

Chapter Four: Education Policy of India

Introduction:

Language is a means of gaining knowledge. Language is also an important medium of imparting education. There is not much difference between knowledge and education. They are co-related. Education leads to knowledge. Knowledge can be self driven. But education needs proper planning and policy which predefines set of rules, regulations and curriculum. For this institutions are involved for imparting education. Education helps in the process of socialization. Education plays an important role in molding the character and personality of a person. Education is a process of learning which can be done via language. The main problem is of deciding which language will be used as the medium of instruction. It is education which can bring national integration in a multilingual nation. Also education is a good means of maintaining multilingualism and maintaining national integration.

Language is not only a medium of imparting education but it is also a subject matter of education. In earlier days due importance was given to language instruction. Earlier the literary language was considered fit for imparting education. There was no place for vernaculars. The language of the common man was considered impure. So today's classical languages were used as a medium of instruction.

Education in India can be traced back to 3rd century B.C. At that time education was mostly imparted via Sanskrit language. Also the education mostly depended on caste hierarchy. Education was only confined to the upper caste people. There were two competing system of education the *pathashala* and *gurukul* (homes of teachers) system. It was when Buddhism spread in India, education became available to everyone and

this led to the establishment of some world famous educational institutions Nalanda, Vikramshila and Takshashila. There were two stages of education: the primary and the secondary. The language of the common people was given due importance at that time. “The medium of Buddhist education was the common language of the people.” (Jayapalan, 2005:22)

During the medieval period, the Muslims had *maktabs* (primary schools) and *madrassas* (for higher education) system. The medium was basically Persian and Arabic and even the Hindus adopted Persian in order to get jobs in the Mughal courts.

In every era vernaculars were considered not fit for imparting education. The world recognized the value of mother tongue only after the publication of the UNESCO Monograph on the use of the vernaculars in education in 1953.

According to the findings of UNESCO,

It is through his mother tongue that every human being first learns to formulate and express his ideas about himself and about the world in which he lives.

(Chaklader, 1990: p. 281)

May be the world recognized the value of mother tongue education after the publication of the UNESCO. But in India the struggle for giving due importance to mother tongue education can be traced back to the early 19th century.

“The Bombay education society expressed itself in favor of the native language as the medium of instruction as far back as 1821.” (Pattnayak, 1981:138-39).

When the British came to India, already India had many schools or *pathshalas*. The medium of instruction in these schools were Hindi, Urdu, Bengali, Sanskrit, Persian, Arabic, etc. “In Bengal alone, it is said, there were about the year 1835 a hundred thousand such pathshala.” (Singh Y K., 2007:56) In the early days the British didn't paid much attention on the education of the Indian masses. Thus education continued to be imparted through classical languages. The British government gave funds and rewards to students who pursued education in classical languages like Sanskrit, Arabic, Persian etc. Later on the missionaries started imparting education via English. “The missionaries used education as a means of evangelization. They propagated for the spread of Christian religion through English medium.” (Nurullah and Naik, 1951)

After the Charter of 1813 everyone was confused regarding the education policy of India. Some like H. H. Wilson, H. T. Prince were in favor of Oriental learning which stood on stipends paid to students in Sanskrit, Persian, and Arabic and by liberal grants for the publication of works in those languages. Some were in favor of teaching the elements of knowledge in the vernacular tongues, and the higher branches in English. At that time there were many institutions which provided education in the Indian languages. “An illustration is provided in the 1823 report of the collector of Bellary District, enumerating that out of 533 schools in the district, 235 schools employed Carnataca(Kannada), 226 Teloogoo(Telugu), 23 Mahratta(Marathi), 21 Persian, 4 Tamil, one English medium;” (Khubchandani, 2001). But then came to a major turning point in the educational policy of India. This is known as Macaulay's Minute.

Macaulay's Minute:

Many regard Macaulay's minute as a very important education policy of India. Macaulay's stay was not for long in India. During his stay he made two important contributions. One was the drafting of the Criminal Procedure Code and another was the Minute he wrote in 1835.

Macaulay came to India on June 1834 as a member of the supreme council of India. Macaulay in his minute criticized the Charter of 1813 claiming that it nowhere mentions the choice of languages for the promotion of knowledge and education. He was very much against the spending of money for the encouragement of studies in Arabic and Sanskrit. Also he was against the use of any of the Indian vernaculars for the learning process.

The dialects commonly spoken among the natives of this part of India, contain neither literary nor scientific information, and are, moreover, so poor and rude that..... it will not be easy to translate any valuable work into them.

(Thirumalai, 2003, p. 15)

He completely ignored the value of the Indian languages which has been timely honored by many British people like Sir William Jones. In his minute he has mentioned that 'I have no knowledge of either Sanskrit or Arabic', still he made very harsh comments regarding the languages of India, "a single shelf of a good European library was worth the whole native literature of India and Arabia." This shows how unscholarly his decision was. So he gave no place to vernaculars/mother tongues in higher studies. His full support was for English education. His ideas and imagination regarding English was very high and gave many arguments

in favor of English, that ‘English is the language of two great European communities which are rising’. In his minute he also raised questions regarding the choice of students in education. He claimed that students seeking education in Sanskrit and Arabic are not happy with their qualifications and even after getting education they are not able to have a decent living and get very less job opportunities.

The main points of his minutes were:

1. English is worth knowing than Sanskrit or Arabic.
2. Natives also want to be taught English.
3. The English educated Indian natives will serve as interpreters between us and the millions whom we govern.
4. English stands pre-eminent even among the languages of the west.

