CHAPTER 2
REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Review of literature is an important part of any research work. Review is helpful to give the right direction to a research study. It explores the developments in the subject of study. It helps the researcher in formulating the research methodology, hypotheses and in selecting the variables to be studied. For this purpose, we have consulted academic journals, conference proceedings, government reports, books etc. to present an exhaustive view of the available literature on the research theme and other connected issues. Finally, with some modification, the literature review is a “legitimate and publishable scholarly document” (LeCompte, 2003). Review in this chapter includes studies from India and even abroad.

Kirkpatrick, D. (1959) defines a four levels model at which an organization should be interested in obtaining measures about a training intervention:
† Reaction: Measures how participants felt during the training activity. Evaluating reaction is usually simple, cost-effective and accomplished by asking trainees to complete surveys.
† Learning: Measures the improvement of a trainee at a certain skill or knowledge because of the training intervention. Learning measures are usually obtained by applying pre and post-tests during a training event.
† Behavior or transfer: Measures how much of the acquired knowledge was successfully applied on the job. Transfer measures, are the first level of measures that the organization should have interest in because they show how the effort invested in training has a return in the job.
† Results: This level is about bottom-line results. It implies collecting data about the degree in which training was able to influence the organization’s objectives. This model is very simple and easy to follow.

Warr, Bird, and Rackham (1970) presented another four-level framework called CIRO. CIRO stands for the four levels Context, Input, Reaction, and Outcome. They believe that before assessing reactions and outcome, there needs to be an analysis of the context and inputs. Context evaluation involves looking at the current operational
situation to help determine the training needs and objectives. Input is information about possible training methods or techniques that can be used to select the best choice of training intervention, and reaction looks at gathering participant views and suggestions about the training programme. This level is similar to Kirkpatrick’s reaction level, but with greater emphasis on suggestions to help change the training programme. Outcome evaluation looks at the results of training at an immediate, intermediate, and ultimate level.

**Salas, E. & et al. using Kirkpatrick’s (1976)** framework for evaluating training, reviewed 58 published accounts of Crew Resource Management (CRM) training to determine its effectiveness within aviation. Results indicated that CRM training generally produced positive reactions, enhanced learning, and desired behavioral changes. However, the researchers cannot ascertain whether CRM has an effect on an organization’s bottom line (i.e., safety). Although the aviation community should be commended in that multi-level evaluations are becoming more common, evaluation needs to become a systematically accepted cost of business, call for the need to conduct systematic, multi-level evaluation efforts that will show the true effectiveness of CRM training.

Phillips states the most widely used framework for evaluation of training is Kirkpatrick’s (1976) four level model (reaction, learning, on-the-job behavior and organization results). The power of Kirkpatrick’s model is its simplicity and its ability to help people easily understand the concepts of training evaluation. Although the Kirkpatrick model is recognized as the being influential, it still has not been widely implemented in its entirety after a half of century (Alliger & Janak, 1989; Kraiger, Fords & Salas, 1993; Phillips, 2003). However, rarely have all four levels been evaluated; most are evaluated at reaction level (Nickols, 2005), with few published studies evaluating at level four (Alliger, Tannenbaum, Bennett Jr, Traver, Shotland; 1997). Although Tannenbaum and Woods (1992) suggest that evaluations conducted at the higher levels will provide more convincing information about the impact of the training at organizational level, ASTD (1998) report only 3% of all training courses are evaluated for business impact (level 4) whereas 89% are measured for reaction (level 1).
Schmidt, F. L., Hunter, J. E. and Pearlman, K. (1982) describes and illustrates the adaptation of the linear regression equations used to estimate the impact of valid selection procedures on workforce productivity to evaluation of intervention programmes designed to improve job performance. The appropriate equations are derived and explained, and the use of these equations is illustrated by means of a hypothetical example. It is concluded that in the future these methods and equations will allow decision- makers to make various assessments of the impacts of the intervention programmes on workforce productivity.

Daniel L. Stufflebeam (1983) developed a CIPP model of programme evaluation. It refers to the four phases of evaluation: context evaluation, input evaluation, process evaluation and product evaluation. It is based upon the view that the most important purpose of evaluation is to improve the functioning of a programme. Context evaluation involves training and development needs analysis and formulating objectives in the light of these needs. It is aimed at determining the extent, to which the goals and objectives of the programme matched the assessed need of the organization. Input evaluation involves an examination of the intended content of the programme. It is designed to assess the extent to which programme strategies, procedures, and activities support the goals and objectives identified in the needs assessment and context evaluation. Process evaluation is a continual assessment of the implementation of the action plan that has been developed by organization. It is an ongoing and systematic monitoring of the programme. A process evaluation provides information that can be used to guide the implementation of programme strategies, procedures and activities as well as a means to identify successes and failures. Product evaluation involves measuring and interpreting the attainment of training and development objectives. In other words it can be said that the purpose of product evaluation is to measure, interpret and judge the extent to which an organization’s improvement efforts have achieved their short term and long term goals.

Honeycutt, E.D. and Stevenson, T.H. (1989) said an important aspect of effective training is the evaluation of such training. The study aimed at to provide information on how such evaluations are conducted and to understand managers’ attitudes toward assessing sales training. Findings indicate that a very few number of managers focus
attention on measuring the results of preparing projects. A mail survey was sent to 500 field sales managers randomly selected from a major sales administration magazine subscription list. Each manager asked to provide data about the company’s training practices, including areas as goals, course content, time given, participative techniques, and assessment efforts. Response rate was 38%. The results of the study showed that industrial marketers still focus on sales training evaluation efforts on trainee reaction. Only a small number appear to be measuring the results of the training programme. Time, money, problems in obtaining information restrictions seem to hamper sales managers’ training evaluation efforts. Only 20 percent sales managers stated that a training programme’s results should be measured. Results suggest that most companies’ assessment efforts remain subjective in nature and that increased evaluation complexity must be implemented if the training programme’s involvement to the firm is to be objectively determined.

Bushnell (1990) also created a modification to the Kirkpatrick Model by identifying a four-step process IPO model of evaluation. Bushnell’s model included evaluation of training from the development through the delivery and impact. This model includes following steps:

1. Input: evaluation of system performance indicators such as trainee qualifications, availability of materials, appropriateness of training, etc.
2. Process: embraces planning, design, development, and delivery of training programmes
3. Output: Gathering data resulting from the training interventions, reactions
4. Outcomes: longer-term results associated with improvement in the corporation’s bottom line- its profitability, competitiveness, etc.

Step three was defined as output which equated to the first three levels of the Kirkpatrick Model. Step three involves trainees’ reactions, knowledge and skills gained, and improved job performance. Bushnell separated outcomes or results of the training into the fourth step. Outcomes were defined as profits, customer satisfaction, and productivity. This model was applied by IBM’s global education network, although specific results were not found in the literature.
Phillips, J.J. (1991) five-level ROI model. Return on investment (ROI) has been used in business as a means of determining the value of an investment in financial terms. Phillips’s model is comparable to Kirkpatrick’s, but Phillips expanded Kirkpatrick’s four-level framework by adding a fifth level, ROI. Return on investment is calculated in order to show value, in financial terms, of a training investment. The levels of Phillips’s framework are (1) reaction and planned action; (2) learning; (3) job application; (4) business results; and (5) return on investment. Level 1, reaction and planned action, is similar to Kirkpatrick’s Level 1 but also includes a plan of what participants intend to apply from the programme. Additional measure of training evaluation, returns on investment (ROI), was used by organizations because of the stress placed on Human Resource Departments to produce measures of output for total quality management. The fifth level adds the cost-benefit analysis that is essential to calculate ROI, requiring that any change in Level 4, results, be converted into monetary value and compared to the costs of the programme (J.J. Phillips, 1996a; P.P. Phillips, 2002). Great debate was found in the training and development literature about the use of ROI measures of training programmes. Many training and development professionals believed that ROI is too difficult and unreliable a measure to use for training evaluation.

