Conclusion

CONCLUSION: TO DEVELOP A COMPREHENSIVE AND SCIENTIFIC BORDER MANAGEMENT AND NATIONAL SECURITY POLICY
The management of the Indo-Bangladesh border has been quite a challenge in the geopolitical and socio-cultural milieu. Indo-Bangladesh border particularly unscientific management of this border has brought severe threats to the national security of India. The traditional border management approaches brought more failures than successes to India. Problems like smuggling, drug and human trafficking, illegal movement of people, goods, insurgents, and criminals across the border, and tensions between the border guarding forces of the two countries have made this border region insecure and have also contributed to tensions in bilateral relations.

"Border" especially unscientific management of international borders, has become the major barrier and biggest enemy of not only the human development but also the development of nation-states and even to the national security of the states. In the 21st century when the whole world is going towards liberalization and open up their national borders, still there are some borders going harder, stronger and violent. The Indo-Bangladesh border is one of them, in fact, one of the most dangerous borders in the world.

The contradictory nature of the partition, reality of 15th August 1947 continues to intrigue historians more than half a century since India was partitioned. Freedom was won, but was accompanied by the trauma of partition. Thus India’s independence represents the great paradox of history. Indo-Bangladesh border, which first conceived in 1905 with the administrative division of Bengal into two administrative provinces by Lord Curzon, the then Viceroy of British India, was politically recognised in 1947 with the partition of Indian sub-continent into two countries of India and Pakistan and that again renewed in 1971 with the division of Pakistan and creation of Bangladesh as a full-flagged country. The exercise of creation of this border was completely unscientific and improper throughout its history. This is an artificial border created in 1947 by Sir Cyril Radcliffe, a juridical person and the then chief of the ‘Boundary Commission’ (formed by the then Viceroy of British India Luis Mountbatten), who sketched the border on the paper through a pencil without having any ground experiences or practical knowledge or having any geological, geographical or anthropological understanding. The border was created dividing not only a nation but also many districts, villages, people and their families along with their livelihood. This improper method of creation of the border not
only making economic and socio-cultural interdependency but also easy crossing of the people across the border and creating several kinds of transborder and transnational security problems.

The geographical proximity, strategic location and demand of the time indicate that India and Bangladesh would have the potentiality of much more easy trade between them than any other countries. The same history, similar culture, same living style and the large size of population in both the side of the border encourage this trade. The liberalization of economy under the banner of globalization has not only opened up the economies but also the national borders and given a very strong argument in favour of Free Trade and for opening up of the border trade and easy flowing of the Foreign Direct Investments (FDI). After EU, NAFTA, and ASEAN it should be SAARC and the Indo-Bangladesh Free Trade would be the best example. It has been thoroughly studied and investigated by several scholars and renowned institutions from all of its angles that Indo-Bangladesh trade in Free Trade and FDI through open up of the border would be very much beneficial to both the countries.

Secondly, the transborder migration, trafficking and subversive movements and their network is natural and due to its historical, socio-cultural and economic reasons are bound to happen. Nevertheless, it is not only happening on Indo-Bangladesh border but also on almost all the borders. Migration, which is the mother of all the other problems, is a natural phenomenon. Nothing can stop migration. No border, no guns, no police or army can stop people to migrate. It's like water flows from high to low to make its own balance. A poor will always try to migrate to an economically advanced place for better livelihood opportunities. The human civilization is formed on the basis of migration and every one is a migrant in a way or more. The government is required scientific approaches to manage the migrants. The government should take steps to settle those migrants who are already inside India. They should be settled in a way that could bring more economical benefits to the country.

Thirdly, the terrorism which has become the sole enemy of human civilization now has become more active on Indo-Bangladesh border especially after 9/11. After Pakistan come under tremendous pressure of America and other international community, terrorism has shifted to Indo-Bangladesh border areas with their bases and camps. It has
been come out that there were Bangladeshi citizens involved in past almost all bomb blasts happened in Indian cities, though no one has ever been proved entirely. The insurgency movements are also growing very faster and have become very powerful and successful day by day. This is true the movement is going on effectively through its help from across the borders with giving shelter and patronage to its leaders and sponsors in each other’s territory. There have been arguments and counter arguments by both India and Bangladesh. While India blames Bangladesh is helping Indian insurgent groups in North-East, Bangladesh blames India have been intervening in their internal matters through helping insurgency movement in Chittagong Hill Tracts. There are only arguments and counter arguments and no measures have never been taken to find out a solution to these problems.