Macaulay visualized that English will bring revival and renaissance in the same manner as Latin or Greek did in England. He concluded with these comments, “Indian in blood and color, but English in taste, in opinions, in morals, and in intellect. To that class we may leave it to refine the vernaculars dialects of the country.” (*ibid, p.21*)

A strong objection against the Macaulay’s Minute came from H. T. Prinsep, another member of the supreme council. His argument against that was “to the great body of people of India, English is as strange as Arabic was to the knights of the dark ages.” But on 7th march 1835 the governor general William Bentinck agreed with Macaulay’s Minute, thus making it a cornerstone of Indian educational policy. The government was eager to establish Macaulay’s Minute, as it was a stepping stone towards getting cheap English-educated Indian servants. Also English would serve as a communicating link between the rulers and the ruled.

Macaulay is highly criticized not for implementing English education but for his views regarding the Indian languages. His ignorance regarding the Indian literature and languages was his main fault. Later on in 1836, as President of the General Committee of public instruction, he wrote, “We are deeply sensible to the importance of encouraging the cultivation of the vernacular languages. We conceive the information of a vernacular literature to be the ultimate object to which all our efforts must be directed.” (Singh, Y. K, 2007:68)

Where on one hand Macaulay completely ignored the Indian vernaculars, Charles Wood gave some relaxation to the vernaculars. Charles Wood sent a dispatch to Lord Dalhousie in 1854. In which he mentioned,

In any general system of education, the English language should be taught where there is a demand for it; but such instruction should always be combined with careful attention to the study of the vernacular language of the districts.

(Choudhary. S, 2009, p. 381)

To an extent Wood's Dispatch of 1854 can be considered the foundation of present system of education in India. With the introduction of Wood's Dispatch known as Magna Carta of Indian education, the whole scenario changed. Before the British came to India the education system was private one but with Wood's dispatch the government started giving due importance to education. British government started giving funds to indigenous schools in need of help and thus slowly some of the schools became government-aided. The main purpose of it was to prepare Indian Clerks for running local administration. Under it the means of school

education were the vernacular languages while the higher education was granted in English only.

Wood's Despatch gave a new direction to the vernaculars as well as to the education system of India. It was recommended:

1. An education department was to be set in every province.
2. Universities on the model of the London University be established in big cities such as Bombay, Calcutta and Madras.
3. At least one government school be opened in every district.
4. Affiliated private schools should be given grant in aid.
5. The Indian natives should be given training in their mother tongue also.

After that many Universities were opened at Calcutta, Bombay and Madras and many Committees and Commissions had worked on the issue of Education policy of India. During the British rule three pattern of education came into existence:

1. The English medium, in urban centers for the education of the elite, right from the primary stage;
2. The two-tier medium, vernacular medium for primary education and English medium for the advanced stage, in towns;
3. The vernacular medium, in rural areas for primary education.

(Khubchandani, 1983)

Education Commissions and their Recommendations:

Indian education system is the oldest in the world as it dates back to 3rd century B.C. Education has always been an important issue and for that the government has appointed various commissions and committees to look into the issues of education. Education Commissions in India since 1858 are:

1. The Indian Education Commission, or Hunter Commission, 1882
2. The Indian Universities Commission, 1902.
3. The Calcutta University Commission, 1917-19.
4. The Hartog Committee, 1928-29.
5. Abbot-Wood Committee, 1936-37.
6. Zakir Hussain/Wardha Committee on Basic Education, 1938.
7. The Sergeant Report, 1944.
8. The University Education Commission/ Radhakrishnan Commission, 1948-49.
9. B. G. Kher Committee on Primary Education, 1951.
10. The Secondary Education Commission, 1952-53.
11. Official Language Commission, 1956.
12. The university Grants Commission/ Kunzuru Committee Report.
13. The Education Commission/ Kothari Commission, 1964-66.
14. Dr. Trigun Sen/ Higher Education Committee Report, 1967.
15. The Study Group Reports on the Teaching of English, 1967-71.
16. National Policy on Education, 1986.
17. Archarya Ramamurti Commission, 1990.

(Choudhary. S, 2009, p. 518)

Summary of Recommendations given by the Commissions (1948-66):

1. The Conference of the Vice-chancellors of the Universities (1948), recommended the replacement of English by Indian languages as the medium of instruction at the university level after five years.
2. The Conference of the Education Ministers of the State (1948), recommended the adoption of mother tongue as the medium of instruction at the primary and secondary school levels, with the state language when it differed from the mother tongue to be studied as a compulsory subject.
3. The University Education Commission (1949) also known as Radhakrishnan Commission recommended that students at the secondary and university level should know at least three languages, namely the regional language, the link language Hindi and English.
4. The Secondary Education Commission (1952) endorsed the recommendation of the Education Minister's Conference and additionally, it recommended the study of at least two other languages, e.g. Hindi and English, at the higher primary level.
5. The English Review Committee also known as Kunzuru Committee appointed by the University Grants Commission 1955 emphasized to 'go slow' on the switch over to regional languages as media of instruction at the university level, and argued the need for continued study of English by all university students even after the switch in media.
6. The Central Advisory Board of Education (1957), suggested what has come to be known as the Three Language Formula, which was

adopted by the state Chief Ministers in 1961. This policy recommended the study of (i) the regional languages, (ii) Hindi in non-Hindi areas and any other Indian language in the Hindi area and (iii) English or any other modern European language.