Figure 2.1: Phillips model for determining the Return on Investment in human resource development

Source: Phillips (1997c)
Birch, S. and Gafni, A. (1992) said in their research paper despite the growing literature on economic evaluation of personnel development programmes, little attention has been paid to the theoretical foundations of cost-effectiveness analyses (CEA) and cost utility analyses (CUA) and the validity of the decision rules adopted as methods of achieving the stated goals. They show that although applications of the techniques can be used to pursue some managerial objectives in the context of highly constrained environments, such applications are inconsistent with some other economic objectives. Where CEA and CUA are chosen as methods of evaluation it is important to state the objective of such evaluation in order that one can consider whether the methods lead us to our objective.

Tatto, M. T. (1993) measure the costs and effectiveness of three approaches to elementary teacher education in Sri Lanka—per-service, conventional in-service, and distance in-service—are examined. The effectiveness of these approaches was measured on various grounds. Costs borne by the sponsoring institution and the teachers were evaluated. Findings are important given the more difficult situations in which they taught.

Campbell, C.P. (1994) discusses the need to justify training expenditures with targeted benefits. Increasingly, training professionals are being asked to justify whether training is a worthwhile investment. In this article author provides details on how to calculate the direct, indirect, and full costs of a training course or programme. Also describes the feasibility of linking training outcomes to organizational improvements and the selection of training outcomes (benefits) to be measured and quantified. While calculating the full cost of training is a first and critical step in determining cost effectiveness, monitoring costs is also important to planning and controlling the training budget. After training managers learn how to calculate the cost and measure the effectiveness of training, they want to know is the training effort producing benefits that are greater than the costs involved?

Campbell, C.P. (1995) following on from part one, describes four practical methods for determining the cost-effectiveness of training. Author presents details and examples on how to use each method. Also identifies the advantages and disadvantages of each method. A variety of methods are available for determining the
cost–effectiveness of training. Some are complex and difficult to utilize, while others are more suitable for research projects. The four methods for justifying a training investment presented in this study were selected because they are practical, relatively easy to use and generally familiar to higher management. The four methods described here are: return on investment (ROI); cost-benefit ratio; bottom-line evaluation; and payback period. Ends with a skill check which provides an opportunity to apply the content covered.

Delaney, J. T. and Huselid, M. A. (1996) in their investigation of 590 for-benefit and non-benefit firms from the National Organizations Survey, USA, discovered positive relationship between human asset administration practices, for example, training and staffing selectivity, and perceptual firm execution measures. Results additionally recommend methodological issues for thought in examinations of the relationship between HRM frameworks and firm execution. This study develops experimental research on the firm-level effect of dynamic HRM rehearses in three ways. In the first place, they draw an interesting national likelihood test of for-benefit and non-benefit associations to assess the relationship between a mixed bag of dynamic HRM practices and perceptual measures of hierarchical execution. Second, they lead some simple exact tests of the impact of complementarities among HRM hones on firm-level results. Case in point, the level of worker interest, the structure and structure of an association's impetus pay framework (e.g., the extent of pay at danger), and more definite data concerning every association's execution administration framework would have permitted the development of a more finish set of HRM practice measures. Finally, they identify some important methodological issues that merit consideration as scholars and practitioners seek to better understand the relationship between human resource development practices and firm performance.

Warr, P. & et al. (1999) in a longitudinal study of three levels of training evaluation, differentiated measures of trainees’ reactions were shown to be more closely associated with learning outcomes than has been found with conventional reaction measures. However, reactions were generally unrelated to subsequent job behavior. A 2-day training course was studied on 23 occasions over a 7-month period. Trainees
completed a knowledge test and questionnaires on arrival at the course (at Time One, T1) and at the end (Time Two, T2), and a follow-up questionnaire was mailed to them from the authors’ university address one month later (at Time Three, T3). A reminder was sent to those who had not returned the follow-up questionnaire after 2 weeks. In all, 163 technicians provided complete data at T1 and T2, of who 123 returned the T3 questionnaire. Both immediate and delayed learning were predicted by trainees’ motivation, confidence and use of certain learning strategies and changes in job behaviour were independently predicted by transfer climate and learning confidence. It is preferable to measure training outcomes in terms of change from pre-test to post-test, rather than merely through attainment (post-test only) scores; the predictors of training outcomes were shown to differ according to which indicator is used. Kirkpatrick’s first level (reaction) is used for measures. External factors better predicted learning changes (compared to predictions of post-test attainment) when their correlations with pre-test values differed substantially from their correlations with post-test scores.

Twitchell, S., Holton, E.F. and Trott, J.W. (2000) this study tried to focus the degree to which specialized or technical training projects, which is frequently thought to be easier to evaluate but has not been studied, uses acknowledged assessment methods. A review was sent to a random sample of 334 individuals from the American Society of Training and Development (ASTD) specialized and abilities preparing proficient practice zone, bringing about a useable reaction rate of 35%. Information was accumulated on the sorts and routines for assessment utilized, explanations behind not assessing, hierarchical preparing practices, and chose demographic data. The outcomes demonstrated that specialized preparing assessment practices were basically the same as those reported for training all in all. Besides, an examination of recorded benchmarks demonstrated that assessment practices have not changed much in the most recent forty years. These discoveries recommend the requirement for another exploration motivation on hierarchical preparing choice making procedures.

Salas, E., & Cannon-Bowers, J. A. (2001) reviews the preparing research literature reported over the past decade. Authors describe the progress in five areas of research
including training theory; training needs study, antecedent training conditions, training methods and strategies, and posttraining conditions. Author’s recommends that advancements have been made that help us understand better the design and delivery of training in associations, with respect to theory design as well as the quality and quantity of empirical research. Finally, Authors challenge researchers to find better ways to translate the results of training research into practice. In summary, it is noted that whereas most training researchers believe and adopt that training-needs analysis is the most important phase in training; this phase remains largely an art rather than a science. We need more research that would enable us to develop an organized methodology to determine the training needs of business associations.

**Eseryel, D. (2002)** reviews recent approaches to evaluation of training in theory as well as in practice. Particular attention is paid to the difficulties associated with assessment practice and whether these are addressed in the theory. Furthermore, possible means of expediting the performance of evaluations and expanding the range and precision of data collection using automated systems are discussed. There is an on-going debate in the field of evaluation about which approach is best to facilitate the processes involved. There could be different sorts of training programmes evaluation. Purpose of evaluation could be (developmental or summative), Type of evaluation objectives (psychological, affective, behavioral, impact), Level of evaluation (reaction, learning, behavior, organizational impact), Type of instructional objectives (declarative knowledge, procedural learning, attitudes), Type of instructional delivery (classroom-based, innovation-based, hyper), Size and type of participant groups (individual, small group, larger group). Diverse ways to deal with evaluation of training discussed herein indicate that the activities involved in evaluation of training are complex and not generally well-organized. Since evaluation activities in training situations involve various goals associated with different levels, assessment ought to be viewed as a collective movement between training designers, training managers, mentors, floor supervisors, and perhaps others.

**Strother, J. (2002)** has done an evaluation of the efficiency of electronic-learning in Corporate Training Projects. Organizations managers are persistently looking for more cost-effective ways to convey training to their personnel. However, some
companies that have spent big amounts of dollars on new electronic-learning methods have not received the desired monetary return. However, author use Kirkpatrick's classic model for evaluation. Until a more solid research methodology is developed for measuring e-learning results, we can rely on the mainly qualitative comment from organizations that are using e-learning to convey their training. Companies praise online training as a cost-effective, suitable, and effective way to convey corporate education. Early studies seem to demonstrate that e-language-learning in business is a win-win proposal for all - the learner, the corporation, and the clientele served by the organization.