Under the shadow of migration and subversive movements the trafficking of human, narcotics, small arms and even animals have become very active and a common and easy business on the border areas. Trafficking of women especially young and teenage girls from Bangladesh are been brought and sold in Indian cities like vegetables at the cost of 500 to 1000 or 2000 Taka which was also much lesser earlier days. They have been sold for three purposes basically i.e., as prostitutes in big hotels and brothels around the country; as wives in West Bengal, Uttar Pradesh, Delhi, Haryana, Punjab, Bihar and Orissa; and as house-meds in cities like Delhi, Mumbai, Kolkata and some other cities of India.

Trafficking of Narcotics has also been destroying societies of India and Bangladesh both. It has reached almost all the cities and every part of India and Bangladesh. Tons of heroines, cocaine, brown sugar and opium of worth millions of dollars are been smuggled into India. Now this also become a two way business with coming and going out for further processing. Trafficking of small arms and light weapons are now made the soils of both India and Bangladesh a zone of boiling for war like situation. Everybody has small arms now or capability of buying some arms. Small arms and light weapons are helping in a big way to the insurgent groups in North-East India and Chittagong Hill Tracts to carry out their small and tactical guerilla wars. This has also helped a lot to the growing Islamic fundamentalism in Bangladesh and naxalite movement in India. The strategic location of South Asia between the world’s two major opium producing regions
Gold Crescent and Golden Triangle is mainly making the trafficking easier and the issue worsen.

Illegal border trade is another big problem being occurring directly out of the Indo-Bangladesh border disputes. Due to unique nature of this border and political antagonism and misunderstandings from both the sides the bilateral trade especially the benefits of border trade has been always out of the agenda and some times even undermined. Indo-Bangladesh border has a potentiality of much beneficial trade than any other borders of India. Its strategic location is mainly argued for it. But, unfortunately, neither government has never tried to exploit this border in this way. The problem now has become acute and very dangerous with smuggling of almost all the types and varieties of commodities and goods and sold in each others' markets. The amount of illegal trade is more than US $ 2 billion comparing with the legal trade nearly US $ 2 billion would be more than legal trade. It has also been observed that in many cases informal trade is more appreciable than the formal trade. Reasons are very interesting also. The hectic procedures, time consumption and monetary loss and even threats to life, goods and vehicles are demoralizing business through this border. Informal trade on the other hand, requires no procedures at all, even easy border crossing low risk and high profit. Some goods are even well accepted and legalised by the concerned governments after entering into their respective sides of the border.

There are several other problems been originated because of this border viz., demographic changes in North-East India and West Bengal, devastation of the socio-cultural and economic life, environmental problems, active of mafias, the nexus and their networks across the border and the most important is the communicable and transmitted diseases they carrying with them across the borders. Mosque and Madrassa education system growing around the border areas are another big problem as this has become the nerve center for terrorism. The Madrassas are funded by basically rich and religious minded people inside and outside Bangladesh. One of the important reasons came out of the growing popularity of Madrassa education in Bangladesh is that it is one of the poorest countries of the world and can’t afford free education for its fast growing population for which it opening up of private institutions, Mosques and Madrassas with the assistance from common people and organisations. Government does not have fully
control on the administration of Mosques and Madrassas since this is a very sensitive matter concerning people’s emotion and religion.

All these above mentioned problems are there since long time because of firstly, underdevelopment and unique feature of the border region. Indo-Bangladesh border region has never tried to be developed by either country on their respective sides. No roads, no electric facilities, no telecommunication which makes the region totally isolated from the other part of the country. Though, it was an age-old strategy of every country that the development of border region could be used by antinational elements like terrorists, insurgents and other subversive groups. But, the people living on the region have no education institutions for their children and no livelihood for them. Therefore, there is obviously a great chance and possibility of there involvement in the antinational groups to get some kind of employment. This makes people their unawareness about the country and the nationalistic feelings are rare to find in them. They don’t have even idea of the importance of international borders and border guidelines.