7. The Education Commission also known as the Kothari Commission (1964-66) looked into the problems faced by the states in implementing the Three Language Formula, and recommended a 'modified', Three Language Formula which won general acceptance and is the language policy currently in force in most of India.

(Sridhar. K,1983 :17-19)

But still the development of vernaculars to meet the need of medium of education was very slow. Mahatma Gandhi too during his struggle of independence vehemently criticized English Education. "Mahatma Gandhi in 1933 proposed a scheme for basic education which was practically the antithesis of the rulers' elitist moorings concerning the questions of content, spread and medium."(Khubchandani, 2001:30) So lots of attention has always been given on the educational policy of India but the major problem is of implementation and execution of these policies.

Review of Education Policies after Independence:

The Constitution provides many provisions regarding the medium of instruction and education in general. Article 30 of the Constitution allows linguistic groups to receive education in their mother tongue and to set institutions of their choice for this purpose. Also according to the

Constitution of India, elementary education is a fundamental right of children in the age group of 6-14 years. India has about 688,000 primary schools, 110,000 secondary schools and 342 universities (211 State, 18 Central, 95 deemed universities) 13 institutes of national importance, 17,000 colleges and 887 polytechnics.

Education policy of 1968:

Education leads a country towards national progress and economic development. The leaders of newly independent India recognized the importance of education for national progress, security and national integration. For achieving its goal, the Government of India had various commissions and committees like the University Education Commission/ Radhakrishnan Commission(1948-49) and Secondary Education Commission, 1952-53 for reviewing the educational reconstruction. Towards the end of the Third five year plan the education commission gave its report which was widely discussed and thus the national policy of education 1968 came into being.

For effective promotion of education the Government had certain principles. Some of them are as follows:

1. Free and compulsory education to children up to the age of 14.
(Article 45)
2. Status, emulations and education of teachers.
3. Development of regional languages. Making it a medium of instruction at the university level.
4. Proper implementation of the three language formula.
5. Promotion of Hindi as a medium of expression in the composite culture of India.

6. Development of Sanskrit language.
7. Emphasis on the study of international language, especially English.
8. Equalization of educational opportunity.
9. The acceptance of common structure of education throughout the country.

The national policy of education was a good start in the way of educating the masses. The national language policy of 1968 provided a strong justification for the use and development of Indian languages.

The key programme will be to develop all Indian languages and to adopt them as media of education at all stages. Unless this is done, the creative energies of the people will not be released, standards of education will not improve, knowledge will not spread to the people, and the gulf between the intelligentsia and the masses will continue to grow.

(Dua, 2001:185)

The main aim of the National language policy of India 1968 was to “promote national progress, a sense of common citizenship and culture, and to strengthen national integration. It led stress on the need for a radical reconstruction of the education system to improve its quality at all stages. And give much greater attention to science and technology, the cultivation of moral values and a closer relationship between education and the life of the people.” (Yadav. B, 2002:224)

The goals of the national policy were high but the way of achieving these goals were not defined. There can be various reasons for the ineffective working of the national education policy of India. The government offered free education to the children but still the illiteracy rate is high in

India. The policy failed to implement education to these children in their mother tongues. The policy gave more importance to the promotion of Hindi and Sanskrit. Also “One of the most important developments in the language policy making process after the 1967 elections was the unusual importance accorded to the regional languages. Until 1967 most of the debates concerning the official language policies centered on the question of English or Hindi.”(Das Gupta, 1970, p 250)

In 1966 the education commission wanted to implement the three language formula in a very liberal way. In which it asked the students to learn the students at least three languages by the time s/he completes the high school (i.e. class X). The three languages could be mother tongue and two non-native modern languages. But this formula was interpreted differently by different states. But it also failed to have its firm ground in the Indian education system. The language policy of education 1968 was unable to fulfill the demands and challenges of the society.

Education policy of 1986:

The Parliament adopted the National policy of Education (NPE) in 1986. It was reviewed twice, once by the committee under Archarya Ramamurti in May 1990 and another time in July 1991 under the chairmanship of Shri N. Janardhana Reddy, the National policy of Education was submitted in January 1992. Finally in a meeting held on 5-6 May 1992 by the Central Advisory Board of education (CABE). The National Policy of Education (1986) and program of action (1992) lay down the objectives and features of Indian education policy. It includes:

- Development of International cooperation and peaceful coexistence through education.
- Promotion of equality. It could be achieved by providing equal access and equal condition of success to children.
- A common educational structure (10+2+3) for the whole of India.
- Education for women's equality. The Indian education should be used as a tool to change the status of women in the society.
- Equalization of SC population with others in the matter of education. This is ensured by giving incentives to parents who send their children to schools, providing scholarship to SC students for higher studies, reservation of seats in institution of higher studies in India, recruitment of SC teachers.
- Opening of primary schools in tribal area for promotion of education in ST people.
- Development of curriculum and study material in the language of tribal people.
- Emphasis on the education of minorities.
- Adult education - Initiation of National Literacy Mission, for teaching illiterate people of age group 15-35. And making them aware of the day-to-day realities of their surroundings.
- Special emphasis on early childhood care and education by opening up of day care centers, promotion of child focused programs.
- Increasing the scope of Operation Blackboard for upliftment of standard of primary education in India.