**Winfred, A. Jr. & et al. (2003)** used meta-analytic procedures to study the association between specified training plan and appraisal features and the effectiveness of training in business corporations. The choice of assessment criteria is a primary decision that must be made when evaluating the effectiveness of training. As a result of the inclusion criteria, an initial data set of 1,152 data points from 165 sources was obtained. Some of the data points were dependent. Various effect sizes or data points are dependent if they are computed from data collected from the same sample of participants. Kirkpatrick’s (1959, 1976, and 1996) evaluation criteria (i.e., reaction, learning, behavioral, and results) were used for evaluation. Authors identified specified preparing plan and assessment features and then used meta-analytic procedures to empirically assess their relationships to the effectiveness of training in organizations. Their results suggest that the training method used, the skill or task characteristic trained, and the choice of training evaluation criteria are related to the observed effectiveness of training programmes. Training organizers will find the information accessible here is of some value in making informed choices and decisions in the plan, accomplishment, and evaluation of managerial training projects.

**Paul, A.K. and Anantharaman, R.N. (2003)** research study based on Indian software companies, was an attempt to develop and test a causal model linking human assets management with organizational performance through an intervening process. They took a sample of software companies of India. Companies with 1,000 or more employees belonged to large scale and those with fewer than 1,000 belonged to small-scale groups. And multinational companies were taken as they are because they were
very few in number. The sample consisted of only those companies that were started in 1996 or before and companies that were based in Bangalore or Chennai. Bangalore was selected because it has been recognized as the Silicon Valley of India and has the highest number of software companies in comparison with other parts of the country. Chennai was selected because of its proximity to Bangalore, rapid growth in software sector and convenience for data collection. The study has found that not even a solitary HR practice has direct causal association with organizational monetary execution. In the meantime, it has been found that every HRM practice under study has an indirect impact on the operational and budgetary execution of the association. Further, HRM practices such as training; job plan, remuneration and motivating forces straightforwardly influence the operational performance parameters, viz., employee retention, employee profitability, product quality, velocity of delivery and working cost. In this study, organizational execution was measured in two measurements: operational performance and financial performance. Operational performance was characterized in terms of employee retention, employee profitability, product quality, velocity of delivery and working cost. Financial performance was a single develop measured in terms of growth in sales, net profit and return on investment from year 1997 to 2000. Market value was not taken into account because many software companies were not listed in the money market. Henceforth the development in business esteem computation was unrealistic.

Alvarez, K. & et al. (2004) surveyed 10 years of training assessment and preparing adequacy exploration to build an incorporated model of both. This model coordinates four earlier assessment models and consequences of 10 years of training viability research. Assessment measures discovered to be identified with post-training behavior were intellectual learning, preparing execution, and exchange execution. Preparing adequacy variables discovered to be identified with post-preparing states of mind were pre-training self-viability, experience, post-preparing dominance introduction, learning standards, and post-preparing mediations. By and large, 10 preparation viability variables were found to reliably impact training results. Results additionally uncover that response measures and preparing inspiration are two regions requiring further improvement and exploration. Creators presumed that, the utilization of a
consolidated model of training assessment and viability may offer a more extensive and successful system for preparing assessment.

**Parivallal, M. (2004)** observed in his research report that evaluation of the training programme should have entry and exit test to test the entry behavior and quantum of improvement gained from the training programme. During the training programme, a multiple-choice test could also be conducted in order to test the participants’ level of understanding the conceptual theories.

**Roark, S.J. & et al. (2006)** in their exploratory study examined the evaluation processes, evaluation tools, and problems of evaluating training programmes experienced by four medium-sized industries. The data was collected through four medium-sized organizations: a financial institution, a healthcare provider, a stationery distributor, and a plastic film manufacturer in a town in Indiana. The mid-sized business organizations were selected based on the IT Business Edge (2006) classification. Each selected private company was among the largest employers in the city. The organizations participating in the study had separate training departments that conduct in-house training. Respondents were asked questions on the evaluation process, tools, and training evaluation problems encountered within their organizations. The procedures for evaluating training compared in this study originated from a convenience sample of four different organizations in different industries. The organizations conducted on-the-job training programmes, but differed on the extent of evaluation, evaluation processes, and evaluation tools used. With the exception of the healthcare provider, the evaluation processes at the two other organizations were generic and covered mainly levels one and two of Kirkpatrick’s model. The training departments were concerned with the poor level of financial support. While insufficient economic support interferes with the quality of training programmes, it is a source for poor or inadequate evaluations. Therefore, business associations expecting training programmes to have a meaningful impact cannot afford to ignore the insufficient budget concerns and should commit adequate resources to training and evaluation. The trainers in this study expressed lack of expertise in evaluating training programmes and analyzing assessment information; therefore, training is needed in conducting effective evaluations. With so much
debate on effectiveness of evaluation strategies, a carefully developed evaluation plan that utilizes various tools may yield better results for an organization. To assist trainers with proper training evaluation techniques, more studies highlighting effective evaluation processes and evaluation tools are recommended.

**Bunch, K.J. (2007)** investigates the relationship between training disappointment and the indications of different levels of hierarchical society. Numerous researchers have considered the reasons for fizzled preparing for a considerable length of time, concentrating on issues, for example, systems, project outline, and learner attributes. Author figured out that at the authoritative level, training fizzles in no less than four ways: (a) untalented specialists give imperfect intercessions; (b) talented experts give defective mediations on the grounds that they don't have the force or impact to plan a legitimate project; (c) gifted professionals give substantial mediations, yet learning does not exchange to the employment; (d) talented specialists give legitimate intercessions that deliver positive exchange, however viability is not saw. At last, preparing adequacy relies on upon the force and status of the calling. Vital to overcoming predisposition against preparing and HRD is enhancing the picture of HRD.

**Barge, G. La (2007)** applied a novel approach to the use of pre- and post-testing was used to take the element of guessing at answers to test questions out of this method to better quantifying knowledge gained by participants in a workshop. The Soil Fertility Workshop was presented at six locations in Ohio during 2002 and 2003. Workshop participants included farmers, chemical/fertilizer dealers, and crop consultants, including those with Certified Crop Advisor certifications. Pre- and post-tests consisting of 13 matched true/false and multiple choice questions were designed to test similar areas of knowledge with each pre-/post-question set. The participants were asked to complete and turn in the pre-test before any instruction began. The post-test was collected at the workshop conclusion. The approach showed a 10% increase in knowledge gained by participants over the traditional method of tallying pre-/post-test. The method also provides instructor feedback to improve the workshop content and allow him or her to better gauge the time needed for programme components,
measure confidence in answers, and identify where incorrect answers are actually thought to be correct by participants.

**Moira Dunworth (2007)** in his study of employment-based social work training in one UK agency suggests that it has led to improved knowledge, better social work skills and the development of more reflective practice both by the individual worker and in the wider team and workplace. Although a proportion of staff moved posts after qualification, 84% of this was within the agency and managers were happy that staff carried their new learning culture with them to the benefit of the agency as a whole. Readiness to practice was assessed through views of fitness for the key social work roles and there was a high level of agreement that the training contributed to this fitness. Although the population size was only 36 the response rate was high (94%). This study aimed to explore the effectiveness of the training within Hamblin’s (1974) framework of Levels of evaluation, specifically examining changes in relation to practice with clients and whether the training met the organizational goals. It is set in the context of previous research, but this case study is unique in that the students mostly worked in the same roles before, during and after their training. Although base-line measurements were not available, this study attempted to measure changes in knowledge, skills and attitudes and to gauge whether these changes could be attributed to the training, and, if so, to what elements of that training. A clear thread emerged through the responses of staff and their managers suggesting that the knowledge of the law gained on the programme was a positive outcome and enabled staff to improve their practice with, and on behalf of, clients. Additionally staff and their managers considered that the programme enabled staff to be more reflective in their practice and to encourage that in their colleagues. An increased commitment to training within the organization was noted by managers and senior managers, as was a greater participation in the wider work of the agency.