Besides these ground realities there are political and bilateral issues beings barriers to the good relationship between two countries and never formed a congenial climate to solve these long pending unresolved problems. These problems are firstly, regarding the border fencing. As Bangladesh argues when migrants, smugglers, traffickers, terrorists or insurgents crossing the border to seek shelter in Bangladesh they are first of all crossing the fence that is on Indian territory. It means they have India’s permission. Then it permits Bangladesh to blame India that motivating state sponsored terrorism and smuggling even sending Indian Muslim and Hindus into Bangladesh. Furthermore, the growing of migration is up to a long way because of the demand from Indian side like for food-grain, commodities, and even chief man power for construction work, for sex business, house-med and to collect the garbage from the streets.

Second reason is the water sharing problem. The water sharing through Farakka barrage has never been judiciable to Bangladesh. There is no water in Bangladesh side in the lean season. However, the argument shows that in the lean season Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal needs much water and without of which it would go for drought. The third reason is the using of Chittagong port for India which is mixed with other reasons as Bangladesh needs transit facilities to Nepal, Pakistan and Myanmar and some other
neighbouring countries through Indian territory. And, the involvement in developing hydro power plants in the neighbouring countries that Bangladesh can share later to fulfill its electric shortage.

The last but not the least reason is the politicization of the whole issues by political parties in both India and Bangladesh. Political parties are constantly using all the issues relating to border to mobilize people and collect their votes. Surprisingly, no big efforts have never been put to resolve these bilateral issues either by India or Bangladesh. Interestingly, while Bangladesh blames India is not serious about the better relationship with Bangladesh, India blames Bangladesh is not fulfilling all the prior conditions for talk.

Despite of all these inconveniences, there are still enormous efforts being put from several sectors—governmental, non-governmental and think tank groups—to resolve all these pending issues. There are regular meetings of secretary levels, ministerial levels and even Prime Ministerial levels along with security chiefs especially between BSF and BDR. There are also several research institutes and think-tank institutions are busy in doing research, conducting seminars, symposiums and workshops regarding Indo-Bangladesh relations and border issues. These institutions are giving enormous feedbacks to revamp the Indo-Bangladesh relations.

Meanwhile, India has taken up several steps with adopting numerous strategies. India has also done extensive works (though not sufficient) for development of border areas. The two phases of border fencing work is about to over, several border roads, bridge, strategic locations, hideouts, BOPs has been constructed, the floodlights and night vision cameras which is very important for bad time surveillance are been set on strategic places. The number of BOPs along with number of personnel has already been increased. Border patrol, patrol vehicles and new techniques to use them has been up-graded. Several modern weapons are been brought and assigned to the BSF. The availability of enough technology with weapons gives moral boost to Jawans to guard the border properly.

On the other hand, border area people are no more enemies to border management programme. They have now in large number been attached to the border management and border area development programmes. They have given training and education to defend
the country, the border and their native place. The border area education institutions are
up-graded and new schools and colleges are opening up. People are also given new
livelihood through loans for small scale industries, new small markets are established, the
transport system has been developed that they can sell their products in other parts of the
country. They are now working in several sectors to defend border especially recognizing
and opposing Bangladeshi migrants to enter into their areas and providing information
regarding hideouts of terrorists and insurgents and about their targets. They have also
given certain small arms for their self-defence otherwise BSF has taken the
responsibility.

Furthermore, the foreign policy and security strategy of India has been changed a lot
since 1994 with Mr. Inder Kumar Gujural as Prime minister and his famous “Gujural
Doctrine”. Since then India has been paying much attention towards its neighbouring
countries with sanctioning special packages, assistances, reliefs, loans for them along
with frequent visit of ministers and cultural exchange programmes. This is a reality that
in nowadays world, no border can be managed through arms, army or machines. It can be
possible only through good and healthy relationship between both the countries and
people in both side of the border. And, the good relationship can be possible when there
will be some sound reasons, perfect logics and viable ways. The sound reasons are first,
India needs a vibrant neighbourhood when it is growing faster as a major power. The
second reason is the growing opportunities of socio-cultural and special economic
benefits of the open border in the age of liberalization under the banner of globalization.