- Secondary education curriculum should expose the students to differentiated roles of science, the humanities, and social science.
- Redesigning of courses of higher education to meet the increasing demand of professionalism.
- Providing enhanced support to the research work in Universities. Efforts to relate ancient Indian knowledge with the contemporary reality.
- Setting up of Open Universities and Distance Learning centers to promote the goal of education as a lifelong process.
- A combined perspective of technical and management education.
- Minimum exposure to computers and training in their use to be the part of professional education.
- The All India Council for Technical Education will be responsible for maintenance of norms and standards, accreditation, funding, and monitoring of technical and management education in India.
- Multiple task performance for teachers such as teaching, research, development of learning resource material, extension and management of the institution.
- Providing teachers a better deal to make education system in India work in proper way, as teachers are the backbone of the system. Providing better facilities to institutions and improved services to students.
- Development of languages in great deal.
- Measures to be taken for easy accessibility of books at minimum costs to all sections of students.

- Strengthening of science education for the development of spirit of inquiry and objectivity in the minds of students.
- The purpose of examination to be to bring about qualitative improvement in education. It should discourage memorization.
- Methods of teacher recruitment to be recognized one to ensure merit and objectivity in the system.
- Overhauling of the system of teacher education and establishment of District Institutes of Education and Training (DIET) to organize courses for elementary school teachers.
- Reviewing of educational developments by the Central Advisory Board of Education (CABE)
- Involvement of local communities for school improvement programmes.
- Review of the implementation of the parameters of the policy every five years,
- Strengthening the base of pyramid of Indian population for proper development of education system in India.

The National Policy of Education 1986 had a target to evolve such a system of education in which apart from moving towards establishment of common educational structure for the whole country, the elements which will go into the system will cut across several areas and will promote values such as India's common cultural heritage, egalitarianism, democracy and secularism, equality of the sexes, protection of the environment, removal of social barriers, inculcation of scientific temper. Also it mentioned, "The new policy will lay emphasis on the removal of disparities and to equalize educational opportunity by attending to the

specific needs of those who have been denied equality so far.” It gave space to all women, scheduled castes, scheduled tribes, handicapped, minorities, adult education, etc. It gave new dimensions to Distance Education through Open Universities, Indira Gandhi Open University, establishment of State Open University, Rural University, technical and management education, innovative research and development, rationalization of education, etc.

National Policy of Education (1992) laid down many objectives for the development of education system in India but it has not been successful in achieving all of them. It has specified that the examination system should discourage the memorizing but it is what is going on. The education in India seems to encourage rote learning instead of experimentation and questioning. There is some disparity in assessment as all the State Boards have different standards of evaluation. The center and the state both have a say on the education system but the privatization of education has some different goals. With the increase in the number of private schools, this language policy will create class difference. Is the policy competent for a multilingual hub like India? Will it be able to make free and compulsory education to all the children up to the age of 14? Will it be able to solve the language issues of India?

Three Language Formula:

The Three Language Formula is a policy statement made by the union education ministry of the Government of India in collaboration with the states in 1961. But Gandhi has felt the need for this three language formula much earlier. In his speech to the Belgaum congress (1924), he gave his idea of three language formula though not using the particular

term. He proposed a) regional language (to be used by the provincial/state government), b) Hindustani (to be used in the higher courts and central government) and c) English (to be used for international diplomacy). (Satyanarayana, 1977:32) But when this formula came into being Hindustani was replaced by Hindi. At that the face of the three language formula was (a) the regional language or mother tongue when the later is different from the regional language. (b) Hindi or, in Hindi speaking areas, another Indian language (preferably a South Indian language); and (c) English or any other modern European language. “The three language formula in spite of its initial failure was strongly upheld by the report of the Education Commission in 1966, though the Commission recommended a different form of the formula.” (Das Gupta, 1970:244-45) Then in 1968 the Three Language Formula came as a statement by the National Policy of Education. According to which the Three Language Formula meant:

- I. In Hindi speaking areas :
 - a) Hindi
 - b) English
 - c) Modern Indian language (preferably south Indian language)
- II. In Non-Hindi speaking areas:
 - a) The regional language
 - b) Hindi
 - c) English

The government was very keen on implementing this formula in all the states. In actual different states interpreted this formula in different ways. Its implementation has been highly uneven. The Three Language Formula

has become a 3+/-1 formula for political, educational, linguistic and socio-cultural reasons (Dua, 1991). Like for the speakers of minority languages the three language formula became four language formula as they have to learn their mother tongue, the dominant regional language, English and Hindi. In most of the Hindi speaking states Sanskrit became the third language instead of any modern Indian languages. Only some states accepted the three language formula in principle while others made some adjustments and some changed it to an extent that it became impossible to implement it. The failure of the three language formula can be due to some reasons, like:

- a) Not properly implemented as it was meant to be implemented. Like the southern states were not ready to teach Hindi and Hindi regions never included any south Indian language in its school curriculum.
- b) The heavy language load in the school curriculum.
- c) The cost for arranging for instruction.