**Tziner, A. et al (2007)** makes an attempt to predict training effectiveness (training grade, supervisor evaluation of the application of training) in a large industrial company. Six employee characteristics (conscientiousness, self-efficacy, inspiration to learn, learning goal orientation, performance goal orientation, instrumentality) and one work environment characteristic (transfer of training climate) were captured for
130 trainees. All of them attended a two-month in-house training programme aimed at maintaining and upgrading technical–professional knowledge. A questionnaire designed to measure the trainee and environmental variables was administered to the participants about a week after commencement of the training programme. The results strongly support the predicted links, although not all the predictor variables contributed a statistically significant share of the explained variance of the training outcomes. Motivation to learn and learning goal orientation were found to contribute most to predicting training outcomes.

Jones, M.K. & et al. (2008) analyses the relationship between training, job satisfaction and workplace performance using the 2004 British Workplace Employee Relations Survey (WERS) 2004, a national survey of British workplaces with 5 or more employees. The survey covers establishments from all industry sectors except for establishments engaged in primary industries and private households with domestic staff (7 per cent of all workplaces). Several measures of performance are analyzed including absence, quits, financial performance, labour productivity and product quality using ordered probit and tobit estimation procedures. While there is clear evidence that training is positively associated with job satisfaction and job satisfaction in turn is positively associated with most measures of performance, the relationship between performance and training is more complicated. With the relationships depending on the features of training and measure of performance considered. Thus, employers may be able to improve establishment performance by increasing the volume of training and taking action to raise the job satisfaction of the workforce, but to succeed in this they also need to pay attention to the quantity and type of training offered.

Greenberg, D. and Cebulla, A. (2008) utilizes the devices of meta-investigation to survey cost–benefit investigations of 50 compulsory welfare-to-work programs that were focused at Aid for Families with Dependent Children beneficiaries and assessed by arbitrary task. Meta-investigation is a quantitative way to deal with incorporating discoveries from different studies, which comprises of a group of measurable systems. 39 all the more particularly, these procedures are utilized as a part of this article to orchestrate discoveries from different cost–benefit assessments of welfare-to-work
programs. The discoveries recommend that the expenses of a run of the mill assessed welfare-to-work program most likely surpassed its advantages from the point of view of the legislature, yet those appointed to the system, and potentially society all in all, may harvest little positive net advantages. On the other hand, individual projects are exceptionally cost valuable. The discoveries recommend that less fruitful projects may be made more cost-gainful by dropping professional preparing and fundamental instruction as system segments, leaving primarily lower expense parts, for example, commanded employment inquiry and assents, additionally potentially the all the more unreasonable money related motivators. The focal finding of this meta-investigation is that welfare-to-work programs regularly fail the cost–benefit test from the administration point of view or the societal viewpoint. The net advantages of these projects could be enhanced by stressing lower expense system benefits close by budgetary motivations.

**Heracleous, L., Wirtz, J. and Pangarkar, N. (2008)** explore the nature of Singapore Airline’s human resource (HR) management practices that enable the company to deliver consistent service excellence in an efficient manner and achieve sustainable competitive advantage. The paper presents an in-depth case study based on primary and secondary data, and especially in-depth interviews of senior management and senior flight crew. The study finds that Singapore Airlines’ HR practices involve stringent selection and recruitment processes, extensive training and retraining, successful service delivery teams, empowerment of front-line staff to control service quality, and motivating staff through rewards and recognition. The paper contributes to the understanding of how HR practices contribute to service excellence and competitive advantage, this being a key dimension of strategic alignment.

**Jones, Melanie K. (2008)** analyses the relationship between training, job satisfaction and workplace performance using the British 2004 Workplace Employee Relations Survey (WERS), a national survey of British workplaces with 5 or more employees. From each workplace an interview is conducted with the senior fellow at the workplace with day-to-day accountability for industrial relations, employee relations or personnel matters. Authors consider two sets of measures of job satisfaction for analysis. The first six direct measures of job satisfaction are achievement, initiative,
influence, training, pay, work it. The second is a set of indirect measures including shared values, loyalty, pride, development, fairness. Various measures of performance are analyzed including absence, quits, financial performance, labor productivity and product quality. While there is clear evidence that training is positively associated with job satisfaction and job satisfaction in turn is positively related with most measures of performance, the relationship between training and performance is complex, depending on both the particular measures of training and of performance used in the analysis. However, employers may be able to improve organization performance by increasing the volume of training and taking action to raise the job satisfaction of the workforce, but to succeed in this they also need to pay attention to the quantity and type of training offered. Training of less than two days appears to have no beneficial effect on financial performance, productivity or product quality, though between one and two days does appear to lower quit and absence rates. Only when training covers a large proportion of the workforce does it appear to have beneficial effects on financial performance and productivity.

**Indira, A. (2008)** directed an assessment of the "Effect Assessment of the Training Programs" of a National Level Training Institution in India utilizing the Kirkpatrick Method (KP Method). The contemplated Institution takes up exploration, gives preparing, offers consultancy and starts activity in the rustic part of India. The assessment study utilized a definite poll for directing a review on the whole populace of members who went to the preparation programs in the chose study period. Individual meetings and workshops were likewise directed with respondents to comprehend the behavioral changes and results found in the workplace. The study drew out the need to comprehend the preparation assessment as a constant procedure, obliging occasional survey and examination of the needs of the different divisions of provincial advancement. It emphasized the need to build up an efficient assessment transform inside of the foundation. It likewise demonstrated that the provincial improvement experts experiencing preparing themselves were quick to take part in the assessment handle in order to help during the time spent self-learning and achieve supportable changes.
Aguinis, H. and Kraiger, K. (2009) in their article provides a review of the training and development literature since the year 2000. Authors review the literature focusing on the benefits of training and development for individuals and teams, organizations, and society. They adopt a multidisciplinary, multilevel, and global perspective to demonstrate that training and development activities in work organizations can produce important benefits for each of these stakeholders. Authors also review the literature on needs assessment and pre-training states, training design and delivery, training evaluation, and transfer of training to identify the conditions under which the benefits of training and development are maximized. Finally, they identify research gaps and offer directions for future research. Some of the suggestions are, the benefits of training may have a cascading effect such that individual-level benefits (e.g., individual performance) affect team-level benefits (i.e., team performance), which in turn affect organizational (i.e., profitability) and societal (i.e., human capital) outcomes. However, future research is needed to understand the factors that facilitate a smooth cross-level transfer of benefits. Second, a gap exists between the applied and scholarly literatures regarding the use of cycle time as a variable to assess training effectiveness. Third, although the role of affect has been acknowledged in the measurement of reactions to training, affect has the potential to play a more central role in the training process in general. Finally, this review identifies the need to study moderators, including moderators of the relationship between behavior modeling and training outcomes etc.

Smidt, A. & et al. (2009) used Kirkpatrick model for training evaluation in the health industry. Services employing staff to support people with disability usually provide training in a range of areas including communication and managing challenging behavior. Given that such training can be costly and time-consuming, it is important to evaluate the evidence presented in support of such programmes. Efficacy in clinical practice is measured using evidence-based practice. In this study six studies published in the last decade that reported the outcomes of communication-based training and six that reported on the outcomes of challenging behavior training were evaluated using the 4-level Kirkpatrick model. They concluded that the Kirkpatrick model provides one technique for appraisal of the evidence for any reported training programme and could be used to evaluate whether a training programme is likely to meet the needs
and requirements of both the organization implementing the training and the staff who will participate.