However, open up and liberalization or soften of border is always relates with high
security risk and those will be there anyway. This is natural and the risk has to be taken
up. But, still there is the question of how the Indo-Bangladesh border is going to be
protected without compromising with so many other benefits. Though efforts would be
too risk by its nature but the policy-makers, scholars and experts have to find out some
convenient ways to tackle these security problems. And the same issue also needs several
more rigorous studies in different ways because there are several issues being relate to the
border management and has made it a very complex, complicated and a very sensitive
area of study for researchers. Those issues are sociological, cultural, economic, political,
anthropological, psychological and even security related issues.
Finally, border management means not just managing the border line on the ground and just putting soldiers with arms or building walls around the country. It means a complete and comprehensive relationship between both the countries. To manage the border perfectly we need a good cordial and healthy bilateral relationship between India and Bangladesh. “Border management is a fluid concept in the sense that the level of security arrangements along a particular border would depend upon the political relations, the economic linkages, the ethno-religious ties between people across the borders and the configuration of the border itself.” There should not be ‘small country big country’ attitude. It is a matter about countries. Does not matter how big or small is its size and how rich or poor it is? The real intension behind the research was to solve the border problem and to prove that border is not a line of separation rather it is a line of cooperation, friendship and love. It is a joint line of two countries and two cultures, in fact, another missing part of one of India’s big culture.

The concluding remarks that can be drawn in light of the present study are that Indo-Bangladesh border needs to be managed through a scientific strategy. But, the investigations show that the strategies and policies adopted by India is a big way not successful. But, if we evaluate some recent statements given by previous and the present Prime Ministers, security and strategic analysists of India the intension towards the neighborhood can better be understood. Starting up of a new relationship with Pakistan through bus service from India Mr. Atal Bihari Vajpayee once said “We certainly can change our friends but not neighbours” (Bearak 1999) and in a similar way Dr. Manmohan Singh argued “We cannot omit the border but the good relationship can gradually change the definition of the border.”(Puri 2007; ICWA 2006) Finally and reluctantly said the best way to manage a border perfectly is to de-border it.

...............however, the voyage has just started......................

Analysing Hypotheses

The proposed study adopted five important statements, logics or hypotheses to test.
All the five statements are tested thoroughly and realized that (i) the traditional policies adopted by India to manage borders are probed failure, though not fully; (ii) India's recent approaches towards its neighbouring countries indicates that there is a great similarity persists between the main theme of the proposed study and the Indian border management policies. Secondly the subversive movements going on in the country and particularly in the northeastern region and its relation spreading not only throughout the country but also to the world. The recent terrorist activities throughout the country have forced India to rethink its antiterrorist campaign. It has also proved that since long time the border region was either ignored or strategically left underdeveloped which facilitated the subversive movements and made difficulties for the management tasks later. The recent approaches taken by India to develop the border areas through several policies have proved similar to the proposed study. But there is always a fear of traditional border management policies could damage the emerging socio-cultural and economic benefits of the open or liberal border. In this regard India has not taken any major steps or adopted any major policy which is barely indeed. The final statement argues that the economic ties, socio-cultural relations and the people to people contact can reduce not only the border tensions can also make the management task much easier. The only requirement is to change the psychology of the decision makers, political leaders and the policy enforcement.

Some very important Recommendations

In the light of the above discussion, Bangladesh and India might take a number of steps at various levels to improve the trans-border cooperation, settle disputes and ensure a peaceful border between the two countries. The following measures can be adopted for efficient border management:

- More BSF personnel should be deployed at sensitive BOPs.
- To motivate and to improve the efficiency, the BSF personnel should be equipped with proper living conditions and be offered incentives too.
- Severe punishment would deter the BSF personnel from indulging in corrupt practices.
- Local people should either be inducted increasingly into the BSF or be entrusted the
responsibility of helping the BSF guard the border more efficiently.