Table 4.1: Three Language Formula as interpreted by the States

State	First language	Second language	Third language
1. Andhra Pradesh#	Telugu, Hindi, Urdu, Kannada, Tamil, Oriya, Marathi, Gujarati or composite courses of these languages Class I-X	Hindi (for non-Hindi speakers), Telugu (for non-Telugu speakers), any other modern Indian language. Class V-X	English Class VI-X
2. Arunachal Pradesh	English Class I-X	Hindi Class I-X	Assamese Class VI-VIII
3. Assam	Mother tongue or regional language Class I-X	English Class V-X	Hindi(for Assamese mother tongue speakers), Assamese (for non-Assamese

Chapter Four: Education Policy of India

			speakers) Class VI-VIII
4. *Bihar	Hindi, Urdu, Bengali, Oriya, Maithili and Santali	Hindi for non-Hindi students or Sanskrit (for Hindi students)	English
5. *Delhi	Hindi	English	Sanskrit or any minority language
6. Goa#	Hindi, Kannada, Urdu, Telugu, Malayalam, English, Marathi or Konkani	Hindi	English or any classical Indian language or any modern European languages. Portuguese or French language from standard VIII onwards.
7. Gujarat#	Mother-tongue	Hindi or Gujarati	English or Gujarati
8. *Haryana	Hindi from Class I	English from Class VI	Telugu, Sanskrit, Urdu or Punjabi from classes VII to VIII
9. *Himachal Pradesh	Hindi	English	Urdu, Tamil, Telugu, Malayalam and Bengali
10. Jammu and Kashmir	Urdu or Hindi Class I-X	English Class VI-X	Urdu(in Hindi medium school), Hindi (in Urdu medium schools) Class VII-X
11. *Karnataka	Kannada from Class I	English from Class V	Hindi from Class V
12. Kerala	Malayalam, (Kannada, Tamil for minorities) Class I-X	English Class IV-X	Hindi Class V-X
13. *Madhya Pradesh	Hindi, English, Marathi, Urdu, Punjabi, Sindhi, Bengali,	Hindi/English	Hindi, English, Sanskrit, Marathi, Urdu, Punjabi,

Chapter Four: Education Policy of India

	Gujarati, Tamil, Telugu, and Malayalam		Sindhi, Gujarati, Telugu, Tamil, Malayalam, Arabic, Persian, French and Russian
14. Maharashtra	Marathi Class I-X	Hindi Class V-X	English Class V-X
15. Nagaland	Mother tongue Class I-X	English Class I-X	Hindi Class V-X
16. Orissa	Oriya Class I-X	English Class IV-X	Hindi Class VI-X
17. Punjab	Punjabi Class I-X	Hindi Class IV-X	English Class VI-X
18. *Rajasthan	Hindi	English	Sanskrit, Urdu, Sindhi, Punjabi and Gujarati
19. Sikkim	English Class I-X	Hindi Class I-VIII	Nepali, Tibetan, Lepcha, Limboo Class IV-X
20. Tamil Nadu	Tamil or mother tongue Class I-X	English or any other non-Indian language Class III-X	
21. Tripura	Bengali Class I-X	English Class I-X	Hindi, Sanskrit, Arabic, Persian, etc. Class III-VII
22. *Uttar Pradesh	Hindi Classes (VI to VII)	English or any other Modern European language Class VI-VIII	Any language mentioned in the Eighth Schedule. Class VI-VIII
23. *West Bengal	Bengali, Hindi, English, Nepali, Urdu, Assamese, Gujarati, Malayalam, Marathi, Modern Tibetan, Oriya, Punjabi (Gurumukhi), Santali, Tamil, Telugu, Lushai, Sudani Classes VI to X	English, Bengali, Nepali Classes VI to X	Bengali, Hindi, Sanskrit, Pali, Persian, Arabic, Latin, Greek, Classical Armenian, French, Russian, Portuguese, Spanish and Italian

24. Andaman & Nicobar Islands	Hindi, Telugu, Urdu, Bengali, Punjabi, Tamil, Malayalam Class I-X	English Class VI-X	Urdu, Malayalam, Sanskrit, Hindi Class V-VIII
25. Chandigarh	Hindi, Punjabi Class I-X	Hindi, Punjabi Class III-X	English Class III-X
26. Dadra & Nagar Haveli	Gujarati, Marathi Class I-X	Hindi Class V-X	English Class V-VIII
27. Lakshadweep	Malayalam, (Kannada, Tamil for minorities) Class I-X	English Class IV-X	Hindi Class V-X
28. Mizoram	Mizo Class I-X	English Class III-X	Hindi Class V-X
29. Pondicherry	Mother tongue or Tamil Class I-X	English or other Indian language Class III-X	

(Source: K. Vishvanatham 2001, p 312-318,

*From site www.education.nic.in/cd50years/u/47/3x/473X0I01.htm

From Fatihi AR, *Language in India*)

The three language formula has not been implemented well in all the states but the results are good where ever implemented. Except Tamil Nadu, all other south Indian states have enthusiastically and sincerely implemented the three language formula. In the north this three language formula has been implemented in a different form. Basically in the north the three languages taught are English, Hindi and Sanskrit or Urdu. At the theoretical level this three language formula is a good policy statement which promotes multilingualism among the people. “A good example of a multilingual, ‘mosaic’ policy is India’s three language formula’ where by a local language, Hindi and English would all be used at secondary school level. The crucial element of the policy is that it seeks to promote languages of wider communication at three different levels: regional, national and international.”(Orman. J, 2008:57)

Now efforts are being made to implement the Three language Formula in the real sense. In 2007, National Commission for Religious and Linguistic Minorities in a report compiled by a former Chief Justice Ranganath Mishra stated that, “the three language formula should be implemented everywhere in the country making it compulsory for the authorities to include in it the mother tongue of every child—including especially Urdu and Punjabi.” Many consider the three language formula a burden for children and think that it will affect the performance of the children. But now teaching or learning a second or third language has become a norm. Most of the countries are in favor of multilingual education because of many reasons.

- a) For national integration
- b) For bringing the minority groups in the main stream of national life.
- c) For knowing the cultural tradition/heritage of the country.
- d) And sometimes for getting higher education

But this multilingualism should be additive in nature and not at the cost of their native languages. Also it is a known fact that children who grow up with two languages have better cognitive skills than their monolingual peers. Multilingual education in early childhood gives parents the opportunity to have this ability imparted to their children effectively in a short space of time. So children who grow up multilingual in their early years are more perceptive and intellectually more flexible.