Nikandrou, I., Vassiliki, B and Bereri, E. (2009) introduce an experimental study in light of a learner situated systemic model for preparing exchange. The paper inspects learner attributes which influence the inspiration to learn and exchange and focus the students’ entrance conduct. At that point, amid the preparation handle, the unpredictable communications among the coach, the students and the substance and system utilized are considered to evaluate what are here termed immediate and circuitous preparing exchange. At long last, hierarchical components influencing both the preparation exchange and the student him/herself are analyzed. The authors utilized 44 as a part of insightfulness meetings with students from distinctive associations who took an interest in a preparation program that was taking into account an inventive experiential training strategy (venture system). The outcomes uncover the significance of learner attributes in the preparation exchange handle and give valuable bits of knowledge with respect to the outline and administration of the preparation program. The subjective technique utilized is an in number component of this study as it gives rich data with respect to the preparation exchange process. The examination outlines system, i.e. talking with learners one year after the preparation occurred, uncovered imperative elements influencing the preparation exchange process.

Pineda, P. (2010) presents an assessment model that has been fruitfully applied in the Spanish context that integrates all training dimensions and impact, to act as a global tool for organizations. The model analyses satisfaction, learning, instructive aspects, transfer, impact and profitability of training projects, and is therefore a global model. The approach is theoretical, and the methodology used involves a review of previous evaluation models and their improvement by comparing their application in practice. An analysis of pedagogical aspects enables training professionals to improve training quality, as they are able to identify any weaknesses in elements, such as training design, needs analysis and training implementation, and improve on them. In fact, the quality of these elements depends entirely on the training professional. The author has applied the model successfully in several public and private organizations, in industry
and in the services sector, which demonstrates its usefulness and viability in evaluating the results of training. Therefore, this evaluation model has interesting and practical implications, as a useful tool for training managers for evaluating training results, as well as providing a global simplified approach to the composite evaluation function. Author concluded that beyond the gross value of the results provided by an evaluation, one cannot forget the positive effects that it has on individuals and the organization as a whole. Evaluation always presents an prospect for progress, and this represents added value to be exploited. Thus, there are many benefits to training evaluation. All that is needed is to set to work to achieve them.

Katou, A. A. and Budhwar, P. S. (2010), investigate the HRM-performance causal relationship in the Greek context. The empirical research is based on a sample of 178 organizations operating in the Greek manufacturing sector. Using structural equation modeling the results of the study revealed that the ability to perform (resourcing and development), motivation to perform (compensation and incentives), and opportunity to perform (involvement and job design) HRM policy domains are moderated by business strategies (cost, quality, innovation), and additionally, the motivation to perform is further moderated by managerial style and organizational culture. Further, the results indicate that the impact of HRM policies on organizational performance is fully mediated by employee skills, attitudes, and behavior. The paper concludes that although the motivation to perform HRM policy domain causes organizational performance, through employee attitudes, it may be supported that organizational performance positively moderates the effectiveness of this HRM policy domain, raising thus the question of reverse causality.

Guerci, M., Bartezzaghi, E. and Solari, L. (2010) Corporate universities have emerged as a system for providing organizations with a wide variety of training and development activities. They are a recent but under-researched experience, and given their substantial budgets, it might be expected that they would wish to evaluate what they do. The authors explore the evaluation practices of six Italian corporate universities, paying particular attention to the means by which these practices are tailored to the requirements of the various stakeholders. Stakeholder-based assessment provides the theoretical framework for the study. The literature suggests that much
assessment of preparing focuses on a single stakeholder, the shareholder, and that practice draws heavily on Kirkpatrick’s hierarchical model. In the context of the corporate university, however, the authors find that multi-stakeholder evaluation is used in practice. Moreover, various aspects of corporate university performance were evaluated, and data were supplied to stakeholders depending on the nature of their involvement. Stakeholder-based assessment is argued to be a constructive system where there are a number of stakeholders, but training evaluation models other than the hierarchical one are needed if all relevant training factors are to be evaluated.

**Chang, Ya-Hui E., (2010)** in his study examined Kirkpatrick’s training evaluation model (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2006) by assessing a sales training programme conducted at an organization in the hospitality industry. The study assessed the employees’ training outcomes of knowledge and skills, job performance, and the impact of the training upon the organization. By assessing these training outcomes and their relationships, the study demonstrated whether Kirkpatrick’s theories are supported and the lower evaluation levels can be used to predict organizational impact. The population for this study was a group of reservations sales agents from a leading luxury hotel chain’s reservations center. The number of reservations sales agents who had completed a sales preparing intervention during this period and had information available for at least two months before and after training composed the sample for this study. The number of agents was 69 (N = 69). Four hypotheses were tested through paired-samples t tests, correlation, and hierarchical regression analytic procedures. Outcomes from the analyses supported the hypotheses for the study. The important improvement in the call score supported hypothesis one that the reservations sales agents who completed the training improved their knowledge of content and required skills in handling calls (Level 2). Hypothesis two was accepted in part as there was significant improvement in call conversion, but there was no significant improvement of time usage. The significant improvement in the sales per call supported hypothesis three that the reservations agents who completed the training contributed to increased organizational impact (Level 4), i.e., made significantly more sales. Last, findings supported hypothesis four that Level 2 and Level 3 variables can be used for predicting Level 4 organizational impact. The results supported the theory of Kirkpatrick’s training asessment model that in order
to expect organizational results, a positive change in behavior (job performance) and learning must occur. The examinations of Levels 2 and 3 helped to somewhat explain and predict Level 4 results.

Ng, I. and Dastmalchian, A. (2011) examine the link between training and the perceived contribution of training to enhanced productivity or cost reduction. Using data from 92 Canadian organizations, the results show that organizations with higher percentage of trained employees are likely to perceive training to be beneficial. In addition, the results indicate that perceived benefits of training are further enhanced by the presence of human resources management practices that either encourages employees to undertake training (the motivation bundle) and/or provides a systematic assessment of post-training effectiveness (the assessment bundle). The evidence however also shows that open climate as measured by autonomous work systems nullifies the benefits of training, suggesting that under such a structure, employees are unlikely to put in practice the skills they acquired during training. This study should be treated only as a partial study of training bundles, because we did not examine other factors such as individual characteristics and instructional methods used. As shown in the training literature, these factors play an equally important role in influencing training effectiveness.

Islam, MD. S. (2011) recognizes that even after the recent financial condense, while it was very complicated for the associations to maintain sustainability, Life Insurance Corporation of India (LICI), a public insurance company, still, with huge number of personnel maintaining its sustainability year after year without retrenching any employee. In this paper, researchers have strongly felt that proper training and strategic application of knowledge & expertise can contribute to financial health and overall efficiency of the organization. The data for this research has been collected both from primary and secondary sources. Primary data has been collected through a survey of 50 employees of LICI in Kolkata, West Bengal, India. The questionnaire consisted with 11 attributes close-ended questions where the respondents have given their view against 5 point likert scale. Author concluded that training is effective in LICI on an overall basis from the point of view of Reaction, Learning, Behavior and Results (Kirkpatrick Model). Contrarily, variation of degree of effectiveness of
training across different Age Groups is insignificant. Distinction of degree of effectiveness of training across different Service Tenure is insignificant. Out of all agents, respondents in age group of 25-35 felt that they have gained from training to the maximum extent. However, Agents should be given on job training apart from product training. It will help them to identify the real picture. Company should focus on the regular training system through web and other media, which saves time as well as cost effective.

