetary allocations the Gond Education Scheme cannot be compared to schemes of planning era. From 0.45 lakhs of initial investment in 1943 (1353F) the allocation increased three fold to 1.34 lakhs by 1949 (1359F). A total of Rs.6.07 lakhs was allocated over a period of seven years on Gond Education Scheme. But the
amount allocated for Utnoor Multipurpose Project alone for five years was as high as 27.00 lakhs i.e., 4½ times that of the allocation for 7 years on Gond Education Scheme. Upto the end of IV Five Year Plan period i.e., 15 years from the beginning of II Five Year Plan, nearly Rs.80.00 lakhs were allocated both under plan, non-plan special 3% Zilla Parishad fund etc.

Another major difference is that no theories of economics, statistical models or concepts of planning imported or developed in India were used while evolving strategies of schemes for the benefit of tribals and other sections in the former times. Every thing was based on the situation in the field. Both problem identification and scheme formulation were practically done as continuation of the process of studying field situation, evolving a general frame of development, discussing it with proper authorities at higher echelons and finally securing the 'Firman' or order of the Nizam for implementing the scheme.

Contrary to this process, the present day plans are formulated on the basis of the concepts of social and economic change, statistical models developed and principles of economic growth enunciated in academic circles located either within the country or outside.
Some times concepts and models experimented outside tribal areas or even outside the country itself have been imported into and used in the plan formulation of tribal areas. The concepts of community project or its carbon copy the multipurpose project in tribal areas or integrated development or micro level planning or the growth centre have their roots in alien countries. They are slightly modified and adopted to the tribal situation instead of being developed indigenously as products of local field situation.

This process of adopting alien models of development resulted in defeating the very purpose for which they were adopted and the consequent wastage of funds. Further, while effecting changes to the development models so as to make them amenable to local situation both the programme and the model became mutilated and disjointed as each model is a comprehensive whole and if an attempt is made to modify a part of it the whole system is effected since the various parts are closely interlinked and interdependent. Consequently a development model should be firmly rooted in local resource endowment, ethnic composition and cultural setting.

Modern Indian planning concepts, policies and programmes have been the products of discussions and
deliberation held by planning Commission with various academicians, administrators, subject matter specialists etc., before initiating any five year plan. Especially the initiation of V Five Year Plan strategy was preceded by the constitution of a number of Task Force Groups which in turn were having a number of working groups to discuss and make recommendations to the concerned Task Force which consolidated the reports of its constituent working groups and made final recommendations to the Planning Commission. However, this remained a macro level activity as such groups were not constituted at State, District and Block level so that the planning process is taken to the grass roots level. Consequently, it is on the basis of the plan strategies decided directly at all India level that programme formulation and scheme execution have been undertaken at State, district and block levels. This frequently resulted in formulation of programme to suit a particular strategy without critically examining whether that particular strategy actually suits the local geo-ethnic situation, livelihood practices and cultural patterns or not.

The strategy of Gond Education Scheme, on the other hand, was evolved after a study of the local situation and the whole scheme was evolved to suit a preliterate tribal society mainly thriving on settled cultivation. Moreover, the Gond Education scheme was a super structure built upon the prodigious land assignment.
scheme which also provided the necessary economic base for implementing the other associated programmes of development such as organisation of co-op. credit societies, Grain Banks or Golas, distribution of plough bullocks, milch cattle etc.

The most important and notable difference between two periods is in the role played by non-official in programme planning and implementation. In the former set up the traditional leaders of tribals who were considered to be the real representatives of people were nominated as members of the Panchayats constituted under Hyderabad Tribal Areas Regulation of 1969 F. But the role of Panchayats was almost restricted to that of the traditional tribal panchayats i.e., cases dealing with social offences, petty thefts and land disputes without however any say in the development programmes implemented. At least at the district level there was ample scope for organising a Tribes Advisory Council to assist and advice the district social Services Officer in Programme formulation and implementation. But no such district council was constituted.

In the new set up, even before the introduction of Panchayati Raj or democratic decentralisation in 1962, Advisory Council was constituted for guiding the
programmes of Multipurpose Project. The tribal has been directly involved in both programme formulation and implementation since the introduction of Panchayat Raj. For ensuring proper tribal representation in these bodies, the posts of Samithi President and Vice President, Panchayat Sarpanch and Upa Sarpanch and even Panch or member Panchayat have been statutorily reserved for Scheduled Tribe candidates if the whole area of Panchayati Samithi or village Panchayat is scheduled. Further, the membership of these democratic institutions is by election through adult franchise. But most of the leaders elected to these institutions are traditional leaders only. Even though democratisation of policy formulation and execution are expected to distribute power throughout the communities instead of monopolisation by a few families claiming hereditary right, in practice it is most of these traditional leaders who captured the positions in these bodies. For example, the hereditary Gond Rajah of Utnoor could become Panchayat Samithi president and latter M.L.A. for the reserved constituency for two consecutive terms. Similarly, the 'Mokhashi' of Bambara village in Asifabad taluk could become M.L.A. from Asifabad reserved constituency for successive terms. Most of the Panchayat Presidents are usually the former village Officers like patel.

* Village munisif.
or Patwari who resigned in favour of their brothers or sons so that both authoritarian leadership and elected leadership and the consequent power are retained in the same family that too almost hereditarily.

But it is increasingly felt that mere reservation does not ensure power in the hands of tribals as many of the elected tribal leaders are controlled by more powerful plains settlers who are playing the role of 'absentee leaders' or 'leadership from a distance'. It is the invisible power of these behind the curtain leaders that is playing havoc with tribal development and lion's share of it is going to the non-tribal.

This brings us to the critical question whether democratic decentralisation is ahead of times in tribal areas. However, it is to be recognised that unless the modern process of adult franchise and elections are introduced to tribal and he is allowed to handle power either independently or as a guided leader he will not be able to catch up with the rest of the society in spite of the fact that this process of learning may some times prove detrimental to the interest of tribal during the transitory period. To minimise the negative effect of the process of democratic decentralisation, training programmes have been evolved for equipping the tribal leader with necessary skill and knowledge of Panchayati Raj.

* Village Accountant.
community development, decision making activity in democratic institution etc. In view of his own personal experience and imitation of the role of leader belonging to advance sections in the play of power politics, besides the knowledge gained through training programmes, the tribal is also slowly becoming self confident and acquiring the capability for independent decision making. For the time being the present tribal leader elected to the democratic institutions is only a shade better than the nominated tribal traditional leader of the previous era.

In general it can be said that in the previous period planning was in response to local felt needs with stress on amelioration and creation of infrastructure for building up a real growth oriented society without much stress on percolation of innovations and modern or sophisticated facilities like electricity, pump sets, tractors, etc., as the tribal was not in a position to utilise them as he was in a preliterate stage. On the other hand the development since independence aimed at diffusion of sophisticated technology and every plan has been striving to modernise the livelihood patterns besides introducing them to new venues of employment. However, the process has been slow and not of the expected pace as both the area and the people are not completely
prepared to reap the full benefits of development due to inherent cultural barriers which could not be properly identified and programmes so oriented as to overcome them.