Mother Tongue Education:

Before going into details of ‘Mother Tongue Education’ one should be clear ‘what is a mother tongue’? For many the term mother tongue is still

not clear. To define one's mother tongue as the language of one's mother will not be appropriate. The dictionary meaning of this term is 'the language first learned by a child'. Mother tongue is often been interpreted as one's native language. Mother tongue is also related to the language of one's ethnic group. "In linguistic and educational accounts, the terms mother tongue and native speech are often used indistinguishably. The term native can be distinguished as 'the first speech acquired in infancy, through which the child gets socialized: it claims some bearing on intuitive competence, and potentially it can individually identifiable'." According to Khubchandani (1983:45) the term mother tongue can be defined as one's allegiance to a particular tradition, and it is societally identifiable. According to linguists, mother tongue refers to L_1 i.e. the language first acquired by the child and the first one to find expressions developed from the Language Acquisition Device placed by Chomsky in 1965. A general interpretation of the term is the language in which one think, dream or shows anger is his mother tongue. According to Pattanayak(1981), 'mother tongue' is both a sociolinguistic reality and a product of the mythic consciousness of a people. It gives social and emotional identity to an individual with a speech community. According to Skutnabb, 'a mother tongue may change, even several times in a lifetime'. The mother tongue may vary even at a single point in time depending on which of the criteria given below is used. So, Skutnabb-Kangas gave four criteria for defining mother tongue, namely origin, competence, function and attitude.

Four criteria can be used for defining ‘Mother Tongue’:

Criterion	Definition of ‘Mother Tongue’
Origin	The language one learnt first (the language in which one established one’s first lasting communication relationship)
Competence	The language one knows best
Function	The language one uses most
Attitudes	The language one identifies with (<i>internal identification</i>) The language one is identified as a native speaker of by other people (<i>external identification</i>)
(World view)	(The language one counts in, thinks in, dreams in, writes poetry in, etc.)

Source : Skutnabb- Kangas, 1981, p 18

In India before the 1961 census the definition of mother tongue in different censuses varied in terms of narrow and broad interpretation. The 1881 census had a narrow interpretation of the term, which defined mother tongue as “the language spoken by the individual from the cradle. It continued till 1891 but the term was changed into ‘parent tongue’. Then again in 1901 census the term gained a new name i.e. ‘language ordinarily used’. In 1961 census the term had a broad interpretation, “mother tongue is the language spoken in childhood by the person’s mother. If the mother died in infancy write the language mostly spoken in the person’s home in childhood. In the case of infants and deaf/mutes give the language usually spoken by the mother.” (Hasnain, 2001:62)

This confusion regarding the concept of mother tongue has not only been seen in Indian censuses but also in the censuses of European countries too.

In the case of the Slovene of Carinthia, in the 1923 census they were asked about their 'thinking language', in 1934 they were asked about 'the language of the cultural circle', in 1951 they gave the 'language of everyday use' and in 1961 they claimed Slovene as the 'language of their homes'.

(Pattanayak. D. P, 1981:48)

In 2000, in a petition the Madras High Court adjudicated that "...mother-tongue of a child should only be understood for the purpose of these cases as the language which the child is most familiar with ... mother-tongue need not be the mother's tongue or father's tongue. Generally, the parents are the proper persons who can assess and say as to which is the language, that child is most familiar with." (Mallikarjun,p12, *Language in India*)

The UNESCO monograph of 1953 supported teaching in one's mother tongue. When a child gets education in his/her mother tongue s/he develops higher abstract thinking in any language. According to the Hague Recommendations on the Educational Rights of National Minorities and UNESCO Education Position Paper 'Education in a multilingual world' (2003), those having their own language as the main medium of teaching, the better they also become in the dominant language, provided, of course, that they have good teaching in it, preferably given by bilingual teachers. In India after independence many leaders like Gandhi, Gokhale, Mohammed Iqbal, Rabindranath Tagore, etc stressed upon adopting the mother tongue as a compulsory subject of teaching and as medium of instruction. Also Article 350-A of the Indian Constitution states that for local authorities in every state endeavoring to

extent adequate facilities for instruction in the mother tongue at the primary stage of education to children belonging to linguistic minority groups and for the President issuing necessary direction to any state. According to Thomas Claire (2009), children progress faster in both their language and the majority language when they first receive education in their home language. Also he favored mother tongue based multilingual education.

A survey was conducted in 2004, by the Indian Institute of Language Studies, New Delhi, on 'Language Preferences in Education in India'. In the survey the data was conducted from Tamilnadu, Karnataka, Andhra Pradesh, Delhi, Jammu and Kashmir, Punjab, Maharashtra, West Bengal and Orissa. The major findings of the survey go in favor of mother tongue education and testify multilingualism. They are as follows:

1. There is a general preference for the study of mother tongue as well as English as a subject in early school education i.e., primary and middle classes. The children whose mother tongue is not taught in the schools (for example, Kolami in Maharashtra, Kashmiri and Dogri in the state of Jammu and Kashmir) opt for the state official language as a subject of study. In the non-Hindi speaking states which follow the Three Language formula, Hindi is taught in addition to the state official language as well as English. Whereas the public/private schools introduce English as a subject from the very beginning, it is introduced as a subject at the third or sixth standard in other schools.
2. The preference for the use of English as a medium of instruction increases with the education. Also both local languages as well as

English are preferred as the media of instruction in most of the states.