Selva, M.K. and Priyan, J.V. (2011) has done a comparative study of Public and Private Life Insurance Companies in India. Life insurance companies deal in intangible products. With the entry of private players, the competition is becoming intense. In this research paper, an attempt is made to analyze the performance of public and private life insurance companies in India. An attempt is made to analyze whether there is any significant difference in the growth of fresh business premium, number of new policies issued and total life insurance premium among public and private life insurance companies or not. For this purpose, Mann-Whitney-U was applied. It makes it possible to work with very small samples. It requires less restrictive assumptions concerning the level of data measurement. It is used to determine whether there is any significant difference between the two independent samples, and each from one population is used. Life insurance has today become a mainstay of any market economy since it offers plenty of scope for garnering large sums of money for long periods of time. Though privatization of the insurance sector is feared to affect the prospects of the LIC, the study shows that the LIC continues to dominate the sector. Private sector insurance companies also tried to increase their market share.

Truitt, D.L. (2011) in his study investigate hypothesis, that employees with training experiences have positive attitudes about training (training attitudes), and the second hypothesis, positive training attitudes are perceived to improve job proficiency. The study explores the relationships between training experiences and attitudes and attitudes about perceived job proficiency. The initial sample for this study totaled 487 full-time exempt/salaried and nonexempt/hourly employees from one academic institution and three businesses in the states of Maryland, Delaware, and Arizona. The
total number of surveys returned was 237, yielding a response rate of 48.6%. Random sampling techniques were employed to arrive at a representative sample of each division of interest. The author finds a direct relationship between one’s positive training experiences and attitudes and one’s proficiency. In this study, 86.8% of those who had updated training had the most positive attitudes toward training ($\gamma = .293$, $p < .05$). Furthermore, 80% of those who had negative training attitudes also had negative views on their proficiency ($\gamma = .465$, $p < .000$). The results of this study support the hypotheses. The gamma calculations found strong significant associations between those employees who fully agreed that they had updated training and subsequent positive training attitudes, as well a feeling of increased job proficiency. The results also showed that those employees who fully agreed that they received effective coaching and those who fully agreed they received meaningful coaching felt they demonstrated an increase in job proficiency.

**Verma, S. & Goyal, R. (2011)** in their paper dissects the status of different training and advancement hones in Life Insurance Corporation in India and investigates the proposed connection between the preparation and workers profitability. The study makes utilization of measurable methods, for example, mean, standard deviation, and Z test. Correlation analysis and regression analysis to process and examination the information gathered for this study. The outcome demonstrated that the Training in Life Insurance Corporation is normal and the view of workers with respect to the Training and Development don't contrast essentially. The paper closes by offering valuable proposals to the administration included in the operations of the companies. A percentage of the proposals are-it is imperative that supervisors, senior official, and in addition all workers get preparing; and that any preparation/administration advancement which happens is in light of legitimate investigation of its commitment to the adequacy and proficiency of an association.

**Saad, A.M. & Mat, N.B.** in their study review the model of training effectiveness for the adoption by the human resources development executives in their planning, designing and implementation training programme. Authors found that some establishments do not have reliable job descriptions, the connection between training function and other personnel functions such as succession and career planning must
be streamlined to facilitate proper synergy to take place. Other notable barrier may be political or structural in nature. To overcome this barrier training must be defined in term of either training based on poor performance or defined based on organizational objectives, although both directly related. Improvement in training effectiveness can directly be facilitated by the following, employee’s awareness of objectives of training courses, continuity of training, and application of training in the work place and proper implementation of the programme.

**Cowman, M. and McCarthy, A.** feels that there is a lack of empirical longitudinal studies employing theoretically valid instruments which assess the effectiveness of training and development on the individual and the organization. It involves the collection of data at a variety of levels in order to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of HRD interventions and assess their impact upon individuals and the organization. Given this cursory but rather bleak review of training and development evaluation practice, this paper discusses the challenges of training and development evaluation. Sector specific factors are believed to be important in terms of evaluating training and development. The paper explores the case of the health care sector in proposing a multi-level, multi-stakeholder training and development evaluation model. This model provides a hypothetical framework for investigating HRD in the Health Care sector. The measures and indicators for each proposed outcome can be identified and defined by the stakeholders within each context. The model needs to be empirically tested to assess its validity, reliability and practicality.

**O’Connor, P. (2011)** in his study of Bridge resource management (BRM) preparing in the civilian maritime industry, an assessment of the effectiveness of the U.S. Navy’s BRM preparing was carried out by assessing the attitudes toward, and knowledge of, the human factors that are responsible to accidents in high-risk associations. A comparison was made between surface warfare officers (SWOs) who had and had not attended BRM training. It was concluded that the Navy’s BRM training is not having the impact on knowledge and attitudes. It is proposed that the main reason for the lack of effectiveness of the BRM programme is that the content of the training was not based on needs assessment carried out within the surface warfare community. The temptation to adapt a crew resource management (CRM) programme
developed in one domain and applies it in another must be resisted by developers of CRM training. This practice risks the development of unproductive training programme that fails to impact operator performance. The design and delivery of training is a science.

**Ghosh, P. at el. (2011)** assess diverse parameters of a prompting system directed by a transmission and dispersion real in India. The study intends to demonstrate which parts of the preparation project should be underscored when formulating impelling system for supervisors and non-chief, and to find out whether there is any noteworthy distinction in their responses. Assessment has been finished with the assistance of student response measured by a poll. The measurable devices utilized incorporate element examination to create elements that impact student fulfillment and a t-test to test the speculation that there will be a huge contrast in the middle of administrative and non-administrative levels in their fulfillment with diverse parts of the project. Component investigation created six elements, to be specific clarity of mentor, different offices, venue of the project, nourishment served, down to earth application, and correspondence of coach. The t-test keeps running on these components demonstrates a huge distinction in means for one and only variable, to be specific correspondence of mentor, which suggests that administrators could relate better to the coach, given their scholarly prevalence. The discoveries could help in building up a prompting project tweaked to addressing the needs of chiefs and non-directors. Also, to manufacture solid combination of both that expands the fulfillment levels of the two gatherings.

**Singh, R. and Mohanty, M. (2012)** studies the impact of training interventions on employee productivity. The sample includes firms from various sectors with a minimum of 1000 employees for the last financial year. In this study, the industries from various sectors like Automobile, Agricultural, Service (Insurance), Financial Services (Credit Banks) and Luxury Items FMCGs (Branded Wall Paints) were chosen. The data was collected from two different sources primary and secondary. Employee productivity was calculated from number of employees and total sales/turnover for the financial year for individual companies and then it was consolidated industry/sector wise. In conclusion, authors said that taken as a whole,
the research outcomes are diverse. Some studies have found a positive relationship, some negative and some no association whatsoever. Comparison and analysis suggest that there definitely exist a relation between these two but the impact and effect of training practices on employee productivity varies for different industry. There are other determinants of employee productivity which are not focused in this research.