- As pointed out by the Godbole Committee, the Government of India should endeavour to resolve the issues of enclaves as well as adverse possessions and demarcate the boundary.
- Alarm systems should be installed to detect breaching fences to prompt the BSF personnel respond with alacrity.
- No human habitation or cultivation should be permitted in the area between the border and the fence.
- The PIF scheme, operational in Assam, should be made effective with immunity to political interference. The same should be extended to other border states too.
- The local administration should introduce a system of issuing identity cards to people who cross the fence everyday to tend their farmlands.
- State and central governments should approach issues of illegal migration from the humanitarian angle.
- Trading in essential goods should be legalized to avert smuggling. State governments should be encouraged to open dutyfree markets near the border.
- To avoid friction, a warm, symbiotic relationship should be structured between the local population and the BSF personnel.
- Simultaneously, people along the border should be sensitized to the strategic importance of the area in the context of national security.
- Greater participation of the people in the border management should be ensured to make developmental plans along the border areas a success.
- To iron out tensions along the border, bilateral institutional mechanisms should be further strengthened, with frequent meetings between the authorities of India and Bangladesh.
- Improvement of infrastructure and organisational capacity of concerned agencies like BDR, Customs, and Police etc. to manage the borders more efficiently.
- Conducting of joint training of the government agencies working in bordering regions.
- Enhancement of co-operation between BDR and BSF in areas such as exchange of
intelligence, arranging of joint patrol of the borders to stop trafficking, smuggling and cattle lifting etc.

- Organising sports competitions between the two border forces as well as between people on both sides of the border to erase the adversarial image that persists and help build mutual trust and confidence.

- Review of visa regime and relaxing of conditions for cross border movements of citizens of both countries. Creation of a special Transit Pass for people of border areas.

- Creation of conditions for easier legal trade, rationalising of tariff barriers and removing bureaucratic bottlenecks.

- Including local leaders of the bordering regions in Dispute Conciliation Committee or Border Liaison Committee. JBWG can share and exchange views with the committee to settle boundary and other related disputes.

- Creation of trans-border co-operation over issues that are nonconflicting in nature, such as environmental degradation, arsenic pollution, disease control etc, which would eventually contribute to building confidence between the two countries.

- Motivating the media so that the negative media campaign against each other is curbed and wide coverage given to positive stories from the neighboring country.

- Border Area Vigilance is another aspect of border management. The concept of Village Volunteer Forces (VVF) helping in border management has a great deal to command itself and has worked with a good degree of success in areas where it has been tried so far.

- The Government is contemplating preparation of National Register of Indian Citizens and issue of Multi-purpose National Identity Cards (MNICs) based on this register to all citizens of age 18 years and above.

- Citizenship, Passport, Immigration and Refugee Law needs to be changed according to the time and the situations.

- Joint Boundary Working Groups (JBWGs) has been constituted to solve the border-related issues. Therefore it needs to be given statutory powers to deal the border issues.
• The Provisions of Religious Institution (Prevention of Misuse) Act, 1988 needs to be amended.

• Border Area Development Programme (BADP) should be given more grants so that it can deal with all sectors of development in the border areas.

• Local youth should be considered as Special Police Officers (SPO) and the setting of Village Defence Committee (VDC) which would be very positive impact on the way of border management.

The Government of India may take initiatives to make cooperation in the region in this regard. Those can be as followings:

✓ Establishment of internal, bilateral and multilateral mechanisms and procedures for the exchange of information on border and trafficking issues.

✓ Where required, training and certification of all ministry personnel directly involve in border control and anti-trafficking activities. The achievement of these short-term objectives must be seen as a first step in a longer-term joint export aiming at enhancing significantly border management and security in the whole region.

✓ Strong organization and leadership, improvement of command and control structures.

✓ To strengthen the specific directions of guarding the borders, providing training personnel.

✓ Efficiency risk assessment techniques and criminal investigation and intelligence gathering capabilities.

✓ Cooperation between national agencies (custom, ministry of Foreign Affairs, armed forces, state intelligence services, local Governmental bodies, etc.).

✓ International cooperation, regional cooperation, cooperation with the international organizations and international police organizations, and the CARDs programme.

✓ Implementation of a single information system with data bases SIS.

✓ Implementation of twin projects on border management.

✓ Drafting of protocols on cooperation with neighbouring police services.

✓ Establishing a new training course for border management.