3. The mother tongue is preferred as the primary language for the communication at home.
4. Appropriate to a multilingual situation, the language proficiency of the respondents reveal proficiency in more than one language in all the states. Most of the respondents have listed their mother tongues/state official languages higher in proficiency. Some languages are learnt as a result of language contact.

This survey shows that the majority of the population is bi or multilingual. Monolingualism is a myth for multilingual nations. People are happy and at ease with two or three languages, it is not a burden for them.

The most recent policy promoting mother tongue instruction came in July 2009 with the passing in both the houses of parliament of the right of children to free and compulsory bill, which also includes provision for medium of instruction, “medium of instruction as far as practicable, be in child’s mother tongue.” (Groff, 2010:129)

Languages used as Medium of Instruction:

In multilingual societies the system of education should be multi-tier where multilingual education since primary level should be encouraged. It also needs a high degree of planning, acquaintance with the languages of the students and a high level of teaching skills. According to the policy of the state Government every child has the right to get education in his/her mother tongue. The number of languages counted in the 1961 census was very large i.e. 1,652. So the policy states that if the majority

language of the state is not the mother tongue of many students then in that case there should be at least ten students of that mother tongue. Then that language is allowed to be used as medium of instruction. At present a total of 42 languages are being used as medium of instruction. It is very difficult for the government to impart education in all the languages present in India. Still it is flexible enough in accommodating as many as possible. Another area affecting the number and selection of language is power and politics. There is a lot of language politics playing behind selection of languages used as medium of instruction. But my study will not go deep in that area.

Table 4.2: The 42 Languages Taught as Medium Languages or Subject (in 2004)

1. Angami	15.Kannada	29.Nepali
2. Ao	16.Kashmiri	30.Nicobari
3. Arabic	17.Khasi	31.Oriya
4. Assamese	18.Konkani	32.Persian
5. Bengali	19.Konyak	33.Portuguese
6. Bhutia	20.Ladakhi	34.Punjabi
7. Bodo	21.Lepcha	35.Sanskrit
8. Dogri	22.Limbu	36.Sema
9. English	23.Lotha	37.Tamil
10.French	24.Malayalam	38.Telugu
11.Garo	25.Manipuri	39.Tibetan
12.Gujarati	26.Marathi	40.Urdu
13.Hindi	27.Maithili	41.Zeliang
14.Kokborok	28.Mizo	42.Santali

Source: Benedikter, 2009:148

On the basis of All India Survey (1974), NCERT reported as many as 80 languages used as medium of instruction, but today the number has almost dropped fifty percent. Now the Sixth All India Survey has recorded 41 languages being used as medium of instruction. This decrease in the number is due to many constraints and hurdles.

- a) Due to improper implementation of the Three Language Formula.
- b) Many languages mostly tribal languages have no script.
- c) Lack of text books in all the mother tongue.
- d) Due to the controversy of language and dialect.
- e) Due to financial and administrative reasons.
- f) Privatization of education.
- g) Due to dominance of English over other languages.
- h) Lack of interest of parents in sending their children in schools other than English medium, etc.

The education system of India up to class XII is basically divided into four stages: (a) Primary/Elementary, (B) Upper Primary/Middle, (C) Secondary/ High School and (D) Higher Secondary/Intermediate/Pre-University.

Table 4.3: Number of Languages Taught in the Schools

Stage	Third survey	Fifth survey	Sixth survey
Total number of languages	67	44	41
Primary school	47	43	33
Upper primary	28	31	25
Secondary	24	22	21
Higher secondary	17	20	18

(Mallikarjun, 2004:14)

At the primary level the number of languages used as medium of instruction is more than the secondary and higher secondary. As we move towards higher education the number of languages used as medium of instruction goes on decreasing. But now many individual institutions have taken up the work of introducing education in those languages whose speakers were not getting education in their mother tongue.

“A few states such as Rajasthan and Karnataka are engaged in experimental programmes of introducing bilingual education for minorities. In Bihar text books are prepared in major tribal languages like Santali, Kurukh, Mundari, Ho, Kharia. The Madhya Pradesh tribal research bureau has also initiated a few text books in Gondi, Bhili, Korku and Halabi.” (Khubchandani, 2001:32). Also in 2005, the Education department of Tripura decided to give a push to Kok-Borok as a medium of instruction at the Junior Basic level to help tribal students learn in their mother tongue. The Higher Education minister Keshab Majumdar stated, “We have decided to introduce it as a medium of instruction at Junior Basic level in tribal areas so that tribal children of the state enjoy their constitutional right of having education in their own language. Simultaneously, we want to encourage parents to send their children to schools.”

Table 4.4: Total Number of Languages Used as Medium of Instruction in Different States.