Onkham, W. & et al. (2012) presents the literature review of human total ownership cost (HTOC) and cost impacts on overall system performance. Economic value assessment models such as cost benefit analysis, risk-cost tradeoff analysis, expected value of utility function analysis (EV), growth readiness matrix, multi-attribute utility technique, and multi-regressions model were introduced to reflect the HTOC and human performance technology tradeoffs in terms of the dollar value. Financial costs of investing in people is associated with training, acquisition, recruiting, and resolving human errors have a significant impact on increased total ownership costs. These costs can also affect the exaggerate budgets and delayed schedules. The study of human performance economical assessment in the system acquisition process enhances the visibility of hidden cost drivers which support programme management informed decisions. The human total ownership regression model introduces to address the influencing human performance cost component measurement. According to economic models, cost benefit analysis can reflect the human performance and learning curve in term of cost of investment, and risk-cost tradeoff analysis can illustrate the tradeoff between cost of technology and human performance. Authors illustrated the preliminary regression model of HTOC which considers the human factor aspect, human reliability, and technology and environment factors. However, the major limitation is the lack of database in term of quantitative data and metrics associated with these factors is still questionable. Therefore, there are no specific economic models that can quantify the human soft cost drivers (subjective components) such as human factors aspects (cognition, physical, perceptual, skill and knowledge). Since the HTOC has involved within various variables and high degree of complexity, the preliminary model may not be the universal model to implement all organization needs. Instead, the multi-regression model can be conducted upon organization objectives.
Stanley, A. (2012) observed that Nigeria's oil industry has been criticized for its incapability to provide adequate services to the community. This criticism is predicated on the fact that the standards of productivity in their services are low and that their amenities are not working up to capacity. For improved performance, the employees require administrative and technological training. Based on the examination, the study determined the types of training programme that existed in the Nigeria's Oil Industry, the instruments used for the identification of training and development needs and the factors that influenced selection of staff for training and development. The job performance of staff pre and post training, the application of professional skills of trained staff and the competence of staff to cope with changes before and after training were also investigated. To achieve these goals, data were collected with the aid of Nigeria's Oil Industry Training and Development Questionnaire (NOTTDQ). Simple random samplings of 400 trained workers were selected from NNPC, Shell and Chevron. The outcome shows that oil workers were offered training opportunities namely seminar, conference and workshop. Supervisory staff reports were used for identifying and selecting staff for training and development needs; nomination of staff for training was based mainly on low job performance. There were also training and development; training and appropriate deployment had positive effect on job performance and its inherent tasks. Based on these conclusions, suggestions were made for policy options to ensure effective staff training and development.

Kumar, P.V., Kumar, B.R. & Vidya Sagar, M. (2012) to show the key zones which Insurance associations ought to consider with a specific end goal to enhance the viability of training and advancement programs for workers, the authors completed an investigation of India-based private protection branches to recognize current assessment strategies, and distinguish the dominating obstructions to the execution of viable preparing and improvement programs. Easygoing components were discovered to be insufficient preparing and improvement destinations and assessment systems, which steam from various boundaries. This paper finishes up with a few suggestions for future strategy and zones of further research in the execution of training and improvement programmes in insurance associations.
Landry, A. (2012) set forward a subjective methodology for assessing the impacts of preparing expecting to forestall health and security issues at work. To assess the training, author utilized information from: preparing materials, records about activity, learners' fulfillment survey and what students said (verbalization) amid training, reports from the 4 gatherings taking after the preparation, and meetings with the mentors. A substance investigation of the diverse wellsprings of information was performed. The analyst utilized a subjective examination. This implies that the scientist makes an understanding of the information. The procedure of information examination includes seeming well and good out of content and picture Data. This includes creating classifications of data, selecting one of the classifications and situating it inside of a hypothetical model and explaining a story from the interconnection of these classes. Assessment results give input about hindrances and drivers in the preparation usage setting. Hindrances are those components, which undermine the execution of activity and the creation of results while drivers, and then again, help to enhance preparing and produce beneficial outcomes. Creator inferred that the assessment set up additionally gives helpful data about the connections between the preparation procedure and the outcomes delivered in work circumstances.

Salas, E. et al. (2012) said that Organizations in the United States alone spend billions on training each year. These training and development activities allow organizations to adapt, compete, excel, innovate, produce, be safe, improve service, and reach goals. However, training is not as intuitive as it may seem. There is a science of training that shows that there is a right way and a wrong way to design, deliver, and implement a training programme. The research on training clearly shows two things: (a) training works, and (b) the way training is designed, delivered, and implemented matters. This article aims to explain why training is important and how to use training appropriately. Using the training literature as a guide, authors explain what training is, why it is important, and provide recommendations for implementing a training programme in an organization. In particular, authors argue that training is a systematic process, and explains what matters before, during, and after training. Steps to take at each of these three time periods are listed and described and are summarized in a checklist for ease of use. Authors conclude with a discussion of implications for
both leaders and policymakers and an exploration of issues that may come up when deciding to implement a training programme.

**Al-Khathami, A.D. (2012)** in his medicinal exploration study said that assessment is not just a vital procedure for planning instructive training projects; however a compelling assessment methodology that helps accomplishes program targets and upgrades the nature of learning destinations. A self-regulated poll was composed taking into account Context, input, process and product (CIPP) organization to look for students' observations about the Saudi Diploma in Family Medicine (SDFM) program, which was sanctioned in 2007 to satisfy the needs of qualified Primary Health Care suppliers in Saudi Arabia. Creator recognizes the qualities and shortcomings of the SDFM program in connection to the learning results; and characterizes the principle hindrances to accomplish the results. The SDFM program students were incorporated. An aggregate of 34 learners were drawn nearer, 31 of them reacted with a complete survey. There were 70% non-Saudi learners, from diverse Arab nations. The study reaction rate was 91.2%. More than 77% of the students expressed that they had accomplished the system targets; a huge distinction was found among Saudis and non-Saudis (p=0.002). The preparation period was accounted for by 84% as a fundamental hindrance to accomplish the system goals, especially the doctor's facility revolution period. Results show a general fulfillment with the preparation goals and the showing routines utilized. These discoveries can be valuable for the strategy creators to actualize the proposed proposals and manage obstructions to enhance the SDFM program keeping in mind the end goal to give compelling and proficient essential consideration administrations.

**Ozudogru, F. and Ozudogru, M.(2012)** in their research study analyze the effectiveness of internal training interventions for teachers in Turkey. In Turkey there is a lot of that catering to the needs of teachers in elementary and secondary schools. Determining the effectiveness of in-service training programmes and reflecting on possible improvements is of great benefit. This study was based on this need and 35 studies were analyzed. According to research findings, the positive results are more than the negative results; however, there are a lot of points to develop in that training that are arranged in Turkey. The research findings also revealed that teachers’ views
as the participant were mostly preferred for the evaluation of internal training in Turkey. From the finding, it can also be suggested that assessment conducted to determine the effectiveness of these training projects should be applied not only at the end of the process but also throughout the programme.

**Deros, B.M. et al (2012)** in his study evaluate the effectiveness of training programmes conducted by Company X on Malaysian Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs). This study evaluates participants’ perceptions with respect to the overall training programme, teaching materials, delivery methods, equipment and facilitators through a postal survey. Analysis of the postal survey results shows the training programmes conducted by Company X had generated positive impact to the organizations and their employees. In addition, training programmes gives positive impacts to the organizations with respect to improved competitiveness, business growth, market share development, increased annual sales and profit. In conclusion, the training courses provided by Company X are very useful and can be further improved to assist SMEs to be more progressive and competitive in national and international market place.

**Rahman, M.H. & Rahman A. (2013)** studies worker perceptions towards training system. The point of this paper is to uncover how the current preparing and administration improvement project is seen by representatives. In this exploration, representatives from five particular banks in the private segment out of 47 booked business banks in Bangladesh have been picked in light of accommodation as a specimen. Both graphic and experimental study have been directed to recognize distinctive measurements of preparing and improvement projects of the banks, for example, number of projects gave, sorts of preparing routines, length of system, preparing spot and format, ability and information of coaches, proclamation of preparing goal and substance to the students, utilization of gaining from preparing to the work place. This study is taking into account both primary and auxiliary information and the examination cover the passage and mid-level administrators from diverse branches of the Private Commercial Banks in Dhaka city. Five point likert scales have been intended to evaluate suitability and speculations have been detailed and also a Z-test utilized as a part of request to get test populaces' legitimate judgment
towards the administration improvement project of the Private Commercial Banks in Bangladesh. This examination has found that regardless of the fact that banks mastermind a satisfactory number of preparing projects and distribute time with the end goal of overhauled Knowledge, Skills and Attitude (KSA), most of the respondents accept that they are neglecting to contribute due come back to their association because of flawed training and administration improvement frameworks.