✓ A working Group can be established for making a proposal of new training and advanced skilled programme.
Intense cooperation has been established with border services (police) in neighbouring and other countries, with regard to all professional segments. Cooperation with foreign liaison officers is especially significant for exchange of information in preventing uncontrolled migration and all forms of organized crime and terrorism.

Making and signing of agreements with customs and other state agencies and services, concerning state border control and surveillance.

Signing of agreement on cooperation with border services (police) of countries in the region.

Active participation at all workshops roundtable and courses concerning borders and foreigners.

Establishment of an inter-agency group for transformation of border security and management. Preparation for the development of a border policy law. And,

Technically equipping of border policy units and restoration of border infrastructure.

Therefore, the followings would be the expected results:

Greater levels of economic growth and social development within border regions.

Greater levels of cross border cooperation between border regions.

The following regional development or cross border cooperation actions may be financed through this programme:

a) Business related infrastructure. This will focus on infrastructure projects that directly benefit productive sector activity and the local business environment.

b) Capacity of human resources. This will target support on improving employability, developing entrepreneurship and encouraging adaptability of business and their employees.

c) Civil society and the NGOs activities, especially where cross-border cooperation links in the social and conflict resolution spheres are involved.

Furthermore, there can also be some other important measures to be taken care up toward the managing of the Indo-Bangladesh border normalization of border conflicts.

Firstly, border problems are born of economic disparities instead of concentrating on trade with its neighbours, which is inherently of an equal nature, India should think on
the lines of making industrial investments in Bangladesh to discourage migration to India in search of better economic opportunities;

Secondly, NGOs are so powerful in Bangladesh in social and developmental work. Therefore, it would suggest that India might provide economic assistants through these NGOs, which would develop the mind of the common people towards it;

Thirdly, the Government of India needs to strike a balance between security concerns and welfare concerns to arrive at a comprehensive border management policy;

Fourthly, India must convince the common people of Bangladesh, that it (India) is not interested in destabilizing their country;

Fifthly, India must not under any circumstances, add to the stock of political capital of diverse elements in Bangladesh’s military and civil establishment and among the mole combination of political adventures who play upon Indo-phobia mixed with Islamic atavism;

Sixthly, as internal and external politics are inextricably linked, the necessity of India to adopt a correct approach, in her dealing with Bangladesh, is one of the essential ingredients of building adorable structure of peace and stability in the region;

Last but not the least; India must not take any kind of stand that would impede the peace process and the healthy bilateral relations

Summary of Suggestions for Further Research

The present study was initiated with the objective of analysing different aspects of Indo-Bangladesh border management and special focus on challenges to India’s national security. It started with the theoretical underpinnings regarding the border, border management and national security and reviewed exiting studies by various researchers on both the viability of the theoretical logic and its empirical validity. It then narrates briefly the trends and progress of problems and the efforts to solve those problems. Next, it tried to explore the actual reasons of those problems and the hurdles in their ways. It also discussed briefly the major areas of concern regarding various security issues. It then briefly discussed the policies to be adopted and the steps to be taken so as to solve those problems. Finally, in an effective way, in light of the findings of this study, it would then
conclude by indicating the possible directions in which this study can be extended further.

(i) There is a need to carry out an in-depth analysis of the effects of liberalization on Indian economy, on South Asian and especially on Indo-Bangladesh free border trade, because South Asia is a unique region due to its history, culture, religion, political status and the economic inequality.

(ii) In further, an attempt should also be made to assess the effect of all the other aspects of the studies like sociological, anthropological, geographical and geological impacts on Indo-Bangladesh border study. Such study would help shade light as to whether or not this objective has been attained.

(iii) Further research on all the individual security problems should be done to find out the reasons in more detail.

(iv) There is also a need of carry out of further research on the partition politics and its impact on border, border management and especially on the security issues.

(v) There should also an in-depth research need to evaluate the fruitfulness of the infrastructure development on border areas and how it is impacting the management programme.

(vi) Another research also required to find out the psychological calculation of policy-maker regarding solving the border issue.

Last but not the least....

"The bunch of carrot is much beneficial
than the sticks of nuclear."

----Joseph Nye Jr.