States/Union territory	Third survey				Fifth survey			
	P	UP	S	HS	P	UP	S	HS
1. Andhra Pradesh	6	9+1	9+1	7+1*	9	9	8	5
2. Assam	9	8	7	5	7+1	6+1	6+1	3+1
3. Bihar	5+1	4+1	NA	3	6+1	6+1	6	3
4. Delhi	11	11	NA	11	11	8	8	8
5. Gujarat	9	NA	6	NA	8	8	7	5
6. Haryana	1+1	2+1	2+1	2	2	2	2	2
7. Himachal Pradesh	4	3	3	3	2	2	2	2
8. Jammu and Kashmir	4+1	4+1	4+1	4+1	4+1	4+1	4+1	3+1
9. Karnataka	8	8	7	5	8	8	7	6
10. Kerala	5	5	5	3	5	5	5	3
11. Madhya Pradesh	10	7	NA	7	9	8	4	3
12. Maharashtra	12	10	10	5	12	11	11	6
13. Manipur	4	4	4	3	4+1	4	4	3
14. Meghalaya	6	6	5	1	6+1	6+1	4	1
15. Nagaland	4+1	4+1	3	NA	1+1	2+1	1+1	1
16. Orissa	7	6	7	3	6	6	6	3
17. Punjab	3	3	3	3	4	3	3	3
18. Rajasthan	3	2	3	3	5	3	2	2
19. Tamil Nadu	9	9	9	3	6	6	6	6
20. Tripura	5	2	2	3	3+1	3	3	3
21. Uttar Pradesh	4	4	4	4	3	3	2	2
22. West Bengal	8	6	7	5	8	6	5	5
23. Andaman & Nicobar Islands	9	5	NA	4	6	4	5	5

Chapter Four: Education Policy of India

24. Chandigarh	4	4	3	3	3	3	3	3
25. Dadra & Nagar Haveli	3	NA	2	NA	3	3	3	3
26. Lakshadweep	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
27. Mizoram	5	6	1	NA	3+1	3+1	1	1
28. Pondicherry	2	2	2	2	4+1	4+1	4	3

*Fig. given after the + sign stands for the 'Other Languages' which generally consists of Tribal and non-Scheduled and non-Tribal languages.

NA: Data not available

Source: Koul, 2005, p 76-77

The above table shows most of the states are using more than one language as medium of instruction. Particularly at the primary level none of the states have only one language as medium of instruction. Also we can see that as we move upward in the education system, the number of language show a decrease in number. Only States like Mizoram, Nagaland and Meghalaya are showing monolingual medium of instruction in the higher secondary.

To conclude, the characteristic feature of the multilingual education scene may be seen as:

- I. In the process of being concerned with protection of linguistic rights of both migrant and tribal population the mother tongue based multilingual education was differentiated from regional language based multilingual education.
- II. The focus on mother tongue based multilingual education resulted in the use of languages, not specified in the VIII Schedule of the Constitution, as educational media.

- III. The language needs of tribal children became a matter of concern. In order to take care of their needs a multilingual transfer strategy has been recommended. The strategy consists of the use of the tribal language as medium and regional language as a subject in the first few years of schooling followed by total switch over to the use of the regional language medium.
- IV. Multilingual education began to be concerned with the number of languages to be studied by the entire school-going population, their purpose and the duration of their study.

(Koul, 2005:92-93)
- V. The three-language formula if implemented well will help in fostering multilingualism.

Multilingual Mother Tongue Education:

In the education system the most privileged one are those whose mother tongue is the medium of education in the schools. Mostly the medium of education is either English or the dominant language of that region. So it becomes difficult for the linguistic minorities to have education in others' mother tongue. It is a known fact that children learn better if they understand and speak the language of the classroom. But only education in their mother tongue will not be fruitful to the children, as they will find difficulty in relating themselves with the outer world. So the dominant language of the region or the national language of the country and language of wider communication is also an important need. So there is a need to have a education system where the along with the mother tongue

education, other language should be introduced gradually over time. Many of the multilingual countries have recognized the importance of multilingualism in their education system. Many scholars like Claire, Skutnabb, have talked about the relevance of multilingual mother tongue education. According to Thomas Claire (2009:83-91), the world's education ministers recommended that states should view linguistic and cultural diversity in the classroom as a valuable resource and promote the use of mother tongue in the early years of instruction. The UN forum also made strong recommendations on MTME. For promoting multilingual mother tongue education, an advocacy kit has been prepared for policy makers, educationists, etc which will aim at 'including the excluded'.

Advantages of Mother Tongue based Multilingual Education (MTME) can be as follows:

- a) The drop-out rates of the students will lower.
- b) It will help students having higher self esteem.
- c) It will help in preventing inter-ethnic conflict.
- d) It will help in the revival of endangered languages.
- e) Various social and personal benefits.
- f) Last but not the least it will help in promoting multilingualism.

One more direction towards handling multilingualism in a society is Multilingual Mother Tongue Education (MMTE), which is different in its perspective than MTME. In India multilingualism is a grass root phenomenon. Every child grows with at least two languages. The definition given by Skutnabb is more a reality in Indian situation, i.e. a person having many mother tongues. So education policy should be groomed keeping these things in mind. Some problems that might come

in the process of executing MTME or Multilingual Mother Tongue Education can be: shortage of teachers in the respective mother tongues; investment an cost for MTME/MMTE is high; problem regarding the development of teaching materials, etc.

UNESCO is developing a number of initiatives for the promotion of mother tongue instruction and multilingual education to enhance the quality of education. It gave three-part rationale for supporting multilingual education.

1. UNESCO supports mother-tongue instruction as a means of improving educational quality by building upon the knowledge and experience of the learners and teachers.
2. UNESCO supports bilingual and/or multilingual education at all levels of education as a means of promoting both social and gender equality and as a key element of linguistically diverse societies.
3. UNESCO supports language as an essential component of inter-cultural education in order to encourage understanding between different population groups and ensure respect for fundamental rights.

The best policies are those that establish multilingual education as an integral part of formal and informal education and gives clear directives for its implementations. Thus MTME or MMTE can be a good solution for maintain multilingualism in all the countries across the world.