**Percival, J.C., Cozzarin, B.P. and Formaneck, S.D. (2013)** realized that one of the central problems in managing technological change and maintaining a competitive advantage in business is improving the skills of the workforce through investment in human capital and a variety of training practices. Their study explores the evidence on the impact of training investment on productivity in 14 Canadian industries from 1999 to 2005. Our productivity analysis demonstrates that in 12 out of 14 industries, training had a positive effect on productivity. However, when the analysis is put within a financial context, the return on investment was positive in only four industries. Faced with negative rates of return, why should managers in most of the industries in the study promote investment in training? Probably the best explanation is that new technology requires an investment in training. The outlay in training is necessary just for the organization to maintain its current labor profitability. Employee turnover necessarily impedes the efficacy of training, because trained workers leave, and untrained workers arrive. Thus, training in this instance again is necessary just to maintain current labor productivity.

**O’Malley et al. (2013)** provides evidence on the cost and cost-effectiveness of global training programmes. This manager’s guide to cost effectiveness analysis (CEA) is for professionals who want to recognize and support high quality CEA. It focuses on CEA of training in the context of programme implementation or rapid programme expansion. CEA provides cost per outcome. To create an evidence base on CEA of training, more well-designed analyses and data on the cost of training are needed. Analysts should understand more about how capacity is built, how quality is improved within a health facility, and the costs associated with them. Considering the life of an investment in training, evaluations are needed on how many trainees apply the skills taught, how long trainees continue to apply them, and how long the content
of the training conforms to national or international guidelines. A CEA can guide programme managers to make the best investments in training. Better data on effectiveness of training is also needed. It is feasible to measure effectiveness by performance standards, or intermediate outcomes and coverage. Intermediate outcomes and coverage can also be combined with published estimates on performance.

Renganayaki, N. (2013) accesses the impact of training on the employees in SRF Ltd Viralimalai, Trichy, Tamil Nadu, India. To achieve this objective, a sample of 90 members was randomly selected out of the 300 employees. The statistical technique used was chi square test. Association between age, educational qualification, experience of respondents and their various training impact evaluation dimensions are checked with chi-square test. Simple percentage method was used in analyzing the questions which were presented in a tabular form. The findings are that modern training brought changes in the attitudes of the employees, a rise in job satisfaction level, productivity, reduction of absenteeism/turn over, employees’ performance and organization’s growth. It is suggested that evaluation of training should be treated not only as a corrective measure for the existing training programmes but also as a proactive measure for making future training programmes more effective. To conclude, today, more than ever, organizations are under pressure to keep pace with ever changing business scenarios. To stay afloat they must develop the competence to turn every challenge into an opportunity. Rigid method of technology must be given up.

Meghe, B., Bhise, P.V., Muley, A. (2013) said in their study that employee training is the important sub-system of human asset management. Their assessment study based on primary data with 100 respondents in CTPS (Chandrapur Thermal Power Station) operating at Maharashtra referring to Chandrapur was used to evaluate the training projects and its effectiveness, was scientifically summarized, tabulated and analyzed with the help of statistical tools like percentage and means. Evaluation of training and improvement practices was done by Kirkpatrick Model. In this research, a detailed questionnaire was prepared for conducting a survey on the entire population of participants who attended the training programmes in the selected study period. Personal interviews were conducted with respondents to understand the behavioral
changes and results seen in the work environment. The study attempts to highlight the perceptions of employees about the training and development. Overall evaluation factor indicates that 84% of the respondents have express happiness about the training programmes conducted by CTPS. The employees are satisfied by the support given by the management to improve the skills. Employees agreed that the goals of the training content are clear. It was interesting to note that, the respondents came up with the same kind of suggestions for evaluation as suggested under the KP model. Training should be more of on-job-training live but not off the job. The Head of the department should explain on the training programmes.

Smith, M., Stolder, M.E. and Liu, M.F. (2014) in their paper describes evaluation findings associated with an innovative, self-directed training programme that was designed to improve general practice nurses’ abilities to identify and care for older adults with depression. A voluntary sample of nurses completed an evaluation that focused on participants’ perceptions of changes in their knowledge and skills and usefulness of the programme. Authors concluded that quantitative items received high ratings, and narrative responses to open-ended questions were largely positive.

As can be seen from the existing literature, Kirkpatrick model has been the dominant model in training literature until the early 1990s when other researchers developing it by looking into successful application of it in the industry. Now widely recognized as the authority on measuring training effectiveness, his four level theory has since then gained worldwide popularity and is possibly the most widely used model for the evaluation of training and learning programmes. Kirkpatrick’s four-level model is now considered an industry standard across the HR and training communities. So before moving further let’s has a detail look on this model.
The Four Levels – A Brief Overview

Step 1: Reaction

**Participants’ Reaction**

Kirkpatrick likes to call this step a measure of customer satisfaction, which is because this step involves gathering feedback from the trainees about they felt about the training programme. This step is important because it evaluates the engagement level and hence the receptivity of your audience.

Step 2: Learning

**Learning**

By learning, Kirkpatrick means measuring the extent of change in the competency of the participant in terms of positive attitude change, improved knowledge and/or increase in skills as a result of attending the programme.
Step 3: Behavior

This step is intended to measure the degree to which the trainee has internalized the learning.

If no change in behavior is observed after training, the reaction and learning should be re-evaluated to check whether the training delivery or content was effective, if it was, then maybe the climate is not conducive to change.

Step 4: Result

The final evaluation of the training programme is measuring the final results that occurred because the participants attended the programme. The various metrics it includes could be increase in production, decline in costs, reduction in employee turnover, higher profits. It is on these results that the scope and future of the training
department depends on. It is important to mention here how pertinent it is to set objectives before the commencement of the training programme, if this is not done right, it becomes very difficult to determine just how effective the training was.

Researchers have not been successful at predicting results of higher levels from measures in lower levels. They argue that a model should allow the practitioners to make inferences. Nevertheless, the greatest strength of the Kirkpatrick’s model is its simplicity. Notwithstanding, this simplicity also led to a gap between the state-of-the-art and the state of the practice, which has been attributed to a lack of practical guidance on how to achieve measurement on each of the four levels. The application of ROI to training interventions was proposed by Phillips as a fifth level. Phillips mainly enhances Kirkpatrick’s model with systematic guidance to help organizations evaluate training in terms of ROI. Hence, more research in the field of training evaluation is necessary. In fact, evaluation is paramount to the success of any training programme. Training not only must be cost effective but also must teach participants skills and concepts that they can readily use in their organizations after the training has been completed. The focus of the training during the last decade has shifted from ‘training for survival’ to ‘training for success.’ Training, therefore, has to serve as a vehicle for change.

**Research gaps**

Human resource management (HRM) is the most important operational and functional area of the management and optimum utilization of human resources is one of the most important functions of any organization. The above review of literature explains that most of the studies on training evaluation are on evaluating the trainees’ reactions towards training. As can be seen from the existing literature, more research in the field of cost –effectiveness of training programmes is necessary. In fact, evaluation is paramount to the success of any training programme. Training not only must be cost effective but also must teach participants skills and concepts that they can readily use in their organizations after the training has been completed. It would be easy at this point to lament (express regret) once again the lack of training evaluation and yet again encourage practitioners to make use of evaluation methodologies. Instead, it may be time to ask new questions about the use of training evaluation practices. Most
of the studies on impacts of training programmes for employees talks about employees’ improvements benefits, but very few of them talks about the cost related factors of such training programmes. There is a shortage of research in this area, especially in India this area is almost untouched by academicians. The purpose of this study is to fill this apparent gap in the literature and will provide a base for future research(s).
References:


